

SECTORAL ACTIVITIES PROGRAMME

Working Paper

**The use of contract teachers in developing countries:
Trends and impact**

by Alec Fyfe
International Education Consultant

Working papers are preliminary documents circulated
to stimulate discussion and obtain comments

**International Labour Office
Geneva
May 2007**

Copyright © International Labour Organization 2007

Publications of the International Labour Office enjoy copyright under Protocol 2 of the Universal Copyright Convention. Nevertheless, short excerpts from them may be reproduced without authorization, on condition that the source is indicated. For rights of reproduction or translation, application should be made to ILO Publications (Rights and Permissions), International Labour Office, CH-1211 Geneva 22, Switzerland. The International Labour Office welcomes such applications.

Libraries, institutions and other users registered in the United Kingdom with the Copyright Licensing Agency, 90 Tottenham Court Road, London W1T 4LP [Fax: (+44) (0)20 7631 5500; email: cla@cla.co.uk], in the United States with the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923 [Fax: (+1) (978) 750 4470; email: info@copyright.com] or in other countries with associated Reproduction Rights Organizations, may make photocopies in accordance with the licences issued to them for this purpose.

ISBN: 978-92-2-119998-4 (print)

ISBN: 978-92-2-119999-1 (web pdf)

First published 2007

The designations employed in ILO publications, which are in conformity with United Nations practice, and the presentation of material therein do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the International Labour Office concerning the legal status of any country, area or territory or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers.

The responsibility for opinions expressed in signed articles, studies and other contributions rests solely with their authors, and publication does not constitute an endorsement by the International Labour Office of the opinions expressed in them.

Reference to names of firms and commercial products and processes does not imply their endorsement by the International Labour Office, and any failure to mention a particular firm, commercial product or process is not a sign of disapproval.

ILO publications can be obtained through major booksellers or ILO local offices in many countries, or direct from ILO Publications, International Labour Office, CH-1211 Geneva 22, Switzerland. Catalogues or lists of new publications are available free of charge from the above address, or by email: pubvente@ilo.org.

Visit our web site: www.ilo.org/publns.

Printed by the International Labour Office, Geneva, Switzerland

Foreword

The ILO's Sectoral Activities Branch commissioned the research leading to this Working Paper in preparation for the Ninth Session of the Joint ILO/UNESCO Committee of Experts on the Application of Recommendations concerning Teaching Personnel, held in Geneva, 30 October – 3 November 2006. The use of what has come to be known as contractual teachers – education sector workers generally trained for very short periods of time, paid salaries considerably below those of certified teachers and contracted for limited periods of time in comparison to a country's standards for permanently engaged, fully trained teachers – has been growing in recent years under the pressure of limited government budgets for education and increased demand resulting from efforts to ensure universal access to education. Concerned with the increase in the practice of recruiting “volunteer teachers”, a precursor term initially used to describe contract teaching personnel arising from programmes introduced in West Africa in the 1990s, or recourse to truncated training programmes, measures designed in a steadily widening range of countries to deal with these pressures, at its Eighth Session in 2003, the CEART requested that the ILO and UNESCO undertake a study on voluntary teachers and paraprofessionals (another term frequently used to define lesser trained, paid and employed teaching staff), and their impact on the quality of education, the status of teachers and the financial efficiency of education systems. The present paper results from that request.

The paper was prepared by Dr Alec Fyfe, an international consultant on education issues, and a former staff member of the ILO and of UNICEF. Based on an extensive review of existing literature on the subject, the paper provides a broad interregional review of the trends in the use of contractual teachers, and examines a range of impacts on education systems and the morale, status and conditions of the teaching profession. It concludes with a set of policy recommendations for consideration by education system planners and decision-makers.

The paper is intended to shed further light on a significant policy choice facing education systems as the world approaches the nominal deadline of 2015 to achieve Education for All in all countries. As such, it is intended to further stimulate exchanges of information, debate and revisions as needed in current policies so as to ensure universal access to quality education for all learners in the shortest possible time, within a framework of decent work for highly trained, professional teaching staff. ILO working papers are a vehicle for disseminating information on topics related to the world of work and the evolution of social and labour policies and practices. The opinions expressed are those of the author and do not necessarily reflect those of the ILO.

Elizabeth Tinoco,
Chief,
Sectoral Activities Branch (SECTOR),
Social Dialogue, Labour Law, Labour
Administration and Sectoral Activities
Department,
Social Dialogue Sector,
International Labour Office (ILO).

Contents

	<i>Page</i>
Foreword	iii
Executive summary	vii
Introduction	1
What are contract teachers?.....	1
What objectives do contract teachers serve?	2
Country experience in the use of contract teachers	2
The experience of francophone West and Central African countries	2
Anglophone Africa: The experience of Kenya	4
The case of India	5
The experience of the BRAC	7
The case of China.....	7
The case of Cambodia.....	8
Cases from Latin America	9
The impact of contract teachers.....	9
Access	10
Quality.....	10
Equity	11
Impact on the quality of the teaching profession	11
Conclusions and recommendations	13
Teachers cost too much, but earn too little	13
The world can afford EFA, but many countries cannot: The importance of the macroeconomic and fiscal environment.....	15
The need for new indicators.....	17
Contract teachers need to be integrated into the regular teaching force	17
The importance of social dialogue	18
Recommendations.....	19

Executive summary

This paper examines the growing trend towards the use of contract teachers in developing countries as a response both to acute teacher shortages and perceived financial constraints, and their impact on the quality of education, the status of teachers and the financial efficiency in the education system.

Contract teachers are a broad and varied category. Many different types of teachers fall under the label of “contract teachers”, including volunteers, community teachers and para-teachers. However, everywhere, the salaries and conditions of contract teachers are far inferior to those of regular civil service teachers. Contract teachers are typically hired for one year at a salary of one-half to one-quarter of that of a regular teacher and few belong to a trade union. Contract teachers have been used to meet a range of objectives from increasing access to education, particularly in remote and unattractive areas serving minority populations, to providing a source of youth employment.

The most extensive use of contract teachers has been in West and Central Africa in the last decade. In 1995, Senegal introduced an experimental programme of recruiting volunteers and, now along with Niger, has around half its teaching force under short-term contract. However, other countries in the subregion, such as Chad and Ivory Coast, have no contract teachers.

The paper also examines the use of contract teachers in East Africa, Asia and Latin America, where they have been a response to similar factors of perceived high teacher costs, and the need to rapidly respond to post-conflict situations, as in Cambodia, and the increased demand for education. Moreover, in countries as diverse as Kenya, India and Nicaragua, policies to decentralize resources and decision-making to local communities have also fostered the trend towards the use of contract teachers.

Whilst the use of contract teachers has resulted in increasing enrolments, particularly for minority populations, in many countries there has been a trade-off in terms of quality and in an increasingly demoralized teaching force evidenced by teacher absenteeism and turnover. Such a fractured teaching force cannot be sustained long term. Indeed, the need to protect quality consequent on the use of contract teachers may very well nullify any intended cost savings. Moreover, in Cambodia the hiring of contract teachers was suspended due to corruption surrounding the practice.

Governments need to take their obligations under international standards seriously and properly fund an education system of good quality that serves all children. Many developing countries are devoting far less than 6 per cent of their national income to education as advocated internationally. There are no short cuts to quality. Teachers are at the heart of quality improvements. The long-term sustainable answer to teacher shortages is not institutionalizing low cost, non-professional teachers, but decent working and living conditions that make teaching an attractive profession.

Education systems in developing countries need reform to make them more accountable, efficient, and equitable, but governments must give greater priority to mobilizing additional resources for education. The paper concludes by recommending that governments adopt a time-bound strategy to phase out the use of contract teachers by 2015 in line with Education for All (EFA) quality goals.

Introduction

Teacher shortages are a problem worldwide, as the Joint ILO/UNESCO Committee of Experts on the Application of the Recommendations concerning Teaching Personnel (CEART) noted in 2003,¹ but are particularly acute in developing countries.² Few governments have responded to this problem by developing long-term strategies. In far too many cases, governments have adopted short-term finance-driven measures to mitigate the problem.³ The most common response to acute teacher shortage in Africa, Asia and Latin America has been the recruitment of unqualified or not fully qualified teachers – so-called volunteer, contract or community teachers. This trend has been particularly marked in francophone West and Central Africa over the last decade where it has been encouraged by World Bank perspectives regarding cost-effectiveness and efficiency in education.⁴

In response to this trend, the Eighth Session of the CEART deplored the practice of using “volunteer teachers” as undermining the professionalism of teaching.⁵ The CEART report called upon the ILO and UNESCO to undertake a study of voluntary teachers and para-professionals in sub-Saharan Africa and their impact on the quality of education, the status of teachers, and the financial efficiency in the education system.⁶ Against this background, the paper aims to provide a broader interregional review of the trend towards the use of contract teachers in developing countries and examines a range of impacts on education systems and the morale, status and conditions of the teaching profession. Finally, the paper draws together some conclusions regarding the practice followed by a set of policy recommendations.

What are contract teachers?

Contract teachers are a broad and varied category. Many different types of teachers fall under the label of “contract teachers”, for example, volunteers, community teachers, community helpers, volunteer parents and para-teachers. This variety in the use of terminology reflects the diverse policy orientations adopted by developing countries. In general, contract teachers have lower qualifications (lower secondary education or less) and are employed under less favourable terms than regular teachers. They are not civil servants and, in most cases, their contracts are limited to one or two years, usually with the possibility of renewal. Their salaries tend to be considerably lower than civil service teachers, from less than one-half to less than one-quarter on average,⁷ and they rarely have

¹ Report, CEART (Paris, UNESCO, 15–19 September 2003) (CEART/8/2003/11, para. iv, p. v).

² The greatest challenge lies in sub-Saharan Africa where the teaching force will need to increase from 2.4 million to 4 million, an increase of 68 per cent, by 2015. See UNESCO Institute for Statistics: *Teachers and educational quality: Monitoring global needs for 2015* (Montreal, UIS, 2005), p. 41.

³ See Education International Report to CEART, Aug. 2006.

⁴ See in particular, J. Farrell and J. Oliveira (eds): *Teachers in developing countries: Improving effectiveness and managing costs* (Washington DC, Economic Development Institute, 1993).

⁵ CEART, op. cit., para. 37.

⁶ *ibid.*, para. 83(1).

⁷ UNESCO/UIS, op. cit., p. 86.

the same employment or labour rights. In some countries, the only way to become a regular teacher is to first be a contract teacher and, in others, contract teachers are often filling official vacancies. The regulation of contract teachers differs between countries and, in some cases, this is left to local communities rather than public authorities. As a shorthand description, contract teachers constitute low-cost, non-professional teachers.

What objectives do contract teachers serve?

Contract teachers have been used to meet a range of objectives:⁸ (a) to increase access in remote rural areas where regular teachers are disinclined to serve; (b) to provide schooling in post-conflict areas where no teachers are available; (c) to serve ethnic minority populations in which local volunteers can communicate with pupils and parents through local languages; (d) to improve pupil-teacher ratios; (e) to provide assistance to regular teachers; (f) to provide a source of employment for educated youth; and, not least, (g) to offer a cost-saving means to rapidly expand enrolments in primary and secondary schools.

Country experience in the use of contract teachers

The emergence and expansion of contract teachers in different education systems cannot be seen in isolation, but rather must be understood in the context of overall national policy choices regarding education, resource levels, educational challenges and teacher policy frameworks. The following are a series of country case examples from Africa, Asia and Latin America, where contract teachers have been significantly used.

The use of contract teachers has been most marked in West and Central Africa in the last ten years, where some countries now have almost half their teaching force made up of contract teachers. This is the region where finance-driven reforms aimed at containing unit cost has been most influenced by international development agencies such as the World Bank. Senegal was one of the first countries to introduce the practice as a national policy in 1995. However, the use of contract teachers has not been confined to the subregion. Contract teachers have also been a feature of government strategies in Asia and Latin America to reduce teacher costs and decentralize the management and financing of education.

The experience of francophone West and Central African countries

To understand why contract teachers have come to constitute such an important part of the teaching force in most West and Central African countries, it is necessary to consider the overall educational profile prior to the adoption of the practice: low primary enrolment rates of about 37 per cent on average in the subregion; generally overcrowded classrooms; and the relatively high teacher salaries using some measurement standards. To meet the Education for All (EFA) goal by 2015 requires a large increase in teachers and resources.

⁸ Y. Duthilleul: *Lessons learnt in the use of "contract" teachers: Synthesis report* (Paris, International Institute for Educational Planning, UNESCO, 2005), p. 41. This is the principal source for the paper.

In relation to gross national product (GNP) per capita, teachers in West Africa and Central Africa – particularly those from the Sahel region – are, in comparative terms, among the best paid in the world when using the standard measurement of salaries compared to national income.⁹ Despite the fact that teacher salaries have declined in the last two decades, the average teacher in the Sahel countries in the year 2000 earned 6.4 times GNP per capita – in the rest of Africa it was about 4.4 times; in Asia about 2.9; in the Middle East and North Africa about 2.3; and in Latin America 2.3 times the per capita income.¹⁰ For these countries, to increase the number of teachers¹¹ at current average salary levels, to meet the EFA goal, has seemed financially impossible given simultaneous constraints on government revenues and budgets. Put in this context, the use of contract teachers appears an attractive policy option for the subregion.

In the mid 1990s, Senegal needed 2,000 additional teachers per year but could only afford 250. The country was already allocating 4.2 per cent of gross domestic product (GDP) and 30 per cent of its budget to education. Teachers' salaries represented over six times GDP per capita and up to 90 per cent of the education budget.¹² The Government decided to make up this shortfall through an alternative low-cost strategy.

In 1995 Senegal introduced an experimental programme of recruiting “*volontaires*” (volunteers) at primary level. The aim was to recruit, train and appoint up to 1,200 young people between the ages of 18 and 35 – these were overwhelmingly (87 per cent) young people with a baccalaureate or university-level education.¹³ The Government, in launching the Education Volunteers Project (PVE), hoped to: reopen over 500 classes that had been closed due to teacher shortages; halt the decline in school enrolment ratios (20 of 41 districts had gross enrolment rates lower than the national average) and achieve a 65 per cent enrolment rate by 1998; and campaign against youth unemployment and underemployment.¹⁴ The starting salary of a volunteer was about CFA80,000 (approximately US\$160) a month and the ratio of the salary costs of a volunteer to that of a certified teacher in the civil service was about 1:5.4.¹⁵ This enabled the Government to reduce the unit salary cost of teachers in real terms and increase the number of teachers. The experiment was subsequently expanded by legislation in 2000-01 that stipulated that all teachers hired at divisional level would be volunteers that would receive an initial teacher training of three months' duration. After four years of service, they would convert

⁹ Y. Duthilleul, op. cit., p. 35.

¹⁰ *ibid.*, pp. 35–36.

¹¹ See Mingat (2004), cited in Y. Duthilleul, op. cit., who has suggested that the number of teachers in West Africa should increase from 221,000 to about 654,000 by 2015.

¹² Y. Duthilleul, op. cit., p. 33.

¹³ CEART/SP/1997/13, Annex 2, pp. 4–5. This figure of 1,200 has become an annual recruitment target. See CEART/7/2000/10, p. 47.

¹⁴ *ibid.*, p. 4.

¹⁵ C. Colclough et al.: *Achieving schooling for all in Africa: Costs, commitment and gender* (Aldershot, Ashgate, 2003), p. 199. The Single and Democratic Teachers Union of Senegal (SUDES) in their allegation of 1995 quote a salary figure of CFA50,000 as a monthly “scholarship” plus free housing, compared to a monthly salary of CFA110,000 for a starting regular teacher.

to contract teachers,¹⁶ eventually gaining access to the civil service through competitive examinations for jobs quotas that would be determined annually at the decentralized levels.¹⁷ Savings were potentially substantial, particularly during the first four years.

Though Senegal may have started the trend towards contract teachers a decade ago, others in the subregion have followed the example. Niger has over half of its teachers under contract compared to Senegal's 42 per cent, whilst other significant users of the system include Guinea (39 per cent); Togo (31 per cent); Burkina Faso (24 per cent); and Cameroon (20 per cent).¹⁸ Nonetheless, there are striking differences between countries in the subregion regarding the extent to which they have adopted the policy of using contract teachers and the way in which they have managed this policy choice. Ivory Coast and Chad have no contract teachers.¹⁹ However, some countries in the subregion have promoted decentralization of school management, making it possible for parents and local communities to directly hire teachers. Countries that officially have no contract teachers, such as Chad and Madagascar, have relied heavily on community teachers²⁰ subsidized by the State, a practice that operates in parallel to contract teachers in other countries such as Benin.

Countries vary in terms of the initial training offered to contract teachers. Senegal, Mali and Mauritania provide three months' initial training while others, such as Niger and Burkina Faso, offer one year, and Guinea as much as 18 months. In the cases of Senegal, Burkina Faso and Togo, there is a career development plan associated with being a contract teacher, which is not available in other countries.²¹ However there is little evidence that contract teachers once "trained" get much, if any, follow-up professional support.

Anglophone Africa: The experience of Kenya

The anglophone countries in East Africa have a different historical background in terms of colonial experience to that of the francophone countries that has a bearing on teacher salary levels.²² Nonetheless, the perceived teacher-cost problem is also a feature of the subregion and has been tackled in a slightly different fashion through community

¹⁶ The first group of 1,200 volunteers was hired as contract teachers in 1999. See CEART (2000), op. cit., p. 47.

¹⁷ C. Colclough, op. cit., p. 200.

¹⁸ Mingat (2004), quoted in Y. Duthilleul, op. cit., p. 35; "Report of the National Steering Group of NGOs", ILO action programme on: Teachers for the future: Meeting teacher shortages for active Education for All (ILO, forthcoming).

¹⁹ *ibid.*

²⁰ Two-thirds of the primary teacher stock in Chad and more than one-half in Congo are parents recruited to teach in local schools. See UIS, op. cit., pp. 85–86.

²¹ Y. Duthilleul, op. cit. See appendix, table 1, setting out a summary table of contract teachers' employment conditions in the subregion regarding: minimum levels of education; length of initial training; length of contract; career development plan; source of financing; types of management; and payment regularity.

²² See S. Lambert: *Teachers' pay and conditions: An assessment of recent trends in Africa* (Paris-Jourdan, LEA-INRA, 23 Apr. 2004), p. 2.

schools and non-formal education (NFE) that have an equal resonance regarding the status and conditions of teachers.

In Kenya, the Government has steadily invested in basic education since independence in 1963 spending around 6–7 per cent of GDP.²³ However, the impressive growth in primary enrolments witnessed in the 25 years after independence have started to unravel in recent years due to economic decline. In January 2003, the new government policy promoted free primary education leading to a 22 per cent rise in enrolments that exacerbated teacher shortages and limited school facilities. Regional imbalances remained acute. As a response, the Government encouraged public/private partnerships in education of which community schools are one element.

In Kenya, community schools are recognized as non-formal institutions, with their number mushrooming in informal settlements including slum areas in urban centres – they represent more than 18 per cent of primary-school enrolments in Nairobi.

Community schools have a long history in Kenya. They developed quickly from the late 1980s with the rapid growth of city and suburban populations, which outpaced public provision. The gap was filled by community leaders, parents and in some cases non-governmental organizations (NGOs) who developed non-formal community schools. Most teachers in community schools are not trained and are temporarily employed by school committees with no formal contracts and with monthly salaries of less than a half of government primary teachers.²⁴

The case of India

India has the largest number of out-of-school children in the world – an estimated 42 million children. Since Independence in 1947 the goal of free compulsory and universal education, enshrined in India's Constitution, has ever receded.²⁵ Nonetheless, expansion has been marked in the last 20 years with the launching of special programmes aimed at achieving EFA, including a national NFE programme launched in 1978 aimed at the poorest communities.²⁶ Indeed, 75 per cent of the out-of-school population are concentrated in the six poorest states that are most dependent on central Government for any improvements in education. There are serious disparities in education access and quality across India and between social groups and girls and boys.

The recruitment of para-teachers has become the norm in many states.²⁷ The number of para-teachers (as local contract teachers are called in India) has doubled in the last few years to around 500,000 in 2005 and this increase is expected to continue. However, since their salaries do not form part of the official payroll, there are no official statistics. That said, a recent survey shows great variation in the use of para-teachers in major Indian states. The states of Chhattisgarh and Madhya Pradesh appear to have the most with

²³ E. Onsomu et al.: *Community schools in Kenya: Case study on community participation in funding and managing schools* (Paris, IIEP, UNESCO, 2004), p. 27.

²⁴ *ibid.*, p. 42.

²⁵ First target date was 1960; subsequently shifted to 1972, 1976 and 1990.

²⁶ Subsequently abandoned 21 years later as a failure being widely viewed as an inferior track of educational provision.

²⁷ UIS: *op. cit.*, p. 85.

para-teachers comprising around 40-50 per cent of primary-school teachers.²⁸ Rajasthan and Andhra Pradesh are also heavy users of para-teachers. This trend towards greater use of para-teachers has been facilitated by decentralization policies in the last decade that has made it possible to transfer teacher management responsibilities to lower administrative levels. Education in India is a state responsibility that helps explain the variation in practices regarding the recruitment and conditions of para-teachers.

However, this trend towards the use of para-teachers has been supported by the central government policy documents of the late 1990s, such as the recommendations of the National Committee of State Education Ministers, that presented para-teachers as the low-cost solution for teacher shortages, not just in remote and difficult areas, but throughout the whole country. Moreover, these documents expressed dissatisfaction with public service teachers, their absenteeism, lack of motivation and accountability towards the community.²⁹

Some reports have suggested that teachers are in part responsible for poor educational outcomes in India, with instances where teachers appear to regard teaching as part-time, secondary and relatively secure element of their livelihood strategies.³⁰ Government-paid teachers have little incentive to do their job seriously since their appointments are permanent and their salaries are not performance-related. Moreover, as enrolments expand, there is a growing social gap between teachers, who are disproportionately recruited from upper castes and pupils who are increasingly drawn from lower status and caste groups.³¹

The use of para-teachers in India had been pioneered in NFE programmes for out-of-school children and in formal schools in remote areas. In Himachal Pradesh, para-teachers were hired to help single-teacher schools cope with increased enrolments and provide schooling in remote areas where regular teachers were reluctant to go. This policy was also a way of providing employment to educated youth. In contrast to these early initiatives, the schemes introduced in the late 1990s have focused on employing para-teachers in regular schools where normally fully employed regular teachers would have been appointed.

Para-teachers are appointed in two types of situation. First, para-teachers are recruited for postings in regular schools. This scheme has been in place in six states since the launching of the District Primary Education Programme (DPEP) in the 1990s, and other states have joined in the last two years. It has resulted in the virtual cessation of the recruitment of regular-pay-scale teachers in some states, with all vacancies being filled by para-teachers. Second, para-teachers are recruited under the DPEP to work in remote and isolated areas in limited access schools (grades 1–5). In this case, para-teachers have been funded by central Government under the framework of ensuring universal access and not as a means of conserving state government funds.

Local community leadership plays an important part in the recruitment of para-teachers in most states. The honorarium paid to para-teachers varies widely across states, ranging from 900 to 3,000 rupees in urban areas and around Rs.1,000 per month in

²⁸ *ibid.*, p. 85.

²⁹ Y. Duthilleul, *op. cit.*, p. 24.

³⁰ See N. Kabeer: *Deprivation, discrimination and delivery: Competing explanations for child labour and educational failure in South Asia* (Brighton, Institute of Development Studies Working Paper 135, May 2001), p. 20.

³¹ *ibid.*, pp. 20–21.

remote areas. In comparison, a regular teacher receives about Rs.5,000 per month, or about US\$100. Para-teachers are appointed on an annual basis and renewal is possible if performance is satisfactory – in fact in the absence of any appraisal system most para-teachers have their contracts renewed. State governments are protected from legal action under equal pay legislation as most teacher contracts are issued by local bodies. Some states foresee the absorption of para-teachers into regular public service positions after a minimum length of service and completion of certain educational requirements. However, regular posts are being filled by para-teachers, making such provisions somewhat redundant.

Para-teachers are, in most cases, local residents that speak the community language. The minimum educational requirement is 12 years, the same as for a regular teacher, except in remote areas where this is lowered. Regular teachers are required to undertake two years of initial training, while para-teachers are asked to undertake an induction programme of varying length and some days of in-service training during the year.

The experience of the BRAC

The Bangladesh Rural Advancement Committee (BRAC) has been an influential model in developing NFE over the last decade. The BRAC, by far the largest NGO in Bangladesh, became involved in basic education in 1985 when it initiated NFE programmes in 22 villages for 8–10-year-olds. The BRAC provides primary-level instruction for disadvantaged children, 60–70 per cent of whom are girls. Instruction is provided in two types of schools: three-year schools for 8–10-year-olds who have never attended formal primary schools; and two-year schools for 11–16-year-olds who have dropped out of primary school and are unlikely to re-enter. From small beginnings in the mid-1980s, the BRAC expanded rapidly³² and soon caught the attention of the EFA movement.³³

At the heart of the NFE programme managed by BRAC are local para-professional teachers, overwhelmingly educated married women,³⁴ who are hired to teach three hours a day at wages a third of the rate of a government teacher – resulting in teacher costs representing only 29.1 of total expenditure. However, direct supervision and management³⁵ costs are about equal to salary costs – relatively high by international standards. This demonstrates that protecting quality, consequent on using low-cost teachers, can be costly and may offset initial savings.

The case of China

In the last 25 years, China has enrolled more children in school than any other country. China has in that time managed to achieve nearly universal primary education (UPE) despite having the largest number of children to enrol, and with 80 per cent in the

³² In 1989, there were 2,500 BRAC schools which had risen to some 34,000 schools in 1998.

³³ In 1992, UNICEF and USAID conducted an evaluation of the BRAC's NFE programme and found it overall a successful model.

³⁴ This may also account for the very low attrition rate of 8 per cent per year.

³⁵ BRAC staff visit teachers weekly. There is an initial 15 days of training and one or two refresher days per month.

rural areas.³⁶ Reforms introduced in the mid-1980s were important in achieving this goal. In 1986 the Government first enacted the Law of Compulsory Education extending basic education to nine years, decentralizing the financing and administration of education, and started to introduce several market reforms.

Moreover, China has achieved universal education at a lower cost than most other developing countries³⁷ devoting just over 2 per cent of its GNP to education compared to a world average for less developed countries of 3.9 per cent.³⁸

Contract teachers were part of the strategy to expand access in China, particularly in rural and remote areas. Contract teachers hired directly by the local community represented about half of all teachers in primary and secondary education by 1980. Due to the policy of decentralization, teacher quality and school infrastructure vary considerably across regions and between urban and rural areas. For example, in 1997, the recurrent expenditure of urban primary schools was 1.46 times that of rural ones.

Attempts to improve teacher quality by replacing local contract teachers with professionally trained teachers have proven difficult given the shortage of qualified teachers, and have resulted in rural schools being closed and community contract teachers being replaced by substitute teachers with less experience and preparation.³⁹ This may be due in part by the poor salary levels of Chinese primary and secondary teachers who come lowest on the public sector pay scale though there have been recent attempts to improve these.⁴⁰

The case of Cambodia

Cambodia is a unique case of a country that had a long history of using contract teachers and then suddenly decided to break with the practice. After 1979, Cambodia's education system was re-established on the basis of volunteers with minimum education who were later absorbed into the public service a decade later. During the late 1990s, severe teachers shortages re-emerged in rural and remote areas. In 1997, the Government reintroduced the practice of direct appointment of contract teachers as an emergency strategy. Contract teachers were directly recruited by the school director and paid by the State under a fixed term contract of one year. They were offered a salary more or less equal to regular teachers, but without the same benefits, and were not paid monthly.

These contract teachers – hired after 1997 – were largely former teachers who had retired at the age of 55 and young students from remote areas, often of ethnic minority background with low educational attainment, but able to work with children in their own language and trusted by the parents. Contract teachers filled all identified vacancies in 1997 and 85 per cent in 1998. The number of contract teachers reached its highest level in

³⁶ C. Colclough and K. Lewin: *Educating all the children: Strategies for primary schooling in the south* (Oxford, Clarendon, 1993), p. 84.

³⁷ X. Liang: *China: Challenge of secondary education* (Washington DC, World Bank, 2001), pp. 15–16.

³⁸ In the 11th Five-Year Plan (2006–10) this is projected to increase to 4 per cent.

³⁹ Y. Duthilleul, *op. cit.*, p. 13.

⁴⁰ X. Liang, *op. cit.*, p. 18. Even by international standards, Chinese teachers are not well paid. The salary to GDP ratio of less than 1 is low compared to the average of 1.5 to 2 worldwide.

2001 with 4,214 teachers recruited, representing about 9 per cent of the total teaching force.

Suddenly, in around 2002, the Government decided to suspend the practice. Concerns over corruption and abuses in the appointment and management of contract teachers were at the heart of this decision – lack of accountability was the real problem. This change in policy has contributed to the decrease in the share of contract teachers to less than 2.5 per cent, although it has proven difficult to eradicate the practice in some remote areas.

Cases from Latin America

In Peru, contract teachers represent about 11 per cent of the teaching force and, in Chile, up to 20 per cent. In the former, contract teachers were established to make up for teachers shortages in rural areas, but have since been used to substitute teachers on leave, to respond to increases in enrolment, and even to replace teachers while official vacancies are not filled.

In Nicaragua, contract teachers have been part of reforms of the overall teacher management system aimed at transforming incentives and strengthening accountability towards the community. In order to improve quality and efficiency of the system, the Government launched a decentralization strategy in 1993 that promoted school autonomy and introduced changes in teacher contracts. Financial transfers were made to school councils who were given the power to hire and fire teachers within the existing legal framework governing teachers' rights, and it could offer them additional financial incentives (bonus payments) on the basis of performance.

Teachers hired by school councils in autonomous schools have the same legal status and salary⁴¹ as teachers in central controlled schools but serve a one-year probationary period. This probationary period can be extended to two years if the school council deems performance as unsatisfactory. Teachers in autonomous schools also have to teach a minimum of 35 pupils per class, while there is no minimum in central controlled schools. These numbers tend to be higher in urban areas, with about 42 pupils per teacher in primary schools and 49 in secondary schools.

The impact of contract teachers

Reviewing and assessing the impact of contract teachers requires an equally wide scope of examination to that of the case studies presented above. The trend towards the use of contract teachers is, after all, a symptom of much broader education and teacher policies set against the prevailing fiscal and macroeconomic environment or space.

⁴¹ Teachers' salaries remain a challenging issue and a contributing factor to teacher shortages in Nicaragua. The differences in salary between trained and untrained teachers have tended to disappear. In 2003, the average salary for a teacher of 25 years' experience was only US\$100 per month, half that of the public sector rate and insufficient to meet basic needs.

The impact of contract teachers can be examined in terms of two interrelated domains: effects on access, equity and the quality of education and the morale, status and conditions of the teaching profession.⁴²

In exploring these impacts available data permits some issues to be more easily addressed than others. For example, the impact of contract teachers on increasing access or supply of education, particularly in remote areas, is much clearer than the impact of contract teachers on outcomes such as the attainment of pupils.

Access

Contract teachers have played a critical role in expanding access to the hard-to-reach populations in rural and remote areas where regular teachers are usually least attracted to or where there are not enough pupils to open a regular school. These hard-to-reach populations are often ethnic minority groups or other marginal communities.

In West Africa, countries that have relied more on contract teachers have tended to show larger increases in primary school enrolments rates than those who have not. For example, in Niger enrolments doubled over a five-year period, with children in the rural areas being the biggest beneficiaries, with enrolments increasing from 38 to 51 per cent between 2002 and 2005. By 2005, Niger was also one of the world's best performers in terms of completion rates – having been one of the worst five years before. According to the World Bank, a key factor in this transformation was the Government's "courageous reform" of freezing the recruitment of civil service teachers and using contract teachers on a lower salary but on a par with the average teacher salary across low-income countries.⁴³

In China, Bangladesh⁴⁴ and India, contract teachers have been central to increasing access to primary education in the rural areas. In Cambodia, contract teachers enabled schooling to be provided in some remote, post-conflict areas serving ethnic minorities. In Nicaragua, after more than ten years of experience with autonomous schools, enrolment rates have increased from 75 per cent to 83.5 per cent in primary schools, and from 20 per cent to 38.7 per cent in secondary schools.⁴⁵

Quality

Teachers are the key factor in improving the quality of education.⁴⁶ Dilution of the quality of the teaching profession ought to result, therefore, in diminished educational

⁴² Despite the popular notion that there are trade-offs between access and quality goals, they are in fact closely interrelated.

⁴³ World Bank: *Niger: On the right track* (Washington DC, 2004).

⁴⁴ Where para-teachers helped increase the primary net enrolment rate from 76 per cent to 94 per cent between 1990 and 2004; see UIS, op. cit., p. 84.

⁴⁵ Y. Duthilleul, op. cit., p. 31.

⁴⁶ UNESCO: *Education for All: The quality imperative* (Paris, 2004), p. 161.

outcomes such as attainment. However, studies⁴⁷ conducted in West Africa, could not distinguish any difference between the achievement of pupils taught by contract teachers and regular teachers. These studies raise many questions regarding methodology and assumptions used and therefore need to be revisited, as the paper will later argue.

In Nicaragua, third graders in autonomous schools had higher attainment in language and mathematics than those in central schools, but the results were less conclusive for sixth graders. Overall, autonomous schools have a higher public image concerning quality. Indeed, ensuring local accountability is seen as having had a positive effect in Nicaragua on quality outcomes such as pupil performance and reduced drop-out rates.⁴⁸

However, others⁴⁹ have warned that the increased turnover of qualified contract teachers would most likely lead to a decline in the quality of these para-professionals, with consequent negative effects on pupil performance in the long run.

It must be continually borne in mind that the overall educationally quality in all the countries cited in the previous section remains unsatisfactory, in spite of the higher number of educated and trained teachers in the system. In this context, the introduction of contract teachers lacking proper training and support may not aggravate an already bleak scenario. Moreover, the coexistence of contract and regular teachers in the same schools (as in India) makes it difficult to disentangle the effects of each group on pupil learning. Specific indicators of teacher performance therefore need to be developed.

Equity

The use of locally hired contract teachers has played a critical role in helping ethnic minorities of different languages to have access to schooling and those other marginal groups underserved by the education system. Often, inspired by the BRAC experiment, this educational provision has taken the form of NFE. This became a popular option for the poor in the 1980s and 1990s when it was meant to be a transitional measure. However, in India, a NFE national programme turned out to be a major failure that had to be abandoned as it was perceived to be a poor substitute for good-quality primary schools.⁵⁰

Impact on the quality of the teaching profession

High rates of teacher absenteeism are a serious obstacle to the delivery of education in many developing countries. The paucity of cross-country data has hitherto made it virtually impossible to arrive at robust conclusions as to its causes. In 2003 the World Bank conducted a national absence survey (WBNAS) in seven developing countries

⁴⁷ Tiyaab and Vianou (2004); see also study of Niger by Bourdon et al.: *Broadening access to primary education: Contract teacher programs and their impact on education outcomes – An econometric evaluation for the republic of Niger* (2005).

⁴⁸ See King and Ozler (1998); also repeated in Honduras (Di Gropello and Marshall, 2004) and El Salvador (Jiminez and Sawada, 2003).

⁴⁹ E. Vegas and J. De Laat: *Do differences in teacher contracts affect student performance? Evidence from Togo* (unpublished, 2002). The authors also found that regular teachers outperformed contract teachers.

⁵⁰ S. Mehrotra: "Democracy, decentralization and access to basic services: An elaboration on Sen's capability approach" (unpublished, 2001).

arriving at the following rates for teachers: Bangladesh (14.9 per cent); India (24.6 per cent); Indonesia (19 per cent); Ethiopia (45 per cent); Uganda (27.0 per cent); Ecuador (13.5 per cent); and Peru (10.6 per cent). However, there are large regional differences in the largest Asian countries.⁵¹

Though poor motivation and lack of accountability is widely reported to result in high levels of teacher absenteeism it is difficult to measure this in a direct way that controls for other factors, and accounts for absence that might have positive consequences.⁵² That said the WBNAS found that absenteeism rates among contract teachers are much higher than for teachers with permanent status. In Ecuador, Peru and Indonesia, the differential was more than ten percentage points.⁵³

There are many reasons for teachers' absenteeism. Teacher incentives are weak in many developing countries.⁵⁴ Salary levels are often so low that this forces teachers to take a second or third job to survive. Salaries are often not paid on time requiring teachers to take time out to secure payment. Poor working and living conditions and a lack of professional support often lead to poor motivation among teachers, especially in demanding postings such as remote areas. Many teachers, especially in small single-teacher schools are required to undertake non-teaching duties that take them out of school.⁵⁵

A World Bank study of teacher absenteeism in Peru⁵⁶ found that contract teachers are 12 to 13 percentage points more likely to be absent than civil service teachers. The study concluded that the teacher's contract status may itself contribute to absence encouraging income-earning efforts outside of school as well as time spent on looking for a permanent job – this was indeed the case for 57 per cent of contract teachers as compared to 42 per cent of regular teachers.

In India, contract teachers have been seen as part of the solution to teacher absenteeism rather than part of the problem. However, recent evidence suggests that local community teachers do not have lower absence rates than teachers from outside the community – they are about the same (24 per cent for contract teachers versus 23.1 per cent for civil servants), in spite of regular teachers having much higher salaries. Absence

⁵¹ In India, for example, there is teacher absenteeism of 40 per cent in New Delhi, but only 15 per cent in Gujarat.

⁵² See P. Bennell: *Teacher motivation and incentives in sub-Saharan Africa and Asia* (Brighton, July 2004), p. 25.

⁵³ *ibid*, p. 31.

⁵⁴ P. Glewwe and M. Kremer: *Schools, teacher and education outcomes in developing countries* (Harvard Centre for International Development, Working Paper No. 122, Sep. 2005), p. 11.

⁵⁵ For example, in India teachers may be required to help with health programmes, surveys and food distribution.

⁵⁶ L. Alcazar et. al.: *Why are teachers absent?: Probing service delivery in Peruvian schools* (Washington DC, Feb. 2006).

rates in non-formal schools, which are staffed by community teachers, are higher than in regular government schools.⁵⁷

The development of a two-tier system with segmentation between two groups of teachers has obvious consequences for teacher morale and status leading to high levels of attrition within the teaching force and to doubts whether this policy is sustainable in the long term, least of all from a management point of view. As noted above, in francophone Africa, governments (with the support of the World Bank and other major donors) have deliberately tried to lower the status of “*fonctionnaire*” (civil service) teachers, who are considered overpaid.⁵⁸ Contract teachers in the subregion are paid between 33 per cent (Mali) and 200 per cent less (Niger) than regular teachers. Some see this as part of a wider trend towards the de-professionalization of teaching.⁵⁹

These developments have resulted in tensions within the teaching force. Analysis of teacher identity and status in Benin demonstrated how the policy of salary freezes and increased recruitment of lesser-paid contract teachers had led to a more embittered teaching force. The use of contract teachers was seen as undermining one of the basic elements of teacher identity in Benin: that of being a respected civil servant with a decent steady salary, job security and high social status. Teachers felt betrayed by the State and as a consequence engaged in a host of negative behaviours such as absenteeism and moonlighting.⁶⁰

Teachers also have rights. The policy of contract teachers often violates the labour rights of teachers as codified in the fundamental rights and principles of the ILO. Non-discrimination constitutes the key human rights principle and applies to all individual rights and freedoms, including those of teachers.⁶¹ Contract teachers are often not members of trade unions that can negotiate collective agreements on their behalf. Indeed, the policy of using contract teachers in Senegal resulted in a complaint to the ILO brought by the teacher unions. In the allegation brought by SUDES mention was made of the possible violation of the Abolition of Forced Labour Convention, 1957 (No. 105), and the Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention, 1958 (No. 111), as well as the Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers, 1966 (ILO/UNESCO Recommendation). Part of the complaint responded to a concern over a lack of consultation or social dialogue regarding the policy to introduce contract teachers.

Conclusions and recommendations

Teachers cost too much, but earn too little

The use of contract teachers has emerged as a solution to developing countries perceiving themselves caught between a rock and a hard place – facing the pressure to

⁵⁷ M. Kremer et al.: *Teacher absence in India: A snapshot* (submitted to the *Journal* of the European Economic Association, 2004), p. 8.

⁵⁸ P. Bennell, *op. cit.*, p. 5.

⁵⁹ *ibid.*

⁶⁰ See M. Welmond: “Globalization viewed from the periphery: The dynamics of teacher identity in the republic of Benin”, in *Comparative Education Review*, 46(1), pp. 62–63.

⁶¹ K. Tomasevski: *Education denied: Costs and remedies* (London, Zed Press, 2003), p. 180.

raise enrolments in line with the 2015 goal of EFA and severe budgetary constraints. Teachers are both the most important resource in education and the most expensive. Teacher costs as a percentage of total education expenditure range from 40 per cent (Botswana) to 90 per cent (Ethiopia) – in low- and middle-income countries salaries make up between 80 and 90 per cent of primary education expenditures. So what to do?

Some have contended that teachers both cost too much, but earn too little.⁶² The challenge of teacher costs derives from the very low level of funding of many education systems in developing countries. Though teacher costs may consume up to 99 per cent of current primary education expenditure, they frequently have real incomes that are significantly below the poverty line and in some cases they have been declining – for example, the average real income of a teacher in Zambia is less than 44 per cent of what it was in 1980.⁶³ However, in most countries in Africa, except in the francophone countries, real salaries have risen.

In fact countries of similar levels of economic development in the same region can have radically different teacher salary structures suggesting that historical and cultural factors and government pay policies all play a critical role in determining teacher salary levels. Mingat (1998) shows, for example, how the level of teacher salaries in the Sahel region is 7.3 times GDP, whereas it is less than 2.7 times GDP in developing countries outside Africa. However, the use of GDP per capita as the benchmark for comparing teacher salaries is open to question in countries where the formal economy is relatively small and where most people work in subsistence agriculture, thus making the figure for teacher salaries seemingly out of proportion. The conclusion that can be reached is that the comparison of teacher salaries between countries is of rather limited value and that teachers should be paid at levels similar to other jobs necessary to attract and maintain those with the desired qualifications.⁶⁴

Buckland (2000) suggests that employing low-cost teachers that are unqualified or under-qualified may turn out to be a false economy as this option comes itself with considerable hidden costs. The threat to quality is obvious and has been examined above. In addition, contract teachers to be effective must be given ongoing support in the form of curriculum materials, in-service training and guidance. For example, while the BRAC paid women community teachers at a fraction of government teachers, the teacher support, supervision and training costs led to unit costs very close to those of regular schools.⁶⁵ Though it may be possible to significantly reduce teacher costs by employing contract teachers and still achieve good quality learning, much of the savings have to be reinvested in curriculum and materials development and in-service training to protect quality. Additionally, there may be extra administrative costs incurred in managing a two-tier teaching force – only some of which may be passed onto local communities. Moreover, in Cambodia the system of contract teachers was open to corruption that entails still further costs and inefficiencies.

There are no short cuts to quality in education. Quality costs, but quality pays in the long run. And teachers are at the heart of quality improvements. Moreover, recent

⁶² P. Buckland: *Making quality basic education affordable: What have we learned?* (New York, UNICEF, 2000), p. 29.

⁶³ Based on UNESCO data (1998).

⁶⁴ J. Farrell and J. Oliveira, op. cit.

⁶⁵ P. Buckland, op. cit., p. 31.

experience has demonstrated that reaching the hard-to-reach (the key challenge in achieving EFA) comes at substantially higher costs. Contract teachers have been successful as a short-term response, as part of targeted policies to increase access, but often with quality trade-offs that lead to hidden costs. New and innovative approaches are needed in the future that can succeed in going-to-scale. Sustainability of approaches are critical and this means incorporation into the national mainstream system. This also must be the fate of contract teachers. Managing that transition is a key challenge for the future.

The world can afford EFA, but many countries cannot: The importance of the macroeconomic and fiscal environment

Whether developing countries can afford teachers in decent numbers, teaching in decent conditions, begs much more fundamental questions concerning the macroeconomic and fiscal envelope for education. Quality costs, but low-cost and short-run solutions cost more in the long run. How then can quality basic education for all be made more affordable in developing countries?

Since the goal of EFA was set at Jomtien, Thailand, in 1990 (to be achieved by 2000) there have been various attempts to cost the global effort required and set out a strategy of how this can best be achieved. The pioneering study in this regard was that of Colclough and Lewin (1993) who examined the period 1990–2005. This seminal study argued strongly for system change as a priority rather than simply raising more resources, important though that was. Many of the policy suggestions put forward by Colclough and Lewin continue to resonate, not least the need to: reduce unit costs; redistribute educational expenditures to primary education without neglecting to properly invest in secondary and tertiary education to absorb the increased outcomes of more successful primary programmes; and raise additional resources for education through taxation and other fiscal measures.

These themes were taken up in the late 1990s by UNICEF and, in more recent years, by the World Bank as the EFA target date appeared, once again, to be in danger. Overall, the trends over the 1990s provides encouraging evidence that where the political will is strong, effective reforms adopted, and international support is adequate, dramatic progress in achieving EFA is possible.⁶⁶ On the other hand, progress has been patchy with some 86 out of 155 developing countries at risk of missing the 2015 target. Factors accounting for success and failure include among others, the share of GDP devoted to education and teachers' pay as a percentage of GDP per capita. However, the policy framework appears even more critical than incremental financing.⁶⁷

That said there is a considerable global financial gap. World Bank researchers estimate that for low-income countries this amounts to US\$32–37 billion per year in additional spending on primary education if EFA is to be attained.⁶⁸ Finance to meet EFA was promised both at the Dakar (2000) and Monterrey (2002) conferences (devoted to EFA and development finance respectively) to all countries with a “credible plan” for achieving EFA.

⁶⁶ B. Bruns et al.: *Achieving universal primary education by 2015: A chance for every child* (Washington DC, World Bank, 2003), p. 7.

⁶⁷ *ibid.*, p. 13.

⁶⁸ *ibid.*, p. 19.

Governments themselves must do better. After all, free compulsory basic education for all is a right that governments are obligated to meet under the Convention on the Rights of the Child (1989). Moreover, the right to education has been a key element of almost every declaration on human rights since 1948.⁶⁹ Nonetheless, the affordability conundrum⁷⁰ remains – many countries cannot afford EFA in a world that spends vastly more on luxury consumer goods, let alone on the military.

Part of this parlous situation is due to the macroeconomic environment in developing countries that has witnessed uneven economic growth and a shrinking public sector following a decline in tax revenues and external debt. The so-called “Washington consensus” preached by the International Financial Institutions have also constrained developing countries attempts to properly invest in the social sectors.⁷¹ In many countries, therefore, real expenditure on education has declined. As part of this trend there has been a blurring of the distinction between public and private financing of education including the greater use of demand-side financing interventions,⁷² such as the use of community teachers, as part of an overall decentralization drive.

The cost and financing implications of system change to meet EFA cannot be ignored but neither can the central role of the State. The State must reassert its role as the principal funder of basic education with ultimate responsibility for quality and equity in education and to ensure every child attains his or her rights under international obligations. And not least to ensure that teachers have decent living and working conditions that makes teaching an attractive profession.

Greater public expenditure is still paramount. Policy reforms will never be a substitute for adequate financing.⁷³ Many countries continue to under spend on education – in India, for example, public expenditure on education as a proportion of GDP actually declined in the 1990s, from 4.4 per cent in 1989 to 3.6 per cent in 1999 way below the Delors Commission (1996) and the ILO target figure of 6 per cent.⁷⁴ Successful countries have given high macroeconomic priority to education.⁷⁵ More public resources need to be mobilized for education within countries via internal political lobbying and fiscal reforms

⁶⁹ Including the little-used International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights of 1966.

⁷⁰ P. Buckland, op. cit., p.16.

⁷¹ See, for example, ILO: *Impact of structural adjustment on the employment and training of teachers* (Geneva, 1996), JMPEP/1996/II.

⁷² These have been particularly promoted by the World Bank with the intention of putting public resources in the hands of those who “demand” education, i.e. the school or community, rather than those who supply it.

⁷³ E. Delamonica et al.: *Is EFA affordable? Estimating the global minimum cost of “Education for All”* (New York, UNICEF, 2001), p. 21.

⁷⁴ See J. Dreze and A. Sen: *India: Development and participation* (New Delhi, OUP, 2002), p. 166. UNESCO (2007) data for other countries cited in the paper are not very encouraging either: Bangladesh (2.1 per cent); Benin (3.3 per cent); Cambodia (2.2 per cent); Chad (2 per cent); Niger (2.3 per cent); Senegal (4.1 per cent); and Nicaragua (3.2). Developing countries average of GNP devoted to education is 4.7 per cent. Data is usually for 2004. See UNESCO: *Education for All Global Monitoring Report 2007* (Paris, 2006).

⁷⁵ S. Mehrotra: *Education for All: Policy lessons from high-achieving countries* (New York, UNICEF), p. 6.

that expand the tax net particularly by penetrating the mushrooming informal economy. The need for external assistance remains, particularly in SSA, where debt relief and debt swaps have been abysmally slow to materialize.

The need for new indicators

In moving forward on cost and financing issues, there is a need for data to be collected on a new set of indicators which will provide a fuller picture and enable decision makers to monitor and advocate for quality education. In particular there is a need for a calculation of expenditure per school-aged child in the population as a percentage of GNP per capita as a better way of seeing how much resources are being committed to every child in the country. Additionally, measures of teacher salaries as a share of GNP per capita need to be supplemented by indicators of teacher salaries as a multiple of the absolute poverty level – a “teacher poverty index”.⁷⁶ Better measures of “teaching costs” need to incorporate the full professional role of teachers such as course planning, marking, meetings with parents, etc. We need better measures of teacher effectiveness in relation to learning outcomes that is, after all, the ultimate benefit of the education process, rather than simple system expansion.

Contract teachers need to be integrated into the regular teaching force

The Recommendation (1966) advises that teacher shortages should be dealt with by exceptional measures, which do not undermine professional standards or the quality of education (Paragraph 141(1)). There is, as the Recommendation states, a need to solve the problem of teacher shortages in the long-run, through specific measures allowing for the up-grading and eventual integration of unqualified teachers into the regular teaching force as part of a more systematic policy of phasing out such “teachers” within a fixed period.

Contract teachers have made a contribution in certain countries, providing the flexibility to meet short-term goals of quick expansion of access and ensuring that girls, ethnic minorities and remote populations are better served. However, contract teachers are not a viable long-term option as institutionalizing the practice has serious implications for quality in education and the status of teachers.⁷⁷ There are a number of measures that need to be taken as part of an overall teacher policy framework, to maximize the use of contract teachers in the short-run and to move towards a situation where they are effectively absorbed into a unified teaching profession with decent living and working conditions.

Contract teachers, like all teachers, need the necessary education, training and support. This was affirmed at the Bamako, Mali, conference in 2004 where participating countries were asked to ensure a minimum of lower secondary education and that at least six months of induction be provided. A system of modular training would fit with a strategy, as in Senegal, where contract teaching is seen as a doorway into the teaching profession. However, if contract teaching is to be seen as an “alternative pathway” into the profession, then the right incentives, training and promotion opportunities need to be in place to ensure the selection and retention of the most competent teachers.

⁷⁶ P. Buckland, *op. cit.*, p. 38.

⁷⁷ One possible policy option would be to use contract teachers as assistants supervised and supported by regular teacher mentors. This option, however, would require due attention be given to likely transportation and other constraints.

Where the use of contract teachers has been part of a move towards greater decentralization and school autonomy, as in some Central American countries, there is some evidence that this has led to higher pupil performance. However, giving more autonomy to schools may lead to greater inequalities and inefficiencies, with some schools, for example, having fewer resources to attract and compete for good teachers.⁷⁸ There is also the risk that these changes towards greater decentralization, school autonomy and accountability may lead to a greater sense of isolation in teachers, heavier workloads and a sense of a loss of professionalism that comes with greater external control.⁷⁹ Effective regional and central management is necessary to ensure an equitable distribution of resources and a fair and transparent selection process.

Finally, there is more to gain from a national policy framework that conceives of contract teachers as ultimately part of the teaching profession than promoting segmentation. This requires that volunteer or contract teachers be effectively absorbed into the regular teaching force after satisfactory completion of certain educational requirements and that due attention is paid to their continued professional development. Countries with contract teachers need to carefully plan and resource a gradual phasing out, so as to avoid possible short-term negative effects on access and quality.⁸⁰ A time-bound strategy that sets targets to phase out contract teachers, in line with overall EFA goals, would provide a concrete policy framework for countries.

The importance of social dialogue

Despite their importance, teachers and their organizations often receive a cursory attention in national and global debates concerning educational reforms and the achievement of educational goals.⁸¹ Policy reforms cannot be successfully articulated or implemented if key actors such as teacher unions are not involved early on in the process.

The meeting of West African countries held at Bamako, Mali, in November 2004, created the first opportunity to get key stakeholders: governments, teacher unions and parents' representatives around the table to discuss issues regarding contract teachers. Such opportunities for social dialogue also provide teacher unions with a space to redefine their role and image in the improvement of education rather than be seen merely as narrow defenders of special interests.

⁷⁸ Y. Duthilleul, op. cit., p. 62.

⁷⁹ *ibid.*

⁸⁰ *ibid.*, p. 65.

⁸¹ K. Tomasevski, op. cit., p. 178. See also B. Ratteree: *Teachers, their unions and the Education for All Campaign* (background paper for the UNESCO Global Monitoring Report, 2005). For example, this neglect appears almost universal regarding consultation concerning EFA national plans.

Recommendations

Following the discussion above, the following recommendations are suggested for the consideration of CEART:

Member States of the ILO and UNESCO

- re-examine the funding and contractual policies that lead to the widespread recruitment of contract teachers with a view to freezing further recruitment and phasing out such categories of teachers according to a fixed time schedule (for example by the target date for realization of EFA – 2015):
- in the interim examine and implement means by which contractual teachers' initial training, professional development and support, salaries and material benefits (health care, housing and transport, social security) can be upgraded in line with the status of non-contractual teachers on the basis of social dialogue with teachers' organizations representing contractual teachers.

ILO and UNESCO

- develop appropriate methodologies to better study the impact of contract teachers on pupil attainment;
- undertake a study to determine the range of factors that determine why some governments and not others adopt policies to use contract teachers and the hidden costs of using contract teachers that may render the practice a false economy;
- examine alternative education financing sources, in cooperation with other international organizations where possible, that could provide means of adequately funding education and supporting a professional teaching force;
- identify and promote further social dialogue opportunities as a follow-up to the Bamako conference, including assisting member States and social partners in setting targets for a phasing out of all contract-teaching policies by 2015 in line with EFA quality goals.

Sectoral working papers ⁸²

	<i>Year</i>	<i>Reference</i>
The Warp and the Web Organized production and unorganized producers in the informal food-processing industry: Case studies of bakeries, savouries' establishments and fish processing in the city of Mumbai (Bombay) (Ritu Dewan)	2000	WP.156
Employment and poverty in Sri Lanka: Long-term perspectives (Vali Jamal)	2000	WP.157
Recruitment of educational personnel (Wouter Brandt and Rita Rymenans)	2000	WP.158
L'industrie du textile-habillement au Maroc: Les besoins des chefs d'entreprise et les conditions de travail des femmes dans les PME (Riad Meddeb)	2000	WP.159
L'évolution de la condition des personnels enseignants de l'enseignement supérieur (Thierry Chevaillier)	2000	WP.160
The changing conditions of higher education teaching personnel (Thierry Chevaillier)	2000	WP.161
Working time arrangements in the Australian mining industry: Trends and implications with particular reference to occupational health and safety (Kathryn Heiler, Richard Pickersgill, Chris Briggs)	2000	WP.162
Public participation in forestry in Europe and North America: Report of the Team of Specialists on Participation in Forestry	2000	WP.163
Decentralization and privatization in municipal services: The case of health services (Stephen Bach)	2000	WP.164
Social dialogue in postal services in Asia and the Pacific: Final report of the ILO-UPU Joint Regional Seminar, Bangkok, 23–26 May 2000 (edited by John Myers)	2000	WP.165
Democratic regulation: A guide to the control of privatized public services through social dialogue (G. Palast, J. Oppenheim, T. McGregor)	2000	WP.166
Worker safety in the shipbreaking industries: An issues paper (Sectoral Activities Department and InFocus Programme on Safety and Health at Work and the Environment)	2001	WP.167
Safety and health in small-scale surface mines – A handbook (Manfred Walle and Norman Jennings)	2001	WP.168

⁸² Working Papers Nos 1–155 are not included on this list for reasons of space, but may be requested from the Sectoral Activities Branch (SECTOR), Social Dialogue, Labour Law, Labour Administration and Social Activities Department, Social Dialogue Sector, International Labour Office (ILO).

	<i>Year</i>	<i>Reference</i>
Le rôle des initiatives volontaires concertées dans la promotion et la dynamique du dialogue social dans les industries textiles, habillement, chaussures (Stéphanie Faure)	2001	WP.169
The role of joint voluntary initiatives in the promotion and momentum of social dialogue in the textile, clothing and footwear industries (Stéphanie Faure)	2001	WP.170
La situation sociale des artistes-interprètes de la musique en Asie, en Afrique et en Amérique latine (Jean Vincent)	2001	WP.171
The social situation of musical performers in Asia, Africa and Latin America (Jean Vincent)	2001	WP.172
Guide sur la sécurité et hygiène dans les petites mines à ciel ouvert (Manfred Walle and Norman Jennings)	2001	WP.173
Seguridad y salud en minas de superficie de pequeña escala: Manual (Manfred Walle and Norman Jennings)	2001	WP.174
Privatization of municipal services: Potential, limitations and challenges for the social partners (Brendan Martin)	2001	WP.175
Decentralization and privatization of municipal services: The perspective of consumers and their organizations (Robin Simpson)	2001	WP.176
Social and labour consequences of the decentralization and privatization of municipal services: The cases of Australia and New Zealand (Michael Paddon)	2001	WP.177
1st European Forest Entrepreneurs' Day, 16 September, 2000 (European Network of Forest Entrepreneurs ENFE)	2001	WP.178
The world tobacco industry: trends and prospects (Gijsbert van Liemt)	2002	WP.179
The construction industry in China: Its image, employment prospects and skill requirements (Lu You-Jie and Paul W. Fox)	2001	WP.180
The impact of 11 September on the aviation industry (Peter Spence Morrell and Fariba Alamdari)	2002	WP.181
The impact of 11 September on the civil aviation industry: Social and labour effects (Prof. Peter Turnbull and Geraint Harvey)	2002	WP.182
Employment trends in the tobacco sector in the United States: A study of five states (Maureen Kennedy)	2002	WP.183
Tobacco: An economic lifeline? The case of tobacco farming in the Kasungu Agricultural Development Division, Malawi (Michael Mwasikakata)	2002	WP.184
A study of the tobacco sector in selected provinces of Cambodia and China (Yongqing He, Yuko Maeda, Yunling Zhang)	2002	WP.185

	<i>Year</i>	<i>Reference</i>
Child performers working in the entertainment industry: An analysis of the problems faced (Katherine Sand)	2003	WP.186
Informal labour in the construction industry in Nepal (Kishore K. Jha)	2002	WP.187
The construction labour force in South Africa: A study of informal labour in the Western Cape (Jane English and Georg Mbuthia)	2002	WP.188
Social dialogue in health services – Case studies in Brazil, Canada, Chile, United Kingdom (Jane Lethbridge)	2002	WP.189
Teachers and new ICT in teaching and learning modes of introduction and implementation impact implications for teachers (Chris Duke)	2002	WP.190
Best practice in social dialogue in public service reform: A case study of the Norwegian Agency for Development Co-operation (NORAD) (Torunn Olsen)	2002	WP.191
Best practice in social dialogue in public service emergency services in South Africa (Bobby Mgijima)	2003	WP.192
Case studies in social dialogue in the public emergency services – Argentina (Laura El Halli Obeid and Liliana Beatriz Weisenberg)	2003	WP.193
Employment trends in the tobacco sector: Selected provinces of Bulgaria and Turkey (Roska Ivanovna Petkova and Nurettin Yildirak)	2003	WP.194
How to prevent accidents on small construction sites (Illustrated by Rita Walle)	2003	WP.195
Sectoral trends: A survey (Katherine A. Hagen)	2003	WP.196
The impact of the restructuring of civil aviation on employment and social practices (Bert Essenberg)	2003	WP.197
Raising awareness of forests and forestry. Report of the FAO/ECE/ILO Team of Specialists on Participation in Forestry and the FAO/ECE Forest Communicators Network	2003	WP.198
Teaching and the use of ICT in Hungary (Eva Tót)	2003	WP.199
Violence and stress at work in the postal sector (Sabir I. Giga, Helge Hoel and Cary L. Cooper)	2003	WP.200
Violence and stress at work in the performing arts and in journalism (Sabir I. Giga, Helge Hoel and Cary L. Cooper)	2003	WP.201
Making ends meet: Bidi workers in India today: A study of four states	2003	WP.202
Civil aviation: The worst crisis ever? (Bert Essenberg)	2003	WP.203

	<i>Year</i>	<i>Reference</i>
Informal labour in the construction industry in Kenya: A case study of Nairobi (Winnie V. Mitullah and Isabella Njeri Wachira)	2003	WP.204
Violence and stress at work in the transport sector (Bert Essenberg)	2003	WP.205
The impact of Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome (SARS) on health personnel (Christiane Wiskow)	2003	WP.206
How we work and live. Forest workers talk about themselves (Bernt Strehlke)	2003	WP.207
Workplace violence in service industries with implications for the education sector: Issues, solutions and resources (Richard Verdugo and Anamaria Vere)	2003	WP.208
International migration of health workers: Labour and social issues (Stephen Bach)	2003	WP.209
Violence and stress at work in financial services (Sabir I. Giga, Helge Hoel and Cary L. Cooper)	2003	WP.210
Violence and stress in hotels, catering and tourism sector (Helge Hoel and Ståle Einarsen)	2003	WP.211
Employment and human resources in the tourist industry in Asia and the Pacific (Travel Research International, London)	2003	WP.212
Democracy and public-private partnerships (Jerrold Oppenheim and Theo MacGregor)	2003	WP.213
Social dialogue in the public emergency services in a changing environment (Bulgaria) (Pavlina Popova)	2003	WP.214
Training of machine operators for mechanized wood harvesting. A study carried out under the EU-funded ERGOWOOD project (Bernt Strehlke and Kristin Warngren)	2004	WP.215
Social dialogue in public emergency services: A case study in Kenya (Leopold P. Mureithi)	2004	WP.216
Public emergency services: Social dialogue in a changing environment: A study on Japan (Minawa Ebisui)	2004	WP.217
Academic tenure and its functional equivalent in post secondary education (Donald C. Savage)	2004	WP.218
Study of the Kerala Construction Labour Welfare Fund (R.P. Nair)	2004	WP.219
The Joint FAO/ECE/ILO Committee: Fifty years of international cooperation in forestry (T.J. Peck and E.G. Richards)	2004	WP.220
La permanence et son équivalent fonctionnel dans l'enseignement postsecondaire (Donald C. Savage)	2004	WP.221

	<i>Year</i>	<i>Reference</i>
Academic employment structures in higher education: The Argentine case and the academic profession in Latin America (Garcia de Fanelli)	2004	WP.222
An introduction to labour statistics in tourism (Dirk Belau)	2004	WP.223
Labour implications of the textiles and clothing quota phase-out (Hildegunn Kyvik Nordas)	2005	WP.224
Baseline study of labour practices on large construction sites in Tanzania (coordinated by the National Construction Council, Dar es Salaam)	2005	WP.225
Informal construction workers in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania (Arthur Jason)	2005	WP.226
Prospects for micro, small and medium enterprises in the food and drink industries in Guyana (Abdul Rahim Forde)	2005	WP.227
Alimentation et boisson au Burkina Faso: au delà de la survie (Dié Martin Sow)	2005	WP.228
Social dialogue in education in Latin America: A regional survey (Marcela Gajardo and Francisca Gómez)	2005	WP.229
Good industrial relations in the oil industry in the United Kingdom (Dr Chris Forde, Dr Rob MacKenzie, Dr Mark Stuart, Dr Rob Perrett)	2005	WP.230
The future of civil aviation in Africa: Restructuring and social dialogue (Bert Essenberg)	2005	WP.231
The issues of fatigue and working time in the road transport sector	2005	WP.232
Privatization of energy in the Argentine Republic	2005	WP.233
Social dialogue in the health sector: Case study Ghana (Dr Delanyo Y. Dovlo)	2005	WP.234
Social dialogue in the health sector: Case study Bulgaria (Dr L. Tomev, Dr N. Daskalova, Ms. T. Mihailova)	2005	WP.235
Migration of health workers: Country case study Philippines (Institute of Health and Policy and Development Studies, Manila)	2005	WP.236
Industrial relations in the oil industry in Nigeria (Sola Fajana)	2005	WP.237
Industrial relations in the oil industry in South Africa (Shirley Miller and Tanya van Meelis)	2005	WP.238
Industrial relations in the oil industry in Mexico (Carlos Reynoso Castillo)	2005	WP.239
Corporate structural change and social dialogue in the chemical industry (Yasuhiko Kamakura)	2006	WP.240
Privatización de la energía en la Republica Argentina Perdidas y Ganancias (Asociación del Personal Jerárquico del Agua y la Energía, APJAE)	2006	WP.241

	<i>Year</i>	<i>Reference</i>
Vocational education and training in the chemical industry in Germany and the United Kingdom (Steffen A. Rogalski)	2006	WP.242
The role of local authorities in promoting decent work. Towards an applied research agenda for the construction and urban development sector (Jeroen Klink)	2006	WP.243
Vocational education and training in the chemical industry in India (National Safety Council of India – NSCI)	2006	WP.244
Health worker migration flows in Europe: Overview and case studies in selected CEE countries – Romania, Czech Republic, Serbia and Croatia (Christiane Wiskow)	2006	WP.245
Recent issues regarding collective bargaining and conditions of work in the chemical industry (Yasuhiko Kamakura)	2006	WP.246
SECTOR source: Database description (R. Doggett)	2007	WP.247
Promotion de la compétitivité socio-économique dans le secteur textile-habillement en Tunisie (S. Bensedrine)	2007	WP.248
Subcontracting in electronics: From contract manufacturers to providers of electronic manufacturing services (EMS) (Gijsbert van Liemt)	2007	WP.249
SECTOR source: data supplement to the report on the production of electronic components for the IT industries (R. Doggett)	2007	WP.250
ILO database on export processing zones (J.P. Singa Boyenge)	2007	WP.251
The use of contract teachers in developing countries: Trends and impact (Alec Fyfe)	2007	WP.252