ÉTUDE CARTOGRAPHIQUE SOUS REGIONALE SUR LE POTENTIEL DE PARTENARIATS POUR LES COMPÉTENCES ET LA MIGRATION

PRESENTATION DES RESULTATS DE L’ETUDE SOUS REGIONALE

M. Aomar Ibourk

Abuja, 11 Septembre 2019
I. INTRODUCTION
II. SOCIO-ECONOMIC CONTEXT OF THE SUB-REGION
III. TRENDS AND PATTERNS OF INTRA-REGIONAL LABOUR MIGRATION
IV. JOB SUPPLY AND DEMAND: CURRENT SITUATION AND POSITION OF FOREIGN WORKERS IN THE SUB-REGION
V. LEGAL, POLITICAL AND REGIONAL COOPERATION FRAMEWORKS: STATE OF PLAY AND IMPLEMENTATION
VI. PROGRAMMES AND ACTIONS DEVELOPED BY ECOWAS MEMBER STATES TO FACILITATE THE MANAGEMENT OF MIGRATION ASPECTS
VII. SYSTEMS FOR THE IDENTIFICATION, ANTICIPATION, TRAINING AND RECOGNITION OF SKILLS: WHAT COMPATIBILITY?
VIII. ACTIONS TO IMPROVE SYSTEMS FOR DEVELOPMENT, RECOGNITION, IDENTIFICATION AND ANTICIPATION
Reduction of quantitative and qualitative mismatch problems: effective and efficient management of skills flows to ensure balance in profile-providing countries (countries of origin) and to fill shortages in countries with skill deficits, destination countries (segmentation by professions, trades, qualifications, countries, etc.)

✓ Employers: fill vacant positions with the most suitable profiles. More effective use of skills and business productivity

✓ Workers and job seekers: access to decent jobs and minimise the different types of downgrades, and better career development

✓ Labour market: better matching

✓ Regular and mutually beneficial labour migration

✓ Training: more relevant, quality and demand-driven supply
Well-managed migration and mobility have been shown to have positive impacts on the well-being of migrants and the development of countries of origin and destination.

- A livelihood strategy for people in difficulty
- Strategy to combat unemployment
- Remittances
- Skills and technology transfer
- Filling labour shortages and gaps
- Catalyst for entrepreneurial innovation
- Sustainable economic growth
- Increasing cultural diversity
- Cultural links that improve international trade
Stakeholders and forms of partnerships on skills and migration

**Stakeholders**
- Governments and departments,
- TVET institutions,
- Employment services,
- Training providers,
- Statistical offices,
- Employers' organizations,
- Workers' organizations,

**Shapes**
- Orientation of migrant workers
- Recognition of prior learning
- Harmonization of training standards
- Mutual recognition of qualifications
- Skills development in the country of origin
- Skills development in the destination country
- Identification and anticipation of supply and demand for skills

The establishment of partnerships requires labour market information systems that provide reliable, up to date and regular information for decision-making at national and regional level.
In 2017, the population of the study area was estimated at 357.4 million.

Growth rate, over five years, around 15% between 2000 and 2015,

Highest concentration of people in the continent: about 3 out of 10 Africans

This dynamic is expected to continue: 387 million inhabitants by 2020 and 630 by 2040, or more than a third of the African population.
**Economic growth at the sub-regional level**

- The region is mainly composed of low- and lower-middle-income countries.
- 5 countries studies are categorized in the lower middle income category (Côte d'Ivoire, Ghana, Mauritania, Nigeria and Senegal)
- Five countries have recorded growth of at least 5% since 2014 (Côte d'Ivoire, Benin, Mali, Niger and Senegal).
- Agriculture remains one of the factors that can explain this performance in these five countries.
Profil of economic growth

- Growth has enabled many development indicators (SDGs) to progress.
- Growth is low in jobs.
- This is due to various structural factors, including inadequate supply and demand structures.
- Despite seemingly low unemployment rates, unemployment data are misleading because they mask high levels of informal employment, underemployment and youth unemployment (IMF, 2019).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Access to employment in the subregion, by country, 2017-2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Employment-to-population ratio</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burkina Faso</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ivory Coast</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mali</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mauritania</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Niger</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senegal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chad</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Togo</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In 2017, the stock of international migrants in the subregion was estimated at 6.7 million, more than half (51.2%) of whom are concentrated in two countries, Ivory Coast and Nigeria.

In terms of trends, the stock of international migrants in the subregion increased between 2000 and 2017, from 4.2 million to 6.7 million migrants, respectively, a growth rate of more than 60% during this period.

The weight of the stock of international migrants in the total population is the highest in Ivory Coast (9%)

In other countries, the weight of the stock of international migrants in the total population did not exceed 4% in 2017

Indeed, for most of these countries, the foreign population represented only about 2% of the total population
Stock of refugees in the sub-region

- The number of refugees and asylum-seekers in the subregion reached 740,385 in 2015.
- Mauritania hosts 77,891 refugees and asylum seekers, mainly Malians in the Mberra camp.
- Chad is the leading host country for refugees and asylum-seekers in the sub-region, with approximately 442.4 thousand people.
- Niger is second, with 124.9 thousand people affected.
- For the rest of the sub-region, on the coast, there has been an attenuation of large-scale refugee movements that were widespread in West Africa.
- Behind this fact are the end of civil wars in Liberia and Sierra Leone and political tensions in Ivory Coast.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tchad</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>17,692</td>
<td>275,412</td>
<td>347,939</td>
<td>422,438</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Niger</td>
<td>792</td>
<td>27,622</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>301</td>
<td>314</td>
<td>124,827</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mauritanie</td>
<td>60,000</td>
<td>34,394</td>
<td>350</td>
<td>632</td>
<td>26,717</td>
<td>77,891</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burkina Faso</td>
<td>355</td>
<td>521</td>
<td>686</td>
<td>609</td>
<td>531</td>
<td>34,160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghana</td>
<td>4,102</td>
<td>83,200</td>
<td>12,991</td>
<td>53,537</td>
<td>13,828</td>
<td>19,265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mali</td>
<td>13,411</td>
<td>17,916</td>
<td>8,412</td>
<td>11,233</td>
<td>13,558</td>
<td>16,257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sénégal</td>
<td>58,113</td>
<td>66,769</td>
<td>22,715</td>
<td>23,341</td>
<td>22,849</td>
<td>17,511</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Togo</td>
<td>3,477</td>
<td>10,876</td>
<td>12,223</td>
<td>9,287</td>
<td>14,051</td>
<td>22,705</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ivory Coast</td>
<td>136,381</td>
<td>297,908</td>
<td>120,691</td>
<td>41,627</td>
<td>26,218</td>
<td>2,842</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>3,571</td>
<td>8,118</td>
<td>7,270</td>
<td>9,019</td>
<td>8,747</td>
<td>1,781</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benin</td>
<td>657</td>
<td>2,317</td>
<td>3,977</td>
<td>5,558</td>
<td>7,139</td>
<td>708</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>280,859</td>
<td>549,741</td>
<td>207,065</td>
<td>430,556</td>
<td>481,891</td>
<td>740,385</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Trends and patterns of intra-regional labour migration

**Classification of sub-regional migration**

- **Temporal classification**
  - Permanent migration and return migration
  - Migration for study and transition migration
  - Short-term migration (seasonal workers, women traders, illegal workers, etc.)

- **Classification by purpose**
  - Migration for the purpose of seeking economic opportunities
  - Migration for further study or training
  - Escape from conflict and the search for better places to live

Source: Prepared by the author
Intra-regional movements

The movements are mainly intra-regional. **About 75 per cent of the subregion's international migrants** remain in another country in the subregion. It is among the **highest in all of Africa**.

### Distribution of migrant inflows to countries in the sub-region by country of origin 2015

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Host country</th>
<th>Benin</th>
<th>Burkina Faso</th>
<th>Chad</th>
<th>Ivory Coast</th>
<th>Ghana</th>
<th>Mali</th>
<th>Mauritania</th>
<th>Niger</th>
<th>Nigeria</th>
<th>Senegal</th>
<th>Togo</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Benin</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>4178</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>54068</td>
<td>16551</td>
<td>4035</td>
<td>551</td>
<td>17908</td>
<td>351985</td>
<td>3487</td>
<td>71438</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burkina Faso</td>
<td>9948</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>1294323</td>
<td>57733</td>
<td>23922</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>19323</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>13601</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chad</td>
<td>699</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>756</td>
<td>29175</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>713</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ivory Coast</td>
<td>13742</td>
<td>540779</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>30359</td>
<td>20144</td>
<td>462</td>
<td>1419</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>2715</td>
<td>5746</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghana</td>
<td>10211</td>
<td>32217</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>42749</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>18561</td>
<td>206</td>
<td>1680</td>
<td>222377</td>
<td>1724</td>
<td>46794</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mali</td>
<td>1290</td>
<td>43815</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>356019</td>
<td>4949</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>104491</td>
<td>94640</td>
<td>160967</td>
<td>32930</td>
<td>8122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mauritania</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>7997</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>17189</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>51490</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>..</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Niger</td>
<td>75775</td>
<td>12757</td>
<td>3115</td>
<td>49783</td>
<td>5826</td>
<td>3819</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>112733</td>
<td>1633</td>
<td>65529</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>44603</td>
<td>5170</td>
<td>2977</td>
<td>38917</td>
<td>67629</td>
<td>11840</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>73179</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>819</td>
<td>31974</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senegal</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>4033</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>18994</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>5501</td>
<td>17630</td>
<td>1150</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>1008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Togo</td>
<td>48118</td>
<td>15393</td>
<td>..</td>
<td>50328</td>
<td>87494</td>
<td>6653</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>9702</td>
<td>147698</td>
<td>1613</td>
<td>..</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sub-region</td>
<td>204386</td>
<td>658342</td>
<td>6092</td>
<td>1913178</td>
<td>270641</td>
<td>111664</td>
<td>123685</td>
<td>219757</td>
<td>102493</td>
<td>96411</td>
<td>245070</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Share Subr.</td>
<td>83,3%</td>
<td>93,4%</td>
<td>1,2%</td>
<td>87,9%</td>
<td>67,7%</td>
<td>30,6%</td>
<td>74,3%</td>
<td>86,9%</td>
<td>85,5%</td>
<td>36,6%</td>
<td>88,5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total People</td>
<td>245399</td>
<td>704676</td>
<td>516968</td>
<td>2175399</td>
<td>399471</td>
<td>365145</td>
<td>166552</td>
<td>252998</td>
<td>119911</td>
<td>276844</td>
<td>..</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Major migration trends in the sub-region

- Continued growth in the stock of international migrants, from 4.2 million in 2000 to some 6.6 million in 2015 and 6.7 million in 2017.
- About 75% of the sub-region's international migrants remaining in another country in the sub-region.
- A dominance of young migrants and the working-age population, accompanied by an increased feminization of the migrant population.
- A concentration in large cities, centres of economic activity, capitals, refugee camps, and traditional transit points.
- Migrants tend to work in the informal sector as traders, construction workers, craftsmen, farmers or in domestic activities.
- Mixed flows, including economic migrants, smuggled persons, victims of trafficking, refugees, also for environmental reasons, etc.
- The majority of migrants in the sub-region move for economic reasons.
- Low levels of education.
Main features of the labour market

- The absence of a relevant, efficient, effective and sustainable LMIS is an important basis for the development of an efficient, effective and sustainable regional LMIS. And a presence of quantitative and qualitative imbalances.
- A dominance of agriculture and low value-added services (such as retail trade) and a strong contribution of the agriculture and services sectors to job creation in the sub-region.
- A steady decline in the primary sector's share of growth and employment over the years in the services profile.
- Jobs in growing services: trade, telecommunications, finance, transport and market sales services and personal service store and market and store salesmen
- A significant contribution of women and youth to employment and a high prevalence of vulnerable jobs (78.5% of jobs in the sub-region).
- Low levels of education among the employed labour force.
- Positive correlation between unemployment and qualification level: youth unemployment by level of higher education in the countries of the subregion is the highest compared to other population categories except in Senegal where the rate is about 6.8%, the lowest in the subregion.
Employment ratio of about 51.52%, of which 49.3% are women.
78.6% are vulnerable jobs
A dominance of the primary sector, and jobs in services are booming
The natural resources industry and construction make up the bulk of the secondary sector
**Trends and patterns of intra-regional labour migration**

| Ratification of international instruments for the protection of migrant workers |
|-----------------------------------------------|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
|                                | Benin | Burkina Faso | Chad | Ivory Coast | Ghana | Mali | Mauritania | Niger | Nigeria | Senegal | Togo |
| ILO Migrant Workers Convention, 1949               | -     | 1961       | -    | -            | -     | -    | -          | 1960  | -       | -       | -    |
| ILO Migrant Workers Convention, 1975             | 1980  | 1977       | -    | -           | -     | -    | -          | -     | 1983    | -       | 1983 |
Intra-regional policy frameworks: education and training

The African and Malagasy Council for Higher Education (CAMES), 1968

- Created in 1968 by the Heads of State of the Malagasy African Union for Higher Education
- In 1972, the 16 French-speaking countries of Africa and the Indian Ocean signed an agreement in Lomé (Togo) for the recognition of qualifications in higher education,
- All qualifications issued by their institutions become automatically valid or equivalent in the territory of each of them.


- Adopted in 2003 to increase the mobility of students, teachers and other skilled workers.
- The Convention commits Member States to recognise the validity or equivalence of diplomas and certificates with the same academic value.
- It also commits them to provide training and education in accordance with international standards, while taking into account the regional context.
Intra-regional policy frameworks: education and training

The Common Approach to Migration, 2008

- Adopted in 2008 by the Conference of Heads of State at the 33rd ECOWAS Summit.
- The objective is to establish the link between migration and development and to minimize the negative impacts of migration.
  - The free movement of persons;
  - Legal migration to other parts of the world
  - The fight against trafficking in human beings and humanitarian assistance;
  - Harmonization of migration policies;
  - Protection of the rights of migrants, asylum seekers and refugees;
  - Recognition of the gender dimension of migration policies.

The Arusha/Addis Ababa Convention, 2014

- It concerns the recognition of studies and certificates, diplomas, degrees and other qualifications in higher education in African States
- Known as the Addis Ababa Convention, December 12, 2014
- The Convention provides the legal means to promote the mobility of learners and workers and to strengthen intra-African cooperation in education, training and research for higher education.
- The version revised in 2014 is now ratified by only seven African countries.
Feasibility study on the application of the Convention on the Recognition of Competences and Harmonisation of Qualifications, 2011

- The study focused on the problems of:
  - low funding and low quality
  - the diversity of education systems in terms of admission requirements and levels of certification examinations, and the inconsistency of academic calendars
  - the inadequacy of education and training to the needs and aspirations of Member States.
- But: the uniformity of the cumulative number of years in all education systems
- Ad hoc committee guides the process of implementing the said system of recognition of diplomas.
- A second follow-up study is planned to develop benchmarks for the recognition of diplomas by Member States.
- Health sector: mutual recognition of qualifications and harmonization of curricula under the aegis of the ECOWAS West African Health Organization.
Programmes and actions to facilitate the management of migration aspects in ECOWAS

ECOWAS Migration Strategy (2018-2028)

- This regional migration strategy covers a wide range of intervention pillars.
- ECOWAS reaffirmed the importance of the full implementation of the ECOWAS Protocol on the Free Movement of Persons in order to encourage the mobility of skills, labour and talents essential to fill capacity gaps in the region.
- A mixed migration strategy that would complement the ECOWAS migration strategy for 2018-2028 (MIDWA).


- It has five main objectives, namely:
  1. Adoption of new practices, common statistical methods and harmonisation
  2. Evidence-based decision-making processes through regular information exchange and enhanced coordination among migration data actors in the region.
  3. Improved quality of the migration data management process.
  4. Make available migration statistics produced in the ECOWAS region for wider use.
  5. Establishment of a strong and comprehensive legal and policy framework in the field of migration data
1. **Preconditions**

**Availability of required data**
- Exploitation of existing data sources (analysis of existing data)
- Carrying out surveys to fill the information gap (improving the statistical system on labour supply and demand)
- Elaboration of the projection of labour supply and demand (Overall prospective statistical framework at national and sectoral level)

**Reference framework**
- Harmonization of classifications (tools for reconciling labour supply and demand)
- Consolidation of the methodological approach for the development of occupational and skills classifications
- Provide all sectors of activity with REM/RECs

**Skilled human resources**
- Strengthening capacities to anticipate and analyse labour supply and demand (technical approaches and methods, analysis of results, etc.)
The countries of the sub-region often have structures in charge of identifying and anticipating skills.

The identification and anticipation of competencies is generally done through quantitative and qualitative surveys and studies. These studies are sometimes general, sometimes spatial or sectoral.

Some countries attest to regularity in terms of the implementation of the mechanisms in place, others do so at discontinuous and distant points in time.

Among the key mechanisms for anticipation and identification is demand-driven training. However, it is a practice that is underdeveloped because of the low development of the skills development sector, the low involvement of employers and other stakeholders, but also the predominantly informal nature of the labour market.

Another key mechanism: sectoral trends in terms of supply and demand for skills, often based on scenarios.

Intermediation agencies also attest to a forward-looking vision of the need for skills.
An overview of the quantitative and qualitative mechanisms for identifying and anticipating skills has identified some incompatibilities.

First, the absence of an employment and skills observatory or a national coordination committee of the LMIS with the objective of improving synergy between the actors of the system.

The diversity of sources of labour market information used in different countries for characterization and planning purposes. This diversity poses the problem of standardizing concepts and methods on both the supply and demand side of skills.

Discrepancy in terms of the date and frequency of publication of data, while the regular and timely presentation of information is extremely important, both for job seekers and for employers and decision-makers.

Example:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Institutions in charge</th>
<th>Main missions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ivory Coast</td>
<td>- The General Inspectorate</td>
<td>- Prospecting companies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- The Youth Employment Agency</td>
<td>- Review the activities and human resources present according to the workstations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Significant presence of **private institutions**

**Financing** is mainly provided by the State, and to a lesser extent by international development institutions and NGOs within the framework of Public-Private Partnerships (PPP).

Employers' and workers' organizations are involved in the governance of TVET in principle through Commissions, **on-the-job training** and **apprenticeship training**. In practice, however, this involvement is often limited both by the low private dynamism and by the lack of an institutional framework or low representativeness.

The training offer is marked by a wide disparity in the spatial distribution for the benefit of large cities, but is very diversified in terms of training programmes and courses.

In principle, there are three types of vocational training:

- **Formal** technical education provided in state-recognized structures. The training is crowned by officially recognised diplomas.

- **Non-formal** vocational training outside the formal system recognised by the State.

- **Informal** vocational training through experience and practice.

**Three levels of qualifications:** an initial level concerning basic qualifications, an intermediate level of professional qualification and an advanced level of technicians and specialisation, but also of master's and doctorate.
No systematic recognition in informal sector jobs

Also, if there are any, users of non-formal skills recognition systems have little access to information on procedures for granting equivalences, slowness of the system

The lack of capitalisation of some good practices for the recognition of skills acquired through experience (Bukrina Faso and Ghana for example).

Rating systems and procurement standards should be harmonised for equivalence. Coordination and institutional mechanisms between the bodies in charge of examinations and certifications should be put in place.

Pre-university and technical and vocational pre-training cycles are characterized by a discrepancy in terms of duration and level of education. Thus, depending on labour market needs, stakeholders should either prioritise harmonisation or mutual recognition.

A certification framework (repository) could help as a comparison tool - but beware of the implications!
Prospects for improving skills systems

Actions to improve skills systems

13 proposed actions, grouped into 3 categories

- 4 actions to improve migration management
- 4 specific actions for the development and recognition of skills
- 5 horizontal actions

Migration management

1. **generalization of phases I and II of the free movement protocol at ECOWAS level**

2. **Work for the application of the common approach to migration**

3. **Harmonization of national migration laws and policies with international and intra-regional frameworks**

4. **Support access to information and guidance for migrants, including workers**
### Actions to improve skills systems

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Specific actions for the development and recognition of skills</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5. Harmonisation of teaching and qualifications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Develop a regional reference system of trades that will be the subject of an official and regular evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Creation of structures for mutual recognition, certification of competences and information sharing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Quality assurance</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Horizontal actions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9. Establish harmonised and comparable information systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Establish national employment policies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Strengthening coordination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Integrate the informal by copying good practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Involve the private sector and other stakeholders</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Thank you

M. Aomar Ibourk