



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation Unit

Governance of labour migration and its links to Development in Mali, Mauritania and Senegal – Final Evaluation Summary

Evaluation report is in Spanish: Gobernanza de la migración laboral y su vínculo con el desarrollo en Mali, Mauritania y Senegal – Evaluación final

Quick Facts

Countries: Senegal, Mali, and Mauritania

Final Evaluation: March-June, 2013

Mode of Evaluation: Independent evaluation

ILO Office Administratively backstopping the Project: Regional Office- Senegal

ILO Technical Backstopping Office: Migrant Evaluation Manager: Mr. Craig Russon

Evaluation Consultant: Evaluando

Project End: March 2013

Project Code: RAF/09/01/SAP

Donor & Project Budget: Ministry of Labour and Migration of Spain (1,996,140 Euros)

Keywords: Migration, labour inclusion, sustainable development, poverty reduction, financial education, green jobs.

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

The project “Buena Gobernanza de las Migraciones y su vínculo con el desarrollo” seeks the sustainable development and the poverty reduction among the countries of intervention (Mali, Mauritania and Senegal), in the framework of the migration process.

This project attempts to enhance the following main objectives:

- The institutional strengthening and the improvement of the management of the migration flows;
- The improvement of the labour inclusion system, and
- Fostering the return and social inclusion of labour migrants.

Present Situation of the Project

This project was implemented between 2009 and 2012. The design of the project took place during the first biennium, whereas the implementation stage has been carried out in the last two years. This intervention has been continuously revised in order to adapt the activities to the changes that were identified in the political and social context.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

This evaluation is a final independent evaluation conducted to account the project’s main achievements to the key stakeholders.

This evaluation is based on the assessment of:

- i. The relevance of the project;
- ii. The validity of the project’s design;

- iii. *The effectiveness of the intervention;*
- iv. *The efficiency;*
- v. *The effectiveness in the management of the project, and*
- vi. *The impact and sustainability of the project.*

The clients of the evaluation are:

- *Managers of the technical cooperation Projects concerning the labour migration (including the ILO technical departments in HQ),*
- *Tripartite constituents of the target countries,*
- *Other beneficiaries of the intervention (NGO, organizations related to the migration flows, etc.)*
- *ILO Office in Dakar and Madrid,*
- *ITC-Technical Unit in Turin,*
- *Evaluation focal point, and*
- *The donor*

Methodology of evaluation

The evaluation has been carried out in Mali, Mauritania and Senegal, as well as in Spain, France, and Italy from March to June, 2013. The evaluation methodology is focused on accountability and organizational learning. To this end, a systematic assessment of each criterion has been conducted as well as an analysis of the project's design, the main processes, and the goals achieved in order to identify the main causal linkages of the intervention. Moreover, it has been sensitive to the local context and has included a gender sensitive approach in order to identify sex-disaggregated findings. In order to guarantee the validity and reliability of the evaluation, the Joint Committee Standards and ethical principles have been applied during the evaluation process. The evaluation techniques are the analysis of the official documents and benchmark references, interviews, questionnaires, and focal groups with the main partners and beneficiaries.

Main Findings & Conclusions

Regarding the relevance of the intervention, the findings have evidenced the alignment

between the project's main outputs and the priorities of the beneficiaries. The project's redesign has contributed to a better response to the local changes and needs of the stakeholders. It has been by virtue of participatory processes carried out at the local level that have engaged the key partners in the briefings and workshops conducted to design and validate the activities. These inclusive processes and the project's alignment with the rest of interventions carried out in the three countries have also benefited the ILO in the use of the partners' expertise, technical resources, and access to the beneficiaries that were identified in the project's design.

Despite the absence of an updated logical framework matrix, the evaluation findings have evidenced a valid causal chain between the activities, outputs, and outcomes. In line with the above mentioned, the participatory processes with the main stakeholders fostered by the project manager have led to a better identification and inclusion of the partners and beneficiaries' needs in the project's logical framework, as well as a better response to the real priorities of each of the contexts of intervention, especially in the case of Senegal.

Special attention should be given to the monitoring system, which has been based on quantitative indicators that have bound the data to the calculation of the implemented activities and the total number of beneficiaries. It has weakened the provision of qualitative data that would have led to an assessment of the project's contribution towards the extent of the capacity building among the main stakeholders, the labour inclusion of the main beneficiaries, as well as the institutional strengthening concerning the management of the migration flows. Similarly, a relevant absence of disaggregated data (e.g. gender and age) can be concluded, which has restricted the use of the data to better improve the activities regarding the different characteristics of the beneficiary groups (labour migrants, youth, and families).

Regarding the effectiveness, the project has encouraged the synergies with the local stakeholders identified as key partners in terms of their advocacy and commitment with the migration issues, which has impacted positively on the implementation of the activities and the achievement of the main outputs. As for the first main outcome, this project has been determinant in the development of the employment database in Senegal. Despite this positive finding, a further intervention should be carried out to strengthen the technical capacities among the civil servants that will be in charge of the management of the database. Moreover, further steps should be taken in order to guarantee the equal implementation of the data base among the various local Employment Centers.

This evaluation can conclude a positive achievement of the second outcome. The learning material and training workshops had been implemented due to the collaboration of the main partners that were already working on this issue. However, the organizations' shortage of technical resources has led to difficulties in the implementation of the activities, which can impact also on the sustainability of the project's goals.

The findings evidence a positive achievement regarding the third outcome. The intensive research in the area of green jobs, and the engagement of the main local organizations that work on this topic, have strengthened the commitment of the local partners in the use of green jobs as an alternative for sustainable development and poverty reduction, especially in Senegal.

The fourth outcome has been one of the main successes of this ILO intervention. Local partners have stated the project's contribution to empower the local organizations that work for the better management of the migration processes. Further, this project has strengthened their commitment in working together as a unified organization.

The main findings have determined efficiency in terms of the budgetary resources. With regard to the timing, the evaluation has identified an imbalance between the re-design process and the implementation stage, which has impacted negatively on the amount of activities this project was able to carry out.

Concerning the management of the project, the ILO strategy of decentralizing the implementation of the activities among the local partners has proved determinant in building their capacities and enhancing their commitment in the future work on the project's objectives.

Finally, the evaluation has concluded positive results concerning the sustainability of the main goals. The main findings related to the training materials in financial education, employability, and labour and social inclusion evidence the easy replicability in the same or other countries. Moreover, this evaluation has identified various initiatives among the local organizations in using these items in future interventions. Regarding the future steps of the ILO, the goals and items used in this intervention have been included in different interventions with other international organizations.

Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Main recommendations and follow-up

The main recommendations are summarized as follows:

R01. The ILO projects implemented among territories with different characteristics should include monitoring systems with specific indicators that provides disaggregated data of the local context of intervention.

R02. The interventions carried out in a framework of political and social changes should include qualitative indicators that provide reliable information in terms of

effectiveness in achieving the outputs and outcomes.

R03. Concerning the ILO mandate, all project intervention should include a monitoring system that provides sex-disaggregated data to better analyze and re-design the intervention concerning the different group of beneficiaries.

R04. To foster the first outcome, the ILO should work on improving the database by strengthening the technical capacities of their managers, as well as tackling the IT shortage over the different employment centers in the country of Senegal.

R05. To enhance the sustainability of the second and third outcomes, a broader intervention should be carried out to strengthen the local organizations that work in the area of trainings for trainers as a mean to tackle their lack of technical resources.

R06. The ILO and especially the ILO Regional Office in Senegal should maintain the communication channels with the local partners during the transition process to encourage the commitment of the local organizations in working towards the main goals of the intervention.

Important lessons learned

The lessons learned the ILO project can be summarized in the following statements:

L01. The re-design of the intervention, with the inclusion of the main local partners, has impacted positively the better alignment of the activities with the needs and the priorities of the stakeholders.

L02. The engagement of the local partners in the design and implementation of the activities has benefited the ILO in using their technical expertise and resources as well as the access to the beneficiaries (especially youth and families)

L03. The re-design of the project to strengthen the political institutions, and their inclusion as main stakeholders of the intervention, have impacted positively on encouraging the political commitment in tackling the migration process through national policies, especially in the case of Senegal.

L04. The four-year intervention and the continuous work of the project manager in adjusting the project to the local needs have contributed positively to the effectiveness of the activities.

L05. The decentralization of the implementation among the local organizations has reinforced their commitment and technical capabilities in the future work on the project's goals.

L06. The work carried out in countries such as Spain or France has led to an achievement of the project's strategy in building a link between the countries affected by the migration flows.