



Evaluation Summaries

Evaluation: National Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour in Yemen

Quick Facts

Country: Yemen

Final Evaluation: July 2005

Mode of Evaluation: independent

Technical Area: Child Labour

Evaluation Management: Rights and Standards Sector

Evaluation team: An international external consultant with national consultant

Project Start: December 2000

Project End: August 2005

Project Code: YEM/00/50/USA

Donor: United States (US\$ 1,400,000)

Key words: child labour, plan of action, sustainable development, tripartism, social dialogue, access to education, education policy, rehabilitation, vocational training, labour inspection, awareness raising, media, Islamic country, capacity building, institution building

Background & Context

The project follows the IPEC Country Programme approach which is based on a multi-sectoral, multi-partner and multi-level approach consisting of a number of phases and elements which are seen to be key elements of an effective country programme and which supports building a foundation for action against child labour.

As the ultimate goal is to achieve sustainability, the country programme aims to integrate child labour issues into the agenda of key ministries, employers', and workers' organizations and NGOs. In Yemen, the tripartite programme set-up, a basic approach of

ILO, links the Ministry of Social Affairs and Labour with the General Federation of Workers' Trade Union and the Federation of Chamber of Commerce and Industry. A National Steering Committee with these members was installed at the beginning in order to orientate the programme and was later enlarged to other partners.

Throughout the first phase of this programme, thirteen Action Programmes (AP) have been developed with eight different partners in Yemen. The APs were to mainstream child labour issues in Yemen and were strategically linked to the programme's development and immediate objectives:

Development Objective: The programme will contribute to the elimination of exploitative child labour in Yemen

Immediate Objectives:

1. By the end of the programme, the Government of Yemen will have developed a National Policy and Programme Framework to combat the worst forms of child labour, and have taken concrete measures toward harmonizing its child labour and education legislation with international standards.
2. At the end of the programme, the country capacity has been strengthened to withdraw children from hazardous work, monitor workplaces and provide social protection through training for staff of relevant partners and the development of partnerships at the national level and in selected sectors and areas.
3. At the end of the project, at least 3,000 working children in 3 selected sectors and

regions will have been withdrawn from the worst forms of child labour, rehabilitated and placed into an education or vocational programme.

4. At the end of the programme, employers, families, national/local authorities, communities and the general public are aware of the problem of child labour and its negative consequences and are mobilized to take action against it.

Evaluation Context: The evaluation assessed whether the objectives of the project were achieved by comparing the intended outputs with the actual outputs. In addition, it assessed the overall impact of the project at different levels such as effectiveness, efficiency, relevance and sustainability. It formulated recommendations based on findings from the evaluation process and the lessons learned discussed during the final workshop in August 2005 in Sana'a.

Information was gathered through the analyses of technical progress reports, status reports, the mid-term evaluation report and individual interviews and focus group discussions. The analysis of this information was done using IPEC's standard evaluation instrument. An evaluation team member specialised in international law supported the assessment of achievements in Yemen and specifically clarified questions regarding the application of ILO Conventions in Yemen.

Main Findings & Conclusions

Some visible results have been achieved:

- A draft National Policy and Programme Framework (NPPF) is available, a national workshop planned and presentation to donors envisaged for the beginning of phase 2 of the Programme;
- A Child Labour Unit is in place at the Ministry of Social Affairs and Labour (MoSAL) and receives budget from the Ministry of Finance,
- One short TV documentary and four TV flashes have been produced and

disseminated by the Ministry of Information,

- 90 teachers have been trained by the Ministry of Information and one training material including child labour issues have been developed for teachers,
- 17 labour inspectors, who are based regionally have been trained by MoSAL,
- Eight brochures have been printed and twenty-five workshops for awareness raising have been conducted,
- Two Rehabilitation Centres for child workers exist in Sana'a and in Hadhramout and offer educational courses for children.
- 1256 children have been withdrawn from dangerous work.

On the other hand, some shortcomings are also visible. One of the most important being limited cooperation, coordination, and complementarities among stakeholders. Especially the tri-partite programme set-up, the basic approach of ILO, linking Ministry of Social Affairs and Labour with the General Federation of Workers' Trade Union and the Federation of Chamber of Commerce and Industry, has not been able to operate successfully throughout the whole phase 1. Linkage with UNICEF and other donors were not visible enough.

Secondly, data and information management, particularly with regard to analysis and dissemination, remains weak. Research conducted by partners has not been finalised and training and TV materials developed are not used widely. It is difficult to assess the change of awareness that occurred in partner organisations, governmental and non-governmental bodies, and families of working children since no comparable monitoring data is available.

Apart from the Child Labour Unit of MoSAL, the other focal points in the Ministry of Education, Ministry of Information, Workers' Union, and Chamber of Commerce are not yet sustainable without IPEC funding.

The two Rehabilitation Centres in Sana'a and Hadhramout acquire funding from other

government sources to complement the budget received from IPEC. It is not easy to assess the number of children removed from hazardous work since data bases and monitoring use different definitions for 'permanently removed' and 'hazardous work'.

Considerable delays in implementation were experienced and the expected outputs could not be produced within the original time limits. Several reasons account for this situation:

- Lack of national technical and human resource capacity, which results in a failure of timely implementation of activities. National partners have limited knowledge about child labour oriented programmes and ILO / IPEC management requirements.
- Request for frequent and very detailed reporting in English, which could not be delivered by partner organisations whose working language is Arabic. This resulted in lengthy procedures and high involvement of IPEC's National Programme Manager.
- IPEC's Yemen office was not staffed sufficiently and timely enough when programme implementation began resulting in poor management performance. The National Programme Manager (NPM) also changed in 2004 with several months between the outgoing and incoming NPM.
- Due to poor reporting and to internal ILO / IPEC procedures, disbursement of funds was not timely leaving several months before AP were to continue. Disruption of implementation was frustrating for partners, particularly since reporting continued to be required. Nevertheless, quality of reports remained weak.
- Collaboration between the different IPEC levels, National Programme in Sana'a, ILO Regional Office in Beirut and HQ in Geneva, was not without tensions. A lack of clear definitions of responsibilities and division of decision power made the common management of the Yemen Programme difficult and stressful. It finally resulted in US \$ 200,000 to be returned

(decrease of budget) because of slow implementation and absorption of funds. The desk officer in Geneva was very much involved in day to day implementation of APs and their design.

Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations:

1. APs need to be better interlinked in order to be truly complementary.
2. APs need to be more closely monitored and more continuously supported.
3. There should be a smaller number of APs if staffing of the IPEC Office in Yemen is to remain the same. The role of the NPM is more a facilitator than an administrator.
4. APs need larger funds to be able to make a difference and show impact of activities.
5. Reporting should be eased – particularly if NGOs will be considered more than in the past. NGOs can play an important part in lobbying and mobilising of communities.

Mainstreaming child labour issues in Yemen is a particularly challenging task due to the structure of the society. Sustainable effects of programmes addressing this sector can not be measured sufficiently at the end of one project phase. Combating child labour on all levels and particularly in government administration needs a change in mentality. This is particularly true in an Islamic society where child labour is seen as part of the educational and growing up process.

There are several **lessons** that can be **learned** for any future phase 2 of the IPEC National Programme in Yemen. Some of the immediate and most important ones are:

1. Interlinking APs and mainstreaming child labour issues seems difficult in Yemen when divided among too many partner organisations.
2. Technical support for APs was not sufficient throughout phase 1.
3. Funding was too little for each AP in order to show considerable & sustainable impact.