



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation Unit

Growth with decent work for all: A youth employment programme in Antalya, Turkey Mid-Term Joint Evaluation

Quick Facts

Countries: Turkey

Mid-Term: September 2011

Mode of Evaluation: Independent Joint

Technical Area: Employment ED/EMP/MSU

Evaluation Management: United Nations
MDG Fund – (ILO lead) Partners: IOM, FAO
and UNDP; Consultant: Samir Mourshed

ILO Project Code: TUR/09/50/UND

Donor: United Nations MDG Fund

Keywords: Youth employment, migration,
Decent Work, employment creation

Budget : US\$3,980,000

IOM: 658,906

UNDP: 1,157,768

FAO: 659,120

ILO: 1,504,206

Taken from the Executive Summary of the MDG Joint Evaluation Report

In June 2011, The UNDP-Spain MDG Achievement Fund (MDG-F) contracted the Independent Consultant for the mid-term assessment of the Growth with Decent Work for All: National Youth Employment Program and Pilot Implementation in Antalya.1 (UNJP-YEM Turkey). It has been executed jointly by the United Nations Organizations: ILO, IOM, FAO and UNDP in

cooperation with The National Employment Agency (İŞKUR).

The aim of the UNJP-YEM Turkey is to reduce youth unemployment among vulnerable young members of migrant families and increase the participation of young women in the labor force. This will be achieved through improved capacities at national and local levels to design and implement employment interventions for unemployed youth and young women.

The Evaluation Consultant adopted a participatory approach in all phases of planning and execution of the evaluation exercise. The field work was conducted during the period of May 31st. – June 17th. 2011.

DESIGN QUALITY AND INTERNAL COHERENCE

Despite an impressive annual economic growth rate that have that exceeded 7% since 2002, the Turkish economy suffers from a mismatch between the national economic growth and employment generation; leading to a systematic problem of youth and women's unemployment particularly in migrants receiving cities. The Turkish national unemployment rate remains around 10%. With the 15-24 age groups of youth, youth unemployment rate is almost doubled (19%) and the labor participation rate of women in the same age group as low as 25%, the internal migration pattern coupled with lack of education, skills and work experience for migrant youth and women create an informal employment situation

with all its attendant problems associated with indecent work conditions.

UNJP-YEM Turkey addresses a well-defined problem and its causes: income deprivation, unemployment and jobless growth that have characterized the country's economic expansion and increased migration of young less educated youth aged 15-24, women with less access to resources and information due to their social exclusion or closed social environment, agricultural workers and people with disabilities to urban cities. UNJP-YEM Turkey is, therefore highly relevant.

At national level the UNJP-YEM is expected to create and implement a National Youth Employment Action Plan (NYEAP) that will lay the policy, budgetary and institutional framework for this objective. At local/pilot area of Antalya level UNJP-YEM is expected to analyse the emerging sectors in the pilot region of Antalya with higher competitive advantage and potential to create new employment opportunities, support the implementation of active employment policies through İŞKUR and the Provincial Employment & Vocational Training Board, improve the capacities of local authorities to increase employment rates among migrants, increase the outreach for unemployed youth and promote İŞKUR services. It would also, contribute to economic growth to the creation of decent work for the most vulnerable in the labor market.

As such, UNJP-YEM Turkey reflects the Turkish Government, MDG-F and the UN recognition that reducing youth unemployment among vulnerable young members of migrant families and increasing the participation of young women in the labor force through placements of young unemployed (age 15-24) into decent jobs would contribute directly to the progress of Turkey in achieving Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), particularly Goals (1): eradicate extreme poverty and hunger and MDG (3): Promote gender equality and empower women and particularly to the realization of the MDG targets of Turkey 1.B and 3.2. UNJP-YEM is, also a programmatic follow up of UNDAF commitment to support the Government of Turkey in formulating and activating social and economic development policies in favour of the poor through partnerships

with civil society and the private sector. In addition, it contributes to the results: 2, 4, 5, 6 and 7 of The United Nations Development Cooperation Strategy for Turkey–UNDCS (2011-2015). And more importantly, supports the vision of the Turkish ninth development plan (2007-2013): "Turkey, a country of information society, growing in stability, sharing more equitably, globally competitive and fully completed her coherence with the European Union". In this Plan, increasing employment is identified as major pillar to improving the labor market besides increasing the sensitivity of education to labor market and developing active labor policies.

While performing-as-one the commitment of UN and Turkey appears to be in good consistency with the Paris Declaration and the Accra Agenda for Action. The design and implementation performance of UNJP-YEM Turkey appears, also to be in good consistency with the five principles of Paris Declaration on Aid effectiveness: it is relevant to the national government. Local partners are committed and involved in the implementation process of UNJP-YEM Turkey. They form a local network that could support its sustainability if the programme management seeks to form and strengthen partnerships further. Both MDG-F and the UN have been working together to establish mutually agreed, harmonized and effective design for UNJP-YEM Turkey that allows participating UN agencies to work together to avoid duplication of its interventions using same processes and one monitoring framework of UNJP-YEM Turkey. Strengthening the M&E efforts/function can, however provide strong supportive environment for sustainable implementation of İŞKUR future activities. MDG-F, the UN and the main institutional beneficiary (İŞKUR) are accountable for the UNJP-YEM Turkey results. These results are needs to be clearly shared between participating UN agencies and other İŞKUR partners in the pilot province of Antalya.

EFFECTIVENESS of UNJP-YEM TURKEY

UNJP-YEM Turkey is expected to achieve five results:

1. Creation and implementation of a National Youth Employment Action Plan
2. Implementation of active employment policies on a local level through İŞKUR and the Provincial Employment and Vocational Training Boards
3. Increasing the employment rates among youth in Turkey's highest migration receiving province Antalya
4. Improving capacities of İŞKUR and local authorities in Antalya to provide support and outreach for unemployed youth who have limited access to their services
5. Identifying sectors with competitive advantages in Antalya in order to create new employment opportunities and to boost the local economy.

Results 1, 4 and 5 have been partially achieved

- The preparation of NYEAP draft is still a work in progress and launching it postponed to after national election to ensure involvement of the new ministerial teams and launch of the National Employment Strategy. Inter-institutional coordination was enhanced through the formation and increasing the capacity of NTT for the formulation & implementation of the National Youth Employment Action Plan (NYEAP) and development of future programs.
- UNJP-YEM Turkey enhanced the capacities of the national and local institutions to developing methods / National Models such as the Occupational outlook (ISKUR, social partners & employer organization), the Sector scan (identification of strategic priority sectors in Antalya and the Quantitative & qualitative research on monitoring of migration impact on local labor market and employment (ISKUR, TURKSTAT & Academia). Also, UNJP-YEM enhanced capacities of ISKUR and local authorities to increase employment of young women and vulnerable groups in Turkey's top migration receiving city, Antalya. (e.g., capacity Development for the National Technical Team responsible for the formulation of the National Youth Employment Action Plan, training on migration management for ISKUR, Provincial Employment Board & Employer Organization, and the vocational training on Cut flower). In addition to ISKUR-counsellor's Training of Trainer's Workshops (in job counselling,

matching and placement, life skills training) for which only first two modules of were developed and delivered. It focused mainly on providing participants with knowledge that most of them already know and was not customized for ISKUR setting and Staff. It lacks teaching skills and practices (e.g. participants learn about and practice effective presentation skills in both classroom and small group situations; including practice teaching exercises that covers both issue-specific topics according participants' needs.

- UNJP-YEM Turkey assisted ISKUR in identifying the strategic and emerging/priority sectors in Antalya that are alternative to tourism and presenting employment opportunities. The sector scan study introduced a model that can be replicated at national level to assess potential local sectors using a participatory approach (e.g., facilitated workshops, using SWOT analysis and benchmarking). BAKA supported the priority list but introduced a list of five sectors to be promoted: health, tourism, yachting, and manufacturing and solar energy sectors with possible co-funding which caused a delay in the clustering process. Only the cut-flower sector is undergoing the development of cluster road map, both prefeasibility and feasibility studies and the implementation for developing selected clusters.

All studies and tools developed are built on best practiced models, solid theoretical background and uses relevant qualitative and quantitative research techniques and thorough analysis to develop replicable tools and research models that improves decision-making and programming. Still, the quality of design and delivery of capacity building activities requires further attention and customization for ISKUR setting and Staff. All training courses needs to include teaching/trainer skills. (E.g. participants learn about and practice effective presentation skills in both classroom and small group situations; including practice teaching exercises that covers both issue-specific topics according participants' needs.

Recommendations

1. ISKUR / UN engagement present an effective case of partnership that promotes a multi-stakeholders approach, uses sustainable consultative planning processes and effective facilitation to promote understanding, collaboration and cooperation among partners. It needs to be replicated. This is recommended not only during planning but also during implementation. Monitoring and evaluation of the process of partnerships and its performance is equally important in order to learn and sustain the outputs of UNJP-YEM in Turkey.
2. Strengthens ISKUR capacity to use effective facilitation mechanisms that may require the following involving local facilitator(s), creating a mechanism and credibility for the partnership through formal or informal mandate, increasing representation of private sector, Adopting a balanced participation mechanism to carry out specific participatory processes, sustaining partnership(s) with champions from both the government and private sector and reaching out larger number of employers and building trust with the business community using a social marketing framework in order to achieve and sustain ISKUR objectives.
3. The TOT is a critical element for the sustainability of UNDP-YEM Turkey. There is a need therefore to customize to ISKUR setting and needs of ISKUR staff. It may include redesign it to provide a trainer manual and a separate trainee manual.
4. Assess capacity building activities in order to ensure its effectiveness and impacts in terms of participant's satisfaction, learning and application and impact on ISKUR.
5. Ensure active communication the form of frequent interactions between ISKUR partners. Revisit the existing communication strategy and make it more structured and that it prioritizes key messages, existing partnership outputs and impact on targeted beneficiaries and providing opportunities to increase the commitment to the partnership.
6. Regular reporting needs to be supported by maintaining of accurate records that document the process and implementation of activities should be important. This would allow the implementation process to find the right path towards achieving its stated goals and learn from on-going progress.
7. Review and revise UNJP-YEM monitoring framework, reformulate its results, corresponding indicators and assumptions and expand it to include assessment of UNJPYEM partnership(s) and executed capacity building activities. This requires, also reviewing its logical framework as well.
8. Establishing a monitoring & evaluation function would allow for increased accountability, hence quality of outputs.
9. ISKUR needs to develop an effective & sustainable results-based management system aiming at improving management effectiveness and accountability of NYEAP through a consultative process. It requires defining realistic expected results, monitoring progress toward the achievement of expected results, integrating lessons learned into management decisions and reporting on performance. It needs to be appropriate to the demand of all stakeholders involved. This will entail the design of a Performance Measurement Framework (PMF), Evaluation system, performance reporting mechanism, capacity building & support of organizational processes and dedicated core organizational resources for regular data collection, analysis and reporting for results. It may include, also M&E policies and procedures for learning and decision making.
10. UNJP-YEM Turkey has successfully executed a number of activities that contributed positively to the sustainability of its results. Developing a sustainability strategy can equally provide a road map for ISKUR to sustain its activities and replicate Antalya model. In order to ensure better functioning, better capacity building, transfer of competencies and replication of Antalya model. A phased approach to exit would, therefore reinforce UNJP-YEM Turkey in the mid-term and an extension of the program for six Months is, equally recommended particularly to ensure the quality of capacity building activities provide additional module to enable participants to enhance their teaching, facilitation and counselling skills. In addition to assessing executed capacity building activities and vocational training. This requires developing an exit strategy to reinforce the proposed sustainability strategy.