



Evaluation Summaries

Community development through employment creation and improved migration management in Tajikistan 2007-09

Quick Facts

Countries: Tajikistan

Final Evaluation: December 2009

Mode of Evaluation: Independent

Technical Area: Labour Migration

Evaluation Management: SRO/Moscow

Evaluation Team: Mr. Johannes Chudoba,
Ms. Mukarrama Burkhanova

Project Start: 1 July 2007

Project End: December 2009

Project Code: TAJ/05/01/HSF

Donor: UN Trust Fund for Human Security

Keywords: Community Development;
Employment; Migration

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

The project aimed to combat human trafficking from Tajikistan through policy development and community-based employment measures. It was based on a two-pronged strategy: 1) empowering people and communities through income-generating activities, training and awareness raising; and 2) assuring the protection of Tajik migrant workers and their families through better migration management. The main beneficiaries of this project were potential migrant workers (most of them men) as well as disadvantaged women and young people from

the Rasht valley. The overall goal of this project was to increase the level of human security of people from the Rasht region of Tajikistan, in particular socio-economic and personal security of people on the move and of women that are left without income.

UNDP as the ILO's strategic partner in project implementation was programmatically and financially responsible for specific activities of the project related to component 1. "Men and women in Rasht district to be empowered through vocational training and income-generating measures as means of preventing human trafficking." In November 2007 the ILO and UNDP signed a cooperation agreement, by which UNDP contributed resources (through its Community Programme) for community based activities linked to Jamoat [community] Resource Centers in the district of Rasht/Tajikistan.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The purpose of the final evaluation is to improve quality, accountability to the donor, transparency of the ILO's work and to strengthen the decision-making. The evaluation sought to:

- Assess the outcomes of the project and its effectiveness with regard to achieving the overall and specific objectives;
- Identify problems encountered during implementation, means undertaken by the

- project to overcome these problems and lessons learned;
- Develop recommendations for similar interventions in the future.

The evaluation hopes to primarily serve the following internal and external clients:

- o ILO tripartite constituents and project implementing partners in Tajikistan;
- o Ultimate beneficiaries of the project – labour migrants and their families;
- o The Donor;
- o ILO management, technical specialists;
- o Project staff.

Methodology of evaluation

The evaluation consisted of desk review of documents, semi-structured face-to-face interviews with project stakeholders and beneficiaries, observation of an evaluation workshop with the tripartite constituents in Dushanbe/Tajikistan. Site visits were undertaken to the town of Gharm/Rasht District of Tajikistan. Findings were interpreted based on the UN/OECD evaluation criteria.

Main Findings & Conclusions

Community development, employment and migration are among the most central issues for development programmes to address in Tajikistan today. Consequently, the decision to partner with UNDP's Communities Programme (CP) appears as the right strategic choice to contribute to this goal.

In the period from July 2007 to November 2009 a range of training & informational services were provided to the target groups, including migrants, their families, policy makers and tripartite constituents. These include:

- Start and Improve Your Business training for women (200)
- Women and Economic Development program training (20)
- Combating human trafficking training (230)
- Informational theatrical performance on the risk of human trafficking (150)
- Job fairs for potential labour migrants (5,000)

- Vocational skills training in beekeeping (200)
- Construction skills training (100)
- Bricklayers and welders skills training (57)

While empowerment does indeed rank topmost among the needs in rural Tajikistan, and particularly in the more remote parts like the Rasht Valley, the challenges resulting among others from poverty, limited educational opportunities and weak government support are so formidable that far greater efforts are required for a sustainable impact to be achieved.

The project has created several entry points (i.e. good working relationships with stakeholders, especially social partners, and good complementarities with UNDP) that could be useful in a more concerted, larger scale programmatic effort. Building capacity, especially of more conservative and slow-moving entities such as governments and social partners, is a long-term commitment. The project has achieved some very positive starting points to build upon, particularly in terms of the close cooperation and genuine mutual trust built with counterparts. It is extremely important, however, that the opportunities opened up through the hard work of the project team are not lost. In addition to securing funding to extend contracts and implement follow-on projects this will require a more comprehensive and coherent effort with the government, and with its national and international partners.

Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Main recommendations and follow-up

For other joint programmes and for future efforts of this kind, it would be worth considering:

- a) agreeing on a management structure with a single manager responsible for all components of the project;
- b) hiring this project manager at a stage when the project document can still be modified;

- c) empowering the project manager with the basic decision making powers and the ability to represent the project at a level senior enough to negotiate on a par with managers in counterpart agencies;
- d) placing this manager as close as possible to the actual implementation to ensure consistent monitoring and assistance.

Joint programmes by definition are the UN system's opportunity to mobilise the combined expertise of multiple agencies to address high-priority complex challenges. For this to be successful, the UN Country Team under the leadership of the Resident Coordinator should define the relevant strategic priorities in its development assistance framework, in line with national priorities and strategies.

Important lessons learned

This project was in many ways groundbreaking. ILO as the organisation that took the initiative, the UNTFHS as a donor dedicated to supporting a more holistic approach to empowerment and development, and UNDP with its Communities Programme as the solid platform to build upon - all deserve recognition for taking on the most formidable challenges and seeing through the implementation of this project.

The idea of bringing together the highly specialised technical expertise of ILO with the strongly established implementation capacity and field presence of UNDP, as well as the experience of IOM with labour migration in Tajikistan is excellent and deserves the full support of the UNCT and the Resident Coordinator.

It is particularly encouraging to see that the project placed such a strong emphasis on local staff and local implementing partners. Indeed, the strong working relationship established with the Government, trade unions, and the implementers of training subprojects can be seen as the project's central strength and achievement that should be built upon.