Decent Work Supply Chain Survey

Pilot on the electronics supply chain in Viet Nam

Ms Francesca Francavilla, Senior economist, ILO

Ms Vu Thi Thu Thuy, Director, Department of Data Collection and IT Application, GSO
Decent Work Supply Chain Survey

The methodology relies on two main pillars, which were tested in the Viet Nam electronics supply chain

- **Decent work questionnaires** to inform the sampling strategy and create indicators of decent work;

- An **innovative sampling design** to identify the linkages between economic units in the supply chains.
Questionnaires and Indicators

**Enterprise Questionnaire**

A Characteristics of the economic unit
B Contracts, working time and payment
C Skills and training
D Occupational safety and health
E Freedom of association and collective bargaining
F Equality and inclusion

- How many suppliers / clients / subcontractors / clients of manufacturing services have you had in 2022? Please list six for each category.
- How many employees do you have? Please provide the contact details of ten of them.

**Worker Questionnaire**

A Socio-demographic characteristics
B Employment characteristics
C Working time
D Earnings
E Skills and training
F Occupational safety and health
G Freedom of association and collective bargaining
H Equality and inclusion
I Work to be abolished

**Indicators**

1 SC Supply chain structure
2 EMP Employment
3 TIME Working Time
4 EARN Earnings
5 SKILLS Skills and training
6 OSH Occupational safety and health
7 FACB Freedom of association and collective bargaining
8 EQUAL Equality and inclusion
9 ABOL Work to be abolished

Tripartite committee of technical experts
Key idea of the sampling design

Main steps:
- ✓ Start with the tiers of the supply chain where all enterprises in the given branches of economic activity belong to the supply chain
- ✓ Reach the other tiers of the supply chain by indirectly sampling through the links of the initial sample

Advantage and challenge:
- ✓ Avoid wastage of sampling in branches of economic activity where many enterprises in the sample may not belong to the supply chain
- ✓ Successful IF all tiers of the supply chain could be reached with sufficient sample size in a minimum number of waves of indirect sampling, say, 1 or 2, or perhaps 3
Schematic representation of sampling design

**First-stage sampling:**
Direct sampling from sampling frame of economic units in the central Tiers 2,3

**Second-stage sampling:**
One or more waves of indirect sampling of linked economic units in all tiers

**Third-stage sampling:**
Sub-sampling of workers (within occupational strata) of the sample economic units
Decent Work Electronics Supply Chain Survey in Viet Nam

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Steps 1, 2</th>
<th>Development of Modules A and B of the enterprise questionnaire</th>
<th>25 enterprise (step 1) + 25 enterprises (step 2)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Step 3</td>
<td>Assess the decent work questionnaires</td>
<td>28 enterprises and 87 workers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Assess the sampling approach</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Decent work questionnaires**

- Data quality is good (limited missing data, DK, Refusal). Some questions have been found difficult to answer. The questionnaires are too long. **Modular approach possible**
- Disaggregation by workers’ characteristics and tiers is possible but subject to **sample size in the full survey**.
- Enterprise and worker datasets can be merged but a **unique enterprise ID and worker ID** will facilitate the process.
- More research is needed to characterize the **household businesses** and the **informal sector**.
Identifying enterprises through links

Link

Overall, the 28 pilot enterprises reported a total of 1,209 links in Viet Nam.

A link between enterprises was considered to have been identified if an enterprise provided information on the tax code or telephone number of its client or supplier.

Name of the enterprise or its address was not considered as sufficient to identify a link.

Number of listed links

The 28 pilot enterprises listed, in total, 173 links in Viet Nam.

Each pilot enterprise provided, on average, the required information on 6 enterprises of their supply chain: 3 clients; 2 suppliers; and 1 client of manufacturing services.

The number of sub-contractors identified in the pilot test was minimal.
**Reaching the tiers of the supply chain**

**Tiers reached in one wave of sampling**

In one wave of sampling all tiers of the supply chain could be reached except Tier 5

- 3 sample enterprises in Tier 1
- 12 sample enterprises in Tier 2
- 10 sample enterprises in Tier 3
- 3 sample enterprises in Tier 4
Coverage of occupations of employees

Production and non-production employees

The pilot results give a high number of sample employees in non-production occupations and too few in production occupations

- 47% in managerial occupations
- 7% in professional occupations
- ...
- 20% in occupations of plant and machine operators and assemblers
- 2% in elementary occupations
Vietnam General Statistical Office

Ms Vu Thi Thu Thuy, Director, Department of Data Collection and IT Application
BACKGROUND

The electronics industry began to emerge in the 20th century and is now one of the largest industries globally.

Vietnam became the 12th largest manufacturer and exporter of electronics in the world, and 3rd one in ASEAN in 2019.
The piloted project is conducted in two phases

**Phase I** starts from the end of 2021 until the 3\textsuperscript{rd} quarter 2023, to build a methodology for mapping electronics supply chains in Viet Nam with a strategy of conducting the pilot survey in three steps.

**Phase 2** is the full-scale implementation of the survey, which will be conducted when evaluation of Phase 1 has completed entirely.

=> *The presentation focuses on the implementation of Phase 1.*
Step 1

Enterprise Questionnaire: 20 questions on the characteristics of the enterprises

Data collection mode: using CAPI (computer assisted personal interviewing).

Data collection method: face-to-face interviews

Step 2

Enterprise Questionnaire: 22 questions to collect information on enterprises.

Data collection mode: using web-based questionnaires (web-form).

Data collection method: self-administration

Step 3

Enterprise and Worker Questionnaires: The EQ consists of 102 questions; the WQ consists of 136 questions.

Data collection mode: web-based for Enterprise Questionnaire and CAPI for worker questionnaire.

Data collection method: self-administration for EQ and face-to-face for WQ
❖ **Supervisors:**
Central-level supervisors: civil servant of GSO
Local-level supervisors: civil servants of Provincial Statistics Office in piloted provinces.

❖ **Enumerators:**
Persons who have experience of participating in Enterprise survey and/or Labor Force survey, they are civil servants of Provincial Statistics Office or District Statistics Offices in piloted provinces.
Step 1
Training course in December 2021 for 6 piloted provinces by GSO and ILO.

❖ Step 2:
Training course in March 2022 for 10 piloted provinces by GSO and ILO.

❖ Step 3
April 2023 on Enterprise Questionnaire for 2 provinces by GSO and ILO.
June 2023 on Worker Questionnaire for 2 provinces by GSO and ILO.
Data collection was implemented in 3 provinces in the North of the country.

-Time of collecting data divided into 3 periods:
  + 22 May to 22 June 2023
  + 4 - 19 July 2023
  + 26 July to 28 August 2023

- Survey units: **28 enterprises and 87 employees** in which 3 enterprises refused to provide a list of employees (due to confidentiality of information that they did not want to provide)
ADVANTAGES OF THE PILOT

➢ Close ILO Geneva - ILO Hanoi - GSO Viet Nam cooperation at all stages: planning, strategy development, implementation to reporting.

➢ Feasible methodology for implementation, user-friendly and adjusted timely (e.g., redesigning questionnaire, changing the way of asking, etc).

➢ The questionnaire is logically designed and adapted upon feedbacks from specialists from relevant stakeholders: GSO (Department of Data Collection, Department of Labour and Population Statistics, Department of Industry and Construction Statistics), MOLISA ILSSA and DIRWA, VGCL (IR Department, Institute for Worker and Trade Union), VCCI, VEIA => aligned with Viet Nam’s context
Organization structure of GSO from central level down to provincial, district and commune levels makes the process of implementing more effective and convenient.

GSO’s experienced and skilled enumerators in data collection relating to enterprises, household businesses and workers.

Applied new techniques on developing electronic questionnaires to make data collection more convenient, high-quality data in a shorter time compared to traditional methods.
➢ Information related to the clients, suppliers and employees of the enterprises are difficult to collect, so there are some refusing to provide information (such as name, telephone, address, email).

➢ Surveyed enterprises are hesitant to/refused to provide the list of employees. Some provided but with minimal information.

➢ Some large enterprises (especially those in Hanoi) are very difficult to approach, so enumerators spent a lot of time contacting, explaining as well as convincing them to cooperate in providing information.
Sampling

Even when having the enterprises’ list of workers, enumerators had to contact the workers back and forth via various means before being able to reach them.

Worker respondents said they needed their employers’ approval to meet with enumerators when discussions concerned the workplace.

Enterprises were concerned that they had to arrange time and venue for interviews with workers, so they were hesitant because it could affect production activities and worker’s schedule.

In practice, it is very difficult to convince the workers to introduce 3 other workers for the survey as set out in the sampling approach.
Worker questionnaire
Some provided insufficiently-detailed responses, or did not want to respond on:
• detailed pay and allowances
• self-assessment of personal compatibility with the skills required for the current work
• Occupational health
• On employers’ treatment of employees

Enterprise questionnaire
• Information come from several departments, so it takes time to complete. Many questions ask for information within 12 months, respondents must check records to respond.

• The survey is an additional burden for the enterprises that have to report their data regularly to several authorities. This impacts on the time of responses.

• There are enterprises that did not consider themselves part of the electrical/electronic supply chain, so they didn’t prioritize it.
When rolled out full-scale, the questionnaire should be shortened. Cognitive tests can help to increase efficiency. Adaptation to language and context is crucial.

Invest even more effort in informing the enterprises on the importance of the survey and agreed on the best timing to collect data with them.

Training of enumerators on the challenges of the survey is crucial for the quality data collection.

Planning work should consider reserved time to handle unexpected situations, to ensure timely progress. Ideally avoid overlap with other GSO surveys to reduce burden.
Panel of data users

Mr. Bui Ton Hien, Director, Institute of Labour Science and Social Affairs, Ministry of Labor – Invalids and Social Affairs

Ms Tran Thi Hong Lien, Deputy Director, Bureau for Employers’ Activities, Viet Nam Chamber of Commerce and Industry (online).

Mr. Nguyen Thanh Tung, Vice Head of Research Department, Institute for Workers and Trade Union, Viet Nam General Confederation of Labour (online).
Closing remarks

Ms. Tina Faulkner, Bureau of International Labor Affairs, U.S. Department of Labor

Mr Rafael Diez de Medina, Director Department of Statistics and Chief Statistician, ILO