INTERNATIONAL LABOUR OFFICE



Governing Body

GB.295/TC/2 295th Session

Geneva, March 2006

Committee on Technical Cooperation

TC

FOR INFORMATION

SECOND ITEM ON THE AGENDA

Thematic evaluation: HIV/AIDS and the world of work

I. Introduction

- **1.** During each of the March sessions of the Governing Body, the Committee on Technical Cooperation considers a thematic evaluation of the ILO's technical cooperation programme. The theme selected for discussion at the 295th Session, March 2006, is HIV/AIDS and the world of work.
- 2. While activities related to HIV/AIDS are mainstreamed across the Organization, the ILO's response is led by the ILO/AIDS programme, which was created in November 2000 in response to an International Labour Conference resolution. ILO/AIDS is engaged in research and advocacy. It also plays a major role in providing technical cooperation assistance to the tripartite constituents and the greater part of its budget comprises extrabudgetary funding. Although operating at international, regional and national levels, the prime focus of ILO/AIDS is on the development of workplace policies and programmes through projects which guide and enhance the capacities of ministries of labour and the social partners to take sustainable action on HIV/AIDS. It is therefore difficult at times to differentiate between programme and project performance when presenting the technical cooperation work carried out by ILO/AIDS.
- 3. The present report is based on the findings of evaluations of technical cooperation projects that are particularly representative of all the projects developed and implemented by the ILO/AIDS programme. Since most of the major projects started at the beginning of the programme in 2002 are still operating, the present report draws primarily on the mid-term assessments of seven projects funded by the United States Department of Labor (USDOL). The final evaluation report of a multi-country project funded by the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (Sida), Sweden, has also been used. Other related technical documents have also been consulted. The projects selected to illustrate the

¹ In June 2000, the 88th Session of the International Labour Conference passed a resolution recognizing that HIV/AIDS threatens the strategic objectives of the Decent Work Agenda and requesting the Director-General to expand the capacity of the Office to respond. A global Programme on HIV/AIDS and the World of Work (ILO/AIDS) was created in December 2000 as a follow-up to the resolution.

ILO/AIDS approach to technical cooperation and achievements to date are as follows (see full list in the appendix):

- ILO/USDOL International HIV/AIDS Workplace Education Programme (Phase I).
 Countries covered: Belize, Benin, Cambodia, Ghana, Guyana, Togo.
- HIV/AIDS prevention in the world of work: A tripartite response, India (funded by USDOL).
- Sida project on HIV/AIDS prevention in the transport and informal sectors. Countries covered: Ghana, South Africa, United Republic of Tanzania, Uganda (informal sector component), Botswana, Lesotho, Malawi, Mozambique, Namibia, South Africa, Swaziland, Zimbabwe (transport sector component).

II. Project objectives and strategies

- **4.** All the projects focus on implementation of the ILO code of practice on HIV/AIDS and the world of work. The code provides both the strategic framework for project development and the core guidance tool for implementation. It sets out fundamental principles and practical guidelines from which concrete responses to HIV/AIDS can be developed at enterprise, community and national levels in the following areas:
 - the protection of workers' rights, including employment protection, gender equality and non-discrimination;
 - prevention through education, gender-awareness programmes, the promotion of confidential voluntary counselling and testing, and practical support for behaviour change; and
 - care and support, including entitlement to benefits and reasonable accommodation, as well as treatment in settings where local health systems are inadequate.
- **5.** These areas of activity represent the three "pillars" of the workplace response in all ILO/AIDS projects. The widespread recognition of the code by international and national bodies involved in the response to HIV/AIDS, as well as by the tripartite constituents, has greatly enhanced buy-in by key partners at country level, and has also strengthened coherence and coordination in the world of work response.
- **6.** In addition, United Budget and Workplan (UBW) funding has been made available for 2004-05 through UNAIDS. This funding reinforces the work done through the technical cooperation projects, supporting capacity building, advocacy, fundamental human and workplace rights, intensifying prevention through education and training and facilitating access to treatment.
- 7. The strategic approach is common to all the projects, though the India and Sida projects started with a pilot phase. It relies on collaboration with the tripartite constituents and operates at three levels simultaneously: (i) consultation with the government and employers' and workers' organizations to ensure that the national legal and policy framework is conducive to workplace programmes and the protection of workers' rights; (ii) advisory services and training for the social partners to help them put in place HIV/AIDS policies for their own organizations and strengthen their capacity to promote and support workplace programmes; and (iii) collaboration with enterprise management and labour representatives, supported by employers' and workers' organizations, to formulate policy and launch effective programmes within public and private sector

- workplaces. Activities at all three levels include mechanisms to facilitate the sharing of experience and replication of good practices.
- **8.** The development objectives of all ILO/AIDS technical cooperation projects cover common ground, although the phrasing and emphasis differs in the various project documents. All seek to prevent HIV/AIDS in the world of work and reduce its adverse consequences. Variations include specific reference to reduced discrimination, reduced risk behaviours and improved access to care, as well as mention of specific sectors (e.g. transport, the informal economy).
- **9.** Immediate objectives of the two Sida projects were as follows:

Transport:

- to develop national policies to prevent the transmission of HIV among employees of the transport sector, including road, rail, water and air transport, and to mitigate the impact of the epidemic in the sector, in eight southern African countries (see paragraph 3);
- to develop a regional strategy and a set of inter-country mechanisms for the prevention of HIV transmission in the transport sector, based on the national strategies of eight southern African countries; and
- to assist the eight southern African countries with the implementation of effective national strategies for the prevention of HIV transmission in the transport sector.

Informal economy:

- to develop and implement gender-sensitive rapid interventions for the prevention of HIV transmission and mitigation of the impact of HIV/AIDS in selected informal sectors of selected countries in Africa (see paragraph 3) (community outreach interventions); and
- to mobilize local communities to sustain effective means of HIV prevention and impact mitigation in each of the participating countries (participatory community-based interventions).
- **10.** The India project took an incremental approach to achieve the following immediate objectives through three phases of operation:
 - at the end of Phase I, the tripartite constituents will be better equipped to adopt and implement effective workplace policies and programmes on HIV/AIDS;
 - at the end of Phase II, there will be enhanced tripartite action against HIV/AIDS in the three selected pilot States, covering workers from the informal as well as the formal economy; and
 - at the end of the project, a sustainable mechanism will be in place for the world of work response to HIV/AIDS.
- **11.** The strategic framework for the ILO/USDOL project has three levels. Long-term objectives are accomplished by pursuing four immediate objectives:
 - improved knowledge and attitudes related to HIV/AIDS risk behaviours;
 - increased awareness and use of available HIV/AIDS workplace services;

- reduced stigma against persons living with HIV/AIDS; and
- increased capacity of the constituents to develop and apply HIV/AIDS workplace policies.
- **12.** These in turn are supported by sub-immediate objectives designed to ensure fine-tuning of project focus and selection of activities, namely:
 - increased availability of quality HIV/AIDS workplace services;
 - improved HIV/AIDS workplace policies;
 - increased levels of workplace collaboration and commitment by labour and management;
 - increased capacity of workplace to offer comprehensive HIV/AIDS policies and programmes on a sustained basis;
 - improved coordination and cooperation between tripartite actors and other partners at the national level:
 - improved national-level policy framework related to HIV/AIDS in the workplace; and
 - increased capacity of tripartite constituents to support development of workplace policies and programmes.
- 13. The advantage of such a detailed framework has been the clear guidance it provides, especially as it is linked to a performance monitoring plan that tracks and measures implementation. The disadvantage has been a certain inflexibility, but the mid-term evaluations provided the opportunity to review and revise aspects of the strategy. One example has been to add a component on improving access to services for care, support and treatment.

III. Main findings

14. In all cases, the evaluators found that the immediate objectives had been wholly or partially achieved and that they contributed satisfactorily to the achievement of the development objectives. For the Sida transport project it was judged that the first and third objectives had been achieved, and the second objective in part; for the informal economy project, the first objective had largely been achieved and for the second mobilization had begun well but further work was needed (see paragraph 7). For the India and ILO/USDOL projects the evaluations were only mid-term, but the assessment of the first and second phases found that the objectives had been fully achieved, and the six other ILO/USDOL projects were all found to be at the required point in relation to the workplans and programme monitoring plans. A positive finding in all cases was the early and full involvement of the tripartite constituents through a variety of mechanisms from consultative workshops to their participation in programme advisory boards or committees (PAB/Cs).

A. Project design

15. The evaluation of the Sida transport project found flaws in its design, stemming from the fact that the immediate objectives had not been developed on the basis of a rigorous situation analysis. It was felt that the absence of benchmark data, of reliable information on

both needs and capacities, and of indicators, were obstacles to project design and evaluation. Adjustments were subsequently made and a sounder methodology developed. Projects now start with a mapping exercise which in the short term assists with design and planning, and in the longer term feeds into a broader database that strengthens the research and policy analysis activities of ILO/AIDS as a whole. Similarly the baseline surveys (USDOL project) – conducted with between 300 and 400 workers on average – provide information for project design and for subsequent monitoring and evaluation. In some projects the research itself has been an important component. The pilot phase of the Sida informal sector project ² developed a rapid assessment methodology in collaboration with the ABET ³ Institute and organized its application through "rapid action teams". ⁴ This method was used effectively in collecting the data necessary to ensure that project design and action plans were appropriately focused.

- 16. The availability of a generic strategic framework for design of the ILO/USDOL projects and implementation made it considerably easier to analyse project suitability for each country and develop an appropriate action plan adjusted for local conditions and needs. The strategic framework allowed for a logical progression with clearly defined stages and therefore provided effective guidance to project staff and those responsible for managing and monitoring implementation.
- 17. The India project was felt to be well-designed in that its staged approach and pilot activities were judged to be appropriate to a situation where the ILO had no previous experience of HIV/AIDS project implementation and the country concerned had very little in the way of workplace-related activity on HIV/AIDS.

B. Project management, implementation and monitoring

- 18. For the USDOL and India projects, a national project coordinator (NPC) manages the project in each country. A project advisory board (PAB) steers the project to ensure harmony with national policy and strategy as well as monitor progress. The PAB brings the tripartite constituents together with other key stakeholders, including governmental agencies, international bodies such as UNAIDS, United Nations Theme Groups on HIV/AIDS, representation from the donor country, if available, as well as interested non-governmental organizations and networks of people living with HIV/AIDS (PLWHA). In all reports consulted, the assessors concluded that the projects were being well managed and implemented, with activities completed on time according to the plan of action. Strategies were judged by stakeholders to be appropriate to the local needs and situation. All the national project coordinators were commended for their competence, dedication to their work and their capacity to respond to issues rapidly.
- 19. A key difference for the Sida projects was the absence of NPCs. They did not benefit from the local knowledge and on-the-spot support of an NPC: one coordinator oversaw the eight participating countries, with limited success, and the national consultants conducting surveys for the informal sector required fairly intensive supervision from Geneva, with inevitable complications. In addition, it must be borne in mind that the Sida projects were conceived as pilots, and that the mistakes made were perhaps as useful as the achievements

² HIV/AIDS prevention in the informal sector of four African countries, 2002-03.

³ Adult Basic Education and Training Institute at the University of South Africa.

⁴ Veronica McKay: Consolidated report on HIV/AIDS interventions in the informal sector, Sep. 2003.

in helping guide the next phase of the projects, as well as projects with other partners in the same sectors. UNDP, for example, is funding a new ILO project for the informal economy in Zambia which has been shaped by the lessons learnt in the course of the project in question using the same research methodology; follow-up to the transport sector project is being planned with Sida.

- **20.** Regarding projects that cover more than one or two countries, coordination of activities raises coordination problems. In some cases project activities have been delayed by the confusion that resulted regarding the distribution of responsibilities between headquarters and field offices. ⁵ In response to these management and monitoring problems, a number of new tools have been developed and are in various stages of application. A web-based project management and knowledge-sharing tool, Community Zero, has been set up to link the national project coordinators, focal points in field offices and the management team at headquarters. First used in the ILO/USDOL project, it now includes all NPCs. It provides a tool to monitor activities in each country, to share the materials developed or used by the projects, and to disseminate good practices and lessons learnt.
- 21. A key component of the USDOL projects is a built-in monitoring system to assess progress and identify strengths and weaknesses for any replanning needed. A performance monitoring plan (PMP) with country-specific indicators is used to assess project impact. The monitoring system is designed to perform: (i) workers' surveys to measure the impact of the project on knowledge, attitudes and practices of target workers; (ii) monitoring of enterprises to assess the impact of the project on their policies and programmes; (iii) tripartite project monitoring to provide an overview of the project contribution to the activities of the tripartite constituents and the national framework.
- 22. The designated government counterparts and employers' and workers' representatives have been involved at all levels of project planning (adaptation of generic strategy to country and sector specific needs) and implementation. The principal mechanism for this is the programme advisory board, supplemented by broader consultations and workshops. A gender balance on PABs has not always been easy to achieve, but participation in training and workshops has achieved a better balance, except where the sector concerned is particularly dominated by one sex. There have also been capacity issues, in particular the level of human resources the constituents are able to divert to the projects. Another challenge encountered has been the reluctance often only temporary of employers to take part in the projects for cost reasons or, as was the case in one country, because the relatively low prevalence led them to consider that HIV/AIDS was not a major issue.

C. Performance and achievements

- 23. Overall, the level of project performance in relation to resource expenditures has been very satisfactory. In every mid-term assessment for the ILO/USDOL projects, for example, the direct and indirect beneficiaries and associated partners such as donor representatives, UNAIDS and NGOs, spoke positively of the achievements of the project to date, in the following respects in particular, and similar achievements may be noted in the India and Sida reports:
 - the projects brought the ILO's constituents to a new level of understanding and commitment on HIV/AIDS, as well as giving them the capacity to disseminate this understanding through their networks and use it to support workplace interventions (examples include the mobilization and training of the education officers of the

⁵ HIV/AIDS prevention in the transport sector and in the informal sector in African countries. Final evaluation report, Aug. 2003, International Labour Office.

Central Board for Workers' Education in India and of the representatives of transport workers in southern Africa);

- the projects broadened the numbers of stakeholders ready to support activities in the
 world of work and provided much-needed coordination in almost all cases (examples
 include the systematic engagement of NGOs in delivering selected workplace
 services in the informal economy and the broad range of stakeholders who join the
 tripartite constituents on the PABs);
- the projects have engaged enterprises in a range of economic sectors and helped them
 establish programmes with built-in mechanisms for sustainability (sectors with
 targeted enterprises range from hotels and tourism, retail, banking and security
 services to textiles, transport, engineering and metallurgy, construction and shipping
 industries); and
- most of the projects have strengthened the legal and policy framework for workplace action, through the integration of HIV/AIDS in labour law or policy, and/or through the integration of the workplace in AIDS plans and structures (recent examples of legal and policy reform include Cambodia, India, Swaziland and the United Republic of Tanzania).
- **24.** Specific achievements are too numerous to present in detail, but the section below provides some highlights. A more extended account of ILO/AIDS projects and their achievements can be found in a report ⁶ on technical cooperation. The project in India the first undertaken by ILO/AIDS provides an outstanding example. It has established such a sound reputation that it now finds the main business alliances coming to it for advice and training, and similarly some of India's largest employers, including the railways, gas corporation and a number of mines. A short summary of key achievements is given below, but does not include the many innovative materials developed, including films, posters, playing cards, flip charts, CDs and handbooks.

Tripartite action on HIV/AIDS in India: Key achievements 2002-04

Legislation, policy

- ILO code of practice disseminated extensively in Hindi and English
- Support for the development of national legislation on HIV/AIDS

Capacity building for national authorities

- The training of 63 Ministry of Labour, 111 National Labour Institute (NLI) employees
- The creation of an NLI HIV/AIDS coordination and capacity-building unit to train trade union leaders and labour inspectors, and carry out research into stigma and discrimination in the world of work
- 110 physicians, 117 paramedical staff and 35 labour administrators have been trained in three states

Capacity building for employers

55 enterprises have implemented workplace policies and programmes for their workers and 225 master educators and 1,225 peer educators have been trained to cover 168,565 workers in these enterprises

⁶ Technical cooperation: A means to implement the ILO code of practice on HIV/AIDS and the world of work, International Labour Office, Geneva, June 2004. ISBN 92-2-115826-8. Available in electronic form at http://www.ilo.org/aids .

Tripartite action on HIV/AIDS in India: Key achievements 2002-04		
Capacity building for trade unions	 Training of all 246 education officers of the Central Board for Worker Education (CBWE) 	
	 Provision by the CWBE of HIV/AIDS education to a total of 313,226 workers (120,970 men and 192,256 women) 	
Sector-specific activities	 Collaboration with the Mumbai District AIDS Control Society (MDACS), Municipal Corporation and police to train 80 police public relation officers 	
	 Establishment of a Voluntary Counselling and Testing Centre in Nagpada Police Hospital 	
Reaching out to vulnerable groups	PLWHA have been involved in 61 advocacy and training programmes	
	 CBWE worker education programmes have covered 220,367 workers (173,367 women and 47,000 men) in the informal sector 	
	 200 trainers from NGOs/trade unions/health services trained for work in the informal sector 	
	 A trade union activity for 5,240 agricultural workers has started in 12 villages 	

25. In the Sida projects training took place for officials of the ministries of labour and transport (in some cases including customs and immigration officials), officials of SADC and other regional bodies, representatives of employers' and workers' organizations, the National AIDS Commission, and United Nations partners in reviewing and applying country assessments, policy development and review, HIV/AIDS prevention, programme planning and management, cross-border regulations (transport), and a substantial programme of peer education was completed.

Mobilization and awareness raising

26. All the projects succeeded significantly in mobilizing the tripartite constituents, as demonstrated by the numbers associated with the PAB/Cs, the numbers that have established action plans on HIV/AIDS and created focal points, and by the numbers of Tripartite Declarations on HIV/AIDS (Benin, Cambodia, Ghana, India and Togo). On 12 December 2005, a statement of commitment was signed by all seven major employers' organizations in India to engage business to address HIV/AIDS in the workplace. The projects have also contributed to the growing collaboration between employers' and workers' organizations in dealing with HIV/AIDS in the workplace, as well as the creation of fruitful links between enterprises and local community networks. The success of the USDOL projects in mobilizing enterprise participation is demonstrated by the fact that in all cases more companies wished to join the project than it was possible to manage. Adjustments were therefore made in several cases to service a "second tier" of enterprise partners, who share in some of the training and materials, but are supported less closely by the NPC and PAB.

Knowledge management and dissemination

27. Information exchange networks and linkages between stakeholders have been developed at all levels for the express purpose of enabling those involved, especially the NPCs, to share materials and resources, as well as exchanging success stories and lessons learnt from failures. The impact data that will be available once the projects have conducted their follow-up surveys will be a valuable resource and case studies are being gathered for a collection that will be an input for all the projects. The availability of information, links

and guidance on the ILO/AIDS web site as well as subregional web sites such as the one developed for India ⁷ has provided useful support.

Legal and policy framework

- 28. Significant technical assistance has been provided to government institutions to ensure that the principles of the ILO code of practice are incorporated in national policies and regulations, both to promote workplace action and to combat stigma and discrimination. Project involvement has resulted in the formulation or revision of laws, national action plans and other regulatory instruments focused on or referring to HIV/AIDS in the world of work. The translation of the code has most often been at the request of the countries concerned, and projects have supported these as well translations of the training manual into Bahasa Indonesian, Chinese and Russian.
- 29. In Benin, the law on HIV/AIDS now includes a reference to the world of work, and a national strategy for the workplace is being developed. The HIV/AIDS legislation recently adopted in Cambodia highlights the importance of workplace action. The Ghana project assisted the authorities to finalize a national HIV/AIDS workplace policy in December 2004. In India, an employers' charter on HIV/AIDS has been developed with project input and a national policy on HIV/AIDS and the world of work is in preparation. In Togo a world of work component has been included in the national strategy on HIV/AIDS.
- **30.** The development of national policies as well as cross-border harmonization of laws and policies was a particular feature of the Sida transport project and one which has several measurable outcomes. Policies are now in place, strengthening national law and policy related to transport through the inclusion of specific provisions related to HIV/AIDS in Malawi, Mozambique, South Africa and Zimbabwe, and also provide the basis for subregional cooperation.

Capacity building

- 31. Projects have strengthened the capacities of the tripartite constituents by advising on policy development; facilitated the establishment and strengthening of infrastructures, consultative processes and coordination mechanisms; provided access to training and related materials; and assisted with resource mobilization. Skills-building activities have focused on two main areas: strategic planning and the understanding and promotion of the dynamics of behaviour change, including the widespread use of peer educators. The Sida project for the informal economy achieved the following: Ghana 100 peer educators among hairdressers and garage owners; South Africa 200 peer educators among food sellers and hawkers and vendors; Uganda 105 peer educators among informal workers in rural and urban areas; the United Republic of Tanzania 100 peer educators among women brew sellers and women who sell second-hand clothing.
- 32. This aspect of the ILO/AIDS technical cooperation work, particularly the training of focal points from government agencies, and employers' and workers' organizations, as well as trainers of trainers (called "master trainers" in the India project) and peer educators is essential for replication, scaling up and sustainability. It ensures a proper transmission of the knowledge and skills needed by constituents to continue the work initiated by the ILO. Nevertheless some NPCs have expressed concern that some of the enterprises may continue to rely too much on their support, and are seeking ways to increase the sense of ownership and motivation on the part of key stakeholders.

⁷ http://www.ilo.org/iloaidsindia.

High-risk populations

- 33. Most of the projects have included activities that target populations who are exposed to a higher than average risk of HIV infection or vulnerability to the impact of AIDS, including women, informal sector workers, migrant workers and workers in certain sectors such as transport. This particularly applied to both Sida projects. The informal sector project focused on community outreach and mobilization, underpinned by rapid assessment and interventions, with a high priority given to interventions for women workers. The evaluators felt that valuable information had been obtained on an area that is of great importance but suffers from a lack of data and of adapted interventions. The assessments enabled key subsectors to be identified and an appropriate strategy to be developed it is significant that a different approach was followed in Ghana and in South Africa, stemming from these findings. As previously mentioned, the methodology developed has been well received and is being applied by other agencies and in other countries in Africa (e.g. Zambia, see paragraph 14) and in the Caribbean. The evaluation also pointed out the challenges presented by the lack of communication channels such as those that exist in the formal economy.
- **34.** The transport project succeeded in developing awareness, networking and dialogue between stakeholders and countries in the SADC region, and developed a regional action plan on HIV/AIDS for the transport sector as a final outcome of the project, in order to protect the workers concerned from many of the risks they are at present exposed to. Follow-up action is planned on harmonization of policy and legal frameworks relevant to HIV/AIDS in the transport sector with particular attention given to gender and crossborder issues. A separate project funded by Italy is using the information gained to organize training of peer educators for transport workers and their families in Ethiopia.
- **35.** Several projects have included PLWHA in their activities as a means to help them break down stigma and discrimination. In Benin, a new network of PLWHA associations is now included in the PAB and participates in the implementation work. In India, PLWHA participate in the PAB and a number of activities including a pilot on income generation in New Delhi.
- **36.** Gender issues are integrated in most project activities, and recognize the weak position of women in negotiating safe sexual relations, as well as the widespread practice for men to have multiple sexual partners. Most materials include the gender dimension and all training is designed to increase gender awareness. However, apart from the India project, scant information could be found on the ratio of women versus men workers covered by project activities.
- 37. The issue of stigma and discrimination still remains a big challenge to ILO/AIDS projects. Any intervention aimed at encouraging prevention and behaviour change, as well as providing care and support for affected workers, needs to create a non-discriminatory work environment to be effective. In Guyana, migrant workers involved in mining and agricultural activities were perceived to be at high risk of infection as well as of stigma and discrimination, undermining the attempt to implement programmes targeting these workers. In fact, due to the fear of being stigmatized, PLWHA were reluctant to participate in the design and implementation of the project strategy.

Sustainability

38. The core components of sustainability include a valid policy framework (ensuring the integration of HIV/AIDS in existing structures and activities), an established network of committed actors, the capacity to carry out workplace programmes (with access to some advisory services and training expertise) and necessary resources. The reports consulted

show that all are potentially in place in the ILO/USDOL project countries, where the action plans build planning for sustainability into the strategic framework. Examples of measures already in place – even at the mid-term point in the project life – include the fact that in Togo the PAB will probably become a permanent National Tripartite Commission on HIV/AIDS and the world of work, and the Ministry of Labour (*Direction de la Santé au Travail*) will take over the project if other funding does not become available to extend it. In other countries evaluators note HIV/AIDS in the curricula of vocational and professional training institutes, and in the work plans of the labour inspectorates. All the projects have been successful in fostering or assisting in the development of national instruments, as well as the establishment of enterprise policies on HIV/AIDS which represent one essential element of sustainability.

- 39. Sustainability was also a key component of the third phase of the India project. This is in its early stages but the assessment of Phase II judged that all the elements are in place for the achievement of a sustainable national plan. The outputs of the Sida projects have been geared to establishing structures, policies and methodologies that can be sustained and built on, and the evaluation report made it clear that most of these are satisfactorily in place, with noticeable gaps in some countries for the transport project, namely Botswana and Mozambique. The obstacle in the case of Botswana appears to relate to a lack of commitment on the part of some officials in the Ministry of Transport, whereas in Mozambique the constraints stemmed from the post-conflict situation.
- **40.** Key factors that will support sustainability include the participation of key actors government, employers, workers, community-based services and other relevant bodies and the networking, social dialogue and mutual trust and respect fostered among them. This has generally succeeded in creating a strong sense of ownership and the commitment to carry the work past the end of projects.
- **41.** The strong emphasis by all the projects on education and training has also ensured that significant levels of human capacities are available and motivated to continue post-project work. The focus on the development of national knowledge bases, guidelines, methods and training materials in local languages, suited to the needs of the tripartite constituents has also strengthened the basis for sustainability.
- **42.** Although sustainability was built into the projects from their inception, what frequently happens is that ILO partners, especially governments, fail to honour their post-project promises, due to personnel turnover within relevant departments, changes in political direction, and so on. Obstacles to sustainability are numerous, the availability of economic resources to continue post-project work being a major one. For example, it is unclear to what extent focal points trained by the projects will have the proper resources to sustain post-project activities. Peer educators face also the same problem, and it is a challenge to maintain their motivation. Focal points in the public sector feel they lack institutional support.

IV. Lessons learnt

43. Placing the ILO code of practice as the pivotal instrument for technical cooperation has ensured coherence and relevance of project objectives and activities. The universal recognition of the code has allowed the development of a "generic" strategy easily adaptable to specific country and workplace requirements. This has resulted in a cost-effective and rapid system for developing and implementing projects. Another important benefit is that this common reference facilitates exchanges between projects and project replication.

- **44.** Ensuring that the national tripartite constituents are given full opportunity to shape, own and participate fully in project implementation is the most effective way to ensure relevance and effectiveness, as well as providing a basis for continued and sustainable action.
- **45.** The appointment of locally recruited project coordinators has been of great benefit to the implementation of projects, though it is essential to build into their work plans the means for them to progressively reduce their involvement in day-to-day activities while still supporting the social partners and the enterprises, so as to build capacity and facilitate sustainability.
- **46.** The gathering of benchmark or baseline data is essential in order to ensure the project is achieving its objectives and having the desired impact, and to make it possible to adjust the strategy if necessary.
- **47.** Workplace programmes require an approach that is both flexible depending on the resources of the employer and the nature of the need and comprehensive, i.e. including prevention, care and the protection of rights.
- **48.** Ensuring that workplace education includes personal risk assessment and the promotion of behaviour change with a gender-aware approach is proving to be the best approach to prevention and the reduction of stigma and discrimination.
- **49.** Sustainability is encouraged through integrating HIV/AIDS into existing workplace structures and mechanisms, ensuring ownership by the constituents and other stakeholders, building skills and capacity, and favouring "multiplier effect" mechanisms such as training of trainers.
- **50.** Making knowledge-sharing and networking a major project component has enhanced delivery, monitoring, effectiveness and sustainability, and improved planning and policy development for future projects.

V. Constraints and challenges

- **51.** The objectives of technical cooperation projects in terms of behaviour change, lower HIV prevalence, elimination of discrimination, and improved access to care all require a relatively long time frame to be realized. It will therefore be necessary to extend or complement some of the existing projects through the mobilization of additional resources.
- **52.** Given the fact that HIV/AIDS is still an incurable disease, strategies must continue to rely heavily on prevention and therefore apply behaviour change approaches. At the same time, as antiretroviral drugs become more accessible and affordable, the world of work needs to support efforts to massively extend access to treatment as a means of helping workers to remain at work, which will in turn maintain incomes, reduce the number of AIDS orphans, and enhance productivity and competitiveness which are critical in this era of globalization.
- **53.** The context of fear, denial and shame that marks the HIV epidemic has fostered discrimination and blocked or undermined the response in many ways. Such issues remain very real constraints as does gender inequality with consequences for the behaviour of men and the vulnerability of women. Projects must continue giving a very high priority to these issues, through education and training as well as normative tools and policy guidance.

- **54.** The importance of increasing the number of projects on prevention of HIV/AIDS in the informal sector can hardly be overemphasized. At the same time as continuing to connect formal enterprises and labour market structures with the informal economy, additional and innovative cooperation efforts should be organized. These may be projects or components of other projects addressing poverty alleviation, agricultural workers or small enterprise development.
- **55.** Interlinked issues such as child labour, migration and working conditions require increased collaboration at project level with other ILO programmes and other international bodies. Efforts will be pursued to boost joint programming and project development.

VI. Conclusion

56. The analysis of the activities and achievements of the evaluated projects shows undeniably that, after a period of searching and adjustment, the ILO/AIDS technical cooperation work has reached a satisfactory level of maturity in terms of project design and implementation. Although it is difficult to obtain a quantitative measure of impact, the overall satisfaction of the beneficiaries, demands from the constituents for more projects and increased availability of interested donor partners are indications of the relevance and usefulness of the ILO's technical cooperation assistance in the area of HIV/AIDS. Of particular note is the success of the projects in creating a forum for social dialogue, which is exemplified by the creation and functioning of PABs (see paragraph 13). This enhanced "social dialogue capital" is likely to contribute to a long-term and sustainable engagement of partners at the national level and improve enterprise-level dialogue, with the potential for improved tripartite relations in other spheres of action.

Geneva, 8 February 2006.

Submitted for information.

Appendix

Project evaluation reports used

Projects	Reports available
International HIV/AIDS Workplace Education Programme (USDOL) Phase I – 2003-06	2005 Mid-term internal assessments for Belize, Benin, Cambodia, Ghana, Guyana, Togo
HIV/AIDS prevention in the world of work: A tripartite response (USDOL) Phase II – 2002-05	India – Mid-term internal appraisal report, December 2004
HIV/AIDS prevention in the transport and the informal sectors in 11 African countries (Sida) Phase I – 2002-03	Final evaluation report, August 2003