



International
Labour
Organization

“Good quality” offers of employment, traineeship, apprenticeship and continued education

**Monitoring performance and assessing the impact
of Youth Guarantee schemes**

Content

1. Introduction

2. “Good quality” offer of:

- Employment;
- Traineeship;
- Apprenticeship;
- Continued education(and training).

Introduction

- According to EC guidance a **good quality** offer is one that results in the sustainable integration into the labour market (outcome-based approach);
- Activation measures and occupations that have low rate of sustainable labour market integration **are not considered quality offers**;

EC guidance from:

- the YEI evaluation criteria for measuring quality of the jobs gained by beneficiary;
- EU quality frameworks (traineeships and apprenticeships) and quality assurances procedures of EQF (further education and training).

Criteria for choosing quality domains and indicators

- The dimension/indicator selected is present in most quality frameworks examined;
- The dimension/indicator is – as far as possible – an objective, observable measure at individual level;
- Benchmarks (reference value) can be easily constructed on the basis of data regularly collected at national level or normative texts (legislation or collective agreement)

Job quality frameworks

- **Decent work indicators** (ILO, 2012): mostly macro (e.g. Employment opportunities, social dialogue);
- **Quality of employment** (UNECE, 2015): combines macro and micro, objective and subjective indicators;
- **Laeken indicators** (EU, 2001): includes both macro indicators (e.g. gender equality) and micro indicators (intrinsic job quality);
- **Job quality index** (Eurofound, 2012): mostly micro with many subjective indicators;
- **Job quality framework** (OECD, 2015): micro and macro indicators, combined in indexes.

Employment quality: domains and elements

1) Contract and social protection (security of employment):

Element/indicator	Benchmark(s)	Quality offer
Duration of contract	Minimum job tenure required to access unemployment benefit	Contract has duration \geq minimum job tenure required to access benefit
Access to social protection entitlements	Access to social protection (labour legislation, collective agreement)	Contract gives access to social protection entitlements as envisaged by law

Employment quality: domains and elements

2) Conditions of work: Earnings

Element/indicator	Benchmark(s)	Quality offer
Mean hourly earnings (gross, Euro/local currency)	Hourly earnings set by collective agreement (normative)	≥ hourly earning set by collective agreement
	Mean earnings by age and occupational groups (statistical)	≥ mean hourly earning youth (< 30) in occupation of choice
	Minimum wage (normative)	≥ hourly level of minimum wage AND ≥ 2/3 mean hourly earnings (low-paid job)

Employment quality: domains and elements

3) Other conditions of work

Element/indicator	Benchmark(s)	Quality offer
Job/qualification match	Vertical education and occupation matching	Occupation is aligned to the qualifications the young person has
Average number of weekly hours of work (including excessive hours and involuntary part-time)	Average number of hours usually worked; Excessive hours of work; Involuntary part-time	≤ than what established by normative rules OR ≤ average hours in occupation of choice AND Low incidence excessive hours No involuntary part-time

Employment quality: domains and elements

3) Other conditions of work (cont.)

Element/indicator	Benchmark(s)	Quality offer
Shift work, work during unsocial hours	Prevalence of shift work, work in unsocial hours	In line with labour law/collective agreement OR \leq average incidence in occupation of choice
Work intensity	Prevalence of shift work, work in unsocial hours	\leq average in occupation of choice

Employment quality: domains and elements

4) Occupational safety and health

Element/indicator	Benchmark(s)	Quality offer
Hazardous occupations	National list of hazardous occupations (specific provisions for 15-17)	Job is not in hazardous occupation OR
Exposure to physical mental health risk	Exposure to risk factors by economic sector/occupation (specific provisions for 15-17)	Exposure to physical and mental health risk is \leq than average exposure (occupation) OR \leq national average of reported accidents (occupation)

Employment quality: domains and elements

5) Learning and skills development at the workplace

Element/indicator	Benchmark(s)	Quality offer
Continuous vocational training	The offer provides access to continuous vocational training	≥ than what envisaged by collective agreement
	Prevalence of employer-sponsored non-formal education by occupation	≥ national average employer-sponsored training in occupation of choice

Quality of continued education (and training)

- According to EC guidance, a **good quality** offer of continued education (and training) is one that leads to a recognized qualification;
- The requirement is that education has quality assurances procedures aligned to:
 - *Common Principles for Quality Assurance in Education and Training;*
 - *European Quality Assurance Reference Framework for Vocational Education and Training;* and
 - *Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area*

Continued education quality: domains and elements

1) Education and training content:

Element/indicator	Benchmark(s)	Quality offer
Education and training content	<p>The education programme:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Provides cognitive and non-cognitive skills as required by education standards;• Meets individual needs and LM requirements;• Allows progression within the NQF;• Is subject to quality assurance procedures as determined by national and European education and training standards;• Leads to a recognized qualification (NQF)	The education offer has all elements listed

2) Validation and certification

Element/indicator	Benchmark(s)	Quality offer
Validation and certification	<p>The education programme:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• is validated through standardized assessment• leads to a recognized education and training qualification (NQF);• Gives access to further education and training or to the labour market	<p>The education course envisages all elements listed</p>

3) Expected returns

Element/indicator	Benchmark(s)	Quality offer
Expected labour market returns	Expected returns of the qualification are \geq average LM returns	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Expected returns are \geq average employment and earnings (by educational attainment)

Quality apprenticeship

The framework for appraising apprenticeship offers is based on the principles of the **Council Declaration on the “European Alliance for apprenticeship” (2013)** as well as the ILO framework for quality apprenticeship.

N.B. Since apprenticeship-type schemes are often regulated at national level, countries should develop their own quality criteria checklist.

Apprenticeship quality: domains and elements

1) Apprenticeship agreement:

Element/indicator	Benchmark(s)	Quality offer
Written form of the agreement	<p>Written agreement that specifies:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Learning and training content (learning programme);• Rights and obligations of parties involved;• Apprenticeship wage and other conditions of work• Social protection entitlements;• Type and level of qualifications to be acquired	Written form with conditions spelled out

Apprenticeship quality: domains and elements

2) Learning and training content

Element/indicator	Benchmark(s)	Quality offer
Learning objectives and content	<p>The offer:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Is for an occupational profile aligned to LM needs (and forecast)• Provides the competences required by occupational standards and includes transferable skills• Allows progression within NQF• Blends theoretical and work based training• Has a fixed duration• Provides supervision by an experienced worker that is also qualified as trainer• Is delivered in a host enterprise that has adequate capacity (premises and trainers)	Learning objectives and content include all elements listed

Apprenticeship quality: domains and elements

3) Conditions of work

Element/indicator	Benchmark(s)	Quality offer
Hours of traineeship	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Hours of work established by national legislation or collective agreements	\leq the maximum hours established by national legislation or collective agreements
Social protection	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Social protection entitlements (health, sickness and accident insurance)Occupational health and safety as established by national legislation or collective agreements	\geq social protection and health and safety rules established by national legislation or collective agreements
Wage level	<ul style="list-style-type: none">As determined by national legislation or collective agreements	The level is aligned to minimum wage legislation, accounting for initial lower productivity

Apprenticeship quality: domains and elements

4) Validation and certification

Element/indicator	Benchmark(s)	Quality offer
Validation	<p>The apprenticeship</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• is validated through external , competence-based assessment• Leads to a (NQF) recognized vocational education and training qualification• Gives access to the labour market or further education and training	<p>The apprenticeship offers provides for listed elements</p>

Quality traineeship

The framework for appraising traineeship offers is based on the principles of the **Council Recommendation on a Quality Framework for Traineeships (2014)**.

The Framework applies to traineeships:

- 1) organized as part of youth employment policy;
- 2) agreed between trainee and a host organisation without the involvement of a third party ('open-market'); and
- 3) Transnational traineeships.

N.B. Traineeship that are part of academic and/or vocational curricula and mandatory professional training **are excluded**.

Traineeship quality: domains and elements

1) Traineeship agreement:

Element/indicator	Benchmark(s)	Quality offer
Written form of the agreement	Agreement that specifies rights, entitlements and obligations	Written form with conditions spelled out

Traineeship quality: domains and elements

2) Learning objectives

Element/indicator	Benchmark(s)	Quality offer
Learning objectives	The learning objectives of the traineeship plan: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• states the level of experience to be acquired• relates to the field of study or qualification of the trainee• matches the learning activities and tasks the trainees will undertake	Learning objectives include all elements listed

Traineeship quality: domains and elements

3) Supervision

Element/indicator	Benchmark(s)	Quality offer
Supervision	<p>The supervisor is an experienced worker</p> <p>Supervisor is given responsibility to teach occupational skills, supervise practice period, assess individual performance</p>	<p>Supervisor has X years of experience:</p> <p>Responsibilities are spelled out in the agreement</p>

Traineeship quality: domains and elements

4) Conditions of traineeships

Element/indicator	Benchmark(s)	Quality offer
Hours of traineeship	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Hours established for traineeships by national legislation or collective agreements	\leq the maximum hours established by national legislation or collective agreements
Social protection	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Social protection entitlements (health, sickness and accident insurance)	\geq social protection established by national legislation or collective agreements
Allowance (where applicable)	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Living cost allowanceStipend	The amount is specified in agreement and/or in national legislation or collective agreements

Traineeship quality: domains and elements

4) Duration and renewal

Element/indicator	Benchmark(s)	Quality offer
Duration	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Average duration is ≤ 6 months	≤ 6 months OR ≥ 6 months, justified on the basis of learning content
Renewal	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Renew conditions specified in the traineeship agreement	Renewal is based on objective reasons (does not lead to carousel or workers' substitution)
(Notification)	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• (Conditions for early termination to be stated in the agreement)	

Traineeship quality: domains and elements

5) Validation

Element/indicator	Benchmark(s)	Quality offer
Validation	<p>The traineeship</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• is validated through a supervisor's assessment• provides the trainee with a certificate	<p>The traineeship is assessed and provides a certificate</p>

QUESTIONS?

