



Evaluation Summaries

Combating the Worst Forms of Child Labour in Indonesia: Supporting the Time Bound Programme for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour in Indonesia

Quick Facts

Countries: Indonesia

Final Evaluation: January 2008

Mode of Evaluation: Independent

Technical Area: Child Labour

Evaluation Management: ILO-IPEC, Design, Evaluation and Documentation

Evaluation Team: Clarence Shubert (team leader), Lamtiur Tampubolon and Antiani Arna

Project Start: Feb 2005

Project End: March 2008

Project Code: INS/05/P50/USA

Donor: United States Department of Labor (USDOL), US\$ 5,565,000

Keywords: Child labour, youth employment, education

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

The project supports the implementation of the first phase of the twenty year National Plan of Action (NPA) and Time Bound Programme (TBP) for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour (WFCL) in Indonesia. It has two major segments: strengthening the enabling environment, and direct interventions. The former included support for the formation of provincial and district action committees, support to educational policy innovations,

capacity building within relevant partners as well as support for research and raising of public awareness.

The direct interventions focused on child prostitution, drug abuse, the footwear industry, mining and off-shore fishing. Overall there were more than 40 different partner organizations.

The project had nine immediate objectives for the end of the project plus the addendum in response to the tsunami in Aceh and Nias:

1. Provincial and district development plans to include child labour concerns;
2. Education and training policies will be proactive rather than reactive to the needs of targeted children;
3. The knowledge base on child labour will be improved to monitor trends and assist in developing national, provincial and district policies;
4. Awareness of WFCL to be enhanced;
5. Enhanced capacities of national, provincial and district level stakeholders to plan, monitor, implement actions to prevent and eliminate the WFCL;
6. Information on the extent and nature of the WFCL in targeted provinces will be available;
7. Children will have been withdrawn from the WFCL;
8. Alternative income schemes implemented for the poorest families;

9. Following the tsunami, in early 2005 the project added assistance for non formal education and vocational training in schools and community learning centres in Aceh and Nias.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The main purpose of the evaluation was to improve knowledge concerning combating the worst forms of child labour in Indonesia with a view to improved design and implementation of future projects by the ILO, ILO constituents, and other implementing partners, in this case the United States Department of Labor and IPEC (International Programme of the Elimination of Child Labour).

The evaluation was to answer key questions relating to the projects' effectiveness, efficiency, relevance and longevity of impact.

Methodology of evaluation

Following an initial desk review of relevant documentation, a field mission by the team of three consultants (two national, one international) was made to Jakarta and four provinces from the 13th to 26th January 2008. The team leader facilitated development of evaluation methods and associated tools as well as integrating the work of the other team members. A Policy Impact Study was done concurrently but independently by another national consultant, and some of the main findings of the study were incorporated in the final report.

Main Findings & Conclusions

IPEC has played a key role in support of the GOI's NPA to eliminate the WFCL, it has worked closely with the national government to support policy and institutional development and with government and NGOs for direct action projects.

The most successful interventions have combined policy and regulatory initiatives

with direct-action, community-based projects coordinated by provincial and district action committees with broad government and NGO membership.

Action Committees for Elimination of the WFCL are needed to empower and coordinate government and NGO partners, but are more effective if placed under the Commission for the Protection of Children headed by a representative of the local government.

IPEC has helped initiate and field test many GOI policies to expand access to and improve formal education at the Junior High School level to prevent school drop out and entry into the WFCL. Field experiences have shown that the most effective interventions are:

- Grants for education related expenses piloted by IPEC which are now supported in MoNE (BOS) and many local government budgets (BOSD) and will be expanded through the GOI conditional cash transfer programme Hope for Families;
- Remedial education and tracking of drop outs and at risk students supported by IPEC in many locations;
- Teacher training on life-skills, child rights, and risks of child labour using modules developed by IPEC partners and extension of the MoNE's PAKEM teaching method;
- Adding junior high teachers and classrooms to existing elementary schools in remote areas to create "One Roof Schools" which was supported by IPEC in Aceh and East Kalimantan and is now being implemented by MoNE nationwide.

On the other hand, non-formal education using Packet B and informal Open Junior High Schools, also field tested with IPEC support, are not working well and are not accepted as equivalent to formal education.

Involvement and support of local governments and community organizations with NGO projects is necessary both for effective implementation and sustainability.

Peer educators and counsellors are cost-effective but must be carefully selected, trained and monitored by professional staff, and may not be suitable in some cases.

IPEC's direct management of many small, short-term contracts was appropriate for the first phase but not as suitable for institutional development and sustainability in the next phase.

Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Main recommendations and follow-up

- Develop long-term contracts with key partners that can mentor, monitor and report on the small project implementers. This could include the teachers union PGRI, APINDO, the relevant Directorates in MoMT and MoNE, JARAK, and Hotline Surabaya.
- Provide a senior advisor for several weeks per year to support the CTA. This is in greatest need during the culmination of the project planning stage to facilitate high level policy advocacy.
- Develop an explicit programme, possibly through APINDO, to link private sector companies to vocational and pre-vocational training as part of their “corporate social responsibility” with the aim of improving the relevance of the training, linking it to future employment opportunities, and obtaining financial and technical support from the private sector.
- Work with MoMT, MoWE on a decree to encourage establishment of a Commission for Protection of Children.
- Support MoMT for activation of the remaining 12 Provincial and more District Action Committees.
- Work with the national teachers union and MoNE to disseminate modules on life-skills, child rights, child labour and the risks of the WFCL.

- Get a consultant to work with the women's group in Sukabumi to develop a module based on their pre-migration orientation training for young workers, and field test this with MoMT offices and NGOs in other sending areas.

Important lessons learned

- Despite the illegal and secretive nature of the worst forms of child labour, a determined government cooperating with NGOs and supportive communities can combat most of these problems, although tracking and withdrawing street children involved in drug trafficking remains very difficult.
- Expanding access to and improving formal secondary education is the most effective way to prevent child labour exploitation. Initiatives considered successful include:
 - grants to poor families and students for educational expenses;
 - remedial education for at risk students;
 - teacher training on active, creative, effective and enjoyable methods;
 - training on life-skills, child rights and the risks of child labour; and
 - Combined elementary and junior high schools in remote areas.
- Non-formal education using packet B and informal Open Junior High Schools are not working well and are not accepted as equivalent to formal education.
- Involvement of community organizations and local governments with NGO projects is necessary, both for effective implementation and to increase sustainability.
- Peer educators and peer counsellors are cost-effective but may not be appropriate in all cases.

- The project's direct management of many small, short-term contracts was appropriate for the first phase but may not be suitable to support the institutional development and sustainability required in the next phase of support to the NPA.