Quick Facts

Countries: Uganda, Kenya, Zimbabwe or Ghana, Moldova, Ukraine
Final Evaluation: August 2007
Mode of Evaluation: External Evaluation
Technical Area: AIDS/HIV
Evaluation Management: ILO-Aids
Evaluation Team: Luis L. Zegers-Febres
Project Start: 2003
Project End: 2007
Project Code: INT/02/45/GTZ
Donor: Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit (GTZ)
Keywords: HIV/AIDS, workers education, social dialogue

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

The scope of this independent external evaluation of the 2003-2007 GTZ-funded project is only intended to evaluate a part of the ILO’s HIV/AIDS workplace policies and programme. The TOR required that the evaluation primarily determine if the project design and approach have been coherent in the achievement of the planned outputs and how well the project has complemented other ILO projects and activities of other donors.

In addition, the TOR required that the evaluation determine whether the project achieved its stated objectives and expected outputs and to explain the causes of achievement or under-achievement together with determining how efficiently and strategically resources have been allocated.

The requirement to assess the degree of relevance with which the project has responded to the needs of the ILO constituents, to assess the extent to which management capacities and arrangements put in place support achievement of results and to assess the impact of the project in terms of sustained improvements achieved, complete the evaluation requirements.

To comply with TOR specifications, the evaluation focused first on the documentation provided by the Project Management staff, identified the development processes that the project offered and assessed the project’s operating systems. Social behaviour and the cultural, political and institutional traditions of the countries involved were taken into consideration while carrying out the initial desk-review and during the two country visits performed in order to assess the project’s impact.

The epidemiology of HIV/AIDS in each country played only a background role in the evaluation process and is not directly referred to in this report; although it is clear that different epidemiological trends, socioeconomic and political conditions in Africa and in Central Europe have been vital in shaping a variety of approaches and in achieving diverse forms of impact in each region.

While the volume of heterosexual transmission of HIV is particularly different in each region, Central Europe is on the brink of an explosion of the pandemic beyond the boundaries of high-risk groups and Africa is battling with a
generalised epidemic. Even if one could observe elements of HIV/AIDS awareness campaigns at workplaces in Uganda, Kenya, Zimbabwe or Ghana already during the early 1990s, the development of HIV/AIDS workplace policies and programmes seem to suffer from similar causes in both regions if not beyond and world-wide. The application and adaptation of early learning in Africa appears to have been very useful in shaping campaigns in Central Europe. Conversely, the lessons learned in Central Europe in terms of labour legislation reform, policy and programme development at the workplace may be useful to consolidate current institutional efforts being carried out in Africa by the international community and ILO social partners.

In order to answer the number of questions GTZ and ILO pose in the evaluation TOR and in order to assess the project within the context of GTZ’s BACKUP initiative, following the Desk-review of the documentation provided by Project Management, the evaluation process included five additional phases:

- meetings with project staff at ILO/HQ, to clarify questions arising from the desk-review and to become further acquainted with the project;
- design of a research approach to identify project performance indicators in countries of major project development and in others of less evident activity;
- design of structured data-collection supports for interviews in countries to be visited and for input requests from countries benefiting from the project;
- travel to two countries demonstrating major implementation – namely Moldova and Ukraine – to interview key implementers, constituents and stakeholders, and
- processing of the data collected to identify most relevant issues and formulate responses to the questions contained in the TOR, and the conclusions and recommendations provided in this report.

Methodology of evaluation
The evaluation methodology consisted of seven steps comprising: (1) a desk review of documentation submitted by ILO’s HIV/AIDS Programme; (2) meetings with key programme staff to clarify issues related to the documentation submitted; (3) collection of accounting data from ILO PARDEV; (4) design of a survey to collect data on project performance, organisation and implementation of activities and publications; (5) collection of data through personal and telephone interviews and e-mail questionnaires; (6) field visits to Moldova and Ukraine to carry out personal interviews of relevant people linked to project implementation in those countries and to observe implementation through analysis of outputs and of institutional relations with social partners, stakeholders and beneficiaries; (7) analysis of information and data collected with emphasis on identifying measurable indicators of progress and performance as well as the causes of successes and failures and the strategic impact in relation to GTZ’s BACKUP Initiative, and (8) validation of the content of the report.

Particular efforts were deployed to safeguard the independence of the evaluation to avoid individuals influencing analysis, conclusions and recommendations and to protect the anonymity of sources of information.

Main Findings & Conclusions

Conclusions
- the project is well established within ILO;
- Objectives have been achieved on the basis of models developed according to the Project’s strategic parameters;
- training and dissemination of information have created awareness amongst decision makers and significant progress has been made to achieve fundamental changes in attitudes at the workplace and revision of labour legislation;
- the actions carried out in Moldova and Ukraine demonstrate that the Programme on HIV/AIDS workplace
policies and programmes can occupy a significant strategic position in every country;

• involving social partners in discussion about HIV/AIDS workplace policies and programmes has created genuine collaboration between most employers and trade unions involved in the project;
• project staff although limited in numbers have been well selected and have a high level of motivation and expertise;
• the project has only just started and has already created the necessary motivation on which to produce lasting changes and supporting mechanisms for effective partnerships, but the creation of sustainable processes is a task that still remains ahead;
• expansion of project activities will require a correlative increase in staff;
• Support to global strategies and support to country projects require different methods for planning and management. As the project developed, the weakness of design for field work hindered field implementation in countries that needed higher level of support to tripartite leaders, as was the case in Africa.

at the beginning of every intervention to avoid wrong expectations and incorrect assumptions;

• knowledge and information-sharing are increased through greater use of the media and the potential of the Internet, in addition to traditional training;
• sustainable structures are developed at national levels outside the ILO;
• strategic high-level conferences are organised in every country to set up appropriate and sustainable national operating structures and systems and to obtain the commitment of stakeholders to support national processes;
• successful social partner interactions are identified to promote replication of successful cases and best practices;
• project management capacities and arrangements are improved by: streamlining internal operational processes into a transparent monitoring system; resolving fund transfers delays through UNDP; streamlining and using transparent monitoring of fund transfers to field projects; and
• further developing monitoring and evaluation tools should comply with requirements for strategic planning for strategy development and implementation.

Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Main Recommendations
To achieve project impact, Management must ensure that:

• progress made is maintained and subsequently succeeds in introducing labour legislation reform;
• training of trainers is increased and continuous;
• the awareness achieved amongst leaders is sustained and amplified with wide dissemination of knowledge and information throughout the structures of the labour market;
• the role of ILO at country level is systematically clarified and publicised