

Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy to extend the coverage of social security Vol. 2 - Annexes - September 2010

CONTENTS

Annex 1. Terms of reference	2
Annex 2. Mission-supported country case studies.....	8
Jordan.....	8
Nepal.....	20
Thailand	29
Zambia	37
Annex 3. Desk country case studies	47
Desk country case study – Senegal.....	47
Desk country case study – Mozambique	56
Desk country case study – Bosnia and Herzegovina	65
Desk country case study – Ghana	70
Desk country case study – Lao PDR.....	79
Cyprus	86
Chile.....	92
Annex 4. Social security project portfolio by region (2005-2009), as at January 13, 2010 ...	99
Annex 5. ILO Social Security Standards-Setting Instruments.....	10809
Annex 6. List of interviewees	111
Annex 7. Works cited	117

ANNEX 1. TERMS OF REFERENCE

Terms of reference:

Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy to extend the coverage of social security

December, 2009

1 Introduction

Eval will conduct a global evaluation of the ILO's strategy and contribution to extend various forms of social protection to all, to improve the governance, financing and administration of social security and to support the determination of national strategies for working towards social security for all, as called for by the ILC resolution, in its 89th session in 2001 and reconfirmed in ILC 2009.

A large majority of the global population (some 80 per cent) live in conditions of social insecurity, i.e. they have no or only partial access to formal social security and have to rely on their families, kinship groups or communities to secure their standard of living. Among this majority, 20 per cent live in abject poverty. Some 90 per cent of the world's working-age population is not covered by pension schemes capable of providing adequate retirement income, formal coverage in social health insurance was as low as 7 per cent in Kenya, and 11.4 per cent in Senegal in 2005, and more than 5 million children under the age of 5 die every year due to lack of access to health care and income insecurity.

Yet, an ever growing body of evidence suggests that social security transfers halve poverty in almost all OECD countries and reduce income inequality by half in many European countries. Evidence (including work by the ILO on the cost of a minimum package of social security benefits in sub-Saharan Africa, Asia and Latin America) also demonstrates that minimum packages of social security benefits are affordable even for the poorest countries.

In April 2009, the UN Chief Executives Board (CEB) accepted the concept of the social protection floor as one of its policies to cope with the global crisis. In June of 2009, the International Labour Conference (ILC) adopted the Global Jobs Pact, which calls on countries to broaden the coverage of social protection and enhance security.

2 Background on the ILO's strategy to extend social security

History and organizational context

Access to an adequate level of social protection is recognized in the [Declaration of Philadelphia](#), in subsequent ILO declarations and in a number of International Labour Standards as a basic right of all individuals. It is also widely considered to be instrumental in promoting human welfare and social consensus on a broad scale, and to be conducive to and indispensable for social peace and thus improved economic growth and performance. In times of crisis, transfer incomes, notably social assistance and social security benefits paid to unemployed workers and other vulnerable recipients, act as social and economic stabilizers. Benefits not only prevent people from falling further into poverty but also limit the contraction of aggregate demand thereby curtailing the potential depth of the recession.

Vision, strategy and objectives

Since 2001, ILO activities have aimed at helping member States to improve and expand the protection they provide to all members of the community across the full range of contingencies: basic income security in case of need, health care, sickness, old age and invalidity, unemployment, employment injury, maternity, family responsibilities and death.

The strategy has taken shape through four interlinked means of action, which have played out at global and national levels, with all largely encapsulated in the Global Campaign. In 2005, the ILO strategy and organizational approach was redesigned with a single vision and strategy for social security, which was laid out in the 2006 ILO policy paper, “Social security for all: Investing in social and economic development”. The document set out basic policy guidelines of the Global Campaign for extension of social security to all, as well as associated standard-related and research activities.

Since 2005, the ILO has promoted a vision of a basic minimum social security system that aims at universal national coverage of basic benefits and aims for progressively higher levels of protection and security. To support this, the Office strategy recognizes the advantages of a sustained and holistic approach at country level that draws on ILO expertise in the areas of financial analysis, assessment of the legal framework, policy advice and financial governance advice, capacity building of social partners. Such an approach requires that support be concentrated on a limited number of countries.

Core means of action have taken as a basic prerequisite recognition of the need for reliable and useable knowledge and learning platforms, with the ILO social security department working to generate knowledge through collection and analysis of statistical information, exchange of experiences, dissemination through diverse mechanisms, and involving policy-oriented technical tools. Research activities related to extension of social security have taken the form of publications, international conferences, high-level research seminars as well as a series of discussion papers.

Policy development has been spearheaded by several global policy papers highlighting the powerful link between poverty reduction, economic growth and social security. Combined with this is advisory support related to identifying the national basic social security package for a given country to guarantee universal basic social security and financial means for sustaining and expanding this through improvements in fiscal space.

A third component of the strategy draws on technical cooperation projects implemented at country level and against regional priorities, which have ranged in areas of focus (health care

mutuals for the informal sector, family allowances, old age pensions, etc.) and means of action (pilot projects, topical studies, actuarial assessments, etc.).

Finally, capacity building in the form of support in planning, implementation and management of social security policies through targeted training of key experts and decision makers, and support for formal academic training.

3 Client

The principal client for the evaluation is the Governing Body, which is responsible for governance-level decisions on the findings and recommendations of the evaluation. The evaluation is also intended to provide a basis for improved leadership and decision-making by ILO management and those working to support social security policies and programmes. It is also to serve as a source of information for the ILO partners and national policy makers.

4 Purpose and scope

The evaluation is to provide impartial insight on the continued relevance, effectiveness and efficiency of the strategy, as well as the impact and sustainability of results achieved. This will include consideration of how the ILO's strategy should be continued or modified. The recommendations and lessons learnt generated from the evaluation exercise are intended to be used in improving ILO's support to constituents.

The strategy evaluation will cover the period 2005-2009. The scope of the evaluation will involve review of:

- a) The evolving role and relevance of the ILO's social security strategy within the global effort to address social insecurity among the world's poor and vulnerable;
- b) Evidence of how the Office has increased the coherence and effectiveness of its support to member States through the programme approach (design and implementation);
- c) Thematic review of the main means of action for extending social security: knowledge generation and learning, policy and financial analysis, standard setting and legal advice, technical cooperation and capacity building.
- d) The Office's capacities and performance in supporting the strategy, including management arrangements and national partnerships involving constituents and other UN agencies;
- e) Consideration of the results-based framework, choice and use of indicators, and reviewing and reporting of progress within the P&B framework as well as DWCP;
- f) Coordination across the ILO to maximise the support to constituents in extending social security.

Implementation of the strategy is shared across the ILO, with some direct links more pronounced than others. The ILO also supports a wide range of global and national actions. Reviewing these aspects of the Office's work will be addressed within this evaluation to the extent possible given the timing and resources available.

5 Evaluation methodology

The terms of reference have been prepared in line with the ILO's evaluation framework, endorsed by the Governing Body in November 2005 (GB.294/PFA/8), taking into account particular characteristics of the ILO's operational strategy for social security (as outlined in the ILO Programme and Budgets, and GB reports). In accordance with ILO guidelines for independence, credibility and transparency, responsibility for the evaluation will be based in the Evaluation Unit. The evaluation team will be composed of one or more external consultant(s) and an ILO independent evaluator without prior links to the programme and strategy. The evaluation process will adhere to the international norms and standards for independent evaluations by the United Nations Evaluation Group.

The evaluation will be participatory. Consultations with member States, international and national representatives of workers' and employers' organizations, ILO staff at headquarters and in the field, UN and IFI partners, and other global and stakeholders will be done through interviews, meetings, group discussions, and electronic communication. An evaluation network mailing list for distribution of documents and messages as well as a dedicated electronic mailbox for the evaluation for stakeholder comments and inputs will be established.¹ Final versions of all evaluation documents will be the responsibility of the evaluation team.

A review of strategy, including national contexts and main means of action, with focus on evolution of the programme over time will be supported through a structured portfolio analysis and review of documentation. The review will explore the extent to which changes in policies and practices can be linked to ILO advocacy and service efforts.

A desk-based review will also analyze selected reporting and other programme documentation, key performance criteria and indicators, to compare and assess the coherence, continuity and evidence of reported results over time. Attention will be given to main means of action, implementation performance, perceptions of major progress and significant achievements, as well as notable products and outputs in the main means of action. Application of good practices, including a results-based management approach, and use of lessons learned will also be considered. Drawing from available country and global programme documents, reporting and evaluations, an analysis of how results are being planned, monitored and progress reported will be prepared and policies and practices reviewed.

Electronic surveys and national case studies will also provide additional means of documenting the usefulness of technical work within member States. Cases will be selected according to where the ILO has worked over a longer period of time, and also where its work is considered innovative with need to know more about its effects (ideally three regions for case studies). Case studies will also consider strategies and approaches at country-level

¹ The evaluation team and secretariat can be reached at the following contact points: eval.@ilo.org; telephone (022) 799-7055; fax: (022) 799 6219.

around the broader Decent Work and national, and will consider the roles and responsibilities of others within and outside the ILO in reinforcing the process.

6 Outputs

The following written outputs will be produced:

- A summary report of findings and recommendations, prepared by the Evaluation Unit, to be presented to the November 2010 Governing Body, including a written response from the Office.
- A more detailed evaluation report to be prepared by the evaluation team and made public.
- Internal background documentation, an inception report and analysis on which the findings, conclusions and recommendations are based.

7 Timeframe and management arrangements

The evaluation will be conducted by senior evaluators with support from the ILO Evaluation Unit. The ILO Evaluation Unit will be responsible for the overall management of the evaluation. Approximately \$95,000 (including staff costs of evaluation unit) is budgeted for the evaluation.

The evaluation timeframe is from February through June 2010. A time table is shown below.

Task	Time frame
Consultations on draft terms of reference	January 2010
Formation of evaluation team	February 2010
Desk review	February 2010
Finalization of terms of reference	February 2010
Staff and constituent interviews	March 2010
Case studies/field missions	March 2010
Draft findings report circulated	April 2010
Final evaluation report	June 2010
Summary to the GB prepared	July 2010
Governing Body discussion	November 2010
Follow up plan of action	December 2010

At evaluation start up, the detailed set of questions will be finalized to address issues raised during desk reviews and an initial round of interviews.

ANNEX 2. MISSION-SUPPORTED COUNTRY CASE STUDIES

Jordan

1 Background and ILO situation

While Jordan is prosperous as compared to other non-Gulf Arab countries, the economic situation remains fragile. Foreign Direct Investment (FDI), mostly from the Gulf, has declined due to the financial crisis and remittances have dropped. While Jordan receives abundant international assistance, this is driven largely by political circumstances and cannot be counted on in the long term.

Jordan has a relatively developed and effective social security system along traditional lines administered by the Social Security Corporation. About 40-50 percent of all employees are estimated to contribute; when military and civil service contributors are added, coverage may be on the order of 60 percent of the workforce. Because they are concentrated in the civil service and other sectors such as health and education, the coverage rate for women greatly exceeds that for men. Female labour force participation in Jordan is low (about 40 percent) and raising it has been a long-held policy goal.

The major contingencies of old-age pensions, invalidity, and survivor's benefits are covered. A Draft Law on Social Security, on which the ILO provided considerable technical advice, proposes to add maternity (which the ILO contributed to designing), unemployment insurance (which the ILO opposed for reasons made clear below), pension insurance, and universal health insurance (which the ILO played no role in designing). Various loopholes were closed and early retirement was curtailed. The Draft Law extends mandatory participation to the self-employed and those working in establishments of less than five persons. However, informality is well-entrenched in Jordan and compliance and enforcement problems are expected. The bill remains with the Prime Minister's Office until a new Parliament sits, but can be enacted as a Temporary Law pending final ratification. The social security law was enacted as temporary law in March 2010.

The labour market in Jordan is characterised by

- Rising unemployment, and a problem of persistent widespread youth unemployment
- Significant numbers of Jordanians working abroad,
- Significant numbers of migrant workers from poorer countries in the Arab world.

While coverage is partial, the availability of social assistance, including waivers of medical fees, for persons who can demonstrate a genuine lack of resources, is relatively good.

Experts interviewed identified two main priorities for social security in Jordan: unemployment, currently estimated at 10-15 percent, and the need to provide universal health insurance. Despite the fact that some 10 percent of GDP is spent on health care, the quality of care for the poor is insufficient.

The ILO's social protection programme in Jordan since 2005 has consisted of several principle initiatives or actions:

- *Technical cooperation with the Social Security Corporation.* The ILO has a longstanding tradition of cooperation with the Social Security Corporation aimed at ensuring the sustainability of the existing social security scheme, advising on extension of social security, and promoting compliance with international standards and principles, including ratification of Convention 102. Under project JOR/05/01/JOR, the ILO provided actuarial and financial projections for the Social Security Corporation, as well as capacity building for staff, from 2005 to 2008. Costs of the advisory services, roughly USD 300,000, were covered by the Social Security Corporation. As an example of analytical output, the Sixth Actuarial Review of the Social Security Corporation as at 31 December 2007 (published August 2009) identified the need for significant and quick reform of key provisions in order to maintain the financial sustainability of the scheme, and proposed options. In October 2007, the ILO had provided an intermediate actuarial valuation. Among training activities, the ILO organised a two-week training on social security financing and actuarial modeling in Geneva on 24 April – 5 May, 2006; an actuarial training in Amman on 14-15 March, 2007; and a one-week training in Amman on actuarial mathematics on 12-18 April, 2008. At least one technical expert from the Social Security Corporation received a Master's degree from the ILO's Maastricht University programme.
- *Support for the development of a maternity scheme.* In the early years of this century, based in part on analytical work done by the Word Bank, the Government of Jordan began to express interest in instituting a new maternity scheme. Under the existing scheme, employers were required to provide maternity benefits, but there was no risk sharing and there was widespread agreement that the existing approach was a disincentive to hiring women and an incentive to terminate women's employment following their marriage or first baby. Increasing female labour force participation has been a longstanding policy goal in Jordan. At the request of the Government, and the social partners, the ILO prepared a feasibility study covering the potential benefits of a new approach, international labour standards in the area, international good practice, and an assessment of options for Jordan. This was published by the ILO in July 2007 under the title *Feasibility study on the implementation of a maternity cash benefits scheme*. Following presentation to the tripartite stakeholders and ensuing discussions, the maternity scheme was incorporated into the Draft Social Security Law and is now being implemented. It is regarded as a possible model for other countries in the region.
- *Policy advisory work on promoting social protection in the informal sector.* With EU funding (Project INT/07/12/EEC), the ILO prepared a Jordan case study *How to strengthen social protection coverage in the context of the European Union Agenda on decent work and promoting employment in the informal economy*. This study was notable, among other things, for containing a chapter on Jordan's health care system. Instituting a new health insurance scheme under the Social Security Corporation is, as mentioned above, a policy priority that features in the new Draft Social Security Law.

The ILO was not involved in development of the proposed approach. Experts interviewed expressed concerns over the financial sustainability of the new health insurance scheme as currently proposed.

- *Policy advisory work on the Draft Social Security Law.* The ILO was active in advising the Government on the new Draft Social Security Law, which is currently a “temporary law” pending approval by the new Parliament. Technical Comments were delivered in October 2008. In addition to commenting on the law as a whole, the ILO provided detailed confidential comments objecting to the proposed unemployment insurance scheme and coverage of migrant workers in compliance with Convention 118 (Equality of Treatment), which Jordan has ratified. The ILO advised against the unemployment insurance scheme, which was developed by Government in collaboration with the World Bank, on two grounds. First, it is a savings account scheme, an approach which the ILO does not favour in general as there is no redistributive element. Second, in instances where, upon retirement, an individual has drawn more in lifetime unemployment benefits than he or she has contributed, the pension will be adjusted downward accordingly. This, in the ILO’s view, is contrary to international standards. In the early years of this century, the World Bank actively promoted a Notional Defined Contribution (NDC) approach to social security in Jordan, but the preference of the Social Security Corporation was for the ILO’s advice on parametric reforms to the existing Pay As You go (PAYG) system.
- *Decent Work Country Programme.* Social protection is integrated into the DWCP for Jordan and is explicitly identified in the logframe. This features four pillars: employment creation and enterprise development, social protection, standards and rights at work, and governance and social dialogue. Ongoing projects include
 - “Better Work Jordan Project.” Based on successful experience elsewhere, e.g. Cambodia, this project aims to raise productivity and improve work conditions at the enterprise level. Direct links with social protection are limited, but improvement of the labour inspection system may be expected to reduce work injuries.
 - “Decent Work and Gender Equality Project.” Expertise in this project was mobilised to carry out awareness building in the area of maternity protection. The benefits of the proposal were presented, concerns and objections were allayed and, ultimately a high degree of consensus among the social partners was achieved.
 - “Promoting Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work Project – Jordan.” Often called the “Social Dialogue Project,” this project provides capacity building and a forum for improved dialogue between workers and employers. Social protection has featured prominently in the dialogue. This builds on the earlier project “Strengthening the social partners for promotion of social dialogue in Jordan” financed by the U.S. Department of Labour. While there is a strong tradition on the part of both workers and employers of providing assistance and social benefits to their constituents, awareness of issues surrounding modern

approaches to social security remains low. The formation of the Economic and Social Council was a direct consequence of the ILO's strengthening of social dialogue. The Economic and Social Council worked with the ILO on the New Employment Policy, still a work in progress and one for which ownership by the Ministry of Labour has been a constraint.

- Supporting policy analysis. The ILO has directly supported the Policy Strategy Unit at the Ministry of Labour, widely regarded as one of the most effective such units in Government. In an earlier phase, this project was supported by the Government of Italy. It has also supported the Economic and Social Council, which brings together experts from Government, workers' organisations, and employers organisations, supported by a small secretariat of sector experts.
- *The regional dimension.* There is no ILO office in Amman – a downside factor for ILO visibility, although the regional office in Beirut is very close. Through regional seminars and workshops, the ILO has promoting sharing of experiences. Recent examples include
 - The Inter-regional Tripartite Meeting on the Future of Social Security in Arab States, held in Amman, 6-8 May, 2008. The background note *The future of social security in Arab States in the Middle East and North Africa* set forth (pp. 13-23) a comprehensive policy agenda for expanding social protection in the region.
 - The Arab Forum on Social Policy held in Beirut, 28-29 October, 2009 and
 - The Arab Employment Forum held in Beirut on 19-21 October, 2009. The thematic paper *Building adequate social protection systems and protecting people in the Arab region* prepared by the ILO Social Security Specialist in the regional office identified the policy challenges and set forth options for expanding social protection in the region.

2 Conclusions and lessons learned

2.1 Conclusions

2.1.1 Strategic approach and design: relevant to situation facing Jordan

Conclusion 1: Taken as a whole, the ILO's country-level activities on social security have been highly relevant to Jordan's needs. It has tended to align itself more with the vertical dimension (not inappropriate in a middle-income country, but at the same time the ILO has advised on extending social protection in the horizontal dimension, as well. The ILO contributed significantly to the new Social Security Law and to the institution of a new maternity scheme. It was unable to do much in the area of unemployment because Government adopted an approach which, in the view of the ILO, violated international labour standards. Going forward, the LO may want to offer advice on the new universal health insurance scheme which, according to a range of experts interviewed, appears actuarially fragile. In addition, the new Social Security Law extending mandatory coverage to all workers is sure to experience compliance and enforcement problems, which may lead to ILO advisory work on these aspects.

The cornerstones of the ILO's social security work in Jordan are building coherent policies based on a solid basic social protection floor, extending social security coverage while also promoting employment, and ensuring good governance of social security. These are highly relevant to country needs. The ILO's long involvement in technical cooperation with the Social Security Corporation aims to strengthen the sustainability of programmes while building capacity. This aligns with the ILO's comparative advantage in providing unbiased, independent actuarial advice. We have described, above, a number of national as well as regional activities of the ILO aimed at promoting the expansion of social protection in Jordan, e.g. to cover the informal sector. However, strictly speaking, the ILO's work in Jordan has been more aligned with the vertical dimension of social security development – not only actuarial advice, but playing the catalytic role in founding the new maternity scheme and advising against the new unemployment scheme, which it regards as flawed. The ILO has not been involved in universal health care, assistance for the unemployed and poor (the national social assistance plan works relatively well, although one must question whether it is not a disincentive to labour), child benefit, and universal old-age and disability pensions. The ILO's concentration on the vertical dimension is justified because Jordan is a middle-income country with a relatively developed social security system, in addition to which, both formal and informal social protection systems for the poor function reasonably well.

The ILO has not been involved in the specific areas mentioned. However, through its support to the Policy Strategy unit in the Ministry of Labour and the Economic and Social Council, the ILO has helped to sponsor policy analyses on the outlook for jobs creation in Jordan. The Jordan case study report How to strengthen social protection coverage is explicitly grounded in the need to promote productive employment while expanding social protection, as does Section 2.3 of the thematic paper Building adequate social protection systems and protecting people in the Arab region. The DWCP, as described above, is solidly founded on the need to combine strengthened social protection with employment growth. However, as described, the most serious employment problem in Jordan is youth unemployment, and the ILO does not appear to have any specific focus on this structural problem. Family support networks (often involving Jordanians abroad) are strong, there is an abundant supply of relatively cheap immigrant labour from less well-to-do Arab states and South Asia, and the social assistance minimum, effectively equal to

the minimum wage, is generous. All of these subjects might be the subject of fruitful policy analyses.

The ILO's work in Jordan has focused on traditional contributory schemes, not tax-based schemes. It is evident from Table 3.9 (p. 21) of the Sixth Actuarial Review that the ILO's views on future increases in coverage of the social security scheme are actually quite conservative. Even by 2050, it is expected that (slightly) less than half of the employed civilian population will contribute to the system, as opposed to perhaps 40 percent today. This includes an explicit view on how effectively the new Social Security Law, calling for the self-employed and workers in establishments with less than 5 employees, will be implemented (pp.44-45).

2.1.2 Effectiveness of strategy in extending various forms of social protection to all

Conclusion 2: Effectiveness includes dimensions of capacity building, effective combination of models and approaches, visibility, and clear focus. The expected passage of the Social Security Law, on which the ILO provided advice, is evidence of effectiveness, as is the work of the policy Strategy unit and the Ministry of Labor and the tripartite Economic and Social Council. The new maternity scheme is a major step forward. However, the ILO was ineffective in dissuading the Government from adopting a defined contribution unemployment scheme and, as hinted above, with hindsight, the ILO may wish it was more proactive in analyzing the universal health scheme now being rolled out, and compliance and enforcement problems with the contributory scheme.

We take as the Social Security Department's strategy in Jordan its contribution to the Decent Work Country Programme. The most relevant output translating into enhanced social protection is (logframe dated 19 April, 2007) "Social security reform process supported through ensuring sustainability of the system including new contingencies," the latter a clear reference to the new maternity programme, a component of the vertical dimension. The ILO provided training and capacity building to the Social Security Corporation as described above, significantly increasing the capacity of that organisation. Capacity building provided to the main ILO constituent organisations has contributed to enhanced social dialogues. The integration of social security into training provided by the "Promoting Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work Project – Jordan" made a significant contribution. The actuarial model used for the Sixth Valuation, as well as the financial calculations done in the context of designing the maternity scheme, have won wide acceptance. Despite providing a small social budget and discussion of non-contributory approaches as part of the EU project, there was not an explicit strategy for combining traditional actuarial models with social budgeting models to present a unified scenario. Support for the Policy Strategy Unit at the Ministry of Labor and the Economic and Social Council (which is tripartite in nature) has proven effective in advancing policy dialogue. Reference is made to a Social Security Department collaboration with the Social Security Corporation in 2004/2005 to study the compatibility of Jordanian social security legislation with Convention 102. The evaluator has not, however, seen this document. Ratification of Convention 102 is one of the three sub-components of Outcome 11 of the DWCP "Social security sustainability and compliance with international principles" (the other two being actuarial advice / training and design of the maternity scheme).

2.1.3 Coherent and complementary with regard to horizontal and vertical extension of social protection

Conclusion 3: The ILO does not appear to have had a strong focus on the horizontal dimension in Jordan, a strategic choice that may be justified in view of the fact that Jordan's social protection system functions reasonably well for a country at its level of development. However, the existing national social assistance programme, offering a benefit roughly equal to the minimum wage, may be a disincentive to labour.

The ILO does not appear to have directly contributed to any innovative, non-contributory, universal component of the social protection floor. The main current activity in this area is the provision, on a pilot basis, of universal health insurance, which is being rolled out to the national level. The ILO was not involved in development of this scheme. However, the Jordan case study report *How to strengthen social protection coverage* contains a very brief social budget and a chapter on non-contributory schemes (essentially the National Assistance Fund). In general the Sixth Actuarial Review is a classic financial assessment, with relatively little analytical attention given to possible structural changes in the economy and labour market. This study was, of course, commissioned and paid for by the Social Security Corporation and must be highly client-responsive. The ILO has not concretely addressed social floor issues in Jordan. The national social assistance scheme, the National Assistance Fund, is reasonably effective, delivering an income roughly equal to the minimum wage or each family member. The main issue here may not be affordability, but rather the possible disincentive to labour. Experts from multiple backgrounds interviewed cited the reluctance of Jordanian nationals to accept many of the jobs that are now carried out by migrants from poorer countries in the Arab region and South Asia. The serious problem of youth employment, and its relationship to social protection, would make an ideal area for further work. In general, in the ILO In its Actuarial Reviews, there is little in-depth attention to changes in structural economic and social conditions, as a result of which, the treatment of coverage and compliance rates is rather mechanical.

2.1.4 Efficient use of capacities and resources

Conclusion 4: The ILO's work in Jordan has been carried out by means of HQ missions, missions from the Beirut SRO, and consultants. Government officials interviewed expressed satisfaction with the level of backup received; but many expressed the view that the ILO's procedures were overly time consuming and subject to micro-management. Multiple sources of funding, including funding from Government itself, were efficiently combined.

Funding from the EU, from the U.S. Department of Labour, from the Government of Italy, and from RBTC was used to supplement and leverage RB resources over the period in pursuit of strategic objectives. The maternity scheme, financed by RB and RBTC, gave rise to an immediately observable expansion of social security coverage. No XBTC was involved. HQ expertise was very efficiently mobilized to backstop the design process. In addition, the Social Security Corporation of Jordan purchases the advisory services of the ILO, and that relationship, of long standing, has been very efficiently leveraged to enable the ILO to contribute across a broader front.

2.1.5 Internal and external coordination to promote extension

Conclusion 5: Two projects, one on gender and one on improving social dialogue, both worked with SOC SEC to raise awareness, especially on the part of constituents. In addition, there was a strong effort on the part of the SRO to involve Jordan closely in regional training activities. Constituent organisations have been implicated in ILO

activities. However, despite the presence of a flagship Better Work project, the theme of an integrated employment and social protection floor project has not been explored.

Social security is fully integrated into the “Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work Project” aimed at enhancing social dialogues. In general, satisfaction was expressed at the coordination aspects of work between projects. There is room for improvement in the flow of information to the Regional Office about ILO HQ activities in Jordan. Not so in the case of the Actuarial Review, however, in designing the maternity scheme, there was a strong effort to involve the social partners, including mobilizing the Decent Work and Gender Equality Project to raise awareness and dispel misconceptions regarding the proposed scheme. There has been no concrete initiative combining the extension of social protection along the horizontal dimension and employment creation.

2.1.6 Impact in form of capacity, tools, policy improvements

Conclusion 6: ILO capacity building and support has increased both the quantity and quality of social security policy dialogue in the Social Security Corporation and at the level of Government. It has resulted in one new programme, the maternity benefit, which represents significant advance over the programme it replaced. The ILO contributed significantly to the New Social Security Law.

The clearest example of an impact is the new maternity scheme, which was heavily informed by ILO technical advice from HQ and involved the Gender project in awareness raising. The new scheme represents an advancement over the old one and, despite some initial suspicions, was ultimately supported by the ILO constituents. No similar extensions in areas such as pensions, health, and family allowances appear to have occurred. However, there has been extension of social insurance coverage to workers in small enterprises (less than 5 employees), agricultural workers and other categories. Moreover, the ILO’s analysis contributed significantly to elaboration of the New Social Security Law. Capacity built within the Social Security Corporation has increased the quality of analytical work there, and has had, as well, an impact on data collection and analysis. Similarly, ILO support to the Policy Strategy Unit in the Ministry of Labour and the Economic and Social Council has raised the level of policy analysis and dialogue.

2.1.7 Sustainability of advancements made

Conclusion 7: The ILO has analysed financial sustainability of the national social security scheme in great detail, although perhaps with too little attention to the entire range of possible economic and social changes. As stated at several points, there are sustainability concerns about the new universal health insurance scheme (which the ILO played no part in designing). Staff attrition is not a major problem, but possible upcoming problems at the Policy Strategy Group of the Ministry of Labour should be anticipated.

The ILO's Actuarial Reviews have addressed financial sustainability head on, albeit in somewhat mechanical terms. As we have said, more consideration of structural economic and social changes would be welcome? The fact that the ILO has not really confronted problems facing the health sector and the possible unsustainability of the new universal health scheme presents both a problem and an opportunity. Staff attrition has not reached serious proportions in Jordan. Most of those benefiting from ILO training remain in post long enough to underpin a reasonable rate of return on capacity building activities. This is particularly true at the Social Security Corporation. Within the Policy Strategy Unit of the Ministry of Labour, there is more likely to be a problem once ILO withdraws staff salary support and (presumably) salaries revert to Ministry levels. Representatives of the social partners interviewed all expressed a reasonable level of satisfaction with capacity building and support provided by the ILO.

2.2 Lessons learned

- *Traditional approaches can have an impact.* Perhaps the main lesson learned in Jordan is that support to fairly conventional policy development embedded in the vertical dimension of social protection expansion can yield tangible benefits in a country where capacity is good and institutions are functional. The ILO's contribution to the development of a new maternity scheme is a signal achievement. The Jordanian social security scheme continues to face long-term sustainability issues, but the ILO's high-quality advisory work has identified these issues and offered sound policy advice on how to address them. The ILO is to be saluted, in particular, for not employing pie-in-the-sky coverage assumptions to paper over the long-term issues.
- *But a broader view would have produced better policy analysis.* At the same time, the rather perfunctory treatment given to long-term structural changes in the labour market and institutions would bear deepening. What the ILO has done is not out of line with international actuarial good practice, but simply represents a point on which international actuarial good practice needs to be improved. With its unparalleled comparative advantage in the study of labour markets and social security institutions, this represents an opportunity missed.
- *The good can be enemy of the best.* Jordan is a country where traditional social support institutions are strong and where Jordanians abroad are a reliable source of support, albeit one under pressure as remittances have declined recently. For political reasons, Jordan is a "donor darling," allowing Government considerable flexibility in providing, e.g., generous social assistance benefits and waiving health care costs for those who can demonstrate genuine need. Add to this the fact that Jordan is middle-income country where capacity and institutions dealing with social security are effective, and one can easily understand why the ILO has focused more on strengthening and extending the vertical dimension than on innovative horizontal programmes identified with the social protection floor. There are groups in Jordan – elderly widows living alone, Bedouin families, female headed households, orphans,

and others – whose needs merit attention, however, the government's requests to ILO have targeted other forms of support.

- *What you do not do is as important as what you do.* The ILO has soundly refused to align itself with the new unemployment scheme, which appears to this evaluator, as well, to be flawed. The main unemployment problem in Jordan is youth unemployment, which may not be entirely unrelated to disincentives to labour; it is not classic industrial unemployment which the proposed scheme seems to propose to address. However, *in reverso*, the ILO may have missed an opportunity in not weighing in more prominently on the proposed universal health insurance scheme, which presents two immediate problems. First, as the ILO has itself identified in its policy paper on extending social protection to the informal sector, the Jordanian health system is lagging (as in most countries, both developed and developing). There are institutional problems of equity and efficiency which are in no way addressed by Government's proposed new health insurance scheme. Second, and from a purely technical standpoint, the chances that the proposed contribution rate will be able to cope with the growth of health care costs in a country on Jordan's economic development path, especially in view of structural issues in the incentive structure binding doctors, hospitals, and pharmaceutical firms, are slim.

Jordan

2006-07

Outcome 3a.1: Improved policies and strategies to extend social protection to all

Indicator 3a.1 (i): Member States adopt or implement effective policies and strategies to extend social security coverage

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Jordan	Prepared a feasibility study on the establishment of a maternity cash benefit scheme and presented it to stakeholders at a national tripartite meeting. Provided assistance in the drafting of the legislative amendments.	Jordan: Adopted a maternity protection policy, which will serve as a starting point to amend and endorse existing legislation.	√

Indicator 3a.1 (ii) Member States strengthen existing social security schemes through policies and strategies to ensure effectiveness and sustainability

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Jordan	Policy advice and comparative analysis for the ratification of the Convention.	Jordan: Submitted a proposal to Cabinet for the ratification of the Social Security (Minimum Standards) Convention, 1952 (No. 102).	√

Indicator 3a.2 (iv): Member States take action to improve governance of social protection schemes or maintain good standards of governance

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Jordan	Performed the actuarial valuation, conducted an administrative audit and provided capacity building to improve the actuarial expertise of the Social Security Corporation.	Jordan: Social Security Corporation completed an intermediate actuarial valuation and cost estimation of proposed reform options.	

2008-09

Outcome 3a.1: Increase member State capacity to develop policies focused on improving social security systems

Indicator 3a.1 (i): Number of member States that apply ILO technical assistance to generate comprehensive social security data

IR Country (GB.307/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.307/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.307/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Jordan	Collected and disseminated social security data through the ILO's social security inquiry for national policy formulation.	Country generated social security statistics for inquiry on social security.	√

Indicator 3a.1 (ii): Number of member States that apply ILO technical assistance to develop social security policies that extend coverage to more and/or increase the level or range of benefits

IR Country (GB.307/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.307/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.307/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Jordan	Provided technical assistance on actuarial matters and on design of maternity insurance branch.	Jordan developed new social insurance bill aimed at extending social security coverage (inclusion of workers in small enterprises, introduction of maternity benefit scheme).	√

Nepal

1 Background and ILO situation

Nepal is a low income country with a large population living in poverty and surviving on the informal economy. Providing adequate social protection is a priority of the government and increasing attention is being paid to provision for the estimated 90% falling outside of existing social security schemes.

The current social protection system consists of social and health insurance, and social assistance programmes (old age pension, disability pension, widow allowances, and a maternity scheme). The contributory, formal schemes of social security are limited to coverage of civil servants, teachers, the military and police, or an estimated 500,000 of the estimated 24 million people in the country.

Additional social assistance schemes have been introduced to provide basic services to a larger segment of the population. Block grants for local community development have been set up to selected low income districts to improve infrastructure and government services. Cash for work and other public works schemes intended to benefit the poor, and micro-credit and other employment services have been included in the broad scope of social protection programmes, but in general the reach of social protection remains limited and very few benefit from improved income security through government-supported measures.

ILO's support to Nepal has focused on supporting the depth and breadth of the national social security scheme in Nepal to improve the financial soundness and coverage of existing schemes and to assess the feasibility of adding new schemes targeting new and vulnerable groups. Since 2005, the ILO has conducted studies, training and technical missions, consulted and helped draft laws that relate to extension of social protection.

2 Conclusions and lessons learned

2.1 Conclusions

2.1.1 Strategic approach and design: relevant to situation facing Nepal

Conclusion 1: The ILO's work in Nepal is relevant to national needs, priorities and approaches based on feedback from national partners and review of key documentation. The ILO's initiatives are also consistent with its global social security strategy to work towards establishing a national social protection floor.

The ILO has concentrated on providing advice and support in areas where it has greater depth of knowledge than other UN agencies, and where IFIs (ADB, WB) are not as active. The ILO has been the primary agency among international organizations to work with the government and constituents to bring forward three legal frameworks and to facilitate a tripartite agreement on labour law reform that addresses the need for labour market flexibility but not

without extending social security schemes to cover a larger share of the workforce and to most immediately devise an unemployment compensation scheme.

2.1.2 Coherent and complementary with regard to horizontal and vertical extension of social protection

Conclusion 2: The ILO has addressed horizontal and vertical aspects of social protection, and in close collaboration with UN and national partners. However, some call on the ILO to show greater visibility and direction for prioritizing social protection measures that target improved security for the poor working in the informal economy.

In follow up to the adoption of the interim constitution in 2007, at the request of the government and in collaboration with UNICEF, the ILO prepared a comprehensive study that laid out a set of costed social security measures that could be offered to the people of Nepal to provide social and economic stability. The report demonstrated various scenarios by which a basic set of social protection measures could be feasible and affordable based on the priority forms of coverage desired in Nepal. The report focused on primarily non-contributory schemes in order to address the estimated 90% of the population falling outside of schemes existing at the time.²

The estimated cost implications were considerable, given the relatively low share of national budgets spent on social protection (at the time approximately 15% of government expenditure, and the country's weak and porous tax base.

The ILO in Nepal and in the Asia region are supporting numerous proposals that link social protection with measures to generate jobs and income for vulnerable individuals and groups. Local employment development projects focusing on work fare and public works/infrastructure development are under development. These initiatives link to the broader emerging national framework for social protection.

The ILO's actuarial and quantitative costing exercises do not at this time directly address the trade-offs between investing in contributory schemes serving a small elite versus the broader set of initiatives to provide a basic social floor in key dimensions. It is likely that politically the ILO and the government cannot consider trading one for the other so that instead costing and coverage analysis, and dialogue, on tax-based versus contributory schemes are largely kept separate.

2.1.3 Effectiveness of strategy in extending various forms of social protection to all

Conclusion 3: ILO technical interventions have been effective in raising understanding of social security systems, the specific changes that can improve existing schemes, and options for establishing additional schemes and coverage.

² Nepal Technical Note: Affordable and not an illusion. Costing of basic social protection benefits for Nepal 2007-2034, (ILO/RP/Nepal/R.7).

Knowledge and advocacy:

The ILO has also been credited with raising awareness of how short-term employment linked to public works schemes are integral elements of a social protection strategy. In Nepal, they have taken the lead in advising the government and are currently collaborating with the ADB to source financing a new short term employment scheme (seasonal and other basic employment schemes primarily for rural poor and vulnerable communities).

The ILO has completed one quantitative costing exercise, as described above (2007) and is currently assessing the financial feasibility of various scenarios for establishing the unemployment insurance scheme. Both were highly demanded and regarded, though the latter is still being finalized. At the time of the report, Nepal provided old age pensions for persons as of 75 years, universal and unconditional, at 200 rupees/month (\$4 at the time). The ILO proposed reducing the eligibility to 65 years and introducing a child allowance for 1-14 years, a birth grant, and improved health care facilities. Additional scenarios advanced these basic elements by altering benefit levels, targeting of beneficiaries, etc. The report was well received and has been one of the documents referenced by MoF, PCM, the UN working group on social protection and selected donors (DFID, WB) as shaping the discussion related to fiscal space for extending core social protection coverage. In addition, the document is credited with helping to provide a frame of reference for establishing a ‘basic social protection floor’ within Nepal.

The ILO has supported financial analysis for the unemployment compensation scheme that assumes a more realistic contributory distribution than what social partners have proposed. At the request of government and social partners, SOCSEC is currently conducting a financial assessment for defining the contribution and benefit distribution for the unemployment insurance scheme.

The ILO has provided comparative information and case study assessments related to social security schemes in countries similar to Nepal but where the social security schemes have been successful. The government is keen to learn more about what is being done and how it can be adapted to the Nepal case. The ILO actively facilitates these exchanges through study tours, etc.

In some cases, ILO’s reports were considered ‘too macro’ and general, however, partners anticipate more detailed operational support being forthcoming once the government advances on the constitutional and legal constraints, which it faced during the evaluation mission.

Technical cooperation and capacity development:

The ILO has conducted a series of training and planning workshops for constituents and the broader international development network to raise awareness of issues and mechanisms for extending social security. Most recently, in January 2010, the outcome of a Nepal tripartite workshop on social security was a written tripartite declaration confirming tripartite commitment to the horizontal and vertical extension of social security in the country around four phases:

1. establishment of a national sso and of an unemployment insurance scheme;

2. establishment of an employment injury insurance scheme;
3. establishment of a maternity insurance and sickness insurance scheme;
4. Ratification of C102 and C158.

For nearly all of above, ILO is regarded by its national partners as having the strongest mandate to provide technical assistance in terms of training, specialized studies, and consultative missions.

The ILO's social partners have regularly met with ILO technical staff conducting missions, however, all have that the capacity gaps of constituents regarding social security policies and schemes are considerable. The ILO has been aware of this but does not yet have a strategy or resources to address this gaping shortfall. Within government, capacity development needs were expressed by the Ministry of Finance, the National Planning Commission as well as the Ministry of Labour (the latter is not directly tasked with managing the newer social security schemes being introduced in the country).

Without an initiative to build national capacity in the area of social security policy development, the ILO could see its partners lose confidence due to unmet expectations.

2.1.4 Internal and external coordination to promote extension

Conclusion 4: The ILO has helped to build strong technical networks of social security specialists involving government, UN, IFI and selected donors. External collaboration is strengthened through establishment of agreed principles, scope and definitions regarding extension of a social protection floor in Nepal. Internal collaboration to support an integrated approach to employment and social protection promotion needs strengthening through tools and examples of successful approaches elsewhere.

ILO is well networked within the highest levels of government and the international donor network, through both of which it channels information and advice. The Ministry of Finance considers it a highly trustworthy source of advice on social security policy, legislation and scheme management, given that it is seen as impartial and committed to tripartism in building national consensus and ownership.

The ILO co-chairs the development partner social protection task team (UNICEF, ILO, ADB, DFID, WB, UNCDF and WFP) since 2007 which aims to support the government of Nepal to ensure that the poor and vulnerable are extended protection, to prioritise the poor and vulnerable in social protection measures, to build on what is already working well, and to consolidate programmes towards a comprehensive social protection framework for Nepal. Additional principles include improved efficiency, administrative simplicity, and ensuring fiscal affordability and sustainability. The scope of this working group covers the broader range of safety net interventions including cash transfers, workfare, and local development schemes aimed at providing income security.

The ILO has provided leadership to this forum since its formation and its papers and technical materials are regularly circulated and discussed.

The ILO enjoys considerable confidence from DFID, GTZ and ADB for its work to reform labour market legislation and strengthen social security schemes in the formal sector. DFID

has invited the ILO to propose a multi-year programme of work to introduce national and local level initiatives along these lines. Some preliminary work has been envisioned to focus more strongly on local development and employment-focused schemes. The consultation process within the ILO as to how social security specialists can contribute to joint programmes of this nature seems to have been uneven in the case of Nepal. At the time of the mission, within ILO there seems to be a strong focus on the extension of a social protection floor to the informal sector in Nepal through employment promotion and support schemes. Linking these into the broader social protection strategy and national dialogue should be a priority.

2.1.5 Efficient use of capacities and resources

Conclusion 5: The ILO's social security team coordinates well in distributing capacities and bundling resources from various sources according to priorities. However, in South Asia, for over a year, the social protection specialist post has been vacant and there exists a backlog of work in Nepal that needs to be addressed.

The ILO has made use of regular budget capacities to support specialized studies, training missions and coordinated advisory services. These have been well coordinated and shared between HQ and the Delhi social protection specialist. Specialized expertise has been made available to deliver high-quality technical reports according to specific requests. SOCSEC is considered by ILO colleagues in the field to be particularly good at collaboration, and particularly in sharing resources to ensure that the work is timely and credible. The SRO specialist in particular complemented the SOCSEC team for their open and flexible manner of working.

The dependency on extra budgetary resources is currently a constraining factor for work in Nepal on social security because there is need for targeted awareness raising of how, why and what social security for all entails, and how to address adequately the administrative and financial management of the schemes. For this, social security experts are needed who are already familiar with Nepal stakeholders and issues being discussed. The Delhi-based specialist will likely have too little time to deliver the scale of support envisioned by ILO's donors and partners. For this reason, the current mix of RB and XB is inadequate with there being a clear need for reliable ILO technical expertise to be expanded either in the subregion or at country level. As the ILO develops integrated proposals to support employment and social protection, adequate attention needs to be given to the technical capacity gap related to social security.

2.1.6 Impact in form of capacity, tools, policy improvements

Conclusion 6: The ILO can be credited with guiding the policy dialogue on labour law reform and social security act, and unemployment insurance policy, and for facilitating the discussion and development of a comprehensive framework and national facility to coordinate social security schemes.

ILO can be credited with guiding the policy dialogue on labour law reform and social security act, and unemployment insurance policy. However, the country's tripartite players are not yet adhering to international standards and ILO advice. Therefore, much of progress can be credited to ILO but much still needs to be done.

Regarding ILO's contribution to progressing on a comprehensive social protection framework for establishing a social floor, ILO is credited by UN and international donors, and government for facilitating the discussion and development of a comprehensive framework and national facility to coordinate, though there is some disagreement on how far ILO can advise given its limited work in social protection through tax-based schemes. The government, however, considers it an honest broker and with less vested special interests.

The government of Nepal increased its social assistance programmes in the 2008-09 budget and raised monthly payments to those over 70 years, endangered ethnicities and dalits (500/mo-\$7); however, so many agencies are working on social protection extension, it is difficult to attribute change in the policy to ILO's single actions.

Personal feedback from government and social partners, as well as UN partners and DFID, during interviews confirmed that the ILO is highly regarded for its advice and expertise regarding the effective mix and sequencing of the overall social protection framework as well as the roll out of specific schemes (unemployment insurance is current example).

All persons interviewed have noted the rapid progress being made in the area of social security extension schemes, but most remain at the design and discussion stage. The government and social partners have been slow to make commitments and there is a risk that additional resources invested by the ILO may be used by the government as a reason to further delay decision-making with regard to budgetary decisions. The government has considerable technical analysis available already but has not been able to consolidate various governmental stakeholders into a dialogue around prioritization and a timed and resourced plan of action. The ILO, therefore, can site progress being made with regard to schemes being designed based on their recommendations, however, these are not yet enacted and therefore the 'impact' not yet evident.

RBM and DWCP

ILO Nepal results framework linked to the social security strategy in Nepal is prominent for the 2010-11 programming period for which it is stated as a high-level outcome: *Improved policies and legal framework for social security coverage for workers, notably of excluded groups.*

Based on the above framework, and also the lower visibility given to social security during the previous biennium, a review of the results framework for the 2008-09 and 2010-11 biennia suggests:

- the ILO has responded to the growing interest and opportunity to advance social security in Nepal, by making a prominent outcome and estimating a resource bundle of \$700,000+ to implement;
- the ILO has developed a results-focused strategy with specific deliverables and milestones, albeit general in wording and vague in measurement, and the outputs and milestones are consistent with ILO's work in the country and expected contributions by our stakeholders;

- the ILO has recognized the importance of policy coherence related to employment growth, albeit without direct reference to social protection but with attention to public works schemes; and
- ILO's public works programming is bundled at country level within the broad national approach to social protection for vulnerable groups.

Finally, regarding the DWCP outcome and work plan for employers' and workers' capacity development in the area of social and labour policy, no mention is made of raising the capacity of social partners to support a reformed labour and social protection legal and programmatic framework. This suggests that the social partners may not share the ILO's emphasis on constituent capacity development for social protection policy and programming.

Social partners for their part have not identified this as a priority so there seems to be limited demand in terms of how they prioritize this within their work planning.

2.1.7 Sustainability of advancements made

Conclusion 7: The ILO is regarded as well positioned to facilitate the government in preparing a comprehensive strategy and plan for advancing social security policies and schemes. It is actively networking within donor and government social protection specialist to build consistency and consensus, however, the absence of a national ILO staff person to backstop the Director has limited participation levels.

The current elements of the broadest components of social security coverage are spread across multiple parts of government, with incoherent administrative approaches and practices for managing the current portfolio. The UN and donor working group on extending social protection is working collectively to support government efforts to consolidate these various schemes and players within a policy and programme map, as a first step towards developing a consolidated strategy and action plan. The active participation of the Director of the ILO Office in Nepal is greatly appreciated by task force partners, particularly in providing technically to the dialogue on social protection. However, several members suggested that it could be even more so, and better sustainable, if this experience and technical expertise was also invested in the programme officers - who are, naturally, expected to remain with ILO/Nepal for much longer.

The Ministry of Finance calls on ILO to next address the means for achieving an efficient institutional set up, to better administer comprehensive social security policy guidance, and to provide a more narrow assessment of the priorities and roll out of an extended social security scheme. The ILO for its part will need to expand its availability to technically steer this and at the same time address constituent capacity needs to see that decisions can become more timely.

2.2 Lessons learned

- UN and donor joint task force has taken steps to formalize and professionalize its joint work. This is considered necessary to garner respect from government and task members' agency colleagues regarding the advice and outputs of the task force.
- Without a clear definition of what is meant by a 'social protection floor', joint action is difficult to achieve; agencies currently approach extension of social protection based on agency mandates and priorities.
- The government benefits from improved coherence within the donor network with regard to its own efforts to consolidate internal ministerial policies, programmes and administration.
- To have influence over the advancement of a social protection floor, the ILO needs to be more conceptually and operationally nimble to integrate social assistance, social insurance with other forms of social protection and include employment promotion. (DFID disappointed with ILO so far in this aspect).
- Most UN agency staff at country level have limited understanding of social security policy and strategy, and therefore require targeted support to improve their capacity to conceptualize and operationalize multiple schemes within a consolidated national social protection strategy and governance system.

Nepal

2006-07

Outcome 3a.2: Better instruments and tools for policy analysis and formulation and good governance in social protection

Indicator 3a.2 (v): Member States in crisis maintain a minimum level of protection for affected populations

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2) Indicator 3a.2(iv)	ILO output reported (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Nepal	ILO study confirmed the financial viability of basic cash transfers to vulnerable segments of the population.	Nepal: Increased the old-age allowance, including to affected populations.	

2008-09

Outcome 3a.1: Increase member State capacity to develop policies focused on improving social security systems

Indicator 3a.1 (i): Number of member States that apply ILO technical assistance to generate comprehensive social security data

IR Country (GB.307/PFA/2) Indicator 3a.2(i)	ILO output reported (GB.307/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.307/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Nepal	Collected and disseminated social security data through the ILO's social security inquiry for national policy formulation.	Country generated social security statistics for inquiry on social security.	

Thailand

1 Background and ILO situation

As a middle income country, Thailand has made steady progress towards providing a basic set of social protection measures for its population. In two key areas the government is well advanced towards offering universal basic social security coverage: basic health prevention and treatment and old age income security.

Currently, there are five contributory social security schemes in Thailand plus a non-contributory retirement and health insurance for government employees; a non-contributory health insurance for employees of state enterprises; the Universal Healthcare (UC) for people who have no other health insurance; and, finally, a number of small social assistance programmes.

Since 2005, a major component of ILO's support to Thailand focused on improving the efficiency and financial management of the national health care system. The ILO received funding through EU (880,000 euro) to 'enhance and secure the financial governance of the national health care system through (i) reform of existing financial management systems, through improved monitoring, financial reporting accounting and (ii) strengthening institutional and human capacity through direct training and custom-made training curriculum for nation-wide replication.

The ILO worked with the three main schemes, which included:

- 1) The SSO contributory scheme covering roughly 8 million (defined benefit--capitation);
- 2) The non-contributory civil servant medical benefit scheme covering roughly 7 million (fee-for-service);
- 3) The universal healthcare (UC) scheme with a registered membership of 47 million (capitation, with emphasis on primary care and prevention education).

Over the past six years, the ILO has been requested by the Social Security Office (SSO) of Thailand to carry out financial and actuarial studies on:

- 1) the Thailand Workmen Compensation Scheme (2007), an actuarial review of old-age benefit branch of the social security fund; an actuary review to assess the viability of the sickness, death and invalidity benefit benefits of the SSF; and a review mission to advise on pension reform (2009), among other technical missions.

2 Conclusions and lessons learned

2.1 Conclusions

Strategic approach and design: relevant to situation facing Thailand

Conclusion 1: The Government of Thailand relies on the ILO to provide targeted technical assistance based on clear requests from national agencies for ILO inputs. Based on feedback, the ILO has been responsive to this demand, and has delivered highly relevant technical studies, capacity building initiatives, and other forms of support.

The government of Thailand considers improvements in social protection as a national development priority. By the end of the government's ninth plan (2002-06), there had been progress on economic and social development, with more capital accumulation, improved health status and quality of life, higher per capita income, reduced poverty incidence, and low unemployment. With regard to decent work, universal healthcare coverage has been implemented, together with job creation and greater access to social services by disadvantaged groups. The tenth plan (2007-2011) focuses far more on the knowledge economy, sustainable development, governance and participation. It aims, however, to reduce the poverty head count from its 9.6 per cent 2006 level to 4 per cent of the population by 2011.

With regard to this, the Government of Thailand relies on the ILO to provide targeted technical assistance based on clear requests from national agencies for ILO inputs. Based on feedback, the ILO has been responsive to this demand, and has delivered highly relevant technical studies, capacity building initiatives, and other forms of support.

Coherent and complementary with regard to horizontal and vertical extension of social protection

Conclusion 2: Thailand is not currently a priority country for social security support and internally the ILO has reflected this in its own planning. It has shown adaptability with how it has set priorities and adjusted Thailand outcomes and indicators based on the changing programme of work in the country.

Internally the ILO has reflected this in its own planning and has shown adaptability with how it has set priorities and adjusted Thailand outcomes and indicators based on the changing programme of work in the country. With regard to the ILO P&B implementation planning, Thailand is not identified as a reporting country for the global social security and the country does not have a DWCP. That said, the ILO's country-level work plan indicates under outcome THAI 106, 'Policies developed and capacities enhanced to extend social protection of men and women in the areas of social security, OSH and HIV/AIDS' it notes,

The three key social protection areas (social security, OSH, HIV/AIDS) have common goals to extend coverage. The three areas will strengthen its cooperation and coordination, for example, through joint policy development, joint staff training, or collaborative training activities at the workplace level.

Effectiveness of strategy in extending various forms of social protection to all

Conclusion 3: ILO technical interventions are well regarded and made use of by national institutions, particularly with regard to two initiatives to extend coverage to the poor: financial management of the Universal Coverage health insurance scheme and the old age pension scheme. The ILO is also credited for its capacity building through short and long technical education support.

Two ILO interventions are credited with contributing to Thai initiatives to extend to poor: financial management of the UC health insurance scheme, and the old age pension, though for the latter, decisions on raising the benefit level have not yet been taken.

The EU financial management of healthcare project was to establish a central financial management unit to manage the various health care schemes operating in the country, each of which was maintaining a stand-alone management unit. However, this aim was modified to only aim for harmonized practices and structured coordination. For human capacity development mid-level professionals were targeted for post-graduate training (MSc and PhD) in financial management and health policy and planning, as well as short courses and study tours for managers.

- 1) the Thailand Workmen Compensation Scheme (2007), carried out by FACTS—ILO financial and actuarial service, with grant funding from SSO of \$13,000; (follow up to 2001 and 2006 studies from which recommendations were not yet implemented - overfunded given level of accidents)
- 2) Actuarial review of old-age benefit branch of the social security fund (confidential report indicating that while financially sound in short term, for long term contribution rates will need to increase); proposed separating budget for short term vs long term, introducing cost of living adjustment, survivor pensions, innovation of investments, and mandatory valuations on a periodic basis.
- 3) Actuary review to assess the viability of the sickness, death and invalidity benefit benefits of the SSF; concluded that in short-term overfunded; that current funding can cover extension of health care to dependent spouses and children, and that the excess funding should be transferred to cover long term payouts. Proposed revised contribution rates.
- 4) A review mission to advise on pension reform (2009), particularly for the old age allowance for the informal economy, which currently pays out one-third of the poverty line, and needs to cover the needs of 23 million workers estimated to be in the informal economy. The models discussed combine a redistributive universal tax financed component and a fully funded savings component. The government currently provides 500 baht (\$16) per month under the scheme, which is considered too small a sum to justify the administrative costs and to make a difference in meeting cost of living expenses. The scheme is popular and therefore promoted by the political parties, yet it is recognized to have little effect on protecting poor and elderly against economic and social crises.

The report cautioned against a move to temporarily reduce contribution rates due to the crisis, to introduce a mandatory savings scheme at the same time, without a guaranteed return by the government, and also called for regular contribution hikes linked to scaled premiums. Its recommendations were to raise the basic monthly payment to 1000 baht for all persons over 60 in the informal sector, and voluntary provident fund coverage. The extra costs associated with this could be absorbed through the government's proposed introduction of an increase in excise tax.

The ILO leaves dissemination of commissioned studies largely to the country-level agencies to handle but for those that are not listed as confidential includes them in public databases. ILO often supports joint workshops to discuss results and plan follow up. Some of these workshops are better appreciated than others. (The 2008 New Delhi workshop on inclusive

strategies for extending social security was not popular with constituents in part because its focus was felt to be too extensively on the ILO's work, with many presentations, too little discussion).

Internal and external coordination to promote extension

Conclusion 4: South-south collaboration - supported by ILO - between Thailand and its neighbouring countries was well appreciated by the Thai government based on the efficiency and effectiveness of these exchanges. Among ILO staff, there has been consistency in supporting the social floor effort but there is not yet a common understanding among specialists of what this entails.

UN networks

The ILO does not have high formal visibility in Thailand among UN networks partly because its office is sub-regional while many UN agencies have country offices. For this reason, ILO is not part of the UN country team. Nonetheless, it is active in the UN working group on extending social protection where the ILO social security specialist is one of the coordinators.

South-South collaboration

The ILO has supported, financially and technically, several long-term technical cooperation arrangements between Thai government officials and neighboring countries' social security agencies. Two of these are Lao (already 2+ years collaboration underway) and Cambodia, where language and cultural similarities also make the collaborations effective and well received, particularly since work exchanges to Thailand's institutions have been arranged.

Internal collaboration

Within the subregional office for SE Asia (Bangkok), ILO technical and project staff have been collaborating to support governments and UN colleagues in national social protection strategies. Among ILO staff, there has been consistency in supporting the social floor effort but there is not yet a common understanding among specialists of what this entails. Cambodia and Lao are two examples where joint initiatives among ILO staff are taking off --Better Work in Cambodia is one anchor and the employment schemes linked to rural infrastructure is another.

Efficient use of capacities and resources

Conclusion 5: Thailand is a particularly good example of how the 'fee-for-service' approach for providing actuary and other studies has been applied successfully, and it has opted to avoid large-scale fund raising to give priority to countries where less national capacity is available. Within the subregion, demand of social security specialists is expanding, particularly within the framework of the UN call of a social protection floor, however, the Office is expanding capacity as well.

As a middle income country, Thailand can finance a fair amount of the technical studies conducted by the ILO and have relatively strong governance and management capacities for social security schemes. The ILO has therefore mobilized resources from the government to finance some of the studies, and from the EU where an ongoing long-term programme sought

expertise in financial management. Thailand is a particularly good example of how the ‘fee-for-service’ approach for providing actuary studies has been applied successfully.

The ILO also avoids large-scale fund raising in Thailand as it has limited capacity to oversee this and therefore gives priority to countries where less national capacity is available. Related, the ILO used extra budgetary resources to finance key officials for specialized academic and technical studies, which meant that the country would have the necessary expertise to sustain capacities in financial management.

The ILO has one full time technical specialist in Bangkok to cover all countries in the subregion, which now also covers Philippines, Indonesia and the Pacific Islands. (China has its own specialist). The ILO has arranged for her to be supported by a social security expert seconded from Government of Korea and an associate expert for the coming 2-3 years. In addition to this core team, there have been a small number of full time staff funded through projects and posted in some countries. Additional human resources are sourced from HQ, where several staff dedicate work months to particular countries in need of support.

At the moment, the ILO does not see a funding gap for Thailand given that there is social security specialist and associate based in Bangkok and because of the government’s willingness to source funding for specialized studies.

Impact in form of capacity, tools, policy improvements

Conclusion 6: ILO is credited with having had significant impact decisions, practices and capacities within all three health insurance schemes, as well by SSO for the various schemes analysed. Regarding the targets set in the ILO implementation plan for Thailand, progress was made on all of the targets and two of the four were confirmed as met.

The ILO is credited by its national stakeholders for having influenced agency decisions, practices and capacities within all three health insurance schemes, as well by SSO for the various schemes analysed. ILO was a strong advocate for the old age pension as well.

In the case of health care, the ILO has reported on tangible changes in practices that harmonize and improve several important aspects of the financial management and monitoring of the three health care schemes. These include:

- Financial analysis to set and adjust capitation rates and payment systems;
- Consolidated data and analysis for assessing the long-term financial sustainability of each scheme;
- Shared data on eligibility of individuals and transaction records;
- Standardized statistical and accounting frames and systems;
- Statistical and performance reporting (work in progress).

Underlying these changes is a team of health financial system analysts who have been trained

by the project and subsequently work collaboratively across the three agencies to harmonize and consolidate systems and practices.

The health care project and actuary studies can be reliably linked to measures taken by the government to improve the financial soundness of some schemes; the ILO was not able to fully harmonize financial management of the three major health care schemes; this was largely based on a government decision to postpone this effort.

For other areas of support, ILO's actuary study on invalidity benefits, actuarial assessment of reform options on the introduction of survivors' pensions under SSF, and improvement of efficiency of the workmen's compensation fund, however, key informants have reported that SSO did not take on board recommendations from several assessments for primarily political reasons.

RBM and DWCP:

Regarding the targets set in the ILO implementation plan for Thailand, progress was made on all of the targets and two of the four were confirmed as met:

- First round of Social Security Inquiry will be finished and the team of national experts will be capacitated to carry out future periodical Social Security Inquiries.
(Feedback indicates that this was largely achieved)
- A new in-house SSO actuarial valuation will be established and staff will be capacitated to carry out future periodical actuarial valuations in order to cater for future improvements and reforms of social security.
(SSO has not yet carried out actuarial valuations but training did take place)
- Policies will be improved on passive and active labour market policies, especially the linkages between two policies. *(No major policy changes linked to this but proposals for local development and integrated action at national level have developed).*
- A financial projection model for three major health care schemes will have been established, used for budget formulations and maintained for periodical uses for budgeting and for measuring reform options.
(Completed based on info from three different agencies plus ex CTA)

Sustainability of advancements made

Conclusion 7: The ILO has worked with national institutions to build specialized capacities and to raise awareness regarding risks and good practices linked to various social security schemes. In combination, this has enabled institution-level change that stands a high probability of continuation.

In case of Thailand, old age and national health care are universal entitlements and financially viable; the ILO has focused on issues related to improving the quality, adequacy and access. Since the government has financed a fair share of the ILO inputs and indicates an interest in continuing this practice, the sustainability of this collaboration is highly likely. The planned augmentation of ILO specialists in the area of social security also assures continuity of delivery.

ILO has collaborated on multiple studies published by national institutions, which is a well appreciated practice, according to all interviewed (National Health Security office - NHSO; Fiscal Policy Research Institute, International Health Policy Programme IHPP, Fiscal Policy Office,). These institutes in turn maintain capacity for regular research and analysis. In addition, of the eight persons receiving scholarships under the EU project on health care financial management, seven are still working with their agencies and the eighth consults nationally.

2.2 Lessons learned

- The capacity building strategy to train a team of experts across multiple agencies within government is considered by Thai officials as a particularly effective means of supporting institutional and systemic change, particularly if the individuals can collaborate technically once returning to their organizations.
- There is strong reluctance to harmonize contributory and non-contributory schemes if the beneficiaries of the former fear deterioration in benefits, particularly in moving from a fee-for-service to a capitation payment system.
- Technical support for a capacity building project, such as the EU health care financial management, should not rely too heavily on short term missions and too minimally on in-country technical person(s) to anchor the work.
- The ILO Social Protection Floor Matrix, which designates the type of protection against the targeted groups of individuals, is proving a useful tool for mapping the activities and programmes of UN supporting agencies wanting to work in collaboration.
- The focus on establishing comprehensive approaches to employment growth and social protection has initially worked to bring HQ units together, the challenge will be to maintain the momentum.
- The social floor approach broadens ILO's traditional work and constituents need to be trained and develop capacity to participate in the broader policy debate.
- In SE Asia, the ILO has bundled social security at local level within larger initiatives that also address working conditions and OSH. Prevention and promotion initiatives are being linked to extension and primary health networks to reach the informal economy. These programmes are also well supported by Workers' Organizations.
- Local government is the means by which to extend the reach of national social protection schemes to the local level. These also can and are being bundled with pro-poor employment services, local dispute mechanisms, and access to health and other social services.

THAILAND P&B targets

2006-07

Outcome 3a.1: Improved policies and strategies to extend social protection to all

Indicator 3a.1 (iii) Member States improve their capacities to combine actions on social security and safety and health in the informal economy and rural areas

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2) Indicator 3a.1(iii)	ILO output reported (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Thailand	Prepared support studies and provided technical assistance to integrate the OSH systems in the provision of basic health services.	Thailand: Implemented OSH measures linked with the provision of basic health care in rural areas (in three provinces). Policy recommendations were produced based on this experience.	

Outcome 3a.2: Better instruments and tools for policy analysis and formulation and good governance in social protection

Indicator 3a.2 (i): Member States generate comprehensive data for policy formulation, including gender-sensitive surveys, and disseminate results

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2) Indicator 3a.2(i)	ILO output reported (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Thailand	Collected social security data for the social security inquiry and gave advice on data requirements for policy formulation.	Generated statistics for an inquiry on social security.	

Indicator 3a.2(iii): Member States adopt new tools and enhance national capacity for good governance through capacity-building programmes for staff of social security institutions, social partner organizations and government ministries

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2) Indicator 3a.2(iii)	ILO output reported (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Thailand	Technical support to establish and use the model, which was enhanced by four fellowships (EU-financed) to Thai citizens.	Government social security institutions adopted elements of the ILO's social budget modelling approach and drafted the first health-care financial model.	√

Indicator 3a.2 (iv): Member States take action to improve governance of social protection schemes or maintain good standards of governance

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2) Indicator 3a.2(iv)	ILO output reported (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Thailand	Actuarial advice provided with respect to the Thailand Industrial Classification.	Reviewed the Workmen's Compensation Scheme. Actions taken to implement recommendations of the actuarial report submitted to the Social Security Office.	

2008-09

Outcome 3a.1: Increase member State capacity to develop policies focused on improving social security systems

Indicator 3a.1 (i): Number of member States that apply ILO technical assistance to generate comprehensive social security data

IR Country (GB.307/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.307/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.307/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Thailand	Collected and disseminated social security data through the ILO's social security inquiry for national policy formulation.	Country generated social security statistics for inquiry on social security.	

Outcome 3a.2: Improve member States capacity to manage social security schemes and implement policies focused on improving social security systems

Indicator 3a.2 (i): Number of member States that either apply ILO technical assistance or tools to give effect to the principles of ILO standards, including the tripartite governance of social security schemes, or use of tools to increase administrative efficiency and effectiveness or to improve financial sustainability

IR Country (GB.307/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.307/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.307/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Thailand	Provided technical advice on governance of health-care system. Published 12 reports and organized workshop for trade union leaders.	Thailand: Ministry of Health improved financial management of health-care system. Trade unions enhanced knowledge and capacity.	

Indicator 3a.2 (ii): Number of member States in which officials trained by the ILO for good governance, planning and management of social security, enter or remain in, the employment of social policy-making bodies

IR Country (GB.307/PFA/2) Indicator 3a.2(i)	ILO output reported (GB.307/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.307/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Thailand	Provided training under ILO/University of Maastricht Masters Course on Social Policy Financing and Social Policy Development.	Thailand enhanced capacity of Ministry of Health and related agencies to manage health-care system.	

Zambia

1 Background and ILO situation

Zambia has a long history of contributory social security insurance schemes with benefits limited to the provision of protection against loss of income resulting from retirement, disability and/or death of a breadwinner. There are also a number of occupational pension schemes and an occupational disease and work injury scheme.

Non-contributory programmes include the Public Welfare Assistance Scheme (PWAS) covering roughly 2 per cent of the population; a group of social cash transfer schemes implemented under the PWAS; the Food Security Pack, a government-funded scheme providing basic agricultural inputs, technology transfers and training to vulnerable small-scale family households; the School-Feeding Programme, funded by the World Food Programme; and a Government-funded public works programme, Project Urban Self-Help.

The first Zambian cash transfers scheme was set up in 2003 as a pilot scheme in the Kalomo District of the Southern Province. The scheme investigated the feasibility, costs, benefits and impact of social cash transfers to very poor families.

To date, both statutory and effective coverage levels for income security-related schemes remain low and highly uneven distribution of medical staff contributes to inequity in terms of expenditure and service delivery within the national health care system.³ In 2005, the old age and disability demographic protection ratio (i.e. the number of affiliates to a social security institution providing benefits in old age and/or disability as a proportion of the working age population (15-64)) was as low as 6.8 per cent.⁴

Strategic framework for government-led efforts and initiatives for the extension of social security coverage to date

The National Employment and Labour Market Policy (NELMP), which was adopted in 2005 with input from social partners and support from the ILO, sets the country's priorities in achieving more and better quality employment including greater inclusiveness and social protection for all. The Ministry of Labour and Social Security has, in addition, drafted a 2006 National Social Security Policy Strategy Document, which, among other things, aims at harmonizing the fragmented social security policies in Zambia.⁵

ILO social security interventions and means of action at country level

³ GESS social security profile, Zambia available at <http://www.socialsecurityextension.org/gimi/gess/ShowCountryProfile.do?cid=238&aid=2> (accessed March 8, 2010).

⁴ ILO Social Security Inquiry Database, 2010.

⁵ Republic of Zambia, 2006: National Social Security Policy Strategy Document (Draft November 2006) (Lusaka: Ministry of Labour and Social Security), p. 4-5.

The ILO's technical focus in Zambia has largely been shaped within the context of the Global Campaign on Social Security and Coverage for All. Social protection schemes were explored as a means to combat poverty, to identify options and determine the feasibility for a minimum social protection package.

ILO social security means of action at country-level during the evaluation reference period have been (i) generation, management and dissemination of knowledge and collection and analysis of statistical information in particular through a Social Protection Expenditure Review (SPER) and social budgeting exercise implemented as part of an extra-budgetary technical cooperation DFID-funded project); and (ii) capacity building through the QUATRAN Africa RBSA funded-project, scholarships for Masters programmes and ad hoc workshops and seminars.

2 Conclusions and lessons learned

2.1 Conclusions

2.1.1 Strategic approach and design: relevant to situation facing Zambia

Conclusion 1: The ILO's focus and approach in Zambia has been consistent with and responsive to the 2006 Zambian Fifth National Development Plan, (with links to UNDAF and DWCP) and government calls for development of a comprehensive social security system.

The ILO's focus and approach in Zambia has been consistent with and responsive to the 2006 Zambian Fifth National Development Plan (acknowledged the role of social protection in poverty alleviation,⁶ and further committed Government to the "development of a comprehensive social security system which ... includes informal sector workers" and to a clear focus on low-capacity households and the most vulnerable groups of the population, including, widows, older persons, disabled or chronically sick persons, vulnerable children and youth). The draft United Nations Development Framework for Zambia (2007-2010) (UNDAF) calls for increasing access of vulnerable groups to basic social services by 2010, including social safety nets.

Focusing on the commitments in the NELMP, the DWCP for Zambia (2007-2011) aims at "reducing the risks, vulnerabilities and decent work deficits facing the designated target groups in seeking and maintaining decent employment, and graduating from informal to formal employment and enterprises, including the extension of social protection."⁷

According to the project's independent evaluation, the technical cooperation also integrated support for the relevant ILO Conventions (C102, C130 and C183), and provided a platform for continued linking of the social protection efforts with the DWCP and of other ILO and UN agency work, including inputs to UNDAF.

⁶ Republic of Zambia, Ministry of Finance and National Planning: Fifth National Development Plan 2006-2010), Lusaka, 2006, p. 160.

⁷ Global Campaign on Social Security and coverage for all as a means to Combat Poverty in Africa and Asia, PRODOC, p.6.

2.1.2 Coherent and complementary with regard to horizontal and vertical extension of social protection

Conclusion 2: Though the ILO interventions were complementary to other work in the country, feedback from national partners indicates that the alignment and coherence with related initiatives was not convincingly explored and addressed.

The motivation for the DFID-funded project, and thus the launch of a SPER and a social budgeting exercise, was strongly motivated to document the feasibility of an effective set of basic benefits through diagnosis of national needs, development of planning tools and initiation of national dialogue⁸, generate social security country-level data as well as examine the performance of existing arrangements in extending the scope and coverage of the national social security system.⁹ The use of national Living Conditions and Monitoring Survey (LCMS) and Labour Force Survey (LFS) data as basis for the SPER and social budgeting ensured complementary data collection efforts and initiatives.¹⁰

Feedback from social security stakeholders in Zambia, however, suggests that the design and scope of the ILO's work would have benefited from initial consultations and a basic mapping of the existing interventions. Many stakeholders began with a limited knowledge of the broad meaning of social protection and the importance of extension of coverage through both social assistance and contributory social security schemes.

⁸ Proposed outline: Social Security for All, Tanzania-Zambia Global Campaign concept note and PRODOC

⁹ GUESS, Social Security Profile, Zambia; available at <http://www.socialsecurityextension.org/gimi/gess/ShowCountryProfile.do?cid=238&aid=2> (accessed March 8, 2010).

¹⁰ Global Campaign on Social Security and coverage for all as a means to Combat Poverty in Africa and Asia, Final independent evaluation report, p.24

2.1.3 Effectiveness of strategy in extending various forms of social protection to all

Conclusion 3: The SPER and social budget completed in 2008 have identified fiscal space for 3 non-contributory cash benefit schemes. The studies also provided extensive data on expenditure on health and education, and disaggregated along gender lines and the gender impact was included in the analyses of data. The ILO is also credited with the fostering of inter-ministerial dialogue and shift in Government thinking from targeted to universal approach to social protection.¹¹ The government partners profess broadened knowledge on both contributory and non-contributory schemes, depth of expertise remains a challenge.

The Zambian SPER, social budgeting and related activities have been completed between November 2006 and December 2009 within the framework of the Global Campaign on social security and coverage for all as a means to combat poverty in Asia and Africa Zambia country programme, a US\$542,359 extra-budgetary technical cooperation project funded by DFID and jointly administered and backstopped by SECSOC, Geneva and ILO Lusaka.

The SPER and social budget completed in 2008 have identified fiscal space for 3 non-contributory cash benefit schemes (cash transfers income security in old age, social assistance to neediest families, and child grant).¹² Both SPER and social budget generated data disaggregated along gender lines and the gender impact was included in the analyses of data.¹³

Illustrative costing analyses were undertaken of the non-contributory benefit cash scheme. The results expressed as a percentage of GDP in the longer term confirmed the findings of the previous ILO research work on the affordability of a minimum set of social protection benefits.¹⁴

Major by-products are country-specific social security-related knowledge and statistics generated. The SPER led to the development of a survey tool to assess international and national NGO provision of social assistance.

Another tool developed through the SPER and social budgeting exercise was the analysis of work and social protection coverage in the informal economy, which demonstrated, for example, that women and the elderly are never able to retire from work.

The SPER and social budget provided extensive data on expenditure on health and education, and noted high mortality indicators, with information showing that the major causes of morbidity and mortality are preventable infectious diseases, and noted the inadequacies of access to quality health care.

¹¹ Ibid, pp. 5, 21.

¹² Ibid, p.20.

¹³ Ibid, p.30.

¹⁴ Ibid, pp.25-26.

ILO support to Zambia has also entailed a five day (25-29 May 2009) seminar on the financial governance of social protection schemes as part of the social security quantitative training for Africa (**QUATRIN Africa**) project.¹⁵ 40 participants from QUATRIN Africa English-speaking countries including Zambian officials attended the seminar.

Members of the Zambian Government have also participated in a series of seminars for African governors organized through the QUATRIN project held in Turin in December 2008 and three “transfer of knowledge sessions” in April, June and September 2009¹⁶. Sessions’ topics of discussion have been basic considerations in social policy design, but also the main pros and cons of social security, the distinction between social security and social protection, data collection and statistical analysis for social security policy analysis, the role of economic theory and econometrics in the assessment of social security policies’ impacts and actuarial valuations.

The Global Campaign on social security and coverage for all as a means to combat poverty in Asia and Africa Zambia country project team has also contributed to the 2008 ILO Social Security Inquiry (2008) expansion and to the consolidation of the database through information provided by national coordinators, and input collected from staff at large.¹⁷ All these broadened the scope of and information base for the development of national policies.

A network for knowledge transfer was set up to further and second the work of the Ministry of Labour and Social Security’s Steering Committee, and a national policy forum was held in April 2009 to generate dialogue on the development of national social protection strategy.¹⁸

ILO advocacy and capacity building efforts have been answered by Government in a variety of ways. The Zambian Ministry of Labour and Social security is working on the design and plans the implementation of a universal old-age pension scheme: a draft inception report has already been written and plans made. The Ministry has also taken over the Katete old age pilot scheme and is planning to scale up to other Districts. The Ministry of Finance is modelling cash transfers to the elderly.¹⁹ Government has also set up a committee of 7 permanent secretaries to work on its response to both the SPER and the social budget.²⁰

The ILO is also credited with the fostering of inter-ministerial dialogue and shift in Government thinking from targeted to universal approach to social protection.²¹ Government partners profess broadened knowledge and expertise on both contributory and non-contributory schemes; yet a quarter of those present at the social dialogue forum and

¹⁵ Agreement between the Federal Republic of Germany and the ILO 18 March 2008 (FRG/ILO MOU), Annex A.

¹⁶ QUATRIN AFRICA Interim Narrative Report for the period 1 July 2008 to 31 December 2009, pp.6-8.

¹⁷ SEC/SOC annual delivery report 2008, p. 15.

¹⁸ Global Campaign on Social Security and coverage for all as a means to Combat Poverty in Africa and Asia, Final independent evaluation report, p.21.

¹⁹ Ibid., p.22, 26.

²⁰ Ibid., p.23.

²¹ Ibid, pp. 5, 21.

interviewed for the benefit of the Global Campaign on Social Security and coverage for all as a means to Combat Poverty in Africa and Asia, Zambia project final evaluation report still admitted limited knowledge of core issues.²²

Knowledge sharing with ILO country office was identified as a by-product of SPER and social budgeting exercise.²³ Yet, delay in starting the intervention of 10 months meant that the last phase including the round of discussions to elaborate a national action plan for social protection never took place and the knowledge transfer envisaged was cut short (i.e. the task of transferring the SPER and social budget models to the country to enable Government to maintain the data and conduct ongoing modelling of variations to their social protection programmes was not completed).²⁴

Yet, neither changes in national policies and practices (i.e. new policies adopted or policy reform; evidence of improved governance and sustainability of schemes) nor increases in social security coverage (by category of benefits/ risks and contingencies and target group) were documented at project or Governing Body-level.

2.1.4 Internal and external coordination to promote extension

Conclusion 4: Collaboration with donors and UN partners, including UNICEF, were reported as productive, however, there were some differences and misunderstandings linked to the roles and involvement of government ministries and the social partners.

Feedback from tripartite partners noted the benefits of ILO's technical contributions in raising awareness regarding the need for non-contributory social protection measures. They also highlighted, however, that problems existed as well with established contributory schemes and that these could have received greater attention.

Collaboration with donors and UN partners, including UNICEF, were reported as productive, however, there were some differences and misunderstandings linked to the roles and involvement of government ministries and the social partners. These issues were addressed such that the Ministry of Labour is more directly linked into national policy and programme development regarding non-contributory social protection schemes.

2.1.5 Efficient use of capacities and resources

Conclusion 5: Inflexibility in use of funds and dependency on extra budgetary resource flows which delayed formation of a national action plan for social security. For Zambia, there is a reported deficit of social security expertise to carry forward the advisory and capacity building support, and only recently have funds been identified to finance this support.

²² Ibid., p.4, 19.

²³ Ibid., p. 29.

²⁴ Ibid., p.17.

The ILO's initiatives in Zambia have been almost exclusively financed through extra budgetary resources. When funding for the initiative was delayed and the implementation period shortened as a result, the Office was not able to bring forward alternative financing to maintain the final phase of the initiative.

Also, the ILO does not have secure longer term national technical staff in the area of social security who can deliver the level of technical support being demanded. The social security specialist for Southern Africa can augment to some extent but overall there was a perceived deficit that required regular involvement from Geneva.

2.1.6 Impact in form of capacity, tools, policy improvements

Conclusion 6: ILO constituents and other social protection partners noted the broadening of their knowledge and perspective as a result of ILO's work, as well as their greater awareness of uses for data collection and analysis and an expanded information base.

ILO constituents and other social protection partners noted the broadening of their knowledge and perspective as a result of ILO's work, as well as their greater awareness of uses for data collection and analysis and an expanded information base.

The ILO initiative is also credited with enabling a shift in government's thinking from social protection for only the most vulnerable to a universal approach. The Ministry of Labour is taking forward the idea of implementing a universal old age pension.

The ILO also is credited with developing tools related to the social budgeting exercise for assessing suitability of NGOs in providing social protection services, however, national capacity to apply these tools more regularly remains limited.

2.1.7 Sustainability of advancements made

Conclusion 7: The ILO will be able to make use of the work done so far in raising awareness and generating information, as Zambia ministries and international donors have already registered their intention to move forward on social protection measures targeting the old and most vulnerable.

According to the evaluation report, the ILO intervention was relevant to national priorities and needs, there was not a strongly articulated demand for the initiative by ILO's social partners and therefore a slow build up of enthusiasm for adoption and implementation of a social security action plan. The situation was further compounded by a shortened project implementation period that cut short plans for supporting implementation of the action plan. In 2010, ILO has been able to find resources to support this, however.

Zambian stakeholders argued that the design and scope of the SPER and social budgeting exercises could have benefited from initial consultation with the in-country partners, and a

basic mapping of the existing interventions in the field covered, noting national stakeholders and cooperating partners would also have proved useful.

They assimilated most of the capacity building efforts to repeated presentations of the SPER and social budgeting exercises' scope and objectives and presentations on the basic subject matter and confirmed that such activities did not guarantee full understanding by all the stakeholders, particularly those at high levels.

Real understanding and national ownership of the results of the SPER and social budget have not yet been fostered because of a (real or felt) deficit in attention to the comments of the national recipients of the products. The SPER and the social budgets outputs' presentations needed to be geared to the different levels of quantitative analytic capacity of the stakeholders in order to maintain interest and motivation.²⁵ Stakeholders would also have been appreciative of a discussion of challenges to the existing contributory schemes.

ZAMBIA

2006-07

Outcome 3a.2: Better instruments and tools for policy analysis and formulation and good governance in social protection

Indicator 3a.2 (i): Member States generate comprehensive data for policy formulation, including gender-sensitive surveys, and disseminate results

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Zambia	Supported data collection on government and non-government social protection as a precursor to a social protection expenditure and performance review, and a social budget.	Social security schemes and national institutions generated data for the evaluation of social protection environment and for policy formulation.	

Indicator 3a.2 (iii): Member States adopt new tools and enhance national capacity for good governance through capacity-building programmes for staff of social security institutions, social partner organizations and government ministries

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Zambia	Training of staff through the ILO–University of Maastricht's Masters in Social Policy Design and Masters in Social Policy Financing.	Enhanced capacity of staff of social security institutions for good governance.	

²⁵ Ibid., pp.33-34.

2008-09

Outcome 3a.1: Increase member State capacity to develop policies focused on improving social security systems

Indicator 3a.1 (i): Number of member States that apply ILO technical assistance to generate comprehensive social security data

IR Country (GB.307/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.307/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.307/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Zambia	Collected and disseminated social security data through the ILO's social security inquiry for national policy formulation.	Country generated social security statistics for inquiry on social security.	

Indicator 3a.2 (ii): Number of member States in which officials trained by the ILO for good governance, planning and management of social security, enter or remain in, the employment of social policy-making bodies

IR Country (GB.307/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.307/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.307/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Zambia	Provided capacity building through QUATRAN Africa programme Provided training on social budget and social protection expenditure and performance review.	Members of tripartite governing bodies (trustees, directors, etc.) and pension fund regulators and supervisors were trained in financial governance of social security schemes. Ministry of Labour established network of experts on social protection. Capacity of national officials was enhanced.	

ANNEX 3. DESK COUNTRY CASE STUDIES

Desk country case study – Senegal

Background and ILO situation

Less than 20 per cent of the Senegalese population (some 12.9 million people in total according to the UN Population Division's World Population Prospects 2010) have access to social security benefits. The overwhelming majority of these 20 per cent of the population are private sector workers, civil servants and their families. Their coverage stems from contributions to formal statutory benefit-defined schemes such as the Civil Servants Scheme (i.e. *Régime des fonctionnaires*, FNR) and the General Retirement Scheme, or the Occupational Accident and Disease Scheme (i.e. *la Caisse d'Accidents de Travail et Maladies Professionnelles*, AT/MP). Workers in the informal economy, in rural areas, day labourers and other vulnerable groups are not covered by formal social security mechanisms.

Providing access to health insurance in rural areas is a high priority in the Senegalese Government's agenda that has translated into the adoption in June 2004 of the new Agricultural Law- *Loi d'Orientation Agro-Sylvo Pastorale*. The Law stipulates that the Government should design and implement a social security scheme for the rural population which represents some 5 million people. Social security extension to the rural sector also features in the new national strategy for social protection which is the third pillar of the Poverty Reduction Strategy (PRS) validated in 2006.²⁶ One of the primary objectives of this PRS is to increase social health protection coverage from the current 20 per cent to 50 per cent of the population by 2015.²⁷ For some the micro-insurance health schemes set up have long been the only alternative means of extension of coverage to those categories of the population. A 2004 inventory of community-based health insurance schemes recorded 87 operational schemes with a total of 294,000 beneficiaries.²⁸

ILO social security interventions and means of action at country level

ILO social security interventions' means of actions at country-level during the evaluation reference period have been:

- (i) knowledge generation, management and dissemination (i.e. knowledge/statistical data generation through a SPER and social budget; and development of new country-specific technical thematic tools and simulation models);

²⁶ Extension of social security coverage in Ghana and Senegal, PRODOC extension, p.4.

²⁷ GESS social security profile Senegal, available at <http://www.socialsecurityextension.org/gimi/gess/ShowCountryProfile.do?cid=308&aid=2> (accessed April 12, 2010).

²⁸ La Concertation : *Inventaire des systèmes d'assurance maladies en Afrique : Synthèse des travaux de recherche dans 11 pays*, Dakar, 2004.

- (ii) research and policy development (i.e. elaboration of social health, agricultural/rural and transport sectors-specific strategies for schemes' design and implementation and assessment of social transfer options);
- (iii) technical assistance in the form of legal advice for policy design and implementation of national strategy for social protection for workers in the informal and rural economies in particular; and
- (iv) capacity building (through QUATRIN Africa, but also ad hoc workshops and seminars).

These means of action played out within the frameworks of 6 technical cooperation projects/technical missions:

- the US\$ 43,189 "Poverty impact assessment of a basic social protection benefit package for a low-income country" DFID-funded project implemented by SECSOC in close collaboration with the Dakar Sub-regional Office in 2006, and aiming to strengthen and extend the knowledge base on the effects of cash transfers in low-income countries in Sub-Saharan Africa, as such meets DFID's interest in the impact of social transfers/social protection on growth. The study assessed the impact of cash transfers on the reduction of poverty generally, whilst assessing the effects of specific transfers (e.g. conditional cash transfers to children, basic old-age pensions or transfers to the rural population) on the poverty levels of different Senegalese population groups.
- the STEP Belgium country project (component of the global project financed by Belgium) which entailed, among other things, contributions to the elaboration of the national social protection strategy and the provision of a feasibility study for the implementation of health insurance schemes for transport and rural sector workers.
- a SIDA-financed US\$ 569,764 technical cooperation project on the extension of social security coverage (also implemented in Ghana) implemented by SECSOC with collaboration of the STEP project staff in between February 2006 and September 2008 which chief output was the Senegal SPER;
- a French-financed project to support the design of a regulatory framework for mutual health insurance schemes, *Appui à la construction d'un cadre régional de développement des mutuelles de santé des pays de l'UEMOA*;
- a social budgeting exercise with a provisional total budget of US\$199,500 launched in November 2009 and implemented by the SRO Dakar and UNICEF Senegal; and
- QUATRIN Africa associated activities.

Rationale for choice of country for ILO support

Extension of social security coverage through social dialogue features in the DWCP for Senegal as a country priority. DWCP outcomes (i.e. SEN101, SEN102 and SEN103) also call for the implementation of rural and transport sector-specific social protection mechanisms and increased national capacity to promote the extension of social security to the most vulnerable members of the Senegalese society.

The ILO has carried out a first fiscal analysis of the costs associated with providing a basic social protection benefit package in seven sub-Saharan low-income countries.²⁹ This study demonstrated that a basic and modest level of social protection (i.e. universal old age pension, a child benefit and targeted social assistance) is affordable within a reasonable timeframe if the country commits a sensible portion of its government budget to basic social protection and if international aid provides temporary support.

A follow-up study carried out in Tanzania assessed the effects of such cash transfers on the reduction of poverty based on Tanzania Household Budget Survey 2000/2001 data. The first results of the simulation of cash transfers showed that such benefits could indeed have a marked effect on the reduction of poverty.

Among the seven sub-Saharan low-income countries included in the costing study, Senegal was the only one (besides Tanzania) where a recent expenditure survey existed which could be compared with the Tanzanian household budget survey data. A simulation of the effects of cash transfers on the reduction of poverty in Senegal, based on the methodology tested in Tanzania not only offered the opportunity to test the effectiveness of cash transfers on poverty reduction in a different country setting, but also provided Senegal with a thoroughly calculated blueprint for a policy to extend social security to excluded groups of the population through cash transfers.³⁰

Why these forms and combinations of interventions? Why now?

ILO support has been designed to complement Government's efforts to implement the engagement taken via the Agricultural Law and the third pillar of the PRS.

As already stated, setting up a system of social protection for workers in agriculture also falls within the strategy of the ILO in Senegal (SEN100) on the extension of the social protection through social dialogue, more precisely outcomes SEN101, SEN102, and SEN 103 from the DWCP for Senegal respectively: *« le gouvernement adopte une stratégie de protection sociale après une large concertation »*; *« les organisations représentatives du monde rural et du secteur des transports routiers adoptent un système de protection sociale adaptée »*; and *« les institutions publiques en charge de la protection sociale, les partenaires sociaux et les représentants des OCB disposent de capacités renforcées pour promouvoir l'extension de la protection sociale aux plus pauvres »*.

As community-based schemes are often the only channel workers in the informal economy have for some kind of health protection and care, their capacity has to be strengthened to enable them to sustain and scale up their operations, progressively linking them to national health care schemes. A Social Protection Expenditure and Performance Review (SPER), i.e. a detailed assessment of social security programmes for formal and informal sector workers, their coverage and performance, operational and organisational arrangements, the adequacy of benefit levels as well as the gaps between the needs of the population and the services

²⁹ Pal, K., Behrendt, C., Léger, F., Cichon, M. and Hagemeyer, K. *Can low-income countries afford basic social protection? First results of a modelling exercise*, SOC/FAS Discussion Paper 13, Geneva, 2005.

³⁰ Poverty impact assessment of a basic social protection benefit package for a low-income country, PRODOC, pp.2-3.

provided, appeared a critical step. It would also build on previous work, including the inventory of community-based health insurance schemes.

The ILO's SPER in addition to being a powerful tool, which gives detailed factual information and the extent of coverage and exclusion and establishes indicators of system performance, is also a training tool for those involved in designing and implementing social security schemes that has proved effective at country level.³¹

Diagnostic tools developed aimed to further enable the government, social partners and other stakeholders to systematically evaluate needs and opportunities and to take informed decisions on the extension of social security.

The social budgeting exercise has been designed to provide a comprehensive, coherent and transparent assessment of social security expenditure in the short and medium terms, measure the current social protection system's performance on the basis of technical and financial indicators, and allow for the identification of the fiscal space necessary to finance the programmes geared towards the extension of social security coverage whilst stimulating leverage of funds. It finally should contribute to coherence in terms of social protection measures promoted through the joint analysis of a variety of options for coverage and their impact on poverty.³²

The Office also judged it critical – and urgent - to conduct a feasibility study on the establishment of a nation-wide health insurance scheme for the rural population and to assess possibilities to extend coverage particularly to indigent and the most vulnerable groups and in particular, enhance the knowledge base for designing viable options and a realistic strategy to extend social security (including how to accommodate low, random and seasonal income and organize premium collection for individuals with non-pecuniary income).³³

Key performance indicators to monitor and /or evaluate/ evaluability

Key performance indicators at the project level for ILO interventions have mostly been indicators of achievement such as indicators of Government and national social partners take up on the results/outputs of the various ILO initiatives:

- (i) The government, social partners and stakeholders of Senegal use the SPER results as the factual basis for the evaluation of needs and opportunities for the extension of social security.
- (ii) The government, social partners and stakeholders of Senegal discuss the recommendations of the feasibility study on the establishment of a national health insurance scheme for the rural population in view of extending social security to the rural population.
- (iii) At least 20 members of the *Commission Nationale du Dialogue Social*, the *Conseil National de Concertation et de Cooperation des Ruraux* (CNCR), and the

³¹ Extension of social security coverage in Ghana and Senegal, SPROUT, pp.3-4

³² UNICEF-SRO Dakar Social budget, PRODOC, pp.2-3.

³³ Ibid, p.4.

Union national des cooperatives agricoles (UNCAS) and other stakeholders are familiar with social security issues, notably the results of the SPER and the feasibility study.³⁴

Indicators were also: national legislation and decrees in application of the WAEMU regulatory framework; number of fully operational social security schemes databases; increasing level of integration and institutionalization of national health mutual regulation mechanisms; collection and analysis of management and financial data on the basis of tools such as the MAS software.³⁵

Yet, progress at project level has hardly been reported on the basis of these indicators. STEP-Belgium progress reports covered the global components as well as activities in Benin, Burkina Faso, Democratic Republic of Congo and Rwanda in addition to those in Senegal and were exclusively activity and output oriented. Only SIDA-funded project reporting recorded progress towards ILO social security P&B outcomes and indicators, DWCP immediate outcomes and priorities as well as against project-level indicators of achievement.

There have been no project level evaluations during the evaluation reference period although the SIDA-funded project has been reviewed as part of the Review of the ILO-SIDA partnership programme.

Outputs and outcomes

ILO support resulted in the following outputs and outcomes:

- the adoption in 2006 of the National Strategy on Social Protection and Risk Management i.e. pillar 3 of the PRS;³⁶
- a feasibility study and pilot health insurance scheme for informal workers in the transport sector in collaboration with both union representatives and *le Comité National du Dialogue Social (CNDS)* i.e. the PRODIAF-STEP collaboration;³⁷
- technical assistance and management advice to the UM-PAMECAS health mutual covering about 200,000 individuals;³⁸
- a well-tested framework for a poverty impact assessment tool to be used in conjunction with the quantitative model developed by the ILO for the costing of basic social protection benefits;
- a study carried out in collaboration with the GENDER bureau to better understand the problem of the access to health care by women in the agricultural sector, examine the role of women and men to take this into account in the design of the social protection scheme, to develop indicators of measurement which permit to follow the gender dimension in the framework of the scheme and strengthen the capacity of the

³⁴ Extension of social security coverage in Ghana and Senegal, SPROUT, pp.7-8.

³⁵ STEP Belgium Phase II, PRODOC, pp.33, 39.

³⁶ STEP Belgium Phase II, Annual progress report 2007, p.22.

³⁷ STEP Belgium Phase II, PRODOC, p.47

³⁸ STEP Belgium Phase II, Annual progress report 2007, p.24

constituents and national policy makers to take informed decisions concerning the design of the scheme for agricultural workers and their families taking into account gender-related issues and concerns;³⁹

- a report (in English and French) on the findings of the poverty impact study that contains concrete policy proposals for Senegal which can form the basis of a coordinated social protection strategy aimed at alleviating and reducing poverty;
- a sound knowledge base that can be used for more in-depth technical cooperation activities, as well as for the formulation and implementation of cash-transfer policies in Senegal and low-income countries at large;⁴⁰
- a Social Protection Expenditure and Performance Review (SPER);
- a preliminary feasibility study with recommendations on the design and process of implementation of a national health insurance scheme for the rural population (including how to accommodate low, random and seasonal income and organize premium collection for individuals with non-pecuniary income);
- a study on the financial set up of the health insurance scheme with identification of the possible sources of financing at the local and regional levels;
- the description of a future shared management unit (outsourcing of technical management of the scheme) and design of a management process and tools (including a proposed Insurance Management Insurance Unit) for the health insurance scheme covering workers in the agricultural sector⁴¹;
- technical assistance leading to adoption of regulatory framework of WAEMU mutual health insurance schemes⁴²;
- preliminary support to the establishment of a contractual approach with the health sector at the national level.⁴³ An outline document for contracts has been written and is being reviewed by the Ministry of Health's legal department for final validation.

The legal texts that set up the health insurance scheme covering workers in the agricultural sector have been adopted by the Government, the State's contribution has been calculated and projected for several years in order to verify that it is coherent with the government budget. These projections have been carried out and validated by the Ministry of Finance. The trial phase of the scheme is ready to start in two pilot regions (Saint Louis and Tambacounda regions).⁴⁴

³⁹ Extension of social security coverage in Ghana and Senegal, PRODOC extension.

⁴⁰ Poverty impact assessment of a basic social protection benefit package for a low-income country, PRODOC, p.5.

⁴¹ Extension of social security coverage in Ghana and Senegal, final progress report, p.3.

⁴² STEP Belgium Phase II, Annual progress report 2007, p.25

⁴³ Extension of social security coverage in Ghana and Senegal, PRODOC extension, p.5.

⁴⁴ Extension of social security coverage in Ghana and Senegal, final progress report, p.16

ILO support has also aimed to build the capacity of national partners by, for instance, organizing a workshop on the strategies for social security coverage extension in Dakar in November 2008. Senegalese stakeholders were also among the group of 47 participants from French-speaking countries who took part in the QUATRRAIN Africa workshop held in August 2009 in Bujumbura.⁴⁵ In total more than 200 representatives of national and local actors [members of the *Commission Nationale du Dialogue Social*, the *Conseil National de Concertation et de Cooperation des Ruraux* (CNCR), and the *Union nationale des cooperatives agricoles* (UNCAS) and other stakeholders] have been trained in follow-up to the SPER.⁴⁶

Issues and constraints

Some key elements of the technical and financial set up of the health insurance scheme for agricultural workers and their families depend upon approval by local / national authorities and financial partners:

- the financial set up which relies on the feasibility of several sources of funding (apart from the contributions of the members): subsidies from the agro-industry, budget allocations from local and central governments ; international solidarity; etc ;
- the design of a coherent framework at the national and local levels for the contracting process between a proposed Insurance Management Unit and the healthcare sector.⁴⁷
- This limited considerably ILO's influence on the implementation, quality and effectiveness of the scheme designed.

The ILO's main constraint in the elaboration of the feasibility studies for the agricultural health mutual scheme has been the cancellation of the contracts of the consultants who were recruited by the *Conseil National de Concertation et de Cooperation des Ruraux* (CNCR to undertake the feasibility studies targeting the pilot areas (region of Saint Louis and of Tambacounda). The tasks were in the end completed by STEP Senegal and the CNCR.⁴⁸

Additional issues and constraints have been a delay in the putting into place of funds allocated by the State to the scheme due to difficulties of treasury in 2008; difficulties in the relations between the government (namely the Ministry of agriculture) and the CNCR. These issues were solved thanks to meetings organized with the minister of budget, reallocation of funds to the 2009 budget and efforts towards the restoration of the confidence between the government and the CNCR.⁴⁹

⁴⁵ QUATRRAIN AFRICA Interim Narrative Report for the period 1 July 2008 to 31 December 2009, pp.6-8

⁴⁶ Extension of social security coverage in Ghana and Senegal, final progress report, pp.23-24

⁴⁷ Extension of social security coverage in Ghana and Senegal, PRODOC extension, p.11

⁴⁸ Extension of social security coverage in Ghana and Senegal, final progress report, pp.33-34.

⁴⁹ Ibid., p.34.

Final observations/lessons learned

The implementation of a social protection system for workers in the agricultural sector received some acknowledgement because it is coherent with the national social protection strategy of Senegal. It is one of the main actions which would permit to increase significantly the level of social security coverage in Senegal, especially in the area of health insurance. It is also coherent with the national social protection strategy as it is based on a mechanism of insurance and not social assistance to cover the populations concerned.⁵⁰

The involvement of different actors in the design process of the scheme contributed to ensuring that the main beneficiaries understood the project and accepted ownership. The target population was heavily involved in defining the benefit package, the different mechanisms for scheme membership and collection of contributions through the intervention of national and local level agricultural organizations. This involvement required close working relationships which were important and took a long time to build. Yet, efforts in this area ensured the strong implication of the professional agricultural organizations and the framework structures and the local elected officials and were thus well worth making.

SENEGAL P&B Indicators

2006-07

Outcome 3a.1: Improved policies and strategies to extend social protection to all

Indicator 3a.1 (i): Member States adopt or implement effective policies and strategies to extend social security coverage

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Senegal	Financial and technical support to the National Committee for Social Dialogue on the improvement of social protection. Contributed to the elaboration of the strategy and worked to enhance awareness and political support of related actors for the extension of protection to non-covered segments of the population. Provided a feasibility study for the implementation of two insurance schemes for the transport sector and for rural workers.	Senegal: Adopted the National Strategy on Social Protection and Risk Management in the third pillar of the PRSP 2. Piloted a health insurance system for informal workers in the transport sector.	√

Indicator 3a.1 (iii) Member States improve their capacities to combine actions on social security and safety and health in the informal economy and rural areas

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Senegal	Provided knowledge, technology and training materials.	Senegal: Officials of the <i>Caisse nationale de sécurité sociale</i> were trained as trainers for the SOLVE Programme (workers' health promotion and well-being at work programme).	√

⁵⁰ Ibid., pp.37-39.

Outcome 3a.2: Better instruments and tools for policy analysis and formulation and good governance in social protection

Indicator 3a.2 (i): Member States generate comprehensive data for policy formulation, including gender-sensitive surveys, and disseminate results

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Senegal	Completed the Social Protection Expenditure and Performance Review.	Senegal: Social security schemes and national institutions generated data for the evaluation of the social protection environment for policy formulation.	

Indicator 3a.2(iii): Member States adopt new tools and enhance national capacity for good governance through capacity-building programmes for staff of social security institutions, social partner organizations and government ministries

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Senegal	Provided technical support for the assessment and recommendations done by social partners, government and civil society. Enhanced the capacities of officials. Supported the inclusion of gender analysis in feasibility studies conducted on health insurance schemes.	Enhanced capacity of officials from public institutions and social partners to promote social protection in health. Submitted a draft project on the regulation of mutual health insurance schemes for adoption by the Committee and Council of Ministers of West African Economic and Monetary Union (WAEMU–UEMOA).	√

2008-09

Outcome 3a.1: Increase member State capacity to develop policies focused on improving social security systems

Indicator 3a.1 (i): Number of member States that apply ILO technical assistance to generate comprehensive social security data

IR Country (GB.307/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.307/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.307/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Senegal	Collected and disseminated social security data through the ILO's social security inquiry for national policy formulation.	Country generated social security statistics for inquiry on social security.	

Indicator 3a.1 (ii): Number of member States that apply ILO technical assistance to develop social security policies that extend coverage to more and/or increase the level or range of benefits

IR Country (GB.307/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.307/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.307/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)

Senegal	Provided technical assistance for implementation of <i>TransVie</i> . Trained technical experts and members of the scheme and supported computerization of management.	Senegal: Under guidance of Ministry of Health and Ministry of Transport, workers from road transport sector set up mutual health insurance (<i>TransVie</i>) covering primary and secondary health care (4,000 beneficiaries in July 2009).	√
---------	--	--	---

Desk country case study – Mozambique

Country context⁵¹

In the aftermath of the 1992 peace accords, Mozambique has steadily recovered from the 1980s civil war. It now enjoys both political stability and strong economic growth. It however remains susceptible to natural disasters including floods, cyclones and repeated drought in the South. National infrastructure is still poor, particularly in terms of roads and access to essential social services, and while progress towards meeting the Millennium Development Goals and the country's PRSP objectives has been recorded in recent years, Mozambique still features amongst the poorest countries in the world.

The Mozambican population is predominantly rural, with highly limited access to health services. In addition, the quality of many basic services is compromised in part because of limited facilities and further exacerbated by the AIDS pandemic, weak institutional capacity for service delivery, planning, monitoring and evaluation further impact negatively on social security access and coverage. Access to food is a major determinant of food insecurity and according to the Baseline Survey 2006, over a third of Mozambican households are food insecure.

Responsibility for implementing social assistance programmes remains with the Ministry of Women and Social Welfare and its implementing body, the National Institute for Social Welfare (INAS), which currently runs five key programmes: the (i) Food Subsidy, (ii), Direct Social Welfare, (iii) Social Benefit for Work, (iv) Income Generation, and (v) Community Development programmes. While the first two programmes mentioned target individuals unable to carry out productive activities, the three other programmes target the most vulnerable who are able to engage in some form of activity for their own support.

A new Social Protection Law was approved and ratified by Parliament in 2007. This law defines the legal basis for social protection and sets out the overall structure of the social protection system, whereby social protection interventions fall into three categories: basic social protection (under the responsibility of the Ministry of Women and Social Welfare, MMAS), compulsory social security (under the responsibility of the Ministry of Labour, MINTRAB) and complementary social security. Both MMAS and MINTRAB are in the process of creating the regulations and defining strategies to implement the new law. A key element for the successful expansion of social protection coverage in Mozambique will be the development of comprehensive solutions, taking into account the national context and the

⁵¹ The country context narrative borrowed heavily from the UN joint programme document "background, context and situation analysis" section, pp.5-8.

right combination of instruments (i.e. cash and in kind transfers, social insurance and universal benefits).

There is a need to upgrade skills and knowledge among major stakeholders on social protection issues, the role and potential of each scheme and their linkages and their contribution to the extension of social protection in the fight against poverty, while acknowledging and assessing existing social action performance and costs to better map social protection interventions.

Strategic framework for government-led efforts and initiatives for the extension of social security coverage to date

Before 2006, the policy framework for social protection was largely undefined: social protection legislation focused more on social insurance than social assistance. In 2006, the objective of protecting and supporting vulnerable population groups (children, women, disabled people, and older people) was introduced to the PRSP/PARPA Progress Assessment Framework. The Government's Five Year Programme also included, as its fourth objective, "to proceed with activities for social assistance to vulnerable people living in extreme poverty"⁵².

The PARPA II (2006-2009) stresses the importance of human capital in achieving sustained poverty reduction, focusing particularly on the areas of education, health, water and sanitation, HIV/AIDS, social action, and housing. PARPA II further includes a target for the expansion of state social assistance within the human capital pillar. Governmental commitment to the social protection agenda has been reiterated through Mozambican involvement in the Livingstone Call for Action addressing the issue of Basic Social Protection.⁵³

Through the Livingstone Call for Action, the Government of Mozambique (along with those of Ethiopia, Kenya, Lesotho, Madagascar, Malawi, Namibia, Rwanda, South Africa, Tanzania, Uganda, Zambia and Zimbabwe, together with Brazil, development partners, UN agencies and NGOs) noted, among other things, that:

- "Social protection is both a rights and an empowerment agenda [item].
- The Universal Declaration of Human Rights and other human rights conventions establish that social security for all and social protection for the vulnerable is a basic human right.
- The guarantee of basic social protection strengthens the social contract between the state and citizens, enhancing social cohesion.
- Considerable evidence exists that social transfers have played a key role in reducing poverty and promoting growth.
- A sustainable basic package of social transfers is affordable within current resources of governments and international development partners.

⁵² UN joint programme on access to safety nets, PRODOC, p.20.

⁵³ Ibid, p.9.

- Transfers, when complemented with other social services, are a way to directly reduce poverty and inequality.
- Addressing generalised insecurity and inequality through social protection is proven to be an integral part of the growth agenda, particularly when provided alongside services promoting economic activity.
- The provision of cash directly to poor people enhances economic growth. Transfers are used for both investment and consumption.
- The provision of transfers increases human capital by helping people to keep healthy educate their children, and support HIV/AIDS affected families.
- Transfers can stimulate local markets, benefiting the whole communities.”⁵⁴

The signatories of the Call called for:

- “Social transfer programmes, including the social pension and social transfers to vulnerable children, older persons and people with disabilities and households to be a more utilised policy option in African countries.
- National and international commitment to social protection, and to the building of consensus within different Ministries and institutional coordination in order to agree national plans.”⁵⁵

Finally, the UNDAF (2006-2009) for Mozambique features outcomes on social security, namely Outcome 2, “increased access to and use of quality basic services and social protection for the most disadvantaged populations, particularly children, youth and women, to reduce their vulnerability by 2009;” and Outcome 2. 5, “social protection safety nets for the most disadvantaged are strengthened and expanded”⁵⁶.

ILO social security interventions and means of action at country level

ILO social security interventions’ means of actions at country-level during the evaluation reference period have been:

- (i) technical assistance (i.e. assistance to ministries for the elaboration of a Basic Social Security Strategy; assistance to Local Economic Development Agencies (LEDAs) in their efforts to introduce social protection mechanisms into local development strategy in the Province of Sofala e.g. help in providing access to LEDA members to savings schemes and health care; legal assistance for the drafting of national regulatory policy documents);
- (ii) research and policy development (i.e. research and technical reports on national cash transfers mechanisms targeting the disabled and elderly with DFID, Netherlands and UNICEF; and options to mitigate the impact of the 2007-08 food crisis and design social assistance programmes for social inclusion); and

⁵⁴ The Livingston Call for Action, available at http://www.undp-povertycentre.org/doc_africa_brazil/Livingstone-call-for-action.pdf (accessed April 16, 2010).

⁵⁵ Ibid.

⁵⁶ UN joint programme on access to safety nets, PRODOC, p.2.

(iii) capacity building of the National Institute of Social Security and other national partners and constituents (e.g. Ministry of Women and Social Welfare-MMAS) to for instance improve management and delivery effectiveness of Food Subsidy Programme (PSA); QUATRIN Africa....⁵⁷

The means of action have played out within the frameworks of the (ILO component of US \$ 780, 178) UN joint programme on access to safety nets implemented (with collaboration from UNICEF and WFP) since September 2008; the US\$ 3,948,279 RBSA German-funded regional QUATRIN Africa project⁵⁸, and the inter-regional Strategies and Tools against social Exclusion and Poverty/Portugal (STEP/ Portugal) projects country activities implemented since 1999 with a total budget of US\$ 5, 022, 884 including allocations to global and inter-regional components.⁵⁹

The UN joint programme aims to deliver the following key results:

- (i) “Stronger common vision on Social Protection created and reinforced in the context of PRSP/PARPA II (National Action Plan for the Reduction of the Absolute Poverty).
- (ii) Increased government capacity for planning and budgeting for the expansion of coverage of social protection programmes.
- (iii) Key social assistance programmes evaluated and informing the development of the National Intervention Strategy for Social Protection by the National Institute for Social Action (INAS).
- (iv) Capacity of Provincial (and district) authorities increased in Sofala Province for greater coordination and implementation of social safety net programmes.
- (v) Selected target groups in Sofala Province have access to a comprehensive set of basic services: (a) Orphaned and Vulnerable Children, (b) AIDS affected households, (c) Vulnerable households able to work.”⁶⁰

The role of ILO in the Programme has involved pursuit of both national and provincial level goals. At National level, the ILO, in close collaboration with WFP and UNICEF, has focused its support on:

- (i) promoting the harmonization and dissemination of the Social Protection Law;
- (ii) the development of the National Strategy for Basic Social Protection, and a comprehensive review of the INAS programmes (Income Generation and Social Benefit for Work);
- (iii) the development of an information management plan in the area of social protection i.e. a common system of information for INAS programmes; and
- (iv) the development of regulations regarding the self-employed and integration of community-based approaches to improve the working conditions of small farmers.

⁵⁷ GESS, Social security Profile, Mozambique; and STEP/Portugal- Phase II, PRODOC, p.7.

⁵⁸ For a description of QUATRIN see country case study for Zambia, p.

⁵⁹ Most ILO activities under the UN joint programme are implemented by STEP/Portugal staff.

⁶⁰ UN joint programme on access to safety nets, PRODOC, p.3.

At Provincial level, ILO has focused its support on (i) capacity development of Local Economic Development Agency in Sofala to provide access by its members to savings schemes and health care, (ii) the provision of training by the Ministry of Labour to improve working and living conditions of small farmers. These activities focused on informal sector workers complement basic social assistance interventions supported by WFP and UNICEF for the most vulnerable households unable to work.⁶¹

The ILO contributed to policy development for social protection, revision of existing social protection schemes to better target the most vulnerable groups and expand coverage; and improvements in targeting, monitoring and evaluation, quality assurance as well as service delivery.⁶²

Rationale for choice of country for ILO support

As a UN specialized agency, the ILO is required to organize the support it provides to member States in the framework of the UNDAF. ILO country programme outcome for Mozambique, MOZ106- Social protection policies and strategies reviewed and implemented to ensure greater coverage of target groups both in the informal and formal economies, further commits the ILO to action on the social front in Mozambique.

From a regional perspective, the DWCP regional outcome RAF 151- Improve the capacities of African member States and constituents to develop coherent national social security strategies, calls for ILO capacity building interventions in the area of social security in all African countries and thus in Mozambique.

Why these forms and combinations of interventions? Why now?

One UN joint programme-related interventions' (and thus STEP/Portugal main country-level activities and interventions) type, nature and timing all stem from the work plan agreed with UNICEF, the programme's coordinating agency.⁶³

QUATRIN is expected to result in strengthened governance which is understood as a *sine qua non* condition for enhanced coverage and effectiveness of schemes and systems, and, by the same token, the aforementioned outcomes (whether they be One UN and UNDAF outcomes or ILO regional and country programme-level outcomes).

Key performance indicators to monitor and/or evaluate/ evaluability

At UN-level, the ILO reports on activities as agreed in the UN Joint Programme monitoring and evaluation plan. In particular, an annual progress review against the expected programme results is to be conducted, together with the Government and other UN agencies involved in the implementation of the programme. A final review of the UNDAF will be conducted at the end of the joint programme, and will mainly draw from the annual review and the end-of-programme evaluations.

⁶¹ Ibid., p.19.

⁶² UN joint programme on access to safety nets, PRODOC, p.4.

⁶³ Ibid, p.19.

The ILO, along with each other participating UN agency, prepares narrative reports, using the UNDG Standard Progress Report at the time stated in the Letter of Understanding. Each agency also prepares financial reports in line with their financial rules, regulations and operational policy guidance. UNICEF consolidates the financial and substantive reports into a single comprehensive Standard Progress Report, and submits it to the Steering Committee for review.

The Joint Programme annual and final reviews are based primarily on assessing progress against the results and activities set out in the Joint Programme logical framework.⁶⁴

Within the ILO, progress against plans and lists of activities completed as part of the STEP/Portugal project national component and outputs produced are detailed in progress reports. However, because the project is multi-country, the evaluators found no clear monitoring and evaluation framework and no country-specific indicators of progress.⁶⁵

Outputs and outcomes

ILO support to Mozambique is reported to have resulted in the following outputs and outcomes:

- a comprehensive evaluation of the food subsidy programme, Programa de Subsídio Alimentario (PSA) and a review of INAS development programmes;
- a technical report on the INAS information system;
- the drafting of a variety of national policy documents (e.g. *Technical foundation of national basic social protection strategy in Mozambique*; *Basic Social Protection Strategy in Mozambique*; and *Basic Social Protection Regulation in Mozambique*)
- various publications including “Social Protection Options for Mitigating the Impact of High Food Price on the Most Vulnerable Population in Mozambique” updated in July 2008
- Participation in the Social Action Group of Mozambique’s current PRSP (PARPA II), which reportedly resulted in the inscription of social protection issues in the PARPA II assessment documents;
- coordinated ILO involvement in the elaboration of Mozambique’s UNDAF 2010-2011; social protection extension continues to be one of results contemplated in the country UN Aid Framework;
- participation and public presentations on different discussions taking place in Mozambique, such as the “*Political Dialogue of the Parliamentarians from Angola and Mozambique on Poverty and Social Transfers*” or the “*National Old Age Conference*”. The ILO has also been an active part in the national debate surrounding the impact of economic crisis on the most vulnerable.⁶⁶

⁶⁴ UN joint programme on access to safety nets, PRODOC, p.21-22.

⁶⁵ See Action Plan for the year 2009- STEP Portugal in Mozambique.

⁶⁶ STEP Portugal inputs to the 2009 SEC/SOC delivery report, p.1.

- capacity building of National Social Security Institute (INSS) staff: in this respect an important training effort was made regarding the social security fundamentals, covering a vast array of INSS staff, at a national and provincial level, comprising managers and technical staff. In addition, INSS staff also profited from capacity building activities specifically on social insurance.⁶⁷ An example of such training activities would include a workshop organized in November 2009 in Maputo and attended by 31 INSS staff. Topics for the workshop were funding, administration and management of social security systems; social security regulation in Mozambique and the extension of social security coverage; global comparative analysis. There has been a brief introduction to pension reforms in Latin America.
- key social protection policy documents translated from English to Portuguese.

Country-specific knowledge generated also included the Social protection and Local Economic Development manual for Mozambique, and the Social protection principles manual for Mozambique. Additional capacity has been built as part of the QUATRAN Africa project. A March 2010 workshop on actuarial reports was held in Maputo for the benefit of 40 stakeholders from Portuguese-speaking QUATRAN Africa countries including Mozambique.⁶⁸

Issues and constraints

ILO-level progress reports were mostly STEP/Portugal reports and were focused on the global as opposed to country level developments. They mentioned neither issues nor constraints specific to Mozambique.

Final observations/lessons learned

See above.

MOZAMBIQUE P&B Indicators

2006-07

Outcome 3a.1: Improved policies and strategies to extend social protection to all

Indicator 3a.1 (i): Member States adopt or implement effective policies and strategies to extend social security coverage

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Mozambique	Assistance and training on the design and implementation of the national policy and the scheme for own-account workers. Support to coordinate the implementation of the new law on social protection.	Mozambique: Improved its policy on basic social protection (non-contributory) and social insurance.	√

⁶⁷ Ibid, p.2.

⁶⁸ QUATRAN AFRICA Interim Narrative Report for the period 1 July 2008 to 31 December 2009, pp.6-8.

Indicator 3a.1 (iii) Member States improve their capacities to combine actions on social security and safety and health in the informal economy and rural areas

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Mozambique	Local-level technical support and training to develop and implement integrated approaches and tools (WIND, CIARIS) linking access to social and labour protection with access to jobs.	Mozambique: Improved its strategy and tools for integrating local-level social protection, occupational health and safety, and income-generating activities.	

Indicator 3a.1 (iv) Member States test innovative approaches to integrate social protection with local development and income-generating activities in order to reduce poverty, gender inequality and social exclusion

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Mozambique	National level: Assistance and training for the design and implementation of the national policy on basic social protection and the scheme for own-account workers. Support to coordinate implementation of the new law on social protection. Support to informal economy organizations on HIV/AIDS prevention and impact mitigation. Local level: Support to develop and implement integrated approaches linking access to social and labour protection with access to jobs.	Mozambique: Improved strategy for integrating local-level social protection, occupational health and safety, and income-generating activities.	

Outcome 3a.2: Better instruments and tools for policy analysis and formulation and good governance in social protection

Indicator 3a.2 (i): Member States generate comprehensive data for policy formulation, including gender-sensitive surveys, and disseminate results

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Mozambique	Assisted in the formulation of the framework for data collection on social security and analysis of the data.	Mozambique: The Social Insurance System and Social Assistance System improved their capacities for the generation of social security statistics.	

2008-09

Outcome 3a.1: Increase member State capacity to develop policies focused on improving social security systems

Indicator 3a.1 (i): Number of member States that apply ILO technical assistance to generate comprehensive social security data

IR Country (GB.307/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.307/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.307/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Mozambique	Collected and disseminated social security data through the ILO's social security inquiry for national policy formulation.	Country generated social security statistics for inquiry on social security.	√

Indicator 3a.1 (ii): Number of member States that apply ILO technical assistance to develop social security policies that extend coverage to more and/or increase the level or range of benefits

IR Country (GB.307/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.307/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.307/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Mozambique	Provided training in basic principles of social protection and technical assistance on draft strategy and held consultations. Collaborated with partners on a paper on social protection. Held public discussions on the impact of the economic crisis on the most vulnerable segments of the population.	Mozambique developed national basic social protection strategy and strengthened capacity of National Institute for Social Action to implement, manage, monitor and evaluate social protection programmes.	√

Outcome 3a.2: Improve member States capacity to manage social security schemes and implement policies focused on improving social security systems

Indicator 3a.2 (i): Number of member States that either apply ILO technical assistance or tools to give effect to the principles of ILO standards, including the tripartite governance of social security schemes, or use of tools to increase administrative efficiency and effectiveness or to improve financial sustainability

IR Country (GB.307/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.307/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.307/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Mozambique	Developed the Learning and Resources Centre on Social Inclusion, an Internet-based platform that provides documentation and facilitates collaborative work and knowledge sharing on social protection and social inclusion. Created and updated the Information Centre on Social Protection web site, in partnership with Community of Portuguese-speaking Countries.	Country used Learning and Resources Centre on Social Inclusion platform to support policy implementation and training of national actors. Country utilized Information Centre on Social Protection to implement social security policies.	

Indicator 3a.2 (ii): Number of member States in which officials trained by the ILO for good governance, planning and management of social security, enter or remain in, the employment of social policy-making bodies

IR Country (GB.307/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.307/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.307/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Mozambique	Provided capacity building through QUATRAN Africa programme	Members of tripartite governing bodies (trustees, directors, etc.) and pension fund regulators and supervisors were trained in financial governance of social security schemes.	

Desk country case study – Bosnia and Herzegovina

Country context

Bosnia and Herzegovina consists of two entities, the *Republika Srpska* and the Federation of Bosnia and Herzegovina. The Federation is divided into cantons; the city of Brcko is also a separate administrative unit. In the Federation, much of social security is financed, administered and sometimes even regulated at canton-level.⁶⁹

The (old-age, disability, and survivor) pension system of Bosnia and Herzegovina consists of two social insurance schemes financed through contributions to two separate funds (one for the Federation, the other for the *Republika Srpska*); these schemes are regulated by separate legislations.⁷⁰

In the aftermath of the December 1995 Dayton Peace Accords, and in a context dominated by post-war reconstruction, planned-to-market economy transition reforms (and further reforms in the framework of talks with the EU on the Stabilization and Accession Agreement started in 2005), the Bosnian system of social protection experienced an enormous demand for various types of benefits, the financing of which was far more costly than budget capacity allowed.⁷¹ The demand prompted yet another round of reforms aiming at ensuring schemes' financial sustainability.

In the Federation of Bosnia and Herzegovina, in the absence of an institutional framework for social dialogue, the 1998 Law on Pension and Disability reform – a comprehensive law increasing the retirement age, counting more years of work in the benefit formula and reducing pension adjustments - was devised by the Office of the High Representative, the highest political authority in the Federation, and the Labour Ministry⁷², without tripartite consultation or agreement. As of 2008, Federation social partners remained excluded of the management of pensions schemes.

⁶⁹ ILO: *Social Security Spending in South Eastern Europe: A Comparative Review*, SRO Budapest 2005.

⁷⁰ ILO: Report on the Pension reform in Bosnia Herzegovina: First assessment, Budapest, 2009.

⁷¹ DWCP Bosnia and Herzegovina 2006-2007, p.1.

⁷² ILO: *Social dialogue on pension reform in South Eastern Europe: A survey of the social partners*, SRO Budapest, 2008, p.9.

In contrast, in *Republika Srpska*, both the trade union confederation and employers' association reported playing a major role in the drafting of the pension legislation passed in 2001 and 2003. The first law restructured the contribution base and rate. The second dealt with the pensions rights of workers in insolvent firms which owed contributions on their behalf.⁷³

The case of the *Republika Srpska* suggests that there is an untapped potential for social dialogue in the country that could be exploited in the formulation, amendments to and adoption of further reforms aimed at ensuring social security schemes' financial sustainability for both *Republika Srpska* and the Federation of Bosnia Herzegovina.

Strategic framework for government-led efforts and initiatives for the extension of social security coverage to date

During the 2005-2008 programme cycles, the UNDAF articulated the major challenges for Bosnia and Herzegovina around three key outcomes, out of which the areas of a) governance and b) social protection, education and health are those which have been reflected in the DWCPs for 2006-2007 and 2008-2010.⁷⁴

The first (revised) National Development Strategy 2004-2007 (MTDS/PRSP) had three main policy goals a) create the conditions for sustainable and balanced economic development; b) reduce poverty by 20 percent, and c) accelerate EU integration. The new Country Development Strategy for 2008-2013 is articulated around similar goals.⁷⁵

ILO social security interventions and means of action at country level

ILO social security interventions' means of actions at country level during the evaluation reference period have been:

- (i) knowledge generation and dissemination (e.g. studies to document the state of affairs in the country in terms of disability pension and investigate the effectiveness of social dialogue for pension reforms through survey of workers, and translation of key textbook into Bosnian) ;
- (ii) research and policy development (e.g. identification and dissemination of new models, strategies and best practices for managing social security schemes and to improve the skills of schemes managers)
- (iii) technical assistance (i.e. legal advice/ comparative analyses of application of Convention No 102 and Convention No 121); and
- (iv) capacity building (e.g. training of social partners and national pension scheme constituents in particular; policy seminars on the current policies vis-à-vis persons with disabilities).

⁷³ Ibid.

⁷⁴ DWCP Bosnia and Herzegovina 2006-2007, p. 2.

⁷⁵ Development Strategy of Bosnia Herzegovina available at http://www.dep.gov.ba/dwnld/CDS_FINAL_DRAFT_in_English_Jan2010.pdf (accessed April 15, 2010).

These means of action played out within the frameworks of (i) three French-financed regional technical cooperation projects aimed at strengthening social protection governance and social dialogue in South Eastern Europe and empowering national pension schemes' constituents to participate in debate surrounding restructuring of selected benefits, and (ii) technical missions leading to the elaboration of comparative analyses/reports on the application of Conventions 102 and 121. The first two French-financed projects had a combined budget of US\$ 1, 776,670 and were implemented between 2002 and 2008. The follow-up regional \$170,877 project's activities were completed in March 2010. All three projects' activities in Bosnia were implemented by SRO Budapest in collaboration with the ILO national social security coordinator.

In terms of governance, ILO interventions have been geared toward improving relevant staff capacities to use statistical information to assess the performance of schemes and devise reforms, to promote social dialogue as a basis for scheme restructuring, and to strengthen regional cooperation in scheme administration.

Rationale for choice of country for ILO support

According to both DWCPs for Bosnia, and thus at the request of Bosnian constituents, ILO support is to concentrate, within the overarching theme of "Decent Work for All," on three priorities in Bosnia and Herzegovina of which priority 3, "improved social security policy development."⁷⁶

For the 2006-07 biennium, social security outcomes under priority 3 were:

- Outcome 1: social partners participate regularly in the governing boards of tripartite social security institutions, including the Social Insurance Institute⁷⁷, and actively promote transparent, effective, and efficient social security administration.
- Outcome 2: social partners actively participate in the debate on the forthcoming pension reform and promote ILO minimum standards.⁷⁸
- For 2008-2010, DWCP social security outcomes were:
 - Outcome 1: pension reforms are agreed based on tripartite consultations, following the guidance of ILO Convention No. 102 (BIH 151)
 - Outcome 2: improved mechanisms of social security governance are in place with the active participation of social partners (BIH 152).

The main motivation for ILO support to Bosnia and Bosnian pension scheme constituents in particular has been to cast light on the weaknesses of alternatives to social security, especially the mandatory, privately-managed individual saving schemes that the World Bank has advocated as a remedy to weak public scheme governance. The ILO has therefore endeavoured, through its research and capacity building activities, to provide evidence of and

⁷⁶ DWCP Bosnia and Herzegovina 2006-2007, pp.3-4, and DWCP Bosnia and Herzegovina 2008-2010, pp.6-7.

⁷⁷ The Social insurance Institute is

⁷⁸ DWCP, 2006-2007.

educate policymakers on the lack of effectiveness of private schemes as a strategy to circumvent weaknesses in public governance and offer alternatives for reform.⁷⁹

Why these forms and combinations of interventions? Why now?

Interventions have been planned so as to contribute to DWCP outcomes. For the biennium 2006-07, and in pursuit of Outcome 1 “: social partners participate regularly in the governing boards of tripartite social security institutions, (...) and actively promote transparent, effective, and efficient social security administration,” training has been provided to social partners with the help of the ILO Budapest Handbook for Social Security Governance, translated into the official languages of Bosnia and Herzegovina. Training of national pension schemes’ constituents (to provide them with increased understanding of ILO minimum standards for social security, the determinants of successful social dialogue in neighbouring countries, and the recent experience of CEE countries with various types of reforms) has also been stepped up in pursuit of Outcome 2. Particular emphasis has been on training trade union members of the boards of social security institutions to improve governance of those institutions and as a result participate effectively in the pension debate and the reforms of the disability insurance system.

A national tripartite seminar was organised focusing on regional experience with different types of pension reforms, with Slovenia and Croatia as chosen alternative models.

ILO has continued its efforts during the 2008-09 period and provided assistance to the relevant stakeholders in taking the steps necessary for the establishment of tripartite boards or advisory groups in social security institutions at the request of national constituents.⁸⁰

Key performance indicators to monitor and /or evaluate/ evaluability

DWCP social security performance indicators for 2008-2010 are outcome indicators for outcomes 1 and 2.

For outcome 1, “pension reforms are agreed based on tripartite consultations, following the guidance of ILO Convention No. 102,” outcome indicators are:

- Necessary legislative amendment is made to allow social partners’ representation on the Board of social security schemes.
- Social partners are actively involved in the policy making and decision making process of pension reform.
- New pension law is adopted and implementation starts.

For outcome 2, “improved mechanisms of social security governance are in place with the active participation of social partners,” the outcome indicator is:

Tripartite boards of social security institutions are established.⁸¹

⁷⁹ Empowering national pension scheme constituents in South Eastern Europe, PRODOC, p.2.

⁸⁰ DWCP, 2008-2010.

⁸¹ DWCP 2008-2010.

The evaluation team was given no evaluation and reporting of progress was primarily activities and output-oriented, and regional- as opposed to country-level reporting. Reporting of progress was rarely against DWCP and P&B outcomes, with the exception of the final progress report for the “Empowering national pension scheme constituents in South Eastern Europe” project i.e. the most recent of the three French-financed technical cooperation projects.

Outputs and outcomes

ILO support to Bosnia has resulted in the following outputs and outcomes:

- a conference report on disability benefits published in 2006⁸²; the study provides evidence of and options to overcome challenges such as shift from medically defined approach to disability towards a focus on work capacity, disincentives to employment and return to work, and use of disability programmes for other social purposes including unemployment protection.
- a tripartite Bosnian delegation’s visit to Slovenia organized in December 2005 and aimed at discussing the example of Slovenia, a country with effective social dialogue and which succeeded in building strong consensus in favour of pension reform options.
- a 2008 survey of a sample of 43 officials of trade union confederations and employers’ organizations in the Stability Pact countries on social dialogue on pension reforms in South Eastern Europe which provides insights into the role of social dialogue in pension reforms as well as examines the institutional framework in which social dialogue on recent pension reform occurred.⁸³
- a report on the pension reform strategy published in 2009: the report retraces the situation in the aftermath of the adoption of Pension and Disability Insurance Act of 1998 and the 2000 amendments to the Act; describes the current system’s coverage, benefit level, contribution rates, and provides historical perspective on the pension reform as well as options for the way forward.⁸⁴

Relatively recent training sessions and ILO-supported meetings held included:

- a national Tripartite Seminar on Pension Reform, held 21-22 May 2007
- a public debate on the Draft Pension System Reform organized by a trade union, 17 December 2007 in Sarajevo
- a trade Union Roundtable on Pension Reform in February 2008

⁸² ILO: *From Disability Benefits to Gainful Employment: Conference report*, SRO Budapest, 2006.

⁸³ ILO: *Social dialogue on pension reform in South Eastern Europe: A survey of the social partners*, DIALOGUE Paper No. 20, Geneva, 2008.

⁸⁴ ILO: *Report on the Pension Reform in Bosnia Herzegovina: First assessment*, SRO Budapest, 2009.

- a capacity building workshop on “Social Security Governance: Practical Tools for Employers’ Representatives on Social Security Boards in Central and Eastern Europe”, held December 13-14, 2007, in Sofia Bulgaria
- actuarial training for the tripartite constituents in *Republika Srpska*, held 10-14 November 2008; training aimed to provide participants with knowledge of actuarial analytical tools for evaluating and formulating financial policies in social security institutions.
- a national tripartite seminar on Pension Reform, 19 December 2008

As a result of ILO support, Bosnia and Herzegovina pension schemes’ social partners developed organizational priorities for pension reform, and are more and more actively engaged in the current reform process. The developed proposals for the parametric reform of the first pillar, designed with technical assistance from the ILO social security national coordinator, could ensure financial sustainability for the years to come. Social partners are appreciative and who reported that at occasions other than ILO meetings, they have little chance to express their opinions, and get involved in the reform process.

Issues and constraints

According to ILO reporting, national and scheme level data on expenditure and contribution collection has proven particularly difficult to gather. As already mentioned, much of the country’s social security is financed, administered and sometimes even regulated at canton-level. Scheme authorities are numerous and sometimes did not elect to share available data with ILO dedicated staff. Also, most of the data from SPER-like studies initiated was not published as it differed significantly from similar statistics collected by the IMF, the World Bank and WHO and triangulation efforts did not succeed in doing away with incoherences and uncertainty in the results.

Final observations/lessons learned

No lessons learned were documented through reporting of progress.

BOSNIA

2006-07 P&B Indicators

Outcome 3a.1: Improved policies and strategies to extend social protection to all

Indicator 3a.1 (ii) Member States strengthen existing social security schemes through policies and strategies to ensure effectiveness and sustainability

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2)	ILO reported output (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output(GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Bosnia Herzegovina	Provided studies and technical advice on the Social Security Minimum Standards Convention, 1952 (No. 102). Held national tripartite seminars which contributed to this outcome.	Bosnia and Herzegovina: Designed a pension reform proposal that maintains the social solidarity elements in the pension system and expands coverage through a minimum, tax-funded benefit.	

Outcome 3a.2: Better instruments and tools for policy analysis and formulation and good governance in social protection

Indicator 3a.2(iii): Member States adopt new tools and enhance national capacity for good governance through capacity-building programmes for staff of social security institutions, social partner organizations and government ministries

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2)	ILO reported output (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output(GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Bosnia Herzegovina	<i>ILO social security governance handbook</i> translated into Bosnian. Social partners drew on good practices from the handbook in developing proposals.	Social partners developed proposals to improve scheme governance.	

Desk country case study – Ghana

Country context

The Ghanaian Social Security and National Insurance Trust (SSNIT), established in 1972, is the statutory public trust in charge of the National Pension Scheme, a contributory defined-benefit scheme providing benefits in the event of old age, invalidity, or in case of death of the breadwinner/contributor to the scheme. It is financed through contributions to the Social Security and Pensions Scheme Fund,⁸⁵ and has a registered membership of about one million.

The 2003 National Health Insurance Act introduced a compulsory social health insurance scheme covering all Ghanaian residents (i.e. formal private sector employees, civil servants, the self-employed, farmers, housewives, students, children, pensioners etc). The scheme has been legally effective since November 2004. It is operated through mutual and private health insurance schemes, and is supervised by the National Health Insurance Council (NHIC). A National Health Insurance Fund provides subsidy to district mutual health insurances. The sources of money of the Fund include a health insurance levy (VAT of 2.5per cent on selected goods and services), 2.5 per cent of each person's 17.5 per cent contribution to the Social Security and Pensions Scheme Fund, money allocated from the Parliament, as well as grants and donations. As of 2006, the scheme covered nearly 30 per cent of the total population (i.e. 20 per cent of some 20.5 million people as estimated from the 2000 Population and Housing Census).⁸⁶

⁸⁵ GESS, Social security profile , Ghana available at <http://www.socialsecurityextension.org/gimi/gess/ShowCountryProfile.do?cid=309&aid=2> (accessed April 14, 2010).

⁸⁶ Dr. Andreas Grüb: Ghana – Social Security Schemes for Health, Accra, 2007 available at <http://www.socialsecurityextension.org/gimi/gess/RessShowRessource.do?ressourceId=4872> (accessed April 14, 2010)

Strategic framework for government-led efforts and initiatives for the extension of social security coverage to date

The Ghana Growth and Poverty Reduction Strategy (GPRS) 2006-2009 highlights the commitment of the government to ensuring access to health care through the improvement of basic health care for the poor.⁸⁷ The strategies include “bridging gaps in access to health, nutrition, and family planning services, ensuring sustainable financing arrangement that protect the poor, and enhancing efficiency in service delivery”⁸⁸.

The current National Health policy document “Creating Wealth through Health” and current Programme of Work (2007-2011 POW) also set as an objective “to increase access to quality health, reproduction and nutrition services”⁸⁹. Finally, the main objective of improving maternal and child health is directly related to Millennium Development Goals 4 and 5.

Yet, despite increases in spending, Ghana still lags behind, based on international expectations of health outcomes. There have been improvements in many health indicators, including mortality and morbidity, however crude indicators demonstrate the need for substantial further improvements especially for the poor and especially in the areas of maternal and child health.⁹⁰ According to the World Health Report 2005, “three quarters of all neonatal deaths could be prevented if women were adequately nourished and received appropriate care during pregnancy, childbirth and the postnatal period.”⁹¹

ILO social security interventions and means of action at country level

ILO support to Ghana during the evaluation reference period has taken the form of:

- technical assistance (i.e. health budget advisory services; and an audit of the actuarial review of the Social Security and National Insurance Trust of Ghana);
- policy development (through the implementation of a Global Social Trust pilot initiative in the Dangwe West District/Conditional Cash Transfers for health to poor and pregnant women);
- knowledge generation, management and dissemination (i.e. the development of social health budgeting/policy and monitoring tools); and
- capacity building (i.e. training of 340 civil servants during seminars; also training workshop of Global Social Trust implementing partners (e.g. in October 2009) etc)

Two technical cooperation projects and two technical missions have been implemented between 2005 and 2009.

⁸⁷ Extending social security coverage in Ghana and Senegal, PRODOC extension, p.3.

⁸⁸ Ghana Poverty Reduction Strategy 2003-2005, *An agenda for growth and prosperity, Volume I: Analysis and policy statement*, Accra, 2003.

⁸⁹ GST pilot project, PRODOC p.28.

⁹⁰ Ibid., pp.6-7.

⁹¹ Ibid.

Technical missions involved (i) the provision of health budget advisory services in 2009 to assess the options for the extension of access to health services through the National Health Insurance System of Ghana, and (ii) ILO Financial and Actuarial Service (FACTS)'s audit of the actuarial review conducted in 2007 by the Social Security and National Insurance Trust of Ghana (SSNIT). These missions were financed through bilateral contributions from the Government of Ghana of US\$19,909 and US\$16,974 respectively.

Solidarité Syndicale, the NGO of the *Confédération syndicale indépendante* of Luxembourg (OGB-L), the International Labour Office (ILO) and the Government of Ghana represented by its Ministry of Health, have entered into an agreement to implement the Global Social Trust (GST) pilot project in the Dangwe West District of Ghana. This US\$376,414 pilot project launched in September 2009 and expected to end August 31, 2015 provides a conditional cash benefit to poor pregnant women and mothers with children under the age of five on the condition that they take up of maternal and child related health care services until the child reaches the age of 5 in the Dangwe West District. To this effect voluntary contributions are collected amongst members of the OGB-L in Luxembourg (*Solidarité Syndicale*, the NGO of the *Confédération Syndicale Indépendante* of Luxembourg). The aim is also to provide an incentive for pregnant women to register in the National Health Insurance Scheme and hence support the rapid extension of health insurance coverage in Ghana, and provide some cash income for the poorest families at a time when the children and women in the families are most vulnerable and thus have a direct positive impact on poverty and especially poverty-related maternal and child mortality and health problems. The level of the benefit has been tentatively set at an approximate amount of US\$ 10 per month.

The Ministry of Health is responsible for the provision of health services, which are financed by the Ministry of Labour.⁹² Before the benefits are paid out, community nurses check the health record books to verify that the required health services have been accessed. Pay centres receive the money to be disbursed, the registry of beneficiaries and the amount to be paid.

It is of course too soon to try assess both delivery quality and effectiveness, but it is clear that project delivery and effectiveness will ultimately depend on the availability of quality health services, coordination of information activities, proper record keeping at the health centres, trust and acceptance inspired by information materials, adequate data for beneficiary identification, compliance monitoring, benefits payments collection etc.⁹³

The US\$ 569,764 technical cooperation SIDA-financed project for the extension of social security coverage in Ghana and Senegal (implemented from February 2006 to September 2008 by SEC/SOC in collaboration with the Dakar Sub-regional Office)'s Ghanaian component aimed to design an updated social health budget and policy as well as a monitoring tool to evaluate the extent to which subsidised health insurance premiums are effective in facilitating access to health care and the delivery of quality care in Dangme West i.e. assess access to care – type and quality; the elasticity of demand; the views of insured members (e.g. whether subsidised members are stigmatised, quality of the care provided); the extent the different types of health services (out-patient, hospitalisation, consultations, etc.) are used according to age and sex; and the average cost of the types of health services used by

⁹² GST pilot project, PRODOC, p.31

⁹³ GST pilot project, PRODOC, annex 3, pp.17-19.

the subsidised and non-subsidised groups. It was also meant to provide support to the Global Social Trust pilot project regarding the design of the framework of the benefits, e.g. an empirical basis on the feasibility of an expansion of the pilot scheme to other eligible groups in the district⁹⁴, and eventually to other districts.

Rationale for choice of country for ILO support

The ILO has been assisting the Government of Ghana since 2002, through the provision of technical advice in the form of a national health budget; and advice on institutional structures, medium term financing and implementation of the National Health Insurance Scheme.

The ILO Social Security Department has elected to answer Government calls for additional assistance in their efforts to update and expand the Ghanaian health budget model so that it could serve as a tool for health policy planning, including detailed projections of gradually extending coverage to the poor under different scenarios.⁹⁵

An actuarial valuation was undertaken by the internal services of the SSNIT in 2007, and there is a legal requirement that an external and independent body should formally review and audit the valuation. The assistance of ILO's Financial and Actuarial Service has been requested in this connection.⁹⁶

The ILO has also been working on a small pre-pilot project in the Dangme West district to develop methodologies for identifying the poor and increasing their access to healthcare through the subsidizing of their health insurance premiums. The project was funded by the Government of the Netherlands and supported by the Government of the United Kingdom. Over a three-year period, i.e. from 2002 to 2005, this project reached between 3'000 and 4'000 individuals (around 3-4% of the district population) and granted them access to healthcare which they did not have before.⁹⁷ The Global Social Trust pilot project is now being implemented to sustain and broaden those benefits.

Why these forms and combinations of interventions? Why now?

Ghana is an ILO Decent Work Priority Country and the reduction of risk and vulnerability among the poorest (informal workers, children at risk from child labour, persons with disabilities and people living with HIV/AIDS) and the protection of their rights has been identified as one of the DWCP priorities.⁹⁸ Both Outcomes under this DWCP priority relate to the extension of social protection, namely:

⁹⁴ The Government of Ghana estimates that about 40 per cent of the population in Dangme West are eligible for subsidised benefits while only 10 per cent are included in the project for the time being.

⁹⁵ Extension of social security coverage in Ghana and Senegal, SPROUT, pp.2-3.

⁹⁶ Audit of the internal actuarial review of the SSNIT, Project summary, p.1.

⁹⁷ Global Social Trust pilot project, Information paper, p.3.

⁹⁸ Government of Ghana Ministry of Manpower, Youth and Employment; and the ILO: Decent Work Country Programme for Ghana (2006 – 2009).

- Outcome 3.1 - A measurable proportion of 20 per cent (1.2m) of the poorest women and men working in the informal economy cope better through health insurance and production interventions;
- Outcome 3.2 - Vulnerable children and orphans, those unable to work (the elderly, some PWDs) and PLWHAs and their households, access social protection and have their rights protected”.

The role of health insurance protection is clearly highlighted in Outcome 3.1.⁹⁹

From the regional perspective, the *Decent Work Agenda for Africa 2007-2015* agreed target that “All African countries adopt coherent national social security strategies, including for the introduction or extension of a basic social security package that includes essential health care, maternity protection, child support for school-age children, disability protection and a minimum pension¹⁰⁰” provides further motivation to ILO work in African countries and thus Ghana.

The forms of ILO interventions thus respond to Government direct requests for assistance, are integrated into the framework of the DWCP, and represent logical steps in furthering Government efforts to extend social health protection coverage (e.g. the extension of coverage of the National Health Insurance Scheme to all children decoupled from the requirement of parents to be insured in the scheme and the investigation of modalities of the introduction of this extension while preserving sustainability of the system).

Key performance indicators to monitor and /or evaluate

Key performance indicators at the project level for ILO interventions (and the SIDA-financed project in particular) are mostly indicators of achievement such as indicators of Government and national social partners take up on the results/outputs of the various ILO initiatives:

- “The Ghanaian government uses the health budget model as a dynamic diagnostic tool to support the implementation of the National Health Insurance and to extend health insurance coverage to the poor.”
- “The government, social partners and stakeholders of Ghana discuss the recommendations from the monitoring of the pre-pilot project in Dangme West and use them for further extending of such mechanisms to other groups of the population and other districts”
- “At least 20 government officials, members of employers and workers’ organisations and other stakeholders are familiar with the health budget model and the monitoring mechanisms as tools for health policy planning and the extension of social security.”¹⁰¹

The GST pilot project has a logical framework with stated “objectively verifiable objectives”, “sources of verification”, and “suppositions or hypotheses.” Objectively verifiable objectives

⁹⁹ Extending social security coverage in Ghana and Senegal, PRODOC extension, p.3.

¹⁰⁰ GST pilot project, PRODOC, p.7-8.

¹⁰¹ Extension of social security coverage in Ghana and Senegal, SPROUT, pp.7-8.

include amount of benefits delivered and number of members in the scheme meant to be verified thanks to operational audits, but also number of women who attend beneficiaries for, compliance rate, benefit collection rate, availability of information material and frequency of verification lists' submission to the project office.¹⁰²

Country-level progress has been reported (both in the form of narrative assessments and comparison of targets and actual) against P&B and DWCP outcomes as well as the project indicators mentioned above in the case of the SIDA-project.

As the implementation of the Global Social Trust pilot project started in September 2009, progress in meeting the projects objectives and targets has yet to be reported.

Outputs and outcomes

ILO support resulted in the following outputs and outcomes:

- an official ILO report on the audit of the internal actuarial valuation of SSNIT to ensure that the actuarial report produced by the Actuarial Department of SSNIT has duly respected and complied with ILO guidelines for the actuarial valuation of social security schemes as well as with ILO conventions and tripartite practice: "ILO/TF/Ghana/R.17 – Peer review of the fifth triennial actuarial valuation of the Social security and national Insurance Trust as at 31 December 2005"
- a report on the results of financial projections of the National Health Budget, Ministry of Health Budget and National Health Insurance System Budget of Ghana, based on an updated health budget model which was developed by the International Labour Office (ILO) in 2004 i.e. ILO/TF/Ghana/R.19 "financial analysis of the national public health budget and projections of reform options 2008-2018".
- a national health budget model developed and updated, delivered to the NHIC and the Ministry of Health and illustrated in the technical report entitled "Financial analysis of the national public health budget 2007-2016;,"
- financial analysis on the extension of coverage of the National Health Insurance Scheme to all children decoupled from the requirement of parents to be insured in the scheme through simulations of the health budget model: the findings are regrouped in a report to the government recommending that there be a phased introduction of this extension in order to ensure sustainability of the system (Ghana: Financial analysis of the extension of health insurance coverage to all children 0-18 years of age 2007-2016, Geneva, 2008).
- a district health budget model (as a component of the overall public health budget) developed and tested in Dangme West.
- the development of a district health insurance budgeting tool which provides operational governance tool: the tool will be used in the framework of the GST pilot project in Dangme West which should start delivering the first cash benefits in early 2010;

¹⁰² GST pilot project, PRODOC, pp.17-18.

- a survey on the utilisation of health insurance, in Dangme West district, to assess attitudes to health insurance and barriers to membership. The survey suggested some recommendations for improvement: a report was published in March 2007 (see ILO (2007): Performance indicators for District mutual health insurance schemes. Working paper) and presented and discussed at a national seminar in March 2007.
- a report on the framework for the delivery of benefits for the GST pilot project is designed (see ILO. A blue print for the implementation of the Global Social Trust pilot project in Dangme West District, Ghana: Targeting criteria, Qualifying Conditions, Benefit delivery and Monitoring mechanisms (mimeo))¹⁰³.

A seminar was held to present the initial outcome of the updated health budget model; and to train administrators from district health insurance schemes in the use of the performance indicators. Around 200 people attended the seminar, including representatives from the Ministries of Health, Manpower, and Finance; and the Ghana Health Service. Also present were over 140 representatives, one from each of the district health insurance schemes; representatives of the social partners and the development partners; NGOs; and other stakeholders.¹⁰⁴

Changes in national policies and practices (i.e. new policies adopted or policy reform; improved governance and sustainability of schemes) reported at the Governing Body level for 2008-09 as a result of ILO support were the following:

- “SSNIT improved financial governance of pension system, based on actuarial valuation using the ILO pension model. Financial governance of health insurance system improved through planning of expenditures and financing for the entire health care system in the medium term.”
- “enhanced capacity of ministry and health insurance scheme to use the ILO health budget model as a diagnostic tool for governance and policy design.”¹⁰⁵

Issues and constraints

The time needed to organize activities on the ground and to recruit qualified consultants was often underestimated.

There were a number of unforeseen developments which occurred and slowed down delivery on interventions. For example, the developer of the health insurance budgeting tools (MAS pilote and MAS gestion) left the ILO in 2007. This delayed the development and the delivery of the district budgeting tool.

The NHIC and the Ministry of Health have not always been working jointly and this has made it more challenging to obtain the relevant information from both sources.

While capacity has been built of a core group of national staff there is rotation of staff and this is a constraint as when the staff leave they do not always train the staff who are replacing them. The rotation of key national counterparts is a major constraint. In 2006, both the

¹⁰³ Extension of social security coverage in Ghana and Senegal, final progress report, pp.17-31.

¹⁰⁴ Ibid.

¹⁰⁵ GB.307/PFA/2.

Director General of the Ministry of Health and the leader of the Ghana Trades Union Congress changed positions. With the change of Government at the end of 2008, more movements among the policy makers followed.¹⁰⁶

Final observations/lessons learned

The fact that the ILO had provided support to the government of Ghana since 2002 and thus had already contacts within the Ministry of Health, within the National Health Insurance Council, and within the District mutual health insurance scheme in Dangme West helped the Office's efforts.

Experience has shown that ILO partners lack staff who are able to undertake the quantitative work in the Ministry of Health and the NHIC. The issue of training remains a challenge for the Ghanaian NHIS, and further work needs to be done in the future to support the sustainability of the system. However, some of the staff from the actuarial unit of the Social Security and National Insurance Trust who have graduated from the University of Maastricht and the ILO's joint Masters in Social Protection Financing are able to undertake quantitative work and were hired by the project to undertake the work on the development of the public health budget (in close collaboration with the ILO) and associated capacity building of the target groups.¹⁰⁷

GHANA: ILO Programme and Budget Performance Reports, 2006-07 & 2008-09

2006-07

Outcome 3a.1: Improved policies and strategies to extend social protection to all

Indicator 3a.1 (ii) Member States strengthen existing social security schemes through policies and strategies to ensure effectiveness and sustainability

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Ghana	Provided a technical note to the National Health Insurance Council and Ministry of Health on the financial feasibility of extending health insurance coverage to various groups of children.	Ghana: Prepared a proposal for the extension of health insurance coverage to all children.	

¹⁰⁶ Extension of social security coverage in Ghana and Senegal, final progress report, pp.33-35

¹⁰⁷ Ibid., pp.37-38.

Outcome 3a.2: Better instruments and tools for policy analysis and formulation and good governance in social protection

Indicator 3a.2 (i): Member States generate comprehensive data for policy formulation, including gender-sensitive surveys, and disseminate results

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Ghana	Collected social security data for the social security inquiry and gave advice on data requirements for policy formulation.	Generated statistics for an inquiry on social security.	

Indicator 3a.2(iii): Member States adopt new tools and enhance national capacity for good governance through capacity-building programmes for staff of social security institutions, social partner organizations and government ministries

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Ghana	Developed the health budget model in consultation with national stakeholders. Provided capacity building through on-the-job training.	Ghana: Ministry of Health and the National Health Insurance Council used the health budget model and enhanced national capacity for governance of the Health Insurance System.	

Indicator 3a.2 (iv): Member States take action to improve governance of social protection schemes or maintain good standards of governance

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Ghana	Assisted with the peer review and certification of the actuarial valuation report produced by the national actuaries.	Ghana: Audited the actuarial valuation of the Social Security and National Insurance Trust to improve governance of the scheme.	

2008-09

Outcome 3a.2: Improve member States capacity to manage social security schemes and implement policies focused on improving social security systems

Indicator 3a.2 (i): Number of member States that either apply ILO technical assistance or tools to give effect to the principles of ILO standards, including the tripartite governance of social security schemes, or use of tools to increase administrative efficiency and effectiveness or to improve financial sustainability

IR Country (GB.307/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.307/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.307/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Ghana	Provided technical assistance and conducted peer review of actuarial valuation. Trained	Ghana: Social Security and National Insurance Trust improved financial governance of pension system, based on	√

	officials from Ministry of Health and National Health Insurance System. Designed framework for delivery of cash benefits to indigent and poor pregnant women and mothers with children under the age of 5 in district of Dangme West.	actuarial valuation using ILO pension model. Financial governance of health insurance system improved through planning of expenditures and financing for the entire health-care system in the medium term, using ILO health budget model.	
--	---	---	--

Indicator 3a.2 (ii): Number of member States in which officials trained by the ILO for good governance, planning and management of social security, enter or remain in, the employment of social policy-making bodies

IR Country (GB.307/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.307/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.307/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Ghana	Provided technical support, tools training.	Ghana enhanced capacity of ministry and health insurance scheme to use ILO health budget model as diagnostic tool for governance and policy design.	√

Desk country case study – Lao PDR

Country context

In Lao PDR, social protection is currently limited, with social insurance programmes for those in the formal sector - - all public sector employees and Vientiane private sector and state-owned enterprise employees are covered for retirement, disability, survivor work injury and sickneess, and all have health insurance. There is scope for this to be extended to the rest of the formal sector. In the informal sector, there are small-scale social assistance schemes operating, some of which can expand.

Lao's health system operates on a fee-for-service basis. Formal sector schemes operate on a capitation basis, while in the informal sector, pilot schemes to establish community-based health insurance schemes have received some attention. Current expenditures on the various schemes is low—estimated at 1.14% of GDP in 2006.

1.1 ILO social security interventions and means of action at country level

Lao adopted a decree in 1999 (Decree 207/PM) calling for mandatory social security coverage to workers employed in private and state-owned enterprises, and for the creation of a Social Security Office (SSO). At the request of the government and the Luxembourg government, the ILO solicited extra budgetary funds to support development of national institutional capacities. (Lao PDR Social Security Project; Phase II - 2002-2007; 2,685,000 euro). The project was completed in 2008.

The previous project (UNDP and Belgium) covered 1997-2001 during which ILO also targeted reform of public sector social security systems, and drew on Go Thailand expertise

for technical inputs and active advisory support. Also collaborated with WHO which was strengthening hospital capacities, including medical information systems.

In addition to capacity building of the SSO the ILO also proposed reforms to the social security scheme for civil servants, which was insufficiently financed. The project was to explore introduction of voluntary social insurance coverage and options for the SSO, and to provide alternative approaches for the government to provide social protection to the population not covered by the SSO, including for victims of motor vehicle accidents. Health sector financing from all sources in particular was insufficient.

Results to be attained through ILO support

According to ILO reporting, the following results were to be achieved:

- Increased capacity of the Board of Directors, SSO management and staff to formulate policy decisions and to administer the SS system;
- Coverage of the SSO to enterprise workers to be extended to a larger pool;
- Institutional arrangements for the administration of the soc sec scheme for public servants determined and strategic plan for implementation in place;
- Feasibility studies on insurance-based solutions to meet the medical costs of accident victims and voluntary social insurance arrangements;
- CTA to coordinate various activities of the project;
- Training of SSO staff in collaboration with Thai SSO;
- Public awareness raising on rights and obligations of insured persons and employers;
- Technical assistance on systems development;
- Thai specialist on health insurance seconded for 1-2 years

The project's immediate objectives were ambitious for the four-year period given that they called for new social security schemes to be operational at least in Vientiane Municipality, that restructuring plans for civil servant scheme administration, a national plan for extending to the 'non-covered' be adopted, and a policy decision be taken on the structure, financing and feasibility of a special insurance scheme for motor vehicle accident victims.

However, according to the evaluation report, the nature of the results planned was fully consistent with assessments of needs and priorities, and also with the means of action being pursued. Larger risk factors, however, such as the weak financial base and a government track record of corruption and inefficiency were not adequately considered and contingencies proposed early in the process.

Key performance indicators to monitor and /or evaluate

For the project, indicators were SMART though ambitious and only roughly half could be met. The evaluation report was well done and equally positive and critical, of results. Progress reports also were analytical and contained information on problems as well as successes. Coverage of partnerships was limited and could be improved.

At the ILO programme and budget level, results were reported under 2006-07 indicator 3a.1(i) ;

- changes in national policies and practices: new policies adopted or policy reform; improved governance and sustainability of schemes

In 2006, the Prime Minister issued a new decree on the social security system for civil servants, in line with ILO actuarial studies, discussions, and other technical support. Also, policy decisions and principles linked to this resulted from training, discussions; also a pilot scheme launched and reviewed in 2007—all performance indicators were reported as achieved.

The ILO project submitted an options report to support a proposed policy on medical treatment for accident victims but there was no response from government and work was stopped. The outcome was removed from the log frame and the project seems to have underestimated the steps involved in such an initiative.

The ILO also supported the drafting and adoption of the 2006 Labour Law, calling for extended social protection. During the same period the national development plan for 2006-10 was drafted calling for social protection to achieve the MDGs.

For the ILO Programme and Budget under 2008-09 **indicator 3a.1(ii)** the ILO reported results under - documented increase in social security coverage (by category of benefits/ risks and contingencies and target group) based on project achievements.

The project was found to have contributed to government efforts to expand coverage to workers in enterprises with > 10 employees, however, according to the evaluation, only half of those eligible in the Vientiane area were reached.

Membership was also reported to have doubled between 2002 and 2007 to 27,000 and 242 enterprises; coverage also expanded to an additional municipality. Combined, membership grew by five-fold between 2001 and 2007.

The ILO also worked with WHO on several schemes they were supporting to extend health services to non-wage earners and those in the informal sector, particularly through community-based health insurance schemes.

The ILO wrote study proposing a road map for the extension of Social Protection in Lao PDR to 2020. (**Social Protection for All: The Way Ahead**), partly in response to the mid-term evaluation recommendation to do more to reach the poor.

Additional P&B results were reported under **2008-09 indicator 3a.1(i)** - country-specific knowledge and statistics generated. The Lao government issued annual reports and generated statistics while the project operated.

Finally, under the **2006-07 indicator 3a.2(iii)**- capacity built (e.g. number of trained civil servants), the ILO carried out training at all levels and customized to target groups at local, regional and national levels of health insurance and SSO schemes. Study tours to Vietnam and Thailand were also completed.

ILO's initiative has been largely gender neutral though a large number of enterprise employees in some sectors, such as garment, are women and also the intent to provide maternity insurance is also gender oriented.

In 2010, the ILO conducted a review of the LAO PDR DWCP, which summarized findings related to social security as follows:

"ILO support to the development of the Lao social security system has been significant and is probably the 'flagship' of ILO assistance over the previous four years. Assisted by the ILOSSP, the social welfare department of the MoLSW has established a broadly effective and comprehensive social security system for private sector employees (SSO) which has obtained coverage of some 50% of eligible workers within Vientiane. While nationally coverage is much lower, estimated at perhaps 10%, strong foundations for national social security has been established. Despite the absence of ILO support since 2007, the SSD and SSO have continued to progress well establishing extending coverage to additional provinces and companies."

The report further clarifies that the gains of the project have been sustained by the SSO and SSD. The final evaluation of ILO assistance to social security states

"The ILO Social Security Project has played a pivotal role in building the basis of a viable social security scheme in the Lao PDR. Over the five-year life of the project it has provided technical and material assistance to a variety of Government agencies in order to establish the institutions necessary to extend social security coverage ... The ILOSSP fills a niche role, addressing health-financing issues, health management and social security policy at a macro/national level. The benefits and role of this program need to be seen in its broad context. The project has met its core objectives: consolidating the social security scheme for private enterprise workers and achieving the legal instruments and policy decisions required to reform the civil servants' scheme. These schemes are based on important social security principles and health financing models that are appropriate for a developing country – prepayment, risk-pooling and equity finance" (March 2007). Through this project the ILO has clearly made a major contribution to the development of social security systems for all within Laos, a specific target within the 6th NSEDP. Despite this overall coverage remains low (estimated by stakeholders to be some 10% of eligible workers), this is not surprising given the scale and range of challenges faced, the recent establishment of the SSO, and still limited national capacities including staff numbers, especially at provincial levels. Expanding awareness on social security both within the population as a whole and amongst decision makers being seen as key strategies.

Planned actions in support of the SSO and SSD over 2008/9 did not occur due to the ILO Social Security Project Phase III not being financed and significant (justified) revisions to the project document being requested by the intended donor. This has resulted in a significant gap in ILO assistance with the eventual 'gap period' likely to be some 3 years in duration. Development of social security systems is a long term undertaking, responding in the Laos context, to long-term needs. Despite this gap, the expansion of the social security system has continued with scheme coverage being extended to new provinces and including major new employers (e.g. Sepon LXML Gold & Copper Mine). The Phase III design represents a challenging, but highly significant undertaking with a focus on the self-employed and health insurance. This focus will need to be closely maintained if achievements are to be made. Technical assistance provided was reported to be of a generally high quality but for some tasks, national consultants are reported as available with their use strengthening longer term sustainability. Board members include those from tripartite constituents but increased technical skill development for

board members reported as required. Limited engagement of partner management in ILOSSP financial management processes was identified by stakeholders as an area for future improvement.

(END OF EXCERPT, Draft Lao country programme review, March 2009)

Regarding the need to extend the project implementation by two years to 2007, according to the 2007 evaluation, the ILO delivered a fair amount of scheduled outputs for the original 2005 deadline, however, the government was slow in uptake and in some cases opted to not implement some of the technical inputs. This includes computerisation of records and claims, expansion of SSO sub-offices and establishment of an in-house training unit, despite ILO deliverables. It is unclear why the government did not move forward on the training unit and whether there were shortcomings in ILO's contributions aimed at this.

The professional capacity of the SSO and quality of health care to members were two major institutional challenges faced by the project. Though these were recognized as risks and actions taken to address them, the time needed to change practices was underestimated.

The government was found to have shown some ambivalence at the policy level, particularly on compliance issues. By mid-2007, the government had not yet addressed the draft inspections regulations submitted in 2005.

The separate administration of the SSD and SSO schemes has been considered unnecessary and expensive but government has only agreed to the idea in principle (in late 90's), with demonstrated reluctance to give timetable to this. SSD lost many staff to SSO when it was established and SSD suffered from loss of experienced staff.

Observations:

The ILO's initiative in Lao PDR was one of the largest in the Asia region during the evaluation period, the delivery of which was largely positive, with a good interplay of HQ and regional social security support linked to a strong full-time CTA on the ground. It shows that a sound design with adequate human and financial resources can produce substantive outputs.

The resources at ILO disposal cannot lead to implementation of social security schemes unless the government is willing and able to take decision and change practices. In future, the ILO needs to be cautious in 1) deciding which countries are willing and able to make use of ILO contributions in a results-committed manner; 2) linking its performance too closely to that of those charged with implementing schemes given the inherent risks at country level; and 3) being responsive in curtailing the level and form of assistance once evidence shows that it is not being put to use.

P&B and GB reporting has reported accurately on work and progress in Lao PDR

Resource levels and flows were adequate, however since 2008 the ILO has not been able to source funds to continue supporting the work at the scale.

Operational management:

- Good balance of centralised and decentralised organization and support services
- Technical backstopping from SRO and Geneva adequate and timely
- Project staffed by nationals and managed by experienced CTA
- Tripartite oversight developing for the SSO in line with ILO practices, however, project documentation did not specify much regarding consultation with and feedback procedures from social partners.

Lessons learned

In order for government agencies to implement national decrees, they must be designated as the authority for this. Often the ILO needs to be proactive in moving this decision level along, particularly if the government is not experienced with autonomous public bodies.

WHO has proven a strong collaborating partner for improving financial accounting in hospitals, which is essential for managing health financial schemes.

Without adequate appreciation of the benefits of an independent SSO administration, the government can undermine the financial soundness of schemes through weak and non-transparent accountability links between management and the governance level, and weak oversight practices. This in turn, reduces confidence in the scheme, which reduces new membership.

The effort to promote a wide-reaching goal such as extending social security to the informal sector, combined with the more nitty gritty detailed support called for by social security institutions lacking capacity and empowerment may well be too large and/or diverse for one project to reasonably tackle.

Most initiatives to extend social protection to the informal economy need a lead agency to champion the initiative, particularly linked to the budget resources, and ILO is not the best placed for this, unless partnering with an IFI in the effort.

Social Security projects of this complexity benefit from CTAs with strong technical knowledge and in-depth familiarity with the country and availability to network among multiple government agencies, and the UN and donor agencies.

Countries are well served when the ILO can be flexible in commissioning technical assistance on an 'as needed' basis, rather than to a prescribed list and timetable.

LAO PDR P&B Indicators

2006-07

Outcome 3a.1: Improved policies and strategies to extend social protection to all

Indicator 3a.1 (i): Member States adopt or implement effective policies and strategies to extend social security coverage

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2) Indicator 3a.1(i)	ILO output reported (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Lao PDR	Provided technical assistance, capacity building of social security organization staff and quantitative studies on financial, administrative and IT issues.	Lao People's Democratic Republic: Established a new decree on social security for civil servants. Extended social security scheme to provinces outside Vientiane. Implemented pilot health insurance schemes for civil servants in Vientiane Capital and Provinces.	√

Indicator 3a.2(iii): Member States adopt new tools and enhance national capacity for good governance through capacity-building programmes for staff of social security institutions, social partner organizations and government ministries

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2) Indicator 3a.2(iii)	ILO output reported (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Lao people's Democratic Republic	Lao People's Democratic Republic: Enhanced the capacity of government officials on the planning and financial management of social security schemes.	Capacity building through tailor-made training tools and technical assistance. Delivered an ILO technical report.	√

2008-09

Outcome 3a.1: Increase member State capacity to develop policies focused on improving social security systems

Indicator 3a.1 (i): Number of member States that apply ILO technical assistance to generate comprehensive social security data

IR Country (GB.307/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.307/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.307/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Lao People's Democratic Republic	Collected and disseminated social security data through the ILO's social security inquiry for national policy formulation.	Country generated social security statistics for inquiry on social security.	

Cyprus

1 Background and ILO support

Cyprus has a comprehensive public social insurance scheme, the National Social Insurance Scheme, designed and managed along traditional European lines. Two main policy issues have emerged:

- Financial sustainability of the fund and the steps necessary to safeguard it. Population ageing, relatively generous eligibility rules (including a young normal retirement age), and a very conservative investment policy contributed to concerns in this area.
- An old-age poverty rate that is high by European standards. This is in part due to the fact that only in the early 1980s was the scheme (founded in 1957) moved from a flat-rate to a earnings-related basis, with the result that the pensions of very elderly persons, those over 75, are extremely low. There is a plethora of social assistance programmes for the elderly poor, but these are fragmented and uncoordinated.

There is a strong tradition of social dialogue in Cypriot social security policy. As a result of actuarial analyses described below and intense dialogue between Government, workers, and employers, serious reform discussions began in 2006. In 2009 Parliament approved a range of parametric reform measures. Chief among these are:

- Gradual phased increases in the contribution rate;
- Stricter eligibility criteria, in the form of a longer minimum contributory period;
- Limitations on credit for time in higher education or training;
- Stricter eligibility criteria for unemployment benefits; and
- Stricter conditions on lump-sum payouts.

Steps have also been taken to liberalise investment policy, including moving responsibility for portfolio allocation from the Minister of Finance to an independent committee comprised of representatives of Government, workers, and employers.

The option of raising the normal retirement age is politically loaded in Cyprus, and it was found through scenarios that it was possible to achieve financial sustainability out to mid-century without taking this step. Other options examined, but not accepted, were indexing “lower band” pensions to prices rather than wages and institution of a universal flat old-age pension or “demogrant.”

The ILO social protection programme in Cyprus consists of several components:

- *Actuarial reviews and capacity building.* Since the early years of this century, the ILO has provided actuarial consulting services and capacity building to the Government of Cyprus under a series of projects:
 - o “Actuarial Consultancy: 2003-2006.” (CYP/03/01/CYP). Budgeted at USD 91,000 this project provided a classic actuarial analysis of the National Social Insurance Scheme. In addition, the project delivered training to enhance the capacity of the Ministry to conduct its own actuarial analyses; training related to the project CYP/07/01/CYP described below. The analysis revealed an

alarming deterioration of the Scheme since the last review three years earlier, with the number of pensioners increasing rapidly, unemployment benefits reaching unsustainable levels, and the rate of return on assets of the Fund declining. The report recommended immediately increasing the contribution rate for unemployment insurance and a transfer of funds from the Supplementary Benefit Account to the Unemployment Benefit Account to remove the substantial deficit which had accumulated in the latter. Having identified significant increases in contribution rates needed to finance long-term benefits, especially old-age pensions, in view of population ageing, the report recommended significant parametric reforms as spelled out in three reform scenarios. These featured a combination of potential steps including:

- gradual increase in normal retirement age from 63 to 65,
- indexing of lower-band pensions to prices instead of wages,
- possible replacement of the lower band pension with a universal flat-rate pension for all persons over 65 pension and
- an increase in number of years of contribution necessary to qualify for a pension.

The reform options naturally had varying impacts on short-versus long-term expenditures (for example, the demogrant would increase the former but decrease the latter), and on the necessity for increases in contribution rates.

- “Actuarial valuation of the Human Resource Development Authority of Cyprus.” (CYP/04/02/CYP). Budgeted at USD 10,000, this project examined the status of a small defined-benefit pension scheme associated with a semi-governmental institution employing 75 persons. Key issues were assessment of the financial sustainability of the fund under current contribution rates and issues of coordination with the National Social Insurance Scheme.
- “Capacity building and peer review for the actuarial valuation of the Cyprus Social Insurance Scheme as of 2006.” (CYP/07/01/CYP). Following the 2003 assessment, no major immediate policy actions were instituted. CYP/07/01/CYP resulted from the ILO’s long-standing advice to the Ministry of Labour and Social Insurance that it needed better in-house expertise for actuarial valuation. This resulted in the hiring of a qualified actuary in 2006. The analysis, as described in the *Report* completed in 2008, built on the assumptions of the 2003 valuation but substituted EU macroeconomic and population assumptions, resulting in a slightly darker outlook for the Scheme (e.g., compare Table 3.8 in the 2003 Assessment with the table on p. 14 of the 2006 reform scenarios assessment). Contributing significantly to this were lower mortality rate assumptions. A wide range of possible reform scenarios was analysed. The ILO’s contribution to this exercise was capacity building and technical peer review of statutory requirements and professional standards, data collection, methodology, data / assumptions, and communication of results for this first in-house exercise. Capacity building was delivered via distance technical support and one week of hands-on training in Cyprus by an international expert hired by the ILO. The ILO was paid about USD 45,000 for the provision of these services. Reform option discussions that culminated in the 2009 legislation were essentially on the

basis of this technical analysis. The Government financed trade unions to commission an independent actuarial assessment, which reached broadly similar conclusions, reinforcing the consensus that developed on the need for immediate steps to be taken.

2. Conclusions and lessons learned

2.1 Conclusions

2.1.1 Strategic approach and design: relevant to situation facing Jordan

Conclusion 1: In Cyprus, the main problems are fiscal sustainability of the contributory pension system and the high incidence of poverty in old age. The ILO has provided actuarial and policy advice very relevant to both, and coherent with its mandate.

In Cyprus, coverage and the range of social benefits provided are good; the main problem related to the adequacy of social protection is the very low level of pensions received by the very old. The ILO supported the idea of a universal basic pension at 65, and also provided scenarios which indexed low-band pensions to prices in order to guarantee access to a minimum consumption basket. Neither option was attractive to Government and the ILO's constituents so far, however, both are now back on the table. The ILO has been highly influential in Cyprus and is trusted by all the social partners. It has achieved a reputation for professionalism and for advising implementable approaches. On the vertical dimension, the ILO has directly, or indirectly via capacity building and peer review, contributed to identifying problems, achieving consensus that action is needed, and presenting policy options for discussion. In analysing and promoting the option of a demogrant for persons over 65, the ILO has exploited its comparative advantage as an advocate for guaranteeing basic social protection, if not for all, then at least for a group in need, the elderly. The labour market in Cyprus is closer to the European model than to a profile that would be typical of a much poorer country. The ILO's strategy in Cyprus has been essentially limited to technical actuarial input, not exploration of links between social security policy, employment, and growth. Coverage in Cyprus is not particularly low and the fiscal base is adequate.

2.1.2 Effectiveness of strategy in extending various forms of social protection to all

Conclusion 2: The effectiveness of the ILO's work in Cyprus has essentially resulted from the ILO's high reputation for actuarial analysis, its long-standing relationship with the social security institute, and its ability to build on a well-established national tradition of tripartism and social dialogue in decision making. While not all advice the ILO gave was accepted, the technical reliability and unbiased nature of ILO advice is appreciated on all sides.

The ILO was effective in improving the quality of actuarial work in Cyprus via the hiring of a professional, full-time actuary in the Ministry of Labour and Social Insurance, a result, in part, of persistent ILO advice in this regard. The rationale was that only the presence of a full-time expert could provide the materials needed to accelerate the debate about necessary changes. The ILO's actuarial model was accepted by all the stakeholders, making it a highly effective tool for adjustment and reform. Its credibility was strengthened when an

independent analysis commissioned by the workers' organizations arrived at essentially similar results. The role played by ILO technical work in informing the reform dialogue, the presence of a full-time actuary in the Ministry of Labour and Social Insurance, and the highly-developed nature of tripartite dialogue in Cyprus all resulted in good dissemination. Analysis of a possible demogrant approach, by no means a new but still generally regarded as a fairly innovative approach to old-age income security, was fully integrated into the technical analysis of the traditional contributory, earnings-related scheme. The Government rejected the ILO's advice in this area (as in the area of raising the normal retirement age); however, both issues are back on the table. All of the stakeholders generally trust ILO policy advice, a trust based in part on acceptance of the underlying modelling approaches.

2.1.3 Coherent and complementary with regard to horizontal and vertical extension of social protection

Conclusion 3: The ILO's policy advice covered both traditional approaches to strengthening the existing pension system and a universal old-age pension alternative that was rejected by Government. In this way, complementarity and coherence between different dimensions and approaches was achieved.

The ILO's technical advisory work, including work done by the Ministry actuary with support in the form of capacity building and peer review, examined a wide range of policy options for strengthening social protection, including aspects most closely identified with the vertical and horizontal dimension. In analyzing the universal old age-pension option while also costing out more traditional approaches closer to Government's own preferences, the ILO achieved both coherence and complementarity in its policy support activities. ,Government is opposed to the option of raising the retirement age, but a number of experts interviewed expressed the view that this issue, along with the universal old-age pension option, is already back on the table. Social dialogue is extremely well-established in Cyprus and ILO work contributed to raising its quality.

2.1.4 Efficient use of capacities and resources

Conclusion 4: All ILO activities in Cyprus were financed by the Government. HQ resources and consultants were used efficiently. In addition, the ILO through training and peer review increased the capacity of the national authorities to conduct analyses on their own.

2.1.5 Internal and external coordination to promote extension

Conclusion 5: The ILO's activities were essentially in support of the Ministry. There was no coordination with other donors. No evidence was found of an effort to deal simultaneously with social protection and employment issues. In general, the treatment of labour market issues in the LO's technical analyses was rather mechanical. Links between different approaches and labour market behaviour of firms and workers could have been better integrated, and would have provided a richer and more solid basis for social dialogue. That said, ILO constituents warmly praised the way the ILO engaged them and built capacity in what they regarded as a fully satisfactory exercise of the tripartite

model.

2.1.6 Impact in form of capacity, tools, policy improvements

Conclusion 6: ILO capacity building, analyses, and peer review significantly improved the quality of technical analysis and policy making for social security in Cyprus.

The ILO's work in Cyprus has helped to focus attention on the need to increase the income of the very elderly, whether by traditional pension policy means or by means of a demogrant (which could operate, in effect, as a device for consolidating disparate and relatively ineffective social assistance programmes currently in place. The ILO's 2003 actuarial review presents age-specific data (Table A4.5) in a way that well illustrates the problem of the inadequacy of pensions received by the very aged. This detail has disappeared by the time of the 2006 assessment, and would have been welcome in the *Report*. The 2009 legislation on parametric reform of the National Insurance Scheme was heavily informed by ILO analysis, capacity building, and review/ The ILO advocated for the hiring of a full-time actuary in the Ministry of Labour and Social Insurance in order to ensure continuity, provided capacity building, and provided review in order to validate and maximise the credibility of analysis carried out by the Ministry.

2.1.7 Sustainability of advancements made

Conclusion 7: The ILO fully analysed financial sustainability in the pension system and was instrumental in setting off alarm bells when an already weak situation worsened. Its capacity building activities have institutionalised sustained impacts in the areas of actuarial and policy expertise.

2.2 Lessons learned

- *Capacity building works well when the absorptive capacity is there.* The ILO convinced Cypriot authorities of the need for continuing, full-time actuarial expertise in Government. Government was willing, high quality staff were available, and the result has been a tangible gain for sustainability. A similar absorptive capacity argument may apply to the ILO's engagement of constituents: the needed awareness of the importance of the issues and the necessary ability to see the other point of view contributed to a very successful exercise in tripartism.
- *Stick to your guns – structural issues never die, they just briefly disappear from and then quickly climb back on the table again.* Most economists and actuaries, and certainly all demographers, would argue that it is not credible that the normal retirement age in Cyprus will remain as low as it is over a twenty or thirty year time frame. Even an increase of life expectancy by one year per decade (almost all increases in life expectancy will occur at older ages and the European record is better than this) would render this unlikely. The ILO should use its trusted relationship and the train it offers to tirelessly remind technical experts and policy makers that social security actuaries makers have persistently over-estimated fertility and under-estimated mortality improvements. This may require increased attention to issues of

disability and long term care - the latter an area in which the ILO appears to have little capacity.

- *While the ILO has a duty to engage in poverty reduction in low-income countries, it cannot forget its important role in middle-income ones.* In Cyprus, as in Jordan, we have encountered a country with relatively good capacity and great ability to absorb and act on policy advice. We cannot advise the ILO on the division of its resources between countries at different income levels, but recognise the importance of the trade off.

P&B Indicators 2006-07

Outcome 3a.1: Improved policies and strategies to extend social protection to all

Indicator 3a.2 (iv): Member States take action to improve governance of social protection schemes or maintain good standards of governance

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Cyprus	Assisted in the development and financial analysis of the reform scenarios and provided training.	Department of Social Insurance completed a financial analysis of the different proposed reform scenarios for the Cyprus Social Insurance Scheme.	

2008-09

Outcome 3a.1: Increase member State capacity to develop policies focused on improving social security systems

Indicator 3a.1 (i): Number of member States that apply ILO technical assistance to generate comprehensive social security data

IR Country (GB.307/PFA/2) Indicator 3a.2(i)	ILO output reported (GB.307/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.307/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Cyprus	Collected and disseminated social security data through the ILO's social security inquiry for national policy formulation.	Country generated social security statistics for inquiry on social security.	

Outcome 3a.2: Improve member States capacity to manage social security schemes and implement policies focused on improving social security systems

Indicator 3a.2 (i): Number of member States that either apply ILO technical assistance or tools to give effect to the principles of ILO standards, including the tripartite governance of social security schemes, or use of tools to increase administrative efficiency and effectiveness or to improve financial sustainability

IR Country (GB.307/PFA/2)	ILO output reported (GB.307/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.307/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Cyprus	Conducted peer review of actuarial valuation.	Cyprus: Department of Social Insurance completed actuarial valuation of social insurance scheme.	√

Chile

1 Background and ILO support

The ILO's involvement in social security reform in Chile has deep roots and requires a bit of history. The Pinochet military regime inherited a Bismarckian pension system that was financially unsustainable, inequitable, and incapable of expanding coverage. Deeply influenced by the liberal market model, the Colonels in 1981 implemented a sweeping reform that amounted to the phasing-out of the existing scheme and its replacement with a mandatory individual saving scheme. Members who switched to the new scheme were awarded "recognition bonds" to recognise their years of contribution to the old scheme.

The ILO refused to sanction the reform, for a number of reasons. It lacked the solidarity component. In view of the regime's suppression of trade unions, there was no role for tripartism in governance. Individual accounts were managed by 12 competing private firms, resulting in high management costs.

In 1992, the ILO published, in the prestigious *International Social Security Review*, an ISSA journal, a critique of the privatised system, while the World Bank was committed to promoting Chile-like "Pillar 2" reforms, in which existing traditional schemes were wound down and replaced by mandatory individual saving schemes.

Two things can be said for the Pinochet-era reform. First, reform was needed; the existing system was weak. Second, as predicted, it resulted in capital deepening and accelerated capital market development in a country which badly needed both.

That, unfortunately, is where the positive points end. At the broadest level, risk conventionally defined as social had been radically transferred to private individuals. More concretely, the ILO identified three key problems: low coverage, lack of solidarity, and (ironically, since this had been the linchpin of the reform) financial sustainability.

Four key, but splintered pension problems needed to be resolved:

- the deficit of the pre-dictatorship system,
- the cost of "recognition bonds,"
- social transfers to disabled persons and elderly in poverty, and
- the minimum guaranteed rate of return in the new pension system, which financial market developments had made unsustainable.

Changes in the political environment made it possible for the ILO to re-assert its policy advisory role with a strategic, solution-oriented approach. In the early 2000s, the ILO analysed problems of coverage, adequacy of benefits, and gender. Specifically,

- In 2002, an ambitious actuarial modelling project with the Budget Office of the Ministry of Finance began.
- In 2003, ILO published a SPER.

- In 2004, an international conference on directions for pension reform in Chile brought together leading policy makers, academics, and constituents.
- In 2005, the ILO commenced formal technical cooperation on the design of a pension reform.

The ILO participated in the Presidential Advisory Group (the Marcel Commission), taking part in meetings and offering technical support. In addition to representing its own view, the ILO facilitated the contributions of top social security policy makers from the region. The ILO prepared a briefing report, as well as a series of notes, for legislators on the eve of the submission of the Draft Law in December, 2006. It participated, as well, in legislative hearings.

Realising that increasing capacity in the Budget Office alone was insufficient, the ILO through QUATRAN provided actuarial and financial training to staffers from a broad range of government institutions in November 2007.

One month later, the regional dimension of reform was strengthened when the ILO sponsored a Regional Tripartite Meeting on Social Security in Santiago with ten countries participating.

In March 2008, the ILO's contribution to pension reform, which started as far back as 1992 and gradually intensified and became more focused, culminated with the signature by President Bachelet of the pension reform law.

Conclusions and lessons learned

2.1 Conclusions

2.1.1 Strategic approach and design: relevant to situation facing Chile

Conclusion 1: The ILO's strategy in Chile, including direct policy advice, mobilising regional expertise, and promoting actuarial and financial analysis (including provision of training QUATRAN) was highly relevant to the problems that the Chilean pension system faced.

We identified, above, the three dimensions of reform that the ILO identified as most pressing: low coverage, lack of sustainability, and financial sustainability.

The ILO view (whose effectiveness and impact were facilitated by the fact that the Regional Office was in Santiago) was that the coverage issue had three dimensions -- low-income workers, the self-employed, and gender. In order to address these, the emerging ILO position was that existing schemes, the old system and the new, as well as the social transfer pensions for the disabled and indigent elderly, needed to be consolidated, including consolidated collections for efficiency gains. Solidarity, including gender, required a multi-faceted approach, but one that required that the new contributory solidarity pillar be the core of the system. Wage-based contributions needed to assume their rightful role. As to sustainability, strangely for a country with a distinguished history in social security, demography, and economics, the Ministry of Finance did not have a well-developed model, nor trained staff, to analyse policy options. The ILO provided modelling and analytical support throughout the reform process.

Relevance was enhanced in Chile by, exceptionally, undertaking a broad and deep examination of the labour market and linkages with reform. One of the strong points of the reform process was that it was informed at every step by consideration of the labor market.

2.1.2 Effectiveness of strategy in extending various forms of social protection to all

Conclusion 2:

The ILO's support resulted in a significant expansion of the pension system to cover more independent workers, young workers, and workers in the informal sector, in addition to improving gender equality.

The goals of the government reform were

- Expand coverage, particularly for independent and young workers,
- Gender equality, through a multi-faceted approach (child benefit, fairer treatment in case of divorce, survivors' benefits for unmarried partners; generally better articulation of survivors' and invalidity benefits).
- Increase the density of contributions by encouraging formalisation of employment; create a voluntary saving scheme and promote awareness.

The reform consisted of several main components:

- A new solidarity pillar providing a basic pension designed to provide income security to those over 65 who had not been able to accumulate in the individual pillar. The only qualification was that the person must belong to the lower 60 percent of the income distribution. All workers, private sector employees, public sector workers, and employers / own-account workers were required to contribute, and an estimated 70 percent coverage rate was targeted.
- Affiliation of independent workers, of whom previously only 5 percent were covered, through a range of incentives. The failure of the old system to cope with workers who rotated regularly between the formal and informal system was one of its major drawbacks. Subsidies were provided to encourage employers to give young workers formal contracts.
- Creation of a voluntary saving scheme, with special emphasis on generating savings from households in the middle range of the income distribution. Retirement saving was the focus of a major awareness-raising campaign.
- Reform of invalidity and survivors' pensions.

Note that the reform did not eliminate the individual account scheme, but supplemented it in order to cover individuals who were previously uncovered.

The ILO's support to the pension system resulted in a system with broader coverage, particularly for the informal sector. The minimum pension was strengthened. The process was, however, by request of government, very focused on pension reform. The ILO did not, for example, work in the area of health.

2.1.3 Coherent and complementary with regard to horizontal and vertical extension of social protection

Conclusion 3: The ILO's contribution was essentially in the vertical dimension.

Work in Chile was essentially on strengthening the vertical dimension with respect to coverage, adequacy of benefits, and financial sustainability. The new solidarity pillar was instituted, with particular attention to extending coverage to the informal sector. However, this was firmly in the model of converting informal employment to formal employment, and cannot be considered as extension of the horizontal dimension.

2.1.4 Efficient use of capacities and resources

Conclusion 4: Both HQ and field office resources were efficiently used.

Efficiency was enhanced by the fact that ILO had strong capacity in place in the ILO Regional Office in Santiago, as well as strong links with policy makers and experts throughout the region. This made it possible to economise on use of headquarters resources, for example, limiting HQ travel to participation in priority or high-profile events.

The ILO's political credibility was used to particular effect, with, e.g., President Bachelet addressing the ILC in the presence of the DG and the DG addressing the Tripartite Regional Conference.

2.1.6 Impact in form of capacity, tools, policy improvements

Conclusion 6:

The ILO's advisory work supported the construction of an integrated model of the Chilean pension system in which linkages between the various components were articulated. Using this, new policies were devised to address weaknesses and gaps that had emerged in the old system.

The work of the ILO resulted in an integrated model of the components of the pension system, operating in a consistent fashion and with linkages taken fully into account. Having formed capacity regarding actuarial and financial modeling within the Budget Office, the ILO realized that a range of government agencies would be involved in the reform, and broadened capacity building appropriately through QUATRIN. All actors recognized that the ILO's support had concrete impacts in terms of strengthening the pension system.

Policy improvements are not to be questioned; the ILO's actions had concrete impacts in addressing coverage, adequacy of benefits, gender equality, and financial sustainability.

2.1.7 Sustainability of advancements made

Conclusion 7:

The ILO's work in financial and actuarial modeling, including capacity building, directly enhanced the sustainability of the system. This applies also to the governance aspects of the ILO's work, which returned tripartism to the policy process.

2.2 Lessons learned

Don't neglect the vertical dimension, especially in middle-income countries. In some ways, the ILO's work in Chile was not particularly innovative, but it paid handsome dividends in terms of impact. While there were capacity gaps, Chile has a long and distinguished history in demography, statistics, economics, and social sciences generally. Problems were identified, and possible approaches were discussed, before the ILO began providing support and there was a dialogue of equals.

Mobilise the regional dimension. The rich tradition of social security in Latin America, and ILO's excellent network in the region, made it possible to mobilise expertise from other countries and to exchange approaches and lessons learned.

The political constellation is important. The political context was almost uniquely favourable. First, the ILO was in the enviable position of being able to say, in effect, "We told them so," having refused to endorse and criticised the 1981 reform. A progressive government, friendly to the ILO, was in power and the Pinochet-era pension reform was viewed as a symbol of the failed policies of a discredited regime.

P&B Indicators**2006-07****Outcome 3a.1: Improved policies and strategies to extend social protection to all**

Indicator 3a.1 (i): Member States adopt or implement effective policies and strategies to extend social security coverage

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2)	ILO reported output (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Chile	Technical advice and background notes provided to the executive branch of government. Participated in hearings of the Presidential Advisory Council and Parliament.	Presidential reform committee adopted a pension reform plan for the social security system.	√

Outcome 3a.2: Better instruments and tools for policy analysis and formulation and good governance in social protection

Indicator 3a.2 (i): Member States generate comprehensive data for policy formulation, including gender-sensitive surveys, and disseminate results

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2)	ILO reported output (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Chile	Technical advice on pension reform to the Presidential Advisory Council and to the Ministry of Finance.	Chile: Generated comprehensive data (including on gender-sensitive issues) for high-level policy-makers for the drafting of a new and more inclusive pension system and for financial governance of the pension system.	√

Indicator 3a.2 (iv): Member States take action to improve governance of social protection schemes or maintain good standards of governance

IR Country (GB.301/PFA/2)	ILO reported output (GB.301/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.301/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Chile	Developed the projection model for Chile. Provided financial analysis of the pension reform proposal and on-the-job training of Ministry of Finance staff.	Ministry of Finance applied the ILO actuarial model for pension reform simulations and projections. Improved the ability of key staff to use the model.	√

2008-09

Outcome 3a.1: Increase member State capacity to develop policies focused on improving social security systems

Indicator 3a.1 (i): Number of member States that apply ILO technical assistance to generate comprehensive social security data

IR Country (GB.307/PFA/2)	ILO reported output (GB.307/PFA/2)	Impact/result of output (GB.307/PFA/2)	DWCP Outcome (SMM)
Chile	Collected and disseminated social security data through the ILO's social security inquiry for national policy formulation.	Country generated social security statistics for inquiry on social security.	

ANNEX 4.

SOCIAL SECURITY PROJECT PORTFOLIO BY REGION (2005-2009), AS AT JANUARY 13, 2010

	Project title	Project code	Budget (\$)	Project duration	Countries covered	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009
AFRICA										
1	Social security project	LIB/85/01/LIB	156,007	May1985-Mar 2010	Libyan Arab Jamahiriya					
2	Actuarial assessment of the intended national scheme social security commission	NAM/01/01/NAM	15,514	May 2001-Dec 2009	Namibia					
3	Actuarial assessment of liabilities Nigeria social insurance fund	NIR/05/01/NIR	71,514	Apr 2005-April 2008	Nigeria					
4	Poverty impact assessment of a basic social protection benefit package for a low-income country	SEN/05/01/UKM	38,608	Jan 2006-Sep2006	Senegal					
5	Comprehensive review of social protection in Botswana	BOT/95/02/BOT		Oct 1995-Mar 2006	Botswana					
6	Extending the coverage of social security to the excluded and the poor (sub-umbrella is INT/02/M71/NET)	MLI/02/50/NET		Jan 2002-Mar 2006	Mali					
7	Fight against exclusion in Rodrigues- MAR/01/003/01	MAR/01/003/01	1,907	Jan 2002-Mar 2006	Mauritius					
8	Implementation of the national social security scheme	URT/99/01/URT	27,443	Jun 1999-Jul 2009	United Republic of Tanzania					
9	Appui à la construction d'un cadre régional de développement des mutuelles de santé dans les pays de l'UEMOA	RAF/03/19/FRA	158,944	Aug 2004-Jul 2007	Africa region					
10	Développement de la protection sociale (PROSOCIAL3) dans les PALOP (linked to RAF/98/M11/POR)	RAF/00/06/POR	120,641	Sep 2003-Feb 2006	Africa region					

11	Enhancing women's role in improving access and quality of basic and reproductive health care	RAF/99/13/UNF		Jan 1999-Mar 2006	Africa region					
12	Promotion du système de micro-assurance pour les micro-entrepreneurs au Burkina Faso (umbrella file INT/00/M03/FRA)	BKF/00/51/FRA	167,820	Jan 2002-Mar 2009	Burkina Faso					
13	Extension of social protection for women in ethiopia (umbrella file INT/00/M03/FRA)	ETH/00/51/FRA	82,793	Jan 2002-Mar 2007	Ethiopia					
14	UNDP/GAM/00/002/01 Fight against social and economic exclusion in Gambia	GAM/00/002/01		Aug 2000-Mar 2006	Gambia					
15	Fight against social and economic exclusion	GAM/35/562/11	591,656	Mar 2005-Mar 2008	Gambia					
16	Projet d'appui à la réhabilitation de la Caisse Nationale de sécurité Sociale (CNSS)	GAB/00/02/IBR		Mar 2002-Mar 2005	Gabon					
17	UN joint programme on access to safety nets	MOZ/08/54/OUF	834,790	Sep 2008-Dec 2011	Mozambique					
18	Extension de la protection sociale (STEP/ Portugal Phase II)	MOZ/08/57/POR	340,243	Dec 2008-Dec 2012	Mozambique					
19	Preliminary assessment of health insurance options in Sierra Leone	SIL/08/02/SIL	90,141	Jun 2008-Mar 2010	Sierra Leone					
20	Etude sur les régimes de retraite en Tunisie	TUN/08/01/TUN	39,345	Oct 2008-Mar 2010	Tunisia					
21	Global campaign on social security and coverage for all as means to combat poverty in Africa and Asia – Tanzania country programme	URT/06/50/UKM	1,187,008	Dec 2006-Jun 2010	United Republic of Tanzania					
22	Peer-review of NHIF actuarial valuation report as of June 2007	URT/08/01/UKM	24,965		United Republic of Tanzania					
23	Appui à la construction d'un cadre régional de développement des mutuelles de santé dans les pays de l'UEMOA	RAF/06/01/FRA	322,116	Jan 2006-Mar 2009	Western Africa					

24	Extension of social security coverage in Ghana and Senegal	RAF/05/56/SID	521,176	Nov 2005-Jun 2009	Western Africa					
25	Global campaign on social security and coverage for all as means to combat poverty in Africa and Asia – Zambia country programme	ZAM/06/51/UKM	542,359	Dec 2006-Jun 2010	Zambia					
26	STEP Phase III	RAF/08/55/BEL	1,493,493	Jan 2009-Dec 2011	Africa region					
27	Appui actuariat et renforcement des capacités de la Caisse Nationale de Prévoyance Sociale au Cameroun	CMR/09/01/CMR	226,796	Sep 2009-Mar 2012	Cameroon					
28	Lutte contre l'exclusion sociale (STEP/Portugal 3)	RAF/06/52/POR	174,020	Jan 2007-Oct 2009	Africa region					
29	Extension de la protection sociale (STEP Portugal) RAF	RAF/08/56/POR	65,952	Dec 2008-Dec 2012	Africa region					
30	Ghana- Luxembourg social Trust Pilot advisory project	GHA/09/02/OGB	23,622	Sep 2009-Aug 2015	Ghana					
31	ILO health budget advisory services in Ghana	GHA/09/01/GHA	19,180	May 2009-Mar 2010	Ghana					
32	Audit of the actuarial review of the social security and national insurance trust of Ghana	GHA/07/01/GHA		July 2007-Mar 2009	Ghana					
AMERICAS										
33	Bilateral technical assistance projects under the ILO umbrella programme for actuarial reviews in selected countries in the Caribbean	STK/99/01/STK	7,733	Jun 1999-Mar 2006	Saint Kitts and Nevis					
34	Feasibility study on the introduction of national health insurance, unemployment insurance and farmers' pensions in Saint Lucia	STL/03/01/STL	18,193	Mar 2003-Nov 2007	Saint Lucia					
35	Bilateral technical assistance projects under the ILO umbrella	STL/99/01/STL	3,277	Apr 1999-Apr 2006	Saint Lucia					

	programme for actuarial reviews (St. Lucia)									
36	Actuarial and financial review of the Antigua-Barbuda social security scheme	ANT/03/01/ANT		Aug 2004-Dec 2005	Antigua and Barbuda					
37	Actuarial and financial review of the social security schemes administered by the Social Insurance Bank of Aruba	ARU/03/01/ARU	283	Oct 2003-Apr 2006	Aruba					
38	Study on alternative policy options for the long-term financial consolidation of the Social Insurance Bank of Aruba	ARU/04/01/ARU	7,568	Sep 2004-Feb 2008	Aruba					
39	Bilateral technical assistance projects under the ILO umbrella programme for actuarial reviews in selected countries in the Caribbean (Barbados)	BAR/99/01/BAR		Jun 1999-Mar 2006	Barbados					
40	Actuarial and financial review of the British Virgin Islands' social security system	BVI/04/01/BVI	634	May 2004-Mar 2006	British Virgin Islands					
41	Desarrollo de un modelo para la proyeccion financier de los sistemas de pensiones de Chile	CHI/02/01/CHI		Jul 2003-Mar 2006	Chile					
42	Bilateral technical assistance projects under the ILO umbrella programme for actuarial reviews (Dominica)	DMI/99/01/DMI	5,729	Jun 1999-Feb 2008	Dominica Republic					
43	Bilateral technical assistance projects under the ILO umbrella programme for actuarial reviews in selected countries in the Caribbean (Grenada)	GRN/99/01/GRN		Jun 1999-Dec 2005	Grenada					
44	Bilateral technical assistance projects under the ILO umbrella programme for actuarial reviews (Guyana)	GUY/99/01/GUY	1,017	Jun 1999-Aug 2006	Guyana					

45	Extension de la cobertura de la seguridad social en Honduras	HON/04/50/NET	407,153	Mar 2004-Jan 2007	Honduras					
46	UNDP/HAI/01/001/01 – Appui au développement d’un partenariat national pour l’intégration économique et sociale	HAI/01/001/01		Jun 2001-Mar 2006	Haiti					
47	Apoyo al fortalecimiento de la instituciones publicas del area social	URU/08/51/UND	560,835	Sep 2008-Jun 2010	Uruguay					
48	Programa regional para la extension de la proteccion social en la subregion Andina	RLA/08/02/SPA	412,337	Jun 2008-May 2011	America region					
49	Seventh actuarial review of the NIS and feasibility study on the extension of social security to the self-employed	TRI/06/01/TRI	245,012	May 2006-Jun 2010	Caribbean					
50	Capacity building for the actuarial valuation of the social insurance scheme of St Lucia as of 2006	STL/07/01/STL	31,910	Sep 2007-Mar 2010	St Lucia					
51	Actuarial services for the tenth actuarial review of the Dominica social security system as of 31 December 2008 with a review of the impact of recent reforms	DMI/09/01/DMI	20,764	Sep 2009-Mar2011	Dominican Republic					
52	Apoyo a la direccion de presupuestos para el proceso de reforma previsional	CHI/07/01/CHI	102,108	Feb 2007-Apr 2010	Chile					
53	Contribution to implementation of DWCP in Chile	CHI/08/01/CHI	164,959	Jul 2008-May 2010	Chile					
54	Validacion de la valuacion actuarial del regimen de invalidez, vejez y muerte (RIVM) realizada por la Caja Costarricense de Seguro Social (CCSS)	COS/09/01/COS	27,120	Oct 2009-Mar 2011	Costa Rica					
ARAB STATES										
55	Eight actuarial valuation of the	KUW/04/01/KUW	131,806	Aug 2004-	Kuwait					

	social security system administered by the public institution for social security of Kuwait			Jun 2008						
56	Actuarial consultancy, 2005-2008	JOR/05/01/JOR	292,266	Sep 2005-Dec 2009	Jordan					
57	Peer review of the report on the actuarial valuation of the public authority for social insurance of the Sultanate of Oman	OMA/07/01/OMA	46,302	Nov 2007-Feb 2010	Oman					
ASIA & PACIFIC										
58	Seventh actuarial valuation of the social security fund and capacity building in Malaysia	MAL/03/01/MAL	21,829	Dec 2003-Mar 2006	Malaysia					
59	Social protection policy phase III	MAL/01/001/01	8,007	Sep 2003-Mar 2006	Malaysia					
60	Technical assistance on social security: legislation, financing and administration	CMB/04/50/ROK	36,858	Jan 2004-Mar 2006	Cambodia					
61	Development of social security in Lao PDR	LAO/01/01/LUX	1,626,325	Jan 2002-Feb 2009	Lao People's Democratic Republic					
62	National scheme of unemployment insurance	SR/03/01/ADB		Jul 2003-Mar 2006	Sri Lanka					
63	Extending the coverage of social security to the excluded and the poor (see INT/02/M71/NET- sub umbrella)	SRL/02/50/NET		Jan 2002-Mar 2006	Sri Lanka					
64	National retirements benefit scheme	TON/01/001/01	63,193	Dec 2001-Dec 2007	Tonga					
65	Sub-regional initiative on social security for the Pacific Island Countries	RAS/04/59/NET	960,890	Mar 2004-Feb 2007	Asia and the Pacific region					
66	Extending social protection through Micro-health insurance schemes for women in the informal economy	RAS/01/02/NOR	26,800	Jan 2001-Mar 2006	Asia and the Pacific region					
67	Eighth actuarial valuation and	MAL/08/01/MAL	96,035	Apr 2008-	Malaysia					

	capacity building			Feb 2010						
68	Study to introduce relief fund for loss of unemployment benefits	MAL/09/01/MAL	120,884	Jun 2009-Jul 2010	Malaysia					
69	Actuarial valuation of the old-age pension branch of social security scheme for formal private workers in Thailand	THA/08/01/THA	41,791	Dec 2008-Dec 2009	Thailand					
70	Financial management of the Thai health care system	THA/05/01/EEC	1,069,946	Aug 2005-Mar 2010	Thailand					
71	Cost projection of a basic social protection package for selected Asian countries	RAS/06/02/UKM	16,793	Feb 2006-Sep 2006	Asia and the Pacific region					
72	Community social protection and income security for HIV vulnerable and HIV positive households in selected communities of Cambodia	CMB/05/05/ROC	145,072	Aug 2005-Mar 2009	Cambodia					
EUROPE & CENTRAL ASIA										
73	Social budget model for Luxembourg	LUX/01/01/LUX	20,885	Jul 2001-Mar 2007	Luxembourg					
74	Actuarial studies - Cyprus	CYP/03/01/CYP	11,300	Dec 2003-Apr 2007	Cyprus					
75	Actuarial valuation of human resource development authority of Cyprus	CYP/04/02/CYP		Apr 2004-Mar 2006	Cyprus					
76	Community development as an instrument to extend social protection to vulnerable population groups in Kosovo (umbrella INT/01/M30/FLA)	RER/01/51/FLA	41,364	Jan 2002-Dec 2007	Europe region					
77	Social protection for Kosovo: reconstruction and extension	RER/00/01/FRA		May 2000-Mar 2005	Europe region					
78	Combattre l'exclusion sociale en Europe central et orientale	RER/02/05/FRA	1,012,102	Mar 2004-Jul 2008	Europe region					
79	Renforcement de la gouvernance de la sécurité sociale en Europe Centrale et de l'Est	RER/02/07/FRA	459,630	Jan 2003-Dec 2006	Europe region					

80	Strengthening social protection in South East Europe	RER/02/04/FRA	516,538	Dec 2002-March 2008	Europe region					
81	Accroître l'étendue et l'efficacité de la protection sociale pour tous en Europe Centrale et Orientale (Phase II)	RER/01/07/FRA		Jan 2001-Mar 2006	Europe region					
82	Actuarial support to the Greek national actuarial authority	GRE/06/01/GRE	361,791	Jun 2006-Mar 2010	Greece					
83	Republic of Moldova: Building capacity for coordination of social security for migrant workers	MOL/08/02/ROM	41,542	Sep 2009-Dec 2010	Republic of Moldova					
84	Capacity building and peer review for the actuarial valuation of the Cyprus social insurance scheme as of 2006	CYP/07/01/CYP	44,494	Jun 2007-Feb 2010	Cyprus					
85	An international perspective for the future design of Germany's social protection system	GFR/05/02/DGB	11,848	Apr 2006-Feb 2010	Germany					
86	An international perspective for the social budget of Germany	GFR/05/01/HBF	44,529	Oct 2006-Mar 2010	Germany					
87	Empowering national pension scheme constituents in South Eastern Europe	RER/06/08/FRA	193,091	Dec 2006-Mar 2010	Europe region					
	Building capacity for coordination of social security for migrant workers	MOL/08/02/ROM		Sep 2009- Dec 2010	Moldova					
INTER-REGIONAL AND/OR GLOBAL										
88	ILO social security database	INT/04/52/NET	514,276	Mar 2004-Feb 2007	Inter-regional					
89	Teaching five Master-level courses at Maastricht University	INT/05/23/UOM	65,795	Sep 2005-Mar 2008	Inter-regional					
90	Teaching a master's level course on actuarial mathematics and actuarial practice	INT/05/02/UOM	23,031	Feb 2005-Mar 2006	Inter-regional					
91	Conceptual development of the global social initiative of the international labour Office	INT/03/08/UKM	2,565	Apr 2003-Mar 2006	Inter-regional					

92	Stratégies et techniques contre l'exclusion sociale et la pauvreté/ Portugal (STEP)	INT/99/07/POR	313,589	Jul 1999- Nov 2006	Inter-regional					
93	Lutte contre l'exclusion sociale (STEP)	INT/02/29/POR	2,271,937	Nov 2002- Feb 2008	Inter-regional					
94	Universitas- social protection (umbrella INT/00/M09/ITA)	INT/01/74/ITA	21,334	Jun 2001- Oct 2007	Inter-regional					
95	Strategies and tools against social exclusion and poverty	INT/97/10/BEL	180,957	Jan 1998- Sep 2007	Inter-regional					
96	Stratégies et techniques contre l'exclusion sociale et la pauvreté (STEP) – Phase II	INT/04/05/BEL	9,448,405	Jan 2004- May 2010	Global					
97	Capitalisation d'expérience et evaluation (umbrella INT/00/M03/FRA	INT/00/67/FRA	61,929	Jan 2002- Mar 2009	Inter-regional					
98	Fonds fiduciaires français pour l'expertise francophone	INT/00/18/FRA	312,140	Jan 2001- Dec2010	Inter-regional					
99	STEP Belgique Phase III	INT/08/94/BEL	55,961	Jan 2009- Dec2011	Global					
100	Extension de la protection sociale (STEP Portugal Phase II)	GLO/08/60/POR	652,575	Dec 2008- Dec 2012	Global					
101	Global campaign on social security and coverage for all as means to combat poverty in Africa and Asia	GLO/06/54/UKM	7,768,128	Nov 2006- Jun 2010	Global					
102	Rethinking the role of social security in state building: Research seminar and report	GLO/06/05/UKM	109,290	May 2006- Jun 2010	Global					
103	Lutte contre l'exclusion sociale- STEP Portugal III- International	INT/06/67/POR	2,116,112	Nov 2006- Dec 2009	Global					
104	Basic social protection benefit budgeting tool for low-income countries	GLO/06/13/UKM	158,582	Jun 2006- Jul 2010	Global					
105	The teaching of Master courses (academic year 2008-09) for SPF and SPD Master programme specialisation at Maastricht	GLO/08/16/UOM	100,231	Feb 2009- Feb 2010	Global					

	University									
106	The teaching of master courses for the Social Policy Financing and Social Policy design programmes at the University of Maastricht- graduate school of Governance	GLO/07/14/UOM	93,313	Oct 2007- Jun 2009	Global					
107	Teaching Master courses at Maastricht university 2006-2007	GLO/06/27/UOM	87,857	Oct 2006- Dec 2008	Global					
108	Strengthening social security and coverage for all through ILO social security standards: Academic consultation workshop and drafting of a technical paper to be presented to ILO constituency	GLO/07/09/NET	129,427	Aug 2007- Mar 2009	Global					
109	Basic social protection benefit budgeting tool for low income countries	GLO/06/15/GTZ		Nov 2006- Sep 2008	Global					
110	Appui à l'initiative internationale sur le développement de l'assurance maladie de tous les pays en développement	GLO/08/05/FRA	134,770	Sep 2008- Jan 2010	Global					
111	Decent work and promoting employment in the informal economy: how to strengthen social protection coverage	INT/07/12/EEC	236,685	Dec 2007- April 2009	Global					

ANNEX 5- ILO SOCIAL SECURITY STANDARDS-SETTING INSTRUMENTS

1 Summary description of ILO standards-setting instruments

International Labour Conventions, Protocols and Recommendations

International labour standards are legal instruments drawn up by the ILO's constituents (governments, employers and workers) and setting out basic principles and rights at work. They are either *Conventions*, which are legally binding international treaties that may be ratified by member States, or *Recommendations*, which serve as non-binding guidelines. In many cases, a convention lays down the basic principles to be implemented by ratifying countries, while a related Recommendation supplements the Convention by providing more detailed guidelines on how it could be applied. Recommendations can also be autonomous, i.e. not linked to any Convention.¹⁰⁸

Protocols are also international treaties but which, in the ILO context, do not exist independently since they are always linked to a Convention. Like Conventions, they are subject to ratification (however, the Convention to which they are linked also remains open for ratification). They are used for the purpose of partially revising Conventions, where the subject of the revision is limited. They thus allow adaptation to changing conditions and enable practical difficulties to be dealt with which have arisen since the Convention was adopted, thus making the Conventions more relevant and up to date.¹⁰⁹

Other ILO instruments

(a) ILC and Governing Body Declarations

Declarations are generally used by the ILO ILC or Governing Body in order to make a formal statement and reaffirm the importance which the constituents attach to certain principles and values. Although Declarations are not subject to ratification, they are intended to have a wide application and contain symbolic and political undertakings by the member States.

(b) ILC resolutions

The ILC generally uses Resolutions for two different purposes. It may use Resolutions as a way of formally expressing its will or its opinion on a given subject. The ILC may also adopt Resolutions accompanied by Conclusions following general tripartite discussions within one of its technical committees.

¹⁰⁸ http://www.ilo.org/global/What_we_do/InternationalLabourStandards/Introduction/ConventionsandRecommendations/lang--en/index.htm (accessed April, 28, 2010).

¹⁰⁹ ILO: *Setting social security standards in a global society. An analysis of present state and practice and of future options for global social security standard setting in the International Labour Organization*, Social Security Policy Briefings, Paper 2, Geneva, 2008, p.79.

2 Selected ILO social security Conventions

Maternity Protection Convention, 2000 (No. 183)
Employment Promotion and Protection against Unemployment Convention, 1988 (No. 168)
Maintenance of Social Security Rights Convention, 1982 (No. 157)
Medical Care and Sickness Benefits Convention, 1969 (No. 130)
Invalidity, Old-Age and Survivors' Benefits Convention, 1967 (No. 128)
Employment Injury Benefits Convention, 1964 (No. 121)
Equality of Treatment (Social Security) Convention, 1962 (No. 118)
Social Security (Minimum Standards) Convention, 1952 (No. 102)
Sickness Insurance (Agriculture) Convention, 1927 (No. 25)
Sickness Insurance (Industry) Convention, 1927 (No. 24)
Equality of Treatment (Accident Compensation) Convention, 1925 (No. 19)
Workmen's Compensation (Occupational Diseases) Convention, 1925 (No. 18)
Workmen's Compensation (Accidents) Convention, 1925 (No. 17)
Workmen's Compensation (Agriculture) Convention, 1921 (No. 12)
Maternity Protection Convention, 1919 (No. 3)

3 Selected ILO social security Recommendations

Maintenance of Social Security Rights Recommendation, 1983 (No. 167)
Medical Care and Sickness Benefits Recommendation, 1969 (No. 134)
Invalidity, Old-Age and Survivors' Benefits Recommendation, 1967 (No. 131)
Medical Care Recommendation, 1944 (No. 69)
Income Security Recommendation, 1944 (No. 67)

4 Other ILO social security standards-setting texts

Resolution and Conclusions concerning social security, International Labour Conference, 89th Session, 2001.
Declaration of Philadelphia, International Labour Conference, 26th Session, 10 May 1944.
Constitution of the International Labour Organisation, 1919.

5 Convention No. 102 ratification dates

Country	Ratification date
Albania	18.01.2006
Austria	04.11.1969
Barbados	11.07.1972
Belgium	26.11.1959
Bolivia	31.01.1977
Bosnia and Herzegovina	02.06.1993
Congo, Democratic Republic of	03.04.1987

Costa Rica	16.03.1972
Croatia	08.10.1991
Cyprus	03.09.1991
Country	Ratification date
Czech Republic	01.01.1993
Denmark	15.08.1955
Ecuador	25.10.1974
France	14.06.1974
Germany	21.02.1958
Greece	16.06.1955
Island	20.02.1961
Ireland	17.06.1968
Israel	16.12.1955
Italia	08.06.1956
Japan	02.02.1976
Libyan Arab Jamahiriya	19.06.1975
Luxembourg	31.08.1964
Mauritania	15.07.1968
Mexico	12.10.1961
Montenegro	03.06.2006
The Netherlands	11.10.1962
Niger	09.08.1966
Norway	30.09.1954
Peru	23.08.1961
Poland	03.12.2003
Portugal	17.03.1994
Senegal	22.10.1962
Serbia	24.11.2000
Slovakia	01.01.1993
Slovenia	29.05.1992
Spain	29.06.1988
Sweden	12.08.1953
Switzerland	18.10.1977
The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia	17.11.1991
Turkey	29.01.1975
United Kingdom	27.04.1954
Venezuela, Bolivarian republic of	05.11.1982

ANNEX 6. LIST OF INTERVIEWEES

No.	Name	Organization	Department	Role
1	Carole Logan	ILO	EVAL	Director
2	Michael Cichon	ILO	SECSOC	Director
3	Alejandro Bonilla-Garcia	ILO	SECSOC	Manager, QUATRIN America
4	Florence Bonnet	ILO	SECSOC	ILO FACTS
5	Krzysztof Hagemayer	ILO	SECSOC	Coordinator Social security Policy
6	Ursula Kulke	ILO	SECSOC	Coordinator standards and legal services
7	Philippe Marcadent	ILO	SECSOC	Coordinator informal sector tools
8	Xenia Scheil-Adlung	ILO	SECSOC	Coordinator health care
9	Karuna Pal	ILO	SECSOC	Coordinator budget and resource management
10	Wolfgang Scholtz	ILO	SECSOC	Coordinator fiscal and economic policy, capacity building
11	Christian Jacquier	ILO	SECSOC	Coordinator STEP programme
12	Aidi Hu	ILO	SECSOC	Social security specialist, Asia
13	Joe Thurman	ILO	PROGRAM	Director
14	Alette van Leur	ILO	PARDEV	Director
15	Assane Diop	ILO	ED/PROTECT	Executive Director
16	Philippe Egger	ILO	CABINET	Deputy Director
17	Stephen Pursey	ILO	INTEGRATION	Director
18	Jean-François Retournard	ILO	ACTEMP	Director
19	Dan Cunniah	ILO	ACTRAV	Director
20	Ibrahim Awad	ILO	MIGRANT	Chief
21	Peter Peek	ILO	EMP/POLICY	CTA
22	Terje Tessem	ILO	EMP/INVEST	Chief
23	Azita Berar-Awad	ILO	EMP/POLICY	Director
24	Valerie Schmitt-Diabate	ILO	SRO Bangkok	Social security specialist
25	Christina Behrendt	ILO	RO Beirut	Social security specialist
26	Jo Hyung Kyu	ILO	SRO Bangkok	Social security Officer
27	Bill Salter	ILO	SRO Bangkok	Director
28	Jittima Srisuknam	ILO	SRO Bangkok	Programme Officer for Thailand
29	Sandra Yu	ILO	SRO Bangkok	Local decent work development specialist

No.	Name	Organization	Department	Role
30	Markus Ruck	ILO	ILO-Kathmandu	Officer-in-charge, ILO Nepal
31	Saloman Rajbanshi	ILO	ILO- Kathmandu	Programme Officer
32	Rapeesupa Wangcharoenrung	Fiscal Policy Research Institute, Thailand	...	Senior Economist
33	Supanee Chantaramas	Ministry of Finance, Thailand	Fiscal Policy Office	...
34	Barbara Olandini et al	UN	Thailand task force on social protection	...
35	Weerawat Phuncrut	National Health Security Office, Thailand	...	Deputy Secretary-General
36	Jadej Thammatacharee	Bureau of Policy and Planning, Thailand	...	Director
37	Kulasake Limpiyakorn	Treasury, Thailand	Civil Service Medical Benefit Scheme (CSMBS)	...
38	Walaiporn Patcharanarumol	Ministry of Public health, Thailand	International Health Policy Program	Researcher
39	Pan Warnnapinij	Social Security Office, Thailand	...	Secretary-General
40	Chantana Boon-Art	Social Security Office, Thailand	...	...
41	Thaworn Sakunphanit	Health Insurance System Research Office	...	Deputy Director
42	Krishna Hari Banskota	Ministry of Finance, Nepal	...	Secretary (revenue)
43	Pradeep Jung Pandey	FNCCI, Employers'	...	Chairperson

No.	Name	Organization	Department	Role
		Council, Nepal		
44	Hansa Ram Pandey	FNCCI, Employers' Council, Nepal	...	Director
44	Atma Ram Pandey	National Planning Commission, Nepal	...	Joint Secretary
45	Bishnu Rimal	General Federation of Nepalese Trade Unions (GEFONT)	...	Chairperson
45	Umesh Upadhya	General Federation of Nepalese Trade Unions (GEFONT)	...	Secretary-General
46	Jasmine Rajbhandari	World Bank, Nepal		Social security specialist
47	Laxman Basnet	Nepal Trade Union Congress	...	President
48	Beth Verhey	UNICEF	Social Policy and Decentralization	Chief
49	Purna Chandra Bhattarai	Ministry of Labour and Transport Management, Nepal	...	Joint Secretary
50	David Evans	WHO	Department of Health and Systems financing	Director
51	Peter Mertens	WHO	UN and Intergovernmental Organizations Unit	Coordinator
52	Dennis Pain	DFID	Poverty Response Team, policy and Research Division	Social protection team leader
53	Isabelle Ortiz	UNICEF	Policy and Practice	Associate Director
54	Robert Holzmann	World Bank	Social Protection and Labor sector	Research Director and Senior Advisor
55	Phillip Fishman	ILO	Better Work	Manager

No.	Name	Organization	Department	Role
			Jordan	
56	Thoraya El-Rayyes	ILO	Jordan Decent Work and Gender Equality Project	National Programme Officer
57	Joaquin Martinez Soler	ILO	Promoting Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work Project -- Jordan	Project Manager
58	Maurizzio Bussi	ILO	Regional office Beirut	Deputy Regional Director
59	Christine Behrendt	ILO	Regional office Beirut	Social Security Specialist
60	Rasha Tabbara	ILO	Regional office Beirut	Programme Office – Jordan
61	Mary Kawar	ILO	Regional office Beirut	Skills Specialist
62	Mazen Maaytah	Federation of Jordanian Trade Unions	...	Secretary General
63	Haider Rashid	General Federation of Jordanian Trade Unions	...	Member of Executive Committee
64	Zaki Al-Ayoubi	Jordan Chamber of Industry	...	Director General
65	Ibrahim Saif	Economic and Social Council of Jordan		Secretary General
66	Yasmeen Tabba	Economic and Social Council of Jordan		Social Policy Analyst
67	Mohammed Nabulsi	Economic and Social Council of		Policy Advisor, Director of Communications

No.	Name	Organization	Department	Role
		Jordan Social Security Corporation		
68	Ayman Kassab	Social Security Corporation		Assistant Director General, Director of Information Center
69	Mohammed Deknash	Social Security Corporation		Actuary
70	Hazim Rahahleh	Social Security Corporation		Director, Studies and Development Department
71	Nadia Al-Awamleh Director, International Cooperation Department, Studies and Development Directorate	Social Security Corporation		Director, International Cooperation Department, Studies and Development Directorate
72	Majeda Al-Assaf	UNDP, Amman		Poverty Analyst
73	Diana Jreisat	ISSA	Liason Office for Arab Countries	Liason Officer
74	Costas Stavrakis	Cyprus	Ministry of Labour and Social Insurance	Actuarial Advisor
75	Mr Theofanis Tryfonos	Cyprus	...	Director of Social Insurance Services
76	Andreas Ph. Matsas	European Affairs-SEK		Director
77	Sotiris Fellas	Pancyprian Federation of Labour, (PEO)		Deputy Secretary General

No.	Name	Organization	Department	Role
78	Emilios Michail	Cyprus Chamber of Commerce and Industry (KEBE)	...	Labour Relations Manager
79	Alberto Arenas	University of Chile	Faculty of Economics...	Professor
80	Ms Ginette Forgues	ILO	International Training Centre	Manager, Social Protection Programme
81	Markus Ruck	ILO	SRO-New Delhi	. Social security Specialist,
82	Mr Krzysztof Hagemeyer	ILO	Social Security Dept.	.. Coordinator Social Security Policy
83	Fabio Bertranou	ILO	Regional Office Santiago...	.Social Security Specialist
84	Liu Xiaoping	Permanent Mission of China to the UN Geneva		Counsellor
85	Mariko Ouchi	ILO	Moscow Office	Social Security Specialist
86	Lania Samuel	EC	DG Employment, Social Affairs, and Equal Opportunities	Deputy Director General
87	Frank Hoffer	ILO		
... = data not available.				

ANNEX 7. WORKS CITED

- ADB. (2003). *Social Protection: Our framework, policies and strategies*. Manila.
- AU. (2006). *The Livingstone Call for Action*. Retrieved April 16, 2010, from http://www.undp-povertycentre.org/doc_africa_brazil/Livingstone-call-for-action.pdf
- Bonnet, F. (2009). The ILO Social Security Inquiry. *16th International Conference of Actuaries and Social security Statisticians*. Ottawa.
- Cichon, M. (2008). Mission Report: Kathmandu, 24-27 November 2008.
- Concertation, L. (2004). *Inventaire des systèmes d'assurance maladies en Afrique: Synthèse des travaux de recherche dans 11 pays*. Dakar.
- DFID. (2006). *Social Protection in Poor Countries*. London: Social Protection Briefing Note Series, Number 1.
- Drouin, A., & Cichon, M. (2009). Optimal Financing and Self-Adjusting Mechanisms for Sustainable Retirement Systems: The social stabilization of pensions in times of crises and beyond. A critical review of three decades of pension reforms and their outcomes. *International Conference of Social security Actuaries and Statisticians*. Ottawa.
- (2006). *Fifth National Development Plan 2006-2010*. Lusaka: Republic of Zambia, Ministry of Finance and National Planning.
- (2003). *Ghana Poverty reduction Strategy 2003-2005, An Agenda for growth and prosperity, Volume I: Analysis and policy statement*. Accra.
- Grüb, A. (2007). *Ghana-Social Security Schemes for Health*. Retrieved April 14, 2010, from GESS: <http://www.socialsecurityextension.org/gimi/gess/RessShowRessource.do?ressourceId=4872>
- Guillion, C., & al. (2000). *Social security pensions: Development and reforms*. Geneva: ILO.
- Hagemejer, K. (2006). *SPER methodology*. Retrieved March 2010, from <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/protection/secsoc/downloads/stat/spersmet.pdf>
- ILO. (2010). *[RO Beirut] Social security*. Retrieved March 8, 2010, from <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/region/arpro/beirut/areas/social.htm>
- ILO. (2006). *[Social Health Protection] What are the ILO's key activities?* Retrieved March 24, 2010, from <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/protection/secsoc/areas/policy/activity.htm>
- ILO. (2006). *[Social Health Protection] What are the key issues?* Retrieved March 24, 2010, from <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/protection/secsoc/areas/policy/issue.htm>
- ILO. (2006). *[Social transfers impacts database] Compendium Bibliography*. Retrieved March 30, 2010, from GESS:

<http://www.socialsecurityextension.org/gimi/gess/ShowCompendiumBibliographiesForUser.do>

ILO. (2008). *[Technical Cooperation] In Africa*. Retrieved March 8, 2010, from <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/protection/secsoc/projects/africa.htm>

ILO. (2008). *[Technical Cooperation] In Asia and the Pacific*. Retrieved March 8, 2010, from <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/protection/secsoc/projects/asia.htm>

ILO. (2008). *[Technical Cooperation] In Europe*. Retrieved March 8, 2010, from <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/protection/secsoc/projects/europe.htm>

ILO. (2008). *[Technical Cooperation] In the Americas and the Caribbean*. Retrieved March 8, 2010, from <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/protection/secsoc/projects/latin.htm>

ILO. (2008). *The future of Social Security in Arab States in the Middle East and North Africa*. Geneva

ILO. (2004). *A Technical Note to the Government: Financing universal health care in Thailand*. Bangkok: SRO Bangkok.

ILO. (2006). *Actuarial and financial advisory services*. Retrieved March 30, 2010, from <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/protection/secsoc/areas/ilofacts/ilofacts.htm>

ILO. (2008). *Asia-Pacific Regional High-level meeting on Socially-inclusive Strategies to Extend Social Security*. New Dehli: Social Security policy Briefings, Paper 6.

ILO. (2008). *Jordan: Case Study. How to strengthen social protection coverage in the context of the European Union agenda on decent work and promoting employment in the informal economy*.

ILO (2008). *Technical Comments on the Draft Jordanian Social Security Law*, Geneva.

ILO (2008). *Peer review of the actuarial valuation of the Cyprus social security scheme*, Geneva.

ILO. (2007). *Basic Social Protection Manual*. Geneva.

ILO. (2009). *Building Adequate social protection systems and Protecting People in the Arab Region*. Beirut: RO Beirut.

ILO. (2009). *Building adequate social protection systems and protecting people in the Arab region*, Geneva.

ILO, (2009). *Sixth Actuarial Review of the Social Security Corporation (Jordan)*. Geneva.

ILO. (2006). *Changing the paradigm in social security: From fiscal burden to investing in people*. Geneva.

ILO. (2006). *Collecte, organisation et diffusion des statistiques sur la sécurité sociale du Département SECSOC: Démarche proposée premier acte*. Geneva.

ILO. (2006). *Cost of social security basic tables 1990-93-Introduction*. Retrieved February 24, 2010, from <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/protection/secsoc/areas/stat/css/cssintro.htm>

ILO, (2006). ILO Decent Work Country Programme (Jordan)

ILO (2006). Actuarial valuation of reform scenarios for the Social Insurance Scheme. Geneva.

ILO. (2007). *Decent work Country Programme Bosnia Herzegovina 2008-10*.

ILO. (2007). *Decent Work Agenda in Africa (2007-2015)*. Addis Ababa.

ILO. (2007). Report to the Government of Jordan, Feasibility Study on the Implementation of a Maternity Cash Benefits Scheme. Geneva

ILO. (2008). *Decent Work and Social Protection in Six countries: Umbrella paper. India, Jordan, Morocco, Syria, Thailand and Viet Nam*. Geneva: Social Security Department.

ILO. (2005). *Decent Work country Programme Bosnia Herzegovina 2006-07*.

ILO. (2005). *Decent Work Country Programme for Ghana (2006-2009)*.

ILO. (2007). *Decent Work Country programme for Nepal 2008-2010*.

ILO. (2006). *Decent Work Country Programme for Senegal*.

ILO. (2006). *Decent Work Country Programme Hashemite Kingdom of Jordan*.

ILO. (2006). *Decent Work in the Americas: An agenda for the hemisphere 2006-2015*. Brasilia.

ILO. (1944). Declaration concerning the aims and purposes of the International Labour Organization (Declaration of Philadelphia). *International Labour Conference, 26th Session*. Philadelphia.

ILO. (2009). Draft National Social Security Organization Law (unpublished). Social Security Department.

ILO. (2009). Draft Unemployment Insurance Law (unpublished). Social Security Department.

ILO. (2009). Extending Social Security to All: A review of challenges, present practice, and strategic options. Draft for discussion. *Tripartite meeting of experts on strategies for the extension of social security coverage*. Geneva.

ILO. (2006). *From Disability Benefits to Gainful Employment: Conference Report*. Budapest: SRO Budapest.

ILO. (2004). Global Campaign on Social Security and Coverage for All: A progress report, GB.289/ESP/5. *Governing Body, 289th Session, Mar*. Geneva.

ILO. (2005). *Global Campaign on Social security and Coverage for All: details of key ILO activities*. Retrieved February 23, 2010, from

<http://www.ilo.org/public/english/protection/secsoc/downloads/events/upcomingactivities05.pdf>

ILO. (2007). *Global Social Trust (GST)*. Retrieved February 26, 2010, from <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/protection/secsoc/areas/policy/gst.htm>

ILO. (2007). *Hashemenite kingdom of Jordan: Report to the Government. Feasibility study on the implementation of a maternity cash benefits scheme*. Beirut: RO Beirut.

ILO. (2006). ILO programme implementation 2004-05, GB.295/PFA/13. *Governing Body, 295th Session, Mar*. Geneva.

ILO. (2008). ILO programme implementation 2006-07, GB.301/PFA/2. *Governing Body, 301st Session, Mar*. Geneva.

ILO. (2010). ILO programme implementation 2008-09, GB.307/PFA/2. *Governing Body, 307th Session, Mar*. Geneva.

ILO. (2006). *Impacts of social benefits*. Retrieved March 30, 2010, from GESS: <http://www.socialsecurityextension.org/gimi/gess/ShowWiki.do?wid=59>

ILO. (2006). *Informal sector*. Retrieved March 26, 2010, from <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/protection/secsoc/areas/policy/informal.htm>

ILO. (2008). *Inter-regional project: How to strengthen social protection coverage in the context of the European Union Agenda on decent work and promoting employment in the informal economy. Jordan. A case study*. Geneva: Social Security Department.

ILO. (2008). *Inter-regional project: How to strengthen social protection coverage in the context of the European Union Agenda on decent work and promoting employment in the informal economy. Thailand: A case study*. Geneva: Social Security Department.

ILO. (2008). *Inter-regional Tripartite Meeting on the Future of Social Security in Arab States. Amman, 6-8 May 2008*. Geneva: Social Security Policy briefings, Paper 5.

ILO. (2008). *La Reforma Previsional en Chile y la Contribución de la OIT*. Santiago: SRO Santiago.

ILO. (2006). *Master in actuarial Science*. Retrieved March 30, 2010, from <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/protection/secsoc/areas/mas.htm>

ILO. (2006). *Master in Social Policy Financing*. Retrieved March 30, 2010, from <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/protection/secsoc/areas/mspf.htm>

ILO. (2009). Memorandum Accompanying the Draft Unemployment Insurance Law for Nepal (unpublished). Social Security Department.

ILO. *Nepal: Social security Activities Update at end -September 2007 (unpublished)*. Social Security Department.

ILO. (2006). *Obtaining advisory services*. Retrieved March 30, 2010, from <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/protection/secsoc/areas/ilofacts/operation.htm>

- ILO. (2006). *Partnerships*. Retrieved March 1, 2010, from <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/protection/secsoc/about/partners.htm>
- ILO. (2009). Programme and Budget Proposals for 2010-11, GB.304/PFA/3. *Governing Body, 304th Session, Mar.* Geneva.
- ILO. (2008). *Proposed Policy for Unemployment Insurance Scheme 2008 (Nepal)*. Social Security Department.
- ILO. (2009). QUATRIN Africa, Executive Masters of Science in Social Protection Financing, Course outline.
- ILO. (2006). QUATRIN Americas. Retrieved March 30, 2010, from GESS: <http://www.socialsecurityextension.org/gimi/gess/ShowTheme.do?tid=327>
- ILO. (2006). Realizing Decent Work in Asia. *14 th Asian Regional Meeting*. Busan.
- ILO. (2009). *Recovering from the crisis: A Global Jobs Pact*. Geneva.
- ILO. (2009). *Report on the Pension Reform in Bosnia Herzegovina*. Budapest: SRO Budapest.
- ILO. (2001). Resolutions and Conclusions concerning social security . *International Labour Conference, 89th Session*. Geneva.
- ILO. (2008). *Reunión Regional Tripartita sobre el futuro de la protección social en América Latina. Santiago, Chile, 12 al 14 de diciembre de 2007*. Geneva: Social Security Department.
- ILO. (2008). *Setting Social Security Standards in a Global Society: An analysis of present state and practice and future options for global social security standard setting in the International Labour Organization*. Geneva: Social Security Policy Briefings, Paper 2.
- ILO. (2008). *Social Dialogue on Pension Reform in South Eastern Europe: A survey of the social partners* . Budapest: SRO Budapest.
- ILO. (2007). *Social health protection*. Retrieved March 24, 2010, from <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/protection/secsoc/areas/policy/social.htm>
- ILO. (2007). *Social Health Protection: An ILO strategy towards universal access to health care. A consultation*. Geneva: Issues in Social Protection, Discussion Paper 19.
- ILO. (2005). Social protection as a productive factor, GB.294/ESP/4. *Governing Body, 294th Session, Nov.* Geneva.
- ILO. (2006). *Social Protection Expenditure and Performance Reviews (SPERs)*. Retrieved February 24, 2010, from <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/protection/secsoc/downloads/stat/spers.htm>
- ILO. (2005). Social Security Department Annual Delivery Report. Geneva.
- ILO. (2006). Social Security Department Annual Delivery Report. Geneva.
- ILO. (2007). Social Security Department Annual Delivery Report. Geneva.

- ILO. (2008). *Social Security Department Annual Delivery Report*. Geneva.
- ILO. (2009). *Social Security Department Annual Delivery Report*. Geneva.
- ILO. (2008). *Social security expenditure database*. Retrieved March 22, 2010, from <http://www.ilo.org/dyn/sesame/ifpses.socialdbexp>
- ILO. (2010). *Social Security for All*. Retrieved March 30, 2010, from ITCILO: <http://www.itcilo.org/en/expertise-services/social-security-for-all>
- ILO. (2006). *Social Security for All. Investing in a global social and economic development. A consultation*. Geneva: Issues in Social Protection Series, Discussion Paper 16.
- ILO. (2009). *Social Security for All: Investing in social justice and economic development*. Geneva: Social Security Policy briefings, Paper 7.
- ILO. (2005). *Social Security Inquiry Manual:First inquiry, 2005*. Retrieved February 24, 2010, from <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/protection/secsoc/downloads/stat/ssimane.pdf>
- ILO. (2009). *Social Security Profile, Ghana*. Retrieved April 14, 2010, from GESS: <http://www.socialsecurityextension.org/gimi/gess/ShowCountryProfile.do?cid=309&aid=2>
- ILO. (2008). *Social Security Profile, Mozambique*. Retrieved April 12, 2010, from GESS: <http://www.socialsecurityextension.org/gimi/gess/ShowCountryProfile.do?cid=314&aid=2>
- ILO. (2009). *Social Security Profile, Senegal*. Retrieved April 12, 2010, from GESS: <http://www.socialsecurityextension.org/gimi/gess/ShowCountryProfile.do?cid=308&aid=2>
- ILO. (2010). *Social Security Profile, Zambia* . Retrieved March 8, 2010, from GESS: <http://www.socialsecurityextension.org/gimi/gess/ShowCountryProfile.do?cid=238&aid=2>
- ILO. (2005). *Social Security Spending in South Eastern Europe: A comparative review*. Budapest: SRO Budapest.
- ILO. (2008). Social security standards and the ILO campaign for the extension of social security, GB.303/ESP/3. *Governing Body, 303rd Session, Nov.* Geneva.
- ILO. (2009). Strategic Policy Framework 2010-15: Making decent work happen, GB.304/PFA/2 (rev.). *Governing Body, 304th Session, Mar.* Geneva.
- ILO. (2004). *Technical Note on the Extension of Social Security to the Informal Economy in Thailand*. Bangkok: SRO Bangkok.
- ILO. (2005). *Thailand: Actuarial assessment of reform options on the introduction of survivors' pensions under the Social Security Fund of Thailand*. Bangkok: SRO Bangkok.
- ILO. (2005). *Thailand: Actuarial review of invalidity benefits provided under the Social Security Fund*. Bangkok: SRO Bangkok.
- ILO. (2004). *Thailand: Actuarial review of the old-age benefit branch of the Social security Fund*. Bangkok: SRO Bangkok.
- ILO. (2009). *Thailand: Pension reform in times of crisis. A report requested by the Ministry of Finance*. Geneva: SRO Bangkok.

ILO. (2004). *Thailand: Preliminary actuarial review of the sickness, maternity, invalidity and death benefit branches of the Social security Fund*. Bangkok: SRO Bangkok.

ILO. (2008). *Thailand: Universal health care coverage through pluralistic approaches*. Bangkok: SRO Bangkok.

ILO. (2008). *The Future of Social Security in Arab States in the Middle East and North Africa: Background note to the ILO address at the Inter-regional Tripartite Meeting on the Future of Social Security in Arab States*. Amman, 6-8 May 2008. Geneva: Social Security Department.

ILO. (2009). *Towards Decent Work Outcomes: A review of ILO work for 2005-08. 8th European Regional Meeting report to the Director General Volume II*. Lisbon.

ILO. (2006). *What does legal advice comprise?* Retrieved March 30, 2010, from <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/protection/secsoc/areas/legal/legalact.htm>

ILO. (2006). *Workmen's Compensation Fund. Report to the Social Security Office of Thailand*.

ILO. (2000). *World Labour Report 2000: Income security and social protection in a changing world*, GB.279/ESP/7. *Governing Body, 279th Session*, Nov. Geneva.

ILO, & WHO. (2009). *Social Protection Floor Initiative: Manual and strategic framework for joint UN country operations*. Geneva.

ILO, WHO, & GTZ. (2007). *GTZ-ILO-WHO Consortium on Social Health Protection in Developing Countries*. Retrieved March 22, 2010, from <http://www.shi-conference.de/index.php>

ILO, WHO, GTZ, & AFD. (2009). *Memorandum of Understanding between AFD, ILO, WHO and GTZ on collaboration concerning social health protection*.

(2006). *National Social Security Strategy Policy Document (Draft November 2006)*. Lusaka: Republic of Zambia, Ministry of labour and Social Security.

P4H. (2009). *Providing for Health business meeting, 22-23 January 2009 draft report*.

Pal, K., Behrendt, C., Léger, F., Cichon, M., & Hagemeyer, K. (2005). *Can low-income countries afford basic social protection? First results of a modelling exercise*. Geneva: SOCFAS, Discussion Paper 13.

Pal, K., Cattaert, G., Woodall, J., & Hagemeyer, K. (2008). *Nepal: Affordable and not an illusion. Costing of basic social protection benefits for Nepal 2007-2034. Technical note*. Geneva.

Planning, D. f. (2009). *Development strategy of Bosnia Herzegovina*. Retrieved April 15, 2010, from http://www.dep.gov.ba/dwnld/CDS_FINAL_DRAFT_in_English_Jan2010.pdf

WHO. (2009). *Primary health care, including health system strengthening*, WHA.62.12. *World Health Assembly, 62nd Session*. Geneva.

WHO. (2007). *Report on the Technical Meeting on the Providing for Health Initiative*. Bonn.

WHO. (2005). Sustainable health financing, universal coverage and social health insurance, WHA.58.33. *World Health Assembly, 58th Session* . Geneva.

Woodall, J., & Hagemeyer, K. (2009). Maintening Pensions Levels in PAYG Schemes in Ageing Societies:Rules versus discretion. *ISSA Technical Seminar on Pensions*. Paris.