



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation Unit

ILO component of the culture and development partnership framework (CDPF) - Mid Term Joint Evaluation

Quick Facts

Countries: China

Mid-Term Evaluation: Jan 2011

Mode of Evaluation: Independent

ILO Administrative responsibility:
EMP/SEED

Technical Area: employment

Evaluation Management: MDG AF

Evaluation Team: Bob Boase

Project Code: CPR/08/51/UND

Donor & Budget: MDG AF US\$ 7,000,000)

UNESCO: 1,298,140 UNDP: 1,285,226

UNICEF: 1,235,011 UNIDO: 437,630

ILO: 485,480 UNFPA: 521,283

FAO: 240,750 WHO: 496,480

Keywords: Ethnic groups, minority groups,
education, child development, migration,
tourism, development partnerships

Extracted from the Executive Summary of the Full Evaluation Report

This mid-term evaluation was conducted in May-June 2010. It is an evaluation of the MDGF China Culture & Development Partnership Framework (CDPF) joint programme of the UN in partnership with the Government of China.

The three year MDGF US\$7 million CDPF began November 4, 2008 and was the mid-way point at the time of this evaluation. The cornerstone of the partnership framework is built on (i) capacity development for government to enable them to promote the rights of ethnic minorities and undertake rights and culture-based policies and development; complemented by (ii) capacity development of ethnic minorities to enable them to participate more effectively in policy and development processes. CDPF is implemented in four provinces/autonomous regions with significant ethnic minority populations: (1) Yunnan; (2) Guizhou; (3) Qinghai; and (4) Tibet. The State Ethnic Affairs Commission (SEAC) is the lead institution for the Government of China and UNESCO is the lead UN agency.

Main Findings & Conclusions

CDPF has made good progress in its first half. The report cites a number of early success stories to illustrate project accomplishments perhaps the most important of which is how it is changing understandings. A senior minority county official stated, 'I thought hardware was important but now I see software is more important.' – meaning that he used to think that the important thing in international projects was the computers or a vehicle but with CDPF he now sees that changing people's understanding and opening up their minds is far more important because it

empowers the minority people to take charge of their own affairs.

The evaluation found that the CDPF complexity with many UN agencies and Chinese government and academic organizations poses its own challenges to implementation. Coordination of effort is critical to the success and a great deal of time and effort must be devoted to this task. Each participating institution has its policies and practices that must be respected which results in high transaction costs for every step of implementation. Given the challenges of implementation CDPF may have been too ambitious in scope and expectation. Sustainability is at risk but can be assured if this report's recommendations are implemented and if there is a second phase. Minority women and youth are not perhaps as involved in CDPF as they might be and training could be improved for more impact. Minority languages are a complex and challenging issue for China and for the minorities. Ownership is strong in CDPF among all stakeholders including government organizations, academic organizations, and most important of all the minorities people themselves.

Perspective on Minorities Education, Migration & Tourism

The report puts forward some views on education, migration and tourism with respect to the minorities and it cautions against proceeding too quickly with boarding school for minorities children and with tourism into the minority villages. Out migration of minority youth to the cities is a serious threat to the preservation of minority culture and this issue, although not a part of CDPF needs more attention from the Chinese government.

Recommendations

Education

Primary school age minority children are extremely vulnerable if they are to be put into

boarding schools. Not only may formal education not succeed, the experience may break their culture. The project should accelerate and deepen its research on what has been done in other countries with a view to finding less intrusive alternatives to boarding schools such as distance education, visiting teachers leaving assignments and the one-laptop-per-child programme <http://laptop.org/en/>. Whatever the JP is able to discover in the remaining time it should caution government to move slowly and carefully with its current boarding school policy for minority primary age school children.

Migration

The JP should work with government to further develop an orientation/training module for migrating minority youth that not only prepares them for their migration experience but which also helps them develop a vision and plan to return to their village with the resources and new skills to develop their village. By planting the notion of returning to their village before departure prospects are enhanced for their eventual return and contribution to their village. Government may wish to consider the idea of a re-settlement allowance for migrants wishing to return home for purposes of starting their own business. If only a few of these individuals return that might not have otherwise done so the payback to their village of origin will be a good investment in the training/orientation programme. CDPF should link up with its sister JP the YEM to explore ways and means of further supporting minority migrant youth.

Tourism

Tourism can be particularly damaging for small vulnerable minority populations. It is interesting to note the policy of a China NGO on tourism for minority villages, '*We advise communities of the pros and cons of tourism and let them decide whether they wish to pursue it.*' In other words, minority villages should not blindly pursue tourism as the answer to all their problems. They should be informed of the positive and negative sides of

tourism and left to decide whether they want tourism. If they decide to pursue tourism then the JP needs to help them develop codes of conduct for the tourist & villagers & a careful monitoring system to address tourism problems quickly as they emerge.

Minority Health Services

In the balance of this JP, effort should be devoted to publicizing and promoting where possible the fact that health and service gaps in ethnic minority areas are still large and that continued attention to underserved areas is required should MDG4 and 5 be achieved equitably; the importance of specific policies (e.g. maternity waiting rooms) to increase access of the most vulnerable population groups; the need for quality and disaggregated data for decision making; the need for language and culturally appropriate health education materials; the need for a collaborative and participatory approach while designing and implementing health promotion strategies; and the importance of improving the technical skills but also the attitudes and communication skills of the health worker.

A National Conference

CDPF will have important achievements and lessons learned in the new fields of cultural preservation, development of minorities and more effective health and education policy for minorities. These achievements should be shared more broadly in China. One way of doing so is to hold a national conference at the JP's conclusion to showcase achievements, techniques and lessons learned. A national conference will enhance the identity and self-esteem of the minorities. It will also gain traction for more attention and resources to be devoted to minorities. The conference might be held in Kunming or Guizhou to focus attention directly on the minority areas. CDPF pilots, success stories and lessons learned need to be documented over the next 18 months so that they can be showcased in the conference.

Additional Suggestions for the JP to consider

In the course of this assignment the consultant observed a number of potential activities that the JP and government may wish to consider as follows:

A national minorities village-head training/counselling programme: UNDP's current cooperation with SEAC in its poverty alleviation project has developed a training manual and training for village heads using the technique and lessons learned in this project and other projects and the manual has also been used by CDPF. This manual could be further developed from CDPF and other donor/government experiences into a national training/counselling programme to be run by government or contracted to local NGOs. The curriculum for this course would cover such topics as: basics of village management, socio-economic development, local tourism development and guidelines, environmental management, how to benefit from migration, cultural preservation and development, health and education management.

Local road maintenance programme: Some countries, including Bangladesh, have a government programme that pays villagers to maintain a portion of the road on either side of their village for a few kilometres. Maintenance consists of removing fallen rock from the road and filling in potholes with gravel. Major road works are still done by the government. This programme would generate revenue for villagers but equally important, it inspires pride and ownership over their road works.

Village environment programme: Government and the donor community may wish to pursue the notion of a village-based environmental programme. The programme would pay villagers to develop their own project based on their values and traditions for work on small local environmental projects such as tree planting, trail construction and maintenance, water and sanitation works, etc.

Regular local radio/TV program in minority language: The consultant was surprised to learn there is no minority language programming on radio or TV in Congjiang and Leishan counties. Experience in

other countries shows that minority language programming is a powerful instrument to inform people of government services, to educate them about basic health practices and to help maintain and develop their language and culture. It is understood UNESCO works in partnership with the National Ethnic Film & TV Association on a bi-annual minority language TV programme award. However, due to repeated budget cuts during the formulation stage of this JP, the partnership with this Association could not be included in the Joint Programme. But this does not prevent CDPF from mounting some pilots in collaboration with local TV/radio stations.

CDPF Websites : The UN has and SEAC is developing CDPF websites. Since a central purpose of this JP is policy advice to government it is important that these sites be complete with all documents, presentations and videos produced by the JP and that the sites be kept up to date on a regular basis. It will be important to ‘advertise’ these sites to interested parties in government, the media and the donor community. The sites should be interactive so that CDPF can learn stakeholders’ views and suggestions.