



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation
Office

Creating a conducive environment for the effective recognition and implementation of fundamental principles and rights at work in Egypt - Final evaluation

Quick Facts

Countries: *Egypt*

Mid-Term Date: *December 2014*

Mode of Evaluation: *Independent*

Administrative Office: *DWT/CO-Cairo*

Technical Office: *DECLARATION*

Evaluation Manager: *Yasmine El-Essawy*

Evaluation Consultant: *Nahla Hassan*

Project End: *August 2015*

Project Code: *EGY/11/03M/USA*

Donor, Project Budget: *USA USD 6,435,643*

Keywords: *FPRW, capacity building*

Background & Context

The existing ILO project on creating a conducive environment for the effective recognition and implementation of fundamental principles and rights at work focuses on raising the awareness of the women and men workers of Egypt on their rights and obligations; building the capacity of the labour administration to promote and implement labour policies and labour relations; and strengthening the capacity of employers and workers organizations to serve the interests of their members and participate effectively in labour market policies and in social dialogue. It is an

important pillar in the portfolio of support being extended by the ILO to the tripartite constituents and the labour force in general. It has been developed based on priorities and needs expressed by the Minister of Manpower. This cost amendment is also based on the needs expressed by the constituents.

Addressing these rights is important and is more effective in the context of policies and an environment for job-rich and inclusive economic growth. The growth in the recent past in Egypt has not been generating sufficient productive employment opportunities, and women's rights and job opportunities in particular have been severely hampered. Women continue to face additional constraints in the labour market and are not adequately represented in social and labour market policy decision-making processes which affect their employment opportunities. The lack of possibilities to participate in labour markets not only restricts their economic empowerment in families and the society as a whole; it also limits their options to participate in social dialogue and social development of their country.

Present Situation of the Project

Although this is a mid-term evaluation, the project is already in its final year of

implementation. The project is scheduled to be completed in August 2015. In Addition, it is important to note that Egypt has undergone some serious political change and instability during the life of the project. This had a big effect on the ability to deliver on objectives

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The evaluation is conducted as per ILO evaluation policy, with the following two purposes:

- i. Give an independent assessment of progress to date of the project across the all outcomes; assessing performance as per the foreseen targets and indicators of achievement; strategies and implementation modalities chosen; partnership arrangements, constraints and opportunities;
- ii. Provide strategic and operational recommendations as well as highlight lessons to improve performance and delivery of project results

The primary clients of this evaluation are the ILO management (the ILO DWT/CO Cairo, ILO/FPRW, Regional Office for Africa), project staff, constituents, key national stakeholders and the donor. The evaluation considers the full geographical breadth of the project, including both national and localised interventions.

Methodology of evaluation

This is a qualitative evaluation. Quantitative data was collected from existing project documents. The evaluation used five data collection methods: 1) review of documents, 2) review of operating and financial data, 3) face-to-face and telephone interviews with key informants, 4) focus group discussions and in-depth interviews during field visits, and 5) a stakeholder debrief. The mid-term

evaluation was conducted in stages. During the first stage preliminary meetings with project staff were conducted. The purpose of the preliminary meetings was to collect all relevant project documents, agree on a work plan and collectively identify the key stakeholders and partners to be interviewed. Following this, the evaluator developed an inception report and shared it with the evaluation manager. The third stage focused on data collection and the fourth on data analysis and report writing. The field work for this evaluation took place 9-29 December 2014.

Main Findings & Conclusions

The conducive environment project is well suited to the ILO mandate, strategies and priorities for Egypt and UNDAF as it comprises components focusing on women economic development, promoting fundamental principles and rights at work, economic empowerment through skills training and job placement. In addition, the project design encompasses awareness raising and policy level advocacy. As such the project is aligned with the priorities of Egypt and the ILO. The circumstances during which the project was conceived negatively affected its design. The project received initial funding for its first three objectives and then a second round of funds were available and the subsequent addition of the last three objectives without a comprehensive revision of the project document. As a matter of fact, the project has two project documents. At the moment it seems that two projects are in operation. The project's theory of change doesn't appear, as far as documentary evidence suggests, to have taken in consideration the political and socio-economic turmoil that the country has witnessed between January 2011 and the beginning of the project in October 2011. The causal relationship between the outcomes and outputs can be generally observed for each of the objectives

individually. However, there is a clear need to develop vertical linkages amongst the six objectives to increase coherence and logic.

In terms of addressing women's needs in particular, the project has successfully addressed women trade unionists recognizing that they face different challenges than men. In addition, the project sought to create employment opportunities for marginalized women – particularly women with disabilities. The project could be said to have addressed some of the needs of women in general related to awareness raising on ILO fundamental principles and rights at work; awareness raising on the national labour law including duties and rights at work, initiative approaches for women's needs to access the market.

The overall environment in which the project was in no way linear, rather it could be said to have witnessed sharp and consecutive changes making it very difficult for the project to maintain a good implementation rate. The project witnessed 8 cabinet reshuffles, each time this brought with it changes in the leadership of MOMM. This usually necessitated a re-introduction of the project to MOMM senior management and agreeing on a plan for implementation. This was always a lengthy process which affected the ability of the project to implement its activities with MOMM in a timely fashion.

The conducive environment project has six objectives. One of the evaluation questions specifically required that the evaluator provides an estimation of the percentage of advancement for each objective as well as for the project as a whole. In addition, one of the questions focused on whether the project is likely to meet its objectives by the closing date of August 2015. As previously discussed in this report, the project's M&E system does not capture sufficient data to enable an objective and evidence-based response to these questions. However, an

analysis of financial data available suggest that the overall percentage of advancement of the project is about between 40 and 50% (burn rate is at 41%. As such, it is difficult to expect the project to be able to meet its stated objectives by the closing date of August 2015.

It is important to note that the first three objectives of the project do not have numerical targets so assessing the percentage of advancement cannot be estimated. A qualitative review and discussion of the progress is offered below under each objective. Where possible, an estimation of "advancement" has been offered.

Objectives 4, 5, and 6 have numerical targets at the output level. They are confusing and not clear. It is not clear how the numbers are collected and whether double counting exists or no. in the absence of a tracking system or a data base it is also very difficult to estimate the percentage of advancement. Available information in project documents as well as data collection during the course of this evaluation suggests that a lot of ground work has been accomplished towards meeting these objectives. However, there are some outputs that have not been achieved at all (output 4 and 5 for objective 6) and (outputs 2 and 3 for objective 4). Perhaps objective 6 is the one with the most confusing data. The main reason is the lack of clarity regarding the actual targets. Also, numerical targets should be allocated at the objective level to facilitate monitoring.

There are two key factors that have affected the effectiveness of the project. The most critical of them is the design of the project. By focusing on the first three objectives mainly during the first three years of the project, this has reduced the timely

implementation of objectives 5 and 6.¹ Furthermore, in terms of design, objective 4 could have benefited from being integrated in the remaining objectives to increase relevance and synergy amongst the various components of the project. However, it is noted that as of November 2012, the gender perspective was added to trainings and awareness raising activities of the project. The second key factor is the weakness of the conceptual framework of the project and hence the weakness of the monitoring system.

It is still rather difficult to assess the intermediate results of the component focusing on women employment since most of the work on that component has only started close a year ago. Nonetheless, an important result that can be directly attributed to the project is the provision of 1375 new job opportunity to vulnerable women. The project has an exit strategy only for the last three objectives. The project should develop a holistic exit strategy that encompasses both components of the project with clear roles, responsibilities and timeframe for implementation. As it stands the exit strategy is achievable but requires creation of linkages amongst the various levels.

capitalize its resources in an effective and efficient manner.

2. Develop a comprehensive M&E system clearly establishing the change the project aims to achieve and revising the human resource structure and monitoring tools accordingly.
3. Working on issues pertaining to freedom of association and collective bargaining in Egypt is a complicated process. It requires the coordination with various entities most notably the Ministry of Manpower and Migration. Developing a protocol of cooperation between the project and the ministry at the beginning of the project could have saved the project many unnecessary delays.
4. Lack of a comprehensive M&E system affects all aspects of the project. M&E systems should be developed immediately following the signing of agreements with donors. The system should clearly state a project goal, develop vertical and horizontal linkages amongst the objectives and outputs, and design M&E processes and tools.

Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Main recommendations and follow-up

1. Reformulate the objectives and outputs and merge similar ones. The project could consider omitting all together outputs that it has not started working towards to

¹ According to project team this was mainly due to the fact that there was no team for Obj. 4, 5& 6 till end of 2012. The project's Senior Technical Officer for Women's Employment only joined at the end of November 2012, and the national enterprise coordinator joined in May 2013.