



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation Unit

Promoting Gender Equality for Decent Employment

Quick Facts

Countries: Pakistan

Mid-Term Evaluation: August 2013

Mode of Evaluation: Independent, External

ILO Office Administratively backstopping the Project: CO-Islamabad

ILO Technical Backstopping Office: GENDER

Evaluation Manager: Graeme Buckley

Evaluation Consultant: Salmar Jafar

Project End: April 2015

Project Code: PAK/09/03/CAN

Donor & Project Budget: Canada CAD 8 Million

Keywords: GENDER, EMPLOYMENT

- Pakistani women have greater access to equal employment opportunities and decent working conditions in selected economic sectors; and
- Stakeholders have increased understanding of and favorable attitudes towards working women's issues.

To achieve these outcomes the project has the following development objective and three immediate objectives / components.

Development Objective:

Working women in Pakistan have better incomes, working environment and increased participation in household decisions and specifically expenditures.

Immediate Objectives:

1. Strengthening national mechanisms to promote Equal Employment Opportunities for Women
2. Enhancing skills and employability of poor women in rural and urban areas of selected districts.
3. Strengthening capacity of media to raise awareness on issues related to working women

Present Situation of the Project

The project is developed in the context of the country situation that has a bulging population of youth ready to work. Women employment is obstructed by low literacy levels, lack of vocational skills and social cultural barriers. Moreover the institutional structures and capacities are weak demonstrated in poor governance, legislation is often gender blind and implementation of laws is weak. Since the majority of women work in the informal sector the issues of lack of legal cover to their rights to decent work are enormous.

Background & Context

Summary of project purpose, logic, and structure

The Project *Promoting Gender Equality for Decent Employment* (GE4DE) is a five year project (2010-15) funded by CIDA with ILO as the executing agency. The implementation is being carried out by ILO constituents, the provincial Departments of Labour, workers and employers federation and implementing partner NGOs. In addition development and media consultants have been engaged in training, research and other awareness raising events. The project builds on an earlier ILO CIDA funded project on *Women's Employment Concerns and Working Conditions* (WEC-PK) that was implemented during the period 2005 till 2010. Based on the experience and lessons learnt of this project GE4DE was developed.

The two strategic national outcomes of the project:

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

This Mid Term Evaluation (MTE) aims to indicate whether the project is ‘on track’ and whether its strategies are adequate to achieve the objectives. The approach undertaken in the MTE is to assess whether the planned objectives are being achieved and to assess the appropriateness of the strategies and approach that have been used so far. The MTE aims to facilitate ILO and its implementing partners to appraise and reflect on how relevant, effective and efficient the delivery is and how it can be further improved to achieve the end goal using the standard parameters of evaluation. It examines the project design and implementation against the outcomes and outputs, documents key lessons learned, and provides recommendations for course correction for the project team and for all relevant stakeholders.

Methodology of evaluation

The evaluation methodology comprised a mix of site visits and observations, telephone and face-to-face interviews, discussion groups, desk-based research of existing reports and secondary data a national stakeholder’s workshop and meetings with project team, ILO and CIDA. This evaluation report is based on standard ILO evaluation parameters comprising, validity, relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, risks and sustainability.

Main Findings & Conclusions

Following are the main findings under each objective:

Objective 1.

- Project achievements are demonstrated in the formation and capacity development of five Gender Units in the provincial labour departments. At the policy level the project success is established by the work done on Home Based Workers policy which has been approved by the Punjab government and is under review by other provinces. Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province has integrated gender in most of the labour laws approved by the provincial legislature. There are major changes in the work done with the DOLs where attitudinal changes in the approaches of government are evident.
- The project has developed a gender labour inspection tool kit which breaks the

conventional gender blind labour inspection approach, the implementation of the tool kit is in a nascent phase so there are some reservations on its usage which requires further discussion with the labour departments.

- The Pakistan Workers Federation (PWF) is making inroads by mobilizing trade unions to form women’s committees and has carried out training on gender equality at workplace for 50 organizations culminating in action plans and follow-up and is working on the review of gender policy.

Objective 2

- The skills development component has achieved more than half of its targets of training out of which 80 percent have been employed. The project target is 6300 beneficiaries and at the time of MTE it had reached 3268 plus (200 indirect women beneficiaries); the male female ratio has been 20/80 percent in most cases.
- The project has successfully used ILOs TREE methodology in the urban sectors and in breaking stereo types by skilling women to join unconventional occupations like hospitality, ancient knots, on line earning and new more marketable patterns in the hand woven cloth cottage industry.
- The project is ensuring women’s workers rights in the informal sector through registration of HBWs and formation of trade unions.
- Using the approach of training of trainers, developing competency based standards for vocational skills, mobilization of communities and bringing on board public sector training institutes like STVETA and MINTEX the project has in principle set the ground for sustainability.
- The post training report highlights that most of the trainees of the completed training are employed; they have enhanced mobility, more confidence, are contributing to family income and can pay the child’s school fee.

Objective 3.

- The project has worked towards enabling gender responsive reporting into a wider journalistic skills training programme targeting 700 journalists from print and electronic media (in 35 districts all over Pakistan) of which 331

have completed training. The project aims, through the pool of mater trainers it has trained, to take the training to next level in Mass Communication / Journalism departments of selected universities by training 300 students.

- The project has also conducted a series of policy level dialogues with senior representatives of national and regional level media organizations. This resulted in 150 policy level representatives to agree on a declaration unanimously signed to promote gender sensitive reporting in their respective organizations.
- A high quality newsletter produced under the project with an Urdu version, a documentary developed 'Women of Courage' advocacy materials such as posters and calendars are the key achievements of the media component in terms of communication.

Overall Project Assessment

- The project has taken steps to achieve the strategic objectives which can culminate into a wider impact over the course of time if planning and monitoring are improved to capture how the projects will be consolidated.
- The objectives of the project are partially achieved at the time of the MTE and the project is on track in terms of its expenditure and achieving beneficiary targets. In March 2013 the project expenditure rate is 41 percent with 40 percent in sub contracts.
- The project shows considerable and impressive achievement in terms of outputs under immediate objectives; however there is a lack of cohesion amongst the three objectives and implementing partners and stakeholders. This if not addressed is likely to affect the impact.
- The projects focus on women's employment is particularly relevant in the favourable policy context towards gender equality and to ILOs DCWP. However implementation of laws in Pakistan is an issue which the project needs to address by implementing the output on capacity building of law enforcement agencies.
- The project at the same time has invested significantly in the capacity building of its government and NGO partners; it is noted that

the project has allocated a large portion of its budget for training activities.

- An approach to bridge the gap between the public and policymakers by creating and strengthening a network of women leaders to reach out to over 500 representatives of parliamentarians, media, judiciary and police has not been implemented because a grassroots women's group from amongst the trainees has to be created as a strategy. This network will be initiated during the 4th year of project which will have minimal outcome.
- The project demonstrates emerging and potential sustainability measures such as capacitating the government, NGOs, public and private sector training and workers and employers federations through effective training and TOT courses; development and implementation of competency standards, formation of gender units in the provincial labour departments and policy and legislative work. There is a need therefore, that these successes of the project are continued through a good sustainability strategy and plan.
- Two outputs of the project a). setting up of Women Facilitation Centers in collaboration with the Ministry of Women Development (MOWD), provincial and district governments and b). developing coordination mechanisms among the provincial cells (gender units) in Labour departments, Women Facilitation Centers (WFCs), Career Development Centers (CDCs) and Media are under review by the project team for implementation.
- The overall risk is related to the lack of cohesion and lack of interface amongst the three components of the project which if not addressed can undermine an overall impact by the end of the project.

Recommendations & Lessons Learned

1. In view of the devolution of Ministry of Labour, provincial level steering committees should be constituted under the provincial departments of labour. Nonetheless a national forum which can be under the project should be in place to ensure coordination and share progress with govt, CIDA and other stakeholders. *(ILO and key government to address)*

2. The Gender Units at the Labour department can be further strengthened including formation of a data base on women's employment. As a first step, awareness raising about importance of role of women in economy has to target also the decision makers so that conscious knowledge is developed about their different roles of women in the economy for which gender units as a mechanism can support maintaining an impetus in the efforts of gender mainstreaming. (ILO and government to address)
3. A database of trainers may be established and shared with other actors outside the project UN agencies and organizations and WEE partners of CIDA working on similar activities. (ILO and partner to address)
4. The work with women parliamentarians, law enforcing agencies is planned for year four this should be reconsidered and can be started now for measuring the outcomes of the project by end of year five. (ILO to address)
5. The project may re-consider introducing new skills development. At this time it is crucial to strategize how the different projects will be consolidated by year 5 to demonstrate impact. If new projects are introduced then these should be in the locations where the project has already created its presence and may consider focusing on youth and PWDs. The project should document indirect beneficiaries in all its projects. (ILO to address)
6. Linkages should be developed by the implementing partners with other programmes for more holistic gains and optimization of resources. (ILO to address)
7. The project would benefit from strengthening the training component of journalists by reducing the number of journalists and instead introduce a refresher for measurable outcomes. It should Communication strategy to be reviewed with partners of all three components to create synergies and bring in innovation to address the underlying issues of household decision making male vs female, domestic violence etc. (ILO to address)
8. In view of the marked role and effect of the advertising agencies in heavily stereotyping women's role the project may consider working with selected agencies. (ILO to address)
9. A Project Implementation Plan till the end of project is strongly recommended, the project should engage its implementing partners in developing sustainability plans culminating in the sustainability plan of the project at the GE4DE, an exit strategy and review of PMP and results matrix. (ILO to address)
10. The project should avoid one off ideas and focus more on in depth and holistic work on some of its successful projects. There are stories of success yes, but what next is vague in terms of impact and can be possible through better integration (ILO to address)
11. The project M&E requires strengthening with respect to more systematic and uniform analysis and data that can help to analyze for the purpose of reporting as well as for corrective action. (ILO to address)
12. The project should assign one of the SPOs the role of a provincial coordinator and also induct an M&E specialist or M&E officer. (ILO to address)