Reporting on forced labour and fair recruitment: An ILO toolkit for Journalists in Pakistan
REPORTING ON
FORCED LABOUR AND
FAIR RECRUITMENT

AN ILO TOOLKIT FOR JOURNALISTS IN PAKISTAN

The present base document was prepared by Cassandre Gaylord Cyr and Lou Tessier and it was adapted for Pakistan by the REFRAME project. This toolkit was originally developed by Charles Autheman, Kevin Burden, Jane Colombini, Maria Gallotti and Lou Tessier.
This toolkit was developed by the International Labour Organization (ILO). The ILO is a specialized agency of the United Nations which, since 1919, has brought together governments, employers and workers of 187 member States to set labour standards, develop policies and devise programmes promoting decent work for all women and men.

In the framework of the Fair Recruitment Initiative, the toolkit aims to foster contributions to the United Nations TOGETHER campaign, promoting respect, safety and dignity for refugees and migrants, and to the 50 for Freedom campaign, which aims to mobilize support for the ratification of the ILO Forced Labour Protocol.

It also aims to further contributions to Alliance 8.7, the global partnership committed to achieving Target 8.7 of the Sustainable Development Goals on eradicating forced labour, modern slavery, human trafficking and child labour around the world.

Many organizations and actors have contributed to this toolkit, including the International Federation of Journalists (IFJ), ILO staff in various country offices and journalists from many countries around the world. The Media-Friendly Glossary of this toolkit was developed with the United Nations Alliance of Civilizations (UNAOC) and is under joint copyright.

The ILO Media Toolkit was prepared by Cassandre Gaylord Cyr and Lou Tessier. This toolkit was originally developed by Charles Autheman, Kevin Burden, Jane Colombini, Maria Gallotti and Lou Tessier based on the lessons learned from several media engagement programmes of the ILO and other agencies as well as building on the wealth of experience of the IFJ. The authors express their gratitude to Joanne Land-Kazlauskas who edited the language of the original publication.

The present toolkit has been adapted for Pakistan by the REFRAME project. The REFRAME project is partnering with the Center for Excellence in Journalism (CEJ) to develop training for journalists on fair recruitment. The Centre for Excellence in Journalism (CEJ) is an initiative for the professional development, training and networking of Pakistani journalists and media professionals. CEJ is a collaboration between the International Center for Journalists (ICFJ), the Institute of Business Administration (IBA), and the Medill School of Journalism at Northwestern University.

The authors of the toolkit and the authors of the various examples of reporting provided in this toolkit are respectively and solely responsible for the content and any opinions expressed within this publication, which does not reflect any official position of the ILO.
# CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Module</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Module 1. Understanding the Story</td>
<td>03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unit 1.1 - Looking for a Common Terminology</td>
<td>03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unit 1.2 - Forced Labour</td>
<td>03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unit 1.3 - Decent Work Opportunities through Fair Recruitment</td>
<td>05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unit 1.4 - Legal Frameworks</td>
<td>07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Module 2. Finding the Story</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unit 2.1 - Getting Prepared</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unit 2.2 - Finding a Story</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unit 2.3 - Getting Support</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Module 3. Getting the Story</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unit 3.1 - Resources</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unit 3.2 - Safety</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unit 3.3 - Sources</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Module 4. Telling the Story</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unit 4.1 - Which Medium?</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unit 4.2 - Consider a Series</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unit 4.3 - Are You Ready?</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Module 5. Following Up</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unit 5.1 - Impact, Awards and Specializing</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unit 5.2 - Final Tips</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex. Glossary of Key Terminologies for Media Reporting in Pakistan Forced Labour and Fair Recruitment of Migrant Workers</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INTRODUCTION

WHY USE THIS GUIDE?

This toolkit was created to help you report on fair recruitment and forced labour. You don’t need any prior knowledge to browse through the content of the guide. You can work your way through the material in your own time and at your own pace.

We recommend that you follow the course in logical order, but it is not strictly necessary. If time is short, you can dip in to find the information you need most at the moment and return later to expand your knowledge.

THE ROLE OF THE MEDIA

“I HAD TO EAT THE DOG’S FOOD TO SURVIVE”

- Hugo Bachega

Maria (not her real name) had arrived in Brazil from the Philippines as a hired domestic worker by a wealthy family who lived in Sao Paulo.

She had to help the mother with the three school-aged boys and a baby. Then clean the large apartment, walk the family’s dog, and put all the children to bed. Weeks would pass without Maria’s employers giving her a day off. With so much to do, she often had no time left to eat. One morning when she woke up her stomach hurt from the lack of food, but her tasks were already waiting for her. Only hours later did she find something to eat: she was cooking meat for the family’s dog and took half of it for herself.

“I didn’t have [any other] choice to survive. “Maria paid $2,000 (£1,500) in fees to the agency that recruited her. Her employer paid the agency $6,000 and the cost of the flights to Brazil.

What they were not told when they applied for their jobs was that their visas would be tied to their employment. So even when they found conditions to be bad, they felt they could not just walk out and look for a new job. And to get a new work permit, they would have to leave Brazil.”


As a human being, you may be outraged by this story. As a journalist, you may be able to do something about it.

Journalists have a voice that many people do not. They have the ability to shine a light on abusive practices and denial of fundamental human rights as well as to alert readers or viewers to the abuses. Journalists have the opportunity to change public opinion, even policy, impacting on the lives of workers. In addition, journalists have a clear ethical duty not to make matters worse, which can happen when reporters and editors use derogatory language for workers and sensationalist headlines.

Writing stories on a human rights issue such as forced labour and fair recruitment is not like writing a routine news story. It takes more time because effort to investigate, speak to a variety of sources, weigh and verify them are should needed in the process.

Many stories of forced labour and fair recruitment are “glocal”: they have a local impact and produce repercussions globally. For instance, workers who are trapped in the garment industry may be producing clothing that some of your readers wear. Therefore, understanding contemporary economic interactions and global production mechanisms are also important for the reporting.

In the following pages, information and advices are provided to help report more accurately and effectively on forced labour and on fair recruitment. Many examples of good reporting are included as well as tips from journalists experienced in covering these often-challenging subjects.

A WORD ABOUT US

This toolkit was basically developed by the International Labour Organization (ILO). The ILO is a specialized agency of the United Nations which, since 1919, has brought together government, employers and workers of 187 member States to set labour standards, develop policies and devise programmes promoting decent work for all women and men.

The toolkit aims at fostering contributions to the United Nations TOGETHER campaign, promoting respect, safety and dignity for refugees and migrants, and to the 50 for Freedom campaign, which aims to mobilize support for the ratification of the ILO Forced Labour Protocol.

It also aims to further contributions to Alliance 8.7, the global partnership committed to achieving Target 8.7 of the Sustainable Development Goals on eradicating forced labour, modern slavery, human trafficking and child labour around the world.

Many organizations and actors have contributed to this toolkit, including, amongst others, the International Federation of Journalists, the United Nations Alliance of Civilizations (UNAOC), and journalists from many countries around the world.
UNIT 1.1 - LOOKING FOR A COMMON TERMINOLOGY

While telling stories on forced labour and fair recruitment, it is important to know that some words are legally defined while others aren’t. Understanding the definitions and interpretations is part of the preparatory work that should be done before any reporting. If you do not have a clear understanding of the meaning(s) of the words you use, your capacity to report accurately and to challenge the discourse of your sources of information is weakened.

Dictionaries, glossaries and media stylebooks are key resources to gain expertise and improve the quality of media productions. Drawing from the Media review exercise, Centre for Excellence in Journalism has developed a glossary of common terminologies (in Urdu) for the journalists and other stakeholders, working/writing on labour migration in Pakistan. The glossary is attached as an Annex - page 36

UNIT 1.2 - FORCED LABOUR

Forced labour can take many different forms. Victims are often tricked into jobs where they are paid little or nothing at all and then cannot leave because they have been manipulated into debt or had their identity documents confiscated. Poverty, illiteracy, discrimination and migration are some of the factors that make workers more vulnerable to forced labour.
A. WHAT IS FORCED LABOUR?
The term forced labour covers a wide variety of coercive labour practices where work is extracted from individuals under the threat of penalty. People who are in forced labour did not give their free and informed consent to start working and/or are not free to leave their work. Human trafficking, debt bondage, bonded labour, slave labour and modern-day slavery are terms that are used by news and media to describe forced labour situations. There are an estimated 24.9 million victims of forced labour around the world. The ILO says forced labour can be found almost anywhere, whether that is in Asia and the Pacific, Europe, Central Asia, Africa, the Arab States or the Americas.

B. HOW DO PEOPLE GET TRAPPED?
Some workers are more vulnerable to the risk of forced labour because they face discrimination (for example, minorities) or because they are isolated (for example, migrant workers). The risk of abuse is higher when the work is performed out of sight, behind closed doors, such as the case of domestic workers.

C. WHAT TYPE OF WORK OR WHICH SECTOR?
Forced labour can happen in any type of activity inside the labour market, in formal or informal sector, even though some low-wage jobs are more prone to abusive practices and exploitation.

D. RECRUITMENT PRACTICES
The use of coercion is often very subtle and hard to detect. Recruitment through deception, including making false promises, is very common when it comes to forced labour. Private recruiters and informal intermediaries may be the only source of employment information available to migrants. This makes it easy for them to lie about the nature of jobs and conditions of work.

E. IMPUNITY AND PROFITS
Unscrupulous recruiters and employers reap huge illegal profits, facilitated by an environment of impunity where abuses are not always effectively investigated or prosecuted. Victims and their families lose income and as a result cannot escape poverty. It also creates unfair competition for ethical companies and risks tarnishing the reputation of entire industries. Therefore, such environment must be tackled with the contribution of all relevant parties including recruiters, employers, and regulators. They do take their responsibility seriously and stick to the law.

F. LABOUR MIGRATION AND THE RISK OF FORCED LABOUR
Migrant workers are one of the groups most vulnerable to forced labour. Around 44% of forced labour victims are migrant workers, either moving within their own country or internationally. Once workers have left their country of origin for a country of destination, they can find themselves more vulnerable to exploitation, especially when they don’t speak the language.

- Debt bondage
Debt bondage is the most common form of coercion used to entrap workers. It affects 51% of all victims of forced labour in the private sector. Accepting credit for expenses such as travel costs immediately places a worker in debt to their employers. This debt can then be manipulated through sudden “rises” in interest rates or hidden charges.
Retention of passports
The retention of passports and other identity documents is one of the most common forms of coercion, restricting a migrant worker’s freedom of movement, preventing them from seeking help and trapping them in forced labour. It is one of eleven indicators of forced labour. In many countries, this is even a common practice for certain kinds of workers, for example, for domestic workers who live in the household of their employers.

Wage withholding
Wages may be withheld in order to cover housing or tools and equipment. This creates a situation where the worker becomes dependent on the employer for food and shelter.

G. ENDING FORCED LABOUR
Forced labour is a severe violation of human rights and is considered a crime under international law. It should be punishable through penalties reflecting the gravity of the offence and deterring perpetrators to repeat. Although most countries outlaw forced labour, human trafficking and slavery-like practices in their national legislation, successful prosecutions of offenders sadly remain few.

H. THE IMPORTANCE OF REGULATION
When labour markets fail and workers are left unprotected, the most vulnerable among them are at risk of exploitation. In its effort to promote decent work, the ILO has developed over time several international labour standards that tackle forced labour. Some address force labour in general while others focus on specific issues such as child labour or domestic work.

Combating forced labour requires the effective regulation of labour markets, at both international and national levels, and proper enforcement of labour laws.

UNIT 1.3 - DECENT WORK OPPORTUNITIES THROUGH FAIR RECRUITMENT
In today’s globalized economy, millions of people are looking for job opportunities beyond their community or country of origin and the recruitment and employment of workers along global supply chains is ever more common. Migration today is more and more about the world of work. In addition, millions of workers migrate within their own country in search of decent work. Making sure that the recruitment process is fair is a key aspect in securing decent work opportunities for all.

A. WHAT IS FAIR RECRUITMENT?
Fair recruitment is a concept that is not defined in international law but that has become central to international debates and ILO work. The Fair Recruitment Initiative is an ILO global initiative looking to improve recruitment practices. It is based on a four-pronged approach: improving global knowledge on national and international recruitment practices (1), improving laws, policies and enforcement (2), promoting fair business practices (3), and empowering and protecting workers (4).

The concept of fair recruitment is embedded in the ILO General principles and Operation Guidelines on Fair Recruitment, which look at various aspects of the recruitment process, and in particular the following:
• Information on job opportunities
Fair recruitment starts at the beginning of the recruitment process when information on the existence of a job opportunity is shared. Unfair practices such as deception can happen at that moment, for example through the publication of false promises in the classified section of a newspaper. Governments can issue press releases or can publish advertisements to reject such lies.

Example of overseas job advertised in local newspaper

• Direct recruitment or agents?
Recruitment processes can be complex and involve different private or public actors. The more intermediaries there are between the employer and the worker, the more risks there are of unethical practices. One of the common problems workers face is the payment, directly or indirectly, of recruitment fees or costs.

The ILO principles and guidelines for fair recruitment state that workers should not pay recruitment fees or related costs, and yet in many countries, recruitment fees are still legally charged to the workers whether in part or fully. In addition, it is important to understand the whole range of costs that workers end up paying. These can include “recruitment fees”, usually charged by a recruitment agency for the services of connecting a worker with an employer, but can also include related costs, such as costs for identity documents, travel documents, medical checks and pre-departure training.

• Appropriate job matching
The recruitment process should ensure that an efficient job matching is made so that workers are offered a placement with job opportunities that are best suited for their qualifications, abilities and aspirations.

B. ELIMINATING WORKER-PAID RECRUITMENT FEES AND RELATED COSTS
The recruitment process often involves third-party intermediaries charging high fees, which frequently burdens migrants in the lowest-paying jobs. ILO-World Bank surveys\(^2\) show that low income migrants - likely the least skilled or educated – are paying the highest costs relative to their earning. The ILO General Principles and Operational Guidelines for Fair Recruitment, and Definition of recruitment fees and related costs, clearly call for recruitment fees and related costs to be borne by employers, not workers.

---

C. WHO ELSE HAS A ROLE TO PLAY IN THIS STORY?
Many different actors have a role to play in promoting fair recruitment and ensuring its effective implementation. Governments bear the ultimate responsibility for advancing fair recruitment and should adopt and enforce laws and policies meeting international standards. Enterprises - including labour recruiters, public employment services, private and public employers - as well as trade unions and civil society organizations - are all essential to promote fair recruitment. Finally, the media can also play a role, by making sure that workers are informed and by exposing malpractices publicly.

D. ETHICAL RECRUITERS
Some private recruitment companies/agencies have made the choice to be “ethical recruiters”. The terms and conditions they offer to employers and workers are transparent and respect fair recruitment guidelines. Their experience is important in demonstrating that compliance with the law and ethical behaviour in recruitment works.

UNIT 1.4 - LEGAL FRAMEWORKS

The legal framework addressing forced labour and fair recruitment is both international and national. At the international level, several instruments have been adopted through time. Some of these instruments are legally-binding for the countries who have ratified them (all conventions and protocols) and some provide non-binding guidance to strengthen national frameworks (recommendations). In addition, the elimination of all forms of forced labour is one of the ILO’s four fundamental principles and rights at work. As a consequence, the instruments related to forced labour must be respected, enforced and promoted by all ILO member states, whether they have ratified it or not.

A. INTERNATIONAL LABOUR STANDARDS

The following timeline presents relevant ILO instruments:


1930
Forced Labour Convention, 1930 (No. 29) - Ratified by Pakistan in 1957
Convention No. 29 requires ratifying States to suppress all forms of forced or compulsory labour (Article 1(1)). As the first convention on the subject, it provides the definition of “forced or compulsory labour” (Article 2(1)) and lists 5 exceptions. It also requires ratifying States to ensure that the use of forced labour is punishable as a penal offence and that penalties are “really adequate and strictly enforced” (Article 25).

1949
Migration for Employment Convention (Revised), 1949 (No. 97) - Not ratified by Pakistan
The Convention requires ratifying states to facilitate international migration for employment by establishing and maintaining a free assistance and information service for migrant workers and taking measures against misleading propaganda relating to emigration and immigration; includes provisions on appropriate medical services for migrant workers and the transfer of earnings and savings. States have to apply treatment no less favourable that which applies to their own nationals in respect to a number of matters, including conditions of employment, freedom of association and social security.
Abolition of Forced Labour Convention, 1957 (No. 105) - Ratified by Pakistan in 1960
Convention No. 105 prohibits explicitly five situations where forced labour is imposed by state authorities, namely forced labour as punishment for the expression of political views, for the purposes of economic development, for participation in strikes, as a means of racial or other discrimination or as labour discipline.

Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention, 1958 (No. 111) - Ratified by Pakistan in 1961
The ILO adopted this Convention concerning Discrimination in Respect of Employment and Occupation, which is part of the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work (Declaration on FPRW adopted in 1998 and revised in 2010). The convention requires states to enable legislation which prohibits all discrimination and exclusion on any basis including of race or colour, sex, religion, political opinion, national or social origin in employment and repeal legislation that is not based on equal opportunities.

Migrant Workers (Supplementary Provisions) Convention, 1975 (No. 143) - Not ratified by Pakistan
The Convention provides for measures to combat clandestine and illegal migration while at the same time setting forth the general obligation to respect the basic human rights of all migrant workers. It also extends the scope of equality between legally resident migrant workers and national workers beyond the provisions of the 1949 Convention to ensure equality of opportunity and treatment in respect of employment and occupation, social security, trade union and cultural rights, and individual and collective freedoms for persons who as migrant workers or as members of their families are lawfully within a ratifying state’s territory. Calls upon ratifying states to facilitate the reunification of families of migrant workers legally residing in their territory.

Private Employment Agencies Convention, 1997 (No. 181) - Not ratified by Pakistan
Adopted in 1997, this convention recognises the “role private employment agencies may play in a well-functioning labour market”. The purpose of the Convention is to allow the operation of private employment agencies as well as to protect the workers using their services. According to Article 7 of the convention, private employment agencies shall not charge directly or indirectly, in whole or in part, any fees or costs to workers.

Declaration on Fundamental Principles of Rights at Work, 1998
Adopted by all ILO Member States in 1998, the Declaration defines the 4 core labour standards that all Member States must “respect, promote and realize”, whether or not they have ratified the relevant Conventions. The 4 principles are freedom of association and the right to collective bargaining, as well as the elimination of forced labour, child labour, and discrimination.

Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182) - Ratified by Pakistan in 1999
Adopted in 1999, this Convention calls for the prohibition and elimination of the worst forms of child labour as a matter of urgency. The worst forms of child labour include all types of slavery, including the sale and trafficking of children; forced labour to pay off a debt; any other type of forced labour, including using children in war and armed conflict. Other worst forms of child labour include the sexual exploitation of children, the involvement of children in illicit activities, and work which is likely to harm the health, safety or morals of children.
Domestic Workers Convention, 2011 (No. 189) - Not ratified by Pakistan
Adopted in 2011, this convention focuses on decent work specifically for domestic workers. Articles 8 and 15 focus on the recruitment side of domestic work with notable provisions on the role of private recruitment agencies, on fees and on repatriation. According to Article 9, domestic workers:
   a) are free to reach agreement with their employer or potential employer on whether to reside in the household,
   b) who reside in the household are not obliged to remain in the household or with household members during periods of daily and weekly rest or annual leave; and
   c) are entitled to keep in their possession their travel and identity documents.

Forced Labour (Supplementary Measures) Recommendation, 2014 (No. 203)
Recommendation No. 203, which supplements both the Protocol and Convention No. 29, provides non-binding practical guidance concerning measures to strengthen national law and policy on forced labour in the areas of prevention, protection of victims and ensuring their access to justice and remedies, enforcement and international cooperation. It builds on the provisions of the Protocol and should be read in conjunction with it.

Protocol of 2014 to the Forced Labour Convention, 1930 (P029) - Not ratified by Pakistan
The Protocol is a legally-binding instrument that requires States to take effective measures to prevent forced labour and provide victims with protection and access to remedies, including compensation. It supplements Convention No. 29, so ILO member States must have ratified the Convention first to be able to ratify the Protocol.

B. GOOD PRACTICES IN SOME OF NATIONAL LEGISLATIONS

- Armenia
  2011 Criminal Code (Amendments) allowed for the confiscation of property from offenders. Additionally, victims of trafficking have been included in the list of priority groups.

- Nigeria
  Section 62 of the Nigeria’s 2015 Trafficking in Persons (Prohibition) Law Enforcement and Administration Act, provides that where “the circumstances so justify, trafficked persons shall not be detained or prosecuted for offences related to being a victim of trafficking, including non-possession of valid travel documents, use of a false travel or other document.”

- United Kingdom
  The United Kingdom’s 2015 Modern Slavery Act criminalizes forced or compulsory labour and human trafficking.

- United States
  In 2012, the United States Government emphasized the importance of due diligence in preventing forced labour and trafficking with Executive Order No. 13627. The Order, and its subsequent federal regulations, set out strict requirements for contractors and subcontractors who receive federal contracts.

C. DOMESTIC LEGISLATION ON FORCED LABOUR AND FAIR RECRUITMENT

- The Pakistan Constitution includes prohibition of forced labour (Article 11)
- The Bureau of Emigration and Overseas Employment (BE&OE) issues licenses to Overseas Employment Promoters (OEPs) in private sector under section 12 of Emigration Ordinance, 1979.
- The Emigration Ordinance of 1979 and its accompanying rules comprise the
overarching legal framework governing all forms of overseas labour recruitment and emigration in Pakistan.
- The Emigration Rules, 1979 (Clause 15-A) prohibit Overseas Employment Promoters (OEPs) from charging fees beyond the actual expenses incurred for air tickets, medical exams, work permits, levies, visas, and documentation along with a service fee capped at 6,000 Pakistani rupees (USD 38').
- The Emigration Rules, 1979 (Clauses 7 and 11) prohibit OEPs from subcontracting to unlicensed agents (although in practice, the demand for recruitment services is so strong –both among OEPs and aspiring migrant workers – that their role is prevalent).
- The Emigration Rules, 1979 (amended 2012) (Clause 21), suggest that the OEPs must explain to migrant workers the content of the agreement in their own language; and ensure that the persons fully understand the terms and conditions of service contained in the agreement and have voluntarily offered themselves for employment abroad, register the foreign service agreements and issue

• Sections of the **Pakistan Penal Code** criminalize some forms of human trafficking (US TIP report)
• The **Prevention of Trafficking in Persons Act (PTPA)**, 2018, criminalizes all forms of sex trafficking and labour trafficking (US TIP report) (the PTPA replaces the Prevention and Control of Human Trafficking Ordinance, PACHTO)
• The federal **Bonded Labor System (Abolition) Act (BLSA)** criminalizes bonded labor
• The **Federal Investigative Agency (FIA)** is the government’s lead reporting and coordinating entity on human trafficking (US TIP report)
• The federal **Bonded Labour System (Abolition) Act** criminalizes bonded labour, and is in force in the Islamabad Capital Territory, Gilgit Baltistan, and Balochistan.
• At the provincial level, the following Acts relate to forced labour applies:
  - The Sindh Bonded Labour System (Abolition) Act, 2015
  - The Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Bonded Labour System (Abolition) Act, 2015 (Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Act No. XIV of 2015)
• At the territorial/regional level, the following Act related to forced labour applies:

**LABOUR MIGRATION POLICY FRAMEWORK**
• No formal labour emigration policy exists in Pakistan, although several drafts have been made in since 2008. As of July 2020, the draft “National Emigration and Welfare Policy” is awaiting finalization and delivery to cabinet for approval.
• The 18th amendment (2010) to the Constitution of Pakistan mandated labour emigration a federal jurisdiction. The provinces only have the responsibility of designing, imparting, assessing and accrediting technical and vocational skills training, to prepare Pakistani workers for the national and overseas labour market. Provinces also cannot sign Memoranda of Understanding (MOU) with any destination country (this is performed by the MOP&HRD at the Federal government level).

1. Based on the October 2019 exchange rate.
UNIT 2.1 - GETTING PREPARED

Being fair to the story is a challenging task. It requires good preparation, understanding of the subject matter, hard work as well as long-term dedication. According to photojournalist and documentary filmmaker Mimi Chakarova, the biggest preparation is mental. Beyond the mental preparation, Ms. Chakarova also suggests that quality reporting comes from extensive research. In doing so, you should bear in mind the following do’s and don’ts:

Table 2: Do’s and Don’ts

**DO**

Read what is currently being reported by the media and look for stories that are poorly covered: decent work deficits or even abuses in some sectors, gaps in legislation, victim protection, and discrimination in services provided to victims.

**DON’T**

Look for stories that are sensational or try to fit into an existing narrative by distorting the reality.
UNIT 2.2 - FINDING A STORY

There are examples of reporting on situations of forced labour in this section, the focus of this module is not on revealing a story of abuse. Positive stories can be powerful and provide information that can both prevent situations of abuse and improve public perception about the benefits of labour migration, which, if it takes place under fair recruitment and decent working conditions, can contribute to development, to the wellbeing of countries of origin and destination and to migrants themselves.

Journalists can also tell stories of positive changes in policies, laws, business practices, and how these changes might affect the life of thousands of people.

This section is organised by theme and provide a brief introduction, examples of reporting and, when relevant, a list of questions that can be the starting point of a story.

A. HUMAN STORIES

The most compelling stories are those where people tell their own stories. There is no need to sensationalise these accounts: you can just let the facts and the personal testimonies speak for themselves, adding any required factual information that is missing. Support groups may be able to put you in touch with someone, for example, who has escaped. You must protect their identity if they request it. Human interest stories are often widely shared and can raise awareness about the issues and create social pressure for change.
Key questions you may wish to consider include:

- How were they recruited?
- What work are they doing?
- What journey did they make?
- What are the living conditions outside work?
- If they had been trapped into forced labour, how did they get their freedom?
- What was the reaction of the community around them?

**EXAMPLES OF HUMAN STORIES**


### B. LABOUR AND THE WORKPLACE

Decent work sums up the aspirations of people in their working lives. The four pillars of the Decent Work Agenda include: Employment creation, social protection, rights at work and social dialogue. The recruitment conditions of workers may affect the realization of each of these pillars and fair recruitment should apply to all workers. Yet abuses can occur in many industries that can lead to forced labour. It can happen out of sight, for example in domestic work; or in remote areas, such as agriculture, mining and fishing; as well as in sectors closer to our everyday lives, such as catering and hospitality.

Key questions you may wish to consider include:

- What are the main sectors of activity and employment in your region?
- What are the steps workers need to take to get a job? Do they have to pay recruitment fees? How can advance payments force workers into “debt bondage”?
- Do employers and workers know about their rights at work?
- What are the working conditions?
- What information is provided about safety and health on the job?

---

C. BUSINESS AND ECONOMICS

Forced labour and unfair recruitment generate huge illegal profits. An ILO study found that modern slavery generates annual profits of over US$ 150 billion. News reports can unveil the economics behind these issues and encourage employers and businesses to address the risk of forced labour and promote fair recruitment and decent working conditions in their own operations as well as in their supply chains.

Key questions you may wish to consider include:
- What are the economic incentives behind unfair recruitment practices, trafficking and forced labour?
- How can these be reversed or overcome?
- What are businesses doing to promote decent working conditions in their operations?
- How do public and private employers ensure due diligence in their supply chains?
- How are corporate promises integrated into actual business practices?
- Has consumer pressure resulted in improvements for workers?

D. MIGRATION

The ILO estimates that there are 150 million migrant workers in the world today. Stories about migration can highlight the difficult choices individuals and their families face in searching for better opportunities. Stories about migration can also help show the positive contribution migrant workers make to countries’ economies, helping to overcome common negative stereotypes and xenophobia.

Key questions you may wish to consider include:

- Why do people look for work opportunities away from home?
- What are the legal opportunities to migrate?
- How do people travel?
- Who facilitates migration?
- What happens when legal or established migration routes are suddenly shut?
- How are migrant workers welcomed in countries of destination? Are they treated fairly?

### E. DISCRIMINATION

Discrimination can be based on gender, race, ethnicity, indigenous identity and disability. All these types of discrimination can influence recruitment and working conditions. In some cases, workers can be in forced labour because they belong to a certain ethnic group or caste, or even for holding some form of political opinion. In other cases, women migrant workers can experience discriminatory labour practices at home and abroad.

It is important to take discrimination into account when you look at issues of recruitment and forced labour. Stories about overcoming discrimination in the workplace and promoting equality of treatment on the job can raise awareness and change mind-sets.

Key questions you may wish to consider include:

- Are some people facing discrimination in terms of job opportunities, recruitment, working conditions? In which sectors?
- Are efforts being made to ensure equality in the workplace?
- Does internal and international migration affect some groups of people differently?
- Are some people more vulnerable to forced labour than others? Children? Women? Men? Indigenous people?
- Do women and men have equal rights at work? Are they equally aware of their rights?

### EXAMPLES OF STORIES ABOUT MOBILITY


### EXAMPLES OF STORIES ABOUT DIFFERENCES


F. LAW, ENFORCEMENT AND CRIMES

The justice system in most countries shines light into some of mankind’s most unsavoury practices. It is true for abuse of labour rights. If your country takes action against labour abuses, make contact with the organizations and people who are responsible for this, whether they are in the mainstream police or a specialist agency. If there are laws, but they are not enforced, ask why not.

Key questions you may wish to consider include:
- What relevant laws are in place in your country?
- Who is in charge of enforcing the laws?
- How do they go about doing it?
- How well are laws enforced?
- What are the consequences for those who abuse workers’ rights?

Below is a news report published in the English-language daily paper *Dawn* about law enforcement’s role in monitoring recruitment agencies. The following news story indicates how law enforcement has received information on multiple questionable recruitment agencies offering jobs to Pakistanis in the Middle East. It highlights the role of the Community Welfare Attaché at the Consulate General of Pakistan in Dubai, Federal Investigation Agency (FIA), and the Bureau of Emigration and Overseas Employment. These types of stories can be useful for launching further investigations by journalists.

**Pakistan consulate seeks action against firms over human trafficking to UAE**

**ISLAMABAD:** The Consulate General of Pakistan in Dubai has written to the Federal Investigation Agency (FIA) and the Bureau of Emigration and Overseas Employment seeking action against nine companies allegedly involved in trafficking people from Pakistan to the United Arab Emirates (UAE).

The letter was written in response to complaints by Pakistani citizens living and working in Dubai. Signed by Community Welfare Attaché Saultat Saqib and available with *Dawn*, the letter informed the FIA that Pakistani citizens have filed applications against companies and agents that they claim are running fake companies in the UAE.

“They issued fake offer letters and visa approvals and charged huge amount from the applicants for their jobs in UAE,” it said.

The letter added: “It is requested to look into the matter and take necessary action for redressal of grievances of the applicants as per rules and procedure, under intimation to this mission.”

*Dawn* 3 February 2020


Below is an example of law enforcement of recruitment agencies in Pakistan, published on the BBC Urdu website. The story focuses on how the contracts that were agreed to by Pakistani workers were violated upon their arrival in Pakistan.
NOTES

G. INFORMATION, EDUCATION AND ADVOCACY

Stories can be inspired by people who everyday are making a difference to tackle labour abuses and to promote decent work for all.

Key questions you may wish to consider include:

- What is being done to inform people about their rights?
- Who is acting for the abused?
- What expressions of public support or hostility are there for people in forced labour and for people who migrate?
- Are there adverse effects to the policies promoted by advocacy groups?
- What role do celebrities or other figures play in raising awareness?

Pakistani news media has published numerous examples of public advocacy and educational initiatives around migration. Several stories covered migration-themed conferences at universities and other venues promoting better understanding of labour migration to the public at large. Other articles looked at how fundamental information about migration or concerning migrant workers was conveyed to migrant communities in the Gulf, such as information on repatriation flights amid the COVID-19 pandemic.

FOREIGN EXAMPLES OF STORIES ABOUT JUSTICE


For example, a May 2020 article in the Urdu newspaper Daily Jasarat discussed the Pakistani government’s virtual town hall with Pakistanis in Saudi Arabia, including how the Foreign Minister used the venue to inform the migrant population of COVID-19 repatriation efforts, free coronavirus tests, access to quarantine facilities, as well as schemes to abolish fines in jails and offer passport assistance.

The following article, published in the Urdu newspaper Daily Jang comprehensively analyses the facts on labour migration from Pakistan, consequences of irregular migration.
A February 2020 article in *Dawn* covered the release of a new report published by the Centre on International Migration, Remittances and Diaspora (CIMRAD) at the Graduate Institute of Development Studies (GIDS) LSE.

**Pakistan Migration Report 2020: Ishrat for tapping expats’ potential to improve indicators**

The Newspaper's Staff Reporter | 20 Feb 2020

**LAHORE: Adviser to the Prime Minister on Institutional Reforms and Austerity Dr Ishrat Hussain has called for utilising the potential of overseas Pakistanis in improving socio-economic indicators of the country through their contribution in the knowledge economy.**

*Dawn* | 20 February 2020


Similarly, coverage of NGO advocacy around migrant workers’ human rights appeared in some news outlets, such as the below 2019 *Dawn* article covering a Justice Project Pakistan community event calling attention to the detention of overseas workers. The article interviewed relatives of prisoners in Saudi Arabia, in addition to highlighting the statements of a senator, the artist, and the NGO itself.

**Art installation draws attention to plight of Pakistani labourers imprisoned abroad**

Sheharyar Rizwan | Updated 19 Jan 2020

*The suitcases as part of the installation representing migrant workers languishing in foreign jails. — Photo by Nade Aji*

*Dawn* | 18 December 2019

UNIT 2.3 - GETTING SUPPORT

A. GAINING SUPPORT
If you are a reporter aiming to do a story which will take time and resources and which may attract hostile attention, you will probably face a tough task in convincing your editors to let you do so.

The only option is persuading editors that the work is important and adds value to the news organisation. You might remind your superiors that:

- Investigations are at the heart of journalism.
- Strong investigative reports will raise the profile of the news organization, improve its standing and potentially increase its revenue.
- The report or reports will be of a uniquely high quality and will bring attention and kudos.
- Your organization can ‘own’ the subject – that is to say, become the natural home of coverage of the subject. Other people will come forward with related stories.
- There may be the chance to enter the report(s) for awards.

B. FUNDING
In investigations, when you are looking for extra time and resources, it helps if you can set out all the likely costs, including staff time, travel and accommodation costs, and other costs.

Look for external funding for a story: an international non-governmental organization might agree to pay the costs of a reporter travelling to another country to produce a series of reports on migration. Sometimes grants are made to the winners of a competition.

Be aware of the risks that the report becomes one-sided and only reports what the funder wants. It is important that the news organization retains its editorial control and remains in charge of what is ultimately published.

C. COLLABORATING WITH OTHER MEDIA OUTLETS
Collaborating with another news organization can help to reduce costs and increase impact. Even global news organizations like the Guardian and the Washington Post have done it, to great effect. There are also opportunities for smaller news organizations to collaborate across borders.

Collaborative efforts are also useful when the time of publication comes. The simultaneous launch of stories, in different media and possibly, in different countries, can yield a bigger impact and audience.

The Global Investigative Journalism Network, in its Human Trafficking Resources, lists several interesting collaborations.
D. EXTERNAL SUPPORT
Ensure that your reporting has strong support both within and inside your media house.
Possible candidates include:
• Elected politicians
• Business leaders
• Law enforcement officials
• Leaders of NGOs and campaign groups
• Experts such as academics
• Celebrities

Explain your story and ask for their support. Publish a few words of support alongside their picture. This will demonstrate to those who would wish you ill that you have support in the community.
UNIT 3.1 - RESOURCES

A. FACTS AND FIGURES
Facts are the basis for all investigative journalism. Mostly, facts are nothing more than dry numbers on a page but with a proper understanding and interpretation they can reveal stories of real interest. Learn to love documents. Look for official or highly respected documents such as official statistics, legal and regulatory frameworks, court documents, company publications, and newspaper articles.

B. PHOTOGRAPHS AND VIDEOS
Photographs, and increasingly video, are a vital part of modern story-telling. But forced labour and unfair recruitment usually take place in the shadows, and both perpetrators and victims may not be willing to be identified.

If someone agrees to be photographed (or filmed), but asks that they not be identified, it is far, far better to protect their identity during the filming – for example, by only photographing them in silhouette or by filming only the interviewee’s hands, rather than relying on post-production techniques such as pixelating or hiding the person’s face during the edit or production process.
What can you do if you can’t get original images?
- You could use stock images from a picture library but the image may not match your story.
- You can illustrate your story with visual arts such as drawings, cartoons and paintings.
- You might even leave the story without illustration and explain your reader why that is your choice.

Images play an important role but lack of professionalism or resources often leads to sloppy photo editing and, in the end, to a major disservice to the audience.

UNIT 3.2 - SAFETY

A. THE PRINCIPLES OF ETHICAL JOURNALISM

Here are some top tips for staying safe in your reporting:

- Be accurate
  Only report those facts which you have checked and double checked and know to be true. Everything else is a claim and should be attributed. Take care to report claims accurately. Do not draw conclusions. Report according to the limits of your ability. If you are covering a sensitive issue, report on what you can see, or at least what you are told by those around you. Leave the analysis, interpretation and speculation to others who have other sources and can see the bigger picture.

- Be sceptical
  Analyse all information you are given on a situation. Consider recording the conversations you have with anyone involved in a sensitive story you are covering. Later, they may be pressured to deny your reports, and you may need to present your recordings and transcripts to a court.

- Be balanced
  Actively seek out the views of all parties. If they won’t speak to you, or you can’t reach them, look for an authoritative source of their position, such as their official website or news agency. If you fail, explain why: “For such and such reason, it has not been possible to reach the following source of information.”

Don’t act as a judge, advocate or human rights activist. Leave this to the experts who can brief you and give you analyses.

- Be impartial
  Don’t promote the views of one of the parties to the conflict.

Don’t use language (usually adjectives) to describe how good (strong, heroic, determined, rightful) one side is, or how terrible (evil, weak, cowardly) the other side is.

Recognise that words used widely and without intended prejudice in one community can cause offence among another. Would you like to be described as a ‘tribal’ or ‘aboriginal’? Show respect to other people. Find out how they themselves prefer to be described.

Recognise when your own bias appears in your reporting and remove it.6

B. PERSONAL SAFETY

Journalists who are reporting on issues such as unfair recruitment or forced labour are particularly at risk – even if they do so in a balanced and objective way. You are likely to be exposing criminal organizations or powerful individuals, or even government abuses. Reprisals may range from intimidation and harassment to actual violence, illegal arrest and arbitrary detention. You need to be aware and to be prepared.

C. PHYSICAL AND MENTAL HEALTH

Be mentally prepared for a traumatic assignment. Share stories and experiences with your fellow journalists. Debrief your bosses and colleagues.

Be aware of any potential risks to your physical health.

D. DIGITAL SECURITY

- Don’t keep contact details of sensitive sources in your handwritten notes, books, in your mobile phone or in computer files.
- Give your sensitive contacts a code name and use this in your notes.
- Protect your mobile phone with a strong PIN code.
- Store the contact details of sensitive sources under an assumed name.
- Delete records of sensitive calls.
- Delete text messages.
- Disguise sensitive numbers in another format.
- Learn how to use higher security for your web browsing.
- Learn how to send encrypted emails.
- Take care with what you post on social media.

RESOURCES


E. GOING UNDERCOVER

It is a general rule of journalism that reporters should be open and honest about who they are. They should not disguise their identity or activity in order to gain access to information that would not be shared with a reporter.

However, it can be very hard to gather convincing evidence of crime and anti-social behavior while being fully transparent.

This is why when - and only when - there is genuinely strong public interest reason to suggest crime or serious antisocial behavior, some investigative reporters will take on an assumed identity, for example, by pretending to be an unskilled worker to take a job where workers are abused. This is known as ‘going under cover’.

If the reporter makes covert sound or video recordings, a court may decide that they are an invasion of privacy and illegal. Reporters who are uncovered may be subjected to threats and even physical violence.

Consider:
- How will you join the organization you are about to expose?
- Will you work alone?
- How will you make sure that you are safe?
- What is your undercover identity and story?
- How will you avoid asking too many questions and arousing suspicion?
- How will you get the information out?
- How will you get yourself out if/when things go wrong?

RESOURCES


UNIT 3.3 - SOURCES

You can get information from a diversity of sources, including workers and their families, employers or agents and intermediaries that orchestrate recruitment as well as academics.

However unhappy they are about the situation they find themselves in, speaking out may only exacerbate the problem and possibly put them in danger. You will need to be sensitive and respectful, while at the same time encouraging them to provide you with information.

Stories about recruitment may address good or bad practices leading to very different outcomes for the workers’ concerned, affecting both their professional and personal life.

Journalists reporting on these stories need to work carefully and methodically to build up a body of evidence, ensuring accurate, fair and balanced reporting.
A diversity of sources must be considered. In the following section you will find tips on addressing particular types of sources.

A. SURVIVORS
You must not pressure them, but it is fair to tell victims that speaking out will inform the public about the scale and nature of the problem. It may give others the confidence to speak. And it may warn others of the dangers they may face in travelling across borders.

If you want people to open up to you about traumatic experiences, you need to win their trust. Victims must know that they will not be denigrated or re-victimized by your reporting. The stories that you write about survivors of abuse and atrocities will also determine whether your interviewees will want to talk to you again for follow-up stories.

You should always treat victims/survivors and their families with compassion, care, respect and dignity. This does not mean you should stop being a skeptical journalist working to find the truth.

Depending on the situation, it is advisable to let the interviewee choose the interview venue. You want them to be in a place where they feel comfortable talking.

Victims and survivors may request that you do not publish any information which could lead to them being identified. News organizations are often reluctant to use anonymous sources because it has the effect of weakening the impact of the testimony.

There may also be the danger that those accused attempt to punish those who speak out. It is vital that reporters do not allow this to happen.

If you promise to protect their anonymity, you must ensure that you do so. Take care that their identity is not revealed, even inadvertently by publishing so much information about the person that someone close to them could work out who you are talking about.

In some very sensitive cases, it goes beyond not mentioning their name or identity in pieces that you publish. You must also keep their identity secret in your own notes, in case these fall into hostile hands.

B. SUPPORT GROUPS, ADVOCACY ORGANIZATIONS, ACADEMICS
Whereas much of the power and emotional impact of a story will come from testimonies of those directly impacted, it will gain strength when bringing a wider perspective, placing the story of one or more individuals into context.

To do this, get information from experts working in the field, such as:
- Support groups for victims and survivors
- Associations
- Trade unions
- Law enforcement agencies
- Social services and other public services
- Academics
- Politicians with a specialist interest in the issue.
- Lawyers
- Global organizations, such as the ILO.

When you meet them, ask them to suggest someone else you should speak to. Build up your network of contacts. Follow them on social media; read their published articles. When you are researching your story, be sure to take detailed notes of what each person says to you. If, when you come to write the story, you are unsure of your understanding, you
will be able to go back and check with the right person. You will also be able to attribute the opinions to the right people. You will soon lose the trust of anyone you mis-quote or attribute the wrong opinion to.

C. ACTORS SUSPECTED OF ABUSE

People accused of crimes or anti-social behavior should be the last people you contact in your investigation, when you have gathered all the evidence and built a strong case against them.

If you contact them too early, they will have the chance to put pressure on witnesses, destroy evidence – and scupper your investigation.

However, in the interest of fairness, you do need to give them a chance to respond properly to any allegations of wrongdoing made against them.

Many news organizations would consider one or two days sufficient time for the accused to give a considered response – but not enough for them to take action – whether legal or illegal – to prevent publication.

If they agree to meet, consider your own safety:

- Take a colleague along with you.
- Inform your editor where you are going.
- Have someone check up on you.
- Take detailed notes or make a recording.
- Conduct the discussion professionally and politely.
- Do not permit yourself to become angry or indignant.

If they refuse to meet, you could ask them to answer your questions by phone or email.

A third option is for them to prepare a written (or recorded) statement for you to use as their response to the allegations against them.

You should be persistent in seeking a response, repeating that you want to hear their view of events in the interests of accuracy and fairness.

If you receive no reply after repeated contact, you should seek to represent their position as best you can, using publicly available sources. You would then write in your report words to the effect of:

Always be polite. As a journalist, your role is not to determine guilt, but to set out the facts as far as they can be established so that the public can reach their own conclusions.
UNIT 4.1 - WHICH MEDIUM?

Journalists have a number of platforms on which they might publish their story. It is worth considering at an early stage how you might make best use of the material you have to reach the largest number of people and make the most impact.

You don’t have to select just one. You can publish your material in different forms on different platforms such as newspaper, web, television etc.

A. WEB

Almost all news outlets have a website and some of them exist only as a website. However, these websites can as easily carry video or audio reports as they can words and pictures. During the process of building a story, consider taking photos, audio or video recordings that can be published in or alongside an article.

A “long read” is a new type of web article, which incorporates pictorial elements such as pictures, Infographics, maps and even audio and video clips into a long text article. The combination makes the format very engaging. It is especially suited to features and investigations.
B. SOCIAL MEDIA
Many news organisations make extensive use of social media such as Facebook, Twitter and Instagram. Often, social media are seen as a way of attracting and serving audiences for their mainstream output, but they can equally be used for storytelling in their own right.

Some reporters have become very clever at telling complicated stories on Twitter in a series of tweets – short messages of no more than two or three sentences, often accompanied by a picture or even a short piece of video.

Instagram is especially good for sharing pictures and short videos. It allows for the publication of a series of images of the people who have provided testimonies – with their permission, of course.

The instantaneity of social media is also quite powerful, notably when looking to produce a concrete reaction from a person or an organization involved in your story. Recent examples have shown how the use of Twitter has helped victims of forced labour and human trafficking shed light on their situation with authorities quickly reacting.

However social media should also be considered as a medium where ethical and unethical recruiters operate, leading to forced labour or fair recruitment opportunities. The fact that social media is a space where a growing number of people are going to search for jobs reinforces the idea that quality reporting should also appear on these platforms.

C. RADIO PROGRAMMES
Radio programmes can exist as part of a regular schedule, or exist entirely on their own as a podcast, downloadable and playable at any time. When they are held close to the source of the sound or used with a plug-in microphone, smartphones make good recording devices.

Editing can be performed on a smartphone or a computer.

D. VIDEO
Lightweight video production techniques such as filming and even editing on a smartphone make it possible for those with even modest resources to make their own video films, which can be shared online, broadcast on TV, shown in cinema or played to audiences in cinemas and community halls.

E. ANIMATION
Animation is a great way to tell a story where there is a need to protect the identity of those involved.

F. APPS
Many people will be familiar with apps which offered by news organisations as a way of accessing their content. But there have also been early experiments with using apps to tell stories in new ways. The BBC created an immersive video to simulate the experience of a migrant risking their life to seek work and a future in another country.

G. TELLING THE STORY IN PICTURES
As mentioned in the previous chapter, journalists must consider carefully how they portray their subject when reporting about labour issues. Particular attention needs to be paid when preserving the anonymity of sources and protecting victims of labour abuses is indicated.
UNIT 4.2 - CONSIDER A SERIES

If you’ve been working hard on a difficult subject such as fair recruitment or forced labour, it is likely that you have more material than you need for a single news report. In this case you could consider a series of reports on the same theme and host it on the web.

You might also consider taking the next step and turning your series into a campaign. This is when a news organization goes beyond its usual role of reporting neutrally on an issue and actually takes sides to support a policy change. News media that aim to be impartial and objective will normally only do this when they are fighting criminal activity and promoting human rights such as liberty, health and free labour.

The stories of the campaign may be focused on a single individual and unfold over time, or may feature different individuals who face similar problems. Alternatively, a single issue from a number of different angles can be considered: the trafficked or abused worker, the employer, the agent, the law enforcement officer, and so on.

The stories can run over consecutive days, or as an occasional series. Signposting forthcoming stories helps to keep viewers or readers engaged:

- “Tomorrow, in our continuing series, we’ll meet the broker who sent Abdul on his perilous journey.”
- “We’ll hear more from Marie and find out how she’s getting on with life as a free woman.”

SIX STEPS TO A SUCCESSFUL CAMPAIGN

STEP 1: SET OUT YOUR GOAL
Campaigns can start off big or start small and grow. They will always benefit from good advance planning. However, your objective must be clear from the outset. Are you calling for a change in the law? Or some other action? For example:

- “We will keep campaigning until we see an end to the permit system.”
- “All trafficked women must be freed and taken care of by the state.”

STEP 2: MANAGE YOUR CAMPAIGN
One person needs to manage the campaign on a daily basis to ensure that it keeps momentum and stays on track. This will usually be the reporter who is writing most of the stories.

The campaign also needs a champion who is senior in the editorial team such as a deputy editor, head of newsgathering, or somebody similar.

The champion will ensure that resources, including time, are allocated. Campaigns needs
many resources and junior staff may be reluctant to commit them. The champion will also protect the writing team by dealing with any external pressures from parties related to the inquiry.

**STEP 3: SEEK TO MAKE A STRONG INITIAL IMPACT**

Try to start the campaign with impact and choose a day when the campaign will not be competing against another planned news event.

Make the first campaign story prominent on the front page of a newspaper, or first in a television or radio news bulletin. Support it with side stories, backgrounders, images, and info graphics.

**STEP 4: MAKE IT EASY FOR READERS TO JOIN IN**

People are increasingly used to have their say on controversial issues by social media. Make the most of this and get them involved. Open up comments on your website and publish the most interesting and supportive. However, be aware that comments can also be negative, racist, sexist and else. It is important to set clear and firm code of conduct for commenting online.

Set up a dedicated email account for members of the public to send you their comments and even stories or story ideas.

There is a platform for e-petitions where citizens can sign up to support demands for a certain action such as a change in the law. If this is the case, set up a petition or ask a sympathetic politician to do it. Then encourage readers to sign the petition. You can publish the number of signatories as it rises, as an indication that the campaign has growing support.

**STEP 5: DO SOMETHING READERS CAN’T DO**

Remember the power and the limitations of your news organisation. It can amplify the voice of the readers, ask uncomfortable questions and demand answers from those in the highest authority.

Follow up this sort of action with calls to see if the material was received, been read and if there are any comments to be make on your dossier. Keep that pressure up. If they have nothing to say, try a week later and a week after that. Record your efforts to get an answer and publish it in the paper.

**STEP 6: KEEP IT AT IT**

There is an old newspaper adage that says that when you are getting tired of a campaign, the readers are only just beginning to notice it. Unless you have opted for a very short, sharp campaign, you are in it for the long run. Keeping campaigns lively, active and interesting is the job of the whole newsroom, not just the handful of people who are directly responsible for it.
UNIT 4.3 - ARE YOU READY?

A. THE EDITING PROCESS
Like any other type of reporting, reporting on fair recruitment and forced labour requires the use of good editing guidelines and practices. A wide body of resources on editing is available and largely contextualized, which is why the present toolkit cannot mention them all as good editing practices go far beyond our scope.

B. ARE YOU READY?
Before you publish your story or series of stories, bring everyone involved in the story together to ensure you have all the information at hand. You must have clear answers to the following questions:

• What are you trying to say or allege?
• Do you have enough information and evidence to say it?
• What are the implications of your allegations?
• Do you have full confidence in your sources and in your analysis of documents?
• Have you made an extra effort to verify and check all your information?
• Has everyone under criticism been given the opportunity to respond?
• How is the story structured? Work out the beginning, the middle and the end.
• Can you break the story up into manageable parts?
• How will you illustrate the reports? Can you explain the story with pictures, illustrations, tables, or graphics?
• Has a lawyer or experienced editor checked the entire story (including the headlines)?

If you can’t answer all these questions fully, you are not ready to publish.
A Toolkit for Journalists in Pakistan |

FOLLOWING UP

UNIT 5.1 - IMPACT, AWARDS AND SPECIALIZING

A. IMPACT
Good journalism makes a difference to people’s lives.

The practices you report on might not end, but reports you publish might:

- Lead to an individual or individuals being freed from forced labour
- Encourage an employer to modify their practices and/or encourage their business partners to do the same
- Give workers who had their rights infringed the confidence and contacts to set up a support group for others
- Encourage authorities to strengthen the laws and enforce the existing laws
- Encourage policy-makers to address forced labour and unfair recruitment practices and their root causes
- Raise awareness on the situation of specific categories of workers and change possible public misperceptions

It is important to think about the desirable outcomes for the workers. When reporting on a situation of forced labour, the solution of freeing the workers is a desired outcome. In other instances, when reporting on situations that are not necessarily fair to the workers, such as, for example, decent work deficits in terms of working conditions, the desired outcome may be subtler and involve improving working conditions through changes involving a large number of actors, hence more difficult to reach and monitor.
B. AWARDS
Awards, prizes and fellowships exist for almost all types of reporting. Labour migration issues and notably forced labour regularly feature in generic media awards, especially when they involve intensive investigation. In recent years, some of the most prestigious prizes in different countries have gone to these types of stories:
- Pulitzer prize (USA): Seafood from slave (2016)\(^7\)
- National Magazine Award (Canada): The Cage (2016)
- Albert Londres (France): Voyage en barbarie (2015)\(^8\)

These distinctions help increase the initial impact of a story as it brings the attention of other media professionals to the issues and, at times, the attention of the general public as well.

Several other award schemes also focus on labour and migration issues, including:
- Global media competition on labour migration and fair recruitment\(^9\)
- Migration Media Award\(^{10}\)
- Anti-Slavery Day Awards\(^{11}\)
- ILCA Labor Media Awards\(^{12}\)
- International Women in Media Foundations Awards\(^{13}\)

C. SPECIALIZING
Reporters with specialist skills are sometimes called ‘beat’ reporters, because they cover a specialized beat. The newsroom benefits from journalists specializing on specific issues. By becoming proficient in forced labour and fair recruitment, you can:
- Offer specialist story ideas to the news desk, even when they are not able to report on them,
- Understand and explain complicated stories,
- Know many experts who can be interviewed or provide information,
- Help your colleagues to cover related stories.
- Prepare ‘background’ pieces, which run alongside a news story, and explain the context,
- Plan ahead, looking for forthcoming news events, and ensure that the newsroom is properly prepared to cover them.

If you specialize you may find your work becomes more interesting and rewarding:
- You will get to know a subject area well.
- It is a different way of working, which may be a refreshing new challenge after years of covering general news.
- You will have a higher public profile in public and at work.
- You will have greater freedom in deciding which stories to cover, and how.
- You may escape reporting on trivial and predictable stories.
- You will be better able to demonstrate your talent, which may earn you the opportunity to tackle more senior editorial roles.

---

UNIT 5.2 - FINAL TIPS

A. READ UP

You need to know much more than you will ever regurgitate on the page or on air.

Read all you can about the subject. Read the specialist magazines. Follow the relevant blogs. Government bodies and NGOs often publish newsletters about their activities.

You will need to understand how recruitment mechanisms work, what labour migration is about and how national and international legal instruments come into effect.

When an opportunity such as workshops to learn more formally about your adopted subject area presents itself, take it. Every opportunity helps build up knowledge and develop a network.

B. DON’T GET LOST IN THE SUBJECT

Your job is to explain specialist issues to an audience of ordinary, non-specialist, people. Your job is to explain it clearly. That means:

- Translating jargon into everyday language;
- Cutting out irrelevant detail;
- Explaining things which are not clear;
- Making your stories relevant to readers, listeners or viewers.

C. DON’T BE ALONE

Get in touch with others who are covering the same beat. They can provide assistance with information, contacts, story ideas and advice. Consider joining or forming your own local group, or at least having an occasional informal get-together.

RESOURCES

ILO Topic page on Fair Recruitment
www.ilo.org/fairrecruitment

ILO Topic page on Forced Labour
www.ilo.org/forcedlabour

Thomson Reuters Foundation (n.d.) Human trafficking and modern day slavery reporting
## Glossary of Key Terminologies for Media Reporting in Pakistan

Forced Labour and Fair recruitment of migrant workers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Urdu Word</th>
<th>English Word</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>اقامتہ</td>
<td>Residential permit</td>
<td>The overseas employment promoter / recruitment agency / employer gets the foreign service agreement signed by workers before departure to pursue residential permit for the worker in the country of destination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>امتیازی سلوک</td>
<td>Discrimination</td>
<td>Any distinction, exclusion or preference made on the basis of race, colour, sex, religion, political opinion, or national extraction or social origin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>امیگرشن دراست</td>
<td>Immigration Detention</td>
<td>Immigration detention is the policy of holding individuals suspected of visa violations, irregular entry or unauthorized arrival, and those subject to deportation and removal in detention until a decision is made by immigration authorities to grant a visa and release them into the community, or to repatriate them to their country of departure.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>انسانی سمگلنگ</td>
<td>Human Smuggling</td>
<td>Human Smuggling refers to the facilitation, transportation or irregular entry of a person across an international border, in violation of one or more countries’ laws, either clandestinely or through deception, such as the use of fraudulent documents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>انتحاف نکر رسانی: بیرون ملک مللہ کا دوران لیش آئے / اسرار نکر ہدایت کو دل کی لپیٹ شکایات درج کرنا</td>
<td>Access to Justice: Grievance/ complaints registration</td>
<td>It refers to support mechanisms/services for migrant workers to access justice through registering complaints/ grievances against the employer, overseas employment promoter/ recruitment agency or work related problems.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>بیرون ملک مللہ کا ممالکہ</td>
<td>Foreign Service Agreement</td>
<td>The Foreign service agreement is legal document which specifies the nature and duration of work, terms and conditions and rights and responsibilities of workers, it is important for the worker to carefully read and understand the agreement/ contract before signing it.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>بیانہ کی ملالشی</td>
<td>Asylum Seekers</td>
<td>An asylum seeker is someone whose claim has not yet been finally decided on by the country in which he or she has submitted it.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>بیشہ وریہ صحیح و حفاظت</td>
<td>Occupational safety and health</td>
<td>It refers to measures taken to ensure safety and health at the workplace. These include use of appropriate safety gadgets, caution while handling dangerous machines and tools, safety against harsh weather and hazardous working conditions to avoid injuries and accidents.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ہنگیسی پریا مباہر</td>
<td>Stranded Migrants</td>
<td>Migrants who “find themselves legally stranded, because they are unable to remain lawfully in the country in which they are physically present, or move to another country, or return to their home country”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>تارکین وطن</td>
<td>Expatriate</td>
<td>A person temporarily or permanently residing outside of the country of which the person is a citizen. The person may be working or not.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>تنظیم سازی کی آزا دی</td>
<td>Freedom of Association</td>
<td>Freedom of association is a fundamental human right and is also at the core of the ILO’s values. In the area of employment, it is the right of workers and employers without distinction whatsoever, and subject only to the rules of the organizations concerned, to form and join organizations of their own choosing without previous authorization.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arabic Term</td>
<td>English Translation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>جبری مشقت</td>
<td>Forced Labor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deportation</td>
<td>An act of expelling or removing a foreign national from a country, either to the country of origin or to a third country.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>دو طرفہ معافیا</td>
<td>Bilateral Agreements</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Donker (Slang)</td>
<td>Legally-binding treaties between a country of origin and a country of destination outlining the agreed terms, principles, and procedures governing labour migration between the two states</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Donkey (Slang)</td>
<td>A slang which is used in Punjab's those districts which are known as the centers of human trafficking and smuggling. The word is used for those people who aspire to go to Europe through irregular migration channels. The word is a metaphor for the kind of treatment which these migrants receive in Pakistan, Iran and Turkey</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>رقم کے منتقلی</td>
<td>Remittances</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>سفری دستاویزات</td>
<td>Travelling documents</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>غیر فاؤنڈ تارکین وطن</td>
<td>Identity, travel and work documents, such as passport, national or foreign national identity card. These documents are crucial to the mobility and safety of migrant workers through all stages of migration and employment process</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>کفالت/سپورنشپ</td>
<td>Kafala/Sponsorship</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Several Arab Governments have authorized their citizens/companies to sponsor / take the responsibility of bringing foreign worker, this process is called Kafala. Worker cannot work with other person/company without obtaining permission of Kafeel.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>کفیل</td>
<td>Kafeel</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Arabic word for sponsoring company or employer in Gulf countries</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>کم از کم اجیت</td>
<td>Minimum Wage</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The minimum amount that an employer is legally required to pay workers under the law in those countries in which a minimum wage has been established by law.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>گھیرلو ملازم</td>
<td>Domestic Worker</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An individual who performs domestic duties such as cleaning, cooking and care work (children, elderly and disabled) in a household within an employment relationship (i.e. paid work).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>مزدور کا استحصال</td>
<td>Labor Exploitation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A broad spectrum of working conditions and practices that are short of decent work and thus unacceptable. They range from extreme exploitation including forced labour, trafficking and modern slavery at one end, to other unacceptable forms of work</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>مساوی مواقع</td>
<td>Equal Opportunity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refers to equal entitlements in pay, working conditions, employment security and social security.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>دیازپورا</td>
<td>Diaspora</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Diaspora refers to a people or an ethnic population that leave their traditional ethnic homelands, or countries of origin, and are dispersed throughout other parts of the world.
REPORTING ON
FORCED LABOUR AND FAIR RECRUITMENT

AN ILO TOOLKIT FOR JOURNALISTS IN PAKISTAN

This toolkit was produced by the ILO Global Action to Improve the Recruitment Framework of Labour Migration project (REFRAME), supported by the European Union. The REFRAME project aims at preventing and reducing abusive and fraudulent recruitment practices, and maximizing the protection of migrant workers in the recruitment process and their contribution to development.

ILO Country Office for Pakistan
ILO Building, Sector G-5/2, Near State Bank of Pakistan Islamabad, 44000 Pakistan
Tel: +92 51 2276456-8 Fax: +92 51 2279181-2

ilo.org/fairrecruitment
ilo.org/forcedlabour