



Evaluation Summaries

Women's employment concerns and working conditions in Pakistan (WEC-PK)

Quick Facts

Countries: Pakistan

Final Evaluation: March-April 2010

Mode of Evaluation: Independent

ILO Technical Area: GENDER

Evaluation Management: ILO Islamabad

Evaluation Team: Mahjabeen Qazi

Project Dates: May 2005 - March 2010

Project Code: PAK/05/01/CAN

Donor: Canada US\$ 2.6 million

Keywords: Gender equality, decent work, working conditions, capacity building /government and trade unions, skills development, awareness raising

Background & Context

The following are the major goals of the project entitled "Women's Employment Concerns and Working Conditions (WEC-PK)":

- I. Creation of a supportive environment through institutional strengthening of relevant ministries and other social partners
- II. Provision of direct assistance to women to secure decent employment

To achieve these goals, the programme has four interrelated components:

Component 1: Creating a supportive environment for working women

Component 2: Direct assistance to women in accessing decent employment

Component 3: Promoting gender equality in private sector employment in Pakistan

Component 4: Promoting women's participation and leadership in trade unions in Pakistan

The project has been implemented under the overall supervision of ILO country director, at the national level. The project was implemented through ILO tripartite constituents of ILO including Ministry of Labour and Manpower (MOLM), Employers Federation of Pakistan (EFP) and Pakistan Workers Federation (PWF). In addition partners from Civil Society Organizations (CSO) were engaged to implement the second component of the project. The project team at ILO including National Project Coordinator and two Project officers provided technical, strategic guidance and monitoring support to the partners. In addition, National Steering Committee representing MOLM, EFP, EFP and CSO also provided strategic guidance to the project.

Present situation of project

The project period had completed its major activities at the time of final evaluation. The project was carrying out final and concluding activities of the project.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The final evaluation study was carried out with the purpose to draw lessons from experience gained during the project period (with

particular focus on progress made after the Mid-Term Evaluation (MTE) and how these lessons of MTE could be applied in programming future activities. The main objective of the evaluation study are summarized below

- i) Identify emerging potential good practices.
- ii) Assess the efforts made by the project to address the issues and reduce the gaps identified in MTE.
- iii) Develop a set of recommendations that could be used in shaping the strategy for new project on Gender Equality.
- iv) Identify the potential impact on policy and strategies and suggest a possible way forward for the future.

Methodology of evaluation

In order to carry out the evaluation study, participatory methodology was adopted. The following steps were followed;

1. Discussions with the project staff
2. Desk review of pertinent project documents to develop checklist for evaluation
3. Visits and discussions with concerned stakeholders including project staff, project partners, beneficiaries and donor organization.

The consultant met with 12 implementing partners of four project components for the final evaluation including project team and donor CIDA (details given in annex 2). Since 100 percent coverage of all partners and geographical areas was not possible under the scope of the study, therefore a careful selection of partners was made on the basis of their mandate with the project. Four main factors were taken into consideration while making the selection;

- i. Partners interviewed by MTE team to assess the progress made after MTE
- ii. Geographical spread (where security allowed) to cover all parts of the country and project areas
- iii. Coverage of four project components

- iv. Partnerships with average to promising results

Main Findings & Conclusions

The review of project implementation reveals that it has achieved planned targets under four components while achievements in training are higher than the planned targets. Following are the main findings under each component.

Component 1:

- The ILO team has made continuous efforts to keep MOLM involved and informed of all project activities. These efforts have developed greater ownership within MOLM for the project objectives.
- The project has substantially contributed to the development of useful training and resource materials. These have become a regular part of training programmes of various government institutes which will have long term policy and programmatic impacts.
- The project has succeeded in legislating bills on prevention of harassment at work in the Parliament and social protection of home-based workers in the National Assembly

Component 2:

- The selected partners provided sufficient grounds for implementing pilot projects and achieving targets in an efficient manner. Moreover, broad range of partners provided geographical and sectoral spread to the project.
- The broad based focus of the project has at times compromised programme effectiveness as partners were allocated with limited resources (time and financial resources). This limitation at times resulted in partners compromising on planning, monitoring, follow up to ensure sustainability of sub- projects.
- The experience and partnership with Ministry of Textile Industry (MinTex) is one of the successful models where skills

training provided to women were responsive to the market demand.

Component 3:

- Sensitizing private sector on gender issues at work place and formulation of gender equality policy is a major achievement of the project as around 60 companies against the project target of 20 endorsed the gender policy.
- The complete adoption of policy within companies is a gradual process and premature to assess tangible impact.
- The objectives of WEC-PK fits well into EFP mandate. The project focused on two main ILO's conventions C.100 and C.111 which fit into the mandate of EFP. Therefore, promotion of gender equality in private sector is part of EFP own mandate which is being implemented with the help of ILO.

Component 4:

- As an outcome of the capacity building initiatives with women workers and office bearers in trade unions, they have better awareness level, improved negotiation skill, and better confidence level which has lead them to demand for equal rights and wages at their work places. This has also contributed to strengthened women committees at regional level.
- Men have started recognizing the role of women in trade unions which is mainly credited to the gender sensitization sessions conducted with both men and women.
- The project has been implemented in close consultation with PWF which has contributed to its capacity building in policy formulation, planning, implementation, monitoring. This has built the Institutional capacity of PWF towards achieving project objectives.

Overall project assessment

- The project has long term strategic objectives however; it has achieved number of strategic steps which contributes to the overall objectives.
- The project has remained focused on its strategic features and its elements. However, the project extension provided it with the opportunity to consolidate its activities.
- The project focus on gender issues and employment concerns is particularly relevant in social, legal, policy development and economic situation of the country. The project approach has been effective and efficient in terms of making partnership with relevant stakeholders and working with existing government institutions.
- The project has published useful resource material and trained number of resource persons. The gender policy and its guidelines will further help ILO constituents to work towards promoting gender equality at work place in a systematic manner. These provide substantial grounds for project sustainability.

Recommendations & Lessons Learned

1. The long term strategic objectives of WEC-PK should be considered under a programmatic approach as it is difficult to achieve long term strategic objective in a time bound project.
2. In order to further build the implementation level capacities of MoLM and MoWD, steps need to be taken with a different strategic approach which will help sustain the activities begun in the project.
3. There is still need for continued and increased sensitization on women and employment related issues at various levels and stakeholders.

4. There is continued need to influence policy and advocate for greater awareness on better working conditions for women.
 5. In order to ensure continuation of training programmes in government institutions, master trainers in the faculty of these institutions should be trained to reduce dependency on ILO.
 6. Focus should be on filling in the gap in the demand and supply of skilled labour in the market. The experience with Mintex based on this principle is a successful model which should be replicated on a larger scale.
 7. To further achieve better and sustainable results, cohesion among various project components and constituents should have been brought through a proper strategic and inter linked approach rather than individual and one time efforts.
 8. Greater focus on enhancing professional skills of women working at the middle management level would contribute to breaking the glass ceiling.
 9. Assessment studies of the three components and constituents of ILO would contribute to the planning of upcoming projects.
 10. Individual unions and federation should develop implementation plans in the light of gender policy. The identified activities should be allocated with budgets to ensure their effective implementation.
 11. To bring women at the higher tiers of leadership in trade unions, it is important to provide strategic guidance to PWF to focus on capacity building and ensuring active involvement of women in unions at provincial and district levels.
- capacities to take forward project objectives on their own and translate policies into implementation.
2. The project objectives focus on the enhanced capacities of both MOLM and Ministry of Women Development (MOWD); however, there is gap in partnership levels between both ministries.
 3. There is need for bringing coordination among all components under a strategic implementation plan. All the concerned stakeholders need to be placed in their relevant role and allocate them responsibilities that will complement and supplement each other. However at the same time, ILO constituents and IPs also need to take proactive role in this regard.
 4. Focused partnerships under components 2 with longer duration and more input support (technical, time and financial) will help achieve deeper impact.
 5. Market and demand based training in skills ensures better employment opportunities in formal sector contributing to the project objectives.
 6. Consultative process and sensitization of stakeholders adopted under the project has shown good results in terms of creating better awareness level on the issues and developing ownership towards the project objectives.
 7. The EFP recommended that the adoption of gender policies should remain voluntary as a legally binding and strict monitoring system may create resistance.
 8. Strengthened women unions and networks provide women with strong foundations to further improve their roles in trade unions and PWF.

Important lessons learned

1. The project has made a lot of efforts to build institutional capacity of Ministry of Labour and Manpower (MoLM). However, there is still implementation level gap in