



International
Labour
Office
Geneva

Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy to promote sustainable enterprises and decent work

September 2013



EVALUATION
UNIT

Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy to promote sustainable enterprises and decent work

Volume II

Annexes 3-6 – online document only

International Labour Office

September 2013

Evaluation Unit

Volume I is available at

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationreports/WCMS_224409/lang--en/index.htm

ABBREVIATIONS

COOP Africa	Cooperative Facility for Africa
CPO	Country programme outcome
CSR	Corporate social responsibility
DWCP	Decent Work Country Programme
EESE	Enabling environment for sustainable enterprises
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization
HIV/AIDS	Human immunodeficiency virus/acquired immunodeficiency syndrome
ILC	International Labour Conference
ILO	International Labour Organization
M&E	Monitoring and evaluation
MIS	Management Information System
MULTI	Multinational Enterprises and Enterprise Engagement Unit
MNE	Multinational enterprises and social policy
SCORE	Sustaining Competitive and Responsible Enterprises
SE	Sustainable enterprise
SIMAPRO	Sistematización de la experiencia en el sector frutícola exportador nacional
SIYB	Start and Improve Your Business
SME	Small- and medium-sized enterprises
UNEP	United Nations Environment Programme
UNIDO	United Nations Industrial Development Organization
VCA	Value chain analysis
VCD	Value chain development
WEDGE	Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality
YEF	Youth Entrepreneurship Facility

Table of Contents

ANNEX 3. MISSION-SUPPORTED COUNTRY CASE STUDIES	4
SOUTH AFRICA.....	4
TANZANIA.....	15
KENYA.....	25
ANNEX 4. DESK COUNTRY CASE STUDIES.....	35
ZAMBIA	35
INDONESIA	43
ANNEX 5. SUSTAINABLE ENTERPRISES PROJECT PORTFOLIO (2007-2012)	54
ANNEX 6. WORKS CONSULTED.....	57

ANNEX 3. MISSION-SUPPORTED COUNTRY CASE STUDIES

SOUTH AFRICA

National Context

South Africa is a middle income nation, with a Gross Domestic Product (GDP) per capita income of just under US\$6,000¹. In recent years, the economy has increasingly diversified into sectors included tourism, mining and ICT but is predominantly built on foreign trade, which accounts for over half of Gross National Product (GNP). Between 1994 and the coming to power of the ANC-led Government in the first non-racial elections and 2008, South Africa saw a trend of sustained, positive economic growth ranging between 3-5.3%. This has been attributed to carefully constructed and implemented macro-economic policies, favourable global commodity prices and an increase in domestic consumer demand. However, South Africa continues to be characterized by high poverty levels and reportedly among the highest income inequality across the world between racial groups, with black South Africans and particularly black South African women and youth most deprived².

Since 2008, the South African economy has felt the negative impact of various internal and external/national and international factors, including the global financial and economic crisis. Economic data released by Statistics South Africa (STATSSA), reveal that GDP for the first quarter of 2009 declined by 6.4%, thus placing the South African economy in a technical recession for the first time in almost two decades. Figures from the fourth quarter of 2009 indicate rising unemployment (up to 24.5%) and the loss of more than 1 million jobs since the start of the year, particularly in manufacturing and construction³.

As with many other nations, South Africa's youth population have been among the hardest hit by rising unemployment caused by the global crisis⁴. Close to one third, 3.3 million, of young men and women aged 15–24 is neither employed nor in the education or training system. School leavers in South Africa enter a labour market where formal employment opportunities are scarce and the promotion of entrepreneurship among young people is an important strategy for reducing youth unemployment. The high level of youth unemployment is therefore of grave concern.

¹ <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/bureau/program/dwcp/download/southafrica.pdf>

² *Ibid.*

³ *Ibid.*

⁴ The State of Youth Entrepreneurship in the Free State A baseline study of entrepreneurial intentions and activity amongst young men and women 2013 Available at www.ilo.org/publns.

The South African quarterly labour force surveys commonly highlight without much variation that the youth cohort between 15 and 34 contribute to 75% of the total unemployed figure. The recessionary climate of 2009–2010 exacerbated the situation with more than 50 per cent of job losses in this period occurring in the age group of people younger than 30. The latest quarterly labour-force survey from Statistics South Africa shows an unemployment rate of 24.9% for the fourth quarter of 2012 with 4.5 million people unemployed. Furthermore, more than 3% or 3.3 million of the youth aged 15–24 were neither employed nor in the education or training systems – the “NEET” category – and are regarded as idle youth. The figures speak for themselves in terms of the severe challenges South Africa currently faces regarding youth unemployment.

With 2012 unemployment figures at 32%, Free State registered the highest rate of all provinces in the Country. Youth unemployment in Free State in the age group 15-34 is even higher at close to 50%.

There are, however, tentative signs of improvement. A recent labour force survey conducted towards the end of 2010 with the creation of 50,000 jobs in finance, real estate and service sectors. The government has also expressed its commitment to addressing the nation’s unemployment problem through an economic growth plan. Additionally, decisive actions to promote decent work for national development are encapsulated by South Africa’s Decent Work Country Programme. In support of the Global Jobs Pact, South Africa is also implementing a national jobs pact which aligns with the DWCP priorities of strengthening fundamental principles and rights at work; promoting employment creation; strengthening and broadening social protection coverage; and strengthening tripartism and social dialogue⁵.

II. Findings to Key Evaluation Questions

Relevance and Strategic Fit:

The basic principles behind the South Africa country programme build upon the ILO’s global strategy and are both consistent and strongly reinforce the ILO’s global sustainable enterprise objectives.

The strategies and actions being undertaken in South Africa are carefully aligned with the aims of the Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) priorities.

A participatory and inclusive “bottom-up” approach to developing a DWCP was facilitated by the current staff in ILO. This process started in 2009 and coincided with a new Head and Deputy Head of Office. Although time consuming, and at times frustrating for some of those involved, this process led to the DWCP for South Africa 2010 – 2014.

⁵ http://www.ilo.org/jobspact/country/WCMS_145343/lang--en/index.htm

Country ownership of the DWCP led by the National Economic Development and Labour Council (NEDLAC) is, and has been critically important. This has ensured that the scope and choice of programme and project activities are really relevant and appropriate to South Africa⁶.

Now many other stakeholders are involved, and these relationships are well managed by senior staff in the office and by individual technical staff in all the projects/programmes examined. There is a high general awareness of the importance of stakeholder engagement and management across the office. One practical suggestion on further improving both capacity and ownership of the DWCP is the idea of placing or embedding an ILO staff member or consultant into the Ministry of Labour.

Coherence and Complementary - The Design and Implementation Strategy.

The ILO in South Africa has developed a logical and well thought through model of project design, development and implementation. All enterprise development projects in the Southern and Eastern African sub-region now build on what is called a “people-centered market systems development approach” (that itself is rooted in the 2010 sustainable enterprise framework of ILO). The building blocks of the model are a clever reconfiguration of the ILO three pillar framework: Business Development Support; Enabling Policy Environment; and Entrepreneurship promotion. At the core of the model is the idea that ILO promotes a people-centred market systems development framework that stresses interaction between internal and external business stakeholders along/across three inter-linked outcome- areas; in the model, both people and nature are represented through institutions *speaking on their behalf*.

Within South Africa objectives, planned outputs, anticipated outcomes and impact of all projects examined have been found to have been highly relevant to the socio-economic development aspirations and livelihood needs of virtually all stakeholders. Importantly relevance and strategic fit to the needs of a wide cross-section of stakeholders play a very important role towards “buy-in” of all project ideas and support during the project implementation stages.

⁶ As the South African National Treasury is at pains to point out, development is not just the pursuit of growth – it is also about creating a more equitable future. The South African government is determined to address its key challenges through the economic integration of its previously disadvantaged majority.

The New Growth Plan, launched in November 2010, builds on plans to restructure the economy to ensure more inclusive and sustainable growth – and sets a target of creating five million new jobs by 2020. The road map to do this is provided by the Industrial Policy Action Plan, which proposes multisectoral interventions across agriculture, mining, manufacturing, tourism and other high-level services to create substantial employment. <http://www.southafrica.info/business/economy/econoverview.htm#ixzz2Rs9AxXrB>

Unemployment, at a rate of 25%, remains the most challenging of South Africa’s hurdles: it is at the top of government priorities and at the heart of its economic policies. Free State registered the highest rate of all provinces at 32% in 2012. Youth unemployment Free State in the age group 15-34 is even higher at close to 50%. Mostert and de Villiers (2012).

Having examined projects in the South African portfolio it is clear that in essence the theory outlined above is very much put into practice, and the Durban Ports Project provides a particularly strong example of this at micro, macro and meta levels of intervention. All projects examined are clearly now linked “upwards” to the South African DWCP and other National Frameworks and Plans. The final evaluation of the WEDGE Project clearly illustrates this in practice, which states that the project “corresponds well” to both national and international framework⁷. Similar alignment is demonstrated by the Promotion of Decent Work in Southern Africa Ports Project and the SCORE Project.

Perhaps the best example of a project illustrating both strategic fit and real relevance is the Free State Province Small and Medium Enterprises (SME) project, which seeks to strengthen the capacity of Free State Provincial Government and its stakeholders in the private sector and civil society to make these policy priorities actionable, by implementing a range of initiatives in support of local SME.

Effectiveness

Demand for ILO projects has been increasing over the past two years. The good reputation of the ILO South Africa office is slowly spreading and the demand for ILO as a possible project partner has been increasing. This is demonstrated not only in the increased TC budget but also in the increased number of TC staff.

The financial project monitoring system allows project expenditure to be tracked on a regular basis. If projects are under or over spending corrective actions are taken. When the management of the South African ILO office changed in 2008, the extra-regular budget for technical cooperation (XRBTC) to finance work under Outcome 3 stood at about 100,000 USD. Regular budget for technical cooperation (RBTC) was 25,000 USD for SA while regular budget from the supplementary account (RBSA) was nil.

In 2012, allocations for Outcome 3 specific XBTC projects have been around 3,5 million USD, plus around 50,000 RB and no RBSA, meaning that the budget has increased about 28-fold over the last five years. Based on the current pipeline, it is safe to project that there will be a further 20% increase of the allocations this year alone. The same is true for 2014.

Several projects are currently entering into a second funded phase. Notable among these is the successful South African Ports Project. The second phase of this project proposes to seek to further consolidate the achievements of phase I and replicate the intervention

approach successfully tested in Durban continuing in the Port of Durban and in the Port of Richards Bay operated by Transnet Port Terminals in South Africa, and in port terminals in Mozambique. As independently verified by an external mid-term review in mid-2012, the project is making a significant direct contribution to the efforts of local stakeholders to boost the competitiveness of the Durban Container Terminal. The mid-term review also revealed that there is excellent potential to replicate the dialogue-driven competitiveness improvement approach in other ports throughout South Africa and in neighbouring countries, provided that the roll-out continues to be supported initially by the project.

Likewise the SCORE project will soon be starting a Phase 2 building on all the important lessons that have been learned in Phase 1. It needs to be carefully noted that the first Phase of this project was fairly heavily criticized in its first review⁸. The situation was however quickly addressed by management changes and now good progress is being made in this project which is dealing with some very challenging circumstances. The internal management operations of the ILO South African office are clearly very efficient due to management and leadership culture. Economic comparisons with other project delivery mechanisms (e.g. the Private sector or through CSOs) are beyond the remit of this short report. It does however need to be noted that the rationale for ILO delivery of projects is not just about economics of delivery but is more to do with ILO's overall rationale and remit which is not just economic. At the current time most of the donors that ILO is working with do not require Business cases.

In all the projects examined, delivery on the ground has been, and is, generally making good progress. Monitoring of projects is undertaken on a quarterly basis. Project Reviews are undertaken on a regular basis – often with independent reviewers. When required corrective action is undertaken and several examples of this can be cited e.g. in the early years of the SCORE project it was reported that Project Management was weak and that considerable adaptation of the SCORE techniques and methodologies were required to fit the Tourism Service sector in South Africa. In the past two years corrective actions have been taken and the SCORE materials heavily adapted and new appropriate materials developed.

Clear evidence of the delivery of outputs is now becoming available as projects mature, see for example the Outreach Figures for the Durban Port Project for 2011-12⁹:

- Social dialogue training of 20 labour and 14 management representatives
- Collective bargaining / mutual gains training of 15 labour and 15 management representatives

⁸ SCORE South Africa Evaluation Report (2013)

⁹ 2012 annual progress of the Portworker Development Project

- Study tour visits including 10 labour and 8 management representatives to assess international best practice of social dialogue and human resource development initiatives
- Training provided to 49 operational staff on international best practices in Container Terminal Management
- 80% of employees in leadership positions (Management and Labour) at Durban Container Terminal trained in the latest thinking on Port-centered HRD policies and regulations
- 825 front line (shop floor) employees trained on productivity measurement
- Three facilitators at the School of Port Operations trained as Chief Instructors (train-the-trainer) in the international Port worker Development programme with an outreach of 303 employees (239 males and 64 females)
- Basic planner training 15 employees trained as trainers
- Advanced planner training 15 employees trained as trainers

The Project Monitoring Systems

The impact of the sustainable enterprise development interventions of the ILO in the sub-region is now being tracked with a catalogue of performance measures drawing from the country-specific outcome metrics listed in the DW(C)P's and the generic metrics specified ILO Mid-Term Strategy Framework. This catalogue combines measures to track process efficiency with measures to track effectiveness or impact. The anchor metric to track impact is the net employment creation effect of its sustainable enterprise development efforts. Beyond employment creation, other impacts tracked as part any sustainable business intervention are (a) increases in the incomes of both business owners and workers, (b) improved job quality and improved levels of enterprise formalization, (c) improved levels of compliance with occupational and safety standards and/or the contribution to the combat against HIV and AIDS in the enterprise workplace, and (d) strengthened capacity of ILO constituents to use social dialogue in order boost enterprise competitiveness. In turn, the anchor metrics to track efficiency are a range of outreach measures for the financial and non-financial business support services facilitated by these projects.

In the past six months the Sustainable Enterprise team in the South Africa office have been trialling SCIFORMA Project Management software package. To date they have found this very helpful. Such software is extremely useful for simple communication purposes. However it is possible that in the longer term its real value may be in its usefulness in simply raising awareness of the importance of Output and Outcome data for reporting purposes.

The use of standard ILO products and tools.

A wide range of well-known ILO products and tools are now being used by the ILO South Africa Office. These for example include:

- Know About Business (KAB) – Free State Development Initiative. The KAB Manual and Training Modules for KAB¹⁰ have been carefully customised to their Use in Free State. Likewise the Start Up and Go – Entrepreneurship Education package which has been carefully and cleverly adapted for use in Free State Schools¹¹.
- HIV/AIDs Transport Corridors Project has used Start and Improve Your Business (SYBI) Training Modules (translated and taught in local languages).
- Women’s Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality (WEDGE) – A range of WED tools¹² and products have been successfully used.
- Sustaining Competitive and Responsible Enterprise (SCORE) – Adapted Modules 1 and 2 and new tailor made modules being used for general training and Responsible Tourism purposes.

These products and tools are all being used with varying degrees of success. What underlies the successful use is their simple but effective adaptation for the South African context (including the important translation of training materials, teacher’s manuals and student workbooks into local languages). This is a basic but key lesson for other ILO programmes. It is important to note that translation of materials is often expensive and has not always budgeted for at Project or Programme Design stage.

The one area that did however receive constructive criticism from a number of project staff is that around the need to share knowledge across projects more.

It is recognised that project staff do have regular update meetings but these short business like meetings do not really lend themselves to reflective sharing and learning. A two day meeting with some 25 staff, was organised in Durban in 2012 to exchange information about projects, however sharing of knowledge and information across projects was identified by staff as an area in need of further improvement.

Building on this initial experience it is suggested that there would be real value to greater cross project sharing of current experiences and of “lesson to be learned”. This could best be done in a lesson learning workshop format with carefully designed and professionally facilitated sessions to enable everyone to focus on the positive and where required turn negatives into positives.

Efficiency

Underpinning the management system is a well-designed and managed performance management system. Performance of projects and programmes is carefully monitored

¹⁰ The new entrepreneurship curriculum is based on the ILO's Know About Business (KAB) entrepreneurship education program, which has been implemented in more than 50 countries and integrated into national curricula.

¹¹ Start Up and Go is complementing the current Free State school textbooks and is now being tested in more than 60 secondary schools across the State.

¹² www.ilo.org/wed

through a series of metrics including financial metrics of actual spend and percentage of overall spend. When things are off track or slow the senior management team is able to see this, quickly analyse why and take immediate corrective action. And do so.

For the past three years a positive culture of teamwork across the office has been actively encouraged. This started from the top of the office and has been actively driven by the senior team. Occasional team work events are held in the office and a sense of pride of working in a team has been, and is, fostered. Success breed success and most staff in the office are now proud to be working in the ILO as part of a deliver team. This teamwork actively encourages sharing of problems and challenges as well as knowledge and experience. This is critically important and helps offsets the often pervading surrounding culture of “knowledge is power”.

Many of the recently recruited staff in the office are personally very effective in their work and operations. This effectiveness comes from an interesting mix of a variety of attributes ranging from being “*highly organised with very effective time management*” through to “*being very persistent and patient*” through to simply just being “*passionate about their work*”. The Decent Work team collectively have a blend of all the required attributes to really get projects and programmes designed and delivered on time and within budgets. All team members consulted feel a real sense of pride in both their individual and their collective work. Again success breeds success and it’s not surprising to have to report that many younger staff in ILO are actively seeking to move towards the ILO South Africa office.

Underpinning the success is the positive and pragmatic approach taken to the **continuous professional development** of ILO staff. A few years ago staff developments budgets were held by the ILO office in Geneva. The recent devolvement of the budget to the ILO office has allowed a careful tailoring of continuous professional development to take place and local suppliers to be sensibly sourced for individual staff development requirements. Again underpinning staff development in the ILO office is a positive attitude that in today’s rapidly changing environment new skills and knowledge are continuously required. More importantly it has been recognized that attitudes are also critically important and that issues of poor staff attitudes can and must be addressed. The reported recent successful hands-on training of a staff member who was “brilliant technically but simply quite appalling with his customer and staff attitudes” is a case in point.

It is to note that in the past two years ILO has greatly improved its ability to systematically track and document its impact and, that as of 2013, annual impact surveys are mandatory for all enterprise projects in Southern and Eastern Africa (from year 2 of the implementation cycle onwards).

Among these are the WEDGE impact survey¹³ and the Port Worker Phase One Evaluation Report¹⁴. The latter highlighted “notable impacts including full (100%)

¹³ Evaluation of WEDGE Project South Africa, Lesotho, Mozambique, Malawi Birgit Brammer 5/7/2012

retention of jobs and creation of an additional 106 employment opportunities at the Durban Containers Terminal (DCT) over the two years of the project; reduction of work days lost to industrial action at DCT; enhancement of employment for women having increased their share of DCT total employment opportunities by about 3%; and significant savings on the part of DCT through the use of Training of Trainers generated through project intervention”.

Achieving real impact and sustainability is seriously challenging. As has already been noted, achieving impact is a long term goal and not something that can usually be achieved within the life time of a project. Sustainability requires long term institutional change.

Three main features of the suite of projects examined give them a sound basis for longer term impact and sustainability of activities beyond their current, relatively short lives. These include:

1. The overarching collaborative frameworks in which the projects are embedded within the ILO South Africa programme and the DWCP- SA.
2. The strong ownership and institutionalization of project activities in the agenda of local, state and national organisations.
3. Improved technical and business management capacity through training whose positive results are already emerging.

One particular ILO project best illustrates all the above and both the success and long term nature of the challenges of achieving long term impact. After no less than five years hard work a new policy on Women’s Economic Empowerment-through enterprise development is nearly in place in South Africa.

One of the objectives of the Norad funded WEDGE Southern Africa project was to promote an enabling environment for women’s entrepreneurship development in project countries (Lesotho, Malawi, Mozambique and South Africa). In partnership with the Gender Unit of the department of Trade and Industry (DTI) in South Africa the project embarked on a long term partnership that has resulted in the development and approval of a strategy for Women’s Economic Empowerment-through enterprise development. Over the medium term the strategy will direct the DTI’s work on promoting gender equality and women targeted enterprise development.

The WEDGE-SA project specifically supported the development of the National Strategic Framework in four key areas:

1. Lobbying the DTI to consider and programme a review of a 2006 Draft National Strategic Framework on Gender and Women’s Economic Empowerment.

¹⁴ Port Work Development Project Independent End-Term Evaluation - Promotion of Decent Work in the South African Transport Sector (Phase 1). Stanley Karuga, 28th March 2013

2. Support the DTI in establishing good practice framework for developing the strategy. I.e. a policy development process, its oversight and ensuring technical rigor.
3. In 2010-11 the WEDGE-SA project funded and directed an enabling environment for women's entrepreneurship development research: 'Towards an Enabling Environment for Women's Economic Empowerment in South Africa.'
4. During 2011-2012 the project built on the findings of the research by supporting the DTI and a technical committee in the development of a strategy, implementation plan and monitoring evaluation framework for the economic empowerment of women through enterprise development.

•

On March 12th 2013 the DTI's Executive Board approved the Economic Empowerment of women Strategy with the recommendation for an Agency to implement the strategy and the development of an incentive scheme for women's enterprises. The next step is to take the framework for approval by the Economic Sectors and Employment Cluster after that then to Cabinet for ratification.

This means that South Africa will have a dedicated National Strategy, implementation plan and monitoring and evaluation framework for the economic empowerment of women through small enterprise development, one of the few countries in the world where specific national strategies exist.

Making ILO's Sustainable Enterprise work more relevant and useful in South Africa?

In addition to continuing their current work there is one clear area where ILOs work could be become more relevant and useful in South Africa, this is in the rapidly emerging "Green Jobs and Economy". In addition there is a real need for the ILO South Africa Office to drive forward the SADC work that they have already started.

Green Jobs and the Green Economy

Green jobs is a new and emerging topic in South Africa about which there is a high level of interest amongst many of ILO's partners, and indeed a much wider range of stakeholders in state, national and regional development¹⁵. Building understanding about green jobs requires ongoing effort, working at different levels, to respond to the different knowledge levels. Within the ILO Office support, some concrete examples of changes have already occurred in Southern Africa (notably in Namibia), however, it will take

¹⁵ Adding the Social dimension to Climate Change and the Green Economy. ILO Newsletter April 2013

some time for some countries before larger-scale, sustainable changes in green jobs availability and experience can be seen¹⁶.

Nowhere in the region is this more important than in South Africa itself as illustrated by three key features of the emerging Green Economy in South Africa:

- 1 One of the most important elements of the New Growth Plan in South Africa¹⁷ is a green economy, and the potential the creation of a lower-carbon economy has as a potential job generator as well as a spur for industrial development.
- 2 President Jacob Zuma has committed South Africa to slowing its growth in greenhouse gas emissions by 34% in 2020, and by 42% by 2025. By May 2012, the government had approved 19 wind, solar and hydropower proposals worth R73-million to help boost clean energy.
- 3 In 2011, the government entered into the Green Economic Accord, which aims to create 300 000 jobs in the next 10 years through investment in the green economy. In 2012, the Treasury allocated R800-million over two years to the Green Fund, which aims to provide finance for high-quality, high-impact, job-creating green economy projects around the country.

The second area of work that needs to become a clear focus for the ILO office in the future is the SADC Decent Work Programme. The SADC Decent Work Programme 2012- 2015 was discussed by ministers of labour and employment and social partners of the SADC at a meeting held in Luanda, Angola on 27 April 2012¹⁸.

By way of conclusion two key points need to be noted:

- 1 The ILO South Africa Office clearly demonstrates that transformational change can occur where good leadership and management are in place in an ILO office.
- 2 Technical cooperation is essential to demonstrate how ILO's policy advice on decent work can be applied in practice. If you get the formula right, these initiatives hold great potential for replication and roll out through local partners, thus triggering systemic change. As a case in point the South African Treasury has just approved a 1,5 million Rand top-up of the social economy project *because it is felt that the models tested* by ILO merit up-scaling.¹⁹ Likewise, the pending ILO submission to the National Jobs Fund, in which they hope to leverage donor funding from the Flemish for the Free State SME project at the rate of 1:4 (e.g. 3 million Euro from the

¹⁶ Skills for Green Jobs: Occupational changes in the Green Economy and www.ilo.org/green-jobs-programme

¹⁷ <http://www.southafrica.info/business/economy/econoverview.htm#ixzz2RsAalb64>

¹⁸ <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/region/afpro/pretoria/pdf/newsletters/may2012.pdf>

¹⁹ Letter to Ms Cebisile Nyambe, ILO PPSE Project Coordinator from South African National Treasury Office dated April 2013

Flemish with 12 million Euro from Government). Furthermore Technical Cooperation is still very relevant and important for ILO to achieve its mission and should maintain its position as a key strategic delivery option within ILO's portfolio.

South Africa – Project portfolio.

DIALOGUE	DWT/CO-Pretoria	South Africa	100361	SAF/05/02/SWI	Enterprise based competitiveness development in Southern Africa	Financially Closed	01-Mar-06	31-Mar-10	2009	256,239
EMP/ENTERPRISE	DWT/CO-Pretoria	South Africa	101689	SAF/09/50/SWI	Sustaining Competitive and Responsible Enterprises in South Africa	Active	01-May-09	31-Mar-13	2013	599,736
EMP/ENTERPRISE	DWT/CO-Pretoria	South Africa	102518	SAF/10/02/MUL	Promotion of Decent Work in the South African Transport Sector (phase I)	Active	01-Jan-11	31-Mar-13	2013	1,275,714
EMP/ENTERPRISE	DWT/CO-Pretoria	South Africa	103117	SAF/11/01/FCA	Public procurement and social economy	Active	01-Jan-12	31-Dec-13	2013	840,000
EMP/SEED	EMP/SEED	South Africa	101509	GLO/08/59/NAD	Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality	Active	15-Dec-08	28-Feb-13	2012	437,552
EMP/SEED	DWT/CO-Pretoria	South Africa	101319	SAF/07/51/FLA	Social Entrepreneurship targeting youth in South Africa	Financially Closed	01-Aug-08	31-Mar-12	2011	1,246,640
EMP/SEED	DWT/CO-Pretoria	South Africa	102514	SAF/10/01/FCA	Employment creation through Small and Medium Scale Enterprise (SME) development	Active	02-Dec-10	31-Mar-14	2013	5,965,308
EMP/SEED	CO-Dar es Salaam	South Africa	102744	RAF/10/09/NAD	Law-Growth Nexus II: Labour Law and the Enabling Business Environment for SMEs in Kenya and Zambia	Active	01-Jan-11	31-Mar-13	2013	2,378,735
EMP/SEED	Global	Global	210275	SAF/10/50/NAD	Sustaining Competitive and Responsible Enterprises II, South Africa SCORE II	Active	01-Jul-10	31-Dec-13	2013	350,515
South Africa TOTAL										13,350,439

TANZANIA

1. National context

Tanzania experienced an extended spell of a high growth rate, averaging almost 7 per cent from 2001 to 2010²⁰. Despite this period of accelerated growth, the poverty rate declined marginally from 35.7 per cent in 2001 to 33.6 per cent in 2007²¹. A population growth rate of 2.9 has increased the number of poor on the Mainland by 1.3 million over the past decade. There are clearly development disparities across regions, but the distribution of income – as measured by the Gini Coefficient – has remained unchanged (0.35) between 1990 and 2007²². In light of this, it is also unlikely that the MDG of halving extreme poverty will be achieved by 2015.

²⁰ Economic Survey, 2010 (URT)

²¹ Household Budget Survey 2007

²² Poverty and Human Development Report, 2009

The Government in its second poverty reduction strategy (MKUKUTA for Mainland and MKUZA for Zanzibar) has identified growth sectors (those which have a greater potential of increasing national output) and drivers of growth (those key interventions that can act as a catalyst to boost growth across sectors). While agriculture, manufacturing, and selected service industries are seen as growth and employment intensive sectors, the mining industry is considered as high growth industry but with limited employment intensity. On the other hand drivers of growth include rural infrastructure, transport, energy which cuts across economic sectors and can help accelerate growth. The approach to determine employment intensity and output intensity of sectors will improve future policies and support for the sectors. Potentially, such an approach will also allow better mainstreaming of employment content in sectors as well as drives of growth.

The employment to population ratio is high at 80 per cent, compared to other countries in the region. According to the last Integrated Labor Force Survey (ILFS, 2006), the unemployment rate in the Tanzania was 11.7 per cent²³. There is additional concern that many of the jobs that do exist are not decent and productive, so that they would positively impact poverty reduction.²⁴

The employment to population ratio and unemployment rate conceals the decent work deficits in Tanzania, particularly for rural areas. In 2010, it was estimated that almost 37 per cent of people employed in Tanzania are still below the poverty line²⁵. More than ninety per cent of the employed population is in the informal economy and almost 89 per cent of the population is engaged in vulnerable employment, with higher rates in rural areas (95 per cent). Especially in rural areas, and particularly women and youth, many are employed informally as contributing family workers, subsistence farmers engaged in low productivity agriculture, home-based micro-entrepreneurs, or, less frequently, as low-paid unskilled seasonal or casual workers. There are significant decent work deficits in terms of lack of social protection, weak enforcement of labour rights and standards, lack of occupational safety and health, and weak organization of workers.

Although agriculture accounts for one-quarter of GDP, it employs almost 80 per cent of the labor force. At 90 per cent, the ratio of females engaged in agriculture work is even higher²⁶. Instilling the necessary skills is vital for young people to enhance their employability and mobility.

In 2010, the second generation of the MKUKUTA and MKUZA II (2011-2015) were launched by the Government of Tanzania. Moreover, a Five Year Development Plan (2011-2015) was prepared to accelerate economic growth and put the country on track to realize the Vision 2025. These policy documents represent a shift towards a more

²³Using the national definition for calculating unemployment rate, the unemployment rate is much lower using the international ILO Standard.

²⁴ Analysis of MDG Employment Indicators: Tanzania Mainland, June 2010

²⁵ Analysis of MDG Employment Indicators: Tanzania Mainland

²⁶ Integrated Labour Force Survey, 2006

employment centric approach in which growth is not seen as an end but as means towards improved economic and social welfare of the people.

II. Findings to key evaluation questions

Relevance and strategic fit:

The Decent Work Agenda, youth employment and entrepreneurship development are well embedded in the MKUKUTA II and MKUZA II, as well as the Five Year Development Plan. The underpinning rationale is that without productive employment, significant progress in poverty reduction, even amidst high growth rate, will remain elusive. There is acknowledgment that there is need to develop policy coherence across all these initiatives to support structural transformation and productive employment creation in both agriculture and industrial sectors.

The Ministry of Labour and Employment in collaboration with the ILO has been spearheading the process of ensuring the implementation of employment creation and decent work goals in sectors, such as trade and industry; agriculture; and infrastructure through Sector Ministries and Local Government since 2008/09. The newly elected government in 2013 has also signalled the central role of entrepreneurship and employment through small enterprise development in addressing youth unemployment, and has outlined a course fully consistent with the strategy being implemented by the ILO. The DWCP specifically calls for a conducive environment for growth of enterprises and cooperatives to be promoted, and this is a primary focus of ILO's work.

Effectiveness

Through the Youth Entrepreneurship Facility (YEF), ILO has been supporting entrepreneurship by promoting an entrepreneurship culture, entrepreneurship education, financial and business development services, and support to youth organisations. The ILO is implementing capacity building activities such as training, study visits, tools, equipment and financial assistance for business development service providers so that they can offer tailor-made services to entrepreneurs, farmers and producer organizations. In addition to promotion of SIYB through networks of trainers supported by Master trainers, the ILO has championed **Kazi Nje Nje (KNN)**, which is being rolled out at district and village levels to support young men and women who aspire to being entrepreneurs. The trainers for the programme were selected from a pool of recent university graduates through a highly competitive process, and subsequently supported through training and a one-year apprenticeship during which they honed their skills as business trainers and advisors to local entrepreneur start-ups or existing small businesses.

The KNN programme is considered by the government to be a sustainable solution to the youth unemployment challenge and to directly respond to the various national development policies focused on employment and poverty reduction. Many of the persons trained under KNN have been partially sponsored by host NGOs,

some of whom have been able to also offer office space (a major cost and constraint, particularly in Dar and other urban areas), counselling, stationeries and use of computers and office equipment. The YEF project places priority on creation of both quantity and quality of jobs. Though it is recognized that many of the existing micro and small businesses do not meet ILO standards for decent employment, limited information on the quality of jobs created was available.

ILO has been successful in partnering with local governments to launch local sensitization campaigns about SIYB and KNN, which in turn has drummed up local demand for these trainings. This infusion of a high-profile event (sport, entertainment, etc.) draws crowds and raises the image of SIYB as something for young, dynamic people, which generates genuine interest among unemployed youth with some education.

More than 80 youth organizations have been reportedly strengthened as a result of the KNN outreach, which also open up a cost-effective means of contacting entrepreneur members. YEF has promoted active involvement of women entrepreneurs in coordination with the ILO WED project. According to a recent review, "Girls and young women have and will continue to benefit from KNN in part because they are often denied full access to or advancement within the existing male-dominated culture, and hence seek tools and skills to create their own businesses."²⁷

- *Maintaining this momentum and reinforcing group management practices remain risks to this progress. KNN can consider expanding to include capacity building for group management, team building, joint production and marketing, etc. Within this is potential for peer coaching and other forms of cross-learning and support. Similarly, access to business information and BDS materials through web sites, cell phones, etc. would be an added and reinforcing benefit.*

SIYB, microfinance and partnerships

The ILO is pursuing a number of lending windows through partnerships with existing microfinance providers (KWFT, PRIDE) to offer small loans to SIYB-trained entrepreneurs. Not all entrepreneurs want to resort to loans due to the high costs of borrowing and risks of repayment problems.

ILO is collaborating with the Community Banks of Tanzania to train their staff, who in turn trains managers of SACCOs and COBA (community banks). Three regional Community banks have since offered training to the entrepreneurs of smaller

²⁷ Tracer Study Report for 2011 Kazi Nje Nje trained entrepreneurs. (Youth Education through Sports Tanzania)

community banks (Mwanza, Kilimanjaro, Njombe), but many expected some compensation for participating in the training. Existing training budgets of the banks are reserved for their own staff so no training is offered to members without special funding. For this reason, sustainability of this programme is somewhat questionable.

Dunduliza also received \$20,000 grant to train managers in 20 SACCOs who in turn were to train members in cooperative management, entrepreneurship. 240 youth were trained and roughly 45 of these subsequently took out loans with the SACCOs. The NGO foresees that training through SACCOs could be sustained if SACCOs can find means of co-financing the trainings. There is opportunity to combine the entrepreneurship training with IFAD funding to expand microfinance for small business lending in rural areas.

YEF has trained members and officials from the Association of Tanzanian Employers (ATE)—17 trained, and the Confederation of Tanzanian Unions (COTU) in SIYB, which has raised their awareness of the efforts and has won praise from both in terms of its potential for addressing youth unemployment and underemployment. COTU in particular praised the quality and relevancy of the training content and saw potential for modified versions to be targeted to young workers, who would benefit from entrepreneurial skills in the work place to raise their productivity and through this their work situation.

ITC Turin is now offering extended support to SIYB trainers, which shows potential for longer partnership arrangements among those having completed courses at Turin. This in turn links to ILO Geneva, where mechanisms are being developed to link up master trainers through associations (Sri Lanka is successful case of this) with ILO technical staff acting as advisors.

- *YEF's approach to partnership has been efficient due to its selection process where partners are screened for their ability to absorb and sustain SIYB and other tools once initial training and support is provided.*
- *SIYB can be more proactive in providing financial management guidance to assess the relative costs and risks of various financial products being offered, including savings schemes and lower-interest revolving funds.*

Cooperatives in Tanzania

The cooperative development efforts championed under CoopAfrica continue to some extent through ILO initiatives to support cooperative reform (simplified structures, implementation strategy for the 2002 Cooperative Policy, development of new primary cooperatives for dairy, salt mines, etc.). ILO's work links into the current UNDAP and to KNN and their reinforcement of youth cooperative societies through business development services, or some form of service provision

cooperative. This is a new model in Tanzania and the details of how it would work are still to be developed.

For cooperative development more broadly, the government and more specifically the department of cooperatives (which moved from agriculture to labour ministry) has been slow to reform. Of the 14 areas called for to be reformed in the new Cooperative Act, after nearly ten years, according to those working within government, nearly all remains to be implemented. The oversight of cooperatives has been somewhat affected by devolution of government to counties, which has also included the cooperative network.

For those organizations supporting the cooperative movement, the focus remains on reinforcing the business skills of cooperative management, despite numerous incidences of corruption within existing management structures. In opposition to the new policy, the department continues to be hands-on in the management and decision-making of the more traditional cooperatives—agricultural commodities of tea, coffee, tobacco, etc. plus financial cooperatives. Their interest in promoting entrepreneurship through member training and skills development is minimal, despite the reported widespread disillusionment of the population with cooperatives.

Under the current UNDAF, the ILO is working in collaboration with FAO to promote associations (perhaps stopping short of cooperative structures and registration), which shows promise for addressing the 80% of population still depending on agriculture for their livelihoods. Associations and/or cooperatives also show potential for addressing the mismatch between idle or underused arable land and youth lacking access to land.

According to several key contacts, the ILO's cooperative work has fallen short of promoting the business connections needed to empower primary cooperatives and their members (e.g. fair trade). There has been too little emphasis on value chain connectivity and much more focus on the policies and social agendas of cooperatives in supporting their communities. Corruption has weakened cooperatives in Tanzania but so has the globalization of agriculture where now private traders and alternative market channels are available to producers. Because it is difficult to leave a cooperative, many have fallen dormant as members sell their products elsewhere.

Regarding women in cooperatives, nearly all major cooperatives are managed by men and the overwhelming majority of members are men. Women in these cooperatives tend to be widowed and without sons. Some small cooperatives are women only but these are largely active in women's traditional products such as handicrafts. This is despite women supplying the majority of labour for most commercial agricultural crops sold through cooperatives.

Moshi University of Cooperative and Business Studies (MUCOBS) is tasked with training of cooperatives and has a network of trainers for this but training resources

are scant and little is done without external funding. The ILO MyCOOP materials were revised by MUCOBS, and while useful and up-to-date, are not radically different from their earlier version or other training materials focused on managing cooperatives. Member-level training focuses on member empowerment (how to choose good leadership, reading financial statements, meetings and decision making, etc.). The CoopAfrica small grant to MUCOBS helped with giving loans to persons with disabilities plus training. Between 50 to 60 were reached through the grant but the means of sustaining the practice were not in place. Some receiving loans and training were able to improve their small income generating activities so this has had likely longer term benefit.

Overall, there are some new areas of cooperatives that have met with success that are not well covered in the MyCoop revised version, such as e-marketing, fair trade, organic farming, that have proven successful in Tanzania by pushing up very thin margins. Also, new types of cooperative businesses are emerging—beekeepers, fisheries, mining, forestry, dairy that show promise for expansion and may skirt the current government bureaucracy in government. Some of these received CooperAfrica grants.

Women entrepreneurs

The ILO's activities have mainly continued after nearly a decade to support entrepreneurship training (Get ahead), plus association development, as well as linking some capitalization funds to microfinance institutions able to offer loans to women's groups. The ILO also targeted vulnerable groups—sex workers for Get Ahead training to begin other businesses in partnership with several NGOs also targeting these groups. A meeting with Shimiyata (Umbrella organization for persons with disabilities) suggested that limited organizational capacity had been developed as a result of ILO support (no observable business records, membership records, etc.), though specific initiatives to open opportunities for entrepreneurship and sponsoring of awareness of employability of persons with disabilities had positive effects.

According to the chairwomen of TANCRAFT, an association of women craft traders, ILO is also right to target working with women and youth because nearly all Tanzanian women are involved in income generating activities because of their responsibility to support the family (estimated 10 million total). By working through organizations like TANCRAFT (nearly 8 years) the ILO maintains connections with the grassroots entrepreneurs (their membership roughly 500 handicrafts wholesalers and retailers throughout country). The Chair of TANCRAFT particularly praises ILO for training and helping to organize, then annualize, major handicrafts trade fair in East Africa, which mostly women participate in. Training in presentation and negotiating deals was particularly useful to members. ILO has also

provided training and support on how to formalize businesses, but does not insist on formal registration—but makes decision more informed.

Implementation efficiency

Tanzania has one of the largest technical cooperation programmes for sustainable enterprise, having over expended roughly 23 million USD in TC resources over the past five years. For those activities based in Tanzania, accessing and expending funds has gone fairly smoothly, however, delivery has been slowed largely due to delays in government and several other partners agreeing to their involvement. That said, ILO has worked efficiently with a number of NGOs and other smaller organizations as well as UN partners. Overall, feedback was positive, though delay in release of funds was mentioned.

The competitive grant fund (Youth-to-youth Fund) targets primarily civil society to apply for one-off small grants through innovation proposals. While hundreds have applied, less than 10% get funded; those shortlisted, however, get some SIYB training and proposal development support; those funded may also qualify for additional funds if merited. The preparation and review of proposals is time-consuming and costly. The grants themselves are often small (as little as \$5000) and may or may not be efficient for those applying. Of those funded, many have offered improved services to entrepreneurs of which a share are newly formed while some are already existing and interested in improvements.

For COOPAfrica, feedback on their Challenge Fund was generally positive, however many Tanzanian primary cooperatives lacked skills to develop good proposals so much assistance was needed to qualify and few ended up winning (<5% of those applying). In cases where amounts were small (\$5000) and the cooperative big, the amount was reported as too little to put to innovative use. Also, several were told that their proposal would be considered during the next phase of project. This did not materialize, however applicants needed to enquire to find out that funding would not continue. Bad communication/public relations may have led to some negative feelings towards ILO. According to the National Cooperative Union, the selection of cooperatives and cooperative service providers for small grants were well targeted but many needed follow up funding, which had been expected but in the end did not materialize.

The ILO should carefully consider use of scarce funds for competitive grant schemes to fund one-off activities. Support for fewer but well targeted initiatives could well be more substantive and provide longer duration support. The Office should also stick to key focus areas within cooperative support such as BDS, entrepreneurship training, youth associations, etc. to achieve scale, visibility and results in this area.

The Office has given up on pursuing PPP in Tanzania due to long delays and a likely dead end within ILO Geneva. However, there are examples within UNDP where these have succeeded and are financing youth-focused private sector initiatives.

Results framework, monitoring and evaluation

The YEF project monitors number of new businesses created and are now working on developing a means of assessing the sustainability of these enterprises. The SCIFORMA Project Management software package is currently being tested. The software is strongest for implementation monitoring and its introduction has been highly appreciated by projects, who can gauge their delivery against what was planned. That said, the focus is also not surprisingly skewed towards delivery of activities and outputs, and may risk less attention being given to effectiveness and sustainability of their deliverables.

The usefulness of the reporting is only as good as the quality and completeness of the data being entered into the system. Systematic means of measuring changes in business and worker incomes, job quality and job creation, require credible measurement and data collection systems. Improvements are being made in this, but at the impact and sustainability levels, analysis will likely need to rely on more stand-alone studies. YEF has conducted several of these, to assess annual impact in jobs created and the methodology and quality of results are improving, with future scopes to include more on quality and sustainability of jobs.

Impact and Sustainability

The success of KNN has not been straightforward in all parts of the country. In Zanzibar the KNN apprentices have trained small numbers and local promotion of the programme and trainers has been uneven. Of the 32 KNN apprentices launched in 2011, only 12 remain and many of these are not actively training. A key determinant to success appears to be the level and form of support being offered by local government and organizations as well as the mind-set of those being targeted for training. Given that previous local training in the area was heavily subsidized and trainees received 'sitting allowances', few have been receptive to the proposed cost-sharing of KNN.

Also, many youth consider starting a business as a 'last resort', and without a positive publicity surrounding the KNN, which was achieved in some other districts, the training does not appeal to youth as new and exciting. Overall, the MOL is embracing the K.N.N. programme particularly for its potential to address unemployed youth in rural areas to promote enterprise development surrounding agricultural production and agricultural-related businesses. The government envisions development of youth cooperatives related to these businesses, including within high-potential production areas such as seaweed and prawn production, dairy as well as other specialty agricultural products. The government also plans to offer land and financing to youth, primarily university graduates to support business start-ups in promising areas. Implementation of this is not yet set out so unclear how this will be administered.

A recent study has estimated that SIYB trained entrepreneurs double the number employed within one year of training, however, these newly formed jobs also start out low quality and poorly paid. The YEF project has not found an effective means of raising awareness of labour standards with new start-ups, although there is more interest in employee productivity among more established small businesses looking to grow.

The KNN and other entrepreneurship initiatives address the BDS skills gap, however, not the underlying problem of a labour market mismatch between the education system and labour market needs. Both need addressing and can be mutually reinforcing.

- To what extent have the ILO strategy and means of action been designed and implemented to maximize sustainability of results at the global and country level?

A 2011 joint ILO/MOLE tracer study focusing on the training beneficiaries of the KNN programme found that among those trained a significant number had started small businesses (Of 579 contacted, 177 had started businesses, and an additional 77 in agricultural production). Of the 122 women contacted 21 per cent reported having started their own business. Self-reported net earnings before and after the training, also suggested that many were able to more than double their income as a result of improved business know-how, though sampling not random and measurement simply recall of before and now earnings.

Nearly two-thirds reported on-going barriers to their businesses, such as unreliable electricity, local government support and other services, lack of information, however, 85 per cent considered access to seed capital critical to their growth. The YEF does not specifically target the enabling environment, however, many see this as an integral part of managing risks for emerging entrepreneurs. Support has been given in training on how to register a business and the merits of formalization.

While the sampling could not be fully representative due to difficulty locating the trainees ex post, the data is nonetheless encouraging.

“ILO/YEF has created a pool of trainers from within their own communities to train and mentor nascent and novice entrepreneurs. These local trainers have created power and, when their influence is combined with a relevant curriculum (SYB and GYB), the model will be most effective”.²⁸

²⁸ Ibid.

Project portfolio

XB Symbol	Project Title	Allocations
RAF/10/50/DAN	Africa Commission: Youth Entrepreneurship Facility, ILO component for Tanzania*	11,700,000
RAF/06/53/UKM	Cooperative Facility for Africa(multi-country)	9,357,000
RAF/12/50/IRL	Women's entrepreneurship development and economic empowerment	1,521,000
URT/07/01/AGF	Women and youth employment through improved beekeepers organisation and beekeeping techniques	143,000
	Total funds	22,741,00

*Estimate

Kenya

National context

Poverty, especially income poverty, remains one of the most formidable challenges for Kenyans today. Over 45 per cent of Kenya's population still lives in poverty, with some 12.6 million of the estimated population of 38.6 million people living below the poverty line of less than one dollar a day.²⁹ Rural communities, especially those in arid and semi-arid Lands areas and informal urban settlements are the most affected. Households that have high dependency ratios, rural dwellers and informal sector workers are the most affected.

The youth shoulder the brunt of the socio-economic problems in Kenya with limited opportunities to improve their livelihood. It is estimated that 64 per cent of unemployed persons in Kenya are youth. Moreover, only 1.5 per cent of the unemployed youth have

²⁹ ILO DWCP Kenya (final draft)

formal education beyond secondary school level and over 92 per cent have no vocational or professional skills training and therefore have limited chances of fully participating in the labour market.

The Kenya Vision 2030 accords high priority to entrepreneurship development and youth employment. Increasingly, the youth employment and entrepreneurship is one of the flagship projects of the Vision and the Medium Term Plan for the period 2008-2012. Additionally, the overall goal of National Youth Employment Policy (2002) is to promote youth participation in democratic processes as well as in community and civic affairs and ensuring that youth programmes engage the youth and are youth-centered. As part of this initiative, the Government aims at sensitizing national policy makers on the need to identify and mainstream youth issues in national development; identifying ways of empowering the youth in order to exploit their potential; promoting a culture of volunteerism among the youth; identifying constraints that hinder the youth from realizing their potential; mentoring the youth to be just and morally upright citizens; and promoting ethos of honest hard work and productivity; among the youth.

Owing to its severity, the government saw fit to propose, and the citizens endorsed, a provision on the National Constitution that specifically addresses the challenge of youth unemployment by providing that the State shall take measures to ensure that youth access employment³⁰.

Small and medium sized enterprises will continue to provide employment opportunities in Kenya. The 2003 Economic Survey found that in 2002 the SME sector had grown to 5.1 million people, approximately 74.2 per cent of the total number of persons engaged in employment in the country. about two-thirds were located in the rural areas while women owned just under half of the enterprises. The share of the MSEs' sector's contribution to GDP was estimated at 18.4 per cent. According to Vision 2030 and the Medium Term Plan 2008-2012, the sector is expected to create almost 88 per cent of the 2.6 million jobs that the Government of Kenya plans to create during the period 2008-2012.

ILO programme of support

For the period 2006-2010, the ILO's work focused on three priority areas in its support to the national development process. All three areas were identified as strategic for ILO interventions at the country level based on the ERS, the UNDAF, consultations with the constituents and the ILO 2006-07 strategic objectives and mainstreamed strategies. The selected priority areas are addressing *youth empowerment and, youth employment by enhancing MSE development*; improving relevance and effectiveness of industrial training to reduce skills mismatch; development of an employment policy and guidelines on a national productivity agenda.

³⁰ Article 55(c) of the new Kenyan Constitution.

The ability of the MSE sector to create both quality and durable jobs is hampered by the numerous challenges and constraints including an unfavorable policy environment, inhibitive legal and regulatory framework, limited access to financial services and markets, inadequate access to skills and technology, insecurity of tenure, poor access to infrastructure, inadequate business skills and linkages with large enterprises, gender inequality, unfavorable taxation regime, limited access to information, HIV and AIDS pandemic and occupational health and safety requirements. The government has already taken steps to address these challenges, one of which includes developing and adopting the Micro Small Enterprises Bill, 2011 which is now in parliament awaiting debate and enactment.

Following on the work done under the current DWCP, for 2013-17, the DWCP will prioritize employment and employability through, among others, enhancing capacities and competitiveness of sustainable MSEs. Business management and entrepreneurial skills are critical in the growth and development of MSEs. To improve and promote the acquisition of entrepreneurial skills, market-led business development services are being provided in partnership with support organizations. The DWCP uses the following results measures:

- I. No of MSEs trained in business and management skills
- II. No of laws reviewed and regulatory reforms made to enhance the enabling environment
- III. No of MSEs associations represented at County Government
- IV. No. of forums held to create awareness of opportunities for sustainable enterprises especially in the green economy

II Findings to key evaluation questions

Relevance and strategic fit:

Both the previous and current governments prioritize entrepreneurship and small and micro enterprise development as a core component to the national development strategy. Youth employment is considered the number one issue for the country right now and the government is establishing a 'youth fund' for training on entrepreneurship and setting up low-cost loans for youth (including university graduates). The main ILO sustainable enterprise initiatives fall under the sub-regional Youth Entrepreneurship Facility, Women Entrepreneurship Development, and the Law-Growth Nexus. All three projects align well with national development frameworks. YEF is part of Vision 2030 national development strategy under social protection pillar (entrepreneurship leadership).

According to constituent representatives, the ILO DWCP has improved the dialogue between ILO and constituents such that ILO is better able to link to their priorities and plans. Currently, sustainable enterprise initiatives in the country are well embedded in the DWCP and enjoy constituent support. That said, two of the

initiatives (WEDEE, YEF) did not begin as part of a joint plan from the design stage but have been appreciated nonetheless.

Law-growth Nexus directly links to the Ministry of Manpower and UNDP initiatives that aim to improve the situation of the matatus (mini-bus taxis) in Nairobi and other cities. The CoopAfrica policy reform in Kenya was found highly relevant, however, smaller grant initiatives were found less relevant to the overall cooperative movement, given that the project covered multiple countries and therefore had limited presence in Kenya.

ILO's sustainable enterprise projects are regarded as highly relevant to Kenyan youth as evidenced by their interest in the various initiatives either as service providers or as trainees. This is evidenced by strong interest in benefiting from training and other opportunities. It is, however, not yet to the point where many planning or already engaged in SME development are willing, or able, to pay for the costs of training. Some are contributing in small ways towards the cost of training delivery but for the most part rely on venue, fees being provided (food and transport more likely to be cost-shared).

The ILO's project approach being taken in Kenya was found to be fragmenting the sustainable enterprise work, which from the perspective of the MOL reduced relevancy by making it more difficult to understand the common goals and coherence underlying the various projects and the government's youth entrepreneurship strategy.

There is continued high potential for the ILO to be highly relevant to the new government's initiatives under the freshly created Small Enterprise Authority, however, this will require working outside of MOL.

Effectiveness

That said, the Law-Growth Nexus project was recognized to have been highly effective in targeting labour code and social dialogue expertise to the matatu transport sector, where it increased awareness among owners and drivers and conductors of various scenarios for improving the employment relations and working conditions of the latter two groups. ILO brought representatives of all groups into discussions for the first time. Now, general recognition that better working conditions and observance of labour laws can raise productivity and reduce risks. Next steps, however, will be to translate newly formed SACCOs for owners into viable cooperatives for managing various transport routes within the city and to outlying areas.

The 2012, Japan-funded project aimed to respond to political unrest among youth, particularly in the arid northern areas, through labour-intensive roads construction, was reduced to 9 months implementation period due to start up delays. The \$1.6 million was to train unemployed youth in the northern regions to build roads using

paving stones. According to the training institution (Kenya Institute of Highways and Building Technologies), 277 youth were trained but it was not clear whether these came from the target region. In addition, 700 meters of cobblestone road were built in Nairobi. The Institute was not certain that those trained actually did the work, however, as no records were kept by the Institute the final evaluation did not consider this. The technology has not yet been mainstreamed into Kenya's road development strategy, although the newly appointed Minister was involved in the project and speaks highly of the technology.

To be seriously considered, the introduction period would need to stretch several years and involve field visits, awareness raising and internal proposal developments for introducing the new technology. The training is not yet part of the training curriculum, however, the project did finance training of trainers at the institute, who are already training in road construction. This capacity development can be tapped in the next few years, should the government opt for use of the cobblestone technology. A proposal for a second phase was declined given that the youth situation no longer was deemed an emergency requiring response, which was a requirement for this funding window.

COOP^{Africa} has used its open financing mechanism called "challenge fund" that allocates grants to applicants on a competitive basis to extended grants to 28 cooperatives, mutual assistance organizations and their partners in Kenya to meet different objectives in the development of cooperatives. An 2010 country impact assessment of COOP^{Africa} found that it was contributing to the rejuvenation of the apex cooperative organization; facilitation of National Cooperative Organizations to provide more services to their members to enhance their loyalty; motivating donors to provide grants for the development of the cooperative movement; and creating some jobs and income generating opportunities through the promotion of specific innovative cooperative ventures. Funding to MUCOPS also helped to develop training and awareness raising on HIV/AIDS through cooperative networks. Other initiatives focused on promotion of gender equality in cooperative development, offering social protection, and reduction of poverty.

The YEF initiatives to raise awareness and motivate an entrepreneurial culture were not in themselves unique. Public radio and TV programmes already existed on small enterprise development, however, the programming funded by ILO (episodes) focused on green jobs, and business advisory services, which were special areas not otherwise covered but also associated with the ILO. Viewer coverage was estimated as widespread for these (700,000) and considered cost-effective. Outside of public media campaigns, few initiatives are targeted at addressing constraints within the enabling environment. Several interviewed asked the ILO to incorporate within initiatives means of addressing barriers to entry of youth, such as the registration process, through innovative options such as a registration fast track for youth.

The entrepreneurship training in formal education is being supported through UNDP with ILO co-chairing this work with UNICEF. Youth polytechnics for trades

and skills were identified as government priorities for including KAB-type training, however, the project opted to not pursue this component in Kenya given stretched funds and the short time period left of the project (one year). However, there is a clear potential role for ILO in Kenya promoting entrepreneurship training in specialized technical schools, where it is currently not mainstreamed.

SIYB training has taken an agency-specific approach, where ILO identifies key partner organisations to train staff as trainers. To date, a joint training two-week workshop graduated government's labour officers, and representatives from Federation of Kenya Employers and Kenya Organization of Trade Unions. Though a few have been certified and have subsequently offered SYIB training, the majority have not yet achieved certification. By April 2013, approximately 7000 persons had received SIYB training of some sort, of which an estimated 5000 have been through the Equity Foundation, whose funding for these comes from MasterCard. Persons targeted for training are identified throughout the country, some may be current clients of the Equity bank, however, there is supposedly a fire wall between the bank and foundation to delink training from the banking side. That said, the Foundation can provide advice and referrals if the trainee performs well.

The funding for the training comes from MasterCard, which will end next year. The Foundation intends to mobilize additional resources and has a well-qualified network of trainers to deliver with reliability. This particular component looks promising. Equity foundation has five core pillars: education and leadership—scholarships; financial literacy; innovation and entrepreneurship; health; environment and sustainability; agriculture and access to finance

The YEF has also trained trainers within the Ministry of Industry and trade in SIYB and these trainers have as well trained small business owners. The ministry intends to make SIYB its core training materials, given their high quality. This component has a fair chance of being sustainable. Previously trained Master trainers have also been supported to update their skills and offer training of trainer courses, which has helped to rejuvenate their activities.

YEF has also trained members of various youth organizations to be trainers, however, this has not yet shown scaled results. Independent trainers have difficulty generating funds and youth organizations are for the most part not yet operating within well- functioning structures. SIYB was found to be weakly designed for follow up, particularly in providing innovative means of mentoring post-training. The time between the first and second trainings is critical and many small entrepreneurs need advice and practical information to get through this high-risk start-up process.

The roll out of green SIYB has progressed slowly in Kenya and constituents felt that more needed to be done to explain concepts and provide customized training of trainers as well as 'greening' of the SIYB materials.

SIYB is getting traction and attention in Kenya; it is considered relatively cost-effective by ILO partners. The SIYB work under the current project has limited visibility so demand for training among those likely to be able to pay, is not high. The ILO can focus more on providing marketing materials, platforms, events that can be sustained by trainers once project ends. Use of internet needs to be stepped up. In addition, innovations for providing on-going support and monitoring progress can become IT savvy such as through Twitter, etc. Training of trainers needs to anticipate the need to address gaps that are not covered in the training materials. On-line peer support? Help center??

That said, SIYB trainers suggested that ILO introduce more IT into their product line, such as an information network to feed SME success stories as well as information on key skills and supply chain niches for those interested in SME start-up. Additional suggestions for improving ILO's effectiveness included MIS support for monitoring trainees and businesses—good M&E tools exist but these can be supported through more versatile software as well as web-based access. E-learning would also have high potential in Kenya where computer use and literacy are high. Business incubation services are not yet part of ILO approach but are being offered by others; the ILO could consider something like 'manage your business', after which Improve Your Business could follow.

The cost and logistics surrounding SYIB materials have improved (was a major problem in the past). Making these available electronically is essential and also finding an effective means of accumulating the various applications and customizations of trainers would be beneficial to other trainers and the ILO. Finally, an SIYB module on financial management would help to protect trainees from potentially biased information sourced from those linked to financial services.

Women entrepreneurship

The economic and social disparities within Kenya are more pronounced when a gender lens is applied. Women's scope for redress against human rights abuses and abuse of their rights, in particular to access property, is limited by the nature of institutions associated with human rights, specifically the legal process. These mechanisms are not within reach for the majority of poor women due to financial and other non-financial costs (e.g. distance). In addition women's participation in leadership and decision making was one of the lowest in Eastern Africa— at 7.3 per cent in the 9th parliament. Gender disparities are worsened by systemic discrimination, entrenched both by practice and the legal and regulatory framework that institutionalizes their impoverishment. The legal regime is further unsuited to address the rising incidences of gender based violence. The problem of violence against women remains a major obstacle to equality, development and peace. Comprehensive legislative reforms are needed to protect women against violence.

The WEDEE project is multi-faceted and covers several countries. It's initiatives in Kenya constitute ILO's contribution to UNDP's Kenya economic empowerment of

women, where ILO is the main agency supporting this. The project has a small budget and its initiatives are widely spread but overall aim to sustain what has been supported through earlier projects. The women-only focus is justified in Kenya given that female youth face special challenges in enterprise development, and also tend to flourish within women's entrepreneurs associations, which in turn can push the policy agenda for ensuring women's inclusion.

The WEDEE project has supported TOT of get-ahead training through a network of 100 BDS trainers, some targeting Kenya industrial estates and with the intention to link to government's women's enterprise fund for disbursing subsidized SME loans to qualifying women entrepreneurs.

In conjunction with the Geneva-based Youth Entrepreneurship Network major impact assessment planned to look at five different scenarios related to women's support (training, training plus loans, association development, etc.)

Efficiency

Procurement, contracting and overall coordination between projects are slowed due to the absence of a country office status. All decisions, work planning, etc. need to go through Dar Es Salaam, which is reported as unpredictable in terms of timing. The three multi-country projects being implemented in Kenya were given mixed reviews on their effectiveness by ILO constituents who felt that the projects' implementation was less amenable to adopting a nationally driven approach.

Several projects have adopted strategy maps and M&E scorecards to assess how projects are delivering against targets; NPCs consider this very useful way of monitoring their performance, however the downside appears to be that numbers and targets drive operations rather than a more strategic outcome-oriented view to longer term sustainability and partnership.

All projects align well with the overall sustainable enterprise strategies, however, work under each is somewhat disconnected from other SE projects. Projects should be more closely aligned with the DWCP SE outcomes to generate and maintain national ownership.

Coop Africa's Challenge Fund received mixed reviews from multiple stakeholders. Most government partners blamed that lack of a second phase, which would have provided opportunities for follow up support or advancement of innovations. Because no additional funding source could be found, some grant-recipients progressed only partially through their work plans. In addition, it was reported that primary cooperatives had difficulty competing against experienced proposal writers, so many were left with nothing to show for their effort. Some grants were as small as \$5000, which for some covered costs of consultants who prepared proposals.

Several grants were successful in financing innovations that are reported to have been sustained.

Impact and Sustainability

According to ILO constituents and partners the weakest link within ILO’s sustainable enterprise work in Kenya is finding means of sustaining the know-how and support for advising out-of-school youth on SME development. Overall, ILO constituents and many implementing partners complained of the poor sustainability of ILO’s SE project-level work in the past.

Some optimism exists however, for sustaining the capacities developed more recently, particularly under the SIYB component of YEF. The partnership with Equity Foundation shows strong overlap in priorities and approaches and, consistent with ILO’s strategy, effectively links entrepreneurship training with enterprise finance schemes. The foundation’s network of 43 trainers will adopt SIYB as its core training approach and will provide follow up training (IYB) to those having made good use of the first round of support. Two follow up visits after this will provide additional assessment of progress. Its operations also stretch into rural areas and all provinces of the country, and target five major sectors, thereby promising wider coverage to disadvantaged youth. The Foundation also requires the transport and venue to be paid through participant contributions.

To improve sustainability and to ensure a longer term presence of ILO in national capacity development, new means of resourcing are badly needed. Non-traditional funding windows could support the longer time horizons called for when trying to institutionalize small enterprise BDS services and know-how. In addition, service providers of training and other BDS services, called for ILO to reinforce formation of SME associations through which to feed information and achieve economies of scale in services, etc.. Formalizing these would also reduce their politicization, which reportedly has been a past problem in the country.

Kenya--Project portfolio

XB Symbol	Project Title	Allocations USD
RAF/10/09/NAD	Law-Growth Nexus II: Labour Law and the Enabling Business Environment for SMEs in Kenya and Zambia (Phase 2)—50% of 2,378,735USD	1,200,000
RAF/12/50/IRL	Women’s entrepreneurship development and economic	520,000

	empowerment (approximately 400'000 Euros for phase I. Same amount expected for phase II.)	
	Capacity-building on value chain development and value chain finance in Kenya	180,000
RAF/10/50/DAN	Africa Commission: Youth Entrepreneurship Facility, ILO Component (phases I&II)	5,000,000 (Estimated)
RAF/08/01/NAD	The law-growth nexus: (Phase 1)	
		6,900,000

ANNEX 4. DESK COUNTRY CASE STUDIES

ZAMBIA

Background

Though commendable progress has been made at stabilising the Zambian economy at the macroeconomic level, the country's social and economic indicators reveal that much work remains to be done if the poverty levels are to be reduced. With a per capita Gross National Income in 2011 equal to 1490 USD³¹ (adjusted to PPP), Zambia still stands out as one of the poorest countries in the world. Approximately 67%³² of Zambians live below the poverty line, and 46% of these are classified as being extremely poor³³. Limited access to health services, poor sanitation and insufficient healthcare infrastructures are among the major factors that influence the overall living conditions of the Zambian population that, in 2011, had a life expectancy at birth of only 49 years, among the lowest in the world. As stated in the ILO Zambia Decent Work Country Programme document, undoubtedly, poverty in Zambia has been exacerbated by the persistently high unemployment levels, and further compounded by the HIV and AIDS pandemic, with a prevalence rate of 13% for people aged between 15 and 49. Although GDP growth has been averaging at about 4.5% annually, this growth has not translated into a commensurate increase in the number of jobs.³⁴

As many other countries in Sub-Saharan Africa, Zambian population is predominantly rural. Recent estimates showed that 61% of the population does not live in urban areas³⁵ and only 11% of the working force seems to be engaged in the formal sector. At the moment, Zambia ranks 117th out of 128 countries included in the 2007 Global Competitiveness Index. Moreover, despite efforts to ensure macroeconomic stability and diversify the economy, rural areas have disproportionately suffered from years of development neglect.

According to the ICA 2008³⁶, the business environment in Zambia has improved since 2003, but still requires vast improvements for its workers to become more productive and its firms to compete. The enterprise sector which generates the majority of economic growth, exports and tax revenues is made up of a few thousand enterprises with over 50 employees. While the large enterprises drive the economy

³¹ World Bank Development Indicators

³² World Bank Development Indicators

³³ Living Conditions Survey III, Central Statistical Office, Lusaka, 2004

³⁴ Zambia Decent Work Country Programme 2007-2011

³⁵ World Urbanization Prospects

³⁶ Investment Climate Assessment 2008

they only account for 7% of employment. Of the 4.1 million employed 88% work for micro enterprises which are more common in rural areas.³⁷

Strategic framework for sustainable enterprise development policies and initiatives

In the last years, the Zambian Government has repeatedly made commitments to support private sector growth by implementing private sector reforms aimed at enhancing a competitive business environment and enhancing the investment climate. These efforts have been systematized into the Private Sector Development Reform Programme (PSDRP), a government-sponsored multi-phase reform agenda that seeks to improve the business environment and reduce the cost of doing business by creating an enabling environment in Zambia that will eventually support job and wealth creation. Its Action Plan aims at advancing rapid improvements and specific reforms to the investment climate and business environment.

The PSDRP second phase which began in 2009 and is expected to end in 2014. It is based on the premise that private sector development is a key development strategy for jobs and wealth creation and economic growth. The programme has once again prioritized key reform areas, namely:

1. Business Licensing Reform
2. Micro, Small and Medium Enterprise (MSME) Development
3. Public Private Partnership (PPP) Development
4. Labour law reform and productivity
5. Trade expansion

and three key cross-cutting areas, Doing Business Reforms, Reform Communication and Capacity Building to manage and implement reforms and Gender mainstreaming. The ILO's involvement in this reform agenda is testified by its participation in the working group chaired by the Minister of Labour and Social Security whose objective is to implement a wider labour law reform to promote private sector development. The Government has tried to support the MSME sector through a number of other initiatives. Notable ones being the creation of the Citizens Economic Empowerment Commission (CEEC); the introduction of the Business Development Services (BDS) Voucher Scheme which provides access to subsidised business advisory services for MSMEs; the introduction of the business linkages programme and the tailor made MSME training in access to markets and finance.

The overall objective is to put MSMEs in the condition of graduating into larger or formal enterprises. PSDRP II has the development of the MSME sector as one of its five priorities and it will mostly concentrate on synergizing development efforts in this sector.

³⁷ Government of Zambia; "PRIVATE SECTOR DEVELOPMENT REFORM PROGRAMME II"; Programme Document; December 2009.

In 2005 the Government adopted the National Employment and Labour Market Policy (NELMP), following ILO's technical support to MLSS. The development of the NELMP involved extensive consultations with the constituents. The Policy provides a major focus for pro-employment strategies in the country. It highlights a range of key government priorities on which to concentrate the efforts to create more and better quality employment, including the promotion of and support to MSMEs; identification and support for job and business opportunities for men and women, as well as young people; the prevention and mitigation of HIV and AIDS; promotion of Social Dialogue and strengthening of social partners' institutions; and creation of an effective Labour Market Information (LMI) system.

The main focus of the new development plan, the SNDP, is to diversify the economy away from mining to agriculture, tourism, manufacturing, energy and infrastructure development. The priorities in the agriculture sector include farm block development, irrigation, productivity and livestock development. In tourism the Plan will focus on development of the northern circuit and enhancement of the development of tourism in Livingstone and other destinations in Zambia. The promotion and development of industrial parks and the development of the Multi-Facility Economic Zones (MFEZ) are the priority areas in the manufacturing sector. There is also a strategy for import substitution meant to stimulate and enhance the value chain of production within Zambia. In energy, the SNDP will promote investment and efficiency in power generation, distribution and transmission, and private sector investment in the sector. There will also be a focus on alternative sources of energy such as biofuels, as evidenced by recent investments. Infrastructure development focuses on roads, railways, schools, health facilities and public-private partnerships in infrastructure development.

The Government of Zambia has recently approved the Micro, Small and Medium Enterprise (MSME) Policy. This policy is designed to guide the efforts on promoting the start-up and growth of MSMEs. Some of the strategies envisaged include facilitating access to finance, markets and business development services for MSMEs.

ILO's support framework in Zambia

The goal of the Decent Work Country Programme for Zambia can be summarized as: *"More and better jobs for women and men in Zambia, resulting from the National Employment and Labour Market Policy (NELMP) implemented under the MLSS, supported by the social partners, connected to the FNDP, SNDP, the UNDAF and the JASZ, and with national and international budgetary support (in the next 4-6 years)"*.

The first priority of Zambian DWCP aims at creating more and better employment for youth, women and people with disabilities, supported by enhanced Labour

Market Information (LMI) system. Such priority is supported by the following country programme outcome:

- Increased employment opportunities for all, with focus on Youth, Women and Persons with Disabilities in particular through Sustainable Enterprise Development and Employment Protection.

- Enhanced employment and self-employment opportunities for the target groups through access to BDS, finance and skills development.

- Enhanced Social Protection for the target groups, including those affected by socio-economic crises, with a focus on the informal economy.

ILO Sustainable Enterprise development interventions and means of actions

According to the documentation examined, the ILO has taken an active part in Zambia's policy reform agenda in terms of both labour market reform and private sector development.

The Decent Work Country Programme priorities have been operationalized in several projects that drew on the following means of action:

- Advisory services and legal advice for reforming the business environment and the labour market legislation;
-
- Capacity building through skills development, BDS and business support for sustainable MSMEs development, enhancement of the capacity of associations and organizations for entrepreneurs;
-
- Research and policy development through information generation and knowledge dissemination, promotion of a national social dialogue on the topics of decent work and sustainable enterprise development.

In the timespan considered, the means of action have been operationalized in the framework of five technical cooperation projects (see Table 1).

Table 1

XB Symbol	Project Title	Project Status	Start Date	End Date	Allocations (US\$)
ZAM/06/01/AGF	Promoting economic empowerment of rural women through membership based association	Activities Completed	01-Apr-08	31-Mar-10	82,807
ZAM/12/01/FIN	UN Joint Programme on Enhancing Competitiveness and Sustainable Business among MSMEs in the Building Construction Industry in Zambia - Inception Phase	Active	01-Jun-12	31-May-13	1,328,021
RAF/10/09/NAD	Law-Growth Nexus II: Labour Law and the Enabling Business Environment for SMEs in Kenya and Zambia PHASE II	Active	01-Jan-11	31-Mar-13	2,378,735
RAF/08/01/NAD	The law-growth nexus: A mapping of labour law and MSE development in Sub-Saharan Africa PHASE I	Activities Completed	Mar-08	Aug-10	599,870
ZAM/07/01/FIN	Broad-Based Wealth and Job Creation in Zambia: Economic Empowerment through MSME Development	Activities Completed	Jan-09	Dec-11	2,240,000

II. Findings to key evaluation questions

Law-Growth Nexus’s development objective aims at creating “*Better business environments for workers and employers in MSEs*”. The ILO’s Decent Work agenda and its focus on the promotion of sustainable enterprises highlight the importance of better business environments for MSE employers and workers. A 2012 evaluation mission in Zambia assessing the second phase of the Law-Growth Nexus project noted the project’s relevance to the development aspirations of the target direct and indirect beneficiaries and the respective government’s development agenda, but also complementary to a significant number of other ILO-labour, employment and MSME development initiatives as well as several initiatives of other United Nation agencies. The overall objective, activities, outputs and emerging outcomes of the Law-Growth Nexus Programme can be perceived as relevant and strategically in line with the needs of MSMEs in Zambia; the development agenda of the Government of the Republic of Zambia as enunciated in the last two National Development Plans; the development agenda of GOF for Africa; development aspirations of the ILO constituents in Zambia; and the ILO-DCWP for Zambia. Although generally well linked to other ILO initiatives as well as other UN agencies active in the country, the programme has failed to fully take advantage of the potential synergies and complementarities between its two national components (Zambian and Kenyan), as well as with a similar ILO project funded by the same donor and implemented in South Asia (SME Growth Trap Project in South Asia).

At the country level, the Law-Growth Nexus project with its two implementation phases, contributed to achieving the overall aims of building sustainable enterprises and decent work supporting social dialogue in the country also through the generation of knowledge on the relationship between regulation and MSE development. The project has also substantially supported labour code reform efforts underway in Kenya and Zambia, although these reforms have not been

completed yet. In addition, the project also produced and disseminated diagnostic case studies for several countries, namely Kenya, Liberia, Rwanda, South Africa, Zambia, investigating examples of innovative approaches to the application of labour and labour related laws in MSEs. In the case of Zambia, the report addressed the topic by carrying out a literature review and a mapping of the key actors involved.

The Broad-Based Wealth and Job Creation programme was a direct response to the Zambian FNDP whose theme is “Broad-Based Wealth and Job Creation through Citizenry Participation and Technological Advancement”. In this respect, the FNDP highly emphasizes poverty reduction, pro-employment economic growth and sound labour administration. In particular the vision of FNDP is to realize “an efficient and effective labour market system that promotes job creation in the economy by 2030”. It is also worth noting that the SNDP as well, with its core theme of “sustained economic growth and poverty reduction” and a strategic focus on infrastructure and human development, aims at building an enabling environment that attains aspirations of Vision 2030. The programme also directly relates to Priority 1 of the ILO DWCP for Zambia (2007-2011) outlined above, and its objectives turn out to be of particular relevance to the first two outcomes of the DWCP under Priority 1. The overall strategic objectives of the BBW&JC are also relevant to the aims and activities of other national policies and programmes already mentioned in the previous sections of this report, such as the Citizens’ Economic Empowerment (CEE) Policy and the CEE Act (2006), the Zambia Development Agency-ZDA Act (2006), the National MSME Development, the National Employment and Labour Market Policy and the Private Sector Development Reform Programme.

In order to contribute to the achievement of the overall objective of promoting sustainable enterprises and decent work, the programme has worked to operationalize a business linkage between MSMEs and large corporations and to create a BDS providers directory on the Zambia Development Agency website. Training in international best practice in BDS marketing for local BDS organizations were delivered and an analytical research report on MSME sector was completed. The BBW&JC also supported the development of a MSME Policy Implementation Plan that led to the establishment of the MSME Coordinating Committee and the National Business Linkage Committee. To conclude, a UN-PSD tracking tool and a UN-PSD Joint Programme on “Improved Livelihoods through Private Sector Development Project” (an outcome of BBW&JC initiative) have been launched in the framework of the project.

Effectiveness

- How effective is the strategy in addressing issues related to its technical products and services?

For what concerns the Law-Growth Nexus project, although the outputs and indicators were found to be somehow inadequate to measure what it was set out to

achieve, the project delivered substantial results. Country-level respondents have indicated that it did provide valuable information on labour laws and MSEs and succeeded in raising these issues as important concerns among the participating social partners. Furthermore, the project provided useful and relevant technical advice to reform efforts that were underway in Kenya and, to a lesser extent, Zambia. A logical framework more relevant for an action-research-based project such as this, would have led to a more efficient implementation.

At a global level, the effectiveness of the project is more difficult to measure. By the end of the Phase I of project (i.e., end of August 2010) the two global products or project outputs (i.e., the guide and training package) were not yet finalized. As a result, it was difficult for the independent consultant to evaluate or assess the quality of these products and their contribution to the global knowledge of labour law and MSEs. While the country mapping reports (Phase 1) and country reports (Phase 2) vary in quality and usefulness, it is clear that the collection of these reports contains a wide range of valuable information that can be synthesized and used to effectively address the current global knowledge gap concerning labour laws and MSEs. However, the project has not yet succeeded in drawing out this information and more attention could have been given to discussing the synthesis of findings that come from the country mapping and country reports. While it is acknowledged that limited project funds constrained this kind of activity, greater effort should have been given to the organization of regional seminars on the topic and the findings of the reports. The greatest challenge of the project was related to the opportunity of properly distilling and disseminating key research findings, lessons learned and good, best and bad practices. Although the project generated a high volume of useful information, it would seem that not it has not been properly synthesized and used to produce information products that could shed more light on the law-growth nexus. This would have been a useful and effective mean through which project partners, staff and ILO officials could better understand the findings of the research and contribute to the process of turning the findings into valuable policy advice.

Despite the delay in programme start-up, delayed staff recruitment and limitations in financial resources, the BBW&JC Programme has performed quite well under all immediate objectives of the programme. Notable achievements were reached under all immediate objectives underpinned by the relevance of intervention, staff commitment and innovativeness in terms of fast tracking some key interventions as well as effective backstopping particularly by the ILO Country Office (Lusaka), ILO-DWST (Pretoria) and UNCTAD (Geneva), and effective collaboration of national institutions and collaborating donor partners as well as synergy with their projects. The interaction between the BBW&JC Programme, the ILO Country Office and other ILO-facilitated projects in Zambia was reported to have been good.

Efficiency

- To what extent does the ILO strategy lend itself to efficient implementation?

According to the independent evaluation reports consulted, the main constraint for an efficient implementation of Law-Growth Nexus programme would seem to be related to the ambition and geographical scope of the ILO's interventions. Simultaneously rolling out a programme in several countries while, at the same time, delivering a broad and diverse range of outputs, may potentially undermine the effectiveness and efficiency of the same development intervention in question, especially within a limited-budget setup.

By similar means, the BBWJC programme ended up spreading available financial resources rather thinly across multiple and concurrent work streams, though it made every attempt to match programme operations with work plans and budgets. Towards countering this, the Programme management unit exerted commendable efforts towards leveraging financial resources so as to ensure quality and timely delivery of planned programme outputs. Notable among these included leveraging of financial resources from the AfDB/AMSCO funded, but BBW&JC implemented, project on "*Enhancing Zambia's SME Competitiveness and Access to Finance*" and from the ILO Regular Budget Supplementary Account (RBSA). In addition, the BBW&JC programme implementation team cost-shared support staff positions with the ILO-Labour Law MSME Development Nexus Project which saved the BBW&JC significant amount of financial cost.

Impact and Sustainability

- What impact have ILO actions had on international and national policy, regulatory frameworks, and programmes and enterprise-level performance and practices regarding decent work in sustainable enterprises?
- To what extent have the ILO strategy and means of action been designed and implemented to maximize sustainability of results at the global and country level?

According to the final evaluation, despite the fact that there is no indication that Zambian government has developed and adopted good practices or policy reforms through the Law-Growth Nexus project's interventions, tripartite dialogue workshops on possible policy reforms were held and the project's activities facilitated the dialogue in Zambia.

While difficult to measure, it is assumed that there will be some degree of sustainability to these awareness-raising efforts. It seems likely that the social partners in Zambia will be able to continue their efforts in considering labour law reforms and ensure this topic remains a reform agenda especially thanks to the implementation of second phase of the Labour-Law Nexus project (currently ongoing) by the ILO. The field mission for the mid-term evaluation of Law-Growth

Nexus Phase II concluded that there are good prospects for sustainability of project activities beyond its life subject as long as efforts will be exerted in order to step up capacity building of ILO constituents, formulate a clear and well-articulated business linkage, as well as a financial access and sustainability/exit strategy.

The final evaluation noted that the BBW&JC programme significantly built the capacity of Zambia's national institutions in terms of policy planning, business linkage development and financial access strategies. In terms of contributing to longer term impact, the programme has also performed quite well. Based on the "BBW&JC Impact Assessment Draft Report" (16th October 2011), an estimated 1,634 enterprises or about 20.4% of the original target of 8,000 MSMEs, had been directly and indirectly reached by the Programme across the whole of the country by the time of the final evaluation. The report observed that during the period 2009-2011, annual sales, annual profits and job creation had increased. Despite the BBW&JC's agenda of significantly "*contributing to broad-based wealth and job creation in Zambia through stimulating investment, entrepreneurship and employment creation within the MSME sector*" is still far from being completed, its significant and positive impact will critically contribute to the future sustainability of programme's interventions.

INDONESIA

Background

Although temporarily hampered by the global economic crisis of 2008, the economy of Indonesia has been resilient showing steady growth due to the low external exposure and strong domestic consumption. Between 2007 and 2011, Indonesia's labour force grew by an annual average rate of 2 per cent, or by around 2.2 million. The poverty rate has also declined steadily, from 16.6 per cent in 2007 to 12.5 per cent in 2011, although this share still represents some 30 million people living under the national poverty line.³⁸

According to the ILO Decent Work Country Programme document, the progress made in employment opportunities in the past decade is mixed, notably in the areas of gender, youth and informality. Young workers continue to encounter serious challenges in the labour market especially young women. As formal employment creation stagnated during the global financial crisis, the number of workers employed in the informal economy increased by about 2 million from 2008 to 2009. In a situation where social safety nets are lacking, workers who lose formal wage employment have little alternative than to turn to lower productivity and informal economic activities. Despite the Government's efforts to advance social protection

³⁸ Indonesia DWCP 2012-2015

in Indonesia, a significant proportion of the population still does not have access to basic social protection provisions. Socio-economic exclusion of the marginalized and vulnerable in society is still a continuing concern and, during the last 15 years, much effort has been devoted to increasing the coverage of social security for the benefit of workers and their families, as it can be observed in the rising government expenditure on social security and the increasing percentage of health-care expenditure. Nonetheless, other deficits remain: a sizeable portion of formal employees are still not participating in the public social insurance scheme and programmes to support informal workers are still at an early stage.³⁹ In terms of regional development moreover, the disparity of economic growth rate among the provinces is significant. Java and Sumatra combined accounts for more than 82 per cent of total national GDP.

Strategic framework for sustainable enterprise development policies and initiatives

The backbone of the Indonesian development policy framework, at the national level, is represented by two national development agendas: the Mid-Term and the Long-Term Development Plans. The 2010-2014 National Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMN 2010-2014) is the elaboration of the Vision, Mission, and Program of the current President, the formulation of which is guided by 2005-2025 National Long-Term Development Plan (RPJPN 2005-2025).

The RPJMN 2010-2014 priority on investment and business climate aims at facilitating and expanding business opportunities also through eliminating various levies that have increased the costs of doing business for micro, small and medium enterprises. Various efforts have already been pursued by the government with the goal of improving the business climate, including the amendment of the Law on Regional Taxes and Service Charges. Other steps include action programs to improve the business climate for micro, small, and medium enterprises.

ILO's support framework for Indonesia

ILO's mandate is to promote opportunities for all women and men to obtain decent and productive work in condition of freedom, equity, security and human dignity. The Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) in Indonesia translates the mandate into the ILO contribution towards the achievement of national development strategies such as RPJMN and MP3EI and the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs).

The UNPDF 2011-2015 was prepared to set its overall framework for the UN development cooperation with Indonesia backed up by the Jakarta Commitment in 2009 with its five thematic priorities: Social Services, Sustainable livelihood, Governance, Disaster Resilience and Climate Change and Environment.

³⁹ Indonesia Decent Work Country Profile 2011

The ILO's DWCP 2012-2015 for Indonesia reaffirms the following three priority areas:

- Employment creation for inclusive and sustainable growth;
- Sound industrial relations in the context of effective employment governance;
- Social protection for all.

While the following cross-cutting themes: gender equality, tripartism, green jobs and social dialogue, International labour standards are mainstreamed throughout the DWCP priorities. With regard to enterprise development, the DWCP 2012-2015 pinpoints several outcomes, attached to the broader priority areas, which can directly relate to private sector development and promotion of entrepreneurship, the most relevant is: *“Improved policies and programmes on entrepreneurship, business and cooperative development for job creation including financial inclusion”*.

Within the DWCP 2006–2010 and DWCP 2012-2015 of Indonesia, the employment targets in the medium-term development plan are underpinned by policies and programmes with an emphasis on pro-poor employment growth and enterprise development.

The DWCP 2006-2010 placed considerable emphasis on youth employment, with notable achievements that included the development of curriculum on life skills education training that was adopted, replicated and up-scaled by the Ministry of Education and Culture, the preparation of guidelines for school counselors for promoting successful school-to-work transition, the introduction of “Know about business” into vocational high schools, resulting in students increasingly considering entrepreneurship as a possibility in their career. Research findings demonstrated that coupling entrepreneurship training with vocational skills training doubles the likelihood of finding employment or starting business after training for youth.⁴⁰

Seeking to maximize employment opportunities, the government and social partners, together with the ILO, continue to develop entrepreneurship programmes as well as facilitate and encourage communities to initiate and develop businesses in their localities. The overall aim is to develop micro, small and medium-sized enterprises (MSMEs) and entrepreneurship particularly focusing on disadvantaged communities and empowerment of women entrepreneurship.

In addition, cooperatives, which number over 190,000 in Indonesia, offer another means of boosting economic development and creating decent work opportunities. Given the magnitude, in terms of numbers, the ILO is also supporting initiatives from trade unions and government to develop cooperatives and improve the services for their members. Some strategies for the subject include giving support to APINDO, business development service providers, and relevant government agencies to

⁴⁰ Indonesia DWCP 2012-2015

provide technical assistance and training to MSMEs and young entrepreneurs, supporting initiatives to establish/develop community-based and workers' co-operatives in order to provide better services to their members and improve their ability to access the market and financial services.

ILO Sustainable Enterprise development interventions and means of actions

According to the available evaluations, the ILO has contributed to sustainable enterprise development policies and activities through its interventions in a way that turned out to be relevant to achieving the overall aims of building sustainable enterprises and decent work. The ILO enterprise development strategy in Indonesia appears complementary within both the national and global context and it also promotes some synergies with other national means of actions. Key actions taken:

- Capacity Building and Training: the delivery of several Business Development Services, often tailored on the peculiarities of the industry assessed. It establishes and develops the local capacity of trainers and training institutions, also by supporting the insertion of sustainable entrepreneurship subjects into national educational curricula;
- Tripartite Social Dialogue and Better Workplace Relations: the ILO works to foster the stakeholders' participation and engagement into the national dialogue on the topics of responsible workplace practices and decent work. The interventions, through the systematic assessment of workplace conditions, aim at providing services that lead to major improvements of workplace practices and relations.

In the timespan considered, the means of action have been operationalized in the framework of five technical cooperation projects (see Table 1).

Responsible workplace practices

Workplace improvement increases the productivity of small to medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) while promoting respect for workers' rights. The Sustaining Competitive and Responsible Enterprises project, through demonstrating best international practice in manufacturing and service sectors and helping SMEs to participate in global supply chains, represents ILO's leading means of action. The ILO is assisting Indonesian government agencies, training organizations, employers' organizations, industry associations and trade unions to offer training to enterprises. SCORE's development objective is to support SMEs in becoming more sustainable through being cleaner, more productive and competitive and by providing more sustainable and decent work conditions to their employees. It was conceived as a demand-driven product, more specifically on the employers' side. With some exceptions, SCORE generally responds to the needs and requirements of most of the SMEs, but it needs further tailoring and grounding on local context and

legislation to be more marketable and relevant to SMEs. The final independent evaluation concluded that more demand-side contents are indeed needed.

The rationale for the project and its strategy are both well founded and Indonesia has a need for such an intervention. SCORE addresses key aspects of enterprise management that improve competitiveness, while also improving social dialogue and workplace conditions. It is further relevant as Indonesia has a specific provision for support to SMEs in its development objectives, so that SCORE also supports national priorities. Thanks to the emphasis the programme puts on pro-poor employment growth through enterprise development it directly links to Indonesian DWCP and its medium term development targets.

SCORE has clearly achieved some important results in SMEs. Implementation of the 5S, creation of an Enterprise Improvement Team (EIT) and preparation of an Enterprise Improvement Plan (EIP), knowledge development of the workforce, improved productivity and lower defect rate, generally better working conditions (cleanliness, social aspects) are all visible in the participating SMEs visited by the evaluation field missions. Where the first compulsory SCORE module is passed down to the workforce level there is a major change in management/workers relationship. The current qualitative indicators used by SCORE are not specifically capturing it. Although effectiveness of the project appears to be generally very good for what concerns the module one of the training, overall results vary depending on level of implementation of the five modules, sectors and industries concerned, and the quality/capacity of the trainers, the understanding of the national counterparts, and the support received from the various levels within the ILO. The field mission to Indonesia for the mid-term evaluation concluded that a strong collaboration with the Ministry of Manpower and Transmigration (MOMT) was established in the country at an early stage of the project. This partnership contributed strongly in raising awareness for the project and in establishing further partnerships.

In the mid-term evaluation report it was already noted that one of the major restrictions for SCORE was the delay in the project implementation. By March 2011 only 17.4% of the targeted number of enterprises had been trained in one or more modules. Another weak point that possibly undermined the level of efficiency of the project is the quality of the data collected.

The delays in implementation were seen as mainly due to underestimation of time needed to establish the project. Delay was due to also the initial approach to implement all 5 modules at the same time. The evaluation indicated a strong need to concentrate resources and energy at a global as well as at a local level.

The evaluation found that sustainability is one of the challenges of the project for the next phase. To consider the three levels of sustainability as defined by the project (financial, technical and institutional) requires also a longer time frame, in which a branded product is being marketed to both SMEs and service-providers. This is not yet the case and there is not yet a critical mass (e.g. sufficient number of

participating enterprises) that could ensure project sustainability. In Indonesia SCORE has a vast potential to become a reference for SMEs across the manufacturing world, because the intervention is grounded on essentials and fundamentals of good management and efficient workplace collaboration. Although it has the potential to become a model and expand once it has consolidated its product, the critical question about achieving sustainability in the country is if Ministry of Manpower and Transmigration will comply with its communicated contribution, as there is no contingency plan established that would allow SCORE Indonesia to be sustainable if MOMT does not contribute. The project therefore cannot become sustainable over the current time frame for implementation as it is too short and because SCORE remains a product under development. It is expected however to become sustainable technically, institutionally and financially by the end of the second phase.

Value chain and local economic development

In Indonesia the development of value chains with a particular focus on local economic development aims at *“contributing to poverty reduction and the creation of income earning opportunities, especially for young women and men, through complementary national policies and national initiatives that lead to more employment-intensive growth”* the *“Employment-intensive growth for Indonesia: Job opportunities for young men and women”* project (known as JOY). With its combination of policy and local level interventions JOY was found to be fully supportive of the Indonesian development plan by the final evaluation, and to have also achieved the goal of mainstreaming youth employment in Indonesia’s new Mid Term Development Plan (RPJM 2010-2014) and by revitalizing the I-YEN secretariat. JOY also pushes substantial support to the ILO’s role as the coordinating agency for UNDAF’s sub-outcome on employment creation, employability, entrepreneurship and equal opportunities.

As anticipated before, JOY programme’s design results into a combination of “top down” (policy level) component with a “bottom up” (local level) component. The policy level component sought to mainstream decent and productive employment into national economic and social policies, while the local level components seeks to have youth employment policies and local economic activities implemented in East Java by local representatives of ILO constituents and communities of the area. JOY’s main achievements at the policy level can be summarized as: the achievement of an effective and close-knit collaboration between the private sector and government structures, the establishment of a certification body for eco-tourism and the launching of a Labour Market Development Programme with the University of Padjajaran (UNPAD). At the local level JOY’s interventions mainly resulted into the setting up and operating of two Employment Service Centres. In addition, JOY spearheaded discussions at local level promoting provincial and national endorsement in three important areas of LED, namely waste management, tourism

development and biogas. JOY also produced regular newsletters and commissioned several publications e.g. on the importance of sector planning; a Labour Market Study of the Food and Beverages Manufacturing Sector in Indonesia; a research on the demand and supply of skills in the hotel and tourism sector. Two youth employment conferences were organized in 2009 and 2010, which involved social partners, national, regional and district level partners, as well as donors, representatives from Indonesian universities and youth entrepreneurs groups.

The JOY project was found successful at being a catalyst between local economic players, international development bodies and micro finance institutions with results that went beyond the reach of its budget. In the area of LED for example, JOY achieved considerable progress at very little cost thanks to its capacity at acting as an “opportunity maker”. The project has played a pivotal role in leveraging extra funding for communities involved in LED activities, such as the construction of biogas units or of a Tourism Information Centre. During the final evaluation field mission emerged that JOY has earned itself a very good reputation in Indonesia. Interviewed partners, at national, local and community level, from high-ranking officials to direct beneficiaries explained how the project has been beneficial for the country, the province or the individuals. In the three years of its operation, therefore, the project has left its mark in the institutional scenery of Indonesia and has strengthened the ILO’s reputation and contribution to the promotion of its mission in Indonesia.

With regards to the sustainability of various components, other constraints were still present. The final evaluation concluded that, overall, the withdrawal of the project should go well even if there remains a need for light monitoring, in particular for some of the biggest outcomes such as the revitalisation of the Youth Employment Network or the touristic promotion of the Bromo-Semeru-Tengger National Park.

Entrepreneurial skills development for youth

The dynamics of a modernizing Indonesian economy as well as global and regional economic integration have resulted in a growing youth employment challenge despite improvements in national indicators of educational attainment. In light of this, the ILO, in promoting entrepreneurial skills development activities, has put a particular emphasis on youth. The “*Skills Training for Youth Employment*” project (EAST) represented evolution of more than 10 years of ILO engagement with the Government of Indonesia in the areas of child labor and youth employment.

The EAST project modeled a comprehensive upstream and downstream approach for both preventing early school leaving and expanding quality opportunities for out of school youth to develop skills that improve their employability and productivity in self-employment. The projects relevance and strategic fit towards the national

priorities and the DWCP for Indonesia were assessed as adequate by the mid-term evaluation report.

Through the implementation of entrepreneurship development activities a cadre of trainers in entrepreneurship and business knowledge was developed (or expanded/strengthened). The content of the training in entrepreneurship was based primarily on SIYB, while the business knowledge training was based on the KAB programme. The final evaluation observed that entrepreneur training resources were systematically developed and trainers certified with respect to their level of engagement. EAST was able to capitalize on and expand an already existing network of SIYB and KAB trainers in Indonesia and, as a result, the two product lines have now been disseminated more widely through EAST.

Although the independent evaluator judged the EAST project to be fairly ambitious in both its technical and geographic scope, it managed to achieve substantial results. Its major achievement has been to raise the level of awareness on child labor issues in project areas and to leave behind a strong network of institutions and individuals with excellent knowledge and experience in addressing child labor and youth employment issues in Indonesia. A number of materials were successfully adapted for use in Indonesia and new materials developed in collaboration with EAST partners. Other significant accomplishments included its support to the development of systems and strategies for improving productive self-employment opportunities for youth. Relevant research and policy briefs in the areas of child labour and youth employment were also produced.

The final evaluation acknowledged that EAST interventions were quality initiatives addressing critical issues in the areas of child labor and youth employment, but it also stressed that the much more work would still be required before these practices can be “owned” and incorporated into government actions and become sustainable. Having one or more well defined and tested interventions does not mean that they will necessarily be implemented. According to the final evaluation, the ILO should identify the EAST components where ILO has a comparative advantage and focus on them also by developing and implementing a strategy for promoting these best practices and approaches to decision makers at all levels.

In addition, the EAST project was implemented in an efficient manner with significant logistical challenges due to the distribution of the project sites and implementation in areas of Indonesia where implementing partners tended to have less experience and capacity than in other parts of the country. One of the most noteworthy aspects of EAST was the relatively small staff in comparison to the scope of the project, the size of the quantitative targets and the geographical dispersion of project sites. To the degree possible the project worked through existing structures rather than requiring the creation of new ones. The project capitalized on existing resources such as ILO programmes SIYB and KAB. Perhaps the most glaring resource allocation issue is the lack of allocation to evaluation and assessment at the design stage. The absence of a formal and systematic assessment and review of the

main interventions places serious limits on their contribution beyond providing services to beneficiaries.

Green Jobs

The promotion of the green enterprises as an effective way for achieving sustainable economic and social development was addressed through “*Green Jobs in Asia*” (GJA). It sought to deepen ILO constituents understanding and commitments for the promotion of gender sensitive green jobs opportunities and a just transition for workers and employers towards a low-carbon, climate resilient, environmentally friendly development in participating countries. The immediate objectives of the project are promoting the capacity of ILO constituents to engage in dialogue on green jobs through increased access to reliable sources of data and information, mainstreaming green jobs in national labour and social and implementing green jobs programs in key sectors selected on the basis of research and consultations which respond to the different needs of women and men.

The independent evaluator concluded that the relevance and timeliness of green jobs promotion was widely hailed amongst stakeholders. The ILO constituents consulted during the course of the evaluation universally acknowledged the importance of green jobs for their countries generally, as well as for their own organisations and communities, and were able to clearly explain the centrality of an environmental awareness and focus to various aspects on sustainable economic development and labour dynamics as well. While national governments all have frameworks to global climate change-related agreements, the follow through to relevant policies and practices was generally less concrete. The GJA approach of developing capacity for dialogue, policy development and demonstrations at the practical level was well placed to address some needs, contributing to a foundation understanding and commitment to developing green jobs as a national focus through a range of policies and information products. At national level, the GJA project does not appear to have maximized engagement with other UN agencies with relevant expertise or cross-cutting interests in the topic of green jobs. Similarly the project engaged with few, national non-government organisations in the environmental sector.

The principle capacity building activities carried out by the GJA project were training and information sessions, national conferences and knowledge sharing workshops, and a regional workshop. Mapping studies, documentation of best practices, development and/or translation of training manuals, and video materials produced on various aspects were found to result into strengthened constituents’ and partners’ capacities.

The final evaluation found that most of the sessions on green jobs delivered to employers and workers were not coordinated or synchronized, such that there has not yet been ample dialogue between these partners at the operational level.

The mapping studies were found to be problematic, primarily due to the approach taken. The Community of Practice (COP) portal at the ILO Green Jobs Programme, was judged to be a solid repository of information. The final evaluation found that some evidence of adoption of green jobs concept in plans, policies and processes. In Indonesia, a strategic plan for tourism and green jobs was launched (September 2012) and took action to formulate policies based on the synergies recognized between their youth employment and environmental priorities, under the umbrella of “eco-preneur” development. All these examples are indicative of a reasonable degree of mainstreaming both with government and social partners.

Promoting green jobs at a policy level can be seen from the integration of green jobs in the Decent Work Country Programs. In Indonesia, where there was disparity in stakeholders’ views about the types of industries to pursue and the value and feasibility of greening industries or the economy, the evaluator concluded that the brief timeframe was not effective in terms of the creation of green jobs. Eco tour guides and homestay operators were provided diverse and practical training, such as cooking, souvenir-making, cooperative strengthening and financial management, and prepared industrial and competency standard for green homestays as well as training modules.

According to the final evaluation, the GJA project had realistic and appropriate objectives, but an ambitious timeframe and wide area to cover with the resources available. In addition to that, it seems that the ILO’s definition of Green Jobs is yet to be fully understood and realized throughout the region and relevant stakeholders cannot always distinguish “green jobs” from more general “green economy” topics.

The delay in project start-up and recruitment of key personnel had an effect through the life of a project, with delays in dialogue, decision-making, and achievements against objectives. Some difficulties in the research and documentation aspects of the project can be attributed in part to the centralized approach taken to mapping studies at the outset of the project. Recognized national experts were engaged as resource persons to assist with key activities, improving the quality and efficiency of project implementation. The evaluator however, stressed substantive monitoring and documentation are areas requiring greater resources and a higher level of responsibility. Overall green jobs baseline data and information still require strengthening. Use of the resources and knowledge generated sustainability of dialogue and continued assistance in the form of further trainings, strengthening partnerships among constituents, as well as strong leadership at management level.

As recommended by the final evaluation moreover, ILO and partners would need to enhance synergies between green jobs and other global discussions, such as green economy, increasing the collaboration with other UN agencies. ILO’s efforts to engage diverse ministries and agencies has begun through GJA, yet the ILO constituents would find it easier to incorporate the new concept into the work they have already engaged in, if green jobs is synergized with other programmes, or if more parties were aware of green jobs.

It is yet to be determined whether the ILO has a comparative advantage in delivering highly technical interventions aiming at “greening” business. It could argued that a greater level of efficiency would be reached if the ILO was to team up with other relevant UN agencies leaving to different actors the most technical features.

INDONESIA-- Project portfolio

XB Symbol	Project Title	Project Status	Start Date	End Date	Allocations
GLO/09/53/SWI	Global Sustaining Competitive and Responsible Enterprises	Active	May-09	Mar-13	1,270,402
GLO/10/52/NAD	Sustaining Competitive and Responsible Enterprises II, Global SCORE II	Active	Jul-10	Dec-13	1,591,167
INS/06/50/NET	Employment-intensive growth for Indonesia: Job opportunities for young men and women (JOY)	Financially Closed	Mar-07	Apr-10	2,800,000
INS/06/15/NET	Education and Skills Training for Youth Employment (EAST)	Financially Closed	Sep-08	Oct-11	22,700,000
RAS/10/50/AUS	Green Jobs in Asia	Active	Aug-10	Dec-12	2,619,300

ANNEX 5. SUSTAINABLE ENTERPRISES PROJECT PORTFOLIO (2007-2012)

Region	XB Symbol	Project Title	Allocations (US\$)
Africa	CVI/10/02/UND	Programme pour l'emploi des jeunes et la cohesion sociale	40,380
Africa	ETH/06/01/AGF	Economic Empowerment of Women and Youth through Cooperatives in Ethiopia	34,283
Africa	ETH/06/02/IRL	Developing Women Entrepreneur Associations' Membership Bases	52,379
Africa	ETH/10/50/UND	Edible Oil Value Chain Enhancement	782,170
Africa	ETH/11/03/CEF	Diagnostic study for the implementation of access to financial services for low income women households and entrepreneurs in Ethiopia	100,000
Africa	ETH/12/50/ITA	Mekelle Prison Cooperatives	645,301
Africa	ETH/12/51/ITA	Organization for Women in Self Employment (WISE)	221,365
Africa	GHA/08/50/DAN	Decent work and local development through dialogue and partnership building	1,509,009
Africa	GHA/09/50/SWI	Sustaining Competitive and Responsible Enterprises in Ghana	514,506
Africa	GHA/10/50/NAD	Sustaining Competitive and Responsible Enterprises II, GHANA SCORE II	223,062
Africa	GLO/08/59/NAD	Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality	437,552
Africa	MLI/07/02/LUX	Programme d'appui à l'insertion des jeunes	2,113,775
Africa	MLI/07/50/FRG	Programme d'appui à la création des moyennes et petites entreprises	680,671
Africa	MOZ/08/56/UND	Strengthening cultural and creative industries and inclusive policies in Mozambique	705,373
Africa	MOZ/09/50/OUF	Support to Decentralization and Integrated Local Development	488,041
Africa	RAF/06/53/UKM	Cooperative Facility for Africa	9,357,638
Africa	RAF/10/09/NAD	Law-Growth Nexus II: Labour Law and the Enabling Business Environment for SMEs in Kenya and Zambia	2,378,735
Africa	RAF/10/50/DAN	Africa Commission: Youth Entrepreneurship Facility, ILO Component	11,691,290
Africa	RAF/12/50/IRL	Women's entrepreneurship development and economic empowerment	1,521,766
Africa	RWA/11/01/OUF	ONE UN Programme Rwanda	892,738
Africa	SAF/07/51/FLA	Social Entrepreneurship targeting youth in South Africa	1,246,640
Africa	SAF/09/50/SWI	Sustaining Competitive and Responsible Enterprises in South Africa	599,736
Africa	SAF/10/01/FCA	Employment creation through Small and Medium Scale Enterprise (SME) development	5,965,308
Africa	SAF/10/02/MUL	Promotion of Decent Work in the South African Transport Sector (phase I)	1,275,714
Africa	SAF/11/01/FCA	Public procurement and social economy	840,000
Africa	SEN/06/01/SEN	Promotion de l'entreprenariat rural -PROMER phase II	519,343
Africa	SUD/11/03/UND	Stabilization and Early Reintegration Support for Returnees in South Sudan.	900,000
Africa	UGA/03/01/SID	Investing in Business Information Services: Developing radio programming and journalism targeting small businesses in Uganda	879,610
Africa	URT/07/01/AGF	Women and youth employment through improved beekeepers organisation and beekeeping techniques	143,345
Africa	ZAM/06/01/AGF	Promoting economic empowerment of rural women through membership based association	82,807
Africa	ZAM/12/01/FIN	UN Joint Programme on Enhancing Competitiveness and Sustainable Business among MSMEs in the Building Construction Industry in Zambia & Inception Phase	1,328,021
Arab States	IRQ/12/02/UNE	Expansion of the KAB programme in Kurdistan targeting students enrolled in vocational education institutes and unemployed youth graduates of TVET	111,511
Arab States	JOR/03/006/01	SUPPORT BUSINESS TRAIN.FOR ENT.PHASE II	-

Arab States	JOR/11/01/BDC	Entrepreneurship Education, Know About Business/KAB in the National Company for Employment and Training	74,467
Arab States	JOR/12/03/JOR	Introduction of Know About Business at the Development and Employment Fund	49,261
Arab States	PAL/08/01/UND	Entrepreneurship Education: introduction of KAB in vocational and technical training in Palestine.	199,987
Arab States	PAL/11/50/KUW	Entrepreneurship Education: Nationalization of the Know About Business	161,156
Arab States	PAL/12/01/WAS	Nationalization of the Know About Business	120,000
Arab States	PAL/95/06/KUW	Training of Palestinian Contractors	142,134
Arab States	SAU/10/01/SAU	KAB at National Entrepreneurship Institute 'RIYADAH' Saudi Arabia	173,892
Arab States	YEM/08/01/SFD	Entrepreneurship education - Know about business	220,887
Arab States	YEM/10/01/SFD	Women Entrepreneurship Development Programme in Yemen	83,595
Asia and the Pacific	CMB/08/50/UND	Creative industries support programme in Cambodia	921,868
Asia and the Pacific	CPR/06/04/SWI	Corporate social responsibility in the Chinese textile industry	354,638
Asia and the Pacific	CPR/08/51/UND	ILO component of the Culture and development cluster	468,927
Asia and the Pacific	CPR/09/50/UND	Protecting and promoting the rights of China's vulnerable migrants	1,623,544
Asia and the Pacific	CPR/09/53/SWI	Sustaining Competitive and Responsible Enterprises China	484,202
Asia and the Pacific	PHI/08/02/FIN	Support to Poverty Reduction and Promotion of Human Rights among the Indigenous Peoples in the Municipality of Lake Sebu, Province of South Cotabato (Phase III)	232,246
Asia and the Pacific	PHI/08/51/UND	Strengthening the Philippines capacity to adapt to climate change	600,000
Asia and the Pacific	RAS/10/50/AUS	Green Jobs in Asia	2,619,300
Asia and the Pacific	RAS/10/58/AUS	Pacific Growth and Employment Plans Project	841,566
Asia and the Pacific	RAS/11/50/JPN	Greener Business Asia - ILO/Japan Multi-bi Programme	288,913
Asia and the Pacific	RAS/11/57/JPN	Greener Business Asia II	448,510
Asia and the Pacific	RAS/12/51/JPN	Way out of informality: facilitating formalization of informal economy in South Asia	1,441,136
Asia and the Pacific	RAS/13/51/JPN	Way out of informality: facilitating formalisation of informal economy in South Asia	397,360
Asia and the Pacific	RAS/13/52/JPN	Greener Business Asia II - Multi-bi 2013 contribution from MoHLW	41,567
Asia and the Pacific	TIM/10/02/IRL	Business Opportunities and Support Services (BOSS)	6,517,695
Asia and the Pacific	VIE/04/01/SID	Poverty Reduction through Integrated Small Enterprise Development	563,390
Asia and the Pacific	VIE/08/01/SID	Poverty Reduction through Integrated Small Enterprise Development: Phase2	213,062
Asia and the Pacific	VIE/09/02/OUF	Youth Employment through Local Economic Development in Quang Nam Province	1,476,000
Asia and the Pacific	VIE/09/53/UND	Joint Programme on Green Production and Trade to Increase Income and Employment Opportunities for the Rural Poor	758,630
Asia and the Pacific	VIE/10/01/LUX	Strengthening of in-land tourism in Quang Nam, Vietnam	1,350,000
Asia and the Pacific	VIE/10/50/NAD	Sustaining Competitive and Responsible Enterprises II Viet Nam (SCORE II)	494,177
European	RUS/06/03/UND	Training of trainers on SIYB	33,950
European	RUS/08/01/HSF	Sustainable integration and recovery in North ossetia-Alania	324,898
Global	GLO/08/56/IRL	WEDGE Headquarters	231,116
Global	GLO/09/53/SWI	Global Sustaining Competitive and Responsible Enterprises	1,270,402

Global	GLO/10/07/ITA	Promotion of Responsible and Sustainable Business Practices through Business Education	99,999
Global	GLO/10/52/NAD	Sustaining Competitive and Responsible Enterprises II, Global SCORE II	1,591,167
Global	GLO/11/13/COO	Score Project Supplier Training	13,377
Global	GLO/11/63/IRL	Women's entrepreneurship development and economic empowerment	380,441
Global	GLO/12/41/NOR	Global Product Green Jobs - Norway PCA 2012-13	338,565
Global	INT/02/33/ITA	Sustainable Development through the Global Compact	882,410
Global	INT/05/04/EEC	Strengthening the creative Industries in five selected ACP countries	170,536
Global	INT/06/09/DSF	Cooperating for Peace: Assessing the role of cooperatives in post-conflict recovery	5,070
Global	RAF/07/07/CAN	Entrepreneurship Education - Know about Business in the Broader Middle East and North Africa Region	2,040,661
Global	SAF/10/50/NAD	Sustaining Competitive and Responsible Enterprises II, South Africa SCORE II	350,515
Americas	BOL/09/53/UND	Integración de Productores Andinos Indígenas a Nuevas Cadenas de Valor Nacionales y Mundiales	428,000
Americas	BRA/11/51/FLA	Ending Forced Labour, Generating Green Jobs: an approach for the promotion of social inclusiveness and sustainable development in Brazil	475,000
Americas	CHI/10/01/CHI	Trabajo Decente en las Empresas de Menor Tamaño	208,890
Americas	COL/09/50/SWI	Sustaining Competitive and Responsible Enterprises in Colombia	526,119
Americas	COL/10/50/NAD	Sustaining Competitive and Responsible Enterprises II (SCORE II Colombia)	223,060
Americas	COS/09/50/UND	Developing competitiveness for the Brunca region in the tourism and agro-industry sectors with emphasis on creation of green, decent employment for reducing poverty" (INT/07/21/UND UNDP-Spain MDGA Funds)	1,279,283
Americas	DOM/09/50/UND	Fortalecimiento de la cadena de valor del banano mediante el crecimiento de mercados inclusivos	458,992
Americas	HON/08/50/UND	Creativity and cultural identity for local development	498,617
Americas	PER/10/50/UND	Industrias Creativas inclusivas: Una herramienta innovadora para el alivio de la pobreza en el Peru	518,765
Americas	RLA/09/01/IDR	Research and develop of ICT based training methodologies for SMES	280,203
Americas	RLA/11/02/IDR	Competencies for Central American SMEs in the Knowledge-Based Economy	116,322

ANNEX 6. WORKS CITED

Zambia

Living Conditions Survey III, Central Statistical Office, Lusaka, 2004

Zambia Decent Work Country Programme 2007-2011

World Urbanization Prospects

Private Sector Development Reform Programme II; Government of Zambia; Programme Document; December 2009

Law-Growth Nexus Phase II: Labour Law and the Enabling Business Environment for MSMEs in Kenya and Zambia; Internal Mid-Term Evaluation Report

Law-Growth Nexus. A Mapping of Labour Law and Micro and Small Enterprise (MSE) Development; Final Evaluation Report

Broad-Based Wealth and Job Creation in Zambia: Economic Empowerment through MSME Development; Final Evaluation Report

Indonesia

Indonesia Decent Work Country Programme 2012-2015

Indonesia Decent Work Country Programme 2006-2010

Indonesia Decent Work Country Profile

National Medium Term Development Plan 2010-2014

Regulation of the President of Indonesia number 05/2010

SCORE Mid-Term Evaluation Report

SCORE Final Evaluation Report

SCORE Phase I project document

SCORE Phase II project document

JOY Final Evaluation Report

JOY Mid-Term Evaluation Report
EAST Mid-Term Evaluation Report
EAST Final Evaluation Report
GJA Mid-Term Evaluation Report
GJA Final Evaluation Report

East Africa

Kenya Decent Work Country Programme 2013-2016 (final draft)
Tanzania Decent Work Country Programme 2013-2016 (final draft)
YEF Phase II Project Document
YEF Phase I Mid-Term Evaluation Report
YEF Phase I Final Evaluation Report
WEDEE Project Document
COOPAFRICA IMPACT ASSESSMENT TANZANIA
THE IMPACT OF COOP^{AFRICA} ON COOPERATIVE DEVELOPMENT IN KENYA
COOPAFRICA Mid-Term Evaluation Report

General

Coop Africa 2012 Cooperative Enterprise - Build a Better World, ILO, Geneva.
Coop Africa Self-Evaluation for the DFID Phase 1 October 2007 – December 2010
Develtere, P. Pollet, I. and Wanyama, F. (Eds) 2008 Cooperating out of Poverty- The Renaissance of the African Cooperative Movement. ILO, Geneva.
Dr. Chi, Do Quynh. 2012 International Labour Organisation (ILO): Employee Participation in Viet Nam. Working Paper No.42, 1st Edition. Geneva.

Global Product 2010 Improving Working Conditions and Safety, Skills and Productivity.

Hagazy, F. Enabling Environment for Sustainable Enterprises. ILO.

Hagen Henry, 2012, Guidelines for Cooperative Legislation 3rd Edition ILO Geneva.

Harsdoff, M., Lieuw-Kie-Song, M., Tsukamoto, M. 2011 Employment Sector; Employment Working Paper No.104; Towards an ILO approach to climate change adaptation. ILO. Geneva.

Henry, C., Engelhardt, A., Standa, A. 2011 Decent Work Results and Effectiveness of ILO Operations: A meta-analysis of project evaluations 2009-2010. 1st Edition. ILO. Geneva.

International Labour Office (ILO) & International Training Centre (ITC). Green Jobs: Linking environment, Climate Change and the World of Work; Green Jobs Training; Distance Learning Handbook.

International Labour Office (ILO). 2006 Famos Check Guide and Methods; Female and male operated small enterprises; A gender-based service quality check for small enterprises. ILO. Geneva.

International Labour Office (ILO). 2008 Strategy on promoting women's entrepreneurship Development; Committee on Employment and Social Policy. Geneva.

International Labour Office (ILO). 2008 Voices of Women Entrepreneurs in Tanzania; ILO in Partnership with Irish Aid.

International Labour Conference (ILC). (2013) Sustainable development, decent work and green jobs. 1st ed. 102nd Session. ILO. Geneva.

International Labour Office (ILO). 2010 The Sustainable Enterprise Programme; Strategic Framework. Geneva. ILO.

International Labour Office (ILO). 2012 Independent Evaluation of The ILO's Sector – Specific approach to Decent Work. 1st Edition. ILO. Geneva.

International Labour Office (ILO). 2012 Sustaining Competitive and Responsible Enterprises (SCORE) South Africa – Final Internal Evaluation. ILO.

International Labour Office (ILO). 2012 The ILO at Work; Development Results 2010-2011. 1st Edition, Geneva.

International Labour Office (ILO). 2013 Making the ILO Sustainable Enterprise Strategy framework actionable in Southern and Eastern Africa; Promoting Decent work for all.

International Labour Office (ILO). 2013 Sustainable Development, Decent Work and Green Jobs; International Labour Conference, 1st edition, Geneva.

International Labour Office (ILO). (no date) Cooperative Facility for Africa, COOP Africa Self-evaluation report on the DFID funded Phase 1 (Oct.2007 – Dec. 2010).

International Labour Office (ILO). (no date) Know about Business (KAB); Entrepreneurship Education for Secondary, Vocational and Higher Education.

International Labour Office (ILO). (no date) Sustainable Enterprises; Creating more and better jobs. ILO. Geneva.

International Labour Office (ILO) 2012. Independent Evaluation of The ILO's Strategy for Integrating Inclusive Employment Policies. ILO Geneva.

International Labour Office (ILO) Sweden Partnership 2012 Technical Cooperation outcome based report.

International Labour Office (ILO) Women's Entrepreneurship Development; Encouraging women entrepreneurs for jobs and development.

International Labour Office (ILO). 2012 Policy Guidelines for Results-Based Evaluation: Principles, Rational Planning and Managing for Evaluations, 1st Edition, ILO: Geneva.

International Labour Organisation (ILO), International Training Centre (ITC); International Training of Trainers Forum. Italy.

International Labour Organisation (ILO), The Directors – General's; Programme and Budget Proposals for 2014-15.

International Labour Office (ILO) Geneva (no date) Capacity building for contracting in employment intensive infrastructure programmes. ILO. Italy.

International Labour Organisation (ILO) Asia-Pacific Knowledge Network on Green Jobs (Green Jobs-AP), Asian Decent work Decade 2006 – 2015; An Asian Decent Work Decade Knowledge Network.

International Labour Organisation (ILO) Asia-Pacific Knowledge Network on Industrial Relations (AP-IR Net). Asian Decent work Decade 2006 – 2015; An Asian Decent Work Decade Knowledge Network.

International Labour Organisation (ILO) Asia-Pacific Knowledge Network on Youth Employment (APYouthNet). Asian Decent work Decade 2006 – 2015; An Asian Decent Work Decade Knowledge Network.

International Labour Organisation (ILO) Knowledge Management and Communities of Peace, Asian Decent Work Decade 2006 – 2015; An Asian Decent Work Decade Knowledge Network.

International Labour Organisation (ILO). A Selection of information tools developed by the ILO.

International Labour Organisation (ILO); ILO/ Japan Multi-Bilateral Programme. (no date) Way out of INFORMALITY Facilitating formalization of informal economy in south Asia. Decent work Decade 2006 – 2015; An Asian Decent Work Decade Knowledge Network.

International Training Centre (ITC) (no date) Know About Business; Entrepreneurship Education for Secondary, Vocational and Higher Education. ILO.

International Training Centre (ITC) (no date) International Training for trainers Forum. ILO. Italy.

International Training Centre (ITC). (no date) Green Jobs; linking environment, climate change and the world of work. Green Jobs Training; Distance learning Handbook. ILO.

Mackie, G. 2012 Technical Cooperation; Final Progress Report (FPR), ILO.

My.Coop; Managing you agriculture cooperative. UPM.

Pardev. 2012 Cooperation Results Overview, ILO – Flanders

Simpson, J. Women's Entrepreneurship Development. International Labour Office (ILO).

The Magazine of the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP). 2012 Our Planet. Kenya.

United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP) Green Economy Report; A Preview.

United Nations Environmental Programme (UNEP). 2012 Measuring Progress towards an Inclusive Green Economy.

United Nations Environmental Programme (UNEP). 2012, Global Environment Outlook5; Summary for Policy Makers. Malta.

United Nations Environmental Programme (UNEP). 2012, Year Book; Emerging Issues In Our Global Environment.

United Nations Environmental Programme (UNEP). 2011, Towards a Green Economy: Pathways to sustainable Development and Poverty Eradication – A Synthesis for Policy Makers, France.

South Africa

Analytical framework of the Decent Work Country Programme for South Africa; with particular emphasis on outcome 4 (sustainable enterprises create decent jobs).

Atkinson, D. (2012) South Africa SME Observatory; Review of the efficiency and effectiveness of the past and on-going SME development initiatives in the Free State. Report 2: Literature Review. ILO. Switzerland.

Bulletin (2013) For Business and development in the Free State.

Call for proposals (no date) BDS Provider Challenge fund.

Dr Mostert, A., & Villiers de, N. (2012) South Africa SME Observatory; An Analysis of the Supply and Demand of Products and Services to Nurture and Culture of Entrepreneurship amongst the Youth and the Free State Province. ILO. The Detea. Switzerland.

Free State SME Development (2013) Promoting business creating jobs. ILO. The Detea.

Greyling, E. (2012) South Africa SME Observatory; Opportunities for Employment Creation through SME Development in the Construction Sector, Free State. ILO. The Detea. Switzerland.

Industry Energy Efficiency improvement project in South Africa. (no date) Moving towards a more energy efficient industry; creating skills and strengthening capacities. Government and private sector working together for a better future.

International Labour Organisation (ILO) (2011) Decent Work Country Programme for Swaziland 2010 to 2014. ILO.

International Labour Organisation (ILO) (2011) Decent Work Country Programme for Namibia 2010 to 2014. ILO.

International Labour Organisation (ILO) (no date) Fact sheet Mozambique. Sweden.

International Labour Organisation (ILO) (no date) Fact sheet South Africa. Sweden

International Labour Organisation (ILO) (no date) Fact sheet Tanzania. Sweden.

International Labour Organisation (ILO) (no date) Fact sheet Zambia. Sweden

International Labour Organisation (ILO) (no date) Fact sheet Zimbabwe. Sweden.

International Labour Organisation (ILO). (2007) Minute Guide for Young Jobseekers. ILO. Switzerland.

International Labour Organisation (ILO). (2010) Decent Work Country Programme for South Africa 2010 to 2014. ILO.

International Labour Organisation (ILO). (2011) Republic of Botswana; Decent Work Country Programme for Botswana 2011 to 2015. ILO.

International Labour Organisation (ILO). (2012) Growing Sustainable Women's Enterprises; A series of Case Studies from the International Labour Organisations Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality – Southern Africa Project. Switzerland.

International Labour Organisation (ILO). (2012) Sustaining Competitive and Responsible Enterprises (SCORE) South Africa – Final Internal Evaluation.

International Labour Organisation (ILO). (no date) Fact sheet Malawi. Sweden.

International Labour Organisation (ILO). (no date) Green entrepreneurship: Creating green jobs through sustainable enterprise development.

International Labour Organisation (ILO). (no date) Green Jobs in Namibia: Opportunities for job creation in the green economy.

International Labour Organisation (ILO). (no date) PRO 169; Promoting and Implementing the Rights of Indigenous People in Africa: The case of Namibia. ILO.

International Labour Organisation (ILO). (no date) Women's Entrepreneurship Development; Encouraging Women Entrepreneurs for Jobs and Development.

International Labour Organisation (ILO). Newsletter; April 2013, Country Office for Botswana, Namibia, Lesotho, Swaziland and South Africa; Decent Work for Team for Eastern and Southern Africa.

International Labour Organisation (ILO). Newsletter; February 2013, Country Office for Botswana, Namibia, Lesotho, Swaziland and South Africa; Decent Work for Team for Eastern and Southern Africa. ILO.

International Labour Organisation (ILO). Newsletter; May 2012, Country Office for Botswana, Namibia, Lesotho, Swaziland and South Africa; Decent Work for Team for Eastern and Southern Africa. ILO.

Kuoni. (2012) Assessing Human Rights Impacts; Kenya Pilot Project Report.

Making It. (2011) Industry for Development; Governing a globalised world.

MBB Consulting Services (South) (PTY) Ltd. (2012) South Africa SME Observatory; Analysis of value- chain upgrading opportunities for the creation of employment in the agribusiness sector in Mangaung and Matjhabeng municipalities. ILO. Geneva. Switzerland.

Naidoo, M. (2012) South Africa SME Observatory, Position paper – opportunities and constraints for development of the tourism sector in Mangaung and Matjhabeng Municipalities. ILO. The Detea. Switzerland.

Ntema, L. (2012) South Africa SME Observatory, Review of the Efficiency and Effectiveness of past and ongoing Development Initiatives in the Free State province. Report 4: Annotated Bibliography. ILO. The Detea. Switzerland.

Promoting Decent Work For All (no date) Making the ILO sustainable enterprise strategy framework actionable in Southern and Eastern Africa. ILO.

Promoting Decent Work For All (no date) Towards a Unified project management information system in Southern and Eastern Africa. SCIFORMA.

SADC Regional centre for renewable energy and energy efficiency (SACREEE). (no date) Project Overview.

Schenk, C., Blaauw, D., Viljoen, K. (2012) South Africa SME Observatory; Unrecognised Waste Management Experts; Challenges and Opportunities for Small Business Development and Decent Job Creation in the Waste Sector in the Free State. ILO.

The Free State Enterprise Job Creation Challenge. (no date) Promoting job creation through innovation, Entrepreneurship and SME Development in the Free State.

Urban-Econ. (2012) South Africa SME Observatory, An analysis of the Coordination and Collaboration between SME Development Programs in the Free State. Collaboration Study. ILO. The Detea. Switzerland.

Venter, A. (2012) South Africa SME Observatory; Review of the efficiency and effectiveness of the past and on-going SME development initiatives in the Free State province, Field work; A case study of the Manguang Metropolitan Municipality and the Matjhabeng local Municipality. ILO. Switzerland.

Ventre, A. (2012) South Africa SME Observatory, Review of the efficiency and the effectiveness of past and ongoing SME development initiatives in Free State Province. Report 1: Synthesis Report. ILO. The Detea. Geneva. Switzerland

Villiers de, R., Nelson, R.E. Christensen, D. J. (2013) Start Up & go; Entrepreneurship Education Grade 10. Teachers Guide. ILO. The Detea. Switzerland.