



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation
Office

Development of a Tripartite Framework for the Support and Protection of Ethiopian Women Domestic Migrant Workers to the GCC States, Lebanon and Sudan – Midterm Term Evaluation

Quick Facts

Country: *Ethiopia*

Mid-Term: *25 February – 31 March 2015*

Mode of Evaluation: *Independent*

Administrative Office: *ILO ROAF, Addis Ababa*

Technical Office: *MIGRANT*

Evaluation Manager: *Mr. Gugsu Yimer Farice*

Evaluation Consultant: *Prof. Oladele Arowolo*

Project End: *31/01/2016*

Project Code: *RAF/12/09/EEC*

Donor & Project Budget: *EU (Euro2, 000,000);
ILO/UN Women (Euro 500,000)*

Keywords: Domestic workers, migrant workers

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure: The aim of the project is to better provide decent standards at work and the human rights of women migrant domestic workers from Ethiopia throughout the process of migration in the Middle East and in Sudan, and up until their return home. The specific project objectives are to: a) Develop a coherent multi-stakeholder framework to promote the rights of MDW from Ethiopia to the GCC countries; b) Streamline and decentralize the migration process in the country

of origin and strengthen reception, oversight and monitoring process in receiving countries; and c) Provide MDW with relevant information and substantive training prior to departure, on arrival in receiving country, and on return home to ensure their successful performance and reintegration. The project supports the realization of the DWCP Outcome ETH 155: Improved management of labour migration and reduction of irregular migration.

In order to achieve the three project outcomes, the project has been designed to focus on achievement of the nine interrelated strategies or outputs that emphasize human and institutional capacity building for the Government of Ethiopia as well as the migrant domestic workers and human rights their protection.

Methodology of evaluation

A desk review was undertaken and analysis of project and other documentation carried out including the approved log frame, ILO 2013 - 2014 Annual reports provided by the project management. The evaluator met with most of the relevant stakeholders including members of the National Steering Committee and the Technical Working Group, as well as project beneficiaries to undertake more in depth reviews of the respective national strategies

and the delivery of outputs and outcomes of the respective components in the country.

Present Situation of the Project

This project is a three year project from February 2013 to January 2016. It was initially designed to target Ethiopia and Somalia however, this has been revised only to target Ethiopia and addendum has been signed with the Donor accordingly. The total project budget is Euro 2,500,000; EU is providing 80% of the funding which is Euro 2,000,000 while ILO/UN Women is contributing the other 20% Euro 500,000.

The project has been managed by the ILO CO, and the Steering Committee, supported by a Technical Working Group consisting the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs (MOLSA) – the Chair; the Confederation of Ethiopian Trade Unions (CETU); the Ethiopian Employer's Federation (EEF); ILO; IOM; UN Women; UNODC; Police Commission; Ministry of Justice; Ministry of Women, Children and Youth Affairs; Immigration Authority; and Ministry of Foreign Affairs. Since its inception the TWG has been coordinating the implementation of project activities through its quarterly meetings.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

This independent evaluation serves two main purposes: a) Give an independent assessment of progress to date of the project across all outcomes; assessing performance as per the foreseen targets and indicators of achievement at output level; strategies and implementation modalities chosen; partnership arrangements, constraints and opportunities; and b) Provide strategic and operational recommendations as well as highlight lessons to improve performance and delivery of project results

The overall objective of evaluation is to analyse progress made towards achieving established outcomes, to identify lessons learnt so far and to propose recommendations

for improved delivery of quality outputs and achievement of outcomes for the rest of the project life span. The evaluation provides an opportunity for taking stock, reflection, learning and sharing knowledge regarding how the project could improve the effectiveness of its operations for the other half of the project period.

This independent evaluation covered all the tree outcomes of project. The evaluation has assessed all key outputs that have been produced since the start of the project in January 2013. The evaluation issues addressed include: progress made towards achieving the project outcomes; how to ensure the achievement of all results (outputs and outcomes) within the project period; internal and external factors that influence speed of implementation; project management and extent of ILO cooperation with government and collaboration with other partners; strategic fit of the initiative within the context of the DWCP.

The primary clients of the evaluation are the European Union as donor of this project, the government of Ethiopia as recipient countries, constituents and the ILO as executer of the project as well as other relevant stakeholders. The ILO Office, the tripartite constituents and other parties involved in the execution of the project would use, as appropriate, the evaluation findings and lessons learnt.

Main Findings & Conclusions

Relevance & strategic fit: The MDW project is relevant to aspects of the overall objectives national development plan of Ethiopia, the social and economic development areas of the UNDAF, aspects of the ongoing Ethiopian DWCP and the EU National Indicative Programme, 2014-2020. The current Ethiopian national development plan, the Growth and Transformation Plan (GTP), which mainstreams employment across all pillars (MOLSA, 2011), and makes the MDW project directly relevant

to the drive towards poverty eradication and reduction in unemployment rate particularly among the youth. In support of government efforts to address the challenge of unemployment in the country the United Nations country Team (UNCT) in Ethiopia formulated their UNDAF with outputs that are relevant to the DWCP and underscore the role of ILO in achieving these outputs.

Validity of design: The design of the project has been based on a Logframe annexed to the signed Memorandum of Understanding; while the objectives and intervention logic or strategies are clearly stated, the Logframe structure appears rather fragmented and difficult to follow. It is not clear from the Logframe the specific outputs that will lead to the achievement of any outcome. The project management has, however, identified this challenge and, to some extent, rectified aspects of the Logframe through the Implementation Plan, 2013-2016.

Project effectiveness: The project management identified quite a number of activities relevant to the realization of each key result area or output under each of the three outcomes of the project. The implementation plan for the first year (01/02/2013 – 31/01/2014) identified a total of 57 activities to address the 9 outputs and eventually the three outcomes of the project (see Figure 2). Significant progress was made during the year, except for the interruption caused by the PM's announcement on 23 October 2013 in which the Ethiopian Government banned low skill workers from migrating to the Middle East and Sudan. Another development that interrupted project activities and caused the inclusion of new additional activities was the unexpected mass deportation of Ethiopian Migrants from Kingdom of Saudi Arabia in November, 2013 which has created a chaos within the government and in Ethiopia in general. The project, to its credit, has been supporting the government in reintegration of such returnees as well as trying to support them in the

institutional re-structuring process. Despite these challenges, the project management with the support of the collaborating partners (IOM, UNDOC and UN Women) continued to implement project activities and to engage with Government implementing partners.

Project efficiency: The evaluation found that the resources (human resources, time, expertise, funds etc.) have been allocated and used strategically to provide the necessary support and to achieve the broader project objectives. In terms of human resources, the ILO has deployed adequate staff (CTA, NPO, Project Assistant – Administration, and Project Driver) and the staffs have responded professionally to the demands of the project. In order to facilitate project operations, ILO CO has made available a vehicle from another project; this intervention has been useful and cost-effective as well. The evaluation has noted, however, that the ILO has not been able to provide any technical backstopping from the Headquarter in Geneva.

Project management & collaboration: The project has been managed by the ILO CO, and the Steering Committee, supported by a Technical Working Group consisting the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs (MOLSA) – the Chair; the Confederation of Ethiopian Trade Unions (CETU); the Ethiopian Employer's Federation (EEF); ILO; IOM; UN Women; UNODC; Police Commission; Ministry of Justice; Ministry of Women, Children and Youth Affairs; Immigration Authority; and Ministry of Foreign Affairs. Since its inception the TWG has been coordinating the implementation of project activities through its quarterly meetings.

Government, Employers' and Workers' organizations participated in the development of the DWCP from its inception. The priorities and outcomes were identified by them through consultation and consultative workshops. It was agreed to set up a national tripartite steering committee and Technical Working Group consisting of ILO's tripartite

constituents namely, the Ethiopian Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs (MoLSA), the Confederation of Ethiopian Trade Unions (CETU), and the Ethiopian Employer's Federation (EEF).

Impact orientation and sustainability: The major project strategies for ensuring the sustainability of project activities consist of human and institutional capacity building, the utilization of existing DWCP structures in government and civil society to manage project implementation, and the move by government to achieve international standards in regard to migration and human rights through bilateral agreements. The ILO supported capacity building for migration management, particularly support by ILO to TWG in revising the Employment Exchange Proclamation No. 632/2009 which is used to deal with matters related to overseas employment including the rights and duties of Private Employment Agencies.

Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Main Recommendations

- 1) The pitfalls of inadequate project design identified by this review suggests that the Logframe of this project, as attached to the MoU, should be reviewed by the ILO project management in close collaboration with the overall project management; baseline data should be collected to serve as input into the new logframe that has baseline for each outcome and output indicator, and an agreed set of corresponding targets.
- 2) The project has limited provision for research; it is necessary to expand the scope of activities to include a national research on migration to provide needed evidence for the formulation of a Migration Policy for Ethiopia.
- 3) The move towards decentralisation of migration management in the country to the regional level is one in the right direction; through this project, efforts should be strengthened to involve the regions in project management and develop capacity for project implementation through training, equipment supply and budget support.
- 4) The NGOs involved in this project (WISE and Agar Ethiopia) have played a critical role in the integration aspects of this project; their sustained contribution to this project and related government efforts should be encouraged through financial support by the ILO and donor agencies.
- 5) The MDWs receiving countries are sovereign states and the process of concluding the dialogues initiated may be much longer than anticipated; therefore, Government should consider a long-term dialogue with these countries as an option.
- 6) Given delays in implementation resulting from the official ban on emigration, coupled with the unintended expanded scope of project activities resulting from mass deportation of MDWs from Saudi Arabia, this evaluation recommends that the project cycle be extended and additional resources made available by Government and development partners (ILO, EU, UN Women, ECA, etc) commensurate to projected work streams in the new Logframe and the ILO implementation plan.
- 7) Without lifting the current ban on emigration of MDWs, this project can hardly move forward in the expected direction; therefore, GDRE should lift the ban on unskilled migration and finalise the Employment Exchange Proclamation No. 632/2009 which is used to deal with matters related to overseas employment including the rights and duties of Private Employment Agencies.
- 8) The ILO project management should turn attention to Output 7 that has hardly been addressed: Fewer disputes arising between DW and PEA/PPE; between DW and employers.