



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation Office

Public-Private Partnership (PPP) between the chocolate and cocoa industry and the ILO in Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire - Midterm Implementation Review

Quick Facts

Countries: Ghana, Côte d'Ivoire

Midterm Evaluation: July 2013

Mode of Evaluation: Independent

Administrative Office: DWT/ Ghana, Côte d'Ivoire

Technical Office: FPRW/IPEC

Evaluation Manager: Peter Wichmand

Evaluation Consultant: Sue Upton

Project Code: RAF/11/01/GIG & RAF/11/04/GIG

Donor & Project Budget: ADM Cocoa, Barry Callebaut, Cargill, Ferrero, The Hershey Company, Kraft Foods, Mars Incorporated and Nestlé, USD 2,060,000 + Mars 2012 Addendum: USD 1,000,000

Keywords: Child labor

Executive Summary

(Extract from the full report)

Context

Since the Harkin-Engel Protocol was signed in 2001, interventions to protect children from hazardous work on cocoa farms and support access to appropriate educational opportunities have made progress in eliminating child labour from the cocoa supply chain in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana. The PPP (Public Private Partnership) is part of IPEC's current programme on child labour in West Africa and works in alignment with three similar projects. While these three projects are funded by USDOL, the PPP is funded by the chocolate and cocoa industry through the National Confectioners

Association (NCA). All four projects work with many of the same stakeholders and their alignment serves to encourage cross-fertilization and increased efficiency and effectiveness.

Project description

The PPP aims to accelerate progress in the elimination of child labour in cocoa growing communities through interventions at national, district and community levels which focus on strengthening national Child Labour Monitoring Systems (CLMS), capacity building and coordination of key actors. The emphasis on strengthening existing systems is the project's principal strategy for sustainability. The PPP plans to withdraw or prevent 3000 children from child labour and ensure that 200 households have increased knowledge of what constitutes hazardous work for children, while raising awareness and supporting community based activities for a further 1200 households. Implementing agencies include both government and civil society organisations working in six PPP specific communities and 13 common communities with the Cocoa Communities Project (CCP).

PIR methodology

Over a two day period in each country the PIR brought stakeholders together to discuss relevant issues and make recommendations to improve the delivery and sustainability of project outputs and objectives. Guided by an external facilitator, the process started with a review of project documents and some pre-field work interviews which were followed by a one and a half day stakeholder workshop in each country and meetings with the national project teams. A participatory process enabled stakeholders to identify and discuss issues

of interest or concern and to reach a consensus on the way forward.

Key Findings

Project Design

Overall the PPP design is proving effective in complementing and extending the work of the IPEC's West Africa programme. Capacity building is underway at all levels and the Community Action Plan (CAP) approach has started to show results. National capacity to roll out CLMS may have been somewhat over estimated and the project's lack of any component linked to improving family economies may affect the sustainability of project results in PPP specific communities unless CAP related activities can be developed to fill this gap.

Project Implementation

Strengthening and expanding national Child Labour Monitoring Systems (CLMS)

The roll out of National Child Labour Monitoring Systems in both countries is facing some political and technical challenges that are largely beyond the control of the project. The PPP team in Cote d'Ivoire is full of hope for the Système d'Observation et Suivi du Travail des Enfants en Côte d'Ivoire (SOSTECI) and ready to do everything possible to fulfil its supporting role. In Ghana there is a sense of uncertainty about the future and feasibility of the GCLMS and associated partners were due to meet shortly after the PIR stakeholders' workshop to review the current situation.

CAPs in both countries are well underway. The principal challenges identified during the PIR were resource mobilisation in Ghana and coordination and collaboration in Cote d'Ivoire, both vital and related aspects of successful community action planning that are addressed in the recommendations resulting from the project review.

The project has suffered significant delays in delivering support to direct beneficiaries, largely due to issues related to the base line study carried out under the CCP. It has yet to start reporting on children withdrawn or prevented from child labour but this will begin during the next reporting period, thus ensuring a minimum of three months to monitor the children concerned before the end of the project.

Building capacity to combat child labour, with a focus on supporting and participating in CLMS

Activities under this immediate objective are underway in both countries, largely in collaboration with the CCP. PIR discussions focussed on capacity building for workers and employers in Cote d'Ivoire and project sustainability and impact in both countries, which is dependent on effective capacity building.

IMPROVED COORDINATION LED BY NATIONAL STEERING COMMITTEES

The PPP and its sister projects are contributing to overcoming the challenges to effective coordination that exist in both countries. The project is currently developing specific activities in Ghana and offering appropriate support to an IPEC proposal to streamline coordination in Cote d'Ivoire.

Conclusions

The PIR indicates that the PPP is working effectively and efficiently alongside the CCP, both projects providing added value to the other, and also to the ECOWAS I and II projects (the three other CL projects being implemented by ILO-IPEC). The project is on track to meet its objectives. It is unclear if the PPP will lead on to similar future funding collaboration between industry partners and some kind of feedback mechanism through which to discuss and share the relevant issues would no doubt be helpful, should the donor collective or individual companies be interested in this.

Recommendation

The recommendations from the PIR are presented by country under the various thematic headings and addressed to specific group of stakeholders. Nine recommendations are identified, with specific measures about how they might be implemented.

Ghana – GCLMS

Recommendation 1 addressed to NPECLC and the NSC (PPP and other IPEC initiatives are recommended to offer appropriate support):
Improve effectiveness and sustainability of the GCLMS through the following measures:

- Investigate re-establishing annual budgetary support from the Ministry of finance.
- Investigate possibilities for public-private partnership funding.
- Consider the merits of raising public awareness of child labour issues to create pressure to provide funding.
- Develop advocacy within government to raise awareness of child labour monitoring issues so that all relevant ministries make child labour part of their sector plans (particularly the Ministry of Local Government).
- Circulate and follow up on the Memorandum Of Understanding signed with Ministries and Departments, to encourage its implementation.
- Carry out a current cost analysis to inform the streamlining of the GCLMS.
- Send correspondence between NPECLC and District Assemblies via the District Chief Executives and District Coordinating Directors and copied to the focal persons (Social Welfare Officer and NGOs).

Recommendation 2 addressed to district level stakeholders and the PPP project team: **Improve effectiveness and sustainability of the GCLMS through the following measures:**

- Support and encourage coordinated advocacy by CCPCs, DCPCs, NGOs, local authority staff and other actors to encourage the mainstreaming of GCLMS and related issues (CAPs) into departmental and District Medium Term Development plans, Annual Action Plans and the composite budget. Make decentralisation work!
- Support and promote capacity building for District Chief Executives and District Finance Officers, especially in new districts, to ensure that they are aware of child labour issues.
- Advocate for a revision of the Functional Organisation Assessment Tool (FOAT) used to assess DAs, in relation to child labour issues (Should the FOAT look at how CAPs and Area Council Plans feed into the development of Medium Term Development Plans? Should child labour have a higher profile in the evaluation tool?).
- Work to empower communities to demand child labour related services from their DAs.

- Encourage alternative livelihoods programmes (skill development and microfinance) to enable families to supplement their income from cocoa.
- Investigate sustainable markets for food crops through Ministry of Agriculture and others and consider a local trade show to market produce.

Ghana - CAPS

Recommendation 3 addressed to implementing agencies, other district level stakeholders and the PPP project team: **Improve effectiveness and sustainability of CAPs implementation and results with the following measures:**

- Explore all possible sources of public and private funding at both local and national levels.
- Build the capacity of communities to explore funding sources, develop proposals and advocate for the right to quality education and decent work. Develop local understanding of a rights-based approach and how to access local government services.
- Consider showcasing the CAPs at district level to market them to potential local funders.
- Advocate appropriately for the extension of state social interventions to cover PPP communities.
- Explore options for livelihood support that the PPP can realistically offer in the remaining time.

Ghana - Direct Beneficiaries

Recommendation 4 addressed to implementing agencies and the PPP project team: **to ensure that direct beneficiary targets are met and successfully reported, implement the following measures:**

- Finish the needs assessment as soon as possible and decide what to do about any short fall.
- Start reporting on direct beneficiaries as soon as possible to iron out any problems using the DMBR and ensure a minimum of three months monitoring before the end of the project.

Cote d'Ivoire - SOSTECI

Recommendation 5 addressed to local level SOSTECI implementation partners and the PPP project team: **Improve effectiveness and sustainability of the SOSTECI through the following measures:**

- Strengthen the capacity of state agencies responsible for meeting the needs of children withdrawn or at risk of child labour by:
 - i. Advocacy towards decentralised authorities (Regional and town councils) for material and financial support and to devolved authorities (Prefectures, Sub-prefecture, ministerial bodies, ...) to request their support;
 - ii. Involving decentralised and devolved agencies in SOSTECI training ;
 - iii. Asking PPP implementing agencies to contribute to strengthening local platforms for coordinated action.
- Resolve the issue of coordination of child protection issues at local level by:
 - i. Establishing if the SOSTECI framework clarifies this;
 - ii. If necessary, mapping existing agencies in each area;
 - iii. Where necessary, advocating for locally appropriate solutions.
- Find effective and creative solutions to the issue of covering costs and recognising the efforts of different actors involved in rolling out the SOSTECI (*eg: by delivering certificates, bicycles, T-shirts etc.*).
- Investigate the feasibility of developing systems and support for using local foster families:
 - i. Identify and raise awareness of the need at community level;
 - ii. Identify voluntary foster families;
 - iii. Build the capacity of these families;
 - iv. Identify a strategy for reintegration of children cared for by such families;
 - v. Ensure regular monitoring of children placed in foster families.

Cote d'Ivoire - CAPS

Recommendation 6 addressed to implementing agencies, other local level stakeholders and the PPP project team: **Establish effective local platforms** to encourage collaboration between all the agencies concerned as a means of improving coordination, collaboration, training and resource mobilisation and supporting the effective roll out of the SOSTECI. (NB: this was also a recommendation emerging from the CCP PIR in February 2013).

Cote d'Ivoire - Direct Beneficiaries

Recommendation 7 addressed to implementing agencies and the PPP project team: **to ensure that direct beneficiary targets are met and successfully reported, implement the following measures:**

- Start reporting on direct beneficiaries as soon as possible to iron out any problems using the DMBR and ensure a minimum of three months monitoring before the end of the project.
- Follow up on the suggestions related to supporting schoolchildren to obtain birth certificates.

Cote d'Ivoire - Training for workers and employers:

Recommendation 8 addressed to the PPP project team and implementing agencies: **Ensure that relevant organisations** are invited to national and local training events and encourage them to get actively involved in replicating training themselves so that awareness to continues to grow concerning occupational health and safety and workers and employer' rights and responsibilities.

Ghana and Cote d'Ivoire – Promoting project sustainability and impact

Recommendation 9 addressed to the PPP project team and implementing agencies: **to promote the sustainability and impact of the project results, consider the following measures:**

- Review PPP capacity building activities at community levels to ensure that the project is doing everything possible with the resources available. Operational, organisational and economic aspects should be reviewed.

(Please see full report for further details)