

244678

CEART/SP/1991/12

International Labour
Organisation

United Nations Educational,
Scientific and Cultural Organisation

RECEIVED
1 JUL 1993
International
Labour Office
ILO BIBL BIT

**JOINT ILO/UNESCO COMMITTEE OF EXPERTS
ON THE APPLICATION OF THE RECOMMENDATION
CONCERNING THE STATUS OF TEACHERS**

(Special Session, Paris, 22-26 July 1991)

REPORT



91B12/57
engl cop.1



Published in 1991 by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), Paris.

Copies of the Report are available in English, French and Spanish from the Division of Higher Education and Training, UNESCO, Paris and from the Salaried Employees and Professional Workers Branch of the International Labour Office (ILO), Geneva.

CONTENTS

	<u>Paragraph</u>
INTRODUCTION	1 - 7
RESTATEMENT OF THE MANDATE AND WORKING METHODS OF THE JOINT COMMITTEE	8 - 9
IMPROVED WAYS AND MEANS TO MONITOR AND PROMOTE THE APPLICATION OF THE TERMS OF THE RECOMMENDATION IN MEMBER STATES OF THE ILO AND UNESCO	10 - 11
FRAME OF REFERENCE FOR A STUDY BY UNESCO ON THE INITIAL AND CONTINUING EDUCATION OF TEACHERS	12 - 14
STUDIES TO BE CARRIED OUT BY THE ILO	15 - 18
Study on participation, consultation and collective bargaining in the teaching profession	16
Study on stress, burnout, turnover of teachers and difficulty of exercising the profession	17
Investigation of gender issues in the teaching profession.	18
Issues related to technical and vocational education	19
JOINT ILO/UNESCO ACTIVITIES TO PROMOTE THE APPLICATION OF THE 1966 RECOMMENDATION	20 - 24
Seminars and workshops	21
Celebration of the 25th Anniversary of the Adoption of the 1966 Recommendation	22 - 24
UNESCO'S ACTIVITIES IN RELATION TO THE RECOMMENDATION	25 - 31
ACTIVITIES OF THE ILO TO PROMOTE THE APPLICATION OF THE 1966 RECOMMENDATION	32 - 34
INFORMATION ON THE ACTIVITIES OF NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANISATIONS TO PROMOTE THE APPLICATION OF THE RECOMMENDATION	35
EXAMINATION OF ALLEGATIONS SUBMITTED BY TEACHERS OR TEACHERS' ORGANISATIONS CONCERNING THE NON- APPLICATION OF THE RECOMMENDATION	36 - 37

	<u>Paragraph</u>
POSSIBLE CONSIDERATION OF THE RECOMMENDATION IN LIGHT OF RECENT DEVELOPMENTS	38
AGENDA OF THE SIXTH ORDINARY SESSION OF THE JOINT COMMITTEE, 1994	39
WORKING PARTIES	40
OFFICERS OF THE JOINT COMMITTEE	41
ADOPTION OF THE REPORT	42
Annex 1 - RESTATEMENT OF THE MANDATE AND METHODS OF WORK OF THE JOINT ILO/UNESCO COMMITTEE OF EXPERTS ON THE APPLICATION OF THE RECOMMENDATION CONCERNING THE STATUS OF TEACHERS	
Annex 2 - IMPROVED WAYS AND MEANS TO MONITOR AND PROMOTE THE APPLICATION OF THE TERMS OF THE RECOMMENDATION IN MEMBER STATES OF THE ILO AND UNESCO	
Annex 3 - FRAME OF REFERENCE FOR A STUDY ON THE INITIAL AND CONTINUING EDUCATION OF TEACHERS	
Annex 4 - DRAFT OUTLINES ON STUDIES TO BE CARRIED OUT BY THE ILO AS REQUESTED BY THE JOINT COMMITTEE	
Annex 5 - AGENDA OF THE SIXTH ORDINARY SESSION OF THE JOINT COMMITTEE, 1994	

Introduction

1. The Joint ILO/UNESCO Committee of Experts on the Application of the Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers held its Third Special Session in Paris, at UNESCO Headquarters, from 22 to 26 July 1991.

2. For this session, the agenda of the Joint Committee included the following items:

- Election of the officers;
- Discussion of the draft restatement of the mandate and working methods of the Joint Committee;
- A review of activities undertaken by the ILO and UNESCO jointly or separately to promote the application of the 1966 Recommendation;
- Review of the activities of non-governmental organisations related to the promotion of the 1966 Recommendation;
- Preparation of the agenda of the Sixth Ordinary Session of the Joint Committee in 1994.

The Joint Committee also had on its agenda information concerning allegations received from teachers' organisations since its last session.

3. The present members of the Joint Committee, half of whom were designated by the ILO Governing Body and the other half by the Executive Board of UNESCO, with a term of office extending or renewable to 31 December 1994, are as follows:

Prof. (Ms.) A.G. Ali (Pakistan)*	Secretary of the Sind Provincial Education Council and Head of the Government Teachers' Foundation
Prof. (Ms.) M. Eliou (Greece)*	Professor of Educational Science, University of Athens; former Acting Chairperson, Pedagogical Institute of Greece; former member of the Management Committee, University of Thessalie; and former Adviser to the Ministry of Education
Prof. S.S. Fall (Senegal)	Professor of Physical Science and Director, Ecole Normale Supérieure, University of Cheikh Anta Diop, Dakar; Chairperson, Committee on Teachers Questions, National Commission on the Reform of Education and Training (CNREF)

* New member

- Dr. (Ms.) E.W. Gachukia (Kenya) Consultant on Education, Women in Development and Population, Information and Communication; Senior Lecturer, University of Nairobi; former National Population Advisor, Government of Kenya; Chairperson, African Women Development and Communication Network (FEMNET); and former Member of Parliament
- Ms. Y. Hammoutène (Algeria)* Free-lance Consultant on Education; former Senior Official responsible for the planning of continuing education and training of personnel, Ministry of Commerce; and former official in the Ministry of Vocational and Professional Training
- Prof. (Ms) A.L. Hostmark-Tarrou* (Norway) Director of the National College of Education for Vocational and Technical Teachers, Oslo; President of the Board, State Institute for Distance Education; member of the Board, Association for Teacher Education in Europe (ATEE), and head of ATEE's Working Group for Technical and Vocational Teacher Education; and former Vice-President, National Council for Teacher Education
- Mr A. Nakajima (Japan)* Managing Director, Kumon Institute of Education; Executive Director, Japan Educational Exchange-Baba Foundation; Executive Director, Japan Association for International Understanding; and former Deputy Director General in charge of Elementary and Secondary Education at the Ministry of Education, Science and Culture
- Dr. E.H. Newton (Barbados)* Director, In-service Education Programmes and Dean, Faculty of Education, University of the West Indies, Cave Hill; member Teacher Selection Board, Government of Barbados; Chairperson, National Advisory Commission on Education; Vice-President, Commonwealth Council for Educational Administration; and Chairperson, Caribbean Association for Educational Administration

* New member

The Hon. Justice L.T. Olsson (Australia)	Puisne Judge, Supreme Court of South Australia; and former President of the Industrial Court of South Australia
Dr. P. Renato Souza (Brazil)*1	Director, Institute of Economics (CEDE), State University of Campinas; and former President of the State University of Campinas, Sao Paolo
Prof. E.G. Sapogov (USSR)	Rector, Tula Institute of Education
Prof. M. Thompson (Canada)*	Professor of Industrial Relations, University of British Columbia, Vancouver; and Member, Board of Governors, Workers Compensation Board of British Columbia

4. The Joint Committee elected the following officers:

Chairperson:	Prof. S.S. Fall
Vice-Chairperson:	Prof. A.G. Ali
Rapporteurs:	Justice L.T. Olsson Prof. M. Thompson

5. Mr. C.N. Power, Assistant Director-General for Education, welcomed the experts on behalf of the Director-General of UNESCO. He explained the important contributions that teachers are asked to make in the combat against illiteracy, and in meeting the learning needs of society. He recalled that the World Conference on Education for All, held in Thailand in March 1990 gave recognition to the Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers in the World Declaration and Framework for Action to meet Basic Learning Needs adopted by that Conference. Emphasising the importance of the Recommendation, which is the only international instrument that deals with the status of teachers in a holistic manner, he stated that more efforts need to be made by society and governments to stop the steady decline in professional standards and in the working conditions of teachers in many parts of the world today.

6. The Chief of the Salaried Employees and Professional Workers Branch of the ILO, Ms. H. Sarfati, also welcomed the participants on behalf of the Director-General of the ILO. She noted the timely convening of the Special Session, given that 1991 marked the 25th Anniversary of the adoption of the Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers. The Joint Committee was potentially at a turning point in the history of its efforts to promote a better recognition and application of the 1966 Recommendation which mirrored significant world-wide changes in education affecting teachers. At the same time, it could be proud that signs were emerging of a greater international recognition of the essential truth that the Joint Committee had sought to promote for more than 20 years, namely that the quality of education depended largely on the quality and the status of teachers.

* New member

1 Was unable to attend

7. The secretariat of the meeting included, for UNESCO, Mr. C.N. Power, Assistant Director-General for Education, Mr. M.A.R. Dias, Director of the Division of Higher Education and Research, Ms. M.D. Borges, Ms. R. Lakin, Mr. A. Bangui and Mr. D. Beridze of the same Division, Mr. D. De San, Representative of the Legal Advisor, Ms. C. Okai, Division for Educational Development, Ms. V. Cavicchioni of the Statistical Office, Messrs Ph. Nalletamby and J.C. Pauvert, Consultants and Mr. J. Emele, Ms. N. Brasseur, Ms. E. Hoyer and Ms. R. Kissi Secretaries; and for the ILO: Ms. H. Sarfati, Chief of the Salaried Employees and Professional Workers Branch and Mr. B. Ratteree of the same Branch, Mr. L. Picard of the International Labour Standards Department, Mr. C. Damen of the Workers' Relations Branch and Ms. J. Laverrière, Secretary.

Restatement of the Mandate and Working Methods of the Joint Committee

8. The Joint Committee had before it a document (CEART/SP/1991/2/1) prepared by the secretariat, providing background information to the proposals for a restatement of the mandate and improved working methods of the Joint Committee. The document takes into account past practice and the need to adapt the Joint Committee's mandate and working methods to the changing circumstances of education and teachers' status, as reflected in the recommendations made by the Experts at the Fifth Ordinary Session of the Joint Committee (1988). In introducing the agenda item, the secretariat of the Joint Committee also provided information on the relevant constitutional and other procedures and structures of the ILO and UNESCO, which assisted the Joint Committee in defining a proposed basis for its future work.

9. The discussion revealed the importance that the Joint Committee attached to having the widest possible sources of information to allow it to fulfil its mandate, consisting of monitoring and promoting the application of the 1966 Recommendation in the interests of teachers the world over. At the same time, the independence, objectivity and impartiality of its work as a jointly constituted body of experts should be assured. After careful consideration of all points of view to meet these objectives and criteria, the Joint Committee unanimously adopted the proposed restatement of its mandate and working methods for submission to and approval by the Governing Body of the ILO and the Executive Board of UNESCO (Annex 1).

Improved ways and means to monitor and promote the application of the terms of the Recommendation in member States of the ILO and UNESCO

10. The Joint Committee discussed improved ways and means of monitoring the application of the Recommendation, and of promoting its awareness in member States of the ILO and of UNESCO and adopted the proposals outlined in the document CEART/SP/1991/6/REV as revised (Annex 2). These proposals will constitute the basis for the work of the Joint Committee for its Sixth Ordinary Session in 1994.

11. The Joint Committee especially commended the joint ILO/UNESCO sub-regional seminars on the Recommendation, which fostered dialogue and a spirit of partnership between governments, teachers' unions and the private sector. It suggested that such activities should be continued and that every effort should be made to obtain funding for them. It further suggested that the themes of the studies to be undertaken by the respective secretariats outlined in this report should be part of the agenda for future joint seminars, thus effectively extending the scope of the studies in varied contexts.

Frame of reference for a study by UNESCO on the initial and continuing education of teachers

12. In regard to the frame of reference (Annex 3) for the UNESCO study on the initial and continuing education of teachers, the Joint Committee made a number of substantive suggestions including the need to cover issues and problems relating to all aspects of the education of women teachers, in particular gender role and balance, and of teachers of minority groups. It also stressed the importance of research and experimentation in teacher training programmes. These points were incorporated in the text of the table of contents for the study.

13. The preparation of these country case studies, involving representatives of governments, teachers' organisations and the private sector, would provide another important opportunity for enhancing awareness of the Recommendation, and of promoting its application.

14. The Joint Committee decided that the contents and conclusions of the studies on the initial and continuing education of teachers would not be treated as confidential documents.

Studies to be carried out by the ILO

15. In discussing document CEART/SP/1991/5 the Experts expressed satisfaction with the general approach adopted in the formulation of the draft outlines for the two studies which the Joint Committee has requested the ILO to carry out for its Sixth Ordinary Session. The Experts suggested that the introductory paragraphs should be more specific with regard to the scope and methodology that will be used for the implementation. The revised outlines approved by the Joint Committee are presented in Annex 4.

Study on participation, consultation and collective bargaining in the teaching

16. Regarding the substance of the study on participation, consultation and collective bargaining by teachers and their organisations on matters for which these processes are provided for in the Recommendation, the main comments concerned the need to focus initial attention on factors that may have precipitated the need for consultation and participation, in particular, the cause, incidence and impact of structural adjustment measures on the education services, expenditures and policies, including the policy-making processes of bodies such as the World Bank. These measures in turn have affected teachers' terms and conditions of employment which

the study should highlight. Tenure and security of employment should be added to the issues subject to bargaining, and data on strike activity by teachers should be included in the chapter on dispute settlement. Moreover, the introductory chapter should be broadened to include an indication of the problems arising from the lack of awareness of the 1966 Recommendation by national and international decision-making authorities. Finally, for developing countries it was crucial that the ILO include in its study reference to the situation of teachers in the non-formal sector, especially when governments could no longer provide adequate education services.

Study on stress, burn-out, turnover of teachers and difficulty of exercising the profession

17. The study on stress, burn-out and turnover of teachers elicited much interest and support among the Experts who considered it highly topical. The outline was endorsed as an appropriate framework of study, with the Experts suggesting that, before embarking upon it, a preliminary survey be done of existing research work and data on causal factors of stress, the extent and causes of absenteeism or turnover among teachers, the types of teachers affected and the impact on the educational system (e.g. teacher shortage, educational quality etc.). This survey would indicate the directions for further in-depth research.

Investigation of gender issues in the teaching profession

18. The Experts underlined gender issues and the special circumstances of women teachers in pre-primary, primary, secondary and technical/vocational education as topics which deserve more attention by the ILO. The two working papers drafted by ILO consultants on women teachers and on women teachers in technical and vocational education in selected African countries served as an excellent model and should be replicated in other countries and regions.

Issues related to technical and vocational education

19. They further emphasised, in particular, the need to monitor and promote research within the ILO about the factors affecting the lower status of, and difficulties confronting, teachers in vocational and technical education, as well as in special education. The means to improve the situation should also be examined. The Experts felt that this was a crucial issue both in developing countries and industrialised countries. Therefore, cross-country studies in different regions of the world would provide comparative analysis which would shed light on problem areas and possible solutions. Indeed, the biggest changes now taking place in the educational system are in the technical and vocational area. The greatest concerns expressed by employers relate to the quality of output of the training system, a key factor of productivity and competitiveness. And yet, so little has been done to improve the quality of the preparation, recruitment, advancement and continuing training opportunities of this group of teaching personnel. The Experts are willing to facilitate first-hand data in national contexts which are often not readily available. The Joint Committee felt that, while a primary focus should be on gender issues, this investigation ought, nevertheless, to go forward as a two-pronged study, in the context of a consideration of the problems which generally exist as to the quality of

preparation, recruitment, advancement and continuing training opportunities of all teachers in the area in question. A progress report on such activities should be included on the agenda of the Sixth Ordinary Session of the Joint Committee (1994).

**Joint ILO/UNESCO activities to promote the application
of the 1966 Recommendation**

20. In examining document CEART/SP/1991/7A on the joint ILO/UNESCO activities to promote the application of the Recommendation, the Experts paid tribute to the secretariat of the Joint Committee for its dynamic approach in developing an impressive range of activities since 1988, despite the current financial constraints.

Seminars and workshops

21. The Joint Committee was particularly appreciative of the development, in a very short period, of seminars and workshops to promote awareness of and the application of the Recommendation, and encouraged the two secretariats to continue these activities at the regional/sub-regional and, where resources permit, national levels. A special reference was made to the desirability of holding a first regional/sub-regional seminar for French-speaking African countries, for English-speaking Caribbean countries and for Asia and the Pacific region. To overcome the budget constraints, efforts should be made by the two secretariats to find extra-budgetary funding for the seminar activities and for the preparation of studies on topics in identified priority areas which would also serve for the seminars. Where financially practicable, members of the Joint Committee resident in the region in question should be invited to assist in the seminar. At the national level resort should be had, wherever possible, to local resource persons. The Experts were willing to draw the attention of the concerned authorities in their respective countries as to the usefulness of such activities for the improvement of the status of teachers. They would also be willing to assist the two secretariats by informing it of existing national data or research materials on the relevant topics, as well as identifying potential resource persons. The Experts noted the extent of efforts invested in preparing working papers and organising seminars. To maximise the impact of seminars as a means of promoting awareness of the content of the Recommendation, it was suggested that, when preparing reports of seminars, the two secretariats prepare brief summaries in an attractive style which could be distributed as media releases to interested teachers' organisations for publication in their journals and the newsletters of their regional and national affiliates.

Celebration of the 25th anniversary of the adoption of the 1966 Recommendation

22. The Joint Committee wished to associate itself with UNESCO, the ILO and the international non-governmental organisations of the teaching profession in recognising this year the 25th anniversary of the adoption of the Recommendation, during the General Conference of UNESCO, in Paris.

23. It approved the text to be inserted in the document transmitting this report to the General Conference of UNESCO and to the Governing Body of the ILO, inviting attention to the anniversary and expressing its view as to the continued validity of the Recommendation.

24. The Joint Committee also approved the text of a letter addressed to the Directors-General of the ILO and of UNESCO, requesting them to write to the tripartite constituents of the ILO and to member States of UNESCO, as well as to the international non-governmental organisations concerned, inviting attention to this anniversary and making a suggestion that discussion of the content of the Recommendation be included in forthcoming seminars and conferences. The Joint Committee gave its full support to the suggestions made by the Director-General of UNESCO regarding the inauguration of an international Teachers' Day, and the issuing of special stamps to commemorate the Day.

UNESCO's activities in relation to the Recommendation

25. The Joint Committee noted with interest the varied activities undertaken by UNESCO relating either directly or indirectly to provisions of the Recommendation falling within the fields of competence of that Organisation. It made a number of general comments and suggestions with a view to improving the Joint Committee's own work, and of facilitating the work of the secretariat.

26. In particular, the Joint Committee identified five areas of interest concerned with (1) other international normative instruments in education, all of which are of more recent adoption than the 1966 Recommendation, (2) appropriate statistics relating to the status of teachers, (3) status of teachers in technical and vocational education, (4) growing importance of teachers in the non-formal education programmes, (5) contemporary trends having an impact on the status of teachers.

27. Noting that the five instruments in education contain provisions which relate directly or indirectly to the 1966 Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers, the Joint Committee advocated that an ad hoc working group be appointed to ensure proper co-ordination in the monitoring of the application of these instruments as regards the gathering and processing of information requested through questionnaires.

28. The Joint Committee appreciated the information provided by the UNESCO Office of Statistics. It was especially interested in the possibility of evolving an approach towards statistical data that would be more relevant to the status of teachers. It is the understanding of the Joint Committee that considerable relevant data is already routinely collected. Its work would be greatly enhanced if, at its regular meetings, it could be supplied with statistical reports (when feasible in graphical form) covering, over time, topics such as number and gender mix of teachers by levels, qualifications held, teacher student ratios, expenditure on education as a percentage of budget and some indication of general teacher salary levels by way of contrast with other professional salary levels. As a matter of

practicality, these may need to be on a selective and indicative basis by regions. The main aim would be to attempt to demonstrate broad trends.

29. The Joint Committee considered that more attention needs to be given to an examination of the area of technical and vocational education and to the status of teachers in these fields in view of the importance of this education for development. In addition to the study referred to in paragraph 12 of this report, the Joint Committee would be interested in the outcome of other current UNESCO studies touching on this topic.

30. While the Recommendation does not cover teachers in the non-formal sector, the Joint Committee noted that non-formal education was rapidly expanding, a trend that may require attention in the future.

31. Contemporary trends in education regarding the environment, population, health and nutrition, together with the new concept of lifelong education, the advancements in information and communication technologies and distance education in teacher training, have implications for and consequences on the status of teachers. In 1985, the Joint Committee considered and noted some aspects which could create the need to supplement its recommendations to take account of such matters. The Joint Committee, therefore, considered that there was a need to further review the situation in respect of developments since 1985, and proposed that an item be placed on the agenda of its Sixth Ordinary Session (1994) to this effect.

Activities of the ILO to promote the application of the 1966 Recommendation

32. The Joint Committee discussed a report (CEART/SP/1991/9/REV) on the activities of the ILO to promote the 1966 Recommendation since the Fifth Ordinary Session in 1988. Among these were research and dissemination of information, including:

- (a) the publication in five languages of a handbook on international labour standards and teachers which had already been widely distributed to governments and teachers' organisations;
- (b) two working papers on, respectively, women teachers and women teachers in technical and vocational education in selected African countries which had been utilised at ILO/UNESCO seminars on the Recommendation, and distributed for information to teachers at all levels;
- (c) new language versions of the Recommendation (Slovak) and the 1984 brochure on the status of teachers (Arabic); and
- (d) a monograph on the working conditions of teachers in developing countries.

In addition, a very substantial report on the employment and working conditions of teachers in preparation for the ILO's Second Joint Meeting on the Conditions of Work of Teachers will be published later in 1991 and will be sent to the Experts.

33. A second major area of activity consisted of two seminars organised jointly with UNESCO on the status of teachers in English-speaking countries of both the Southern and East and West African regions in 1989 and 1990 respectively. Members of the Joint Committee expressed particular interest in these seminars as a way of promoting knowledge and application of the Recommendation, and the reports which followed, including treatment of the special problems facing women teachers. The ILO had also participated in eight major regional or international seminars, conferences or other meetings organised by national and international non-governmental or intergovernmental organisations, during which it had presented extensive information on the provisions of the Recommendation and related issues which concerned teachers and education. Plans were underway to organise with UNESCO additional seminars in other regions, including Central America, the Caribbean, Asia and the Pacific and French-speaking countries of Africa. The Joint Committee expressed the strong desire for the ILO and UNESCO to develop activities, including seminars and other meetings in other regions, including Central, Eastern and Southern Europe.

34. The Joint Committee noted with considerable interest the work carried out by the ILO, in collaboration with UNESCO, to advise the Government of Mauritius on employment and working conditions of teachers as part of the formulation of a Master Plan for Education for the Year 2000. The Joint Committee considered that this was a model for future activities in other countries to improve the status of teachers.

Information on the activities of non-governmental organisations to promote the application of the Recommendation

35. The Joint Committee received reports from two international non-governmental organisations on their activities related to the promotion of the 1966 Recommendation. The Joint Committee noted with satisfaction the vigorous activities of these organisations to foster implementation of the Recommendation, and reiterated its desire to encourage greater collaboration with non-governmental international organisations in the future.

Examination of allegations submitted by teachers or teachers' organisations concerning the non-application of the Recommendation

36. The secretariat of the Joint Committee tabled papers outlining a number of communications concerning allegations received by ILO and UNESCO related to alleged failures to apply various provisions of the Recommendation. The Joint Committee was informed that all of these had been examined in consultation with legal officers of the ILO and UNESCO. As presented, they did not appear to fall within the criteria and procedures set out in the mandate of the Joint Committee. None of them were directed to the Joint Committee. The Joint Committee therefore merely noted the information supplied. It emphasised that it was most important that such allegations should be responded to promptly when received. The