



# Evaluation Summaries

## Support to the proposed national sub-programme to eliminate the worst forms of child labour: Time bound measures – Mongolia

### Quick Facts

**Countries:** *Mongolia*

**Final Evaluation:** *May 2010*

**Mode of Evaluation:** *Independent*

**Technical Area:** *Child Labour*

**Evaluation Management:** *IPEC, CO-Beijing*

**Evaluation Team:** *Keith Jeddere-Fisher,  
Boldbaatar Bazar*

**Project Start:** *September 2005*

**Project End:** *May 2010*

**Project Code:** *MON/05/50/USA*

**Donor:** *United States Department of Labour*

**Keywords:** *Child Labour*

the national strategic planning workshop in 2005. However, the NSP-WFCL was never approved by the government. Instead, many of the actions proposed in the draft NSP-WFCL were included in the phase II action plan (2005-2007) of the (National Programme of the Development and Protection of Children) NPDPC.

The project has two objectives related to strengthening the enabling environment for national action against WFCL in Mongolia and one objective relating to the development of an area-based intervention model to directly assist children at risk or engaged in the worst forms of child labour (WFCL). The project works in five provinces and selected areas of Ulaan Baatar (UB).

### Background & Context

#### Summary of project purpose, logic, tructure

The 'Support to the Proposed National Sub-Programme to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Time Bound Measures' project, described in this report as the 'WFCL Project', is funded by the United States Department of Labor (USDOL) with a budget of US\$ 2,900,000. The project is for 56 months from October 2005 to May 2010 and is implemented by the ILO's International Programme for the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC). The project follows on from two earlier phases of support by USDOL and IPEC.

The WFCL Project was developed to address the gaps identified in the proposed National Sub-programme to Eliminate the Worst Form of Child Labour (NSP-WFCL) that was developed through

#### Methodology of evaluation

##### *Target group impact assessment study (TGIAS)*

The TGIAS was carried out as the first stage of the evaluation. The objectives of the TGIAS are to document the direct impact on children of participating in the WFCL project. The study was carried out by ME Consulting.

The main tool is direct interviews with child beneficiaries. A 6 percent sample was used (approximately 500 children out of a beneficiary population of 8,056). Respondents were children who had received at least one service provided by the WFCL project and were randomly selected from across all the geographical regions and from all sectors of WFCL. Details on the methodology and sampling strategy for the TGIAS were

developed as an initial step in the evaluation and are detailed in the 'evaluation instrument' provided to DED.

## Main Findings & Conclusions

### Achievement of immediate objectives

#### *Objective 1. Policy development and capacity building*

The NSP-WFCL objectives, which this project was designed to support, were incorporated in the action plan of the NPDPC. With the NPDPC expiring in 2010, and with its WFCL objectives appearing dormant recently, there is concern that there is a lack of focus and impetus to achieve the expected policy objectives. Some significant ones have been achieved, like the review of the list of hazardous occupations, but the revision of the Labour Law is still in process. There is also an ongoing lack of clarity on which institution is responsible for coordinating action.

The project has contributed to revisions in the regulations covering horse racing and child jockeys. The issue of WFCL and its elimination has been successfully incorporated into many policy and implementation documents.

The WFCL project has supported a significant increase in the knowledge base on child labour through the 2006/07 National Child Labour Survey, child labour monitoring (CLM) at the local provincial and district level within the project area and through studies on specific issues. Discussions are ongoing between the MoSWL and the NSO on the development of a system for regular national level child labour surveys.

There has been rapid and clear progress on policy development within the five provinces and the one UB district where the project has been directly involved. In most of these institutions there has been a clear local policy commitment, a multi-department task force cooperating in practice, a significant increase in local knowledge on the incidence of child labour, and effective interventions to withdraw and prevent children from WFCL. The institutionalisation of action against WFCL has also been developed in the next level of local government. The same impact has not been achieved in UB (except in Nalaikh district)

where both the implementation process and the context are different.

The project has carried out systematic and extensive training of officials involved in project implementation and in the wider context of child labour elimination. The technical knowledge on child labour issues of government staff in many departments and at all levels (ministries, local governments and implementing agencies) has improved significantly. There has also been an effective strategy of cascading of the capacity building training.

#### *Objective 2. Awareness raising and mobilisation*

The project has been very successful in raising awareness on the child labour issues and in promoting wide scale social mobilization to address it effectively. The main strategies have been supporting the National Authority on Children (NAC) in the development of the National Advocacy Strategy against WFCL, national awareness raising campaigns usually focussed around the WDACL and the development of education material for university and secondary school students. The advocacy strategy has facilitated the participation of many different stakeholders in action against WFCL.

A large variety of awareness raising methods has been used and this has resulted in bringing about significant changes in public opinion and in practices in the use of child labour. This has included changes in the culturally sensitive areas of child jockeys and children herding livestock.

#### *Objective 3. Area-based intervention against WFCL*

The area-based integrated intervention model (ABIIM) has been developed in a participatory way and applied very successfully in the provinces and in Nalaikh district. The use of this model has contributed strongly to the achievements in local institutional development noted earlier. Experience sharing amongst implementing partners has continued to improve the model and it is currently being documented for wider dissemination. This model has potential for use in other countries where there is an effective and committed local governance system.

CLM has been applied effectively in the provinces and in Nalaikh and provides reliable information on the numbers of children in WFCL. It appears as

if the numbers in these areas have decreased significantly during the project period. Challenges remain in applying CLM in most parts of UB, and the numbers and change in numbers of children in WFCL in UB cannot yet be identified confidently.

The project technical progress reports (TPRs), based on the numbers of children receiving certain services, show that the target number for the withdrawal of children has been almost exactly achieved (98%) and the target for prevention exceeded (113%). Monitoring by the partners, based on current information which is not quite complete, suggests that the success rate of these services in achieving the desired outcome is in the region of 87%.

The most important conclusions from the TGIAS on the impact of the project on the child beneficiaries are:

*Changes in work status of children to be prevented from WFCL*

- 6% of this group entered WFCL (the project failed to 'prevent')
- Overall this intervention has been successful, especially in the *aimags* and amongst girls in UB.

*Changes in work status of children to be withdrawn from WFCL*

- 28% of this group remained in WFCL after their involvement in the project
- The withdrawal of girls was more successful than of boys
- The withdrawal of children from WFCL in the *aimags* (19% still in WFCL after the project intervention) was much more successful than in UB (46% still in WFCL)
- There has been an ongoing decrease in WFCL since the completion of involvement in both the *aimags* (9% still in WFCL now) and in UB (38% still in WFCL now)
- The ongoing decrease in children in WFCL since the end of the project intervention has been especially strong amongst girls and this has been much greater in the *aimags* (19% to 2%) than in UB (35% to 23%)
- Under 15 year olds are now involved almost exclusively in the informal sector with a large reduction in involvement in mining

- 15-17 year olds are now mainly involved in the informal sector and in mining, and have almost completely stopped their involvement in herding and being at risk of commercial sexual exploitation. No conclusions can be drawn on movement from one sector of child labour to another.
- Overall this intervention was reasonably effective in the *aimags* and only partially effective in UB. There has been a strong ongoing reduction in the proportion of children in WFCL even after the end of direct intervention, especially among girls in the *aimags*.

*Changes in education status*

- Attendance in education of the project beneficiaries in UB has increased from 37% prior to the intervention, to 68% after the intervention and to 83% now. Girls attendance has remained considerably higher at all times
- Attendance in education of the project beneficiaries in the *aimags* has increased from 47% prior to the intervention, to 90% after the intervention and to 98% now.

**Sustainability of project impacts**

The sustainability of the project's direct impacts is expected to be high in those areas where the ABIIM has been implemented effectively; - in most of the project *aimags* and in Nalaikh district. The main threat to this is the challenge to the livelihoods of many families. Sustainability of the impacts is much more fragile in the remaining project areas, mainly in UB city.

The future of the national enabling environment against WFCL is currently at a critical point with the following current issues:

- The Labour Law is to be revised in 2010
- The NPDPC expires in 2010
- There is dual jurisdiction on child labour issues within the government with a resultant lack of clear leadership and responsibility on these issues
- A decision has not yet been made on how the government will adopt the models and practices of the WFCL for further application

- The agreement between the MoSWL and the NSO on conducting child labour surveys needs to be concluded and provision for funding made

## Recommendations & Lessons Learned

The most important of recommendations made are:

### *Recommendations for ILO/IPEC in Mongolia:*

- The data from the TGIAS and from the FGDs contains a lot of information that would be useful for future programme planning. This information should be reviewed with that objective in mind and important points summarised.
- A system needs to be developed to supplement the CLM system to collect CLM information in remote areas with a high numbers of in-country migrants

### *Recommendations for ILO/IPEC:*

- ILO/IPEC should ensure that the information collected at the time of beneficiary intake is clear on whether the child is in some form of education or not.
- Project beneficiary monitoring systems need to ensure that beneficiary children's work status is monitored to identify changes in 'child labour' status, and that this information is accurately reported in the projects periodic report.

### *Recommendations for the Government of Mongolia:*

A number of issues that have been identified during this evaluation are presented here for consideration by the Government of Mongolia:

- Clarify which institution is responsible for policy and programme development and implementation of programmes for the elimination of WFCL
- Carry out an evaluation of the achievements of objective 13 under the NPCPD and in consultation with stakeholders determine the most effective programming modality for WFCL elimination work from 2011 onwards.
- Carry out a consultation process amongst experienced organisations to identify how an

acceptable and accurate estimate of the scale of child labour in UB can be determined and such study be carried out.

- Carry out a consultation process amongst stakeholders on how the ABIIM model should be adapted and applied to the situation in UB
- Review the information available on the number of children involved in WFCL in UB and develop a realistic strategy based on this assessment.
- As part of the awareness strategy, motivational messages should be developed targeted specifically for boys that are built around traditional beliefs on the role of men which would increase responsibility and provide motivation to maximise the opportunities that education provides
- A decision should be made as soon as possible on the specification of safety equipment to be worn by child jockeys

### **Important lessons learned**

1. The application of the ABIIM in UB city has not been as effective as in the *aimags*. Some lessons in relation to this are:
  - The UB Governors Office needs to engage more directly with districts to empower them in the ABIIM process, in addition to its coordination and capacity building role.
  - The links with the next level of governance, the district, need to be strengthened.
  - In order to increase local government commitment, ownership and inter-department/organisation and cooperation, it is probably necessary to facilitate the ABIIM at each district – as has been done in Nalaikh. This would enable policy development at the district-level in the form of district sub-programmes for the elimination of WFCL
  - And in order to support the ABIIM process in each district, funds need to be made available for the important work of promoting partnerships, holding consultations and taking practical action.
2. The ABIIM model may require some degree of openness to a participatory style of governance by those in leadership in order to develop the cooperative structures necessary and to develop collaborative ownership.