



Evaluation Summaries

Creating Jobs: Capacity building for local resource-based road works in selected districts in NAD and NIAS (Phase II)

Quick Facts

Countries: *Indonesia*

Final Evaluation: *Feb 2010*

Mode of Evaluation: *Independent*

Technical Area: *EMP/ENTERPRISE*

Evaluation Management: *ILO-Jakarta*

Evaluation Team: *Eri Trinurini-Adhi
& Mulyadi Abdullah*

Project End: *Nov 2009*

Project Code: *INS/51/071/11*

Donor: Multi Donor Trust Fund Office
Partnership Bureau-UNDP US\$ 2,402,039

Keywords: *Road construction, employment creation,*

Background & Context

Project's Background

The ILO applied a local-resource based approach in infrastructure works in Aceh and Nias since 2005 in support of the Master Plan of Reconstruction and Recovery Aceh and Nias.

This has led to the development of a full-fledged project on capacity building on local resource-based road works for local governments and contractors (LRB), which received an initial funding of USD 6.42 million from the Multi-Donor Fund for Aceh and North Sumatra (MDFANS) for implementation during 2006 first quarter 2008. The project was later

extended to phase II for an additional 18 months and the project budget was increased by USD 5,38 million. ILO is responsible for implementing the project, while UNDP is a partner agency and responsible for project monitoring, evaluation and reporting to the World Bank which is the trustee of the MDFANS.

The project's budget for phases I and II are administered off budget off treasury. Phase II had an actual start in October 2008. Currently, the project phase II extension to September 2010 is under review for approval by the MDFANS. The project is located in 4 districts: in Aceh (district Pidie and Bireuen) and in Nias Island (Nias and Nias Selatan). During phase II the project emphasizes strengthening the capacity building of local governments in effective application of the LRB approach. This includes strengthening of the contracting system, supervision of construction/rehabilitation to ensure cost-effective investments and quality rehabilitated road, developing maintenance procedures and practices of rural roads. Project phase II activities extend to enhancing the capacity of other rural infrastructure providers specifically small scale contractors, the consultants of KDP/PNPM, and local communities.

Based on the lessons learned in Phase I, the current phase II continues the introduction of alternative road pavement methods using cold asphalt, which are more environmental friendly and safer for the health of the workers. The LRB approach makes optimal the use of local materials and workers as well as promoting the participation of women in the

planning, rehabilitation and maintenance of rural infrastructure works.

Evaluation objectives, time frame and methodology

After 12 months of phase II implementation and according to the project monitoring framework, UNDP has commissioned an independent mid-term review (MTR). The objective of the evaluation is to review the project progress and challenges and to provide recommendation for necessary adjustment. The evaluation took place in November 2009 for 1 month working duration. It used a comprehensive approach, including desk review, observation, interviews and focused group discussions. All 4 districts were visited for collecting primary data. The evaluation focuses its examination on phase II's design relevance, effectiveness and efficiency of the implementation, the sustainability and impacts.

Project progress

The LRB capacity building project is also an infrastructure project, through which capacity building of local government, local contractors and communities are carried out. There are 2 elements of road infrastructure works in this project: road rehabilitation and routine maintenance works. The funding sources of these infrastructure road works come from the project and the local government and other organizations. The table below shows the project achievement of road rehabilitation and routine maintenance works as of September 30, 2009 based on the revised target. The target was revised due to the change of BRR's budget plan on infrastructure in Nias and Aceh, notably the cancellation of bridge works previously planned to be carried out by the project, but later undertaken by BRR. The project then allocated the bridge construction fund to additional road targets in Aceh and Nias. The quality of the physical road works has met standard specifications and received compliments from the provincial and district government and contractors. As per 30 September 2009, all of the government funded rehabilitation works in Bireuen and Pidie have not yet completed. The late disbursement of government budget has led to the late start of road works funded by government. Through road rehabilitation and maintenance works the project provides

capacity building to local government and contractors through an on-the-job strategy. As of September 2009, there were 65 managers, 41 supervisors and 48 supervisors from districts DBMCK have been trained. The worker days, excluding irrigation works, is amounted to 106,907 with 69% male and 30% female participation.

Relevancy, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability

The project design remains relevant in the existing condition. In phase II, the project intends to integrate critical aspects of the LRB approach into the government rural infrastructure programmes and investments with the aim to build better roads and promote asset management. To this purpose a strategy of in-house training facility has been set up for Bireuen and Pidie by the project. The logical framework of the project is clear, but the indicators were heavy tangible rather intangible, it is missing process-based indicators, which measures facilitation of the project to local government in making the decision.

The training was carried out effectively with the essential contribution of on-the-job-training to further contribute to the quality of the road works. The routine road maintenance training to KDP/PNPM has showed the good result. The plan of KDP to conduct a further training on the road maintenance to their consultants by their own funds increases the sustainability of the training's output. Nevertheless, the sustainability of the LRB training particularly in district of Bireun and Pidie is depending on the commitment of district government to establish training unit under DBMCK as agreed in the Memorandum of Agreement. The LRB is principally possible to be implemented in the government road works system, but the reinforcement of this approach becomes difficult due to the lack of sufficient number of skilled government officials and the will particularly of the decision makers on the LRB approach. Related to project management, the project management has been carried out efficiently, among others as it shows a total increase in the target: from 153 kms to 194 kms for roads to be rehabilitated and maintained with project's technical assistance.

Conclusions and Recommendations

The overall design are still relevant to the current situation. The involvement of the Ministry of Manpower and provincial DBMCK has positive influence to monitoring and evaluation as well as increasing the ownership. The capacity building of contractors and government staff training has been also successfully implemented.

Key influences factors to the success of capacity building achievement are the understanding of the decision makers on the LRB approach and its benefit to the development and comprehensive assessment on the institutional aspect of LRB capacity building. Lessons learned are that the short life time of the project making difficult to create a genuine capacity building particularly related to policy. Key recommendations for immediate application are: (1) develop process-based indicators of capacity building target, (2) build closer coordination with BAPPEDA to enhance the chance of the government budget allocation on road maintenance and training and (3) update and manage the project's risk log. The project has submitted a concept note to BAPPENAS for further funding by the MDFANS for a third phase to continue capacity building of Aceh local governments in Aceh. The evaluation recommends:

- Developing a strategy of the next phase based on a comprehensive study on the institutional aspect of LRB's capacity building include national, provincial and district level;
- Use of a comprehensive capacity building approach including institutionalization of LRB to government system and;
- Making optimal the complementary function of the national, provincial and district level in to support the capacity building to local governments.