



Evaluation Summaries

Evaluation: Creating Jobs: Capacity building for local resource-based road works in selected districts in NAD and Nias

Quick Facts

Country: Indonesia

Mid-Term Evaluation: May 2007

Mode of Evaluation: Independent

Technical Area: Employment

Evaluation Management: ILO Jakarta Office

Evaluation Team: Eddy Bynens

Project Start: 28 March 2006

Project End: 31 March 2008

Project Code: INS/51/071/B01/11

Donor: Multi-Donor Trust Fund for Aceh and Nias (MDF) via UNDP (US\$6.42 million)

Keywords: Employment creation, Capacity Building, Road construction

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

The project was aimed at contributing to the restoration of rural livelihoods and communities affected by the tsunami disaster in NAD and Nias. District governments and small scale contractors in project areas were supported to adopt and undertake local resource-based road works thereby providing access to socio-economic centres and creating job opportunities for rural people.

Present situation of project

At mid-term the project is expected to be largely successful in achieving its objectives.

Purpose, scope and objectives of the evaluation

The evaluation is an independent evaluation undertaken at midterm, i.e., one year after the start of this two-year project, as provided for in the project document. The evaluation fulfils the requirement of ILO, UNDP, Government of Indonesia, and the MDF. Further, it is to engage these organizations in a dialogue on the expansion of the project into new districts, after the ending of the current project in March 2008.

Methodology of evaluation

ILO Jakarta served as the secretariat to the evaluation team. The International Programme Officer in the ILO Jakarta Office acted as the evaluation manager. The evaluation mission started with one day of consultations in Jakarta, meeting with ILO and UNDP representatives. One week was spent in the Aceh cluster and another week on Nias, examining project documents, visiting project roads and meeting project staff, partners and beneficiaries.

At the end of the mission the Evaluation Manager with the support from the Project team organized the Project Steering Committee where initial findings and recommendations were discussed. After the mission first a draft and then a final report are to be produced.

Main Findings & Conclusions

It can reasonably be expected that at the end of the project 95 km of roads will have been rehabilitated or improved to a good quality standard. Training of Kimpraswil staff already exceeded the targets, training of contractors is progressing well, and the addition of Mobile Construction Trainers is having a major impact on the on-the-job training of

contractors' and Kimpraswil staff. The training was much appreciated by the project partners, and resulted in improved quality of the road works executed. Improving techniques, standards, systems and strategies for local resource based road construction is ongoing and the main results in this area are to be expected during the second year of the project. Community participation will further improve when the use of the Integrated Rural Accessibility Planning (IRAP) will be expanded.

The project's strategy was relevant at the time of formulation and remains valid. Recommendations formulated below are mainly intended to fine tune activities in order to improve results.

Indicators that were not fully achieved are: length of roads rehabilitated and employment created. Within the approved budget, the target of 130 km will have to be reduced to 95 km as cost per km is higher than expected by 10% in the Aceh cluster and by 40% in the Nias cluster. Employment created will probably be less than half the estimated 325,000 worker days.

The mission found that the main reason for the shortfalls was due to the fact that almost all the roads selected for rehabilitation were major district roads that had been bitumen surfaced before, or required bitumen surfacing. However, another important category of roads in the project area are gravel roads. It is with gravel roads that the ILO had more experience and it is therefore recommended for the expansion phase, to provide capacity building in both types of roads: gravel and bitumen surfaced. The recommendation is to use half of the construction budget on each type of road. The advantage would be that the cost per kilometre would come down and would be more in line with the project's original estimate of USD 33,000/km. This would allow improving more kilometres of roads and thus providing more villages with access. Since gravel roads are more labour intensive, the employment created could be increased to levels targeted by the project document.

Another set of indicators that have not been fully met are the gender equality indicators. The 30% target of training female staff of Kimpraswil (10% only) and of contractors' staff (0%) was not achieved. Women employed in the works are so far only 13.7% (Aceh cluster 7%, Nias cluster 29%), also well below the 30% target. Much more can and needs to be done in this area.

Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Main recommendations and follow-up

For the next phase the project's management structure should be reinforced with a CTA based in Banda Aceh. In addition, it is suggested for the next phase, the project should provide capacity building in both road construction techniques: bitumen surfaced roads and gravel roads, using about half of the construction budget on each type of road. Roads selected should include district and main village roads.

In order to improve gender equality a small survey could be done to find out in which conditions women could accept to work on construction sites and some conditions that work in other countries could be tested.

The ILO should explore the possibility to conclude a partner agency agreement with the World Bank or find another way to work directly with the World Bank rather than working through the UNDP as this creates unnecessary transaction costs and delays.

During the next phase, the project should gradually turn over training activities to a local organisation. For the next phase, aspects such as maintenance, employment, gender, environment and community participation should be reinforced.

Since this is a capacity building project and capacity building takes time it is recommended for the project to continue its activities in the actual five districts for an additional three years. During the three years in the proposed expansion phase the project should apply an exit strategy whereby all project activities should gradually be turned over to local organisations and sustainability achieved.

Important lessons learned

Project design

The dynamic of post crisis and transition into development requires a shift from reconstruction and physical outputs to building capacity.

Project objectives:

Capacity building projects are usually small compared to other projects and their physical output is limited. But even so some partners and some staff come to see the physical output as the most important part of the project. It is important to keep in mind during formulation, execution and evaluation that building capacity in the government and private sector by training men and women, by establishing effective sustainable procedures, is more important than producing a few kilometres of road.

Sustainability:

Achieving sustainability and a meaningful long term impact is difficult in the context of a two-year project. Often an additional phase is necessary to consolidate the achievements.

Gender equality promotion:

The difficulty of gender equality promotion is often underestimated. It requires staff that has experience, that is proactive, that can adapt proven methods from other countries to the project area in an imaginative and sensitive way. It is not enough to set targets for engineers to achieve.

Training:

Skills training is an important element for successful project implementation. This project has shown that the use of Mobile Construction Trainers for on the job training is a good practice that should be further replicated.