Priority Sector PRS Review from a Gender Perspective: Strategies for Mainstreaming Gender in the Road Sector for Poverty Reduction (PRSP II)

Edward H. Mhina and Richard Kundi
Dar Es Salaam, April 2004
Ministry of Finance
Macro Economics Gender Mainstreaming Group (MGMWG)

Ministry of Community Development, Gender & Children (MCDG&C)

and

OD Training and Facilitation Center (TRACE)

Study Report
(April 2004)

Report on
Priority Sector PRS Review
from a Gender Perspective:
Ministry of Works
Acronyms

AIDS Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
ATTI Appropriate Technology Training Institute
ATU Appropriate Technology Unit
ATP Appropriate Technology Project
CRB Contractors Registration Board
CBO Community Based Organisation
CIP Construction Industry Policy
DE District Engineer
DED District Executive Director
DFR District and Feeder Roads Project
DROMAS District Road Maintenance Management System
DMT District Management Team
EDF European Development Fund

FINNIDA Finnish International Development Authority
GoT Government of Tanzania
GFP Gender Focal Point
GAD Gender and Development
GDP Gross Domestic Product
HIV Human Immune Virus

IT Information Technology
IEC Information, Education and Communication
LBT Labour Based Technology
LBM Labour Based Methods
LBTU Labour Based Technology Unit
LBTM Labour Based Technical Manual
LDF Local Development Fund
LDP Local Development Project
LGPR Local Government Reform Programme
LGSP Local Government Support Programme
LGSR Local Government Service Regulations
MP Member of Parliament
MoU Memorandum of Understanding
MoW Ministry of Works
M&E Monitoring & Evaluation system
MDG Maboresho Development Grant
MTEF Medium Term Expenditure Review
MGMWG Macro Economic Gender Mainstreaming Working Group
MPWG Macro Policy Working Group

NCC National Construction Council
NCP National Construction Policy
NGO None Government Organisation
NPES National Poverty Eradication Strategy
NLBRSP National Labour Based Road Sector Programme
NRE Royal Netherlands Embassy
NORAD Norwegian Agency for Development Cooperation
NRA National Roads Adviser
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NRE</td>
<td>National Road Engineer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NIGP</td>
<td>National Income Generation Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O&amp;M</td>
<td>Operation and Maintenance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O&amp;OD</td>
<td>Obstacles and Opportunities to Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PER</td>
<td>Public Expenditure Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PORALG</td>
<td>President’s Office on Regional and Local Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRS</td>
<td>Poverty Reduction Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RCC</td>
<td>Regional Consultative Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RTA</td>
<td>Regional Technical Advisor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RS</td>
<td>Regional Secretariat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RAC</td>
<td>Regional Advisory Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RAS</td>
<td>Regional Administrative Secretary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RIDP</td>
<td>Regional Integrated Development Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RRMP</td>
<td>Rural Roads Maintenance Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SADC</td>
<td>Southern Africa Development Conference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDP</td>
<td>Support to Decentralization Programme in Mwanza Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SGLG</td>
<td>Support to Good Local Governance Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STIs</td>
<td>Sexually Transmitted Infections</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDc</td>
<td>Swiss Development Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAS</td>
<td>Tanzania Assistance Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tanroads</td>
<td>Tanzania Roads Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRA</td>
<td>Tanzania Revenue Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TASAF</td>
<td>Tanzania Social Action Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>URT</td>
<td>United Republic of Tanzania</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNCDF</td>
<td>United Nations Community Development Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>URRP</td>
<td>Urgent Road Rehabilitation Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>United Nations Development Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VTTP</td>
<td>Village Travel and Transport Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WPU</td>
<td>Women Participation Unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WEQA</td>
<td>Women Evaluators and Quantity Surveyors</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Acknowledgment

This report on Study of the Ministry of Works from a Gender Perspective was commissioned by the Ministry of Finance’s Macro-Economic Gender Mainstreaming Working Group in order to detail how the ministry of works, as one of the PRSP I priority sectors, can consolidate and improve on its implementation of cross cutting issues and especially gender and HIV/AIDS in the coming PRSP II. The study report presents immediate findings on the current gender and poverty related issues in the sector; the trend in implementation the current PRSP I; as well as present the gaps abounding. The study includes an analysis of provisions for gender and cross cutting issues in the ministry, as well as develops suggested measures to improve the overall situation. The study was executed for 7 days, in the first and second week of March 2004. The research involved documentation review; and, interviews with government officials at the Ministry of Works. Consultations with other non government stakeholders was not achieved due to the tight nature of the task (7 days), and its timing (a time where the researchers were both engaged in travel and moping up of other obligations).

The researchers of this report are indebted to numerous people who assisted and facilitated in many ways to make the research and its reporting successful. In this thought, I should convey my gratitude to the staff the Ministry of Works Head Office, especially the acting Director of Policy and Planning Mr. L. Katabaruki, for his support and concern in enabling us to accomplish this engagement, and, Engineer Raya, the acting Director of Rural Roads. Mention should also be made of Mrs Grace Mwikilufi, from the Policy and Planning Department, Engineer Ukende Msengesi and Engineer Raphael of ATP, Mrs. Mwakitosi, the Gender Focal point at the Ministry of Works, and, Mrs Grace Mwangwa, the Women Participation Unit officer in charge, for the trust they had in me and my colleague (Mr. Richard Kundi), in doing this job. It is my sincere belief that the support from all the above mentioned people enabled us to accomplish this job comfortably.

This study report was compiled by Mr. Edward H. Mhina, (a Gender Trainer & Consultant – from GAD Consult, Gender & Development Consultant firm, and also a member of Tanzania Gender Networking Programme), with initial support from Mr. Richard Kundi, from the Ministry of Works, and, Mr. Aboud S. Jumbe, who was involved in the research as a GAD Consult associate consultant, and contributed, effectively to parts of this report.

The final version of the report was amended entirely by Edward H. Mhina by adding observations and comments from participants who attended the sector review workshop held at Courtyard Hotel from 25th to 27th March 2004. Special mentioned should be made of Mr. W. Lyatuu from the Ministry of Works, who made significant observations that assisted in facilitating accurate presentation of several factual issues.

Mr. Edward H. Mhina

GAD Consult
Gender and Development Consultants
P.O.Box 4361, Dar Es Salaam.
Physical Address: AlyKhan Road 82, Upanga East.
Tel: 2121631
Mobile: 0744-340488
Email: GADConsult@msn.com
## Contents

### Items

- Acknowledgement: 5
- Executive Summary: 7-8

### Main Report

- Introduction: 9
  - Accessibility, Mobility and Rural Travel Planning: 9
  - Rural Roads and Rural Transport: 10
- Rural Roads Sector and Experiences in PRSP: 13
  - Interim Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper: 13
  - Draft Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper: 13
  - Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper: 14
  - First Draft Progress Report on PRSP I: 14
  - Second Draft Progress Report on PRSP I: 15
- Budget Speech and Provisions on Cross Cutting Issues: 16
  - The 2001/02 Ministry of Works Budget Speech: 16
  - The 2002/03 Ministry of Works Budget Speech: 16
  - The 2003/04 Ministry of Works Budget Speech: 17
  - The Medium Term Plan for Growth and Poverty Reduction: 17
- Lessons Learnt in Rural Roads sector: 18
- Challenges and Constraints: 20
- Gender Analysis of the Rural Roads sub-sector: 22
  - Women’s Participation Unit: 22
  - Gender Mainstreaming Focal point: 23
  - Cross Cutting Issues in Policy and Planning: 23
- Gender and Poverty Gaps in the Rural Roads Sector: 25
- What is in Place?: Data, Plans, Strategies and Programmes: 26
- Interventions at Policy, Implementation and Monitoring levels: 28
- Recommendations for Engendering Rural Roads sub-sector: 30
- Policy Commitments and Statements for Inclusion: 31
- Action points to be focused by the Sector and Public at the Implementation levels: 32
- Proposed Gender Indicators: 32
- Suggested Radical Shift Alternatives in the Sector to Guide the Monitoring Process at all levels: 33
- The Way Forward: 34

### Annexes

- PRSP II Road Sector Gender Inclusion Matrix: 36
- Observations and Comments from the PRSP Consultative Sector Review Workshop: 40-44
- Selected Readings: 45-46
Executive Summary

1. This report was commissioned by the Ministry of Finance’s Macro-Economic Gender Mainstreaming Working Group in order to detail how the ministry of works, as one of the PRSP I priority sectors, can consolidate and improve on its implementation of cross cutting issues and especially gender and HIV/AIDS in the coming PRSP II.

2. This study report, which was to some extent improved by comments and observations from participants at the Review Workshop, presents immediate findings on the current gender and poverty related issues in the sector; the trend in implementation the current PRSP I; as well as present the gaps abounding. The study includes an analysis of provisions for gender and cross cutting issues in the ministry, as well as develops suggested measures to improve the overall situation.

3. The rationale and justification for change is undisputable. Transformation is to be anticipated if poverty reduction and addressing of cross cutting issues are to be implemented effectively. The numerous plans and strategies already developed by the Ministry of Works through the PER, the Budget Speeches, LBT policy framework, pilot projects in the field, departmental plans, and numerous studies by different actors, have established the necessity of systematic implementation and commitment by top leadership.

4. The consultants therefore suggest that the ministry continue to act proactively and incrementally in developing opportunities and possibilities for enhancement addressing gender and other cross cutting issues in the next PRSP II (Roads Sector Public Expenditure Review 2004 (PER 04). The measures recommended, are mostly those from the current PER document, and these should include:

On Labour Based Activities

- To contribute to economic development and poverty reduction by creating employment in infrastructure investments and optimizing the use of local resources through using labour based technologies (LBT).

On HIV/AIDS Activities

- Increase the knowledge and understanding of HIV/AIDS/STIs transmission, prevention and management to workers on road works, camp sites, and surrounding communities.
- Develop HIV/AIDS and poverty reduction strategy.

On Environmental Activities

- Reduce negative impacts of road developments on environment.
- Monitor environmental activities in the road sector.
On Gender Activities

- Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger among women through access to economic opportunities availed by infrastructure development activities.
- Reduce gender inequality resulting from lack of leadership and guidance in road sector development.
- Increase capabilities of women and young people to effectively participate in road sector activities.

5. Other measures to include in the coming PRSP II for the rural roads sector in regards to its poverty reduction contribution should also include:

i) Ensuring **gender-disaggregated data** are available.

ii) Circulating **gender focused guidelines** that will enforce compliance of gender inclusion to actors in the sector.

iii) Ensuring all PRS **recognized cross cutting issues** are integrated (in terms of physical and financial targets) into 10-year Road Sector Development Programme and the Regional Road Sector Development Programme.

iv) Addressing **organizational capacity constraints** by allocating adequate resources to WPU to make it to supervise and follow up sector institutional performance on gender.

v) Restructuring **institutional constraints**, those related to public procurement and the sector policy discouraging use of force account. These conditions are hindering TANROADS to set aside specific contracts for promotion of gender in road works.

vi) Promoting **rural accessibility** (community development initiatives and public works programme) for poverty reduction all 15 regions, which were not covered.

vii) Targeting VTTP activities in quest to improve transport infrastructure, **promote intermediate means of transport and non-transport interventions** carried in all 117 districts in Tanzania Mainland.

6. Another critical measure is to continue the development of **gender budgeting** in the Ministry and its agencies.

7. Design and use **gender disaggregated indicators** at all levels.
Introduction

According to critique by various actors and stakeholders, both internal and external, the previous Poverty Reduction Strategy (PRS I), provided inadequate emphasis to cross cutting issues such as Gender, Environment and HIV/AIDS. PRSP (I) did not account effectively for many of the key priorities of women, youth and the destitute. For instance, need for improvement of maternal health services, support for food production or marketing within the country, and eradication of gender discriminatory practices within social services and economic infrastructure were not satisfactorily handled.

On the other hand, PRSP (I) progress reports clearly reflect the need for increased mainstreaming of gender and other cross cutting issues into sector policies in quest to eradicate poverty and other socio-economic misgivings. Main weaknesses in the PRSP (I) as regards gender content were widely noted in various sporadic efforts to add on explicit gender inputs at alternating intervals. Progress reports on the PRSP outline Government’s commitment to: promote gender equality; to ensure that poverty data analysis is engendered; and, that gender sensitive indicators are used in monitoring.

The Government therefore on 15th October 2003, launched a public appraisal of the PRS as a precondition for development of PRS II. The process aims at bringing on board all stakeholders and the public at large into informing the sectors on their imperatives for reducing poverty. The process is aimed at enabling these stakeholders share with other actors in a consultative way, on substantive issues of gender, environment and HIV/AIDS. The purpose is to bring on board these issues systematically for incorporation into the new PRS II strategies for the concerned sectors. The process is thus expected to imbue the involved actors with basic gender analysis capabilities in order to facilitate them contribute into the PRS Review processes.

This gender review study of the rural roads sub-sector is therefore designed to looking into the current gender and poverty related issues and the trends over the last three years as regards the roads sector component of the PRS I. The study shall focus on: assessing achievements in regards to gender aspects identified in the first PRS; trends in implementation in the past 3 years; lessons learned from the experience so far; challenges and constraints on furthering the process; existing gaps in gender and poverty; existing plans, strategies and programmes for gender and cross cutting issues; as well as provide recommendations for the way ahead.

The study shall therefore provide suggestions on how gender mainstreaming and cross cutting issues in the rural road sector could best be incorporated in the PRS II document. The suggestions shall be in the form of: a selection of practical interventions; gender disaggregated monitoring indicators; and eventually, essential measures for enhancing positive outcomes in addressing gender and cross cutting issues, as well as minimize poverty through the rural roads sub-sector.

Accessibility, Mobility, and Rural Travel Planning

Access to social and economic facilities, goods and services is a daily prime concern of all human beings. This daily endeavour demands facilitation of movement of people to the goods, services and facilities providing them. Rural households, as well as urban households, meet their needs and priorities most effectively if the means for accessing them are in place.

---

1 Bell, E.; Gender and PRSPs: With experiences from Tanzania, Bolivia, Viet Nam, and Mozambique; 2003
However, in order for this to happen, a multi-sectoral integrated planning approach that puts into consideration all aspects of household access needs is required. It is an established fact that poor access to subsistence, economic and social needs leads to isolation and therewith poverty. Mobility needs at the household level require the provision of appropriate transport infrastructure.

Present *conventional approaches to rural transport needs* assume that rural road improvements lead to improved access, and that continued state investment in the physical infrastructure for motor vehicles enables the transport needs of every community member being catered for. This approach subordinates road planning to the needs of agriculture, and therefore roads are justified towards agricultural harvests only. The approach neglects the fact that women and girls are prime movers in most rural areas, but they are not considered as prime targets for transport planning. It is obvious that most transport activities take place in and around villages, and have little use of the formal road network.

Current studies in rural or village level transport and travel patterns have revealed that there are specific gender aspects to be taken consideration of. These aspects include: division of labour (e.g., women doing a larger share of trips and burden of head-loading), infrastructure (e.g., poor access to essential services), and ecological conditions (e.g., dispersal of firewood and other goods and services such as water, markets, farming fields, etc).

Integrated *rural accessibility planning* therefore defines access needs of rural households in connection to social and economic services that households require. The method integrates mobility needs at the household with the siting or location of essential social and economic goods and services. This approach pays attention to purpose of travel, availability of services, condition of the transport infrastructure, means of transport, and the availability of social and economic services. The planning identifies development needs, problems, and priorities which can be addressed by improving access to facilities and services.

The starting point is the *access needs* of rural households. Key access interventions that are considered in improving access include: rural infrastructure (e.g., tracks, foot paths and footbridges); rural transport mobility (e.g., low cost IMTs); environment for rural mobility (e.g., facilitating purchase of IMTs, training in operation and maintenance); accessible locations or sites for facilities and services (e.g., water supplies, sanitation services, health centers, market facilities, grinding mills, etc); and, environmentally friendly measures (e.g., Energy efficient stoves, woodlots, etc).

It is such articulated issues that the rural roads sub-sector should address, rather than ending its analysis on the provision of roads for its unlinked sake. In order to further the analysis let us view how the sub-sector identifies and deals with rural roads.

**Rural Roads and Rural Transport**

According to the Ministry of Works, the road sector is considered as a major contributor in facilitating socio-economic development of poor rural areas. The road sector is said to contribute towards 5% of the overall GDP and handles 70% of internal freight traffic and 60% of transit cargo. Existing data shows that Tanzania’s *road network* comprises of 85’000 kilometers, distributed as follows:

- 10’300 kilometers of trunk roads.
- 24’700 kilometers of regional roads.
- 2,450 kilometers of urban roads.
- 20,000 kilometers of district roads.
- 27,550 kilometers of feeder roads.

However, only 4,000 of the above kilometers are paved (5%). In closer detail, the Ministry of Works (through TanRoads and Road Fund), is responsible for 35,000 kilometers of the roads in Tanzania, while PORALG (through its local authorities), deals with the remaining 50,000 kilometers.

**The Tanzania Development Vision 2025** states infrastructure development should involve the private sector and communities generally. It goes on into saying “development of the road network is absolutely essential for promoting rural development”. It is not stated whether these goals augur well with the stated accessibility needs of the rural based communities as explained above, or whether the interventions should merely meet the requirements of a limited proportion of rural resident Tanzanians.

Development and maintenance of the rural roads and transport infrastructure was previously assumed being gender neutral. In our time, various studies have revealed that men and women have varying transport needs and constraints that are affected differently by rural transport interventions. Rural women, who balance the productive, social, and reproductive roles in their local societies, are highly in need of a gender responsive rural transport infrastructure that can enhance their income generation and participation in decision making activities. It is in this spirit that rural roads are extensively championed by different stakeholders as instrument for alleviating poverty. The purpose is to raise living standards among the poorest inhabitants in rural areas by engaging them in the rehabilitation of existing feeder, district and regional roads through labour promoting methods and technology.

**Labour intensive technology** is one of the most convenient tools for poverty reduction through the road sector. Ministry of Works has already acknowledged appropriateness of using the Labor Based Technology in rural roads as a way forward to development in the rural sector and alleviating poverty. Labour based technology, in comparison to capital intensive technology, creates more employment, increases incomes to rural residents, and helps re-distribute incomes.

Policy Guidelines for the 1996/97 National Labor Based Road Sector Programme identify direct and indirect benefits of using labour based methods. These benefits were listed as:

- **Creation of jobs** in rural areas where other wage earning opportunities are few.
- **Reduced dependency** on heavy equipment that is often difficult to maintain, especially when working in areas remote from main suppliers, workshops and manufacturers agents.
- **Reduced requirement** for foreign exchange, as more of the costs are local costs.
- Boost to local economy through the spending power of worker’s wages.
- The **acquisition of skills by workers** employed on road construction and maintenance.

---

3  World Bank; Transport and Gender Equality: Gender and Development Briefing Notes; www.worldbank.org/gender/transport/
4  Halifa Msangi and Geert Muijser; Experience of using Rehabilitation and Maintenance of District and Feeder Roads (Medium Term Impact on people and the Government of Tanzania); 2003; 10th Regional Seminar for the Labor Based Practitioners.
• The **provision of work opportunities for women** as the recruitment of road workers is usually organized close to worker’s homes, a situation necessary for most women.
• Encouragement of a **sense of ownership** of the roads by the rural people through their involvement in their construction and maintenance.
• Assisting with **poverty alleviation** to the extent that the laborers who seek work on the roads are often poorer people who have few other options, for example those who have little or no land to cultivate.
• **Reducing migration to urban areas**, particularly through large scale national programmes that offer a steady number of work opportunities in rural areas.

It is hereby obvious that the advantages of employing labour based methods in the maintenance of rural roads, as well as other types of roads, have been well articulated by the Ministry of Works much earlier. Such revelations have been amassing from within and without the country, as can be attested by the Case Study from Uganda in the Box below. The challenge henceforth, remains in implementation and up scaling.

---

**Employment Creation and Labour Based Technology in Roadwork:**

**Ugandan Case Study**

*G. Taylor and M. Bekabye*

A Case Study on Uganda has shown that a **switch towards more labor based methods could generate very significant benefits for the poor in the form of employment opportunities, and for the country in terms of GDP and foreign exchange savings**. The Case Study further provided the following revelations:

- **Labor based methods** are cheaper than equipment based methods: in direct financial terms they are **18% cheaper for full rehabilitation** of feeder roads and **50% cheaper for spot rehabilitation**
- In **economic terms**, labor based methods are even more advantageous: **38% cheaper for full rehabilitation** and **60% for spot rehabilitation**
- In **terms of costs**, labor based works are **competitive** as long as the unskilled daily wage does not exceed US$4; the **current rate in rural areas is US$1.2**
- The employment generation effect is much higher for labor based than for equipment based work: in the labor based projects studied the proportion of the cost spent on wages, mostly for the unskilled, ranged **between 44% and 60% against 3% - 8% in equipment based works**
- The macro-economic model showed that the indirect effects were even greater than the direct effects: **for each job directly created another 2 jobs are generated elsewhere** in the economy through a multiplier effect
- An investment of **US$23 Million** in feeder roads rehabilitation would **generate 107,000 jobs** (directly and indirectly) if carried out with labor as **against 36,000 jobs** if carried out with equipment (the GOU current investment in feeder roads is estimated at Ush 30 Billion per annum)
- Due to the savings in foreign exchange form not having to import heavy equipment from abroad, the **fiscal deficit of the investment would be 37% less** with labor based methods than with equipment

The Ugandan labor market grows by at least 300,000 young people each year. With the formal sector being able to absorb less than 100,000 of them, the **study concluded that there is a strong case for making the wider application of labor based methods in infrastructure works** a dynamic element in a strategy for employment creation and poverty eradication.
With support from various donor agencies and other multinational organizations, the Government of Tanzania has made progress in rehabilitating rural roads by using the Labor Based Technology (LBT) techniques and is now in the process of strengthening infrastructure-related institutions and policies.

**Rural Roads Sector and Experiences in PRSP**

The overall objective of the road sector\(^5\) is “to have a road network that is well maintained, serving all parts of the economy, and one which is well integrated to other modes of transport providing services that are relatively inexpensive and safe”. The strategy selected to achieve this objective includes: rehabilitation of sections of the road network currently in poor condition to good condition. The aim was to start with roads which serve the most vulnerable districts (in most vulnerable 12 regions\(^6\)), and focusing on the potential for agricultural production.


The *Interim Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper*\(^7\) (March 2000) first and foremost highlights the process (e.g., consultations with stakeholders, civil society and development partners), for the development of the Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper, which was to be produced by August 2000. Besides stating that the paper was not to replace existing sectoral programmes but instead strengthen the prioritization of actions on targeting poverty in each sector, the paper indicated the need for each sector to set poverty reduction targets and monitorable indicators and shift budgetary allocations to meet the specified poverty reduction targets. The paper hence touches on the enactment of legislation, of December 1998, for dedicating 90% of the Road Fund towards maintenance, as a major policy accomplishment. The paper also mentions establishment of a National Road Agency (TanRoads) in July 2000, as a way for ensuring effective and efficient management of the country’s road network from a poverty reduction perspective.


By July 2000 another more detailed *Draft PRSP* was issued by the government. The document identifies poor rural transport, especially “roads are not good enough to attract private transporters to operate”, as one of the causes for poverty (page 13). Furthermore, the document reiterated the focus on poverty reduction by the road sector as being application of “labour intensive technology and increased use of local contractors” in the rehabilitation and maintenance of all rural roads network.

Nevertheless, it is disturbing to see the emphasis that “priority will be given to rehabilitating to weather standards a total of 4’500 kilometers by 2003 under the Urgent Roads Rehabilitation Programme in 12 identified regions” (page 28). This focus seems to overstretch the definition of rural roads as well as the list of the most deprived regions into proportions that won’t be easily achieved bearing in mind the resource envelope at hand.

---


\(^6\) The most deprived regions (in regards to food security; income and production; education; health and nutrition services, were Dodoma, Kagera, Lindi, Kigoma, and Coast Regions. Page 12, of the Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP), October 2000.

\(^7\) United Republic of Tanzania; Interim Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP); 14th March 2000
Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (October 2000)

The Final PRSP, the National Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP), was issued in October 2000. The document provides a more comprehensive and consolidated overview of the poverty reduction consultation process and measures to be implemented by the various sectors in Tanzania for the next three years.

Poor roads were identified in the document as one of the main causes for income poverty. Rural road network in Tanzania within the context of PRSP constitutes most of the Regional, District and Feeder Roads amounting to about 74,000 kilometers. Potential impact of improved road network infrastructure on poverty reduction cannot be dismissed. Indeed, poor conditions of rural roads are a critical constraint to development of the agriculture sector, upon which the majority of the rural poor depend on for their livelihood. Poor conditions of roads limit accessibility and raises costs of accessing facilities, services and goods.

In the section on rural sector development and export growth, the PRSP categorically states that “local communities will play a more active role in rehabilitating and maintaining rural roads” (page 21), a fact that provides proof on the intended goal of involving, through employment, more rural residents in the rural roads sector. The paper also indicates that particular attention was to be directed at deprived regions. The proposed budgetary allocation for the rural roads sector was: 46.9 billion shillings in 1999/00; 86.8 billion shillings in 2000/01; 92 billion shillings in 2001/02; and, 76 billion shillings in 2002/03. The proposed funds were supposed to cater for subventions to local government authorities, Road Fund allocations to districts, and Ministry of Works Sub-Vote on Other Charges. The projected results after the three year period were supposed to consist of:

- 4,500 kilometers of rural roads rehabilitated in twelve regions identified as the poorest (e.g., Dodoma, Kagera, Lindi, Kigoma, Coast, Mtwar, Morogoro, Mara, Tanga, Rukwa, Tabora and Singida).
- Routine and periodic maintenance promptly undertaken on all rural road networks.

The improvements were anticipated to be achieved through increased budget allocations to rural roads. Secondly, through application of labour based technology in the rehabilitation and maintenance activities. Thirdly, through increased utilization of local contractors. Lastly, through strengthened capacity for managing district roads by local contractors.

The First Draft Progress Report on PRSP I (2000/01)

The May 2001 Draft Progress Report on the PRSP I8 assessed the government’s particulars on the contents of the rural road component in the PRSP and the cost estimates on interventions required to meet targets with regards to district, trunk and regional roads. The Progress Report also responded to specific issues raised by stakeholders concerning substance and practicability of the rural roads programme. Generally, the resource envelope for the roads sector experienced a shortfall averaged at 47% of the required amount for the road sector in totality, as well as 22% of the requirement for the rural roads in specific (Table 23).

---

8 United Republic of Tanzania; Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper: Draft Progress Report 2000/01 (Summary); May 2001 (Summary).
The assessment encouraged the Government to develop an outlook on interventions required for seeing improvements on rural roads through to 2010. The outlook included a costed programme for the three-year period ending fiscal year 2003/04.

The Draft report also presents plans to review the roles of the Regional Consultative Committees (RCC) and the Regional Road Board with the aim of avoiding duplication in their respective mandates. Efforts were being made to strengthen the offices of District Engineers and clarify the role of the TanRoads in this sub-sector. However, while the launching of the Road Fund, Road Fund Board, and TanRoads was a welcome development, the construction, rehabilitation, and maintenance of trunk and regional roads continued to be constrained by shortage of resources. For instance the resource gap for the rural roads maintenance and rehabilitation was projected as being: 593.5 million shillings in the 2001/02 fiscal year; 924.2 million shillings in the 2002/03 period; and, 713.7 million shillings in the 2003/04 period. Altogether, the roads sector was facing a resource gap of: 37 billion shillings in 2001/02; 43.5 billion in 2002/03 and 45.2 billion in 2003/04. The government also tried to refocus on the poverty reduction objective under PRSP in linking it to the improvement of regional roads, domestic and cross border traffic, and traditional exports.

It was against that backdrop that the Government pledged to set aside 1.8 Billion shillings on a monthly basis (starting May 2001) in order to improve transport links to the northwestern and southern regions, of the country. The initiative was to be accompanied with efforts to accelerate implementation of externally funded road projects, and to bolster resources of TanRoads.

The Second Draft Progress Report on PRSP I (2001/02)

The Second Draft Progress Report of the PRSP I, contains clear and detailed achievements in the road sector. While the focus was to improve the condition of the road network with special attention to the most vulnerable and poor regions of the country, the detailed planned interventions for the roads sub-sector were identified as being:

- Allocation of 1.8 Billion shillings on a monthly basis to improve the transport link to the northwestern and southern regions of the country.
- Increase of normal budget allocations to facilitate rehabilitation and maintenance of eight most vulnerable and poor regions of the country
- Rehabilitation of feeder, district, and regional road network in the poorest eight regions.
- Special attention to footpaths, tracks and trails and to mobilize communities in carrying out needed improvement.
- Carry out routine maintenance, emergency repair and spot improvement in all districts to ensure uninterrupted use of roads.
- Develop and prepare a program similar to the “Urgent Road Rehabilitation Programme” ( URFP) for the districts, feeder and urban roads.
- Improve the capacity of district engineers to manage execution of road maintenance works at district level.

The above planned interventions were all presented in a manner that failed to create a definite link to cross cutting issues or poverty reduction.

---

9 United Republic of Tanzania; Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper - Second Draft Progress Report 2001/02; March 2003
Budget Speech and Provisions on Cross Cutting Issues

It is also imperative to assess the Ministry of Work’s commitment to addressing cross cutting issues in its annual resource allocation statements as captured in the budget speech read in Parliament by the Minister. These statements provide an indication on what development issues the ministry focuses on annually and how it intends to deal with the issues.

The 2001/02 Ministry of Works Budget Speech

The 2001/02 Budget Speech\(^\text{10}\) allocated seven paragraphs (or 4 pages), to addressing labour based technology matters (e.g., 2 paragraphs), as well as women participation (e.g., 4 paragraphs). The labour based paragraphs touched on the distribution of 435 manuals (out of 500 copies), to regional engineers, district engineers, contractors, consultant engineers as well as other stakeholders. The minister also mentioned the resolve to strengthen the Appropriate Technology Institute in Mbeya (Kiwira), and the issuance of guidelines on labour based technology to all stakeholders.

Besides reminding that the ministry had engaged efforts to increase women’s participation in road works since 1992/93, the minister stated that already 20% to 35% of labour in road works was contributed by women. The intended focus was to increase women’s employment in road works; mobilize more girls into science subjects; and, train 30 government workers to mobilize school girls into science and technical subjects. The minister also mentioned that Denmark had assisted the ministry to create strategies for women involvement up to village level through WEQA (Women Evaluators and Quantity Surveyors Association). The ministry had planned to engage gender budget training in the stated year.

The 2002/03 Ministry of Works Budget Speech

The 2002/03 Budget Speech\(^\text{11}\) allocated six paragraphs (or 4 pages), to addressing labour based technology matters (e.g., 3 paragraphs), as well as women participation (e.g., 3 paragraphs). On the labour based technology, the focus remained on distribution of guidelines; dissemination of a Labour Based Technical Manual (Volume 4); assisting Mbeya’s ATTI center with equipment; developing a National Framework for labour based technology; and, developing the Labour Based Documentation Center.

On the women participation side, the minister mentioned that progress achieved was mainly: 14 regions were now involved in piloting women’s involvement in road works to between 20% and 35% of labour force (e.g., Lindi, Mbeya, Iringa, Ruvuma, Morogoro, Dar Es Salaam, Coast, Kagera, Arusha, Kilimanjaro, Tanga, Shinyanga and Mbeya). NORAD\(^\text{12}\) was stated as assisting in gender training of 35 Directors and Deputy Directors in the Ministry.

---

\(^{10}\) Pages 52-55: Hotuba Ya Waziri wa Ujenzi, Mheshimiwa John P. Magufuli (MB), Akiwasilisha Bungeni Mpango wa Maendeleo na Makadirio ya Fedha kwa Mwaka 2001/02. Jamhuri ya Muungano wa Tanzania. 2001

\(^{11}\) Pages 27-31: Hotuba Ya Waziri wa Ujenzi, Mheshimiwa John P. Magufuli (MB), Akiwasilisha Bungeni Mpango wa Maendeleo na Makadirio ya Fedha kwa Mwaka 2002/03. Jamhuri ya Muungano wa Tanzania. 2002

\(^{12}\) MoW’s recommended guidelines on women’s participation are based on a study that was prepared by IDSWSG for NORAD in March 1987, based on the rural Roads Maintenance Programme (RRMP) in Mbeya and Tanga regions.
Meanwhile Finnida (in Lindi and Mtwara), DANIDA (Pwani), SDC (Morogoro), UNDP (Mwanza), and EDF (Ruvuma and Iringa), have all facilitated creation of groups of women small scale contractors and therefore increase the involvement of women in road works to around 35%. The minister ended by saying that the ministry shall continue with gender budgeting training and aims at increasing women’s involvement in the road works sector from 35% to 50%.

The 2003/04 Ministry of Works Budget Speech

The 2003/04 Budget Speech\(^\text{13}\) allocated three paragraphs (or 3 pages), to addressing labour based technology matters (e.g., 2 paragraphs), as well as women participation (e.g., 1 paragraph). On the labour based technology side, the minister linked poverty reduction with labour based methods, by stating that “kutumia nyenzo na nguvu kazi zinazopatikana humuhumu nchini” is a way of increasing incomes for rural residents. The minister said the focus in the past year was: follow up on the labour based technology interventions in various regions; training District Engineer on DROMAS (District Roads Management System); facilitating the ATTI center in Mbeya; and the preparation of a policy that shall guide the application of labour based technology in Tanzania (the Framework Document had already been prepared).

On the women participation side, main observations by the minister were that all regions were now involved in addressing promotion of women’s participation in road works through use of various IEC materials. The goal was still to increase women’s participation from the present 35% to 50% in 2005. Mobilisation of secondary school girls into science and technical subjects, as well as gender budgeting training were the other ongoing interventions. The latter was supposed to cover, TanRoads managers from all regions as well as budget officers from the ministry.

The Medium Term Plan for Growth and Poverty Reduction

The “Medium Term Plan for Growth and Poverty Reduction”\(^\text{14}\) identified opportunities and potential for the road sector development as including: a large pool of cheap labour; plentiful sources of construction materials such as gravel, aggregates, lime, sand, water, etc; as well as, articulated policies for sustainable development and poverty reduction.” (page 66). The plan identified the road network as one of the key sector for economic growth and proposed that the reduction of poverty will in the medium term period be adopted from the following objectives for the road sector:

- Support the development of human resources.
- Build a competitive climate in the road construction industry, and,
- Train and assist local contractors in capacity building to enable them compete equally for construction works.


Among the 12 the strategies\textsuperscript{15} identified for implementing the seven objectives, were:

- Mobilizing rural communities to carry out the construction, rehabilitation and maintenance of rural roads.
- Promote the use of local private sector consultants and contractors.
- Mainstream gender issues in road sector policies, plans and budgets.
- Evolve efficient road maintenance technologies especially those which are labour intensive.

As was stated in the \textbf{Household Budget Survey}, “Income poverty has only significantly declined in urban areas. While the proportion of people living below the poverty line has decreased, their numbers has increased.” The survey showed that 87\% of the poor population lives in rural areas, with 36\% of Tanzanians living under the basic needs poverty line.

\section*{Lessons Learnt in Rural Roads Sector}

Generally the road sector is a complex area. As things stand at the moment, the sector is proliferated with quantitative set of criteria fro prioritizing rates of return to improvements of existing networks.

As seen in the preceding sections above, it appears that the sector is handicapped in regards to creating strong associations to poverty and labour based elements. This is proved by the fact that goals and targets in the road sector component are always based strongly on physical lines rather than socio-economic gains at individual, household and community level. Criteria used to allocate road projects, though argued on regional deprivation indices, raises distributional concerns.

Arguments tendered for the justification are based on internationally traded commodities (cashew nuts or cotton), reduced transport costs (mainly for trucks not buses), and competitive internal trading systems (which are imply more aggressive entrepreneurs gaining). All of the itemized are factors that favour the better placed rural or urban residents instead of otherwise. Households based outside the market system normally do not benefit because impact depends on geographical location and actual economic potentials. The problem is that the economic based criteria used for developing roads favours the more affluent individuals, politically well disposed communities or resource rich areas.

\section*{Local Government Authorities}

- Local Government Authorities \textbf{lack capacity} to manage district, urban and feeder roads.

Ongoing reforms in local government authorities should go further to establishing a mechanism that will ensure that the road network under their jurisdiction is managed properly by local authorities. It should then be the role of the Director of Roads to ensure that all local government authorities use the same decision making process as other roads in terms of selecting and prioritizing investments in the road construction, maintenance and improvement.

Ministry and District Road Plans

- The delay in rolling out is that the programme needs funds for rolling out. It is therefore important that PO-RALG take the lead to identify funding for this important activity.

The Ministry has planned for the Urgent Road Rehabilitation Program (URRP), under the Trunk and Regional Roads Network and the Ten Year Road Sector Rehabilitation Programme (10 Year Plan), while the District and Feeder roads have developed District Roads Management System (DROMAS), which needs to be rolled out to other Districts.

Resources and Capacity

- Thus lack of resources and inadequate capacity are issues to be addressed for the success of the programme.

There must be a deliberate move by the Government to underscore the importance of strengthening capacity at the district level. Strengthening local government capability through training and allocation of skilled manpower.

Employment of Women in Trunk Road Projects

- With respect to poverty reduction strategy the Ministry is currently employing more than 700 people (mostly laborers) at the Chalinze – Melela roads rehabilitation project. Out of these about 12% were women, which have an impact on poverty reduction. While on the Makuyuni – Ngorongoro Road that is being upgraded to bitumen standard about 500 people (mostly labourers) are employed and although only 2% were women, but the impact on poverty reduction is considered present.

Income Opportunities to Women

- In the Southern Highland Zone, several small scale contracts were awarded to village contractors and communities involving women. In Arusha for example 50% of small scale contracts executed were awarded to women.

The effect is that income is generated to local communities, which ultimately contributes to poverty reduction in the country.

Financial Resources

- Limited financial resources to raise the condition of roads to maintainable status, implying a need to go beyond the Road Fund Resources.

Road Sector Reforms

- More needs to be done with respect to road sector reforms to ensure smoothness of operations in road works in road works and road network administration.

- Enhancement of technical and managerial skills by the Local Government Authorities.
Challenges and Constraints

The government is implementing measures to address outstanding problems in the sector by carrying out the following initiatives:

Resources for the Road sector

- Inadequate budgetary allocation to road rehabilitation and periodic maintenance and spot repairs for the entire planned network.

Use of Labour Based Technology and Methods

- Use of Labor Based Technology which promotes employment of women and men, in rural areas, in rehabilitation, routine, periodic and spot improvement for the whole network has not been very successful. Constraints include resistance by engineers at district and national levels in accepting labour based methods instead of equipment based methods.

Employment of Women in Maintenance Work

- National average on women employment in the road sector (30%), does not tell the entire story on variations within different districts and regions.

Capacity Building at District Level

- Improvement of capacity of District Engineers to manage execution of road maintenance works at district level, should also include their acknowledging and appreciating the necessity of applying labour based technology and methods within road works in their districts.

Engendering Various Manuals

- Need for preparation of technical manuals for road rehabilitation and maintenance works, contract administration & managements, technical standards and work specifications, unit rates, procurement procedures, environmental guidelines, road sign & safety, gender and social issues, M&E etc., to 113 districts.

Popularisation of Village Based Accessibility Needs

- Late up scaling and dissemination of VTTP programme package tools to 113 districts (including training, baseline access study, capacity building, guidance notes etc.

- Footpaths tracks and trails and to mobilize communities in carrying out needed improvement not given sufficient emphasis.
The Concept of Women Participation in Road Works
Study on Women Participation in Road Works in the Coast region
Kafanabo and Macha

Welfare Level

Participation at this level means receiving benefits. Thus one may say that women are participating in a roadwork because they are receiving benefits, e.g., the use of roads. At this level one does not make decisions nor is involved in implementing the activities decided for by others.

Implementation Level

At this level one is able to implement decisions made by brothers. In road works participating at this level would mean getting opportunity to be involved in road works. Women are not participating at this level as they have been denied the opportunity to work in the roads.

Decision-Making

At this level one is involved in making decisions on road works. Decisions could be related to the roads to be worked on, the choice of contractors, laborers, the amount of payment. Women are seldom participating at this level.
Gender Analysis of the Rural Roads Sub-Sector

Macro Policy Working Group (MPWG), government of officers, donors, and NGOs has greatly contributed to engendering the PRSP First Annual Progress Report. The MPWG has been responsible for facilitating analysis of key government documents in quest to ensure that gender aspects have been adequately mainstreamed. Although the PRSP and Progress Report outline the government’s commitment to mainstreaming gender, government staff is not fully equipped on how to do this. In the year 2002, the Ministry of Finance prepared tools for institutionalizing gender mainstreaming and give it a government ownership.

As we saw above in the section on speeches by the Minister of Works, the ministry has been actively engaged in engendering its structure and activities since 1991. The Ministry formed a Women Participation Unit, which was mainly responsible for promoting more women to be involved in road works. This was aimed at enabling women to benefit equally as men in acquiring skills and income.16.

Women’s Participation Unit

For a long time the location of responsibility for gender mainstreaming at the Ministry of Works was entrusted to the Women Participation Unit. The Unit has existed for more than 10 years in connection to IRP 1. The Unit was previously staffed with two female employees, but is currently managed by a lone staff. According to the WPU, the problem with promoting women’s participation in road works is limited by people’s attitudes. It was argued that the 35% participation of women could be achieved if various Directors at the ministry possibly will support the goal. The Unit is responsible for Trunk and Rural Roads only (other departments such as Government Buildings, Policy and Planning, Administration and General, Supplies and Services, Electrical and Mechanical, Finance and Accounts, etc are outside this Unit’s mandate).

Most project documents were said to seal terms on employment and participation and therefore render impossible opportunities for including women's participation. Even where contractual obligations recommended involvement of women, such as in the Himo-Arusha road, contractors get away from fulfilling quotas on employment of women without punitive measures (the African Development Bank’s 30% requirement for women employment was neglected by the contractor and not enforced by the Tanzanian officials). Reasons given for women’s low participation contradict the fact that Arusha and Kilimanjaro have some of the highest participation by women in road works.

The new Procurement Act was mentioned as one of obstacles in restricting participation of women small scale contractors, due to the registration requirements and expenses involved. Nevertheless, Arusha and Kilimanjaro regions’ TanRoads managers have managed to find ways of employing women small scale contractors in vegetation control and other small works. In fact the Procurement Act has increased costs for various works, for instance while small scale contractors used to charge 350’000 to 500’000 shillings for vegetation control jobs, which are now charged between 1.8 million and 2 million by the Class 7 and above contractors.

16 J.C.Kafanabo; Final Report on Planning Workshop For Women Participation in Road Works; Morogoro May 1993
The WPU suggests that commitment by different staff members on women’s participation in government funded projects should be enforced on the contractors. Also the minister of works, and the permanent secretary should speak more often on women’s participation as they do on HIV/AIDS. The WPU mentioned that the Ministry’s Strategic Plan for 2004/2007 aims at the following measures: increasing number of women participating in road works by 2%; increase number of women expressing satisfaction with in participation in road works; increase the number of staff undertaking gender sensitization in women’s participation in the construction industry.

**Gender Mainstreaming Focal Point**

The Gender Desk at the Ministry of Works was established in September 2003. A Principal Establishment Officer (from the Department of Administration and Personnel), is handling gender issues. The focal point pointed out that initially it was only women’s participation that was focused upon, and that now a gender perspective was at last to be engaged. Low gender awareness and sensitization was identified as the main gap at the ministry. Other weaknesses were mentioned as being: domination of men among the Director positions; Ministry’s strategic plan not taking on board gender issues effectively; absence of a comprehensive gender mainstreaming plan; and, contractors having poor provisions on addressing gender issues.

The Gender Focal Point suggests 4 measures to be taken by the ministry in order to strengthen gender mainstreaming. These include: creation of a Gender Committee in the ministry comprising of members from all Departments as well as agencies under the ministry (about 10 to 12 people); training or sensitizing the Committee members in their roles and responsibilities as regards gender mainstreaming; sensitizing senior management at the ministry on gender issues; establishing gender disaggregated data base on employees according to sex, age, functions, qualifications, etc; securing adequate funding for the Gender Committee and its activities. Altogether the ministry has more than 1’973 employees.

**Cross Cutting Issues in Policy and Planning**

Discussions with the Policy and Planning Department revealed cross cutting issues addressed by the ministry include: gender, HIV/AIDS, environment and labour based methods. The ministry has an environmental assessment expert and Unit, a gender focal point with a committee in formulation, a women participation expert and Unit; and, an Appropriate Technology Unit with two staff members. There is also a person responsible for HIV/AIDS, and who makes follow-up with the ministry of health.

According to the Department of Policy and Planning, gender mainstreaming started in Mbeya region with NORAD engaging women as drivers and technical workers. However, the challenge was the question “how does gender fit into the ministry of work”? Also how does one measure success in gender mainstreaming? Nowadays there are more female contractors than in the last decade. Is this a product of policy changes in the Ministry of Education & Culture, Ministry of Works or the Ministry of Community Development, Gender and Children? It was argued that there are many issues requiring clarification, and that there is a need to identify areas where gender mainstreaming could be most effective. Questions to be answered include: are there jobs that women could find most suitable, or jobs that are least suitable for them?

---

Contractors were seen as reluctant to train women in new operations, because their profit maximization motive would be dented. Instead contractors depended on job mobility to acquire labour in new sites. They used people who had earlier worked on road sites and gained competence. TanRoads feels reluctant to tie up contractors into employing women.

Poverty reduction was identified as the reason for engaging labour based technology and similar methods in road work. Maintenance work was seen as an entry strategy where income generation could be promoted for the rural poor. This could benefit more people living near the road. It is expensive to ship labour from other areas for such work. So this was an area where promotion of cross cutting issues could gain prominence.

A report on “The Estimated Potential for Use of labour Based Methods in Road Works in Tanzania”, done by the ATU in 1995, showed that routine maintenance of all types of roads in Tanzania could generate up to 32,000 employment positions, while periodic maintenance through labour based methods could employ up to 17,000 Tanzanians. Rehabilitation generates employment of up to 26,000 people. In all, up to 75,000 employment positions could be achieved if these methods were applied regularly.

However, it remains important to determine what the specific targets for women participation or other cross cutting issues should be. There is a need to establish the human resource requirement for a whole year, and engage policy to determine future requirements.

The rationale for this promotion of cross cutting issues, especially gender, should be established with clarity. There is a need to establish whether the promotion is based on utility arguments, technical arguments, policy arguments, economic arguments, etc. The goal should always be to balance proportionally between women and men without leaving men worse off.

### Table on Women involvement in the road sector

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution/Programme</th>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Achievements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TANROADS</td>
<td>Arusha</td>
<td>50% of small scale contracts awarded to women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Southern Highland zone</td>
<td>Small scale Contracts awarded to village contractors and communities involving women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lindi</td>
<td>Several women contractors were trained in road works under support of FINNIDA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PORALG</td>
<td></td>
<td>LBT projects to achieve gender targets by making it obligatory for 60% LGAs based LBT projects to include women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOW</td>
<td>RAS offices in all regions</td>
<td>Training on engendering budget targeting Planning officers in RAS and Ministries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LBT</td>
<td></td>
<td>30-40 % of LBT work included women</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Gender and Poverty Gaps in the Rural Roads Sector

It is apparent that there are quite a number of steady and progressive achievements in gender mainstreaming at the Ministry of Works as well as in the districts and regional based projects. Nonetheless, the challenge emerging from the existing gaps in terms of consistency, regularity and undivided commitment in gender mainstreaming seem to burden the sustainability of the successes so far. Women can participate in all road works. But patriarchal attitudes and gender stereotyping still perpetuate the marginalization of women. Even so, gender and poverty gaps abounding in the rural roads sector include:

- Unfair recruitment system and shortage of appropriate information on opportunities available to women in the road works.
- Deficiency in of support services for women.
- Gender mainstreaming in the rural road works sector through labor based technology has not reached the expected level. For example, out of 484,554 worker-days clocked in the Mwanza UNCDF funded road works, in villages along the project roads only 20% of the labourers were women. It should be called for to endorse labor based methods as the choice approach in all road works funded under the poverty reduction envelope.
- Deficiency in necessary skills for road works (women’s low level of education), leading to employment gaps, few women participating in management and decision making.
- The 10 Year Road Sector Development Programme and PORALG’s 3 Year Road Rehabilitation Programme do not have targets on gender and other crosscutting issues.
- Inadequate confidence among women due to stereotype characteristics among men in the sector (e.g., cultural and traditional norms that discourage full women’s participation in the road works).
- Unsatisfactory attempts at mainstream gender aspects in the road sector, especially in decision-making, management and technical levels.
- Pilot programme on women involvement in road works is yet to roll over into the remaining 6 regions of mainland and the 5 regions in Zanzibar.
- Lack of gender-disaggregated data and information at all levels in the construction sector. Therefore there is little profound information on how improvement of roads affects, especially, women and children. On promoting gender equity in employment at the Ministry, disaggregated gender database should be developed.
- Limited efforts to promote rural accessibility (community development initiatives and public works programme) for poverty reduction. Only 6 regions out of 21 regions have been covered.

18 Joyce. C. Kafanabo and Veronica Macha; Study on Women Participation in Road Works in the Coast Region; The Royal Kingdom of Denmark – Danish Development Agency
VTTP activities which have been targeted to improve transport infrastructure, promote intermediate means of transport and non transport interventions have only be carried in 6 districts out of 117 districts in Tanzania Mainland. 50% of the gang leaders trained in labor based technology are women.

Insufficient gender awareness and literacy among women.

Organizational capacity constraints that require tendering process and all bidders to be considered on similar terms denies more women a chance for employment.

Creation of the Gender Focal Point while not reconciling with the roles and responsibilities of the Women’s Participation Unit, was feared to create an overlapping or apparent duplication of roles. It is suspected that the Gender Focal Point seems challenge the functions of the Women Participation Unit. Presence of these two entities could cause confusion on the coordination of gender issues if their roles and mandates are not articulated effectively.

Suspicion still abounds among some quarters on the efficacy of labor based methods in promoting poverty reduction among women and men, due to poor awareness in the midst of contractors and engineers on how this could be achieved.

Unconditional employment of contractors entirely on equipment based methods is not conducive for enhancement of labor based methods and employment generation among larger sections of the rural poor (in terms of packaging of contracts; availability of information, etc.)

Experience Using LBT in Rehabilitation and Maintenance of District and feeder Roads (Medium term Impact on people and the Government of Tanzania)

By Msangi, H.R.S; and Muijsers, G.

“.In working with a number of government and other institutions (PO-RALG, MoW, TANROADS, CRB, ATTI, NCC, and Donors) at the national level in up-scaling of LBT, the programme observed:

Lack of proper LBT at the national level
Lack of co-ordination between the key players like PO-RALG’s regional secretariat, MoW, TANROADS, District councils, and donors
Lack of national lead institution and capacity for training in labor based technology. Where training was carried out (e.g. by Norconsult, NCC, FINNROADS, and SDP) each had their own training programme
Lack of standardized appropriate documentation for labor based works
Insufficient capacity at the national level to provide technical guidance with regard to LBT...."
What is in Place? *Data, Plans, Strategies and Programmes*

As evidenced above, there is certainly plenty that is in place within this sub-sector. Besides the numerous studies and documentation on women’s participation, the sector also boasts of numerous pilot projects that have shown proof on how women’s participation and the use of labour based technology can be promoted as crucial entry points into poverty alleviation among rural dwellers. Moreover, these experiences have shown clearly that all is possible if the commitment by senior leadership transforms itself into systematic and unrelenting action. The data is there, the plans are in place, the strategies have been developed, and programmes exist. Hereunder are some of the elements in more detail:

- The Ministry of Works is currently piloting a programme on **involvement of women in road works in 14 regions** of mainland.

- The sector has further **designed a programme in Labor Based Technology (LBT)** to, among others; promote employment of poor including women and youth in the road sector.

- The **Village Travel and Transport Programme (VTTP)** has a gender component aimed at promoting women participation in road works.

- The **National Construction Policy (2002)** also has clauses promoting women **involvement** in the construction industry. The Draft Road Act (74) November 2003 makes provision for inclusion of cross cutting issues including gender in activities of the road sector institutions.

- A **gender focal point** has been appointed to ensure the coordinating sector ministry directs the pace of gender mainstreaming in the sector.

- Ministry of Works has set aside **30 million shillings** to implement gender mainstreaming aspects in the coming fiscal year. The money is to attend to the following matters:
  - gender policy implementation; capacity building and monitoring of activities;
  - monitoring study and follow up visits in donor funded projects in regions;
  - promoting increased employment of women in formal road sector initiations through promotion campaigns in Girls Secondary School;
  - awareness raising in 7 region; and,
  - production and dissemination of information education materials.

- The **Road Sector PER 04, for 2004**, is by far extremely well endowed with references and actions on cross cutting issues. The PER (done by NORPLAN), consists of a whole Chapter, 7, on cross cutting issues, as well as Action Plans for the same in its Annexure 7. The Road Sector PER document recommends many useful measures.
  - Indicators proposed for monitoring LBT and other Cross Cutting Issues included: value of work done using LBT implemented by women; value of work done using LBT implemented by youth (age 15-24); value of work done using LBT implemented by men; number of women employed in LBT; number of youth employed in LBT; number of women trained in LBT; number of youth trained in LBT; number of men trained in LBT; etc.
Interventions at Policy, Implementation, and Monitoring levels?

It is actually not called for to design additional interventions other than rallying all stakeholders, government staff and communities on implementing the ones that exist at the moment. As it is commonly known, there are three distinct ways of invigorating communities into developing faster, these include: highlighting education as an instrument in poverty reduction; stressing the notion of skill formulation and building of human capital for productive employment; and, emphasizing the notion of capacity development within both local and central government. It is undeniable that these factors are among the most critical ingredients to overcoming poverty among rural residents.

Strategies that PRSP II requires to put in place should in this case aim at creating better human capital through training and skill formation for productive and remunerative employment. Content of such strategies should include promotion of economic growth (among women and men at households and communities levels); investment in human capital (at village, community and private sector), and, strengthening of the social safety net (e.g., enabling more rural dwellers get opportunities for employment in road works).

Poverty reduction is essentially all about redistribution of resources, by targeting the distribution more towards less fortunate or deprived households and individuals living in under developed areas. This entails influencing changes in labour market policies in a way that creation of more employment to women and men in rural areas becomes a prime motive for justification of PRSP resources. These changes in emphasis require all actors to promote good governance among and within their areas of competence (e.g., Ministry of Work’s staff and contractors, being committed to promotion and application of labour based technology and the employment of women in road works as well as other construction works).

The sector requires consolidating cross cutting issues dimensions in its processes and activities. Gender mainstreaming should be promoted as a means for establishing gender equality at the ministry head offices and among staff in its agencies. This will have to involve continued efforts to employ more women at all levels, as well as foster an environment where gender relations are more conducive to promotion of women professionals in relation to men, especially in high leadership positions such as Directors, Regional TanRoads Managers and District Engineers.

The ministry should also, through its gender budgeting exercises, promote additional measures to create gender balance in resource distribution by allocating more resources towards cross cutting issues and poverty reduction activities. The ministry should be seen to clearly promote pro-poor measures rather than doing “business as usual” with building of roads and other infra structure structures. In order to achieve this, the ministry requires to make an explicit statement in its section within PRSP II, about its commitment to poverty reduction in all activities; to creating a strong monitoring system on promotion of poverty reduction measures such as employment of women and rural residents in all road based activities; and, creating an institutional framework facilitating and encouraging the capitalization of synergies between labour based methods, rural roads maintenance, contractor based works, and poverty reduction for economic development.

The management at the ministry should similarly be more vigilant in ensuring that mechanisms and structures for monitoring and evaluation of gender mainstreaming and other cross cutting issues are well established. This shall also involve ensuring that financial resources or strategies for assuring that sufficient funds exist are in place.
Creation of linkages in poverty reduction interventions in the roads sector to the National Poverty Reduction Strategy, Vision 2025, National Strategy for Gender Development, etc., is another crucial imperative. In all, for the ministry to be more successful in enabling its poverty reduction efforts succeed further, the following activities are essential:

**Community level Interventions**

- Providing **community education** through village meetings to provide gender awareness in road works.
- Encouraging **voluntary women groups** to participate fully in roads construction activities.

**Contract Based Interventions**

- Stipulating the employment of women workers in roads as a **condition in the tender documents**.

**Ministry level Interventions**

- Giving **equal positions and status in leadership** roles in the sector.
- Providing **information to** various departments, key actors and stakeholders within the road sector on **experiences of women** participation in road works in other regions.
- Conducting **study tours** to other regions with women participation programmes.

**Contractor and Field level Interventions**

- Conducting **education and promotional campaigns** targeting at potential contractors, as well as men and women in villages alongside road sites.
- Targeting contractors, road engineers, and government officials involved with road works and the community at large, through **promotion campaigns**, seminars, leaflets and posters.
Recommendations for Engendering Rural Roads Sub-Sector

The next PRSP II section on the roads sector should not be merely business as usual again, but instead the Ministry of Works and other road sector stakeholders should transform the approach to squarely address the poverty obligation more accurately. This will include:

Explicit Poverty Reduction Goals

- Creating more explicit definitions on goals for poverty reduction (at rural levels), employment creation (among women, community members and contractors), resource distribution (from a gender perspective), gender participation (in all levels), and a pro-poor prioritization (in terms of investments and improvements).

Interlinkages with other Policies

- The ministry needs to make its approach to poverty reduction more comprehensive, more interlinked and interconnected to the above aspects, rather than simply limiting the arguments and justifications on technical aspects.

Prioritisation of Women and Rural Poor

- The pro-poor prioritization should in this matter take a hard prioritization of requirements for women and rural poor (semi skilled and non skill jobs near their homes), as has been explained in various sections above.

Gender Budgeting

- Moreover, the ministry should adequately budget and cost all activities on cross cutting issues as a proportion of all existing budgets or resources. This could be in the form of a minimum 5% of all resources in each budget being allocated for promoting specific cross cutting interventions in the requisite project or programme.

Employment policy

- Casual labor force to be recruited from the population living in the locality of the road.
- Women and men are equally eligible for employment and the public must be informed accordingly.

Participation of women

- A quota system of 50% should be adopted in the employment process to make the ratio between males and females 1:1
- Efforts should be made to involve female representatives during the recruitment process.

Guidelines related to recruitment

- Women should be recruited as road workers, attendants or supervisors.
- Village women’s leaders should be involved during the recruitment exercise.
Before recruitment, **general regulations and terms of employment** should be explained to the potential road workers and attendants.

**Organization of work**

- Work should be **organized in groups** where possible, however preferences regarding type of group gender arrangement preferred should be sought.
- Women should be allowed to **participate in group leadership**.
- Payment should be **directly paid** to the employee without using a middle man or woman, and it should be paid fortnightly or on a monthly basis.

**Policy Commitments and Statements for Inclusion**

The newly inaugurated National Construction Policy 2002 clearly defines policy directions aiming at mainstreaming gender in the road sector and stipulates main policy directions for gender inclusion. Perhaps it is opportune that these policy statements should be suggested to be included in the next PRSP II section on the Roads Sector. The statements are:

i) The government and the stakeholders of the industry shall **promote the development, participation and representation of women and youth** in the construction industry and enable them to acquire marketable skills and thus enhance income generation opportunities.

ii) The Government shall at the regional level **establish co-ordination units** to facilitate implementation of women and youth participation activities.

iii) Implement **positive discrimination measures** in order to allow enhanced participation of women in decision-making, planning and management.

iv) Promote **voluntary collaboration forums for women and youth** in technical fields related to the construction industry.

---

**Promoting Women and Youth Participation in Construction Activities**

*Taken from the Workshop on Preparation of Strategies and Action Plan for the Construction Industry Policy (CIP), 2003*

**Actions:**

- Gender Sensitization of stakeholders
- Training on positive discrimination for women and youth
- Training needs assessment for women and youth in respect to construction industry
- Encourage female to pursue science subjects
- Regional coordination units to be established to facilitate implication of women and youth participation
- Review procurement conditions to bolster women participation in construction works at all levels including in contracting
- Positive discrimination in key design positions
- Identify existing collaborative forums
- Capacity building and strengthening capacity for women and youths

*Source: National Construction Council (NCC)*
Action points to be focused by the sector and public at the implementation levels

In order to roll over inclusion of gender concerns correctly in all planning and operational levels of the road sector many actions are required, but collection of **disaggregated data by gender** is a prime area to focus in order to smoothen the planning process at all levels to include gender considerations in order to achieve the ultimate goal of active and effective participation of both women and men in road related programmes. Other crucial actions are:

- Gender **awareness training and empowering women** to actively participate at all levels in decision-making, planning, supervision and management.

- Put in place and strengthen the education, information and communication (IEC) unit at Ministry of Works and PORALG that will be responsible for dissemination of policies, guidelines, strategies and legislations to communities so as to facilitate information exchange among all stakeholders on all aspects of mainstreaming gender dimensions in their daily activities from the household level, community level to the national level through use of media and other communication tools.

- Establish **road sector database** containing information relevant to measure sector performance on gender. Relevant information may include geographical distribution of; women small scale contractors including their socio economic profile and age; women specialist in LBT, and, profile of women benefiting from training in LBT and as small scale contractors.

- List and **profile of women engineers and technicians** at district and regional level; all road projects by type of activities that have involved women.

- Ensure a **fair and equitable representation** of both women and men in regional road boards and other advisory boards countrywide.

- Conduct **training of all board members** to ensure respect of the freedom of both women and men members to contribute during board meetings.

- Ensure both **women and men are consulted effectively** as an integral part of planning and execution process to attain equitable distribution of social benefits within communities.

Proposed Gender indicators

Gender sensitive indicators suggested to be used in the next PRSP II by the Roads Sector should include follow-up and measuring of the following:

i) Number of **women and men participating in road activities**-gender equity employment.

ii) Number of men and women in top **management positions**.
iii) Number of **women contractors** competent enough to carry small scale contracts in the road sector.

iv) Number of **girls taking science subjects** from primary to secondary schools increase in number.

v) Number of LBT recognized **women and youth** (small scale contracts).

vi) Number of **contracts and jobs** implemented by women and youth small scale contractors.

vii) Number of **sensitization workshops** on cross cutting issues.

**Suggested Radical Shift Alternatives in the Sector to Guide the Monitoring Process at all levels**

Engendering of projects and programmes as well as adherence to cross cutting issues, calls for strong hearted and heroic individuals. Implementation of necessary radical measures in order to accelerate changes is not always popular among some elements in male dominated institutions. There is therefore a strong need for taking this as a **long term process** which will be recurrent each year for decades to come.

The poverty reduction and engendering process should be **comprehensive and more focused on problems** of poverty among women and rural poor, rather than just roads and their technical angles.

The ministry should ensure that their **MTEF framework is strongly focused on creation of livelihood and employment for women and rural poor** in each intervention. The thrust should be on promoting active participation and involvement of women and rural poor through an active dialogue among all stakeholders and partners.

Furthermore, the ministry should **create monitorable public management capacity in addressing cross cutting issues, especially gender and HIV/AIDS**, among all technical staff at the ministry and it agencies. Other measures to be engaged by the ministry should include:

i) **Prepare gender focused guidelines** that will enforce compliance of gender inclusion in all road sector projects countrywide including consultation of both women and men on choice of the technologies, site of the project, size of contributions both on investment and operation and maintenance costs.

ii) **Prepare a special training programme for both female and male staff at the ministry and in its agencies** to ensure full empowerment for positive participation of all committee members during decision-making.

iii) **Develop and review of strategies, programmes and plans** in the ministry in each department to include gender.

iv) **Create binding obligations in contract documents** in regards to terms and conditions on ensuring that employment in all activities supports poverty reduction through promoting recruitment of women and rural poor in all activities funded through the PRSP funds.
The Way Forward

The road ahead was predictable from the very onset of this review. What we were doing was creating the rationale and justification to convince others that change must be made if poverty reduction and addressing of cross cutting issues are to be implemented effectively. There is no way other than being honest and sincere on this matter. With this spirit in mind, we suggest the following paths and routes:

viii) Conduct **sensitization workshops** for 25 Top Management and stakeholders of the Ministry on gender issues by October 2005.

ix) Conducive **environment within the Ministry** is felt which provide equal opportunities for unprivileged gender in the implementation of sectoral programs by 2007.

x) Conduct a **one-day training on gender issues** to 15 gender committee Members for preparation of gender disaggregated for the Ministry by January 2005

xi) Ensure **gender-disaggregated data** are available by June 2005.

xii) 12 gender committee members **conduct gender survey** in the Ministry to establish gender-disaggregated database for 10 days by June 2005.

xiii) Circulate **gender focused guidelines** that will enforce compliance of gender inclusion to actors in the sector (by June 2005)

xiv) Ensure all PRS **recognized cross cutting issues** are integrated (in terms of physical and financial targets) into 10-year Road Sector Development Programme and the Regional Road Sector Development Programme by 2005

xv) Address **organizational capacity constraints** by allocating adequate resources to WPU to make it to supervise and follow up sector institutional performance on gender by June 2005.

xvi) Restructure **institutional constraints**, those related to public procurement and the sector policy discouraging use of force account. These conditions are hindering TANROADS to set aside specific contracts for promotion of gender in road works.

xvii) Promote **rural accessibility** (community development initiatives and public works programme) for poverty reduction all 15 regions, which were not covered by 2007.

xviii) VTTP activities targeted to improve transport infrastructure, **promote intermediate means of transport and non-transport interventions** carried in all 117 districts in Tanzania Mainland by 2007.

xix) Recommend that the following goals, objectives and strategies mentioned in the PER Document for the **Roads Sector Public Expenditure Review 2004 (PER 04)**, as regards Cross Cutting Issues be considered for inclusion in the next PRSP II document as regards this sector. These goals include the following:
On Labour Based Activities

- To contribute to economic development and poverty reduction by creating employment in infrastructure investments and optimizating the use of local resources using labour based technologies (LBT).

On HIV/AIDS Activities

- Increase the knowledge and understanding of HIV/AIDS/STIs transmission, prevention and management to workers on road works, camp sites, and surrounding communities.
- Develop HIV/AIDS and poverty reduction strategy.

On Environmental Activities

- Reduce negative impacts of road developments on environment.
- Monitor environmental activities in the road sector.

On Gender Activities

- Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger among women through access to economic opportunities availed by infrastructure development activities.
- Reduce gender inequality resulting from lack of leadership and guidance in road sector development.
- Increase capabilities of women and young people to effectively participate in road sector activities.
Annex 1

PRSP II Policy Matrix for Gender Inclusion – Road Sector


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GOAL 1: Create employment in the provision of infrastructure using LBT</th>
<th>To Contribute to Economic Development and Poverty Reduction by Creating Employment in Infrastructure Investments and Optimizing the Use of Local Resources Using Labor Based Technologies</th>
<th>Objectives</th>
<th>Targets</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>By the year 2007, infrastructure assets created or improved using LBT will be 50% of the value of road works</td>
<td>Develop/review existing policies on LBT</td>
<td>• Policy formulated • Policy adopted</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Develop/review/disseminate LBT standards, manuals</td>
<td>• LBT manuals reviewed • LBT contract procedures and standards disseminated • Dissemination workshops held</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Develop/review monitoring and evaluation system</td>
<td>• M&amp;E System with robust LBT indicators developed • Dissemination workshop</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expand Knowledge capacity in LBT</td>
<td>• ATTI as semi autonomous training institute • Accreditation of ATTI • Modules prepared • Pilot lectures carried • Needs assessment for LBT done • Dissemination workshop</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GOAL B1: Increase the Knowledge and Understanding of HIV/STIs Transmission, Prevention and Management to Workers On Road Works, Camp Sites, and Surrounding Communities</th>
<th>Objectives</th>
<th>Targets</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To create conducive environment for counseling, preventive and management of HIV/AIDS/STI</td>
<td>By 2007, 90% of staff of public road sector institutions, and 80% of other workers (camp sites) on road works have access to information Education including Peer education</td>
<td>Conduct seminars at workplaces and campsites</td>
<td>• Number of seminars conducted and number of attendees</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| | | Prepare and conduct HIV/AIDS STIs education day | • Number of participants  
• Number of education days on the subject | |
| | | Develop and disseminate IEC materials | • Numbers and types of IEC materials distributed | |

#### GOAL B2: To Develop HIV/AIDS and Poverty Reduction Strategy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objectives</th>
<th>Target</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ministry’s policies and plans fully incorporate and address the challenges of the HIV/AIDS pandemic</td>
<td>By 2007, 90% of staff of public road sector institutions, and 80% of other workers (camp sites) on road works have access to information including Peer education</td>
<td>Evaluate existing guidelines</td>
<td>Revised guidelines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Develop guidelines for the integration of HIV/AIDS in development programs</td>
<td>Existence guidelines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Develop database to collect information on the impact of HIV/AIDS</td>
<td>Data</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### GOAL B3: Reduce Negative Impacts of Road Developments on Environment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objectives</th>
<th>Targets</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To strengthen environmental management in the roads sector</td>
<td>By 2007, 60% of engineers and 80% of technicians will have the knowledge and understanding of the environmental issues in the road sector</td>
<td>Develop SDS, guidelines, training manuals and regulations</td>
<td>Documents in place</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Conduct national workshop for 75 road stakeholders for 3 days</td>
<td>Number of workshops conducted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Conduct training workshops for 60 engineers</td>
<td>Number of trainings conducted</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GOAL C1: Monitoring Environmental Activities in the Road Sector</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Objective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To ensure that roads activities have less impact on environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GOAL D1: Eradicate Extreme Poverty and Hunger Among Women Through Access to Economic Opportunities Availed by Infrastructure development Activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Objective</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| To promote greater involvement of women beneficiaries at project, planning, and implementation stages to ensure access to jobs and contracts | By the year 2007, value of contracts and jobs implemented by women and youth small scale contractors will be 30% and the number of women and youth involved in construction industry will be 2-5% | Conduct seminars to sensitize women to opportunities offered by the construction industry | • Number of seminars  
• Number of participants |
| | | Develop and distribute information materials on opportunities in construction industry | • Number and types of promotion materials used. |
## GOAL D2: Reduce Gender Inequality resulting From lack of Leadership and Guidance in Road Sector Development

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objectives</th>
<th>Target</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Ensure inclusion of gender in all priority sector strategies, programmes and plans | By 2007, all operational strategies, programmes and plans of LGAs and TanRoads should contain brief description of the baseline position on promoting women participation in the road sector and, with appropriate targets for the anticipated impact | Gender sensitization workshops | • Number of workshops  
• Number of participants |
| | | Develop and review of strategies; programmes and plans to include gender | • Number of documents reviewed or developed |
| | | Develop and disseminate guidelines on gender mainstreaming in road sector | • Develop guidelines |
| | | Monitor gender mainstreaming activities road sector institutions | • Gender monitoring management system |

## GOAL D3: Increase Capabilities of Women and Young People to Effectively Participation in Road Sector Activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objectives</th>
<th>Target</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| To strengthen capacity of women and young people through training in LBT, entrepreneurship and other appropriate technologies | By 2007, 30% of expenditure allocated to training in LBT and other emerging road technologies will target women and young people (age 18-25) | LBT training/trial contracts | • Number of LBT contracts for training  
• Number of participants |
| | | Disseminate LBT Manual to LGAs and other district level implementing agencies | • Number of LBT Manual disseminated |
Observations and Comments from the PRSP Consultative Sector Review Workshop

The presentation of this report at the PRS Consultative Review Workshop held at the Courtyard Hotel from 25th to 27th March 2004, attracted several observations and comments from the participants. The observations and comments ranged from questions that sought to know whether women were being overburdened, to inquiry whether wages were fair between women and men. The complete range of questions is presented hereunder:

1. Are disparities in wages between women and men in roadworks?

   *This report and field visits by this consultant showed that there are a few cases where contractors pay women less than what they pay men. However the practice is sporadic and random among the contractors. The trend among most contractors is paying equal rates to all labourers irrespective of their sex. The daily rate in Tanzania at the moment is Shillings 1'200 per day.*

2. How are women small scale contractors going to be accommodated in the new Procurement Act?

   *The new Procurement Act actually has several provisions for small scale contractors. The main requirement is that all firms or organisations that tender for jobs, be registered in some way. Former petty contractors can be registered as small scale contractors and be legible for jobs that are below the Class 7 registration category.*

3. Why is it that in Magu communities are putting up resistance towards bulldozers and graders that are building roads?

   *Road works in Mwanza Region have of recent been done through labour based methods. The use of machine based methods means less employment and income earning opportunities for the local communities. This might be the reason why there was resistance to permitting bulldozers and graders on the roads in Magu.*

4. What type of jobs is done by women on road sites? Are there any women or men specific jobs?

   *In most road sites women are not discriminated on which jobs they can or cannot do. But discussions with most contractors show that women have a preference for less taxing work, and prefer letting men do the most demanding works. The type of work which women dislike are loading sand or aggregates into dumper trucks, or heavy digging work.*

5. What are the inter-sectoral synergies between Ministry of Works and the Ministry of Education & Culture? How can the school mapping process be used by the Ministry of Works in facilitating the improvement of roads leading to schools and other social services?
One of the planning approaches that could enable more synergies between the sectors is accessibility planning. This approach addresses accessibility needs from two main positions, either reducing proximity problems by siting the facilities or services nearer the users, or establishing better roads or paths towards the services or facilities.

6. What is the linkage between roads and other issues such as HIV/AIDS? How can roads be used to facilitate reduction of HIV/AIDS infections?

It is true that roads increase mobility and movement of people and goods. It is intended that improvements shall enable community members move easily as well as be able to ship their goods and services. However, at most road sites, there has been a growing trend of contractors providing information to their workers, and perhaps also labourers, on the risks for contracting or communicating HIV/AIDS from irresponsible behaviour. Some contractors in Mwanza Region have even distanced their camps in remote areas so as to minimize contact with community members. Nevertheless, the onus for preventing HIV/AIDS infections is on the individuals.

7. Are we helping women in encouraging them to take jobs in road sites? Are we not creating more burdens in their work? Is there no risk in causing more divorces for women when we bring them into situations where they mix with men?

Evidence from different road sites in Tanzania, shows that women gain more respect and status when they earn an income. Women in Geita District mentioned to this consultant that gender relations improved in their households, and their men were more respecting and cherished them when they brought home an income. The women also bought capital goods and made important investments for their families. Even though the road work might increase their daily activities, some of the women working on road sites mentioned that this income was valuable to them, especially if we consider that they do domestic work without payment.

8. How is planning in the road sector facilitating the access to services and facilities such as health centers or dispensaries?

The application of accessibility planning is yet to be popularized in most Districts. Thus its benefits will not be fully achieved until this change.

9. Is TASAF’s payment of community members in road works detrimental to fostering a voluntary spirit in community works? Does paying community members increase ownership feelings?

Considering that some of the roads being repaired by the community members belong to the District Council, community members in a VTPP project in Morogoro Rural District’s claimed payment from the Council. The idea of community members earning incomes should not be treated as negative. Most community services are supposed to be paid for, but since the government (local and central) has meager resources, these activities are normally requested to be done voluntarily. However, should there be money for such activities, as in the TASAF case, it should be encouraged because earnings help in reducing income poverty.
After discussion on the above issues, the workshop also contributed more suggestions on how to improve the focus on addressing poverty through the rural roads sub-sector. The suggested improvements are captured below.

**Commendable Poverty Reduction Achievements in the Rural Roads Sub-Sector**

Poverty reduction achievements gained through the rural roads sub-sector are there to be seen. However, the workshop participants identified those achievements that were deemed as more prominent and commendable for the sub-sector. These achievements comprise:

1. Potential for women empowerment through road works. Especially considering the fact that road works offer faster changes in income situations.
2. Commitment and support from donors on promoting women involvement in road works.
4. Woman being provided opportunities to do various jobs on the road sites.
5. Women earning incomes and supporting their families (e.g., in Singida).
6. Good quality roads being made through labour based methods.

**Less Positive Achievements in the Rural Roads Sub-Sector**

Negative developments noted by the participants during the Consultative Workshop in the recent PRS interventions as regards the rural roads sub-sector included the hereunder:

1. Persisting gap in budgetary allocations for rural roads.
2. Poor legal status for village road, especially in regards to applying punitive measures on misuse of roads by over weight trucks that destroy roads.
3. Absence of mechanisms to access the full potential of improved rural roads.
4. Poor protection of female labourers as regards wages and protective gear, and hence promoting gender based exploitation.
5. Poor enforcement of bye-laws to protect women workers on city roads.
6. Over utilization of women in rural roads.
7. Need to strike a balance between employment of men and women and the costs as well as benefits for employing them.
8. Unknown continuity to projects that promote paid labourers in road works (e.g., TASAF interventions).

**What Should be Done for Poverty Reduction through the Rural Roads Sub-Sector**

On what should be done to change, the participants wanted the government to change its current allocation formula be revisited and reviewed by allocating more funding towards local authorities instead of centralised institutions.

1. Engaging a new study to determine whether the current formula for allocating funds to different type of roads is still valid.
2. Ensuring that more funds are allocated towards rural roads from the Road Fund. For instance instead of allocating only 30% of the funds to the districts, the fund should allocate up towards 50% of the funds to districts and rural roads.
3. The focus should be on feeder roads, village access roads and district roads, in that order.
4. Councils should earmark funds for the maintenance of village access roads.
5. Councils should be given support to create own law enforcement agencies for policing their bye-laws. The current use of people’s militia has had problems, in regards to unreasonable demands on payment.

**On Radical Shift towards Poverty in the Roads Sub-Sector**

Radical shift in the manner with which the sector approaches labour based methods, linkages between poverty and improvement of rural roads, or the employment of women in road works, is imperative. The Ministry of Works, and especially engineers and contractors working at road sites or any other construction site require adapting an approach that aims at addressing poverty related problems in the communities where road works are being executed. Other measures recommended at the workshop by the participants were:

1. Promoting change of attitudes among engineers towards more receptive attitudes in regards to promotion of labour based methods, and employment of women on all road sites.
2. Making an inventory of all small scale contractors, especially taking stock of female and youths among the small scale contractors.
3. Encouraging increased recruitment of small scale contractors in various road sites, with emphasis on female and youth as a poverty reduction contribution from the rural roads sector.

**Gender Indicators for the Rural Roads Sub-Sector**

Most indicators used in the current PRS I denote quantitative achievements in terms of road kilometers rehabilitated or constructed. These indicators do not link well with poverty or do not show how poverty has been addressed through the roads that were improved. It was therefore suggested by the workshop participants that the following indicators be included in the next PRS as regards the rural roads sub-sector.

1. Indicators that reflect accessibility to services, facilities and goods.
2. Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) as indicators to measure the impact from improvement of rural roads for rural communities.
3. Extent of community involvement in the selection of roads to rehabilitate.
4. Number of rehabilitated roads leading to community service facilities such as schools, health centers or water.
5. Striking a balance between immediate income generating interventions and those which have long term benefits.
Annex 3

Selected Readings

Bell, Emma., Gender and PRSPs: With Experience from Tanzania, Bolivia, Viet Nam, and Mozambique. Bridge Development – Gender. 2003

Kafanabo, J.C. and Macha, Veronica., Study on Women Participation in Road Works in the Coast Region. DANIDA. 1998


United Republic of Tanzania Draft National Strategy For Gender Development. Ministry of Community Development Women Affairs and Children. 2002


United Republic of Tanzania

Workshop on Developing a Monitoring and Evaluation Design for The Village Travel and Transport Programme. 1999. Ministry of Regional Administration and Local Governments (PO-RALG).


Poverty Monitoring Master Plan. 2001


Transport and Gender Equality: Gender and Development Briefing Notes. [www.worldbank.org/]

gender/ transport/