

► Roundtable on ILO Quality Apprenticeships

Recommendation No. 208 in Egypt – Meeting Report

10 July 2024

Meeting background:

Meeting title:

Roundtable on Quality Apprenticeships: Recommendation No. 208 (R. 208)

Attendees:

- Alexandria Business Association (ABA) V-Tech
- Catholic Relief Services (CRS)
- Delegation of the European Union to Egypt
- Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH
- Education For Employment (EFE) Egypt
- Federation of Egyptian Industries (FEI)
- International Applied Technology Schools (IATS)
- International Labour Organization (ILO)
- Ministry of Education and Technical Education (MoETE)
- Ministry of Labour (MoL)
- Ministry of Social Solidarity (MoSS)
- Ministry of Trade and Industry (MoTI)
- Movement for self-development, interchange and solidarity (M.A.I.S)
- Sekem School
- The network of German Chambers of Commerce Abroad (AHK) - Egypt

Location and time:

Cairo, Egypt. 9:00 AM – 13:00 PM (Cairo Time)

Preamble:

This report summarizes the key discussions and outcomes of the roundtable on Recommendation No. 208: Promotion of Quality Apprenticeships. The meeting brought together key stakeholders to explore the implementation of this recommendation within the Egyptian context. Participants, including representatives from concerned ministries, ILO, GIZ, and the Federation of Egyptian Industries, engaged in in-depth discussions on the components of quality apprenticeships, the necessary regulatory framework, and the role of various stakeholders in promoting and implementing the recommendation. The roundtable aimed to identify potential challenges and opportunities for Egypt in adopting Recommendation No. 208 and to develop strategies for its successful implementation. This report outlines the key points discussed and insights from industry representatives on international best practices.

► Overview of meeting:

Meeting introduction:

Opening remarks:

Laura Schmid, Skills and Employability Specialist, ILO - Welcoming notes & overview of the round table:

Laura Schmid, Skills and Employability Specialist, ILO, outlined the roundtable agenda. She welcomed attendees and introduced the keynote speakers, Ms. Rasha Abdelbaset, undersecretary of foreign relations department at the Ministry of Labour and Mr. Eric Oechslin, Director of the ILO Decent Work Team for North Africa and the ILO Country Office for Egypt and Eritrea. Following their opening remarks, a discussion on quality apprenticeship recommendations was held. The session included presentations from ILO, GIZ, the Federation of Egyptian Industries, and civil society organizations, followed by a moderated discussion by Ms. Marwa Salah, National Project Coordinator on Child Labour at the ILO, on implementing recommendations. The meeting was scheduled to conclude with a summary of the discussion and refined recommendations.

Rasha Abdelbaset, Undersecretary of Foreign Relations Department at The Ministry of Labour (MOL):

Ms. Rasha Abdelbaset highlighted Egypt's recent progress towards a sustainable future through the government's "Together We Build a Sustainable Future" program, focusing on improved education, decent work (via initiatives like "Mahni 2030" in collaboration with the private sector, "Your Profession, Your Future", agreement with Italian Salesian Institute "Don Bosco," ongoing projects and agreements with the ILO and the EU), and labour inspector oversight, emphasizing vocational training's importance for Ministry of Labour.

Eric Oechslin, Director of the ILO Decent Work Team for North Africa and the ILO Country Office for Egypt and Eritrea:

Mr. Oechslin emphasized the importance of quality apprenticeships in driving economic growth and social justice. He advocated for government policies supporting apprenticeships across sectors, focusing on quality and safety. By investing in skills development and promoting apprenticeships, societies can reduce inequality, enhance productivity, and create a more resilient workforce. Mr. Oechslin stressed the crucial role of governments, employers, and workers in collaborating to build sustainable apprenticeship programs, emphasizing the need for ongoing training and support from employers.

Attendees' presentations' key points

Presentation by the International Labour Organization (ILO)

Laura Schmid, Skills and Employability Specialist, ILO:

ILO has introduced Recommendation no. 208 (R208) to enhance apprenticeship quality, focusing on improving worker employability and productivity while aligning with international standards. Key components include defining quality apprenticeships, establishing regulatory frameworks, protecting apprentices, ensuring apprenticeships are governed by a written agreement, ensuring equality and diversity, promoting quality apprenticeship systems and enhancing cooperation for quality apprenticeships. Egypt is a potential pilot country for the ILO's global action plan, which involves awareness raising and advocacy, policy development, capacity development, knowledge sharing, and partnerships. To support implementation, the ILO offers tools including training materials, checklists, apprenticeship agreement templates, and a policymakers' guide. A potential network of quality apprenticeship champions in Egypt can be established, which would lead to the development of existing organizations and individuals.

Introduction to quality apprenticeships and R208

- **Definition:** Apprenticeship is defined as “a form of education and training that is governed by an apprenticeship agreement, that enables an apprentice to acquire the competencies required to work in an occupation through structured and remunerated or otherwise financially compensated training consisting of both on-the-job and off-the-job learning and that leads to a recognized qualification.”
- **Purpose:** Regulate and promote quality apprenticeship, uphold rights at work, and ensure apprentice protection.
- **Alignment:** Aligned with international standards, promotes decent work, enhances employability, and boosts productivity.

R208 process and adoption:

- **Standard Setting:** Development process spanned multiple years until adoption in 2023.
- **Adoption:** International Labour Conference (ILC) session in June 2023, with the participation of delegates from Egypt.

R208 components and structural overview:

- **Definition:** Includes apprenticeship agreement, structured remuneration, and leading to recognized qualifications.
- **Regulatory Framework:** Includes establishing regulatory frameworks, monitoring systems and processes for identifying suitable apprenticeship occupations.
- **Protection of Apprentices:** Covers, among others, minimum age, remuneration, and occupational safety and health.
- **Apprenticeship Agreement:** ILO developed a template apprenticeship agreement that could be piloted in Egypt.
- **Equality and Diversity:** Considers the situation and needs of persons belonging to one or more vulnerable groups, inclusive of refugees, migrants, gender and people with disability.
- **Promotion of Quality Apprenticeships:** Engages stakeholders for developing and implementing strategies for quality apprenticeships. This includes the involvement of various entities (business associations, government bodies and workers' associations) to promote quality apprenticeships. Moreover, social dialogue is significant, which shall include the involvement of employers' and workers' organizations in scheme design.
- **International, regional and national cooperation:** Includes enhancing cooperation and exchange of information on good practices, recognizing competencies acquired by apprentices, building effective partnerships to promote quality apprenticeship programmes and promoting the recognition of apprenticeship qualifications nationally, regionally, and internationally.

Action plan:

- Designed for 2024-2027 to disseminate quality apprenticeship recommendations globally.

National-level role

- Tracing and Advocacy: Roles of organizations like chambers of commerce in raising awareness and advocacy.
- Policy Development: Revisions to laws, and regulations to support quality apprenticeship; capacity building for partners.
- Capacity Building: Training and skill development initiatives to support implementation, such as skills fairs.
- Knowledge Sharing: Development of tools and dissemination of knowledge is critical to success.
- International Partnerships: Collaborations across industries and initiatives to enhance implementation effectiveness.

Template for apprenticeship agreement

- ILO-developed template that is adaptable to national needs.
- Global initiative, potential for local champions in Egypt to promote recommendations.

Role of champions' network

- Proposal to establish a local network of quality apprenticeship champions in Egypt.

Tools/ Materials

- Policy Maker Guide: Practical guide with modules for policymakers, scheduled for launch in 2024.

Presentation by partner: Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ)

Nouran Mohsen - Advisor, Technical Support for the Comprehensive Technical Education Initiative with Egypt (TCTI), GIZ

Ranya Atef - Advisor, Technical Support for the Comprehensive Technical Education Initiative with Egypt (TCTI), GIZ

- GIZ plays a key role in the dual education system, focusing on enhancing practical training quality in training facilities and oversees governance support for the dual education system at the governorate level.
- GIZ highlighted the recent participation of Egyptian delegates at the Quality Apprenticeship Fair and Industrial Apprenticeship Conference. The delegation included representatives from the Ministry of Education and Technical Education and bodies partnering with the ministry in implementing dual education on the ground.
- Representatives from the Egyptian Union of Investors, Federation of Egyptian Industries, Alexandria Businessmen Association, and Sadat Investors Association who attended the Quality Apprenticeship Fair and Industrial Apprenticeship Conference will discuss the current state of the dual education and training system. They will benchmark the system against international standards, identify gaps, and develop strategic recommendations for improvement.

Presentation by partner: Federation of Egyptian Industries (FEI)

Ahmed Rabea - Lead Auditor, FEI

Highlighted the importance of learning from international experiences to improve Egypt's dual education and training system.

Key takeaways from international experiences

China:

- Emphasis on supporting both trainees and companies through financial incentives and comprehensive training centres.
- Inclusion of not only young students but also existing employees seeking upskilling in apprenticeship programs.
- Establishing accessible training centres: a crucial element of the Chinese apprenticeship system is the availability of vocational training centres for small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs). These centres provide cost-effective or even free training opportunities to address skill gaps and enhance both trainee and company capabilities.

Pakistan:

- Crucial role of labour unions and their representatives in shaping the system.
- Gathering feedback from unions to identify in-demand skills and address industry needs, and specifically those employed in the sectors what skills they need to develop and work on.

France:

- Establishment of unions for apprentices to advocate for their interests and participate in decision-making.

Germany:

- Data collection and analysis practices to identify gaps, and opportunities for improvement, and inform policy decisions.
- Transparency through sharing reports with relevant stakeholders, including policymakers and industry representatives.

Potential benefits of implementing these practices in Egypt

- Informed decision-making: Data-driven insights can guide policymakers in addressing system gaps and optimizing resource allocation.
- Enhanced stakeholder engagement: Active involvement of unions, apprentices, and employers can foster a more inclusive and responsive system (better foundation for social dialogue).
- Continuous improvement: Regular feedback and evaluation can drive ongoing refinement and adaptation of the system.
- Economic benefits: Improved skills alignment and workforce productivity can contribute to economic growth.

Presentation by partner: SEKEM school

Gamal El Sayed - Head of the Regional Unit, SEKEM School

75% of the recommendation's provisions are already being implemented in Egypt's current system.

For the remaining 25%: three key areas were identified for further improvement

1. Recognition of prior/previous learning through incorporating mechanisms to recognize and value the skills and experience gained by individuals outside of formal education, particularly for refugees, older learners, and those who have not completed traditional secondary education. However, the system of those qualified for joining apprenticeships should be the same, which would mean that they are still required to have completed preparatory education.
2. Partnerships with labour unions and the importance of involving labour unions in the design and implementation of apprenticeship programs, drawing inspiration from the Swiss model where unions play a significant role.
3. Student representation: Including student representatives in decision-making processes related to curriculum development and program administration to ensure their voices are heard and their perspectives are considered.

Challenges and recommendations

- Implementation of existing regulations as there's an abundance of laws and policies related to vocational education and training in Egypt. However, there's a need to focus on effective implementation and ensure that these regulations are translated into tangible practices.
- Establishing standardized skill assessment criteria to be internationally recognized to ensure that Egyptian graduates are equipped with the skills and competencies demanded by the global market.
- Language proficiency and language training for vocational graduates, particularly in English or German, is essential and must enhance their international employability.

Presentation by partner: Ministry of Labour (MoL)

Dr. Alia Al Qayati - General Manager of the Sharabiya Training Centre, MoL

Need for skilled workforce

- There is a global and national emphasis on developing a skilled workforce to combat unemployment.
- Apprenticeship is crucial for addressing the skills gap and aligning the workforce with labour market demands.

Apprenticeship

- Apprenticeship is defined as a contractual relationship between employers and workers.
- The MoL plays a key role in facilitating this relationship.

Key takeaways from international experience

India:

- India's apprenticeship program specifically helped marginalized youth, particularly girls, who were vulnerable to child marriage.
- By equipping participants with employability skills, the program enabled them to secure livelihoods, support their families, and contribute to the economy.
- The program provided an alternative pathway for girls, diverting them from child marriage and offered them opportunities for self-reliance and societal participation.
- India's experience highlights the effectiveness of targeted vocational training programs in addressing social issues and promoting sustainable development.

Brazil:

- Brazil's apprenticeship program was designed based on a comprehensive assessment of labour market needs, ensuring that training aligned with industry demands and job opportunities.
- Egypt's vocational training framework could benefit from refinements to better align with current market demands and emerging occupational trends.

Italy:

- Italy's apprenticeship program adopted a project-based approach, providing trainees with hands-on experience and a clear sense of purpose. It also offered financial support to trainees.

Recommendations

- Facilitating the bureaucratic processes is essential for implementing apprenticeship programs.
- Raising public awareness about the value of apprenticeships is crucial to encourage parental support and break the social stigma.
- Aligning legislation with labour market needs is necessary to ensure the effectiveness of apprenticeship programs.

Presentation by partner: Federation of Egyptian Industries (FEI)

Rasha Magdy- Head of Women in Business Unit, FEI

1. The approach of investing in apprenticeship rather than simply spending resources on them.
 - a. Emphasize the financial benefits of apprenticeships for employers, focusing on return on investment (ROI).
 - b. Develop clear cost-benefit analysis through providing tools and resources for companies to calculate the ROI of apprenticeship programs.
 - c. Promote different financing models to support apprenticeship programs.
2. Promote transparency and accountability
 - a. Foster open dialogue among program stakeholders by establishing clear communication channels.
 - b. Create a flexible apprenticeship manual outlining program goals, processes, and requirements.
 - c. Implement accountability measures to ensure all parties fulfil their roles and responsibilities.
3. Partnerships

- a. Identify and explore opportunities for collaboration between government and industry through public-private partnerships.
- b. Facilitate the formation of partnerships among diverse stakeholders within the apprenticeship model (beyond governmental level, ex: EU project that promotes apprenticeship and the tendering process is open for private sector participation).
- 4. Support Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) to gain updated knowledge on apprenticeships and gain more competitiveness.
 - a. Empower MSMEs through targeted support, including specialized resources and guidance.
 - b. Facilitate MSMEs' transition to the formal economy by assisting with apprenticeship program formalization.
 - c. Create platforms for knowledge exchange between MSMEs and industry leaders through organized events.

Challenges and opportunities in apprenticeship programmes

Employers' engagement:

Strong employer engagement and commitment are crucial for successful apprenticeship programs.

- Recommendation: Governmental support through incentives like subsidies or tax credits can encourage employer participation and investment.

Social inclusion and disability:

Currently, the inclusion of people with disabilities in apprenticeship programs remains low.

- Recommendation: Efforts are needed to increase support for social inclusion and equal opportunities for individuals with disabilities.

Refugees and migrants:

Insurance: Refugees and migrants often lack access to social and medical insurance, requiring reliance on private insurance during apprenticeships.

Legalization: Apprenticeship contracts raise concerns for employers regarding potential penalties during inspections due to the unclear legal position of refugees.

- Recommendation: Policy-making interventions or regulations are needed to address insurance coverage and legal concerns for refugee and migrant apprentices.

Presentation by partners: MAIS NGO & International Applied Technology Schools (IATS)

Natascia Mascia, Country Representative and PM of Apprenticeship Program for Refugees and host Communities in Damietta-MAIS NG

Ahmed Ebrahim, International Applied Technology Schools (IATS), Workforce Egypt¹

Addressing skills mismatch

- Previous ILO skills mismatch training in Turin (2020) provided a foundation for understanding the issue.
- Alexandria Business Association utilized this knowledge to design its first apprenticeship program as an intermediary organization.

Alignment with national and local priorities

- Apprenticeship programs should be responsive to the needs of the local community.
- A demand-driven approach is essential for successful implementation.

¹ Mr. Ebrahim formerly worked at Alexandria Business Association (ABA) V-Tech and was presenting his experience in ABA V-Tech

Importance of coalition building

- Coalition building is essential for effective apprenticeship program implementation.
- The concept was reinforced during the Turin training.
- Building Coalition would have the following benefits: shared costs and resources, collaborative problem-solving, aligned vision and goals, increased impact and sustainability, as well as enhanced advocacy and influence.

Partnerships

Partnerships are essential to:

- Enhance private sector engagement.
- Foster connections between development agencies, intermediary organizations, government entities, and TVET service providers.
- Establish a community of practice to share experiences, lessons learned, and resources.

Innovation and evidence-based practices

- Prioritize integrating technology, design, and social needs into apprenticeship programs.
- Use data to determine program effectiveness and make necessary adjustments (Evidence-Based Approach).

ITCILO & V-TECH 2020

- The ITCILO apprenticeship format will be used as a basis for program development with necessary modifications.
- Apprenticeship programs have been active at V-TECH since 2020.
- Innovation extends to instrumental areas and requires strong stakeholder engagement for effective needs assessment and response.

Building citizens through apprenticeships

- Focus on both technical skills and soft skills like industry connections, lifelong learning, and work ethics.
- Promote civic engagement and social responsibility among apprentices and stakeholders.
- Recognize the importance of personal development and character building in apprenticeship programs.

Student-centric approach

- Involve apprentices in decision-making processes through participation in steering committees.
- Empower apprentices to shape their own apprenticeship experience.

Fostering a global/ growth mindset for inclusive apprenticeship programmes

- Prepare apprentices for international work environments.
- Explore opportunities for regional and international training and internships.
- Promote a culture of lifelong learning and adaptability.
- Focus on "conditions of vulnerability" rather than labelling individuals as vulnerable.
- Encourage youth, families, and employers to embrace proactive and resilient approaches to career development.
- Influence youth decisions to align with market demands.
- Promote a culture where apprenticeships are viewed positively and valued by families and society at large.

Apprenticeship as a driver of economic growth

- Integrating large corporations (Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) programs), in terms of making use of their in-house training centres and their HR structure.
- Special emphasis on inclusion of MSMEs as they are most in need of support.
- Inclusion of in-company trainers, the frontline supervisors, in order to promote lifelong learning and increase the retention of the apprentices as well as the already hired employees in the apprenticeship programs.

Promoting inclusion in apprenticeship programmes

- Include immigrants, displaced persons, disadvantaged communities, and individuals of all genders in apprenticeship opportunities as a wider talent pool leads to increased engagement and participation.
- Inclusion fosters a stronger and more equitable society.
- A diverse workforce can contribute to increased profitability.
- Highlighting the economic benefits of inclusion can encourage greater private sector participation.

► Working groups– Flip board sessions:

Marwa Salah Abdou, National Project Coordinator on Child Labour, ILO

Introduction to the apprenticeship working group session

This session focused on implementing the International Labour Organization's Recommendation No. 208 (R208) within the Egyptian context. Participants were divided into 4 working groups, with each group assigned one or two specific recommendations from R208 to work on. These recommendations included:

- A. Recommendation 1: Set clear definition, scope and means of implementation of Quality apprenticeships
- B. Recommendation 2: Create a regulatory framework for quality apprenticeships
- C. Recommendation 3: Ensure apprentices' protection
- D. Recommendation 4: Harmonize the apprenticeship agreement and strengthen and enforce the legal status of apprentices
- E. Recommendation 5: Equality and diversity in quality apprenticeships
- F. Recommendation 6: Promotion of quality apprenticeships
- G. Recommendation 7: International, regional, and national cooperation for quality apprenticeships

The working groups were tasked with considering the following criteria as they explored their assigned recommendations:

- a. Highlights of Context in Egypt (2-3 Bullet Points)
- b. Suggested Actions Steps in the Egyptian Context
- c. Concerned Stakeholders
- d. Potential Resources/Sources of Funding

► Outputs of the working groups:

Recommendation 1. Set clear definition, scope and means of implementation of quality apprenticeships:

Recommendation	Highlights of the context in Egypt (2-3 bullet points)	Suggested action steps in the Egyptian context	Concerned stakeholders	Potential resources/ Sources of funding
1.1 Acknowledge that apprenticeships can help bridge the gap between the labour market needs and the talents nurtured by the formal education system	1. Availability of the dual education and training system and applied technology schools 2. Availability of vocational training centres at the governorate level	1. Setting quality standards that all relevant training entities must adhere to 2. A unified law for apprenticeship and vocational training 3. Training those involved in apprenticeships and the vocational training system to implement quality training programs	1. All relevant authorities/ concerned parties in Egypt 2. Funding bodies	1. Budgets of concerned parties 2. Funding Schemes 3. Granting authorities
1.2 Conduct a tripartite national conference on Quality Apprenticeships and Recommendation (R208)	Independent conferences regarding vocational training and technical education are conducted separately by each concerned ministry.	Form a coordinating committee to hold a national conference represented by the three parties.	The tripartite parties	
1.3 Raise awareness of employers on existing apprenticeship schemes	1. There is involvement of employers and the private sector in implementing the education and training system across all entities. 2. Frameworks are available for private sector participation in some ministries.	Developing frameworks for private sector participation in the remaining ministries.	1. Employers 2. Training Institutions	

Recommendation 2. Create a regulatory framework for quality apprenticeships:

Recommendation	Highlights of the context in Egypt (2-3 bullet points)	Suggested action steps in the Egyptian context	Concerned Stakeholders	Potential Resources/ Sources of Funding
2.1 Strengthen the national apprenticeship system	There is no comprehensive national regulatory framework, and each ministry has its own regulations, specific organizing rules, and even programs.	Establish a tripartite umbrella for apprenticeships with a clear executive framework that defines roles and responsibilities among all stakeholders, with unified standards in light of the national qualification framework.	1. Concerned ministries 2. Student and trade unions 3. Employers' Organizations and Sectoral chambers	
2.2 Reduce Government red tape related to apprenticeships	There are no routine procedures/ red tape			
2.3 Establish a tripartite steering committee	Similar to 2.1. Dual education includes a council, which comprises the ministry and economic sectors	Establish a tripartite umbrella for apprenticeships with a clear executive framework that defines roles and responsibilities among all stakeholders, with unified standards in light of the national qualification framework.	1. Concerned ministries 2. Student and trade unions 3. Employers' Organizations and Sectoral chambers	
2.4 Enhance quality assurance in apprenticeship systems	Ministry of Trade and Industry: 1. There is a system for monitoring field training.			
2.5 Enhance the quality of apprenticeship training	2. Standards for technical training Ministry of Education and Technical Education 1. Ministerial Decree 111 2. Standards for technical training			

Recommendation 3: Ensure apprentices' protection:

Recommendation	Highlights of the context in Egypt (2-3 bullet points)	Suggested action steps in the Egyptian context	Concerned Stakeholders	Potential Resources/ Sources of Funding
3.1 Make sure that fundamental principles and rights at work are respected	1. Labour Laws 2. Quadripartite contract/agreement 3. Child Law	1. Activating the role of relevant authorities for inspectors 2. Working on the part related to union formation/ joining unions/ unions establishment 3. Framework for refugees and migrants' inclusion and protection of their rights	The regulatory body for laws/ the unit that monitors law implementation/law enforcement authority	

Recommendation	Highlights of the context in Egypt (2-3 bullet points)	Suggested action steps in the Egyptian context	Concerned Stakeholders	Potential Resources/ Sources of Funding
3.2 Make sure that apprentices receive an adequate remuneration or financial compensation.	1. Quadripartite contract/agreement 2. Ministerial decree 111 3. Each relevant training entity (whether related to a specific ministry, etc.) has its own laws and contracts regulating remuneration system (not wage) but financial compensation/ allowance/reward 4. Apprentices could remain getting paid the same amount when they start working just as the training (issue of laws not the entity organizing the apprenticeship)	1. Trainees above 18 years old should receive a financial compensation that meets or exceeds the minimum wage during their training period. Inspectors can be deployed to verify compliance. 2. For apprentices between 15 and 18 years old, the compensation may be more incentive based than a fixed amount. 3. Ensure that the financial compensation and other benefits agreed upon in the apprenticeship contract and relevant laws are implemented. 4. Establish regulations and systems to manage apprentice compensation after they complete their training through involving law enforcement authorities to ensure timely and proper payouts.	The regulatory body for laws/ the unit that monitors law implementation/law enforcement authority	

Recommendation	Highlights of the context in Egypt (2-3 bullet points)	Suggested action steps in the Egyptian context	Concerned Stakeholders	Potential Resources/ Sources of Funding
3.3 Review and consider reform related to other forms of rights and protection	Labour Law	Activate the role of the regulatory body for laws/ the unit that monitors law implementation/ law enforcement authority	The regulatory body for laws/ the unit that monitors law implementation/law enforcement authority	
3.4 Regulations should be enforced across training centres and affiliated stations to protect apprentices at the workplace	1. There are procedures and laws in each entity/ training centre (financial and training regulations) that govern the training. 2. Ratified local and international agreements by Egypt. 3. Inspection by labour inspectors isn't a part of education/ vocational training/ apprenticeships.	1. Raising awareness of entities that provide training on the local and international agreements ratified 2. Checking the implementation of laws across training centres through inspectors 3. Creating specialized bodies to monitor and follow up on what is implemented by laws and regulations in the field of training. Inspectors may not have a background in dealing with those aged 15-18 and may not be able to comprehend the decisions related to education or vocational training and separate them from the labour law.	1. Entities that provide trainings/ apprenticeship programs 2. Law enforcement authority 3. Ministry of Labour- Labour inspectors 'mandate to involve apprenticeships Another point introduced: 4. To have a body specialized (not labour inspectors) only for monitoring and auditing apprenticeships	

Recommendation 4: Harmonize the apprenticeship agreement and strengthen and enforce the legal status of apprentices:

Recommendation	Highlights of the context in Egypt (2-3 bullet points)	Suggested action steps in the Egyptian context	Concerned Stakeholders	Potential Resources/ Sources of Funding
4.1 The revision of the national model of apprenticeship agreement should follow a consultation with social partners and education authorities.	This falls under the category of protection in the national model for the vocational training agreement	Flexibility in modifying and changing ministerial training agreements according to labour market demands (as the labour market is changing, the workers are changing, and even degree holders need to update their educational background)- the foundation of this started to exist in MoETE	Ministry of Education and Technical Education (MoETE)	
4.2 Revisit the minimum and maximum age for admission into apprenticeship	This is guaranteed by the law and the regulations governing it: The Child Law. This is regulated by Law Enforcement authorities and it's already included in the Egyptian Law			

N.B.: Funding entities and concerned stakeholders weren't completed by the group due to time limitation for recommendation 3 & 4. Concerned stakeholders are added according to the context of the action needed.

Discussion upon recommendations 3 & 4 key points:

1. Refugees and migrants, who are capable of being trained, should be included in training programs. However, to effectively integrate them, it is necessary to establish laws and regulations that organize their inclusion.
2. Regulating and legislating under a legal framework for the validity of vocational training for the age above 18 is crucial, given Egypt's market context that includes millions of qualified youth graduates facing unemployment. Facilitating vocational training for 6 months to 2 years can significantly enhance Egypt's appeal for external financing/grants in this direction. To implement this effectively, it is essential to establish structured frameworks that regulate and places these financing processes in an effective manner.
3. Coordination between ministries on apprenticeships' legal framework. Training in hazardous professions like welding, it is crucial for coordination with the Ministry of Education to be informed about these professions. This ensures that such training programs align with regulations set by the Ministry of Labor. For instance, within the Ministry of Education's dual education framework, welding for students under 18 is legal while in Ministry of Labour

established framework and laws it's illegal. Currently, consultants from the OSH sector are reviewing the jobs listed by the Ministry of Education in the dual education system to assess compliance with Law Decree 215 of 2021. They are also evaluating the level of risk associated with each profession and identifying any discrepancies with the decree. Additionally, they are examining whether precautionary measures, such as PPEs during training, are in place. This includes scenarios where students observe training without actively participating. This evaluation aligns with the framework, marking a significant shift since pre-2021 discussions on this matter were not possible. (This falls under the protection of apprentices in this specific age group).

4. 5% of individuals with special needs are supposed to be working as part of vocational training but face obstacles due to not having work authorization or aren't part of the testing phase of vocational training. (Inclusion & accessibility)- Leaving no one behind.

Recommendation 5: Equality and diversity in quality apprenticeships:

Recommendation	Highlights of the context in Egypt (2-3 bullet points)	Suggested action steps in the Egyptian context	Concerned Stakeholders	Potential Resources/ Sources of Funding
5.1 Supporting social inclusion for migrant and refugees	Inclusion exists in traditional vocational education and is available at various vocational training centres, but not in dual education system	1. Enabling accessibility and inclusion of dual education system for all nationalities not only Egyptians 2. Enforcement of legislation to integrate different nationalities into dual education, as there is significant potential to accommodate diverse nationalities. 3. Standardizing competencies as a measure to assess educational outcomes for trainees of various nationalities and academic levels. This not only allows us to assess their skills in a fair manner but also enables employers or service providers to utilize them as a reference.	Ministry of Education & Technical Education Ministry of Social Solidarity Ministry of Labour	

Recommendation	Highlights of the context in Egypt (2-3 bullet points)	Suggested action steps in the Egyptian context	Concerned Stakeholders	Potential Resources/ Sources of Funding
5.1 Supporting social inclusion for migrant and refugees		4. Recognition of prior learning as a component - a fundamental right for anyone learning something, proving their proficiency. The concept itself or a skills assessment model at the Ministry of Labour is unknown if accessible to refugees and different nationalities. 5. Expanding training in self-employment occupations provides flexibility and space to regulate the risks or constraints associated with social security coverage or legislation governing foreign labour in various facilities, and make use of laws and legislation to regulate this informality through license issuance/ certification, etc. 6. Focusing on sectors with shortage in labour supply	For the 6th Action Point: 1. CAPMAS 2. FEI 3. Investors' associations 4. Chambers, such as the Chamber of Commerce Representatives of employers	

Discussion upon recommendation 5 key points:

Foreigners require a work permit for conducting such work; however, such permit is allowed for expertise that isn't locally available. A recommendation was made to make laws more inclusive and to include refugees (so they won't be considered or treated from the perspective of expertise but from the perspective of "refugees" as refugees are trained and existent in Egypt, so we need to create an enabling environment for them to work through laws). Taking into consideration that unemployment scale in Egypt is high and challenging for nationals to land a job, so ensuring how to implement this without being a competition to the Egyptian labour force. Another meeting can be conducted in a form of a think tank to research this issue- Dr. Yasmine to introduce and present the framework of refugees' inclusion in terms of what laws and procedures are available to be presented in the next meeting

Recommendation 6: Promotion of quality apprenticeships

Recommendation	Highlights of the context in Egypt (2-3 bullet points)	Suggested action steps in the Egyptian context	Concerned Stakeholders	Potential Resources/ Sources of Funding
6.1 Rebrand apprenticeship as popular and modern career path	Stigma/ Stereotype on apprenticeship in Egypt	Motivational Success Stories/ campaigns Ensuring & emphasizing decent work to encourage apprentices	1. Ministry of Social Solidarity (MoSS) 2. Ministry of Education and Technical Education 3. Ministry of Labour 4. Civil Society 5. Union & representatives of apprentices	• CSR of Private Sector • In-kind contributions

Recommendation 7: International, regional, and national cooperation for quality apprenticeships:

Recommendation	Highlights of the context in Egypt (2-3 bullet points)	Suggested action steps in the Egyptian context	Concerned Stakeholders	Potential Resources/ Sources of Funding
7.1 Foster collaboration among key stakeholders to deliver within an integrated approach	1. There is no integrated cooperation due to the absence of a unified umbrella. 2. MoETE coordinates efforts between development partners and divides resources among them.	1. Internal coordination between relevant ministries 2. The current situation of each ministry (situational analysis) 3. Integration plan between ministries and various vocational training activities 4. Establishment of a ministerial committee 5. Cooperation between the MoETE and MoL in hazardous professions 6. Inclusion of the private sector and setting unified frameworks and standards for vocational training	The entities involved in vocational training from the ministries: Ministry of Education & Technical Education, Ministry of Trade and Industry, Ministry of Labour, employers and international organizations participating in supporting vocational education.	

7.2 Raise resources with international partners and domestic funds to ensure the financing of apprenticeships is diversified, fair and sustainable				
--	--	--	--	--

► Meeting conclusion:

Closing session and key takeaways:

Dalia Mahmoud, ILO National Project Coordinator – PROSPECTS

1. Financing of apprenticeships
2. Coordination - effective networking and communication
3. Inclusivity/diversity (foreigners/people with disabilities/children/women)
4. Social dialogue/unifying standards while maintaining the uniqueness of different apprenticeship systems
5. Importance of having an institutional platform for apprenticeships
6. Integrate the Applied Technology System/International Schools of Applied Technology

Contact details

International Labour Organization
9, Taha Hussein St., Zamalek
11211, Cairo
Egypt

T: (+ 202) 27369290 / (+ 202) 27350123
E: cairo@ilo.org