



Evaluation Summaries

Sustainable Elimination of Child Bonded Labour in Nepal: Phase II

Quick Facts

Countries: *Nepal*

Final Evaluation: *August 2010*

Mode of Evaluation: *Independent*

Technical Area: *Child Labour*

Evaluation Management: *IPEC, CO-Kathmandu*

Evaluation Team: *Geeta Unnikrishnan, Ram Krishna Sharma*

Project Start: *September 2006*

Project End: *September 2010*

Project Code: *NEP/06/50/USA*

Donor: *United States Department of Labour (USDOL) (US\$2,000,000)*

Keywords: *Child labour*

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

The Government of Nepal abolished the Kamaiya system (a form of bonded labour in agriculture) in July 2000 through an enactment: “The Kamaiya Labour Prohibition Act-2001”. Although the Act is named after one system of bonded labour (the Kamaiya system), it covers other forms of bonded labour such as Bhaisabar (buffalo herder), Gaibar (cow herder), Chhekarabar (goat herder), Haruwa (tiller), Charuwa (herder), Hali (tiller), Gothalo (herder).

The Government of Nepal has started initiatives to address the issue of bonded labour (Kamaiya system) in coordination with development agencies (including ILO-IPEC) in the western part of Nepal.

The two neediest categories comprising 14,000 households were identified by the government for assistance in terms of land and housing. Through the first phase of the project “Sustainable Elimination of Child Bonded Labour”, ILO/IPEC provided them assistance during September 2000 to August 2005.

The second phase of the project Sustainable Elimination of Child Bonded labour – Phase II started on 15 September 2006 and will run for four years till 15 September 2010. (The project end date has been subsequently extended to 31st December 2010). It aims to provide assistance to another 12,000 Kamaiya households identified by government as requiring rehabilitation as well as those under the Haruwa/Charuwa system.

The project has the following four immediate objectives, each with the time frame of achievement by the end of the project:

- Immediate Objective 1: Children and adult members from the targeted families receive appropriate formal and non-formal education.
- Immediate Objective 2: Targeted families are gainfully employed.
- Immediate Objective 3: Agricultural workers, particularly freed Kamaiyas and Haruwas/Charuwas in the target districts receive the minimum and equal wage rates.
- Immediate Objective 4: An enabling environment is created for effective implementation of Kamaiya Labour Prohibition Act – 2001 and Child Labour Prohibition Act – 1999.

Methodology of evaluation

The evaluation team undertook the following steps:

- Briefing discussion: Telephonic discussion with ILO/DED was done to clarify the TORs and the process for the evaluation. Discussions were also had with USDOL, ILO Regional CL specialist and ILO Country Director, Nepal.
- Preparation of Evaluation Matrix: Prepared and agreed with ILO/DED
- Primary data collection through field visits of beneficiaries: Field visits were made to 4 of the 8 project districts (Banke and Bardia in the West; Dhanusa and Siraha in the East). As ex Kamaiyas are in the Western districts and the Haruwa / Charuwa target group is in the Eastern districts, the visit provided an opportunity to gain some understanding of the nuances in programme interventions in these areas. In the interaction with freed Kamaiya and Haruwa/ Charuwa communities both group discussions and key informant interviews were applied with PLA groups, Child Labour Monitoring Committee members, children withdrawn from work, target group who benefited from off farm and on farm skills training and school teachers. Interviews and discussions were help with ILO/IPEC project team in Kathmandu and in Nepalgunj, project implementing agency staff and staff of civil society actors working in Kamaiya and bonded labour issues. For the interviews an interview guide (open ended questionnaire) was developed.
- Primary data collection through 1-1 and group interviews of secondary stakeholders: Conducted interviews of key stakeholders which included project implementing agencies, MoLRM / MoLTM, INGOs engaged in elimination of bonded labour in Nepal, UN partner agencies, primary stakeholders, school teachers and members of Child Labour Monitoring Committees. In addition, interviews were conducted of key stakeholders during field visits. These interviews were based on semi structured interview guides created by the evaluation team. (Annex 2 lists the individuals, groups and organisations consulted during the evaluation mission)
- Secondary data collection and review: This consisted of analysing the regular project

progress and monitoring reports produced by both ILO/IPE project team and the implementing partners. The comprehensive project monitoring system including the technical report submitted by project to ILO/USDOL (the last one was in March 2010) was extensively used. Records of current implementing partners were also accessed to get updated information of the current numbers and conditions of the beneficiary groups. Desk review of project document, mid term review report, progress reports/status reports, technical reports of partners, studies, workshop documents was carried out.

- National stakeholder workshop: A workshop was organized towards the end of the evaluation. The purpose of the workshop was to share early findings and to have participants' inputs to fill in gaps and triangulate the findings. The workshop was well attended by implementing partners, government representatives, trade unions, primary stakeholder representatives and others. (A complete list of workshop participants is at Annex 3)

Main Findings & Conclusions

The evaluation found firstly that the problem identified and focused on by this project was especially relevant in that it sustained the efforts to rehabilitate the ex-Kamaiyas and also brought into the project realm lesser focused groups of Haruwas and Charuwas.

Next, the evaluation found three aspects that made the design and planning of this project particularly effective. First, this phase of the project took a multi-dimensional and comprehensive approach to addressing the problem at hand in that it addressed withdrawal of children, education, vocational and skills training, employment for families and unionization. Second, the project supported both the efforts to create an enabling policy environment as well as the communities directly. This policy practice linkage should have meaningful impact on long term sustainability. Third, the project design brought together multiple stakeholders including government, NGOs, trade unions, employers' organizations, community organizations.

At a high level, the project has largely achieved its objectives. This is particularly note-worthy given the fast changing socio-political context in Nepal. Some highlights include:

- 1821 children withdrawn from bonded labour
- Increased literacy rates among families (39% to 57%)
- Changed school enrolment rates (57% to 75%)
- Drop-out rates reduced considerably (35% to 2%)
- 1528 families provided with training for generating on farm employment
- Over 4475 agricultural labourers unionized
- Regulation under Kamaiya Labour Prohibition Act drafted
- National Action Plan on bonded labour drafting in process

An especially notable achievement of this project is the number of women and girls who have benefitted from the various aspects of the program. For instance, of those agricultural labourers unionized, 62% are women. Of families with training for generating on farm employment, 80% are women. 74% of those trained on off-farm employment generation are women. 96% of those in PLA classes are female. Disparity between men and women's wages has also been reduced, and women are more represented in community structures.

However, the evaluation also identified certain challenges that prevented this project from achieving the originally set out targets on some outputs and objectives. The first of these is related to the targets set for withdrawal of child bonded labour which was set on the basis of a study carried out in 2005. During implementation which began in 2008, the total number of children in bonded labour was found to be significantly below the target set for the project, which led to a review of the targets. Second, the project was also constrained by start up delays related to approval procedures and the political context. While the project has concluded its intended activities in the shortened timeframe, the delays constrained certain activities such as skill and vocational training. It also has raised questions about post training support and long term sustainability.

The project's approach to strengthen community structures (e.g., CLMC) and the PLA groups could make a meaningful contribution to long term sustainability. However, the short time frame of this project creates challenges for enhancing capacity of these structures to a level of self-sustenance.

Overall, the project's design and approach is comprehensive and provides significant lessons for other projects and future interventions. The project also displayed flexibility in its design to address the context of the country environment it was operating within. One aspect of the project that requires further strategic thought for future projects in this area is that of employment and income generation. The further analysis in this area will need to examine questions such as the time frame needed to achieve desired levels of sustainability, market linkages and nature of post training support. On the whole, the project has brought together multiple stakeholders and acted upon several dimensions of the problem of child bonded labour – this will create a good platform on which other projects and interventions in Nepal can build upon.

Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Main recommendations and follow-up

1. For ILO / IPEC

- It is recommended that while designing projects for elimination of child bonded labour, the approach should consider including strategies to rehabilitate children in different forms of bonded labour and not be limited to focusing on one particular form especially in areas where they exist together. Within this, the approach could consider prioritizing groups that are most vulnerable.
- It is recommended that future programmes that promote income generation/ employment should consider a strategic approach that includes market analysis and linkages, adequate time frame and post training support.
- It is recommended that while designing and implementing projects, the monitoring systems include provision for external monitoring and that it is budgeted for. It is also recommended that the outputs are specific and fully monitored.

- It is recommended that future programmes to address child bonded labour build on the approach adopted by SCEBL-II of bringing together key stakeholders in addressing multiple dimensions of the issue. There is need to ensure that mechanisms for multiple stakeholder engagement are well thought through and are incorporated in the project design.
- It is recommended that when designing projects, adequate time is provided for preparing for project implementation and that the time is realistic keeping in view the experiences of similar projects, project processes and the local context.

2. For ILO/IPEC, MoLRM

- It is recommended that a study be carried out on the utilization and impact of the training provided by the project for income and employment generation. This could inform the design and implementation of vocational training programmes implemented by MoLRM and could be a useful input to designing future programmes.

3. For ILO

- It is recommended that the proposed collaborative project (of ILO and other UN agencies) to address bonded labour in Nepal consider building on the project database initiated by SECBL-II project in VDCs where there is potential overlap. This is particularly relevant for child school tracking.
- It is recommended that the proposed collaborative project mentioned above builds on social structures especially the CLMS in VDCs where there is potential overlap.
- It is recommended that activities to support income generation / employment under the proposed project consider offering post training support including market linkages to those in the SCEBL- II target group who were provided only training under SECBL- II.

Important lessons learned

Realistic preparation period for project implementation: A realistic time frame for implementation of child bonded labour project in Nepal is about 12 months for getting approval, for initiating APs and for start up arrangements.

Flexibility in project implementation: Project design should provide for flexibility in implementation. This is particularly true in context that is fast changing such as Nepal.

Preparation of baseline information by selected Aps: Involving the APs to undertake the baseline is valuable and is an opportunity to build rapport with community and for better understanding of the socio economic conditions of the community. This requires additional time for implementation as a shared understanding of the baseline methodology need to be developed and capacity of partners to implement will need to be built.

Competitive selection process for IPs: A transparent selection process for NGOS with clear criteria for selection and appraisal process is useful in identifying appropriate partner organisations to implement the programme. This approach requires additional time and will need to be factored into project design.

Appropriate monitoring indicators and processes: It is important to ensure that monitoring processes such as end project survey is built into the monitoring plan and is budgeted for. Output monitoring requires appropriate indicators (both qualitative and quantitative) to track progress against the entire output. For example where the output is about training and employment, both these aspects will need to be tracked and analysed for adjusting the project strategies.

Continued support post training needed for sustainability: While designing and implementing skill development / income generation training programmes, it is useful to have post training support to ensure market linkages and address start up concerns.

Supporting community structures: For implementation and sustainability of potential project impact, it is effective to strengthen mechanisms for community involvement and empowerment. For longer term sustainability, specific strategies are required to enhance their capacity including their access to resources where required.