



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation
Office

Promoting gender equality for decent employment in Pakistan - Final evaluation

Quick Facts

Countries:	<i>Pakistan</i>
Final Evaluation:	<i>October 31, 2016</i>
Evaluation Mode:	<i>Independent</i>
Administrative Office:	<i>CO-Islamabad</i>
Technical Office:	<i>GED</i>
Evaluation Manager:	<i>Nita Neupane</i>
Evaluation Consultant(s):	<i>Francisco L Guzman, Lead Evaluator</i> <i>Adeela K Zubair, National Consultant</i> <i>Nuria Moya, Evaluation Assistant</i>
Project Code:	<i>PAK/09/03/CAN</i>
Donor(s) & Budget:	<i>Canada\$ 8,000,000</i>
Keywords:	<i>Gender mainstreaming, employment, gender equality, sexual discrimination, harassment, labour market segmentation, compliance, DWCP.</i>

Background & Context

Situation of Women at Work

Pakistan has a very complex and multifaceted challenging situation related to different dimensions and determinants of economic participation. According

to the country scorecard of the World Economic Forum Report 2015¹, Pakistan ranks 143 out of 144 in Economic Participation and Opportunity, which is an alarming figure for a developing country like Pakistan. The statistics for educational attainment and health and survival are 135 and 125 respectively. Labour force participation ranks at 140, which is another red flag for economic empowerment in the country.

Social, economic, and cultural factors have a direct effect on gender equality in the workplace in Pakistan. Women are underpaid and overworked, even when they overcome structural and social barriers to seek employment. The near invisibility of women in micro and macroeconomic policies compounds the issue, as the different initiatives of the federal and provincial governments are aimed more at income generation than bringing women into the economic mainstream. The situation warrants a deeper analysis of the existing socioeconomic data as the basis for future ILO work on GE.

Sexual harassment is one of the top most issues for working-women in Pakistan. There are hundreds of incidents of sexual harassment every year. Social taboos and norms refrain women from speaking up against cases of sexual harassment. According to an estimate more than 70 percent of women are harassed at their workplaces every day. Protection against Harassment of Women at Workplace Act was passed in March 2010 for the whole country. It makes sexual harassment of women in the workplace and in public spaces a criminal offence.

¹ <https://www.weforum.org/reports/>

Present Situation of the Project

GE4DE is a national multi-year project (2010-2016) funded by Global Affairs Canada (CAN\$8 million), formerly known as the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) and implemented by the ILO Country Office (CO) in Pakistan. The project was developed to contribute to the ILO Office's 2010-2015 Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP).

The main premise of the Gender Equality for Decent Employment (GE4DE) is that "gender equality and the empowerment of women are essential to overcome poverty".² The project is very much in-line with the gender equality policies of the ILO and the donor agency Global Affairs Canada. ILO and the Canadian Government joined forces in 2010 to further the achievements realized under the Women Employment Concerns and Working Conditions Project (WEC-PK), which was implemented from May 2005 through March 2010.

GE4DE builds upon WEC-PK's experiences, resources developed, and lessons learned, and brings together technical resources from different ILO departments with expertise in: skills development, enterprise development, labour inspection and labour administration, and GE. The project used a multi-sectoral approach to GE including support to the implementation of ratified labour standards and the strengthening the gender equality aspects of legislation, policies, and strategies.

Evaluation Purpose and Objective

The main purpose of the evaluation is "to assess the extent to which the project has achieved its immediate objectives." To this end the evaluation team has:

1. Examined the performance of the project by assessing the extent to which outputs have

been delivered and immediate objectives have been achieved;

2. Assessed strengths and weaknesses, opportunities and challenges, and any external factors that have affected the achievement of the immediate objectives and the delivery of the outputs. In particular, examine how the different roles and the status of women and men within the community, political sphere, workplace, and household have affected the performance of the project;
3. Assessed the emerging impact of the interventions (either positive or negative) and the sustainability of the project's benefit and the local partners' strategy and capacity to sustain them;
4. Assessed the extent to which the project has responded to the recommendations of the midterm evaluation; and
5. Drawn lessons and provided concrete recommendations for future design and implementation of projects/programs based on the evaluation findings and conclusions.

Main Findings & Conclusions

The GE4DE project is highly relevant to: ILO's DWCP priorities and outcomes, national policy dialogue on gender equality, One UN Strategic Priority Areas (SPAs), and ILO's Social Justice and a Fair Globalization mandate. The GE4DE focus on gender issues and improving employment conditions is particularly relevant in the social, legal, policy development, and economic situation of the country, which also has particular reference to ILO Conventions 111, 100, 177 and 156. However, the project has long-term strategic outcomes, which makes it difficult to quantify and comment on the reported achievements.

The project has been successful in achieving an array of outputs within each immediate outcome, but there was no clear evidence that the three immediate

² ILO, Project Document - Promoting Gender Equality through

Decent Employment

outcomes were strategically linked among each other to optimize the achievement of the project's development objective. Lack of coordination and interface amongst partners implementing different components of the project can result in isolating the theme of decent work, which is common to all. At the same time, it deprives partners of mutual learning and forming partnerships. Although project outputs can still be achieved in terms of numbers, the lack of linkages can affect the strategic outcomes.

Although gender equality is the driver towards the achievement of decent employment, the immediate outcome teams have primarily focused on the core area of the outcome without necessarily paying enough attention to gender equality aspects.

The operationalization of gender equality and non-discrimination as a cross-cutting 'policy driver' is not commonly understood by some of the stakeholders at national or provincial levels.

Greater efforts were needed to enable national tripartite constituents to become champions of gender equality, as well as to review what support they required.

Activities realized to sensitize stakeholders have contributed to the policy dialogue and actions that have resulted in positive responses to women's employment concerns, formulation of gender policy, and its quick adoption by large number of stakeholders, including private sector and units of workers' federations. It is important to note these as contributions rather than attributions of project activities as often reported in progress reports.

It appears that the project has carried out activities in an efficient manner; however, data limitations preclude rigorous analysis. However, the project has faced difficulties in the oversight of its implementation contracts due to the lack of explicit office-wide M&E procedures and overall operational strategy as well as resource constraints, particularly with respect to staff with RBM and expertise specific to each of the three immediate outcomes. From a broader institutional perspective, while the Office has established planning and control systems, some deficiencies are apparent in the implementation of the GE4DE project. These include functional limitations in IRIS; the lack of integration of planning, reporting and financial

systems; and the absence of a mechanism to independently validate results presented in project progress reports. Well-defined outcomes and indicators are needed to ensure accountability and provide a basis for continuous improvement. Looking ahead, future work on Gender Equality and Decent Employment would require measurable indicators, baselines, and milestones, for measuring the impact of ILO actions to improve the application and compliance of gender sensitive labour laws.

The final evaluation also found that the MTE lessons and recommendations had not been fully addressed in the last half of the project implementation. There was little evidence that the project enhanced coordination among the activities and under a systematic strategic and implementation plan to be able to generate effective results.

Looking forward, the gaps that need to be addressed include: linking the outcomes to the SDGs, adopting a broader empowerment approach, and a better focus on rural women, particularly considering that two out of ten ILO P&B outcomes are very much linked to rural areas.

Recommendations

In the area of gender equality and treatment in employment of women in the workplace, very limited progress can be directly attributed to the project. However, it is important to point out that the project has contributed to the national policy dialogue that has been crystalized in the strengthening of policies and laws that address gender equality and equal treatment of women in employment. With only a marginal increase in the share of women employed as legislators, senior public sector officials, managers and professionals, it is difficult to claim direct project impacts.

It is fair and appropriate to conclude that the project has laid fertile ground for further future efforts. However, substantial challenges remain on this front, primarily the growing and significant share of women working in the low-productivity agricultural occupations, with close to 66 percent of all employed women engaged in agricultural and fishery work since 2012. Other challenges for the future include expanding education and employment opportunities for women, ensuring

equal pay for work of equal value, and reducing the considerable gender inequalities between men and women in wage employment. From the legislative perspective, the absence of any legal framework for ensuring equal remuneration for men and women outside of public-sector employment represents an important gap.

The following recommendations are presented for consideration of ILO and its tripartite constituents in the design of future ILO activities dealing with pending issues on gender equality and decent employment:

Recommendations addressed to ILO:

Recommendation 1. The long-term strategic objectives for gender equality and decent employment should be considered under a programmatic approach.

Recommendation 2. A more comprehensive strategic approach would be needed to effectively carry out future endeavors to further gender equity and equality as the foundations for decent employment for men and women in Pakistan.

Recommendation 3: Future ILO activities focusing on mainstreaming gender equality for decent employment should focus on designing skills development activities that fill the gaps in the demand and supply of skills in the labour market.

Recommendation 4: Cohesion among various project components as well as among other ILO DWCP activities can help further achieve better and more sustainable results.

Recommendation 5: Support capacity building among technical training institutions that can equip individuals with skills aligned with market demands and the rapidly changing technology.

Recommendation 6: Building on the achievements of GE4DE and looking forward, ILO and potential donors for a follow-up phase of the project should consider targeting immediate outcomes to fill in the actual gaps on gender equality and decent work in each of the provinces included in the project.

Recommendation 7: Review internal information systems and strategic planning platforms and develop

an action plan to address current deficiencies in strategic and financial management.

Recommendation addressed to ILO, MOLW, and DOLs:

Recommendation 8. Effective impact on gender equality, sensitization, and mainstreaming of the national gender policy must include all units within provincial government departments and not only in the Inspectorates of the Departments of Labour.

Recommendation 9: Future ILO action on gender equality for decent employment would require a conscious effort to highlight the importance of a gender perspective in the budget process, allowing the budget to work towards narrowing gender disparity and tackling the emerging issue of the feminization of poverty.

Recommendation 10: There is still a need for continued and increased sensitization on gender equality and women employment-related issues at various levels and for all stakeholders.

Recommendation 11: There is continued need to influence policy and advocate for greater awareness raising on better working conditions for women.

Recommendation 12: The government should implement the 10% quota for women in government service without further delay.

Recommendation 13: Future ILO projects that aim at continuing the empowerment of women through equal and equitable working conditions should scale up the achievements of the GE4DE project to focus on the compliance of gender equality and nondiscrimination laws.

Recommendations addressed to ILO, MLW, DOLs, PWF, EFP:

Recommendation 14: There is great demand for professionally skilled and competent middle management in the private sector with great scope for women to fill in the gap..

Recommendation 15: Gender mainstreaming

endeavors should continue to support tripartite constituent's efforts to increase women's access to higher tiers of leadership in their respective organizations and institutions.