

**Joint ILO/UNESCO Committee of Experts on the Application of the Recommendation
concerning the Status of Teachers**

(Fourth Special Session, Paris, 15-18 September 1997)

Report

Copyright © 1998 International Labour Organization (ILO) United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization and International Labour Organization 1998. Publications of UNESCO and the ILO enjoy copyright under Protocol 2 of the Universal Copyright Convention. Nevertheless short excerpts from them may be reproduced without authorization, on condition that the source is indicated. For rights of reproduction or translation, application should be made to UNESCO Publishing Office, 7 place Fontenoy, 75352 Paris 07 SP, France on behalf of both Organizations. UNESCO welcomes such applications. ISBN 92-2-110945-3

Contents:

Introduction
Members appointed by UNESCO
Changing perspectives
Employment, career opportunities and retention of teachers
Participation, consultation and collective bargaining in the teaching profession
Education for teachers
Status of women teachers in technical education and training
Action taken to promote knowledge and implementation of the ILO/UNESCO
Recommendation
Information supplied by international teachers' organisations
Allegations
Future procedures for consideration of allegations
Draft Recommendation concerning the Status of Higher Education Teaching
Personnel
Proposals for future action
Agenda for the Seventh Ordinary Session of the Joint Committee

Annex 1 - Resource materials considered by the Joint Committee

I. Working documents
II. Information documents
III. Documents from regional preparatory meetings for the 45th Session of the
International Conference on Education
IV. Unpublished studies commissioned for the Fourth Special Session

Annex 2 - Allegations received from teachers' organizations

- A. Allegations received since the Sixth Ordinary Session (1997)
 - B. Allegation received from the Czech and Moravian Trade Union of Workers in Education
 - C. Allegation received from the National Teachers' Confederation of Haiti (CNEH)
 - D. Allegation received from the Single and Democratic Teachers Union of Senegal (SUDES)
 - E. Allegation received from the National Association of School Masters'/Union of Women Teachers
 - F. Allegation received from Education International
 - G. Allegation received from the World Confederation of Organizations of the Teaching Profession (WCOTP) and the Ethiopian Teachers Association
- Annex 3 - Agenda of the Seventh Ordinary Session of the Joint Committee
-

Introduction

1. The Joint ILO/UNESCO Committee of Experts on the Application of the Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers (CEART) held its Fourth Special Session in Paris at the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation (UNESCO) headquarters, from 15 to 18 September 1997.
2. The agenda of the Joint Committee covered the following items related to the Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers, 1966 (ILO/UNESCO Recommendation):
 - (a) review of regional and national reports and conclusions of the 45th International Conference on Education of UNESCO (ICE, Geneva, 1996);
 - (b) review of reports on national and regional trends and conclusions of the ILO Joint Meeting on the Impact of Structural Adjustment on Educational Personnel (JMPEP, Geneva, 1996);
 - (c) review of new national studies on teacher education and of case studies on participation and stress;
 - (d) consideration of reports and workshops focusing on further education of teachers; employment and career opportunities; and participation, consultation and negotiation between the teaching profession and educational authorities;
 - (e) review of information supplied by international teachers' organizations;
 - (f) consideration of allegations on non-observance of the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation received from teachers' organisations since the Sixth Ordinary Session (1994) and review of further developments in the allegations examined at the last Session;
 - (g) the forms of questionnaire to be used as envisaged by the Sixth Ordinary Session of the CEART (study of the data collection programmes of international organisations on teacher indicators);
 - (h) developments related to the preparation of a Recommendation concerning Higher Education Teaching Personnel;
 - (i) review of other action taken to promote and monitor the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation:
 - update of commentaries on the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation;
 - World Teachers' Day;
 - sub regional seminars, symposia and workshop(s);
 - status of teachers and the International Labour Conference;
 - implementation of the partnership strategy to promote the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation;
 - guidelines concerning the submission of allegations;

(j) Other matters related to the Joint Committee's mandate.

3. The present members of the Joint Committee, designated by the Governing Body of the ILO and by UNESCO, with a term of office extending to 31 December 2000, are as follows:

Members appointed by the Governing Body of the ILO

Prof. (Ms.) Anita Ghulam Ali*

(Pakistan)

Managing Director, Sindh Government Education Foundation

Dr. (Ms.) Eddah W. Gachukia

(Kenya)

Executive Director, Forum for African Women Educationalists (FAWE)

Dr. (Ms.) Maria Antonia Gallart

(Argentina)

Professor, Latin American Faculty of Social Sciences (FLACSO) and Researcher, Centre of Population Studies

The Hon. Mr. Justice L. Trevor Olsson

(Australia)

Puisne Judge, Supreme Court of South Australia, and former President of the Industrial Court of South Australia

Dr. (Ms.) Anne-Lise Hostmark Tarrou

(Norway)

Professor of Education and Research Coordinator, Akershus College; Member of the Board, Section for Culture and Society, Norwegian Research Council; and former President and Coordinator, Research Support Group of the Association for Teacher Education in Europe (ATEE)

Dr. Mark Thompson

(Canada)

William M Hamilton Professor of Industrial Relations, Industrial Relations Management Division, Faculty of Commerce and Business Administration, University of British Columbia, and former member of the Board of Governors, Workers' Compensation Board of British Columbia

Members appointed by UNESCO

Prof. (Ms.) Marie Eliou*

(Greece)

Professor of Educational Science, University of Athens, and Acting President, Pedagogical Institute of Greece

Ms. Zahia Farsi

(Algeria)

Trainer, University Institute for Teacher Training (U I F M), Lyon Academy and former Director of Basic and Secondary Education Programme, Ministry of National Education, and Inspector General of Mathematics in Algeria

Prof. Sega Seck Fall

(Senegal)

Director, Graduate Institute for Teacher Training, Cheikh Anta Diop University of Dakar, and Chairperson of the Committee on Teachers' Questions, National Commission on the Reform of Education and Training

Prof. (Ms.) Konai Helu-Thaman *

(Fiji)

Head of the School of Humanities, University of the South Pacific

Dr. Earle H. Newton

(Barbados)

Professor and Director, School of Education, University of the West Indies, Cave Hill, and former Dean, Faculty of Education, University of the West Indies, Cave Hill

Dr. Gennady Ryabov

(Russian Federation)

President, Nizhny Novgorod Linguistic University, and member, Association of Teacher Training Institutions of the Russian Federation

* was unable to attend

4. The Committee designated the following officers:

Chairperson

Prof Sega Seck Fall

Vice Chairperson

Dr. Anne-Lise Hostmark Tarrou

Rapporteurs

Dr. Earle H. Newton,

Justice L. Trevor Olsson,

Dr. Mark Thompson

5. On behalf of the Director-General of UNESCO, Mrs. Aicha Bah Diallo, Director of the Basic Education Foundation and Mr. Valentin Klotz, Chief of the Salaried Employees and Professional Workers Branch representing the Director-General of the ILO welcomed the members of the Committee. The secretariat of the meeting was composed of, for UNESCO: Mr. Richard Halperin, Chief, Mr. Peter Gonda, Ms. Nathalie Brasseur, Ms. Patricia Cooper and Ms. Rollande Maccaud of the Section for Secondary and Teacher Education, Division for renovation of Secondary and Vocational Education, Mr. Robert Parua of the Division of Higher Education, Mr. Daniel De San and Mr. Guillermo Trasancos of the Office of International Standards and Legal Affairs; and for the ILO: Mr. Bill Ratteree and Ms. Corinne Feyler of the Salaried Employees and Professional Workers Branch, Mr. Loic Picard of the Application of Standards Branch, Mr. Conradus Damen of the Workers Activities Branch. Ms. Winsome Gordon, Director of the UNESCO Section for Primary Education, Mr. John Smyth, Chief Editor of the *World Education Report*; Ms. Magali Imbert of the ILO's Bureau of Statistics, and Mr. Yannick Simbron, Director of the ILO Office in Paris, also participated.

6. Ms. Aicha Bah Diallo, in welcoming the members of the Joint Committee, referred to difficulties, often extreme, currently being experienced by many of the 60 million teachers of the world. She drew attention to aspects such as the adverse impact of structural

adjustment and the effects of military conflict in some regions. She also stressed the fundamental importance of catalysing better living and working conditions for teachers, so that they might discharge their tasks more effectively. The Joint Committee had an important role to play in assisting to promote such an outcome.

7. Mr. Valentin Klotz added his welcome on behalf of the ILO. He referred to the previous important work of the Joint Committee in promoting the concepts of the 1966 recommendation. He, too, drew attention to the impact of structural adjustment policies on teachers and education, and expressed the view that the outcomes of the major conferences held by the ILO and UNESCO in 1996 had been positive in focusing attention on the importance of investment in education and teachers in member countries. It was important to build national and international momentum around these efforts to reconstruct favourable teaching and learning conditions so that highly trained and competent people would enter and remain in teaching. The Joint Committee would have ample information before it from such sources with which to make a significant contribution in the next three years to furthering the status and role of teachers.

8. In the Report of its Sixth Ordinary Session, in 1994, the Joint Committee reviewed the implications of a series of case studies which had been commissioned by UNESCO and ILO on teacher training, on participation, consultation and collective bargaining in the teaching profession and on stress and burn-out of teachers. It also reflected on a range of concerns related to gender issues in the teaching profession. Based on its analysis, the Joint Committee expressed a series of proposals for further action. Having done so it drew attention to the need to test the general validity of the themes emerging from the initial case studies in relation to a wider range of countries and to examine a wider series of issues. It proposed a draft agenda for the present Special Session on that footing.

9. In the event, resource restrictions within UNESCO and ILO and limitations imposed on the time span of the Special Session have not permitted the Joint Committee to deal in detail with all aspects envisaged by the draft agenda. Its deliberations have, of necessity, been restricted to the main topics referred to in this report. These have been based on summaries produced by the joint secretariat, information supplied by international teacher organisations and a series of comprehensive research initiatives conducted and monographs produced in preparation for the ICE and the JMPEP, both held in 1996. In their totality, the preliminary activities leading up to these events actually produced far more extensive and definitive material than might otherwise have been available to the Joint Committee, had a separate data gathering exercise been initiated by it. Details of those materials are set out in Annex 1 to this Report and the conclusions drawn by the Joint Committee with regard to them are reflected elsewhere in this Report.

Changing perspectives

10. The Joint Committee notes with satisfaction what appears to be a consensus on the part of the major stakeholders, emerging from the reports of the ICE, the JMPEP and the International Commission on Education for the Twenty-first Century, of the need to recognize and give effect to the principles expressed in the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation. This appears to have stemmed from a growing awareness of the problems currently besetting teachers and education, as outlined in those reports. It seems to the Joint Committee that, prior to the issue of such reports, no consensus of that type was evident: Whilst the effects of the consensus are not yet evidenced by positive action to redress the relevant problems, its existence will certainly facilitate implementation of desirable and positive strategies in the future.

Employment, career opportunities and retention of teachers

11. The materials before the Joint Committee reveal a considerable diversity of circumstance relating to these aspects of the situation of teachers.

12. However, a particular feature of the reports is that the majority reveal many similar core concerns. Specifically, it is apparent that the processes of substantial economic rationalism or structural adjustment which have occurred over the last decade have had profound implications for teachers and education. No country to which the Joint Committee has directed its attention, by considering the documentation referred in Annex 1, has been immune from such influences.

13. In that regard it is significant that, whilst there are indications from the reference materials and meetings held that the norms expressed in the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation are steadily becoming better known throughout the world, there has actually been some decline in application of them in many countries since they were promulgated in 1966.

14. The Declaration which marked the outcome of the ICE recognised that it was clear that the text of the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation still remains basically as valid as it did in 1966, an opinion already expressed by the Joint Committee. Since that time the world has experienced dramatic economic and political shifts. In considering the impact on teachers and education the Joint Committee recognises the need to avoid an over-simplistic assessment of cause and effect.

15. Although there have been many adverse effects on teachers resulting from processes of economic rationalisation, these have, by no means, been the only operative forces. Enormous structural adjustment has been a direct product, in many Eastern European countries for example, of the rapid and dramatic political developments which have taken place in that region. Moreover, the last decade has seen unprecedented general change, both in technology and in societal environments and expectations, in a manner which has directly impinged on schools and teachers. All of these interacting factors have had important implications for the extent to, and speed with which, the concepts of the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation have been capable of being either put into practice or maintained.

16. A clear message which is conveyed to the Joint Committee by these developments is that the morale of teachers, almost universally, is currently low. It is therefore important, objectively, to identify the reasons for that situation - giving due recognition to the fact that the operative factors giving rise to it are variable (at least in their intensity) from region to region. The continuance of such an atmosphere bodes ill for both recruitment and retention of high quality teachers.

17. In the present economic, political and social context within regions, there are often inherent tensions arising between the stakeholders concerned - government, teachers and the community at large. These have been apparent in the developing countries for some time but, in recent years, some of the practical consequences of structural adjustment policies and related educational reforms in the more industrialised countries have become far more obvious and acute in their impact than was at first apparent.

18. The Joint Committee observes that, in virtually every country reported upon, the status of teachers in the relative employment hierarchy still remains low or, in some instances, has actually deteriorated in recent years. This recurrent and fundamental theme helps explain the reported decline in morale of teachers. For example, in Africa, many areas of Latin America and some countries of Eastern Europe, teachers receive such poor salaries that they often have to seek other means of survival, including taking second jobs. In some areas the concept of "privatization" of teaching is tending to produce situations in which fee-paying students receive preferential treatment in contrast to those who are not. With

some notable exceptions, teacher remuneration and status compare adversely with those of other professions, with the result that the more able students are not attracted to the teaching profession, or leave it when they find better employment opportunities. The increasing personal insecurity of teachers and violence in schools are phenomena which impact adversely on teacher morale and performance. Additionally, in many industrialised countries teachers have been under fairly consistent public criticism from families, business leaders and politicians alike, as a consequence of an apparent loss of public confidence in teachers and education systems.

19. It is reported that some factors which contribute to the perceived unattractiveness of the teaching profession to the brighter students include:

- the stress and teacher dissatisfaction associated with the gradual breakdown of traditional consensus regarding the purposes and functions of education and, more specifically, the role of teachers;
- recruitment restrictions and a loss of attractiveness, provoking a general ageing of the profession, particularly at the school level, which is seen as inhibiting an infusion of new blood, ideas and career progression;
- the processes of rationalization, which have had an adverse effect on professional status in many countries, where teaching is seen as something of a second class option. This has contributed to the steady feminisation of the profession at the pre-secondary levels and, therefore, tends to stereotype such areas of teaching as a women's profession with the result that fewer men are attracted to it. Real equality between men and women is often still the exception rather than the rule.

20. Whilst there are variable factors operating within regions, some general causes for a decline in teacher status have been:

- a perceived failure of Governments to interact effectively with teachers to establish proper educational policies and to provide resources to implement them, especially as public resources directed to education have declined;
- a neglect by teachers to promote their own status and professionalism in times of economic austerity. Almost by default, they have allowed a community perception to develop that their main preoccupation has been with their own salaries and benefits, which may consume up to 90 per cent of the education budget in many countries;
- the emergence of community perceptions that teachers are failing to deliver an educational outcome considered to be satisfactory, thereby attracting widespread public and governmental criticism, to the detriment of their professional status;
- in the context of government attempts to reduce costs, the efforts by teachers' organisations to resist measures which increase class sizes and reduce teacher qualifications, conditions and pay, have often been characterised as major obstacles to educational development. This dynamic has tended to denigrate teachers and lower the general community perception of the quality and value of public education. Schools and educational professionals are bearing much of the blame for the increasing difficulty of coping with enormous economic and societal changes which have been taking place, including economic globalization, social dislocation, slowly growing economic productivity and increased unemployment.

21. World Bank policies have had an important influence on teacher status, especially in low and middle income developing countries. Arguments to link teacher pay scales more

to performance criteria than to the level of pre-service training, recruit less educated teachers (at lower pay levels), provide more in-service incentives to improve productivity, and achieve major savings by making some increase in class sizes, without reducing education quality, have led to a climate in which teacher salaries have often been reduced in real terms (most acutely in some Latin American and African countries). Often recruitment of lower qualified entrants has not been complemented by the provision of resources for increased in-service training and qualification. The Joint Committee considers that policies which present in-service training as a substitute for effective pre-service qualification and training seek to build on a very dubious foundation. Even in many of the industrialised countries, where there has been a move towards greater academic qualifications on initial employment, teachers have lost ground, in comparative terms, in relation to other professional groupings with similar qualifications. It cannot be ignored that teacher pay is an indicator of how much a society values teachers. Teacher pay, relative to salaries in other professions, is crucial in determining the quality of individuals attracted to teaching.

22. The Joint Committee notes that, in the context of the continuing feminisation of the profession, very substantial barriers to equal opportunity and treatment of women still remain to be addressed and, until they are, this will continue to have an adverse effect on morale and status. These include:

- the continued disproportion of family responsibilities borne by women;
- impairment of opportunities for promotion and for access to positions of responsibility, particularly because of interrupted careers due to child-rearing and domestic responsibilities;
- the predominance of women in part-time employment, which leads to their being ignored as prospects for promotion;
- remaining negative perceptions, by male-dominated selection panels, of women as potential managers;
- reluctance of women to apply for training and appointment to senior posts, due to ingrained social stereotypes;
- cultural and domestic factors which inhibit acceptance by women of promotional or other deployments to rural or outer metropolitan schools, including lack of suitable housing in some instances;
- residual inequalities of remuneration in many countries.

23. The Joint Committee further observes that, particularly in some of the more industrialised countries, there appears to be an increasing trend, in the context of economic and rationalisation policies, towards the employment of non-tenured, temporary contract teachers. Whilst this provides a degree of managerial flexibility, it inevitably infuses an undesirable note of instability in school staffing, coupled with the unattractiveness of teaching as a career, especially for a beginning teacher.

24. In turn, a recognition of the scenarios described above has brought a sharper international focus to bear on the norms established by the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation and the need to aspire to their attainment, as evidenced by repeated reference in the recent high level meetings, commissions and their published outcomes.

25. In its 1988 Report, the Joint Committee expressed the view that "the status of teachers and the status of education are so intertwined that whatever produces changes in one will normally produce changes in the same direction in the other". As it emphasised, if education does not command the respect and support of the entire community, then

teachers will not command that respect and support. The converse is also applicable. Meeting the needs of Education is of crucial importance, for the quality of its output has enormous long-term implications for the growth and well-being of every country. The Joint Committee considers that the fundamental importance of the recruitment and retention of quality teachers is an issue the critical priority of which cannot be stressed too much.

26. Attracting the best qualified persons and retaining them in the teaching profession is a basic step in promoting good quality education. In addition to adequate salary scales, working conditions conducive to good teaching, and attractive career prospects, a matter of the highest priority is the need to enhance the professionalisation of teaching. It is only in this way that the current regression in standards and also of the concomitant level of commitment of teachers, recently noted by the ICE, will be reversed; and the status of teachers and teaching/learning conditions can be improved.

27. A flexible combination of strategies, adjusted periodically in light of actual experience, will clearly be required to address the problems identified above.

28. If society is to accord education and teachers a proper and beneficial status, associated with a desirable level of professionalism, then these conditions will need to be satisfied:

(1) educational goals and the training of teachers to meet them will have to recognise the need to make education more directly responsive to the economic and employment requirements of a country, as well as its broader societal needs. There will need to be a much greater flexibility, readiness and capacity to recognise and adjust to rapid change. Teachers will need to forge links with business and the community which they serve, to abate current climates of mutual distrust,

(2) these goals will need to be arrived at by a process of consultation and co-operation between governments and teachers' organisations, as emphasised by the International Commission on Education for the Twenty-first Century and the relevant conclusions and recommendations of the ILO's Joint Meeting on the Impact of Structural Adjustment on Educational Personnel;

(3) whilst improved salaries, better physical facilities and equipment and lower class ratios have important impacts, the critical features required to raise the image and self-esteem of teachers in the immediate future include more relevant professional training of individual teachers and improved working conditions and work organisation in schools. Emphasis will necessarily vary from region to region. In developing countries, improved basic qualifications, salaries and physical facilities are priority requirements, without which little progress will be feasible. On the other hand, in the industrialised countries, surveys suggest that many teachers are seized with uncertainties regarding their preparedness for and capacity to meet the cultural and other changes facing them;

(4) there is a pressing need for substantial, continual training to assist those whose own training consisted simply of traditional forms of classroom teaching. They must become technology "literate", both in terms of teaching method and curriculum content. Also organisational restructuring within schools and school systems to promote quality and efficiency in teaching will be essential;

(5) teaching will need to come to terms with, and participate in developing, appropriate forms of external evaluation of school performance (and thus of teachers themselves) as a means both of monitoring professional quality and efficiency of the education process, thereby providing reassurance to the community of the professional standards being attained (and maintained) by them.

29. The Joint Committee is of opinion that there is a need for adoption in all countries, of a strategy specifically setting forth these broad objectives:

- attracting a sufficient number of able and motivated young people to the profession. This implies: the adoption of positive recruitment strategies such as major campaigns (at school, national and regional levels and in the media) to promote the importance of education, the image of the profession and the status of teachers;
- offering incentives and scholarships to suitable students with strong academic and extra curricular records; removing age limits and encouraging mature age entrants with experience in other fields to consider taking up a teaching career;
- positively promoting a better gender equality in teaching services; setting up guidance and information services in tertiary institutions; and adapting the content and methods of initial training to meet contemporary needs. Initial training itself must be structured as an instrument of recruitment policy, professionalisation and enhancement;
- facilitating the development of long term career structures for teachers, by establishing appropriate career planning and development mechanisms, supported by fair and comprehensive teacher performance and appraisal systems. These should pay particular regard to the specific needs of women, including training, recruitment and support packages for women in rural areas, provision of targeted leave and in-service training opportunities, recognition of marital constraints by simultaneous assignment of spouses to the same region, and provision of adequate housing, transport and other facilities, and development of part time and job sharing opportunities;
- improving the motivation, professional competence and general professionalism of working teachers by implementing proper processes of continuing professional training and diversified career structures. This implies the development and implementation of both centralised and decentralised relevant, positive and comprehensive systems of continuing education designed to extend knowledge, upgrade teaching skills and mould professional attitudes of teachers in light of changing needs. It connotes a need for resources with which to achieve that result, and the catalysing of very positive government policies to ensure their continued provision;
- reviewing salaries and basic conditions of employment of teachers. Salaries should be appropriate to qualifications and be properly relative to those paid to other professionals holding equivalent occupations. Due allowance should be made for their workload and proper recognition given to the increasing range of extra curricular and administrative requirements being imposed on them in relation to curriculum development and change, including interfacing with the wider community which they serve. The combination of these demands is presently contributing to a relatively high rate of "burn out", giving teachers incentives in order to enhance their self esteem and their social image, including financial and promotional recognition, provision of paid opportunities to enhance skills and the affording of opportunity to make personal contributions to the development of educational policies and strategies.

Finally, there is a need to create a climate in which it is accepted that schools are not factories and teachers merely assembly-line workers, as appears to be a philosophy underlying some structural adjustment policies. Teachers must demonstrate that they are at

the centre of the education process and are motivated, as professionals, to implement curricula which they can adapt to their teaching circumstances and help pupils to attain their learning potential.

30. In sum, there is a pressing need for significant change towards a higher degree of professionalisation of teachers, with a concomitant elevation in their status and the status of Education itself, to meet the changing needs of contemporary society. That change requires governments to both provide the resources to enable it to take place and also, positively, create a general environment conducive to its occurrence which fosters educational partnerships for financing and administration. Equally, it requires teachers themselves to adopt a positive outlook. The challenge must be taken up, on a basis of mutual goodwill, by teachers, governments and the communities, working in concert.

31. The Joint Committee remains convinced that, in confronting the significant problems identified above, the core principles expressed in the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation continue to constitute a sound and solid framework for, and basis upon which the development of education systems appropriate to the needs of modern society can take place. In this context, quality teachers with a proper professional status can be recruited and pursue fulfilling careers which will be attractive to the brightest students. The Joint Committee applauds the steps which have been taken by UNESCO and ILO to promote knowledge of and adherence to the Recommendation in the recent past. The Joint Committee urges an intensification of such activities, coupled with promulgation of the need to address the urgent problems of the teaching profession, as discussed above.

Participation, consultation and collective bargaining in the teaching profession

32. In the Sixth Ordinary Session (1994), the Joint Committee reviewed the results of a number of country studies on participation, consultation and collective bargaining in the teaching profession. A common theme in these studies was the lack of participation of teachers' organizations in educational planning, especially in times of structural adjustment, with negative consequences for teachers and learning conditions. Further, governments continued to restrict basic rights such as collective bargaining and the right to strike.

33. Since the Committee last met, additional evidence supporting its observations has become available, highlighting the challenges the teaching profession faces. Based on data made available since 1994, the Joint Committee confirms that its previous observations not only remain valid, but deserve even greater emphasis. After reviewing documents prepared by UNESCO and the ILO, the Joint Committee found that participation by teachers' organizations in educational planning is lacking in all regions of the world.

34. The evidence from the regional and international analyses of teachers and education reveals that school systems in many countries are being restructured. A common form is decentralization of authority and greater accountability for schools or regional school authorities. In some countries, restructuring is a mechanism for cutting educational spending from traditional public sources and shifting the responsibility for funding to local government or parents. Almost invariably, this process affects the circumstances of teachers, professionally and economically.

35. In its 1994 Report, the Joint Committee noted that national case studies revealed that it was rare for teachers' organizations to be involved in educational planning, including restructuring of education systems. At most, individual teachers, often not a large number, were engaged as consultants or members of government-sponsored committees to advise on changes in education. Participation of teachers often was informal, rather than through formally-established institutions.

36. National case studies prepared for the ICE found considerable variety in the role of teachers' unions in the promotion of human rights and tolerance through education. In South Africa, teachers' organizations are not in agreement on the subject, while the teachers' union in Chile has become more active in this endeavour. Teachers in Ghana, on the other hand, do not have the opportunity as a professional body to participate in educational policy and decision-making processes.

37. The Joint Committee also noted a report from Education International (EI), which brings together more than 275 national unions representing 23 million teachers, to the ICE. EI polled its members in some of the most populous nations of the world, including Bangladesh, Brazil, India, Indonesia, Mexico and Pakistan. Teachers' organizations in these countries reported that at best there was insufficient consultation between governments and teacher organizations, and in several cases, such consultation was non-existent. In many countries, there is no appropriate mechanism for regular negotiation.

38. A review of the role of teachers in educational reform found a pattern of minimal participation of teachers in reforms. Many plans for educational change pay scant attention to the status of teachers.

39. The Joint Committee noted with satisfaction and urged adherence to the first statement made by ministers and ministries of education in the declaration of the ICE, which emphasized the importance of "the active participation of teachers and all educational partners in the processes of changing education systems". It further pointed to the conclusions of the ILO's Joint Meeting on the Impact of Structural Adjustment on Educational Personnel and to the report of the UNESCO convened International Commission on Education for the Twenty-first Century which both strongly urged that teachers' organizations be involved in planning and carrying out educational reform.

40. The Joint Committee also endorsed Recommendation No. 4 of the ICE which called on member states to "encourage the participation of teachers in the process of transforming education". In particular, the ICE urged that the direction of reforms be established through "consultation, co-ordination and dialogue with teachers and their organizations in line with the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers". ICE Recommendation No. 4 also suggested that participation of teachers be supported with training, equipment and professional support services.

41. The ILO/UNESCO Recommendation recognizes the right of teachers to negotiate with their employers through their organizations. The Joint Committee concluded that this right is frequently absent and endorsed the unanimous JMEP resolution concerning the fundamental rights of educational personnel. The resolution cited the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation and drew the attention of Member States "to the fact that teachers' organizations should be accorded legal status and the right to negotiate terms and conditions of work and employment, to represent their members and to defend their interests, and their members should not be discriminated against or repressed because of their trade union activities."

42. Inputs to the ICE Declaration included a round table held by the Asia-Pacific Centre of Educational Innovation for Development in 1995 which recommended that governments "develop mechanisms for consultation with teachers and other social partnerships relating to education policy developments". The ICE Declaration also echoed the conclusions of a regional seminar in the Caribbean held in preparation for the ICE.

43. While these statements are positive signs that the educational community recognizes the need for the involvement of teachers and their organizations in making educational policies, the statements typically are vague, lack explicit recognition of the role of teachers' organizations, and do not contain recommendations for concrete measures to advance the principles of the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation.

44. If education is to meet the challenges posed by social, technological and political changes, and if the status of teachers is to improve, the active and informed participation of teachers and their organizations will be crucial to the success of educational policy-making. Teachers bring their professional knowledge and experience to any discussions of change in educational systems. By definition, teachers' organizations are among the most committed supporters of improvement in the status of teachers, which is a necessary condition for higher quality of education in general. The collective voice of teachers is important to marshal support for new public policies if governments are to be persuaded to reverse priorities that have caused the decline in teachers' status.

45. The Joint Committee recognized the need for further efforts by the ILO and UNESCO to encourage the establishment of formal procedures and structures to involve teachers and their organizations in educational policy-making to implement the Declaration and relevant recommendations of the ICE, the ILO's Joint Meeting on the Impact of Structural Adjustment on Educational Personnel and the International Commission on Education for the Twenty-first Century. It urged that the two agencies seek examples of successful systems of consultation and negotiation with teacher organizations to identify the circumstances which promote these results. The agencies should also collaborate in identifying the specific roles that teachers have played in educational reform at national and sub-national levels in countries experiencing the changes identified earlier in this report.

Education for teachers

46. Surveys from different regions of the world show very strongly that the role of the teacher has changed considerably in recent decades, and this trend is likely to continue. Furthermore, the rate at which knowledge and information is generated, becomes obsolete and is replaced by new knowledge and information, makes it impossible for any teacher to remain effective and efficient without regular upgrading and renewal. There is also an abundance of evidence to show that there has been little change in approaches and methodologies in classrooms in spite of new technologies - television, multi-media and computers. Moreover, it was reported to the Joint Committee that at the present time, up to one-third of the world's teachers in some countries have no formal teaching qualification.

47. The ILO/UNESCO Recommendation at Section VI states the case for "in-service education designed to secure a systematic improvement of the quality and content of education and of teaching techniques". The Joint Committee believes that the further education of teachers has become even more crucial in today's world.

48. A review of pertinent reports earlier referred to indicates:

(1) there is a growing tendency to expect teachers to provide the education that addresses many social issues;

(2) a shortage of teachers in many parts of the world has led to poorly qualified, poorly trained and even totally untrained persons entering the profession;

(3) many teachers have been thrust into totally new roles because of changed economic, social and political situations in their countries.

49. The Joint Committee agrees with the Report of the International Commission on Education for the Twenty-first Century which places the teacher at the hub of education of the next century, and argues that the training and retraining of teachers must be given renewed emphasis and significance.

50. It further accepts the observation that in our rapidly changing world the initial training of teachers, however appropriate and thorough, will not take them through their professional lives. It reiterates the need for a commitment to the further training and education of teachers. Accordingly, The Joint Committee endorses the recommendation of

the ICE that the "in-service training of teachers as a strategy for teacher improvement and quality education be made both a right and a duty for educators".

51. The Joint Committee is encouraged by the Declaration of the Ministers of Education at the ICE. In the second statement of the Declaration they state their determination, "to develop and implement integrated policies designed to recruit and retain in the teaching profession motivated and able individuals of both genders; to reform pre-service and in-service education in order that they shall serve the new challenges facing education...."

52. The task facing the education of teachers is a formidable one. In-service training has to deal with two basic needs at the same time, if the current and projected roles and perspectives for education and teachers are to be fulfilled. First, there is the urgent need to ensure that the large numbers of teachers across the region who are unqualified or seriously underqualified are fully trained and upgraded both academically and pedagogically. The Joint Committee noted in the report of the World Confederation of Teachers (WCT) that there is a tendency to recruit unskilled teachers or teachers with insufficient education and training. Second, there is perhaps the even more daunting task of preparing all teachers for the new roles and perspectives that are required of them especially as we approach the Twenty-first century.

53. In this perspective new demands are made on teachers with no diminution of the traditional ones. Teachers must be trained and prepared to handle intelligently and competently the rapidly changing information and communications technologies. They are expected to take up the slack created by the diminishing role of the family, the church and other institutions and their training must be appropriately adjusted. They must be able to cope with and prepare children for a world of change. They must be educated to provide the knowledge and values needed for culture of peace. Teachers must provide prompt responses to urgent problems of our times such as violence in schools. They must assume responsibility for what the Report of the International Commission on Education for the Twenty-first Century calls the four pillars of education - learning to know, learning to do, learning to be and learning to live together - and must seek to integrate and reconcile them and not see them as discrete or separate things. All this implies new orientations, attitudes and philosophies, new curricula, new methodologies and pedagogies and new approaches to assessment.

54. The Joint Committee is not unaware of the fact that there is some in-service education for teachers across the world. However, it points out that the data before it indicate that much of what obtains is neither systematic, nor effective, nor well supported by teachers. It postulates that teachers' response to in-service training may be related to their working conditions and status which for reasons earlier noted are felt to be strongly demotivating.

55. As a consequence of the above situation, the Joint Committee feels that a number of questions must be raised for serious consideration by the relevant authorities. These are:

(1) what role can countries that do not provide appropriate and systematic in service education expect education to play in their social, economic and cultural development, and what quality of education do they expect?

(2) how can teachers be motivated for in-service training when there is similarity of treatment regardless of extra effort or commitment?

(3) how can they be expected to consider in-service training, when because of low salaries, they are often forced to take on a second or part-time job?

(4) why should they invest time in in-service courses which have been designed without their input and not in response to their felt needs?

56. While the above issues are of immediate concern for the further training and education of teachers, their significance and implications for pre-service or initial training cannot be overlooked. Provisions 11 and 31 of the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation taken together

indicate the close relationship and continuity between pre-service and in-service training and present the education of teachers as a lifelong activity that needs constant upgrading. They strongly show the importance of pre- and in-service training of teachers to ensure that, at all times, teachers are competent and prepared to provide the most appropriate education for the changing times and circumstances.

57. The Joint Committee recommends that a determined effort be made to ensure that no one is allowed to embark on teaching without an acceptable minimum level of academic achievement and pedagogical training, as implied in provision 13 and 14 of the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation. The burden on in-service training will always be great and the status of teaching as a profession will be questionable until this is achieved. Of greater importance, however, is likely damage to the growth and development of children taught by ill-prepared and untrained teachers.

58. The Joint Committee particularly emphasizes the importance of recommendations 2 and 3 of the ICE which focus on pre-service and in-service education and training of teachers. The thrust of recommendation 2 which strengthens provision 12 of the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation, is "better linkage between pre-service training and the demands of an innovatory profession". It draws attention to important concerns associated with training programmes, especially the gap between teacher training inputs and activities and the perceived demands that professional activity should satisfy the recommendation. It suggests at section 2.2 a close link between pre-service and in-service training and presents a "unified teacher education and training system which views pre-service and in-service learning as a continuum" as highly desirable. This reflects the intention of sections V and VI of the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation and is strongly supported by the Joint Committee.

59. The ICE recommendation 3 has as its title "In-service training: Both a right and duty for all educational personnel". This recommendation covers a wide range of relevant interests and concerns, ranging from the recognition that the training and education of teachers is an on-going process, through the need for the locus of action to be the work place itself, to the involvement of teachers in determining and developing appropriate programmes, and the need for trainers to be at the cutting edge of research and development in the field. It thus strengthens and advances the goals of the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation.

60. Given the changed circumstances in today's world and especially the new roles and direction being ascribed to teachers and the variety of demands being made of them, teacher preparation must move away from the traditional content and approaches if it is to meet the demands of the modern realities and challenges of teachers, teaching and education. Changed circumstances require new content and knowledge, new approaches and strategies. There are many competing areas that would merit serious consideration. They include such issues as Education for Peace and Tolerance, Information and Communication Technology, Cross Cultural Education, Values and Valuing, Moral Education, and Environmental Education.

61. The explosion of knowledge, the new demands on teachers, the democratization of schooling, The Jomtien Declaration, the new perspective of the Report of the International Commission on Education for the Twenty-first Century, the social environment of education, issues of globalization, modernity, equity and equality, gender, the avoidance of conflict and the quest for peace together with a whole host of other factors indicate the necessity of taking teachers beyond the barest minimum level of qualification. Teachers should be encouraged and facilitated in every possible way to improve their qualifications, and broaden the scope of their work for both developmental and promotional purposes. This is indeed the focus of provision 33 of the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation. The

commentary on this provision lists objectives formally associated with further education activities. To this may be added research. The criticism advanced in the closing session of the ICE that education systems lacked vision in not investing in research and development, teachers and education in the way that industry has done, is apropos. The ability of teachers to do research as a serious activity is vital at a time when so much is required and expected of education and teachers. Teachers and other stakeholders need to know what teaching techniques work and what do not, before teachers commit themselves to new approaches. Benefits that come from any investments in the area would redound to the pupils, the school, the system and even the wider community as well of course as to the individual teacher.

62. The importance attached to the pre-service and the further education and training of teachers in the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation has been endorsed and strengthened by the recommendations of the ICE. This emphasis has been justified by the current state of the art in teaching education across the world. By establishing a link between pre-service and in-service training and recommending that in-service be considered both a right and a duty, the ICE has advanced the case for further training of teachers. Strategies and practical steps are now strongly indicated to facilitate the realization of the value and benefits to be derived from the training of teachers.

63. Against the above background the Joint Committee proposes the following strategies:

(1) that Member States of ILO and UNESCO be reminded of provisions 13 and 14 of the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation and the need to take urgent steps (emergency training, crash programmes, etc.) to remove the backlog of untrained teachers in their systems and initiate programmes for pre-service training to ensure that a similar buildup does not recur;

(2) that it be recommended to such Member States that:

(a) evidence that a teacher has attended and meaningfully participated in acceptable levels of further training be one of the factors to be considered in his/her advancement in the system;

(b) the involvement and participation of relevant teachers be a requirement when training activities are being determined or materials developed;

(c) the views of educators across the regions be sought as to the types of programmes and materials considered necessary for the facilitation of the new perspectives for teacher training such as peace education, values education and globalization, and that the preparation of relevant self-instructional materials be commissioned;

(3) that Member States be encouraged to undertake studies of teachers' workload, including out-of-school time devoted to school work; time available to teachers for reflection, planning and professional interaction; and variety and nature of tasks undertaken on a routine basis and their assessed ability and preparation for these tasks;

(4) that UNESCO and ILO undertake regional seminars or other mechanisms, to consider the application of section V of the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation in light of the changed circumstances of education and teacher education.

Status of women teachers in technical education and training

64. Reference is made in other sections of this Report to the status of women teachers generally. However, the Joint Committee particularly notes the content of a report, published in 1995, dealing with the status of women teachers in technical education and training in Benin, Cote d'Ivoire, Mali and Senegal. This report records the adverse impact of structural adjustment plans, the small number of women teachers in vocational and technical institutions (concentrated in certain areas perceived to be "female" disciplines), weak participation of women in teacher trade unions and reduced possibilities to redress

imbalances affecting women teachers due to the decline of teacher status, salaries and conditions in the context of economic restraints and adjustment measures.

65. That report was followed by the organisation of national workshops in each of the countries concerned, which resulted in recommendations and proposed follow-up actions to redress these problems. The Joint Committee observes that the problems reported follow an all too familiar a pattern in many countries (to which separate reference is made in this Report) and is gratified to note the establishment of national working groups in each of the four countries to evolve strategies for remedial action. The Joint Committee believes that it is essential that national working groups established to address problems of the above type involve governments working in conjunction with NGOs. It commends such initiatives and will seek to follow up practical outcomes in due course.

Action taken to promote knowledge and implementation of the ILO/UNESCO

Recommendation

66. The Joint Committee noted with satisfaction the very considerable activity which had been generated since 1994 by both UNESCO and the ILO to promote knowledge of the provisions of the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation. Specific initiatives included:

- steps taken to revise and upgrade the publication "The Status of Teachers (1984)", a draft of which was placed before the Joint Committee for review and comment;
- the planning of work towards publication of an attractive brochure, to be circulated in a range of languages, drawing attention to the purpose of the Recommendation and its provisions;
- the production and distribution in co-operation with regional bodies, of officially authorised versions of the Recommendation in the Hindi, Portuguese and Russian languages;
- the initiation of steps leading to similar publications in Afrikaans and other major languages spoken in South Africa;
- the taking of a wide variety of steps to catalyse the integration of relevant aspects of the Recommendation into all aspects of education and training; the development of more comprehensive briefing programmes on education and teachers for ILO and UNESCO officials and their constituents, including both hard copy and electronic formats;
- the development of a variety of partnership-building and communication strategies involving international teachers' organisations and inter-governmental bodies involved with education and teachers;
- the highly successful promotion of World Teachers Day;
- the organisation of joint regional UNESCO/ILO workshops, seminars and symposia on the status of teachers, with action-oriented foci to promote and implement the provisions of the Recommendation in national contexts;
- the catalysing of close collaboration between UNESCO, the IBE, the ILO and teachers' organisations in preparation for, and conduct of, major international activities such as the ICE, JMPEP and other significant events and the active involvement of CEART members in such events, particularly in regions in which they live.

67. The importance of this volume of promotional activity must not be under-estimated. The Joint Committee strongly recommends a continuance of the strategies referred to in its 1994 Report (on a tripartite basis wherever appropriate) in as many of the relevant areas as resource constraints permit, bearing in mind the priorities set out below in its proposals for future action.

68. The Joint Committee received a report concerning the planning of the 1997 World Teachers' Day, the theme of which is "Teachers in Difficult Situations". The Joint Committee agrees that such a theme is timely and supports the concept advanced in the report that such a day ought to be seen as the commencement of a year-long consideration of this theme. The Joint Committee recommends that future arrangements as regards World Teachers' Day be based also upon a thematic approach.

Information supplied by international teachers' organisations

69. The Joint Committee welcomes the collaboration with the major international teachers' organisations in obtaining information relevant to its mandate - a continuation of cooperation initiated in 1991 and 1994. Contributions from both Education International and the World Confederation of Teachers have constituted valuable additions for study in conjunction with the materials from government and other sources listed in Annex 1.

Allegations

Allegations received from teachers' organisations on non-observance of the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation

70. Nine communications were received from teachers' organisations since the last Session which related to the application of the Recommendation. Of these, six were deemed properly receivable in whole or in part according to the procedures of the Joint Committee, and three were deemed to be non-receivable according to the procedures.

71. A summary of these communications is set out below. A more detailed summary of the communications and observations by the teachers' organisations and by the respective Governments for allegations deemed receivable, and draft texts of the findings, conclusions and recommendations proposed by the Joint Committee in each case, are contained in Annex 2 to this document.

Non receivable allegations

72. The Primary Teachers' Union of Djibouti (SEP) addressed a letter dated 7 August 1995 to members of Parliament, a representative of the President of the Republic and trade unions of Djibouti, with copies to other national figures and international organisations, including the ILO. The letter alleged that negotiations had failed on the means to effectively apply agreements with the Ministry of National Education concerning teachers. Furthermore, it was alleged that Ministry officials had undertaken arbitrary actions in violation of the agreements, including large-scale dismissals of substitute teachers and transfers of teachers, which negated the status of SEP as an educational partner. The communication was considered non-receivable as an allegation as it was not addressed to the CEART, to the ILO or to UNESCO. Since the secretariat considered this to be a matter for national-level action, no further action was taken and no additional communication or information concerning Djibouti was received by the secretariat.

73. The Committee for the Defence of Foreign Language Lecturers addressed an undated letter, received on 5 January 1996, to the Director-General of the ILO concerning alleged discrimination in salaries and working conditions of non-national university teachers in Italy. The communication was considered non-receivable since it dealt with university teachers who are not included in the scope of the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation. The

complainants were informed of this, and of alternative complaints procedures of the ILO and UNESCO.

74. The Education and Science Employees Union of the Russian Federation addressed a letter dated 3 February 1997 to the Director-General of UNESCO concerning allegations of non-payment of teachers' salaries by national and local authorities in the Russian Federation. The letter cited the large amount of unpaid salaries as evidence of the Government's failure to respect the Recommendation and as the basis for the fifth strike of its kind at national level within the past year. At its 268th Session (March 1997), the Governing Body of the ILO examined a representation filed by International Education (EI) and Education and Science Employees Union of the Russian Federation (ESEUR) alleging the non-application of the Convention on the protection of wages (No. 95). A tripartite committee has been established to examine the allegations concerning non-payments or delay in payment of teachers' wages.

Receivable allegations

75. The six new allegations received since 1994 raise a wide spectrum of issues in terms of the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation, including recruitment and employment of unqualified teachers to meet alleged shortages (Senegal), increased workload (Czech Republic), teachers' salaries (Bolivia), retirement/pensions (Haiti), non-respect of the Recommendation's guiding principles and teachers' professional rights and responsibilities (Federal Republic of Yugoslavia - Serbia and Montenegro) and failure to fund pay increases recommended by the competent body (United Kingdom). In most cases, teachers' organisations also complained of a failure by governments to consult them in the conception and implementation of proposed changes.

76. The allegations were carefully examined by the Joint Committee, whose report on the substance of the allegation, findings and recommendations to the competent bodies of the ILO and UNESCO is set out in Annex 2 to this report.

Review of further developments in allegations examined in 1994

77. The Joint Committee had requested information from the governments and teachers' organisations on further developments in respect of three allegations examined at the Sixth Ordinary Session in 1994 (Albania, Colombia, and Ethiopia). The information provided was examined and the Joint Committee's analysis, findings and recommendations to the competent bodies of the ILO and UNESCO are set out in Annex 2 to this report.

Future procedures for consideration of allegations

78. In the report of its Sixth Ordinary Session the Joint Committee observed that, under its existing mandate and working methods, there was frequently an inordinate delay between the time an allegation is received and its ultimate examination. It was concerned that any such delay militated against the efficacy of, and external confidence in, the allegations procedure.

79. Accordingly, it proposed a new working method designed to lead to a greater efficacy in responding to allegations when they are received. That working method was approved by the Governing Body of the ILO and the Executive Board of UNESCO.

80. The new method has promoted a more efficient and in some cases more rapid initial examination of, and response to, allegations when they are received. However, substantial difficulties still remain in producing a final response to allegations in a timely manner, and thereby assisting complainants in the resolution of reported problems, since the Joint Committee meets only once every three years. As a result, the organisations of teachers seeking the assistance of ILO and UNESCO in the resolution of what are often quite acute difficulties are apt to become disenchanted with the process currently in place.

81. In the circumstances the Joint Committee proposes the following further modified working methods:

(1) that, upon receipt, allegations be initially examined and processed in the manner described in paragraph 30 of the Report of the Sixth Ordinary Meeting (1994), those procedures being facilitated by use of such means of communication as are the most rapid and appropriate to the circumstances;

(2) that, in the event that the final draft of a report on an allegation which has been received since the end of the last Session is prepared more than one year prior to the next scheduled meeting of the full Joint Committee, the working party of the Joint Committee be authorised to transmit that report, as the report of the Joint Committee, for consideration by the Governing Body of the ILO and the Executive Board of UNESCO, provided that it has been approved by the Joint Committee;

(3) that a document containing simple explanatory guidelines concerning the revised work methods and the submission of allegations be prepared by UNESCO and the ILO and widely distributed to relevant bodies;

(4) that where appropriate, information related to its consideration of allegations be sought from sources which are available in accordance with its mandate.

82. It is the view of the Joint Committee that such a procedure will result in a much more effective process and engender significant confidence in it. It accordingly seeks approval to that additional variation in its working methods.

Draft Recommendation concerning the Status of Higher Education Teaching Personnel

83. The Joint Committee notes with satisfaction the proposal for the adoption by the General Conference of UNESCO of the above document and the expressed wish of the ILO Governing Body that the present mandate of the Joint Committee be extended to include a monitoring of the instrument, if it is adopted. In the event that the competent bodies accept the proposal, the Joint Committee would welcome the suggested extension of its mandate as being a natural, logical and economic addition to its present role. The Joint Committee does, however, observe that the provision of adequate resources to facilitate any approved method of monitoring will be essential. It also suggests that, from the outset, steps be taken to establish a protocol for collecting and publishing appropriate statistical indicators relevant to Higher Education Teaching Personnel so as to provide a sound basis for the monitoring function.

Proposals for future action

84. The Joint Committee notes with concern that limitations on resources to monitor, promote and apply the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation have not permitted certain of its recommended strategies to be implemented to date. It is conscious of the fact that there are likely to be continuing resource limitations which will, in the immediate future, necessarily restrict the nature and number of initiatives which can be undertaken to monitor, promote knowledge of the Recommendation and take steps towards its implementation by member States.

85. It therefore proposes that the following steps be taken by the ILO and UNESCO:

(a) that the work already commenced in the redrafting of the publication "The Status of Teachers" be continued as a high priority task, together with the brochure referred to in paragraph 104(a) of the Report of the Sixth Ordinary Meeting, with a view to their wide circulation as soon as is possible. The Joint Committee urged that the revision to the commentaries on the Status of Teachers take account of the principles of plain language;

(b) that a world-wide Web site on the Internet be created to provide information on the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation;

(c) that continuing steps be taken by the ILO and UNESCO to integrate and emphasise relevant aspects of the Recommendation (in particular, section V) in all activities related to education and training. In the period since the Sixth Ordinary Meeting that has been done with notable success. It is important that this type of strategy be continued;

(d) that, apart from these general approaches, resources available during the period between the present meeting and the Seventh Ordinary Session, be concentrated on the preparation of a high profile thematic report on the Status of Teachers, which might profitably follow on, as a joint ILO/UNESCO project, from the World Education Report commissioned by UNESCO. In light of its previous concerns, the Joint Committee suggests that the first report focus on forward-looking procedures and structures which encourage participation of teachers and teachers' organisations in educational reform decisions by the most appropriate means with regard to issues - consultation, negotiation and collective bargaining - and at the various levels of educational systems - central, local and school;

(e) the inclusion on the agenda of a future ILO education sectoral meeting of the theme of lifelong learning, with the focus on the role of teachers and educational personnel;

(f) where feasible, continuation and extension to other countries of previous work in two critical areas: (1) augmenting initial and continuing education and competency levels of teachers; and (2) on the increasingly severe challenge to maintenance of experienced teachers in the profession - stress and burnout - by means of a scientifically grounded stress audit and organisational/systemic responses to reduce and/or manage stress in teaching in both developed and developing countries.

86. The Joint Committee has for some time been concerned with the continuing dearth of comprehensive and reliable statistical data available to it for the purpose of examining the effectiveness of the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation and the levels of adherence to its provisions. Accordingly, at its request, the ILO and UNESCO jointly commissioned a report on teacher indicators available internationally. An integrated report on this topic was prepared by Peter Williams, a UNESCO consultant, and former head of the Education Department of the Commonwealth Secretariat. The report included substantive inputs from UNESCO and ILO statistical and education sector specialists. Additional reports on specific topics were prepared by ILO-commissioned consultants. The Joint Committee commends this valuable investigation for detailed study by governments and teachers' organisations.

87. The Joint Committee shares the report's surprise that so little attention has been given to teachers, whose role in education is so crucial and whose potential contribution to economic and community development is so central, given the current concerns with competitiveness, costs, efficiency and like considerations. The report notes some recent co-operative endeavours involving UNESCO, OECD and EUROSTAT, although these fall somewhat short of producing data which will facilitate comprehensive, meaningful comparisons of what is occurring with regard to vital aspects of the education systems of member countries. The Joint Committee agrees with the proposals for action made in the report. Its proposals for future action reflect its view that work in this area should be accorded high priority.

88. Accordingly, as a critical research basis for this evolving analysis of teachers' status, the Joint Committee recommends that the ILO and UNESCO launch the initial phase of a long-term international project on teacher indicators based on the findings and recommendations of the international feasibility study presented at its 1997 Session. The programme should associate international governmental and non-governmental organisations, national technical cooperation agencies as appropriate, and at a national level, governments, teachers' organisations and other education stakeholders in the design

and implementation of an indicators project. It should be stressed to the ILO and UNESCO Member States that the development of such indicators will facilitate better policy, planning, management and support to teaching professionals, and that it is in their own interests to participate in this type of activity. The Joint Committee urges that such efforts be linked to broader programmes designed to strengthen the statistical capacity of Member States. For example, these efforts should be linked to initiatives such as the projected UNESCO International Institute for Statistics. It may well be that some of this information can be gathered by means of revised ILO and UNESCO annual statistical collections, whilst the remainder will need to be collected by other less frequent, specific surveys at about five years intervals. The Joint Committee suggests that the international teachers' organizations be requested to assist in working with Governments to secure an adequate level of response to any specific surveys. It would be helpful if some attempt could be made to make some comparative examinations of data on a regional basis. The Joint Committee recommends that the initial focus of a project should be directed to the following aspects:

- pre-appointment qualifications for teachers;
- further education opportunities for teachers;
- gender distribution of teachers by categories at both classroom level and by promotion position including school principals (head teachers) and deputy principals (deputy head teachers);
- the numbers of part-time teachers expressed directly or in full-time equivalents (FTEs);
- hours of work for teachers, including non-student contact commitments;
- class sizes;
- teachers' remuneration.

Agenda for the Seventh Ordinary Session of the Joint Committee

89. Against the background of the foregoing recommended activity, the Joint Committee proposes the agenda set out in Annex 3 to this report for its Seventh Ordinary Session.

Annex - Resource materials considered by the Joint Committee

I. Working documents

CEART/SP/1997/1 Election of Officers. (English, French)

CEART/SP/1997/2 Review of the ILO and UNESCO joint or separate activities to promote the application of the Recommendation in view of the conclusions set out in the report of the 1994 Ordinary Session of the CEART. Review of UNESCO activities . (English, French)

CEART/SP/1997/3 and 4 and Add. 1 Review of new case-studies made by UNESCO on teacher education, participation and stress, with particular reference to contents and methodology. Review of any other case-studies conducted since the Sixth Ordinary Session of the Joint Committee as identified in the report of that session. Add. 1: Studies of UNESCO. (English, French)

CEART/SP/1997/5 Review of studies undertaken in several African countries on the status of women teachers in technical assistance and training. (English, French)

CEART/SP/1997/6 and Add. 1 Examination of the results of any other actions undertaken as proposed in the report of the Sixth Ordinary Session. Add. 1: Information supplied by international teachers' organizations: (A) Education International and (B) World Confederation of Teachers. (English, French)

CEART/SP/1997/7 Report on the 1996 International Conference on Education (ICE), focused on teachers. (English, French)

CEART/SP/1997/8 The forms of questionnaire to be used as envisaged in the report of the Sixth Ordinary Session: "An improved International Information System on the Status of Teachers" by Peter R.C. Williams, UNESCO consultant. Annex 4: "Quantitative and qualitative indicators of factors impeding entrance to teaching and advancement of women teachers to posts and in fields dominated by men", by ILO Annex 7: "Teacher indicators: Monitoring stress and burn out - issues and draft research tool", by Geoff Pike, ILO consultant. (English, French)

CEART/SP/1997/9 and Add. 1 Consideration of allegations received from teachers' organizations since the Sixth Ordinary Session Complaints received from teachers' organizations and submitted to the ILO Committee on Freedom of Association. (English, French)

CEART/SP/1997/11 Developments related to the preparation of a Recommendation on higher education teaching personnel. (English, French)

II. Information documents

Colloque conjoint UNESCO/OIT sur les programmes d'ajustement structurel et la condition du personnel enseignant. Rapport final. Dakar, Senegal, 23-26 juin 1997. Dakar, ILO/UNESCO, 1997. (French)

Impact of structural adjustment on the employment and training of teachers: Report for discussion at the Joint Meeting on the Impact of Structural Adjustment on Educational Personnel, Geneva, 22-26 April 1996. Geneva, ILO, 1996. (English, French, Spanish)

International Conference on Education, 45th Session, Geneva, 30 September-5 October 1996. Final Report. Geneva, IBE, 1996. (Arabic, Chinese, English, French, Russian, Spanish)

Learning: The treasure within. Report to UNESCO of the International Commission for Education in the Twenty-first Century. Paris, UNESCO, 1996. (14 languages)

Note on the proceedings: Joint Meeting on the Impact of Structural Adjustment on Educational Personnel, Geneva, 22-26 April 1996. Geneva, ILO, 1996. (English, French, Spanish)

Overview of work on teachers, their pay and conditions, teaching quality and the continuing professional development of teaching. Paris, OECD, 1996. (English)

Recent developments in the education sector. Report for discussion at the Joint Meeting on the Impact of Structural Adjustment on educational Personnel, Geneva, 22-26 April 1996. Geneva, ILO, 1996. (English, French, Spanish)

III. Documents from regional preparatory meetings for the 45th Session of the International Conference on Education

Conclusions of the European Consultation ... (English, French)

Contribution of the Africa region to the 45th session of the ICE by Nwabuno Nwaboku. (English)

Education and teachers in central and eastern European countries: 1991-1995 by Julieta Savova. (English, French)

Education and teachers in Western Europe by Jose Antonio Fernandez. (English, French, Spanish)

Enhancing the role of teachers in a changing world - the Latin American and Caribbean Region by Beatrice Avalos. (English)

Final report of the regional preparatory meeting in the Arab States by UNESCO's Amman Office. (Arabic, English)

Strengthening the role of teachers in a changing world: an Asian-Pacific perspective by the Asian Pacific Centre of Educational Innovation for Development. (English)

IV. Unpublished studies commissioned for the Fourth Special Session

Report on the 45th session of the International Conference on Education; synthesis of five national monographs; summary of UNESCO activities from 1994 to the present to promote the application of the 1966 Recommendation by Shapour Rassekh. (English)

Analysis of replies from Member States to the special IBE questionnaire on the theme of the 45th session of the International Conference on Education by Nona Iliukhina. (English)

Annex 2 - Allegations received from teachers' organizations

1. Allegations received since the Sixth Ordinary Session (1997)

A. Allegation received from the Confederation of American Educators (CEA)

Background

1. By facsimile of 21 April 1995 addressed to the Director-General of UNESCO, the Confederation of American Educators (CEA) submitted allegations concerning the non-observance by the Government of Bolivia of the Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers in respect of teachers' salaries. The Joint Committee's request for additional information addressed to the CEA on 26 September 1995 did not receive a reply.

2. The allegation was submitted to the Government of Bolivia for its observations by letter of 22 July 1996. The Government reply of 9 August 1996 was in turn sent to CEA for additional observations by letter of 26 September 1996. No response was received.

3. A request for an update of the situation with regard to this allegation in light of changes in progress as announced by the Government of Bolivia in its initial letter was sent to the Government by facsimile on 12 June 1997. A copy of the Recommendation in response to the Government request was sent on 27 June 1997. The Government of Bolivia supplied additional information by letter dated 20 August 1997.

Substance of the allegation

4. The communication from the CEA raised allegations of inappropriate salaries for teachers in Bolivia. The provisions concerning negotiations to determine salaries established by the Educational Reform Law No. 1565 were allegedly ignored in the context of a "State of Siege" (the definition of this term was unclear) declared by the Government. The Joint Committee requested more detailed information relating to the salaries and working conditions of Bolivian teachers and living conditions in Bolivia, collective agreements which set salaries and any relevant information as to how the "State of Siege" affected teachers, but did not receive a reply from the CEA.

5. The Government initial reply merely stated that considerable changes had recently been made by the Government with respect to the issues in question. Once related decrees and regulations had been approved, the Government observations would be sent. Moreover, assurances were given that the Government viewpoints were in line with the provisions of the Recommendation. No reply as to the substance of the allegation was provided. In its latest communication, the Government indicated that elections in August 1997 had produced a Government whose electoral programme called for substantial improvements in teachers' education and salaries. The improvements should become evident in the eight months following the elections. The letter reiterated the Government total agreement with the Recommendation's provisions.

6. The Joint Committee did not receive any additional information which would help to clarify the situation with regard to teachers' salaries in Bolivia.

Findings

7. In light of incomplete information received from the CEA and the incomplete and summary information supplied by the Government of Bolivia, the Joint Committee

considers that it is unable to thoroughly examine the substance of the allegations, and that no further consideration of them is appropriate until such information is supplied or available.

Recommendations

8. The Joint Committee recommends that the Governing Body of the ILO and the Executive Board of UNESCO:

- take note of the above situation and agree that no further consideration of the allegation is appropriate at this stage;
- communicate the report on the situation both to the Government of Bolivia and to the CEA.

B. Allegation received from the Czech and Moravian Trade Union of Workers in Education (CMOS PS)

Background

1. By letter dated 23 April 1997 addressed to the Joint Committee, the Czech and Moravian Trade Union of Workers in Education (CMOS PS) submitted allegations concerning the non-observance of the Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers by the Czech Republic with respect to guiding principles, educational objectives and policies, rights and responsibilities of teachers and conditions for effective teaching and learning (hours of work).

2. At the request of the Joint Committee, CMOS PS sent additional information by letter dated 30 June 1997.

3. The Government of the Czech Republic was requested by facsimile and by letter of 31 July 1997 to submit its observations on the allegation. A reminder was sent on 3 September 1997. At the time of the meeting, no reply had been received. The Joint Committee is of the opinion that there has been insufficient time for the Government of the Czech Republic to respond to its request.

Recommendations

4. The Joint Committee recommends that the Governing Body of the ILO and the Executive Board of UNESCO:

- take note that the Government of the Czech Republic has not yet presented its observations on the allegations, and that further consideration of the allegations has been postponed until such information is provided, or a reasonable time has elapsed, as set out under the allegations procedures;
- invite the Government of the Czech Republic to send its observations on these points as soon as possible, request the Government and CMOS PS to keep the Joint Committee advised as to further developments and that these will be reviewed in accordance with approved procedures.

C. Allegation received from the National Teachers' Confederation of Haiti (CNEH)

Background

1. By letter of 7 November 1995 addressed to the ILO, the National Teachers Confederation of Haiti (CNEH) transmitted information alleging the non-observance by the Government of Haiti of the Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers in respect of security of employment, negotiations over terms of service and social security.

2. The initial communication alleged that the Ministry of National Education, by virtue of a Presidential Decree of 28 March 1995, had distributed notifications of special early retirement to hundreds of teachers in October 1995. The measures were allegedly taken following the introduction of structural adjustment measures in the education sector. The communication alleged that the notifications were invalid both as to the form and the

substance. In the first place, backdated notifications were issued but received by teachers after the deadline stipulated by the Presidential Decree. As to the substance, the CNEH alleges that the Presidential Decree is unconstitutional, since any pension granted on retirement must be the object of a law adopted by Parliament. Action by CNEH apparently managed to halt the process of automatic retirement, although the measures in question were not cancelled, and the dispute had not been resolved by mutual agreement at the time that the allegation was deposed.

3. In view of the uncertainty with regard to whether or not the dispute had been resolved, the CNEH was requested to provide additional information on the situation by letter of 11 July 1996. No response to the communication has been received.

4. The Government has not been invited to submit its observations on the situation.

Findings

5. In the absence of further information on the situation from CNEH, the Joint Committee considers that it is not in a position to examine the matter further, unless and until additional information is provided by CNEH, and the Government is then invited to submit its observations according to the appropriate procedures.

Recommendations

6. The Joint Committee proposes to suspend consideration of the allegation until such time as the requested further information is received. It recommends that the Governing Body of the ILO and the Executive Board of UNESCO:

take note of the situation as described above.

D. Allegation received from the Single and Democratic Teachers Union of Senegal (SUDES)

Background

1. By letter of 28 August 1995 addressed to the Director General of the ILO, the Single and Democratic Teachers Union of Senegal (SUDES) submitted allegations concerning the non-observance of the Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers by the Government of Senegal with respect to guiding principles, educational objectives and policies, employment and career, and social security. The parts of the communication relating to the Abolition of Forced Labour Convention, 1957 (No. 105), and the Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention, 1958 (No. 111), were referred to the Governing Body of the ILO for a decision on their receivability, and eventual examination by the relevant supervisory bodies of the ILO.

2. At the request of the Joint Committee, SUDES sent detailed additional information by letter dated 5 September 1996. The allegation was submitted to the Government of Senegal for its observations by letter of 25 April 1997. The Government presented detailed observations and supporting information by letter of 5 June 1997. These were in turn sent to SUDES for its additional comments, which were transmitted by letter and facsimile dated 27 June 1997. The Government was invited to make its final comments on the SUDES observations, and these were sent by letter of 17 July 1997.

Substance of the allegation

3. SUDES has complained that the Government of Senegal launched an Education Volunteers Project (PVE) in 1995 with the aim of recruiting, training and appointing up to 1,200 young men and women between the age of 18 and 35 each year for four years to serve in effect as teachers in schools throughout the country. The Government's stated purpose with the launch of this project was to reopen over 500 classes that have been closed because no teacher is available, to halt the decline in the school enrolment rate, achieving a 65% enrolment rate by 1998 in line with basic education objectives, and to campaign against unemployment and under-employment of young people. The young

people must have a diploma equal to or above that of the lower secondary school-leaving diploma (BFEM), provide a medical certificate proving physical aptitude to teach and other identity papers, pass the written and oral selection tests controlling admission to the programme, and undergo three months of pedagogical training. Once hired, the "volunteers" are to receive a monthly "scholarship" of 50,000 CFA francs (compared to a monthly salary of 110,000 CFA francs of a regular starting teacher) and free housing at their place of service. After four years of service, a volunteer may be engaged as an employee of the state, of a local authority or of the private sector.

4. Among the points raised by SUDES in its supporting documentation are the following:

(a) the training certificate issued to volunteers provides no indication of the amount of training nor of its evaluation; the list is equivalent normally to four years of proper teachers' education in a regional training college;

(b) under the Government decree establishing the project volunteers are not permitted the basic human right to freedom of association and to organize as a trade union, and may be dismissed if they do not respect the decree's provisions;

(c) the schools' executive which certifies fitness of volunteers for duty may ignore the medical certificate required of all volunteers;

(d) volunteers perform the same work as regular teachers and may even be required to teach double-shift classes without the additional compensation which regular teachers receive,

(e) the Government decree stipulates that neither the State nor the project provides social security coverage, but the volunteers are obliged to join a mutual benefit society, on pain of dismissal.

5. It is furthermore alleged that the Government has at no time involved the teachers' organizations in planning for the project. When invited to a seminar on ministerial policy, the teachers' unions unanimously boycotted the discussion on the volunteers project, an action which they considered would accelerate deterioration in education and training quality by undermining the teaching profession and encouraging the spread of precarious employment in the public sector. Faced with teachers' opposition to the project, the Government nevertheless proceeded with the biased selection of volunteers based on party-political lines.

6. The Government's actions disregard the Recommendation by:

(a) offering a salary just above the guaranteed minimum wage, creating an image of poor teachers liable to be exposed to corruption and other indignities

(b) showing its concern only for quantity, not quality in education.

(c) creating more job insecurity in the teaching profession;

(d) ignoring provisions on consultation with teachers' organizations; and

(e) not respecting provisions on social security.

An extensive list of supporting documents was also provided.

7. In its initial observations, the Government of Senegal does not contest the points concerning the establishment of the project of education volunteers, nor its objectives. The Government underlines that commitments made at the Jomtien Conference on Education for All (1990) to provide education for everyone by 2000 oblige it to make agonizing choices and adopt alternative strategies at a time of major constraints due to a difficult economic situation. The choices are all the more stark in relation to continued rapid population growth and the even greater disparities between regions and by gender in the context of falling enrolment ratios - 20 of 41 educational districts have a gross enrolment ratio lower than the national average, with the rates even lower for girls.

8. At the last nationwide consultation on education and training in 1991 involving all stakeholders, a consensus was reached that, given the enormous tasks imposed on

education and the lack of sufficient resources to provide universal education, parents, teachers, academics and employers (both the State and private employers) would have to be mobilized to support schools. During discussions between the Government and teachers' unions in 1994, it was unanimously agreed that alternative solutions were needed to meet staff shortages. The efforts by various partners - parents and local communities who build and equip 700-800 classes per year, teachers who work in multi-grade and double-shift classes, development partners who have undertaken to set up and equip 3500 classes by 1998, the State, which already allocates 30% of its budget to education, and the efforts of young people from other countries engaged in voluntary service - provided the context within which the Government felt obliged to launch the education volunteers project.

9. The Government also contests the allegation of its refusal to consult over the project. It had met the teachers' unions in June 1995 to present the project and provide information before making it public. The teachers' unions then announced their opposition to the project without providing an alternative, and refused to participate in a further seminar to discuss it in detail. The Government contends that it did not refuse to involve the teachers' unions in the study; rather they chose to boycott discussions. Moreover, public opinion has strongly supported the project, and more than double the usual number of candidates who sit for primary school teachers' exams were candidates for the project. These were overwhelmingly (87%) young people with a baccalaureate or university level students who could hardly impair the quality of education and training as charged by SUDES. Furthermore, the fact that the written tests for project candidates were administered in three quarters of the educational districts means that not all teachers adhered to the boycott announced by the unions.

10. The charge of bias in the selection process is far from the truth according to the Government. The volunteers were not selected by the Ministry as usual, but in a decentralized operation by fully autonomous panels under the inspectorate's supervision. The panels were composed of teachers, representatives of teachers' unions, parents' associations, administrative authorities, and observers from the inspectorate and the Ministry. The testing and subsequent selection were carried out in accordance with strict criteria and transparency.

11. Among other facts in support of its observations the Government notes that:

- because it holds the teaching profession in such high esteem, the volunteers cannot join the profession before they have served in effect a four-year apprenticeship;
- the project has quality objectives in the areas of curricula, interaction between the school and local environments, and continual training of teachers which have benefitted the volunteers and the programmes and methods of child-centred schools;
- the training module incorporates language and adult education facilities and techniques enabling volunteers to help educate people in the rural environments; the modules have been extensively prepared by a working party and reviewed after the first year of the project;
- volunteer training is not very different in length from primary school teacher training (EFIs), and the relative success of education volunteers compared to other teachers at professional examinations, after one year's training, demonstrates the high level of training standards;
- there are few alternatives for making up teacher shortages since a recent audit revealed that the possibilities for re-engagement of unemployed teachers or redeployment of serving teachers were very limited. In any case, budgetary constraints have prevented the Government from meeting its commitment to recruit 700 new teachers per year, although the exceptional step of creating this volunteer project is in no way intended to substitute for regular recruitment of teachers;

- education volunteers do not enjoy trade union rights because they are not salaried workers, but in fact this situation is not new, since trainee teachers have never been allowed to join trade unions but have always set up associations in conformity with their status; education volunteers have set up their own association (AYES) with branches in all educational districts;
- education volunteers, like trainee teachers, may be dismissed because of infirmities which are incompatible with teaching, even though they have provided a medical certificate;
- education inspectors have been asked not to assign education volunteers to two-shift classes while awaiting a solution for the problem of compensation;
- the allegations concerning social security are misinterpretations of the project's texts which provide protection against accidents through self-administered mutual assurance associations, with contributions paid for by development partners or the Government.

12. In conclusion, faced with the constraints listed above, and taking account of the guarantees to protect the interests of education and teachers built into the project, the Government felt that it had no choice but to take this exceptional step, given the prospects that hundreds of classes would have closed otherwise, depriving 75,000 children of their rights to education. It remained limited in time - four years - and the Government was still open to discussions with the teachers' unions to improve the project or develop better alternatives.

13. The necessity of maintaining the volunteers to prevent class closures has led the Government to commission a study starting in May 1997 and financed by the World Bank, to consider the possibility of:

- a permanent body of education volunteers in the framework of a national civilian service;
- terms for creating a special permanent category of contract teachers benefiting from a career structure and whose financial compensation takes account of budgetary constraints;
- finding better ways of integrating the volunteers in the teaching profession.

14. In its subsequent observations, SUDES challenges the Government's assertions on the following points:

- training: there is a lack of clarity over the end-of-training certificate or diploma. The training modules are pointless if they do not lead final evaluation, confirmed by diploma, which measures the extent to which the coursework of the trainee is tailored to future teaching requirements. In addition, when touting the high results of the education volunteers in passing formal exams, no mention is made of the fact that a teacher's pedagogical skills have never been a function merely of their university degrees;
- entry into the profession/careers: the Government's approach to criteria for entry into employment in the volunteers project by way of a valid medical examination which it expressly downplays in some cases is an invitation to abuse and patronage. Moreover, there is absolutely no consensus within Senegal on the status - state official, civil servant - or on the type of career for education volunteers, and contrary to the Government's contentions, no regulations or laws to this effect;
- conditions of employment: on the one hand the Government's statements and actions treat education volunteers as good teachers who finish with a training certificate, and have the same teaching load and professional obligations as their other colleagues, yet on the other hand are denied the same trade union rights. Furthermore, there is not even a professional order which instructs inspectors to withhold volunteers from double-shift classes, and in schools with only such classes, the inspectors have no choice but to permit these practices;
- Medical benefits/social security: the terms of the mutual benefits fund are very clear in terms of compulsory membership for volunteers and the risks of dismissal for misconduct, including trade union membership, and the State's refusal to pay social security

contributions, in contrast to the Government's statements. In addition, no legal text exists stipulating that health Care is available to volunteers or their children through public medical services.

15. In sum, SUDES contends that the education volunteers approach drains the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation of much of its substance with regard to high standards for teacher preparation and other matters. The drop in school enrolment ratios can be explained as much by the insufficient resources allocated to education in Senegal in contrast to extravagant Government expenditures on ministerial prerogatives. There has also been an irrational use of existing staff, inasmuch as the most recent survey revealed that more than 2000 primary-level teachers were not assigned to the functions for which they were trained. The desirable goal of higher enrolments ratios must still not allow diminished respect for the right to work as well as less rigorous teacher training standards and recruitment. SUDES regrets that despite a protocol signed between the teachers' unions and the Government in May 1997, shortly thereafter the Government announced a commissioned study on the volunteers programme funded by the World Bank.

16. In its final observation, the Government makes the following points:

- Education policy/consultation: in February 1996 a meeting was organized by the Government to examine the conclusions of the first study on the weak and strong points of the volunteers project in order to identify strategies for improving it. During the meeting, a workshop took place on the strengths and weaknesses of initial training, in which five principal teachers' unions participated; only SUDES refused to participate. The Government could hardly be accused of failing to associate the teachers' unions in the elaboration of educational policy.

- training: an evaluation study financed by the World Bank which examined the examination and performance results of 150 volunteers and 150 non-volunteer teachers had produced satisfying results with regard to the former: the group of volunteers under study had performed as well or better than the regular teachers on four of the six evaluation or performance criteria, and nearly as well on the other two. In addition, training continued for volunteers throughout the period of their apprenticeship in the form of a continual training session of 15 days per year:

- entry into the profession: the Government has followed a very innovative and open procedure in naming representatives of various stakeholders to the projects' selection panels, and no one, including the media and teachers' unions presents in all districts, has ever made charges of manipulation of the process in the form of cronyism. A recent incident alleged to be one of these cases related in fact to candidates coming from outside the district, and in any case the responsibility for the selection process is in the hands of the district educational authorities (academie). The Government rejects the accusation that aptitude tests applied in addition to the required medical certificate constitute an undermining of independent medical certification since the latter does not really address the question of physical aptitude to teach. It also defends the priority accorded to women candidates (assuming equal qualifications) as a part of its desire to extend greater access to girls in rural areas through the engagement of female volunteers as role models;

- *employment conditions career development*: the Government re-emphasized that a distinction was made between the status of the volunteers and that of officials or civil servants in no matter which country, and that the volunteers project constituted a provisional response to the problem of broadening and deepening access to education taking account of the specificities of

Senegal. As to their future status and careers, it was unimaginable that they should be dismissed after four years of service, and their classes closed; the second study on future

alternatives would permit the identification of a career strategy for these volunteers in order to continue development of the education sector;

medical facilities/social security: the Government reiterates its position on the voluntary and self-administered nature of the mutual benefits fund, and indicates that since the interventions of the President of the fund, public hospitals in all regions now treat volunteers:

trade union rights: the right to "organize in an association" is not denied to volunteers, and a volunteer has never been dismissed because of their ideas or choices.

17. The Government concludes by reiterating its budgetary constraints since it is already spending 30% on education, while it must find solutions to large-scale problems related to expansion of the education system. The conclusion of the recent joint commission (Government and teachers' unions) which surveyed the staffing possibilities to which SUDES referred would be an important element in that search for solutions. The Government requests advice as to whether it can make available to the media the observations of both parties for the benefits of the public. It furthermore suggests that if the dispute cannot be resolved, an investigative commission of inquiry be sent to Senegal to look into the matter

Findings

18. The Joint Committee commends the Government and SUDES for their careful replies to the allegation. It further notes that the Government has shown an admirable commitment to expanding basic education in a difficult economic context.

19. However, several aspects of the Government's plan contravene the provisions of the Recommendation. In particular, the use of volunteers with minimal training as teachers violates the very core of Section V of the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation. The interests of both students and volunteers would be served by ensuring that persons entrusted with the responsibility of teachers have received adequate preparation for the role of teachers.

20. Moreover, if "volunteers" are to work as teachers they should enjoy the same rights of freedom of association as other teachers, however they may have been defined by their employers. Persons employed in this capacity may be especially vulnerable and require collective representation to deal with professional problems. The Joint Committee is also concerned that any extensive or permanent use of volunteers or contract teachers could undermine the status of professional teachers who have dedicated their careers to their professions. It calls attention to provision 141 of the Recommendation which emphasizes that measures to deal with teacher shortages should be exceptional and not endanger teachers' professional standards.

21. The Joint Committee regrets that SUDES has not been involved in all stages of the development of this programme. The ILO/UNESCO Recommendation holds that teachers and their organizations should participate in the development of education policies. The Joint Committee notes, however, that SUDES has on some occasions not availed itself of its opportunities to participate in consultative forums.

Recommendation

22. The Joint Committee recommends that the Governing Body of the ILO add the Executive Board of UNESCO:

- take note of the situation as described above;
- communicate the findings to both the Government of Senegal and to the SUDES;
- offer the services of the ILO and UNESCO to provide, consistent with a proposal of the Government, a mission or other appropriate form of assistance to aid the Government and

SUDES in providing expanded education services for the youth of Senegal operating within the principles of the Recommendation;

- request that the Government and SUDES keep the Joint Committee informed of developments with regard to their remaining problems, and that such information be examined in accordance with approved procedures.

E. Allegation received from the National Association of School Masters'/Union of Women Teachers (NASUWT)

Background

1. The National Association of School Masters/Union of Women Teachers (NASUWT) of the United Kingdom addressed a letter dated 22 November 1996 to the Director-General of the ILO, concerning the composition, financial remit and alleged failure of the School Teachers Review Body (STRB) to properly address conditions of service of teachers in the United Kingdom, and the failure of the Government to fund pay increases recommended by the STRB. After determining that the last part of the communication was receivable, since all other parts of the letter were taken up under other supervisory procedures of the ILO, the secretariat invited the NASUWT to supply additional information requested by members of the Joint Committee.

Findings

2. In the absence of further information from NASUWT, the Joint Committee considers that it is not in a position to examine the matter further, unless and until additional information is provided by NASUWT, and the Government is invited to submit its observations according to the appropriate procedures.

Recommendation

3. The Joint Committee decides to suspend consideration of the allegation until further notice and recommends that the Governing Body of the ILO and the Executive Board of UNESCO communicate its decision to NASUWT.

F. Allegation received from Education International

Background

1. By letters of 6 June and 19 October 1995 addressed to the Director-General of the ILO, Education International (EI) submitted allegations concerning the non-observance by the Government of the Federal Republic of Yugoslavia (Serbia and Montenegro) of the Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers in respect of guiding principles (discrimination in matters of preparation and employment, educational objectives and policies (availability of facilities without discrimination, liberty to establish and direct educational institutions), and rights and responsibilities (professional freedom). The allegations concern the treatment of Albanian-speaking teachers in the autonomous region of Kosovo.

2. Aspects of the allegations which concerned university teachers were not considered as they do not come within the scope of the Recommendation and/or the competence of the Joint Committee.

3. The Joint Committee requested additional information from EI by letter of 24 November 1995. In its response dated 15 January 1996, EI provided detailed information concerning the cases of the teachers and schools as requested by the Joint Committee.

4. The allegation was submitted to the Federal Republic of Yugoslavia (Serbia and Montenegro) for its observations by letter dated 22 July 1996. A reminder was sent on 11 June 1997, and in response to the Government's request, copies of all communications were sent to it by facsimile dated 14 June 1997. At the time of the Meeting, no response had been received.

5. The consideration by the Committee of this allegation is without prejudice to the question of whether or not the Federal Republic of Yugoslavia (Serbia and Montenegro) should be recognized as a continuation of the former Socialist Federal Republic of Yugoslavia

The substance of the allegation

6. In its communications, EI alleged that over the course of two years, and more intensely since January 1995, government police had raided more than 100 Albanian-language primary and secondary schools, closed or expelled Albanian-speaking people from some, banned teachers from conducting educational activities in their homes, beaten or threatened teachers with death, imprisoned, and in some cases tortured, and fined most of the imprisoned teachers. The names of individual teachers, schools and their localities were cited. The harassment deprived both students and teachers of their fundamental rights.

7. Detailed information concerning the various aspects of the allegations were submitted by EI in January 1996. The information indicated that imprisonment, fines, physical mistreatment and in one case the death of teachers, whose names, positions and schools were cited, had begun in October 1993 and continued up to the time of the submission. The cases variously affected teachers in primary, general secondary and technical secondary schools.

Findings

8. The Joint Committee regrets that the Government has not replied to the allegations. Provisions in the Recommendation's guiding principles (paragraph 3) stipulate that the utmost importance should be attached to the contribution of education to peace, understanding, tolerance and friendship among nations and among racial and religious groups. Furthermore, all aspects of the preparation and employment of teachers should be free from any form of discrimination on grounds of national or social origin, among other considerations (paragraph 7). The Recommendation's provisions under educational objectives and policies (paragraph 10 (a) and (b)) state that every child should be provided with the fullest possible educational opportunities, and that all facilities should be made available equally to enable all persons to enjoy their rights to education without discrimination on grounds of national or social origin, among other considerations. Moreover, the responsibility of the State to provide free education in an adequate network of schools should not be construed so as to interfere with the liberty of parents or legal guardians to choose for their children schools other than those established by the State, nor the liberty of individuals and bodies to establish educational institutions provided that they conform to minimum educational standards laid down or approved by the State (paragraph 10 (c)). In terms of the Recommendation's provisions on the rights and responsibilities of teachers (paragraph 61), the teaching profession should enjoy academic freedom in the exercise of its professional duties. More specifically, teachers should be given the essential role in the choice of and adaptation of teaching materials, textbooks and methods, within the framework of approved programmes and with the assistance of the educational authorities.

9. The allegations concern in part serious violations of fundamental human rights which are enshrined in international law, and are the competence of human rights bodies established to deal with such violations. The Joint Committee also considers that the allegations of school closures, expulsions, bans on private educational activities, harassment and imprisonment of teachers on grounds that they taught in Albanian, none of which have been contested by the Government at the time of the meeting, constitute serious failure to apply the provisions of the Recommendation set out above.

10. The Joint Committee has moreover been made aware of an agreement signed in 1996 between the Government of the Federal Republic of Yugoslavia (Serbia and Montenegro) and representatives of the Albanian community of Kosovo. The agreement purportedly provided for the return of Albanian pupils to their schools. The available information, however, indicates that the agreement has not been implemented, and that most of the problems pointed out above remain unresolved.

Recommendations

11. The Joint Committee recommends that the Governing Body of the ILO and the Executive Board of UNESCO:

- take note of the situation as described above;
- communicate the above findings to the Government of the Federal Republic of Yugoslavia (Serbia and Montenegro) and to Education International, request the Government to respond as soon as possible to the allegations referred to above, and to take urgent steps to redress the situation, if it has not already done so, drawing on the advice and assistance of the ILO and UNESCO, where appropriate;
- request the Government of the Federal Republic of Yugoslavia (Serbia and Montenegro) and Education International to inform the Joint Committee as to what steps have been taken to address the identified problems, and that the information will be reviewed in accordance with approved procedures.

2. Further developments in allegations received since the Sixth Ordinary Session in 1994

A. Allegation received from the Independent Trade Unions of Education of Albania (SPASH)

Background

1. The Joint Committee initially examined the allegation, submitted by the Independent Trade Unions of Education of Albania (SPASH) in 1992, at its Sixth Ordinary Session in 1994 (CEART/VI/1994/12. Annex 1). It regretted that the Government of Albania had not responded to the allegation. The Joint Committee's main findings and recommendations included the following points:

- positive developments in the form of a collective agreement arrived at in 1993 had made improvements in some areas affecting the teaching profession;
- notwithstanding the general economic and social problems faced by Albania, it seemed obvious that the Government had done very little to ensure the safety, functionality and reasonable comfort in use of school buildings to maintain them at an acceptable minimum standard, or to supply basic books and materials for effective learning; substantial numbers of children, particularly in rural areas, seemed to be denied effective education;
- unsuitable transportation, or lack of transport of teachers in rural and remote areas had rendered it difficult or impossible for them to discharge their teaching functions;
- unless and until proper machinery for communication and consultation between teachers and competent authorities could be established and operate in a bona fide manner, real progress towards implementation of the Recommendation would be difficult;
- the findings should be communicated to the Government of Albania, with a request that positive steps be taken to address the issues identified, drawing on international advice and assistance where appropriate;
- the Government of Albania and SPASH were requested to keep the Joint Committee advised as to developments and that these should be reviewed at the next Special Session.

2. Following its examination by the Governing Body of the ILO and the Executive Board of UNESCO, the Joint Committee's report, including the analysis of the allegation, was simultaneously sent to the Government of Albania and to SPASH in June 1995 (1). The Government and SPASH were invited to keep the Joint Committee informed of

developments in the situation. Reminders were sent to both parties in July 1996, and again in June 1997.

Further developments

3. By facsimile dated 18 July 1997, SPASH informed the ILO of developments since 1994, notably:

- the signing of a collective agreement at the first level in September 1994, and its renewal in March 1996 with some improvements;
- approval by Parliament of a law for the preuniversity education system on 21 July 1995;
- approval of the Labour Code, and subsidiary acts concerning public schools by the Ministry of Education, on 12 July 1995;
- failure by Parliament to approve legislation concerning the Status of Employees, in which SPASH has demanded that teachers have the same rights as other employees.

Moreover, despite the large Government deficit and a 30% inflation rate in Albania, SPASH has demanded that salaries of teachers reflect the importance of teachers and the teaching profession to society, by ensuring a satisfactory living standard. Information on current salary levels and the standard of living was not provided.

4. As of the time of the meeting, the Government of Albania had not supplied additional information.

Findings

5. The Joint Committee regrets that the Government of Albania has not responded to repeated requests to provide information on the initial allegation and on further developments. It considers that this failure to respond demonstrates an attitude of nonrespect for the mandate of the Joint Committee.

6. In light of the information received from SPASH, the Joint Committee nevertheless considers that improvements have been made in the situation of teachers and the teaching profession in Albania in respect of at least some of the Recommendation's provisions regarding means for consultation and negotiation with teachers. The Joint Committee welcomes the positive steps towards installation of a process of communication, consultation and negotiation in line with the Recommendation, which are apparent from the signing and renewal of the collective agreements, and the approval of the Labour Code and subsidiary acts governing public schools. The available information, however, does not permit an analysis of the extent to which changes in the Labour Code and its subsidiary acts establish a sustainable basis for consultation and negotiation of appropriate issues between the teaching profession and competent authorities as foreseen in the Recommendation. In that connection, the Joint Committee notes continuing differences between SPASH and the Government of Albania concerning the status of employees and teachers' position under such legislation.

7. The Joint Committee also notes that little information has yet been provided on other aspects of education and the teaching profession, most notably the situation in rural and remote areas, making it difficult to evaluate progress in these areas.

Recommendations

8. The Joint Committee recommends that the Governing Body of the ILO and the Executive Board of UNESCO:

- take note of the situation as described above;
- communicate the above findings both to the Government of Albania and to SPASH, requesting both parties to consider the advisability of drawing on international advice and assistance from the ILO and from UNESCO to improve the situation of teachers and the teaching profession in areas which remain below the standards of the Recommendation;

- request the Government of Albania and SPASH to keep the Joint Committee advised as to further developments and that these be examined in accordance with approved procedures.

Notes

(1) The Report was also examined by the Committee on the Application of Standards of the International Labour Conference at its 82nd Session (June 1995) and by the 28th Session of the General Conference of UNESCO (November 1995).

B. Allegation received from the General Confederation of Labour of Colombia (CGT)

Background

1. The Joint Committee initially examined the allegation, submitted by the General Confederation of Labour (COT) of Colombia in 1992, at its Sixth Ordinary Session in 1994 (CEART/VI/1994/12, Annex 1). The communication alleged non-observance by the Government of Colombia (Department of Santander) of the Recommendation with respect to its guiding principles, conditions for effective teaching and learning, teachers' salaries and social security. The part of the allegation relating to salaries with respect to the Minimum Wage Fixing Convention, 1928 (No. 26) was examined by the Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations of the ILO (2). The Government's observations to the ILO responded essentially to those aspects covered by Convention No. 26, with brief references to social security and hours of work.

2. The Joint Committee's main findings and recommendations included the following points:

- in view of the incomplete information available, the level of remuneration of contract teachers in comparison to full-time, permanently employed teachers or other State employees was not clear;
- nevertheless, the system of contract teachers used in Colombia did not provide the requisite stability and security of employment, payment of appropriate remuneration, other adequate terms and conditions of service and social security, or made due allowance for the hazards of teaching in declared security risk areas ("red zones");
- the remuneration paid in the past did not conform with the principles established by the Recommendation, nor did recent adjustments appear to recognise the proper status of teachers in relation to the importance of their function and in comparison with other professional and non-professional sectors of the workforce;
- the findings should be communicated to the Government of Colombia, with a request that steps be taken to redress the situation;
- the Government of Colombia and the CGT were requested to inform the Joint Committee as to further developments and that these should be reviewed at the next Special Session.

3. Following its examination by the Governing Body of the ILO and the Executive Board of UNESCO, the Joint Committee's report, including the analysis of the allegation, was simultaneously sent to the Government of Colombia and to the CGT in June 1995.(3) The Government and the CGT were invited to keep the Joint Committee informed of developments in the situation. Reminders were sent to both parties in July 1996, and again in June 1997.

Further developments

4. By facsimile dated 23 July 1997, the Government of Colombia sent its observations on the situation to the ILO. According to the Government, Law No. 60 of 1993 provides that contract teachers employed before 30 June 1993 will be gradually recruited as regular teachers in the departments or districts in which they serve, after review of personnel needs and in proportion to incremental increases in the budgets of the respective authorities. The

appointment of such teachers should be accomplished within six years of the publication of the law. The Government also provided extracts of Law No. 115 of 1994 which sets out certain expected functions, rights and required qualifications of educators. These include the following points:

- they will receive training and professional development, will not be discriminated against because of philosophical, political or religious reasons, will carry out the institution's educational programme, and will seek to constantly improve educational processes with ideas and suggestions through their respective school boards and education boards, and to the Academic Council;
- appointments of teachers shall be made by decree which confirms selection and accreditation following competitions organised by the respective authority, and according to a system devised by the Ministry of Education which is designed to ensure impartiality;
- those university graduates not on the National Teachers' Registry may be included if they meet the specified requirements within a period of two years; beyond this date they will be barred from educational service unless they are following a recognised professional development programme, giving them the right to a two-year extension for inclusion in the registry;
- contract teachers which are the subject of Law No. 60 of 1993 will have their contracts extended for successive academic periods until they can be recruited as regular teachers;
- notifications of teacher or administrative personnel decisions - nominations, transfers, exchanges, and others - will be made by the governors or mayors of the respective districts or municipalities responsible for state educational services, and in accordance with available funded positions and legal procedures;
- exceptions may be made to engage university graduates with degrees in fields in which there are shortages of qualified or registered teachers in secondary technical education; post facto inclusion of such teachers in the National Teachers' Registry requires fulfilment of the corresponding requirements.

5. Furthermore, Law No. 344 of 1996 limits the appointment of teachers by regional authorities in accordance with an annual human resource rationalisation plan which takes account of the budgetary situation proper to the authority. Two members elected by the corresponding boards of education established by Law No. 115 of 1994 participate in the plan's elaboration. Within the context of these restrictions, regional authorities may not open competitions to fill positions with new responsibilities nor vacancies in existing positions until such time as contract teachers with seniority before 8 February 1994 have been given priority in nomination in accordance with the 1993 and 1994 laws.

6. The Government states that these legislative provisions represent a significant advance in finding a solution to the problems faced by contract teachers as they grant these individuals preferential rights. Accordingly, in the Department of Santander a number of contract teachers have been appointed as regular teachers, although budgetary and administrative limitations have not permitted full realisation of the legislated standards.

7. Finally, the Government notes that the Constitutional Court handed down a decision in a case related to that of contract teachers in Santander, compensating the contract workers for all aspects of their employment relationship, thereby opening an additional legal avenue for solutions of the problems faced by contract teachers.

8. As of the time of the meeting, the CGT had not supplied additional information concerning the situation of the contract teachers in Santander or contesting the Government response.

Findings

9. In light of the information received from the Government of Colombia, which has not been contested by the CGT at the time of the Meeting, the Joint Committee considers that

improvements have been made in the employment situation of contract teachers in Colombia in respect of at least some of the Recommendation's provisions regarding security of employment as the basis for stability in the teaching profession. The appointment of contract teachers as regular teachers would in principle contribute to the resolution of other problems of this category of personnel, such as adequate remuneration, health and social security benefits, pointed out by the Joint Committee in 1994. The Joint Committee welcomes the positive legislative steps towards the application of non-discriminatory criteria and transparent procedures in the appointment and transfer of teaching staff, and their inclusion in the National Teachers' Registry, which appear to meet many of the guidelines set out in the Recommendation. Moreover, the 1996 legislation establishes a preferential basis for the appointment of contract staff as regular teachers which should facilitate meeting the deadline for regularisation of the employment relationship of such staff by 1999, as stipulated in the law adopted in 1993. Taken together, these legislative provisions also maintain respect for the professional qualifications required of all teachers in the interests of a quality educational system.

10. The Joint Committee notes that the provisions adopted to address the problem of contract teachers are nevertheless subject to budgetary limitations imposed on the respective educational authorities who employ them. As a consequence, not all the contract teachers in Santander for example who are candidates for appointment as regular teachers have received such appointments. The Joint Committee recalls the importance that the Recommendation attaches to adequate funding by the State of education throughout a nation's education system and therefore the resources allocated to recruit, provide stable employment and appropriate salaries for teachers and ensure effective conditions for the exercise of their functions. It urges the Government to ensure that sufficient resources are available at national level to compensate for any deficiencies which might occur because of the economic and fiscal situation of a particular department or local authority, so as to effectively apply the legislative measures which have been adopted to guarantee security of employment for all teachers, including those presently engaged as contract staff.

Recommendations

11. The Joint Committee recommends that the Governing Body of the ILO and the Executive Board of UNESCO:

- take note of the situation as described above;
- communicate the above findings both to the Government of Colombia and to the CGT.

Notes

(2) ILC, 80th Session, Report III (Part 4A); 81st Session, Report III (Part 4A); 85th Session, Report III (Part 4A) - Convention No 26 by Colombia.

(3) The Report was also examined by the Committee on the Application of Standards of the International Labour Conference at its 82nd Session (June 1995) and by the 28th Session of the General Conference of UNESCO (November 1995).

Allegation received from the World Confederation of Organizations of the Teaching Profession (WCOTP) and the Ethiopian Teachers Association (ETA)

Background

1. The Joint Committee initially examined the allegation, submitted by the World Confederation of Organizations of the Teaching Profession (WCOTP) and the Ethiopian Teachers' Association (ETA) in 1993, at its Sixth Ordinary Session in 1994 (CEART/VU1994/12, Annex 1). The communication alleged non-observance by the Government of Ethiopia of the Recommendation with respect to its guiding principles, educational objectives and policies, preparation for the profession, further education for

teachers, employment and career (entry into the teaching profession, security of tenure) the rights and responsibilities of teachers (professional freedom, relations between teachers and the education service as a whole), conditions for effective teaching and learning (school buildings, special provisions for teachers in rural or remote areas), teachers' salaries and social security.

2. The Joint Committee's main findings and recommendations included the following points:

- reviewed against the background of Ethiopia's difficult economic situation, and keeping in mind that the Government had not responded to the initial allegation, the information provided nevertheless indicated that the health and efficacy of the educational system was at serious risk;
- the low relative salary level of teachers, to the point of rendering them indigent, would inevitably and adversely affect the quality of persons entering the profession and the educational process; the situation was exacerbated by the unequal treatment of teachers by comparison with other public service employees in areas such as vacation pay, allowances, medical expense subsidy and security of tenure;
- concern was expressed over the situation of teachers in remote areas who had to travel considerable distances at their own expense to collect salaries and/or did not receive their salaries in time, in that this was inimical to a sound employer/employee relationship;
- conditions in the nominal schools of resettlement centers fell far short of the basic principles of the Recommendation, and it was difficult to perceive how any satisfactory educational process could take place if the fundamental physical requirements and reasonable conditions of service for teachers who staffed such schools were not met; - a serious concern over the allegation that the ETA had not been accorded any capacity for proper input into educational policy or decision-making;
- the findings should be communicated to the Government of Ethiopia, with a request that urgent steps be taken to redress the situation, drawing on international advice and assistance, where appropriate;
- the Government of Ethiopia and the relevant international and national organizations of teachers concerned were requested to inform the Joint Committee as to what steps had been taken to address problems identified, and these should be reviewed at the next Special Session.

3. Following its examination by the Governing Body of the ILO and the Executive Board of UNESCO, the Joint Committee's report, including the analysis of the allegation, was simultaneously sent in June 1995 to the Government of Ethiopia and to Education International, the successor organization to the WCOTP, acting on behalf of the ETA.(4) Matters relating to freedom of association were examined by the Freedom of Association Committee of the ILO Governing Body in case no. 1888. The Government and EI were invited to keep the Joint Committee informed of developments in the situation.

Further developments

4. By letter dated 22 July 1995, the Government of Ethiopia sent its observations on the situation to the ILO, indicating that previous requests for information had never been received. According to the Government, the war-economy policies pursued by previous regimes for more than a generation had impoverished the country, affecting teachers accordingly. During this period, the material and social status of teachers sank to such lows that Ethiopians had no interest in becoming teachers, gravely affecting the quality of education. Democratic rights and professional freedom were absent - teachers were unlawfully imprisoned and even disappeared, nor did they have an input in educational processes or policy, which did not exist.

5. The present Transitional Government of Ethiopia (TOE) was engaged in democratizing society, rehabilitating it socially and rebuilding infrastructure, including education as a basis for national development. Following a process of public consultation to identify problems and propose remedies, a Comprehensive Education and Training Policy was ratified in April 1994 which placed teacher training and professional development of teachers as one of the three priority areas. It was stressed that the deep-rooted problems faced by teachers could not be alleviated overnight. Significant progress had been made in the following areas:

- the Ministry of Education had established a network composed of a reasonable number of teachers to participate in the process of putting into operation the new educational policy, and other teachers had been informed of the country's new objectives and policies through their associations or directly at school. Teachers had participated in the production of new teaching materials, and in the evaluation of the new curriculum beginning in the 1994-95 academic year;

- the new policy on preparation for the profession stressed that teacher trainees demonstrate ability, diligence, professional interest, physical and mental fitness appropriate to the profession, that teacher education emphasize basic knowledge, methodology, practical training and a code of ethics, and that teachers were certified before being assigned to teach at any educational level;

- the Ministry of Education, in cooperation with regional education offices, had offered further education to as many teachers as possible in view of its economic capacity;

- though accountable to the Federal Ministry or regional education offices on the same basis as other educational institutions, teacher training institutions, including universities and colleges, functioned autonomously with respect to decisions of their administrative bodies in regard to hiring and firing of staff, had their own salary scale and enjoyed full academic freedom;

- teachers enjoyed democratic rights, including freedom of association and expression, like other citizens; teaching staff had full rights to be members and to participate in leadership bodies of the ETA, however, use of a professional association for sectarian political ends was subject to disciplinary action on presentation of concrete evidence, in order to avoid that universities and colleges should become breeding grounds for political instability which runs counter to the interests of the majority of the members of the educational community;

- job security has been maintained so long as teachers perform their duties and responsibilities;

- a six-step career structure has been implemented, ranging from beginner to lead teacher;

- a new salary scale was adopted in November 1994 and funded with a significant investment of government funds for 1994-95, placing every teacher irrespective of position one step higher than civil servants of similar qualifications and service, and increasing salaries at all levels;

- restructuring of the Ministry of Education along school and district ("wereda") lines has improved teachers' access to professional advice and their monthly salary from local authorities, while improvements in the national transport network had made it easier for teachers to collect their salaries;

- school buildings were being constructed or reconstructed, teachers were now offered priority in rented housing, they were entitled to a hardship allowance equivalent to 30-40% of salary when deployed to very hot areas, and retirement benefits were safeguarded.

6. The Government's observations were submitted to EI and to ETA by separate letters dated 11 September 1995. Responses with further observations were received from each organization dated 20 November and 17 October 1995 respectively. In its communication,

ETA contested the Government's observations, maintaining that all the problems raised in its previous reports remained unresolved. Among other points, it contended that:

- teachers and other citizens did not accept the new education policy because it encouraged privatization, considered harmful to Ethiopians' interests, and children were deprived of education in their mother tongue;

- teachers had been arbitrarily transferred or fired for political and ethnic reasons; for example, some 6,000 teachers in one region were reportedly ordered to accept transfers or be fired because they could no longer teach in the language of their home region, and they were replaced by unqualified individuals, some of whom had not completed secondary education.

- devaluation of the Ethiopian currency had meant that the new salary scale and its increases represented only a nominal improvement in the living standards of teachers:

- the Minister of Education refused to meet with the President of ETA to examine the problems raised in the allegation.

In its communication, EI supported the points raised by ETA in respect of inter alia. refusal to negotiate over salaries and conditions with the duly elected leadership of ETA, disappearances and massive transfers of teachers, based on its observations in the course of two visits to Ethiopia in October and December 1994.

7. ETA provided further information in a facsimile sent to the ILO dated 21 and 24 February 1996, and EI sent additional information to the ILO in letters dated 9 May and 6 June 1996. The information from both organizations essentially concerned allegations of failure to respect freedom of association and collective bargaining rights as set out in relevant international conventions. Part of the communications from ETA dealt with alleged deaths, kidnappings, detentions or imprisonment without trial, large-scale transfers and firings of teachers because of their political opposition to ethnic policies of the Government. With the exception of this latter part, most aspects of these communications were considered to come within the mandate of the Committee on Freedom of Association of the ILO, and therefore examined by that body.

8. The observations submitted by ETA and EI in 1995, and the aspect relating to ethnically- and politically-based actions taken against teachers alleged in ETA's communication of February 1996 were submitted to the Government for its observations by letter of 9 July 1996. A reminder was sent on 11 June 1997. As of the time of the meeting, no reply had been received to these requests.

Findings

9. In light of the information received from the Government of Ethiopia, ETA and EI, the Joint Committee considers that improvements have been made in the status of teachers in respect of the Recommendation's provisions regarding educational objectives and policy, preparation for entry into the profession and further education, career development, conditions for effective teaching and learning, and teachers' salaries. In the first place, the Joint Committee welcomes the adoption in 1994 of a global policy statement on education as the basis for improvements in the establishment of educational objectives, teacher training, career development and salaries to restore the status of teachers to a higher level. The adoption of a national policy on education with reportedly widespread participation of many citizens augurs well for acceptance and implementation of other concrete measures concerning education.

10. At the same time, the Joint Committee observes that certain aspects of the policy are reported to encourage greater privatization of education and to restrict access by virtue of limitations on indigenous languages. It should be recalled that the Recommendation expressly provides for the liberty of parents or guardians to establish alternative, essentially private schools. At the same time, it points to the primary responsibility of the

State with regard to the provision of universal, free public education, available to all children without discrimination on the basis of political or religious opinion or ethnic origin. Beyond recalling these principles of the Recommendation and urging respect for them, the Joint Committee considers that the available information does not permit it to comment further on the extent to which the Government's present policy adheres to these provisions.

11. The Joint Committee is encouraged by the emphasis on standards and professional development of teachers identified as one of the priority areas for action within the 1994 policy. The autonomy and status accorded to teacher training institutions, inclusion of a code of ethics and the requirement of certification before employment were important elements in the creation of a sense of professionalism among prospective teachers.

12. It also notes the economic restraints cited by the Government which have inhibited further development opportunities for all serving teachers. It nevertheless considers that, particularly at a time of large-scale reconstruction of the education system and the teaching profession, all efforts must be made to offer every teacher the possibility for continual professional development, especially those working in rural, isolated, or disadvantaged areas.

13. Among the most promising developments are the new career and salary structures instituted in November 1994. A diversified career structure with opportunities for advancement which seeks to preserve qualified and competent teachers in the profession, has been combined with a salary structure based on transparent and objectively defined levels which respect teacher competency acquired through professional development. All teachers - serving and prospective - have seemingly been placed in a more advantageous position with regard to the old salary structure which was marked by anomalies in regard to the discretionary powers of authorities at certain levels to determine advancement. Unequal treatment in relation to other public employees has been eliminated, and the salary structure on the surface compares favorably with public servants with similar qualifications, providing renewed incentives for individuals to join the teaching profession. Improvements have been made in the administration of salary payments, accommodation, transportation, and hardship allowances.

14. Yet, the information provided by ETA, and not contested by the Government at the time of the Meeting, suggests that the salaries have hardly increased in real terms, if at all, because of currency devaluations and subsequent changes in living costs. If confirmed, such a situation would hardly represent a positive change and would have the potential for seriously undermining other reforms. The Joint Committee points out that the Recommendation calls for salaries to be set at levels which properly reflect the importance of the teaching function, do not discriminate among different categories of teachers, and are periodically adjusted taking account of such factors as rises in the cost of living, increased productivity leading to improved standards of living (where appropriate), or general upward movements in wage or salary levels. This last point requires more detailed information on real salary levels and adjustments over the last four years in order to come to meaningful conclusions.

15. Among the most serious problems which remain are those arising from allegations of politically and ethnically-based transfers or dismissals, imprisonment or detention, and even deaths and disappearances of teachers. The Government's report has remained silent on these aspects, other than to state that teachers enjoy job security provided that they perform their duties and responsibilities. The Joint Committee expresses its serious concern over such reports, which, if confirmed, are a direct negation of the Recommendation's guiding principles and its provisions with regard to security of tenure. Unless and until such practices are stopped, and transparent, equitable procedures affecting

personnel decisions instituted, the education system in the affected regions cannot hope to achieve stability and quality, all the more so that allegations are raised of unqualified teachers replacing those who are the victims of these practices.

16. The Joint Committee welcomes the Government's statements that teachers enjoy rights to freedom of expression as do other citizens, including the right to join and participate in the ETA. It notes, however, that the exercise of these rights is subject to potential disciplinary actions with regard to vaguely defined "sectarian political activities" in order to avoid political instability. Such provisions lend themselves to abuse and may be at the root of the arbitrary disciplinary actions mentioned above. Moreover, the Government has qualified its positive reference to inclusion of teachers in a network to decide on educational policy by limiting the teachers to a vaguely defined suitable number. Nowhere has the Government explicitly referred to direct consultations or negotiations with the ETA over policy or its implementation.

17. The Joint Committee refers to Case No. 1888 of the Committee on Freedom of Association of the ILO Governing Body with regard to fundamental rights of freedom of association and the right to organize which are also mentioned in the Recommendation. These are the foundation for the extensive provisions in the Recommendation concerning the participation of teachers and their organizations in consultations and negotiations on a wide range of educational activities. The Joint Committee considers the current climate of non-cooperation in consultations over educational policy, to be fundamentally unsuitable for the development of partnerships necessary for the development of education in Ethiopia. It strongly urges the Government to take steps to restore a healthy partnership which recognizes the important role that teachers and their democratically-elected representatives can play in improving education through consultations and negotiation.

Recommendations

18. The Joint Committee recommends that the Governing Body of the ILO and the Executive Board of UNESCO:

- take note of the situation as described above;
- communicate the above findings to Education International, the Ethiopian Teachers' Association and the Government of Ethiopia, requesting it to take steps to address the remaining problems highlighted by the Joint Committee above, where appropriate drawing on the advice and assistance of the ILO and UNESCO;
- request the Government, EI and ETA to keep the Joint Committee informed of developments with regard to these remaining problems, and that such information be examined in accordance with approved procedures.

Notes

(4) The Report was also examined by the Committee on the Application of Standards of the International Labour Conference at its 82nd Session (June 1995) and by the 28th Session of the General Conference of UNESCO (November 1995).

Annex 3 - Agenda of the Seventh Ordinary Session of the Joint Committee

1. Election of the Officers.
2. Review of reports and other sources of information in accordance with the mandate of the Joint Committee to report on the application of the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation.
3. Review of the ILO and UNESCO joint or separate activities to promote the application of the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation in view of the recommendations set out in the report of the Fourth Special Session of the CEART.
4. Review of progress made in relation to the initiatives regarding improved teacher indicators.

5. Consideration of allegations received from teachers' organizations since the Fourth Special Session.
6. Report of the outcomes of allegations considered at the Fourth Special Session.
7. Proposed recommendation on higher education teaching personnel - further developments and necessary follow-up action.
8. Agenda for the Fifth Special Session.