



Evaluation Summaries

Evaluation: ILO's Action Programme Against Forced Labour and Trafficking in West Africa (PATWA)

Quick Facts

Countries: Nigeria, Ghana

Final Evaluation: July 2006

Mode of Evaluation: Independent

Technical Area: Declaration

Evaluation Team: Robert Shaw, Christiana Okojie, William Ahadzie

Project Start: May 2003

Project End: October 2006

Project Code: RAF/03/54/UKM

Donor: The United Kingdom (1,800,000 US\$)

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

SAP-FL designed an Action Programme against Forced Labour and Trafficking in West Africa (PATWA) "to contribute to the prevention and eradication of forced labour and trafficking in West Africa".

The PATWA project document identifies three immediate objectives: to consolidate the knowledge base on forced labour and trafficking in the selected countries, with particular reference to international labour standards, gender and HIV/AIDS; to assist key stakeholders in the implementing countries to mainstream forced labour and trafficking concerns into their Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers and legal and social policy frameworks and to begin taking concrete actions; and to develop a strategy to combat forced labour and trafficking through integrated pilot schemes

incorporating prevention of trafficking and protection and rehabilitation of victims.

The project document specified a series of outputs for the three immediate objectives:

Outputs for immediate objective 1):

a) field studies, surveys and rapid assessments covering attitudes as well as the basic facts and causes of forced labour, trafficking and irregular migration, including sector surveys and recruitment mechanisms;

b) a comparative study on the laws and policies relating to forced labour, trafficking and migration in the selected countries;

c) a consensus on the need for combating forced labour and trafficking among key stakeholders, and the adoption of action plans.

Outputs for immediate objective 2):

a) an awareness-raising campaign for key stakeholders on the reality and risks of forced labour and trafficking;

b) strengthening the legal and policy frameworks to prevent forced labour and trafficking, including mainstreaming these concerns into poverty reduction strategies;

c) strengthening the institutional capacity of labour market authorities and other relevant institutions, including employers' and workers' organizations, to combat forced labour and trafficking.

Outputs for immediate objective 3):

a) design, implement and evaluate integrated pilot programmes on the prevention of forced labour and trafficking, including protection, rehabilitation and reintegration of trafficked persons;

- b) hold consultations to discuss, identify and establish good practices and strategies to combat forced labour and trafficking;
- c) systematize strategies and good practices drawn from the pilot projects, consultation processes and stakeholder experiences.

Present situation of project

Almost all of the outputs and activities listed in the original project document and in subsequent work plans were actually undertaken by the end of the project. The PATWA project document proposed a series of field studies, surveys and rapid assessments to determine the incidence of forced labour and trafficking, and examine the sectors using forced and trafficked labour as well as the mechanisms of recruitment. In practice, two literature reviews were prepared, and two baseline surveys were undertaken in selected areas of Nigeria and Ghana, mainly to set the stage for subsequent pilot projects in these areas.

Methodology of evaluation

This terminal evaluation has been conducted over a period of two weeks in the field. The consultants have reviewed the project documentation, visited five of the eight pilot projects (three in Nigeria and two in Ghana), and held extensive discussions with almost all key PATWA stakeholders, pilot project implementers and beneficiaries.

Main Findings & Conclusions

Improving the Knowledge Base: The baseline survey in Nigeria contains some interesting hints that could have been followed up, but is generally poorly organized with weak analysis. The Ghanaian baseline survey is more useful and readable, concentrating on migration (generally seasonal) from northern Ghana: many migrants are deceived into taking jobs in exploitative and abusive working conditions. It was helpful in providing some baselines for the pilot project. PATWA also contracted a study of trafficking of West African migrants to the Netherlands. This is a slight study that makes some contribution to the literature on irregular

migration. Overall, PATWA was only modestly successful in improving the knowledge base, since it was unable to estimate the incidence of forced labour and trafficking in the two countries, and did not explore the economic sectors using this labour.

Improving the Legal and Policy Framework:

PATWA made a substantial and important contribution in this area. Strong papers reviewed the legislative base in each country. PATWA's role was critical in rapid passage of Ghana's Human Trafficking Act in 2005. In both countries, the project was significant in facilitating the preparation of draft national plans of action and in the building of consensus on the need to combat human trafficking and forced labour. Despite preparation of a strategy paper in Nigeria, less progress was made in incorporating these concerns in national economic development plans, which could have helped to obtain national and international resources.

Awareness-raising: Many West Africans believe that human trafficking is a "false problem" in the region, with outsiders confusing traditional practices of fostering with trafficking. PATWA has made very significant progress in raising awareness about the nature and dangers of trafficking and forced labour across a broad range of groups, including the general public, vulnerable groups, parliamentarians, government officials, and leaders of social partners and civil society organizations. A range of creative approaches has been used. However, the evaluation team is concerned about the ultimate effectiveness of awareness-raising activities in the absence of the provision of serious and productive economic alternatives for those who are vulnerable to being trafficked. The team also fears that most of the awareness-raising activities will not be sustained after the end of the project.

Capacity-building: Capacity in both countries is limited to implement the new anti-trafficking laws. The lead government agencies are small and currently have little field presence. Other government agencies needed to combat human trafficking have limited knowledge about the problem and how

to address it. Very late in the project, PATWA organized a series of capacity-building workshops for social workers, law enforcement agencies, consular officers, trades unions, labour inspectors, regulators of private employment agencies and traditional leaders. The training was warmly appreciated by the participants, most of whom recommended that it should be expanded and institutionalised. However, the training provided was probably too short, and was not part of a broader capacity-building strategy. There was no opportunity to follow up on the numerous opportunities that arose from the workshops. The social partners and civil society organizations only participated marginally in the training workshops.

Pilot Projects: The PATWA project document planned a small number of integrated pilot projects to test and demonstrate local approaches to tackling human trafficking. In practice, four pilot projects were implemented in each country at an average cost of \$35,000. They started in the last few months of PATWA, with the result that few lessons could be learned and shared elsewhere. Because each project was so small, none was truly integrated. To varying degrees, each contained some elements from the following list:

- advocacy visits to community and traditional groups
- awareness-raising among vulnerable groups and road transport and hotel workers
- establishment of Community Vigilance Groups and telephone hotlines to report trafficking
- training to provide skills to vulnerable groups and returned victims
- provision of machines (grinders, sewing, knitting and processing) to selected women's groups to raise incomes.

The awareness-raising and reporting activities were successful. Assistance to skills acquisition centres benefited a relatively small number of people, and it is not yet clear whether the skills will be translated into productive employment. The machines have

only just been installed, and without sufficient background work on marketing opportunities or training for the women's groups. There may be a high risk of failure. There is also reason for concern about the sustainability of the pilot projects.

Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Main recommendations and follow-up

SAP-FL should make every effort in the short term to finalize those activities that merit small additional inputs, including publication of high-quality reports; provision of training materials from other countries to Nigeria and Ghana; final staff visits to pilot projects to derive lessons; and technical assistance to the nascent sub-regional task force of trades unions on human trafficking.

Given the needs and opportunities to combat human trafficking in West Africa, the team urges ILO and the concerned governments to do everything possible to obtain sufficient resources to mount a second phase of PATWA in the near future. A second phase should focus on expanding the knowledge base and on further, systematic building of capacity. These might be complemented by one or two integrated pilot projects in each country to demonstrate approaches to the eradication of human trafficking in specific local areas.

Important lessons learned

The Importance of the Knowledge Base:

Based on the sketchy evidence available, the evaluation team fears that the trafficking problem in Nigeria and Ghana may be larger than generally thought. To argue for sufficient resources to address the issue and to determine priorities, it is essential to improve the knowledge base, particularly to estimate the scale of the problem and to investigate the economic sectors and recruiting mechanisms involved.

Awareness-raising: While a good start has been made, awareness-raising efforts need to be sustained if they are to reach the very large number of people potentially vulnerable to trafficking and to impact their behaviour. Moreover, awareness-raising alone is

insufficient: it must be combined with programmes to increase incomes and jobs for the vulnerable and to implement the recent legal provisions.

Capacity-building: The PATWA experience clearly shows the need for greater government implementation capacity and the enthusiasm for capacity-building. It is vital that there be a strategic and systematic approach to this task, building training modules and manuals for regular training in all concerned agencies. Special attention needs to be paid to the judiciary and labour inspection systems.

Non-governmental partners: The social partners and civil society organizations participated only marginally in PATWA, though they have much potential in combating human trafficking. The trades unions, in particular, are starting to organize workers in the informal sector. This merits further support. Employers' organizations and coalitions of NGOs have considerable potential, especially in awareness-raising. In Nigeria, PATWA worked closely with a small number of competent NGOs to manage the pilot projects.

Pilot projects: Any future pilot projects should have clear goals and reporting systems to measure progress towards those goals; they should be of sufficient scale to have a measurable impact on the problem; should adopt a fully integrated approach; and should enable the learning of lessons to be shared with others.

Project design and implementation: Key stakeholders should be fully involved in the project design. The sustainability of project activities and outputs should be addressed in the project design. Reporting systems should be reviewed to ensure they include adequate information on beneficiaries and impacts. And the project time frame should be long enough to achieve objectives and to facilitate the learning of lessons.

International aspects: Human trafficking in West Africa has significant international dimensions both within the region and between the region and Europe. One of ILO's greatest strengths is its ability to bring countries together in international fora and to use its tripartite structure to involve the social partners across borders. Since PATWA was unable to attend to the international dimensions, ILO should continue and increase its efforts to assist West Africa to reduce the trafficking of human beings across borders.