

**Report on the National Workshop in Bulgaria
on the ILO Guidelines on Social Dialogue
in Public Emergency Services in a Changing Environment
(Sofia, 14-15 April 2005)**

**Shizue Tomoda
Sectoral Activities Department
ILO Geneva**

ACRONYMS

PESs	-	Public Emergency Services
CEMA	-	Centers for Emergency Medical Aid
CITUB	-	Confederation of Independent Trade Unions in Bulgaria
CLA	-	Collective Labour Agreement
CLP	-	Confederation of Labour Podkrepa
EMS	-	Emergency Medical Services
ILO	-	International Labour Organisation
MI	-	Ministry of Interior
MLSP	-	Ministry of Labour and Social Policy
NICA	-	National Institute for Conciliation and Arbitration
PPE	-	Personal Protective Equipment
OSH	-	Occupational Safety and Health
C122	-	Employment Policy Convention, 1964
C100	-	Equal Remuneration Convention, 1951
C111	-	Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention, 1958
C87	-	Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organize Convention, 1948
UCAMI	-	Union of Civilian Administrators in the Ministry of Interior
NFU	-	National Firefighters' Union "Ogneboretz"
NPU	-	National Police Union

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
1. Introduction	4
1.1. Objectives.....	4
1.2. Workshop programme	4
1.3. Participants	4
2. Opening Remarks.....	5
Welcome address by Ms. Shizue Tomoda, ILO Geneva	5
Opening addresses:	
by Mr. Galab Donev, MLSP.....	6
By D-r Theodora Valcheva, CL “Podkrepa”	7
3. ILO Guidelines on Social Dialogue in PESs in a Changing Environment ..	7
4. Presentation of the national study on Bulgaria	9
5. Commentaries on the ILO Guidelines and the national study	11
On behalf of the Government/Employers	11
On behalf of Workers.....	12
6. Group discussion and the consolidated strategies/recommendations of the workshop participants for improved social dialogue in PESs in Bulgaria ..	15
7. Closing remarks by Ms. Shizue Tomoda,	18
 ANNEXES	
1. ILO Guidelines on Social Dialogue in PESs in a Changing Environment ..	19
2. Workshop programme	25
3. List of participants.....	27

1. Introduction

The two-day national workshop in Bulgaria on the ILO Guidelines on Social Dialogue in Public Emergency Services (PESs) in a Changing Environment (hereafter the Guidelines) was held in Sofia on 14-15 April 2005. It was organized and facilitated by Ms. Shizue Tomoda, Senior Sectoral Specialist Responsible for Public Services, Sectoral Activities Department, ILO Geneva, as a follow-up to the adoption of the Guidelines by the ILO's Joint Meeting on Social Dialogue in PESs (Geneva, 27-31 January 2003) and the Governing Body decision requesting the Director-General to promote them through appropriate actions.

Prior to this workshop in Sofia, national studies on social dialogue in PESs were commissioned in selected countries, one of which being Bulgaria. The objective of such studies was to ascertain the gap, if any, between what was being promoted in the Guidelines and the reality of social dialogue in PESs as useful background material for discussion in national workshops such as the one held in Bulgaria.

1.1. Objectives

The objectives of the workshop were threefold: (1) to promote the ILO Guidelines; (2) to examine any problematic areas/issues in promoting the Guidelines in the PESs in Bulgaria by reviewing the outcome of the national study undertaken; and (3) to arrive at some strategies/recommendations for improved social dialogue in PESs in Bulgaria.

1.2. Workshop programme

The workshop programme (see Annexes) centered around the presentations made by Ms. Tomoda on the Guidelines and by Mrs. Pavlina Popova, national consultant, on *Social Dialogue in Public Emergency Services: A case study on Bulgaria*. Subsequently, the two discussants on behalf of the Government/Employers' and the Workers' groups presented their views on these two documents to initiate discussions in the plenary. The workshop participants were then divided randomly into three groups for the purpose of group discussion on the issues highlighted in the earlier presentations. The outcome of each group discussion was presented at the plenary where various views expressed were then consolidated into a set of strategies/recommendations adopted by the workshop participants for improved social dialogue in PESs in Bulgaria.

1.3. Participants

The workshop was attended by forty-two (42) participants (see the List of Participants in Annexes), representing the Government and the Workers' organizations.

The government participants included policy makers/managers representing the agencies responsible for public emergency services, namely, the National Police Service and Centers for Emergency Medical Aid as well as the Ministry of Labour and Social Policy, the Ministry of the Interior and the Ministry of Health. The National Institute for Conciliation and Arbitration was also represented by its Director, Deputy Director and Legal Advisor.

The workers in PES were represented by the National Police Union, the National Firefighters' Union "Ogneboretz", and the Union of Civilian Administrators in the Ministry of Interior. The two largest unions, the CITUB and the Confederation of Labour "Podkrepa", were also represented: CITUB by its Deputy Chairman and members of the Medical Federation; CLP by the Chairperson of Federation Medicine and members of the said Federation.

All the participants had at their disposal the ILO Guidelines as well as the National study on Bulgaria in English and in Bulgarian languages, which contributed to a lively and serious discussion during the workshop.

2. Opening Remarks

The opening ceremony was attended and addressed by Mr. Galab Donev, Director, Directorate of "Labour Conditions, Crises Management and Alternative Duty", the Ministry of Labour and Social Policy (MLSP), Dr. Teodora Valcheva, Chairperson of Federation Medicine of CL "Podkrepa" and Ms. Shizue Tomoda, Senior Sectoral Specialist Responsible for Public Service, ILO Geneva..

The summaries of the opening addresses are as follows:

Welcome address by Ms. Tomoda, ILO, Geneva

Ms. Tomoda stated that too many people had taken the work of PES workers for granted, yet their dedication to their profession was the driving force behind their fearless and heroic actions. They had played key roles in ensuring the safety of the population at large. They maintained law and order, rescued people and protected lives and property threatened by all types of disaster, both natural and man-made. They were the first ones to rush to the scene to perform their duties, often risking their lives in so doing.

Available data showed that due to the rapidly changing socio-economic and political factors, the volume of work for PESs was rapidly rising and becoming increasingly dangerous and risky. This was further compounded by problems arising from financial constraints, particularly acute in many developing countries, and this had resulted in understaffing in PESs. Therefore, PES workers faced increasing pressure to deliver services as best they could, with diminishing resources.

Under this circumstance, effective social dialogue was the best solution and the optimal way to ensure cost effective and efficient service delivery, where the workforce could be kept motivated and dedicated to their profession. This was the challenge that the government, the workers and the whole community had to face together through consultations and information sharing.

In many ILO member states PES workers were known to work in the most hazardous environment. For example, the occupational safety and health (OSH) records available showed that the injuries and deaths that fire-fighters sustained while performing their duties were among the highest of all occupational groups. Adequate enforcement of and compliance with safety and health laws could minimize the risk that PES workers would have to take while on duty. Workers should therefore be

allowed to negotiate their own safety and health matters as well as participate in the safety standard setting, as they had much to contribute from their first hand experience and knowledge.

Ms. Tomoda was convinced that the output of the workshop would immensely contribute to improved social dialogue in PESs in Bulgaria, where adequately trained, equipped and motivated PES workers would be able to deliver quality services to meet the changing needs of the Bulgarian community. She wished the participants fruitful deliberations.

Address by Mr. Galab Donev, MLSP

Mr. Donev welcomed the participants in the workshop and thanked the ILO for the research carried out on the *Social Dialogue in PES in a Changing Environment in Bulgaria*. He mentioned that for the Ministry of Labour and Social Policy it was very important to have an assessment by independent experts on all issues of PESs in Bulgaria as well as to obtain recommendations to serve as a basis for discussions for future work and improvement.

Under the current globalization trends in the world economy, which have impacts on material, financial and labour resources, Mr. Donev thought that the role of PESs and their employees in the contribution to the safety and security of the Bulgarian society was undisputable. Since the PESs were the key factor for guaranteeing security to the public, he felt that they should be part and parcel of the general framework of the social policy for ensuring dignified life and work for all workers and they should also be entitled to the same treatment.

Mr. Donev agreed that there was no doubt that in order to respond to the changing needs of society, PESs must be adequately financed, well trained and equipped as well as to be provided with the opportunity to effectively exercise their rights at the working place. He felt that the strengthened dialogue was the optimum way for the improvement of the working conditions and ensuring of quality services.

Due to this, the MLSP accepted the Guidelines on the social dialogue in PESs and considered that the following must be ensured:

- employment and development of the human resources through appropriate education, qualification, etc.;
- good working conditions through introduction of flexible working time, adequate leaves, dignified payment and compensations;
- safe and healthy working conditions by undertaking special measures in response to the specific professional risks and by providing up-to-date equipment, PPE, special working clothes, etc.;
- social dialogue between the employers and employees aimed at good governance of PESs;
- good co-ordination among different services for efficient provision of services, particularly when it concerns life-threatening mission, which is the basis for effective PESs.

The MLSP considered that events such as today's workshop would help address specific problems, raise the awareness and motivate all parties at stake regarding the

process of governance in PESs, which would promote the dialogue for improving their effectiveness and the quality of the services provided. He wished a fruitful discussion at the workshop.

Address by Dr. Teodora Valcheva on behalf of the Workers' Organizations

On behalf of the workers' organizations, Dr. Valcheva expressed her great satisfaction with the National Workshop on the Social Dialogue in PES in a Changing Environment in Bulgaria. She believed that undoubtedly, the role of PESs had increased during the last years and the development of the ILO Guidelines was a very important step towards strengthening the social dialogue in PESs in principal. She welcomed the National Study on Bulgaria that had been carried out because it would give a new impetus to social dialogue aimed at improving the working conditions, occupational safety and health at the workplace in PESs. It would also allow the identification of bottlenecks and would support the efforts of both workers' organizations and government for overcoming the existing problems.

3. ILO Guidelines on Social Dialogue in PESs in a Changing Environment

Before presenting the ILO Guidelines, Ms. Shizue Tomoda gave background information leading to the adoption of the Guidelines by the Joint Meeting on Social Dialogue in PESs (Geneva, 27-31 January 2003). She stated that within the framework of "Public Service" in the ILO's Sectoral Activities Programme, a number of international meetings had been organized to discuss employment and labour issues relating to public service. In addition to the meetings on human resource development in the context of structural adjustment and transition (1998) and the impact of decentralization and privatization on municipal services (2001), the most recent one, held in 2003, had addressed social dialogue in PESs in a changing environment, covering the police, fire-fighting and emergency medical services.

She underscored the fact that although there had been a meeting held on the fire-fighting service in 1990, the one held in 2003 was the first time ever that the police service was covered in an ILO meeting. She said that the police and the military being essential services of special nature, the governments were allowed to exclude them from the scope of the application of the ILO Conventions which they had ratified, including the core ones. It did not mean, however, that the fundamental human rights of those who were employed in these services could be disregarded. In C87 and C98, the two of the core Conventions guaranteeing the fundamental human rights in the world of work, it was provided that "the extent to which the guarantees provided for in this Convention shall apply to the armed forces and the police shall be determined by national laws and regulations." In other words, it was up to each ratifying State to prescribe in its national laws or regulations how workers' fundamental rights guaranteed in C. 87 and C. 98 should be treated with regard to the police. Therefore, some governments guaranteed the police all the rights as in any other services; some others provided them with the right to organize and bargain collectively with certain limitations, while the rest imposed considerable restrictions on workers' fundamental rights in the service.

Despite the exclusion of the police permitted from the application of the International Labour Standards, the ILO's Governing Body had decided that a meeting on social dialogue in PESs, including the police, would be held under the Sectoral Activities Programme. The decision was made in recognition of the vital role that PES workers played in contributing to the safety and security of our society while risking their own lives in performing their duties.

The report prepared as the background material for the discussion at the meeting highlighted a number of employment and labour issues in PESs. They included: (1) the declining employment levels due to budgetary constraints, which affected adversely the working conditions such as remuneration and hours of work; (2) working hours longer than those established statutorily for the rest of the population, for which they were often not adequately compensated; (3) despite the fact that PES workers worked under dangerous and hazardous environment, national occupational safety and health laws often did not apply to them; and (4) being in essential services, PES workers in many countries did not fully enjoy the right to associate freely and to bargain collectively, which meant that they were unable to negotiate for more decent working and living conditions.

Against this background report the meeting discussion took place and the ILO Guidelines were adopted (See Annex for the full text). The decision in adopting the Guidelines was made in view of the fact that if we were to ensure quality service by PES workers, they should be given proper means, tools and funds so as to be able to respond effectively to changing needs of communities. It was important that efforts be made to retain properly trained and experienced personnel. It was also recognized that an enhanced social dialogue mechanism was the optimal way to allow the participation of PES workers and their representatives in improving their working conditions and ensuring quality services.

The Guidelines stressed the necessity of (1) allocating sufficient budgetary resources to ensure adequate training and staffing levels, as well as employment diversity, for decent work and quality service; (2) allocating resources and allowing information sharing, including worker participation in the design and implementation of OSH measures, for safer workplaces; and (3) promoting effective social dialogue to ensure that PES workers remain motivated and committed to quality service delivery.

The major challenges faced by PESs today included (1) how best to provide cost effective and quality services with limited resources, which was a problem shared by many countries, both developing as well as industrialized ones; and (2) how to improve social dialogue in all the PESs, while recognizing their being essential services of special nature, so that all stakeholders, including workers, would be able to contribute to improving the service delivery.

Ms. Tomoda stated that the Guidelines were not binding, unlike ILO Conventions which the ILO member States ratified. Instead, they were intended to provide guidance on how to achieve better PESs in a changing environment through social dialogue. Therefore, all ILO tripartite constituents should make a good faith effort to use them for a common objective to ensure quality services delivered by competent and committed personnel, particularly at a time of heightened security consideration.

4. Presentation of the national study on Bulgaria

The study *Social Dialogue in PESs: A Case Study on Bulgaria* undertaken by Mrs. Pavlina Popova (the entire text can be accessed at www.ilo.org/sector, under “public service”) was presented by the author herself. It looked into front-line PES personnel such as police, firefighters and emergency medical workers in Bulgaria. During the presentation of the study the author made comparisons in various aspects between PESs in Bulgaria and those in comparable countries based on the ILO study which had served as a basis for the development of the ILO Guidelines.

In Bulgaria the two services, namely, the police and fire-fighting, fall under the same government department – the Ministry of the Interior – and the regulations that govern, working conditions, remuneration, etc, in these services are covered by the Ministry of Interior Act (as well as by the Labour Code for the civilian personnel). The emergency medical services fall under the Ministry of Health, however, and the regulations governing the service are contained in the Medical Facilities Act, Labour Code and a number of secondary laws. A two-pronged approach was adopted for the national case study. First, the relevant legislation, both primary and secondary, was analyzed to see whether the legal framework for the Bulgarian PESs was in compliance with the ILO guidelines and other research studies on the three services that had been carried out had been reviewed. Second, interviews were conducted with several stakeholders from the Ministry of the Interior, the Ministry of Health, the National Police, a number of officers (from fire-fighting and the police) and four to five doctors working in the emergency medical service. The objective of these interviews was to assess the implementation of the respective laws and regulations in practice.

In general, the situation of the Public Emergency Services in Bulgaria corresponds with what is being promoted in the ILO Guidelines adopted at the Joint Meeting of January 2003. For the police and fire services, appropriate legislation appears to be in place as far as employment, gender issues, overtime work, remuneration, organization of work, occupational safety and health conditions and social dialogue are concerned.

However, working conditions in the emergency medical service are far less favourable (e.g. remuneration, retirement, etc) than those in the other two services, which appear to indicate that the importance of their work is underestimated. Due to this, greater attention should be paid to the service and to the working conditions of their employees. On the one hand, their remuneration should be increased considerably, conditions for retirement should be made more favourable, and occupational safety and health conditions should be improved significantly (especially in view of the stress under which they work). This will require major amendments to the legislation that would adequately reflect the work of the staff. On the other hand, social dialogue at the sector level should be improved and strengthened, and the social partners (both the Government and CEMA representatives) should raise awareness of the importance of the services among themselves and the public, and initiate a general review of the working conditions of staff, so that the emergency medical profession takes the place it deserves in society.

Although the equality of employment opportunity is guaranteed in the Bulgarian Constitution and legislation the low number of women and Roma police officers

requires special attention. As far as the Roma is concerned it should be underlined that their low number in the police and firefighting services is due to their low education (which is a result of other reasons) but not to any policy of discrimination. However, the government has undertaken a number of steps to improve this situation.

Given the stressful conditions in which police officers and firefighters work, significant efforts are needed to reduce the effects of stress, including the establishment of adequate stress management and counseling programmes. This is relevant also for emergency medical service workers, whose work is, in addition, undervalued.

It seems that the high vacancy rate in the police – about 11 per cent – is due to the fact that the profession is not held in high regard. Although the positive attitude toward the police has increased during the last years, it is still low. Comparing with other professions (especially those of the emergency medical staff) it is obvious that the low status of the police is not a result of low remuneration or lack of benefits. Apparently, further efforts are needed by the Ministry of the Interior and the National Police Service to enhance the public image of the profession.

Workers in PESs services in Bulgaria have enjoyed opportunities for advancement through training, which ranged from certificate courses to higher education, specialty for EMS. Study leaves are also granted for the three sectors of PES.

There has been insufficient provision of OHS devices and equipment especially in terms of Personal Protective Equipment (PPE) for firefighters. This along with the significant reduction of the staff during the late 1990s places them under greater risks of injuries and stress.

The Council for Social Partnership has been established in the Ministry of the Interior and discusses and concludes agreements for guaranteeing the rights of Ministry employees. It is chaired by the Minister, or someone authorized by him. Delegates of the national organization of police officers and sergeants participate in the Council. Three organizations participate in the Council – the National Police Union, the National Ognoboretz Union (firefighters) and the Union of Civilian Administrators (whose members are employees working on a labour contract in the Ministry, including those working in the police and fire services.). The employees of EMS negotiate their working conditions within the framework of the established tripartite cooperation where the working conditions are negotiated for the health sector as a whole. The setting up of a special commission to the Branch Council of Tripartite Collaboration in Health Care to discuss and resolve EMS problems is a step in the right direction. Although Bulgaria has ratified the Council of Europe's revised European Social Charter, which includes articles concerning social dialogue, social dialogue especially in the public sector needs improvement. The establishment of mechanisms for consultation is gaining speed, though the mechanisms themselves still need to prove their effectiveness.

5. Commentaries on the ILO Guidelines and the national study

On behalf of the Government/Employers

The commentaries on behalf of the Government/Employers on the two documents as well as to the situation in the police and firefighting services were made by Ass. Prof. Dr. Kalin Gaydarov from the Ministry of Internal Affairs (the full text is available on request). He focused mainly on the occupational stress associated with the professions since one of the main conclusions in the national study was that the prevention and management of occupational stress in Bulgaria was at a very low level.

Led by the changing environment in the tasks of the police and firefighters and the current situation in Bulgaria as in June 2004, the Minister of Interior has approved the MI System Employees Professional Stress Prevention and Management Program for MI's Employees implemented (regarding its psychological part) by the Psychical Prophylaxis and Consulting Division in the MI Psychology Institute. The program's main idea is to create a system to help the employees when they have problems resulting from occupational stress and to facilitate their access to specialized medical and psychological services, using present organizational resources of the Ministry: Psychology Institute, Medical Institute, Human Resources Directorate, immediate chiefs, psychologists and regional directorates medical services.

The activities under the programme were implemented on two levels: local and central. The local level role was to direct an appropriate help to be delivered to the employees. The central level fulfilled methodical and auxiliary functions and interfered directly with the case when a problem cannot be resolved with local level resources.

The objectives and the main purpose of the Program were as follows:

- Create organizational mechanisms for establishment and maintenance of psychological and medical services set for professional stress prevention and alleviation of its impact on employees.
- Provide the employees with necessary information on the problems of occupational stress, its harmful consequences and the ways to limit/prevent it, stimulating the employees to make active efforts in this direction.
- Organize and maintain an optimum set of services on professional stress prophylaxis including free of charge access to psychological services for the employees and their family members.
- Provide guaranteed access to quality and comprehensive health services, which would be a significant step for prevention and resolution of the problem relating to occupational stress among MI employees
- Establishment and maintenance of a system for stress management in emergency situations.

Within this framework six main activities have been implemented:

- Psychological consultation – for employees and their family members who need it;
- Work-related stress prevention: education about the nature of stress, its symptoms and consequences; ways of overcoming and alleviating the consequences; present services available;

- Working out, providing and implementing individual and group psychological modules of work-related stress prophylaxis and overcoming;
- Stress management in critical situations and post-traumatic stress disorder prophylaxis;
- Directing for help to other experts (for example, somatic physicians, psychiatrists, other psychologists);
- Organizational consultation on work-related stress problems.

The Program has assessed the following factors as mainly responsible for the work-related stress:

- on the first place: overload at work (3.46 average evaluation under 1 to 5 scale);
- on the second place: critical incidents (3.31 average evaluation);
- on the third place: bad equipment and irregular hours of work (3.10 average evaluations)
- on the fourth place: lack of return information on the results of the assigned tasks (3.04 average evaluation);
- on the last and fifth place: problems of personal relationship with bosses (2.94 average evaluation).

While comparing with similar inquiries among the American policemen, the results show that in America the relationship with their bosses is the main stress factor while in Bulgaria the lack of personal protective equipment and material means is a dominant factor.

Teaching materials and instructions designed for the programme for MI employees and psychologists have been developed and are updated on a regular basis.

National Institute for Conciliation and Arbitration (NICA)

On behalf of the National Institute for Conciliation and Arbitration, its Director Mr. Kiril Alexandrov explained the functions and structure of NICA as a tripartite basis for conciliation. It is an Executive Agency within the Ministry of Labour and Social Policy, which settles only the disputes relating to collective labour contracts. It was underlined that conciliation as a way and mechanism should find its place in the strategy for improving the social dialogue in PES as well.

On behalf of Workers

The commentaries on behalf of the Workers were made by D-r Ivan Kokalov, Deputy Chairman of CITUB. During his presentation he focused on the social dialogue in all three services (the full text is available on request).

Dr. Kokalov underscored that workers' organizations in the police, firefighting and medical emergency services looked at the ILO Guidelines in detail, and that they considered these documents as exceptionally useful for implementation for the Bulgarian trade unions and PES professionals.

Dr. Kokalov believed strongly that it was the duty and necessity of all those concerned to improve social dialogue forms and mechanisms aimed at finding appropriate, practical and rational ways of resolving issues regarding working conditions, employment and remuneration, personnel safety and qualification,

coordination among emergency services to increase citizens' security and quality of life. PES workers in Bulgaria believed that the quality of dialogue had no alternative but needed to improve further. Moreover PES workers were situated in a really changing environment: politically and economically. The challenges for them were still the same even though Bulgaria soon would become a full-fledged member of the European Union. The PES workers fully accepted the Guidelines as a good instrument to face these challenges. He stated that the Guidelines would be disseminated in the workers' organizations for use in their day-to-day work.

Dr. Kokalov highly appreciated the national study on the situation in Bulgaria in the context of the ILO Guidelines, but considered as necessary to amend part of the information in the study with some newer data on the situation in Bulgarian PES, and to put the emphasis on the role of the workers' organizations and associations in social dialogue, as well as to pose some of the most important questions.

He mentioned that the social dialogue in the three services was structured differently at different levels and that it was the best structured in the EMS. There was a tripartite council on social co-operation in the Ministry of Health, where there were two representatives from each of the following organizations: Ministry of Health, trade union organizations (Health Care Syndicates Federation within Confederation of Independent Unions in Bulgaria, Podkrepa Medical Federation) and the employers' organizations (National Association of Employers in Health Care). Under the Minister of Health Order a commission was created as an auxiliary organ to the Branch Council of Tripartite Collaboration in Health Care (BCTCHC) to discuss and resolve EMS problems. In 2003 an agreement was concluded in Branch Tripartite Council, where minimum starting basic salaries in EMS since 01.01.2003 were agreed on. Thus remunerations were increased by 10% average, and since 01.07.2003 salaries were increased by 10% (compared to 3.5% for other state budget employees).

Dr. Kokalov mentioned also the Union of Civilian Administrators in the Ministry of Interior (UCAMI) which organised over 6300 employees working under labour contracts and the Labour Code. All MI structure divisions – police, firefighting, border police, gendarmerie, academy and MI institutes – had UCAMI trade unions. He put a special emphasis on the social dialogue in these divisions, mentioning that UCAMI had been an active participant in the Federation of the independent trade unions from public sector and organizations (FITUPSO) and through it to CITUB. There was a good level of social partnership. There were 4 Collective Labour Contracts signed by the union (three of them had been signed with the present MI governing body). The last Collective Labour Contract that had been signed on 25.02.2005 would expire within 2 years. This showed that the dialogue was constructive and branch cooperation between the union and the employer was good, said Dr. Kokalov

As far as the police and firefighting services were concerned, D-r Kokalov mentioned the need of removing Art. 265, Paragraph 2 of MI Law which stated: "Officers and sergeants cannot be members of other trade union organizations. They cannot accept into their organizations workers and employees' representatives from outside the ministry. Officers and sergeants' organizations have no right to join or affiliate themselves with trade unions outside the ministry". He outlined a few issues which might improve significantly the social dialogue in the police and firefighting service:

- MI officers and sergeants had to be represented in the National Tripartite Collaboration Council.
- MI employees should have all the rights that the rest of the workers in the Republic of Bulgaria have, though their right to strike can be restricted.
- MI trade unions should have the right to negotiate with the employers of officers and sergeants (minister, national services directors, regional directors) and conclude agreements analogous to labour contracts that trade unions conclude within civil administration.

The major challenges faced by the PES workers in Bulgaria were as follows:

1. Constant restructuring of the services which led to demotivation and insecurity at the workplace;
2. Poor remunerations (especially in EMS), although the social dialogue provided different opportunities for negotiating better remuneration;
3. Lack of adequate financing, resulting in insufficient equipment and vehicles that were in bad condition or out-dated, which contributed to increased stress among PES workers;
4. The opportunities for upgrading skills and qualifications should be tied to pay increase.

As a future member of the EU, Bulgaria should consider that in many European countries the PES workers enjoyed the right to strike, while in Bulgaria they did not enjoy this right as a tool for effective negotiation. In this regard the legal framework should be liberalized in order to improve and make social dialogue more effective.

The problems faced by the Bulgarian PES workers made the professions non-attractive. The Government should find and establish the mechanisms for better financing, better remuneration, permanent professional qualification and provision of PPE and up-to-date equipment.

In conclusion D-r Kokalov said that the social dialogue level and existing mechanisms in three public emergency services were at different levels, as the national study showed. The problems had been identified and employees would believe that within discussions and final documents some practical solutions would be found in the spirit of the ILO Guidelines, which was one of the purposes of this forum.

National Police Union

On behalf of the National Police Union (NPU), a commentary was made by Mr. Emil Rashev, Chairman of the NPU.

He mentioned that the NPU has the statute of a syndicate but in fact they do not enjoy rights inherent to a syndicate. In his opinion the NPU should enjoy all the rights (including joining to other trade unions) as they may disavow voluntarily the right of strike.

It is a fact that in the MI has established a Council for Social Partnership but it is an internal body for the ministry. The decisions should be taken with consensus and sometime they are taken very difficulty. In order to protect the rights of police officers and sergeants the NPU itself should have rights.

Mr. Rashev also mentioned that the European Police Union is organized as an NGO and the NPU as its member.

UCAMI

On behalf of the Union of Civilian Administrators in the Ministry of Interior (UCAMI), its Chairman Mr. Christo Christov made a commentary. He mentioned that to their members the provisions of Labour Code were applied and that 70-80% of their members were women. UCAMI has a collective labour contract and they have negotiated better working conditions than those provided for in the Labour Code.

The social dialogue is effective and over 90% of the problems and issues discussed there are upon UCAMI initiative. The existing problems emerge from insufficient financing and although some problems are legally regulated they can not be implemented in practice.

National Firefighters' Union (NFU) or "Ogneboretz"

On behalf of NFU "Ogneboretz", a commentary was made by Mr. Leonardo Stoyanov, deputy chairman. He pointed out that today's challenges faced by the people were not the military operations but the natural calamities, transport of dangerous material, etc., which significantly improves the role of PES.

Mr. Zahariev mentioned that as far as the number of firefighters was concerned, they had certain reserve towards the results of the national study. He mentioned that in year 2000 the NFS was deprived of 3000 staff positions given to other MI services but not that 3000 firefighters have been dismissed. Thus the NFS in Bulgaria ranks last in the world with the ratio of 1 firefighter for more than 1000 people. It leads to violation of the working time set up by the law and sometimes the firefighter work more than the allowed 40 hours per week.

The number of women in the Bulgarian NFS is very low, which marks a big difference with other countries. However, there is no separation on ethnic basis and all who have the necessary qualification could be employed in NFS. The retirement conditions are the same as in the USA – 25 years length of service and 60 years of age.

Despite of the difficult conditions in which they work the percentage of the accidents among the Bulgarian firefighters is very low because of their good training.

Mr. Stoyanov mentioned the coordination as one of the main issues for providing good services and that it was at a relatively good level. Despite of this he said that the introduction of one national emergency number would improve significantly to the appropriate distribution of efforts and for the overall co-ordination when handling different incidents.

6. Group discussion and the consolidated strategies/recommendations of the workshop participants for improved social dialogue in PESs in Bulgaria.

The workshop participants were divided randomly into three groups and all groups dealt with the issues in PESs in Bulgaria highlighted in the national study, namely, (1)

shortages of funds and employment levels, (2) benefits and allowances, (3) OSH, (4) further training, (5) working conditions, including pay and (6) social dialogue, including in the police service. After engaging in several hours of group discussions, each group presented its results and recommendations. Their different views were then consolidated into a set of workshop strategies/recommendations for improved social dialogue in PESs in Bulgaria, which was adopted by the workshop participants at the end. The consolidated strategies/recommendations given below reflect the vision of both the government and workers for the improvement of social dialogue for quality service delivery in PESs in Bulgaria.

General Recommendations

It is recommended that:

- the PES activities be set as a priority in the government's policy in the area of national security;
- the infrastructure (especially in the big cities) for adequate and effective work of PESs be built and a 'special regime' for the traffic of PES vehicles be adopted.

Recommendation/Strategies

Employment/Diversity

On Ethnic Representation: it is recommended that the possibility for representation of all ethnic groups be sought through development and implementation of policies for education, qualification and incentives for working in PES.

On Gender Diversity: it is recommended that women's participation in the professions of firefighters and police officers be promoted and facilitated through appropriate measures.

Equipment

It is recommended that:

1. purposeful financing of PES activities be secured through priority setting;
2. additional sources for PES financial security be sought; and
3. specialized vehicles of PES and its technical equipment be replaced in stages for the safety of PES workers and as well as for quality service delivery.

Education

It is recommended that:

1. permanent education programme in each PES be established with module for specialization;
2. such education programme be tied to professional qualification and promotion as well as the remuneration system; and
3. modules for continuous joint training for the three branches of PESs be developed.

Working Conditions

It is recommended that:

1. a sufficient number of personnel be hired to avoid systematic overtime work and to reduce traumatism and professional stress;
2. working hours be reduced to 35 per week for all PES workers;
3. the work for EMS workers be re-evaluated and re-categorized;
4. a chance for “second career” and social reintegration be ensured for those police officers and firefighters who retire early;
5. the minimum standard for gross monthly salary for PES workers be increased to 2,5 times as much as the average gross salary in the public sector in view of their qualifications and responsibilities.

Occupational Safety and Health Conditions

It is recommended that :

1. committees and groups on the working conditions in all PESs be established and their effective functioning be ensured in accordance with the Law on Occupational Safety and Health Conditions;
2. mandatory insurance coverage be provided to PES workers in accordance with the Law on Occupational Safety and Health Conditions;
3. a professional risk insurance be introduced in view of the nature of PES work;
4. mandatory standards for PPE in compliance with the European norms be ensured and observed;
5. the criteria for assessing harmful substances at the workplace be changed in accordance with the European criteria for risk assessment, limit values for harmful substances and factors worsening psychological environment; and
6. special programs be developed to provide psychological counseling for combating and overcoming stress.

Social Dialogue

It is recommended that:

1. law amendments guaranteeing the firefighters and the police officers the right to associate and bargain collectively (and as a result the right to strike under limited conditions) be proposed ;
2. the opportunities for improving the social dialogue model for police officers and firefighters be considered;
3. an early-warning mechanism against emerging collective labour disputes be established and disputes be resolved through alternative means of conciliation and arbitration in which both disputing parties take part in;
4. an arbitration clause be included in the collective labour contracts; and
5. Regular joint meetings of the Councils for Social Dialogue of the three PESs be established for improving the co-ordination of their activities and effectiveness.

Co-ordination

It is recommended that:

1. a uniform system for emergency calls and united co-ordination center be established; and
2. functionally united units of NFS and EMS be set up.

Media – public debate; engagement

It is recommended (in view of the public's general lack of understanding of PES) that:

- efforts be made to raise public awareness of the role of PESs in maintaining the safety and security of the society; and
- discussions on the work of PES workers using the media be initiated for the purpose of raising public awareness and promoting their professions.

7. Closing remarks by Shizue Tomoda

Ms Shizue Tomoda expressed her belief that the workshop had been useful for all the participants. She underlined that the ILO Guidelines should serve as a basis for the improvement of the social dialogue in PESs and each country should decide on the ways and manner of implementing them through an open forum involving all stakeholders concerned, such as this one.

She noted that the strategies/recommendations adopted at the workshop followed the framework set up by the ILO Guidelines. She said that once the workshop report was finalized, it would be sent to the Bulgarian Government. The Government would then be asked to share the workshop results with all the stakeholders in PESs concerned, so that recommendations could be implemented or any follow-up activities could be undertaken jointly by all parties concerned. The workshop results should help the Bulgarian effort to put in place a stronger and more reliable institutional framework on disaster management and strengthening of the social dialogue in PESs. She was also convinced that the workshop participants representing PES workers would promote the ILO Guidelines and the strategies/recommendation in their organizations and workplaces in terms of creating an enabling environment aimed at effective emergency responses.

Ms. Tomoda thanked all of the participants for their active participation and declared the workshop closed.

Annexes

Guidelines on social dialogue in public emergency services in a changing environment

The Joint Meeting on Public Emergency Services: Social Dialogue in a Changing Environment,

Having met in Geneva from 27 to 31 January 2003,

Adopts this thirty-first day of January 2003 the following guidelines:

General considerations

- A. A changing economic, social and security environment requires the enhancement of public emergency services (PES).¹ Such services must be adequately funded so that well-trained and properly resourced workers can deliver quality services, which are effective, responsive to different sections of community needs and defined by high standards of ethical behaviour on the part of service deliverers. There should be recognition of the vital role played by front-line PES workers in responding to the increasing threats to life and property in these uncertain times.
- B. To these ends, all PES workers should be able to effectively exercise their fundamental rights at work, in accordance with the 1998 ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work, so as to achieve quality working conditions which help ensure design and delivery of quality services.
- C. Social dialogue mechanisms based on the ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work between PES employers and the workers should be constructed where they do not exist. Such mechanisms are the key to an effective voice in determining the conditions that make for effective services.

1. Employment and human resource development

Employment levels

- 1.1. Decisions intended to enhance services for effective delivery should balance a number of considerations:
 - 1.1.1. application of new technologies;
 - 1.1.2. staffing levels necessary to ensure decent work and quality working life;
 - 1.1.3. the nature and scope of anticipated needs;
 - 1.1.4. contingency planning for unanticipated incidents;
 - 1.1.5. budgetary allocations and use of funds.
- 1.2. Investments in PES should therefore be planned so as to avoid reductions in employment which erode services over time, and where necessary to increase staffing levels so as to provide better response rates and quality.

Employment diversity

- 1.3. The need to achieve greater gender, ethnic and other diversity in PES employment requires enhanced efforts to eliminate prejudice and discrimination in these services in line with the equality of employment opportunity and treatment principles set out in the ILO's Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention, 1958 (No. 111).
- 1.4. To enhance employment diversity, PES employers, in cooperation with workers and their organizations by means of social dialogue, should undertake to define and implement a policy on diversity. Such a policy should include as part of planning and management tools:
 - 1.4.1. documentation and follow-up of a service's employment composition over time based on age, gender and ethnicity;

¹ Public emergency services are defined to include police, firefighters and emergency medical personnel including doctors and nurses and paramedics called to respond to an emergency situation. For purposes of these guidelines, the definition excludes military personnel.

- 1.4.2. establishment of objective recruitment benchmarks;
- 1.4.3. an objective system of evaluating results.
- 1.5. To increase and/or maintain employment diversity, an active campaign to recruit and retain youth, women and ethnic minority candidates who are interested in and qualified for serving in PES should be an integral part of human resource planning. Recruiters' attitudinal changes should also be ensured where these are considered barriers to meeting objectives.
- 1.6. Measures to facilitate the achievement of recruitment/retention benchmarks may include:
 - 1.6.1. legislation or regulation to facilitate maternity leave and reintegration to professional activity;
 - 1.6.2. policies aimed at helping to balance work and family life such as increased access to childcare facilities;
 - 1.6.3. analysis and action to correct career progression obstacles;
 - 1.6.4. provision of initial and continual training opportunities linked to career development;
 - 1.6.5. study and provision of appropriate personal protective equipment and its effective use;
 - 1.6.6. ensuring a work environment free of harassment, accompanied by gender and racial sensitivity training for all staff;
 - 1.6.7. a complaints policy which is equitable and impartial for all staff.
- 1.7. Social dialogue should be an effective means of achieving commitment to more employment diversity in PES that greater reflects the community based on age, gender and ethnicity considerations.
- 1.8. To effectively apply new orientations towards community-based service in response to law and order questions, a proactive communications policy for information sharing, the building of trust and the creation of partnerships between PES, especially police, should be achieved primarily through better diversity of ethnic representation.

Training

- 1.9. Staff training and empowerment for improving services and the work environment should be considered as paramount for improved working quality and service delivery and should be adequately funded. Training programmes should be tailored to meet the increasingly specialized nature of PES work, providing personnel with the necessary skills and competences to meet their obligations and maintain a high degree of professionalism in a rapidly changing work environment. PES workers should have the right and responsibility to participate in the development of training standards that will ensure the availability of needed skills to provide quality services.

2. Working conditions

- 2.1. To avoid that the work of PES workers is undervalued, while productivity and quality service delivery is ensured, installation of a climate and mechanisms for effective social dialogue on better working conditions and appropriate pay structures and levels should be an overriding policy consideration for PES employers and workers. Salaries and other terms and conditions of employment should be considered as integral parts of HRD policies designed to recruit, train and retain well-qualified and experienced workers.
- 2.2. Faced with increasing workload and responsibility, PES workers' representatives² should be fully recognized through the social dialogue process in determinations over

² Throughout this text when the term "workers' representatives" is used, it refers to Article 3 of the Workers' Representatives Convention, 1971 (No. 135), which reads as follows:

For the purpose of this Convention the term "workers' representatives" means persons who are recognised as such under national law or practice, whether they are:

the organization of working time. Mindful that PES workers are different from workers in other sectors in terms of their responsibilities, the exigencies of service delivery and therefore their work organization, their unique social role should not be used to deny these workers the right to effective social dialogue on these issues. Such a denial would over time work against the objectives of rapid and quality service delivery.

- 2.3. Establishment of working conditions in PES should take account of the demands or needs of different local and national authorities. Terms and conditions of work should therefore be determined through collective bargaining or its functional equivalent at the appropriate level according to national law and practice. The extent to which the police are covered by such mechanisms should be determined by national laws or regulations.
- 2.4. PES workers in developing countries should be entitled to a guaranteed minimum income for a decent living in law and in practice. Minimum wages should represent a salary level that meets workers' needs for adequate living conditions, health and education of themselves and their families. An effective minimum wage could reduce or eliminate their work during off-duty hours to supplement their incomes which puts them at extra risk due to fatigue, and may also endanger the health and security of the public. Where not established by national law or practice, a legal mechanism should be set up with the participation of workers and/or their representatives to define the criteria for fixing minimum wage levels, their application and implementation.
- 2.5. In recognition of their obligation to work odd and irregular hours, and to respond immediately to emergencies, the following principles should be observed in defining working time and organization:
 - 2.5.1. laws stipulating maximum weekly hours of work, the minimum daily consecutive rest period and the minimum weekly consecutive rest period should be observed, except in unusual circumstances;
 - 2.5.2. when on duty, the rest periods of PES workers should be counted as working hours;
 - 2.5.3. in shifts of any length beyond normal working hours where the employer requires the worker to stand by for specific service requirements or at specific locations, such stand-by time shall be treated as working hours unless other compensatory arrangements exist. The employer shall be responsible for notifying the workers of such policy.

The application of these principles should be discussed and resolved through social dialogue and collective bargaining.

- 2.6. Pay structures should be established based on many factors, including required qualifications for employment, hours of work, risk and stress level. Comparability between different occupational groups of PES, including police officers, firefighters and EMS workers, should reflect local and national circumstances based on job and pay evaluation systems that are designed and operated through social dialogue. Parties understand that each sector of PES plays a unique yet equally vital role in the provision of public safety. This equality of work should command equal value in areas of wages, benefits and funding.
- 2.7. Based on available information indicating that women are concentrated in support positions and tend to earn lower salaries and wages than men in PES, the provisions

-
- (a) trade union representatives, namely, representatives designated or elected by trade unions or by the members of such unions; or
 - (b) elected representatives, namely, representatives who are freely elected by the workers of the undertaking in accordance with provisions of national laws or regulations or of collective agreements and whose functions do not include activities which are recognised as the exclusive prerogative of trade unions in the country concerned.

of the Equal Remuneration Convention, 1951 (No. 100), should be applied to pay structures in order to ensure that work of equal value is compensated equally, irrespective of the sex of the official performing the duty.

- 2.8. Given the nature of PES workers' early retirement and pension schemes based on the hazardous work they perform, and the increasing imbalance between numbers of staff reaching retirement age and decreasing recruits, employers should plan for, design and finance retirement systems which guarantee benefits on retirement. Such systems should be managed by bodies on which all stakeholders, including PES workers, are represented.

3. Occupational safety and health

- 3.1. To reduce the psychological and/or employment impact on individuals, co-workers, families and organizations as a result of the death, injury, disability and illness of PES workers in the line of duty, PES employers should commit to high standards of workplace safety and health based on a proactive policy and preventive measures. Workers should participate in the process of design and implementation of these measures.
- 3.2. Concrete measures to this end should include:
 - 3.2.1. application to PES workers of local or national safety and health laws applicable to other workers, and their adequate enforcement;
 - 3.2.2. allocation of adequate resources for their protection and own rescue in situations whereby they risk their lives to save others;
 - 3.2.3. adaptation of new technologies developed in the area of safety and health to constantly improve the PES working environment;
 - 3.2.4. making available modern equipment that meets international standards to workers in developing nations;
 - 3.2.5. provision for collective bargaining, where applicable, over safety and health standards and their application.
- 3.3. In view of physical, chemical and psychological hazards they face in rescuing others, PES employers should provide PES workers with the best preventive measures available, including properly designed personal protective equipment (PPE) and materials. Protective clothing, boots and other equipment provided to women PES workers must be designed to meet their physical requirements in the interests of women workers' safety and health and efficient service delivery. There should be provision for ongoing research on ways of improving occupational safety and health and responding to the occupational diseases that directly affect PES workers.
- 3.4. The knowledge and experience of front-line PES workers, including representation of women workers on the relevant bodies, should be taken into account through social dialogue processes to appropriate design and use of PPE.
- 3.5. To reduce the impact of negative stress, the incidence of "burnout", and of violence on PES workers while on duty, notably the consequences of critical incidents such as horrific accidents and tragic deaths leading to post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD), PES agencies should implement the following practices:
 - 3.5.1. establish adequate stress management and counselling programmes to protect their staff and immediate family resulting from a cumulative or a specific incident of stress, including critical incident stress debriefings (CISD), with particular attention to rural areas and developing countries which do not often have such provisions;
 - 3.5.2. adopt a "zero-tolerance" policy towards workplace violence and ensure a dynamic intervention to deal with any problems arising from violent incidents;
 - 3.5.3. undertake risk assessments of critical incident stress and violence possibilities;
 - 3.5.4. provide for regular review of challenges, policies and measures to deal with problems through effective social dialogue on stress and violence issues.
- 3.6. In relation to increased concern among PES workers about contracting HIV/AIDS and other communicable diseases while handling the injured and the sick, cooperation of employers' and workers' organizations should strive to ensure that workers are educated, sensitized and given proper protective equipment against such diseases. In

the campaign against HIV/AIDS and other communicable diseases, prevention strategies should be based on the application of the “universal precautions” principle, including the ILO code of practice on HIV/AIDS and the world of work. This may include provision of protective clothing (especially in rural areas), immunization where available, training in the application of the principle and the establishment of a monitoring mechanism to assess effective application.

- 3.7. Where protective measures are not sufficient to prevent infection, workplace compensation for PES workers should be provided where infection is work-related.
- 3.8. With regard to stress management and counselling programmes, as well as measures to reduce vulnerability to, and prevalence of, HIV/AIDS and other communicable diseases, confidentiality should be strictly observed and formally prescribed to avoid the stigma and potential workplace isolation that is often attached to those who undergo testing, stress management and counselling programmes.
- 3.9. To take account of changing PES response and work environments, information sharing on planning and implementation of new safety and health measures, particularly on new technology developed and applied to PPE, should be encouraged at the international level. Such information sharing, especially on new challenges and on best practices, will especially aid safety and health improvements for PES workers in developing countries.
- 3.10. Where appropriate, regional standards on PPE could be referred to when developing international standards for PES.³

4. Social dialogue and rights at work

- 4.1. It is widely recognized that effective social dialogue mechanisms between employers and workers, and where appropriate, users of services, are critical means to ensure the input of all stakeholders on key decisions concerning the full range of needs and constraints in the provision of public emergency services. Given that social dialogue can improve the ability of all parties concerned to make improvements based on common interests, and contribute positively to reaching compromises over divergent viewpoints, it should be the overall aim of PES employers and workers to institute effective social dialogue mechanisms to ensure that PES are well run, efficient, accountable and provide quality service.
- 4.2. Synonymous with respect for basic rights (cf. General considerations, paragraph B), elements of social dialogue should include the recognition of other parties, mutual respect and readiness to listen to others. These elements would ensure shared responsibility in implementing what has been agreed through social dialogue.
- 4.3. To ensure the respect for basic rights and the institution of social dialogue mechanisms, the following principles should be borne in mind when adopting policies and practices:
 - 4.3.1. the Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organise Convention, 1948 (No. 87), and the Right to Organise and Collective Bargaining Convention, 1949 (No. 98), enshrine basic workers’ rights to organize and bargain collectively, including those in public services. The extent to which these provisions are applied to the police shall be determined by national laws or regulations. Under these circumstances the relevant provisions of the Labour Relations (Public Service) Convention, 1978 (No. 151), and the Collective Bargaining Convention, 1981 (No. 154), should be applied.
 - 4.3.2. the process of collective bargaining should be on a voluntary basis between the interested parties.
- 4.4. Where possible, disputes should be resolved through negotiations. In the event of failure to do so, fair, effective and speedy dispute settlement procedures, including conciliation, mediation and arbitration as appropriate, or if these procedures are

³ For example the European Directives on PPE as applicable to the Members of the European Union.

unsuccessful, a mutually agreed legal process. These processes should be made available to all PES workers, including those whose rights to strike are restricted. Existing procedures should be improved with the close involvement of all parties concerned at all stages of the process.

5. Coordination in public emergency services

- 5.1. Good coordination must be ensured among different branches of PES for effective service delivery, especially to realize the life-saving mission of PES. Effective coordination is best achieved by clearly defining the roles and responsibilities of each agency within a clearly established chain of command, authority and accountability structure. Elements of good coordination practices should include:
 - 5.1.1. Clearly defined parameters for each service, identifying specific duties in the provision of public safety. Each service plays an equally vital role and should be considered of equal value;
 - 5.1.2. coordination of services in a network of shared information and reliable communications, especially on crisis management and dangerous substances, at both national and international levels;
 - 5.1.3. delegation of authority within accepted and clear senior management guidelines and protocols;
 - 5.1.4. provision for continuous and joint training and drills involving personnel of different agencies concerned so as to identify weaknesses in the existing coordination mechanism and ensure its smooth functioning when an emergency actually strikes;
 - 5.1.5. provision of adequate funds for effective coordination to avoid competition for funds resulting from inter-agency “turf” battles.
- 5.2. Establishment of an international early warning system should be envisaged to better combat disasters that are international in scope.



INTERNATIONAL LABOUR ORGANISATION

National Workshop on the ILO Guidelines on Social Dialogue in Public Emergency Services in a Changing Environment (Hotel Central Forum, Sofia, Bulgaria, 14-15 April 2005)

Programme

Day 1 – 14 April 2005, Thursday

08:00 Registration

09:00 Opening

- Welcome speech by Ms. Shizue Tomoda
- Opening address on behalf of the Government/Employer by Mr. Galab Donev, Ministry of Labor and Social Policy
- Address on behalf of the PES workers by Dr. Teodora Valcheva

09:30 Coffee break

09:45 Background and objectives of the workshop (Ms. Shizue Tomoda)

- ILO's Joint Meeting on Public Emergency Services (PESs) (Geneva, Jan. 2003)
- ILO Guidelines on Social Dialogue in PESs adopted in 2003.

10:30 Presentation and discussion of the case study on Social Dialogue in PESs in Bulgaria (Ms. Pavlina Popova)

11:15 Commentaries on the Guidelines and the national study on behalf of the Government/Employers and discussion

11:50 Commentaries on the Guidelines and the national study on behalf of the Workers and discussion

12:25 Lunch

14:00 Group discussion and work on the strategies/recommendations for improved social dialogue in PESs in Bulgaria (on each of the following topics):

- Employment and HRD
- Working Conditions
- Occupational Safety and Health
- Social Dialogue and Rights at Work
- Coordination in PESs

15:30 Coffee break

15:45 Group discussion and work continued

18:00 Workshop adjourned for the day

Day 2 – 15 April 2005, Friday

09:00 Presentation of strategies/recommendations by each group and plenary discussion

10:30 Coffee break

10:45 Consolidation of group strategies/recommendations into a set of strategies/recommendations (to be adopted by the workshop participants)

11:45 Adoption of the workshop strategies/recommendations for improved social dialogue in PESs in Bulgaria to be forwarded subsequently to the Government of Bulgaria and the social partners.

12:00 Evaluation and closing remarks

12:30 Lunch



International Labour Organization

**National Workshop on the ILO Guidelines on Social Dialogue
in Public Emergency Services in a Changing Environment
14-15 April, 2005, Sofia**

LIST OF THE PARTICIPANTS

1. Ms. Shizue Tomoda

Senior Sectoral Specialist
SECTOR, ILO, Geneva

2. Ms. Plamenka Markova

ILO National Correspondent

3. Ms. Pavlina Popova

Resource Person

4. Mr. Galab Donev

Director of Directorate "Working Conditions, Management of Crises and Alternative Service", Ministry of Labour and Social Policy

5. Ms. Larisa Todorova

Senior Expert, Directorate "Labour Law and Social Security"
Ministry of Labour and Social Policy

6. D-r Unakov

Ministry of Health

7. Ms. Desislava Hadgidimitrova

Legal Directorate, Ministry of Interior

8. Assoc. Prof. Gaidarov

Director, Institute of Psychology, Ministry of Interior

9. Ms. Lubimka Tzvetkova

Inspector, Management of the Human Resources
National Police Service

10. Colonel Kiril Alexandrov

National Police Service

11. Captain Marina Ivanova

National Fire and Emergency Service

12. Mr. Emil Rashev

Chairman of National Police Union

13. Ms. Ludmila Lubomirova

National Police Union

14. Ms. Katia Ganeva

National Police Union

15. Ms. Svetla Mutafova

National Police Union

16. Mr. Christo Christov

Chairman of Union of Civilian Administrators in the Ministry of Interior

17. D-r Evgeny Goshev

Union of Civilian Administrators in the Ministry of Interior

18. Ms. Liliana Ivanova

Union of Civilian Administrators in the Ministry of Interior

19. Ms. Voditza Ushagelova

Union of Civilian Administrators in the Ministry of Interior

20. D-r Dobri Dobrev

Hospital of the Ministry of Interior

21. D-r Vesko Petrov

Hospital of the Ministry of Interior

22. Mr. Vartan Hachikian

National Firefight Union "Ogneboretz"

23. Mr. Leonardo Stoyanov

National Firefight Union "Ogneboretz"

24. Mr. Svetozar Zahariev

National Firefight Union "Ogneboretz"

25. Mr. Rumen Stefanov

National Firefight Union "Ogneboretz"

26. Ms. Elisaveta Petrusheva

National Firefight Union "Ogneboretz"

27. D-r Ivan Kokalov

Deputy Chairman of CITUB

28. D-r Plamen Radoslavov

Deputy Chairman of Medical Federation, CITUB

29. Ms. Slava Zlatanova

Medical Federation, CITUB

30. Ms. Marlen Bojilova

Medical Federation, CITUB

31. Ms. Anna Nikolova

Center for Emergency Medical Aid

32. Mr. Plamen Stoinev

Center for Emergency Medical Aid

33. D-r Georgi Gelev

Director, Center for Emergency Medical Aid – Sofia

34. D-r Rumiana Koleva

Deputy Director, Center for Emergency Medical Aid – Sofia

35. D-r Yri Tornev

Director, Center for Emergency Medical Aid – Sofia District

36. D-r Teodora Valcheva

Chairperson of Federation Medicine, Confederation of Labour “Podkrepa”

37. D-r Nikolay Klinkachev

Federation Medicine, Confederation of Labour “Podkrepa”

38. Mr. Iliya Stoyanov

Federation Medicine, Confederation of Labour “Podkrepa”

39. Ms. Daniela Ignatova

Federation Medicine, Confederation of Labour “Podkrepa”

40. Mr. Kiril Alexandrov

Director of National Institute for Conciliation and Arbitration

41. Ms. Svetlana Videnova

Deputy Director of National Institute for Conciliation and Arbitration

42. Ms. Miglena Kisiova

Legal Adviser, National Institute for Conciliation and Arbitration