



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation
Office

Combating Hazardous Child Labour in Tobacco Farming in Urambo Phase II - Final Evaluation

Quick Facts

Countries/Regions: Tanzania

Final Evaluation: 02/2011

Evaluation Mode: Independent

Administrative Office: DWT/CO-Dar es Salaam

Technical Office: DWT/CO-Dar es Salaam

Evaluation Manager: ILO/IPEC' (DED)

Evaluation Consultants: Stephen Tembo, (Team leader); Sitta Ngissa, (National Consultant)

Project Code: URT/06/02/ECT

Donor(s) & Budget: Elimination of Child Labour in Tobacco Growing (ECLT) (US\$ 1,439,671)

Keywords: Child Labour; Tobacco

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

The Urambo Tobacco Sector Programme

The Urambo Tobacco Sector Project (UTSP) implemented by the International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) of the International Labour Organization (ILO) focused on addressing child labour (CL) in tobacco growing in the district of Urambo (Tabora region). Tanzania is Africa's third largest producer of tobacco, and Urambo is the leading district in the country. Tobacco

growing is labour intensive. Prior to the project it was estimated that around 45 per cent of the labour force in the tobacco sector were children, the majority being under 15 years old.

UTSP Phase I ran from January 2004 to December 2006 and Phase II from January 2007 to December 2010. Both phases were funded by the foundation for the Elimination of Child Labour in Tobacco (ECLT).

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The primary purpose of the evaluation is to serve as a learning tool for stakeholders to inform future planning. It encompasses the following:

1. Assessing and documenting the achievements of the project vis-à-vis stated objectives by comparing intended outputs with actual outputs, with particular focus on: education; livelihoods; corporate social responsibility; and mainstreaming of the activities of Urambo District into the Tanzania National Action Plan (NAP).
2. Understanding how the recommendations of the mid-term evaluation concerning education have been implemented.
3. Identifying and documenting models of intervention for possible replication (separate sub-study, see below).
4. Providing inputs and suggestions for the sustainability of the project efforts, including recommendations for future planning and implementation of CL projects in Urambo District in the context of the way forward for the ECLT/ILO partnership.

Phase II has two intermediate objectives:

1. Model interventions for the prevention and elimination of child labour in tobacco growing are in place in Urambo District.
2. Capacity of relevant institutions strengthened to address CL issues in a sustainable manner.

Activities related to the first objective include the construction of classrooms, prevention and withdrawal of children from CL, the establishment of sustainable monitoring and support mechanisms through the schools and Village Child Labour Committees (VCLC), and to the most vulnerable families through income generation. For the second objective the project sensitized and strengthened the capacity of key government institutions at district and community level, and partnered with the private sector, with NGOs, and with other projects to engage in upstream policy influencing.

Methodology of evaluation

A team of two independent consultants carried out the evaluation. The field work in Urambo took place in a two-week period in November 2010. Visits were made to seven out of nine wards in the target area.

Standard evaluation methods were employed including a review of documents, and interviews or focus group discussions with a sample of beneficiaries and tobacco growers, and representatives of all the major stakeholders including district government officials and tobacco companies. Discussions were also held with the donor and with key stakeholders in Dar es Salaam and with support staff in ILO Geneva.

Preliminary findings were presented at a Stakeholders Workshop in Tabora which was attended by representatives of all the main stakeholders and a sample of beneficiaries. Feedback from the workshop has been incorporated into the report.

Main Findings & Conclusions

1. UTSP II has been a relevant and worthwhile project that has had a discernible impact on the group of children most at risk.
2. Quantitative data collected from a participating school, supported by qualitative information from

other schools, indicate that the number of children enrolled in the last two years of primary school in 2010 is double the figure for 2006, and attendance has also risen. Triangulation of this statistic against anecdotal reports by the tobacco companies that CL incidence in the district has fallen from 26 per cent (2004) to 13 per cent (2009), and against the verified number of 1,973 children withdrawn/prevented by UTSP II (bearing in mind the baseline figure of 1,875 (12 per cent) engaged in tobacco farming; 4,063 (26 per cent) in agriculture), leads to the cautious conclusion that child labour incidence in the target area has been halved. While not all of this progress can be attributed to UTSP, the project has made a significant contribution.

3. Working through Implementing Agencies (IA) the project has strengthened the capacity of VCLCs for the identification and monitoring of children engaged in or at risk of CL. The strongest VCLCs are continuing to monitor and report cases of CL and most of them have formulated by-laws against the practice. Several have successfully leveraged education sponsorship for vulnerable children through government sources. A few of the VCLCs have become dormant and several voiced the need for financial incentives.
4. The provision of scholastic materials to identified children was a one-time intervention. To sustain its impact UTSP has introduced income-generating activities to sample schools to build a fund to support the education needs of children at risk. Similar income-generating support was provided to vulnerable families to enable them to fund their children's education. These activities had a one-year timeframe which was too short to be successful, although the concept has good potential and is recommended for further development.
5. Children older than 14 years were provided with vocational training. The teenagers really appreciated the vocational skills they gained but it is too early to evaluate their employment and income. A few have found employment or started up their own business but the majority are in need of further support to get started. The short timeframe of the activity has limited this input. The lack of access to start up capital is also a problem. The evaluation suggests that with the growth of secondary education, support for this age group would be better directed to that goal,

with the support of catch-up classes where necessary.

6. Classroom construction has been greatly appreciated by the participating schools. Problems in implementation have caused delays and increased costs. Although none of the classrooms are fully finished, most are roofed and already crammed with children, indicating the extent of the need which existed. It is recommended that the classrooms be speedily completed and the model replicated as a good practice for increasing enrolment.
7. The implementing agencies who supported or carried out these interventions have worked hard under adverse conditions.
8. One of the most successful collaborations has been with the private sector. UTSP and IAs provided technical support for the insertion of CL into the training curriculum of the tobacco company extension workers known as leaf technicians (LT). These LTs are passing on the information to the contact farmers they work with, and are actively monitoring CL in the field and reporting cases to the primary societies. Tobacco companies and primary societies have a clause in farmers' contracts against CL. The tobacco companies' own initiatives to improve productivity through the introduction of labour-saving devices such as the ox plough have had a great impact on reducing labour input and hence contributed to reducing CL.
9. At district level the project has built the capacity of members of the District Child Labour Subcommittee (DCLSC) but positive structural changes in its membership and transfers of staff, has meant that some of this capacity has been lost. The District Child Labour Coordinator has been active in monitoring the VCLCs and pilot data gathering for a child labour monitoring system (CLMS) has been carried out in all the wards. The next step is to decide into which data base this information should be entered and how it will be used. Last year CL received its own budget allocation for the first time (3.5 million TSH) from district funds. Stakeholders urge the government to commit at least 5 per cent of the tobacco levy income to addressing CL in the district.
10. Upstream policy influencing work has focused on sharing the experiences of UTSP and supporting

the Time-Bound Programme (TBP) of the government in the formulation of the NPA. The project has collaborated closely with the TEACH project of Winrock and with the ILO Support Project to the TBP.

11. This has been a useful project providing the right conditions to innovate and test new models, due to the fact that it is geographically small and sector-specific. New research has been carried out documenting the trafficking of children into Urambo, the reasons for girls drop-out from secondary schools, and a baseline survey of CL in Urambo.
12. The project has faced a number of challenges. These include a difficult operating environment, a design process that lacked sufficient grounding in the local context, an inefficient division of responsibilities between the implementing agencies; and bureaucratic delays within ILO which have failed to provide the degree of responsiveness necessary to support community-level interventions.
13. Despite these shortcomings, the project's efforts have resulted in synergies and all its activities – even those which were not fully successful – have all contributed to raising awareness in the district, which is the most sustainable output of all.

Recommendations

Main recommendations and follow up

1. It is recommended that ILO turn its attention to replicating the best models and lessons learned into other tobacco growing areas or similar rural districts with high rates of CL in small-scale agriculture, and that they particularly focus their efforts on known CL supply regions such as Kigoma and Singida in order to stop the migration of children for labour. It is strongly recommended that they carry out research into ways in which the successful relationship with the tobacco private sector and the development of labour-saving devices might be replicated with other private-sector companies in other crops and sectors.
2. In Urambo, it is recommended that they focus on further capacitating and empowering of VCLCs

and village committees to develop and implement their own plans and priorities for CL.

3. The District government is urged to commit at least 5 per cent of tobacco revenues to address CL, and to restructure the DCLSC to include a wider range of stakeholders including district councillors and the regional Labour Officer.

Key lessons learned

Evaluation and lessons learned from UTSP Phase I

Phase I (budget of US\$557,729) ran for three years from January 2004 until December 2006. It consisted of two broad components: the provision of social protection services to children engaged or at risk of CL, and capacity building of local communities to sustainably combat CL. The end of project evaluation found that Phase I had been worthwhile and recommended a second phase. Among their key programme recommendations for the next phase were:

1. To make greater effort to lobby and involve the tobacco industry.
2. To give more support to income-generating activities (particularly for women) and support the creation of savings and credit societies, and the need for thorough market analysis.
3. The need for a more effective model for vocational training.
4. To extend support beyond primary school.
5. The need to include upstream activities to ensure sharing and replication.

In terms of the implementation framework, the following key needs are noted:

1. Greater participation by communities and stakeholders in planning and implementation (to foster ownership).
2. Quantifiable project outputs and indicators.
3. Realistic budgets factoring in inflation (should be increased from 5 to 10 per cent).
4. Better selection of implementing agencies.
5. To streamline administrative processes in ILO for faster decisions and approval of actions in the field.