



Evaluation Summaries

Strengthening the Services of the Labour Administrations - Bolivia, Ecuador and Peru

(Original Report in Spanish)

Quick Facts

Countries: Bolivia, Ecuador and Peru

Final Evaluation: February 2007

Mode of Evaluation: Independent

Technical Area: Labour Administrations

Evaluation Management: The ILO Subregional Office for Andean Countries.

Evaluation Team: Marleen Rueda Catry, Juan José Serrano Remón, José García Tena.

Project Start: August 2004

Project End: August 2006

Project Code: RLA/03/M09/SPA

Donor: Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs of Spain.

Keywords: Labour Administration

- General services and support bodies;
- Conciliation and mediation for resolving individual and collective disputes;
- Labour inspection;
- Security systems and health services;
- Employment services and labour migration;
- Services for the formalization of small and medium enterprises.

Present situation of project

In the framework of ILO assistance on the issue of labour administration, diagnoses had been undertaken in recent years, in the three countries covered by the project, in Bolivia in 2000, in Ecuador in 1998 (updated in 2003) and in Peru in 2003. They have represented an excellent diagnostic tool for identifying the countries requiring technical assistance, to understand in detail the status of labour administrations and to know the priorities set by the players for their improvement. These elements were an important input in the design of the strategy reflected in the project document. In this sense, FORSAT has continued a work which had already been launched in the Andean region by the technical services of the ILO both at Headquarters and in the field, in collaboration with other technical cooperation projects such as the BID/ILO Project, and has been a key support

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

The FORSAT Project "Strengthening the Labour Administration" is a multilateral technical cooperation project of the ILO, sponsored by the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs of Spain and executed by the ILO Subregional Office for Andean Countries. The Project started its activities in August 2004 for 24 months duration.

The project aims at strengthening the labour administrations in Bolivia, Ecuador and Peru in six areas related to the six immediate objectives of the project:

to strengthen those areas that were identified by countries as priorities.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The objectives of the evaluation were, first, to analyze the strategy and project implementation and, secondly, to provide recommendations that help improve its effectiveness and impact.

The purpose of the Final Evaluation is to provide an analytical and independent view on the project's ability to achieve its objectives and results, especially considering the performance (achievements), efficiency, sustainability and transferability highlighting strengths, opportunities and weaknesses of the implemented actions.

Methodology of evaluation

The evaluation consisted of an analysis of the existing documentation provided by the Project (project documents, technical reports, mission reports, policy proposals, etc.) and performing a series of interviews with key actors of the project, labour ministries by means of a mission to Ecuador and Peru under the terms of reference for the evaluation. It was not considered appropriate to visit Bolivia as the project has not been able to make great strides in this country due to political instability.

Main findings & Recommendations

Regarding the project's objectives

Compared with the objectives initially set, 6 for each of the countries, only one or two per country have been progressing. This is not due to an inconsistency in the strategy or inefficiency in project implementation, but to the setting in the initial project document of some very ambitious goals that were difficult to achieve. The FORSAT approach has been pragmatic, setting priorities following the interests of each labour administration working in the area of Inspection. In this sense,

the strategy has been consistent and the Project has strengthened a ILO work in progress.

For future projects, and without prejudice that they obviously have different objectives, taking into account the changing circumstances of the countries, from the moment which a project is drafted until it is executed,

- it is advisable to incorporate in these a revision clause or element of flexibility allowing to adapt these according to national interests.

Technical support needs of administrations will continue to exist when the project ends.

- The ILO should encourage, so far as possible, the mainstreaming of labour administration in cooperation projects being undertaken in other technical areas. Strengthening the labour administration should be a shared goal, as the design of policies and programs is not possible if there is no efficient administration in order to implement them.

Regarding the Project implementation

The execution of the project was appropriate given the time constraints and resources. External factors to the project have hampered further progress in Bolivia (adverse social and political situation) and in Ecuador (the difference of objectives and actions to be carried out between the Ministry of Labour and the Project).

- It is recommended that in view of the great progress achieved in Peru, the project focuses on Bolivia, which after political normalization seems in good condition to achieve results in its services of labour inspection and mediation and conciliation, as the project demonstrated during the second half of 2005, and on Ecuador. While in this country the difficulties seem

insurmountable, some of the problems are also related to the institutional weakness and lack of a comprehensive monitoring, since the ILO does not have a permanent structure to monitor closely the FORSAT activities in the country.

Regarding the Project strategy

- It is recommended that the Project renew efforts and encourage horizontal cooperation activities so that the officials of labour statistics services and labour inspection in Ecuador may know the organization and operation of these services in Peru and the recent changes that led to its strengthening. It is hoped that these activities contribute to institutional strengthening of the Ecuadorian labour administration and to increased project sustainability in that country. Also monitor the Pilot Inspection Plan in Guayaquil and explore, where appropriate, other possibilities for action in this area.

Regarding technical inputs

These have been high, thanks to the experience of the Project Manager, the contribution of ILO officials of the various support services, and the international experts made available by the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs, which have not cost to the project.

- Regarding the latter, it would be desirable to explore ways to streamline the procedures for their appointment.

Administrative and technical follow-up seems to have been correct, and the project has been well integrated into the structure of the ILO. There seems to have been a collision between the SAT objectives and the Social Dialogue Project that has generated some discomfort for the social actors (employers).

- From the ILO, greater coordination would be required to try to prevent future conflicts of this nature.

- It is also recommended greater attention to gender mainstreaming in technical works to be undertaken with the support of the SRO Lima or technical services at Headquarters.
- To promote the efficiency and profitability of future cooperation of the Ministry of Labour, it is considered appropriate in this report to suggest accelerated procedures for the appointment of experts.

This project was highly involved in the drafting and designing of the Labour Inspection Bill Project. However, the later was not consulted at the National Labour Council.

- It would be desirable, for the future, in projects of this nature, that the Project Manager proposes that the Drafts or Bill drafts or Regulations to be submitted prior to approval at the social and labour tripartite collegiate bodies with skills of knowledge, study and / or report on the matter.