Diversification of women’s employment through training: Pakistan

by Khawar Mumtaz and Farida Shaheed

LIMITED DISTRIBUTION

Discussion papers are preliminary material to stimulate discussion and critical comment. The views expressed by editorial staff and contributors do not necessarily reflect those of the ILO.

Training Policies Branch
INTERNATIONAL LABOUR OFFICE GENEVA
PREFACE

Women are entering the workforce in unprecedented numbers. Despite this increase however, they are still visible in only a handful of occupations. The vast majority are working in low-paying jobs requiring limited skills and offering very little or no opportunity for mobility or career development.

The Training Department of the International Labour Organisation is particularly concerned about this situation, and has consequently focused its attention on measures to expand and diversify women's training, in particular for so-called "non-traditional" occupations, having higher levels of skill, responsibility and pay.

There is specific urgent cause for concern. In situations of adjustment and restructuring, women are in those occupations and sectors which are particularly vulnerable to budget cuts and subsequent retrenchment while the economic contribution of women is vital to household security.

Governments, training institutions, employers' and workers' organisations should take the lead in promoting the entry of women not only into technical fields but at higher professional and managerial levels. Jobs in technical fields represent an important avenue for women: a chance to develop skills for which there is a real and growing demand, and a means of increasing their earning power.

Making these opportunities a reality however, requires the concerted efforts of a range of institutions and organisations. In this regard, the project "Diversification of Women's Training and Employment", conducted in Bangladesh, India, Pakistan, and Sri Lanka is a particularly significant initiative. With ILO assistance and financial support from the Royal Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Norway, a task force comprising key officials from Government, employers' and workers' organisations and NGOs have worked closely in each of the participating countries to identify the obstacles to women's entry into non-traditional occupations, the measures required to redress the situation and the ways in which their specific actions can be mutually supportive in achieving this end.

The present report investigates women's access to training and assistance in occupational areas considered "non-traditional". A general overview of the problem and the participation of women in vocational and technical training is provided, followed by examples which have proven effective in promoting the entry of women in new occupational fields. It is hoped that the conclusions and recommendations will provide guidance to training planners and policy makers so that the training women receive functions to improve their employment opportunities.
CONTENTS

PREFACE

I. Country profile
   A. Demographic overview
   B. Participation of women in vocational, technical and managerial training
      1. Public sector institutions
      2. Programmes in the private sector
   C. Policies on training
   D. New opportunities for training
   E. Support measures
   F. Conclusions

II. Case studies
   A. Introduction
   B. Methodology
   C. Technical Training Centre for Women, Karachi
      1. The programme
      2. Programme content
      3. Support measures
      4. Programme appraisal
   D. National College of Computer Sciences
      1. The programme
      2. Course content
      3. Support measures
      4. Programme appraisal
   E. The Training Academy of the Pakistan Voluntary Health and Nutrition Association (PVHNA)
      1. The programme
      2. Programme objectives
      3. Programme Delivery
I. Country profile

A. Demographic overview

Pakistan’s population is estimated at 102.5 million (1987-88) with women comprising only 47.3 percent. Contrary to world trends the male/female ratio in Pakistan is 111 to 100 with women’s life expectancy being 53 years, two years less than that of men (1981 Census). Of the female population 43 percent is of childbearing age (15-49) and on an average, a woman undergoes seven to eight live births during her lifetime.

The vast majority of Pakistan’s women live in the rural areas and the highest number of women are officially recorded as employed in the agricultural sector. According to the Agricultural Census in 1980, 42.5 percent of all labour on owner-cultivator holdings, 25 percent of all full-time workers and 76 percent of all part-time workers are women, but their work is subsumed as part of unpaid family labour.

At 16 percent, Pakistan’s female literacy is perhaps the lowest in the world (overall literacy is 30 percent for the total population). Rural-urban imbalances are sharp: 9.6 percent of rural women are literate compared with 32.9 percent of urban women (Seventh Plan: p.37). Twice as many boys as girls enroll in primary school and the dropout rate for girls is higher than that of boys - 58 percent and 41 percent respectively.

Educational institutions for women are limited. For every category, there are three to four times more male institutions. This restricts women’s opportunities for education. In rural areas for instance only one out of 14 girls enrolled in primary schools has the chance of attending middle school.

The female labour force participation rate in the 1981 Census was recorded as only 3.2 percent. The Seventh Plan places it at 4.8 percent. The rate is widely acknowledged as underrepresenting women’s participation and reflects the social/cultural biases that militate against recognition of women’s work. Amongst the literate labour force, women are better educated than their male counterparts (46 percent of the literate female labour has graduated from grade ten as compared with 28 percent males; and 24 percent of women workers have a college degree compared with eight percent of males). However, women are largely employed in low skill, low paid jobs, with the majority in the category of temporary and casual workers. In major occupational categories, almost 200,000 women are listed as production, transport and equipment workers, representing 42 percent of the non-agricultural female work force.

In 1975-76 the Census of Manufacturing Industries (CMI) 43 percent of the 506,601 women employed in large-scale manufacturing establishments were concentrated in six industrial sectors: textiles, pharmaceuticals, manufacturing of electrical machinery, garments, soaps and detergents and the canning and preserving of seafood. On the other hand a current study on the female industrial centres of Karachi, Lahore, Faisalabad and Multan covering all sizes and categories of establishments found that only three percent work in soaps and detergents (under cosmetics) and only four percent in fisheries. In
contrast, 41 percent are employed in garments, 24 percent in pharmaceuticals and 13 percent in brick kilns. Only eight percent of those surveyed work in electronics and six percent in food and beverages (minus fisheries). The remainder are working in rubber, plastics and carpets.

In the professional and technical fields women’s participation has increased over the years (15 percent in 1981 from nine percent in 1971). Approximately 25 percent of all doctors and 30 percent of all teachers are women. Almost all nurses and all dais (traditional birth attendants) are women. In the clerical sector there has been an increase in the number of women from 4,106 to 20,870 and in the sales sector from 10,000 to 36,000. It should be emphasised however that despite numerical increases, women rarely reach decision-making positions in any of these sectors and have fewer opportunities for training than men.

B. Participation of women in vocational, technical and managerial training

In the absence of consolidated and disaggregated data on vocational, technical and managerial training in the country it is extremely difficult to arrive at a comprehensive picture of existing institutions, their efficiency and enrollment. At best an overview of the range of training programmes and approximate enrollments can be made. Various programmes operate in both the public and private sectors with a substantial number being run by Non-governmental Organisations (NGOs) with or without the support of provincial governmental social welfare departments and the Ministry of Women’s Affairs. The latter has been responsible for major initiatives regarding innovative programmes for women including all the non-traditional components added to existing government schemes. Courses range from formal, certificate and diploma courses to informal, short-term, and in situ ones. These operate both in the urban and rural areas.

1. Public sector institutions

At the broadest level the participation of women in the labour force and training is overseen by the Ministry of Women’s Affairs. The Ministry was created in 1989, and was preceded by the Women’s Division which had been formed in 1979 to ensure the needs and interests of women were properly represented in the policies, plans and programmes of various government agencies. It has carried out this mandate by formulating policies and plans and initiating projects. At federal level, the Division functioned mainly as a policy-making and planning department like the Planning Commission. At the provincial level it had only a cell under the Planning and Development Department which allocated finances and monitored the work of executing departments known as line departments. With the exception of some schemes in the federal area therefore, it depends on these other departments to execute its plans and policies.

Currently 12 departments have training programmes for women:

1. Social Welfare Department
2. Small Scale Industries Corporations and Boards
3. Labour
4. Health
5. Directorates of Technical Education
6. Local Government and Rural Development
7. Establishment Division
8. Ministry of Women’s Affairs
9. Livestock and Poultry
10. Agriculture
11. Forestry, and
12. The Telephone and Telegraph Department.

Each of these falls under a different Ministry and so far there has been little inter-departmental co-ordination. The LGRD, Livestock and Poultry, Agriculture, Forestry and Telephone and Telegraph Departments have informal programmes in which trainees receive neither diplomas nor certificates (See Annex).

Major responsibility for formal vocational/technical training rests with the Provincial Education, Labour and Social Welfare Departments. Whereas the Labour Department (Directorate of Manpower and Training) runs most male vocational institutes, with the exception of the Technical Training Centre, female institutions are operated by provincial education departments (boards of technical education) and the Department of Social Welfare. Nine other departments run their own programmes. Reflecting cultural norms of gender segregation, public sector training programmes for men and women are gender specific. Exceptionally, the nine colleges of technology are co-educational as is the Health Department’s medical technicians course. Other departments train both men and women but even where facilities are the same, trainees are segregated by sex.

For women, training programmes fall into the broad categories of: vocational, technical, livestock, poultry, agriculture, commercial, managerial and paramedical/medical technicians. The more traditional area of skill training includes needlecraft, sewing, knitting.

The more significant programmes are briefly outlined here (for details see Annex). Under the Department of Education there are 38 polytechnics in the country, 29 for boys and nine for women. The women’s institutes are distributed in Punjab (6), Sindh (2), and NWFP (1) and women constitute a little more than one-fifth of the total 9,000 enrollment capacity of all polytechnics (2,000 in 1987/88). The female polytechnics offer diploma courses in four trades - architectural/technical drafting, radio/TV electronics and repairs, designing/dressmaking (DDM) and commerce. Commerce and drafting are the most popular, and radio/TV electronics the least. In comparison, the male polytechnics offer courses in 15 different trades.

The Labour Department runs three Technical Training Centres (TTCs) for women in Karachi, Quetta and Lahore. The TTCs have a total enrolment capacity of 176 and offer ten different training courses (details in Annex). In contrast, in Punjab alone, there are 13 male TTCs with a day-shift capacity of 3,434 and night-shifts accommodating a further 1,500-2,000. Sindh has six male TTCs offering 25 different trades to 1,671 students, 522 in evening shifts. In NWFP three TTCs run by the Labour Department provide 710 men training in six trades. The latest figures are not available for Baluchistan but two TTCs were started in 1983-85, each with an 80-seat capacity. Taken together there are 24 male TTCs offering approximately 30 trades to almost 8,000 men.

In addition, the Labour Department conducts training exclusively for men under the Apprenticeship Training Centres and Apprenticeship Schemes. In Sindh there are three ATCs catering to 1,116 trainees, in Punjab three ATCs train 620 men annually. In addition formal three-year apprenticeship certificate schemes are available for men placed in manufacturing units under the Apprenticeship Ordinance 1962. In 1985 there were...
204 establishments in Sindh with 2,000 trainees learning 101 trades. In Punjab 2,082 men were being trained in 40 of the 60 authorised trades in 222 establishments. In Frontier 426 men had been apprenticed in 64 establishments. The Labour Department also runs Overseas Workers Foundation training schemes, and the programmes of the National Training Institutes of the Federal Government. In 1988 there were 169 Government Vocational Institutes (GVis) for men. Altogether it is estimated that in 1989 the Labour Department trained more than 20,000 men under various schemes in more than 125 trades compared to only 176 women in ten trades. Less than one percent of those trained by the Labour Department are women.

For women, vocational training has largely been restricted to the schemes of the Social Welfare Department. Formal schemes leading to certificates or diplomas are available in 107 Government Vocational Institutes (GVIs) throughout the country to 11,000 women. Thousands more women receive non-certifiable training in approximately 1,230 institutions.

Some training programmes cater exclusively to the disabled and women. Punjab has 21 District Industrial Homes, 1,140 local Industrial Homes, 462 Women's Centres and 78 Pilot Women Centres. Sindh has 15 District Socio-economic Centres and 187 Villages Centres, Baluchistan has 25 Community Centres and 19 Rehabilitation Centres and NWFP nine Community-sponsored Centres. All provide traditional skills combined in some places with adult education. Recently new skills have been introduced such as typing, shorthand, book-keeping and various crafts (see Annex). With the exception of the GVIs, no Social Welfare Department Scheme provides a certificate.

The Agency for Barani Areas Development (ABAD) operates 37 TTCs in the 14 rain-fed areas of rural Punjab. Of these 18 cater to men and provide training in 16 different trades. The 19 TTCs for women are spread in 11 districts and offer courses in poultry, repair and maintenance of domestic appliances, light woodwork, interior decoration and metalwork. Altogether female TTCs can train approximately 800 women per session while the male enrollment capacity exceeds 3,600.

The Ministry of Industries runs training centres through the provincial Small Industries Corporations and Boards (SIC). In Punjab, Sindh and NWFP the SICs run 112 centres for men and 51 for women. Data on male centres were not available for Baluchistan SIC which runs two women's carpet weaving centres. The vast majority of SIC schemes in Punjab and Sindh are also carpet or rug weaving centres. In Frontier, six out of eight centres teach embroidery and knitting. In three provinces SIC training for men provides skills in 7-12 trades. For women, other than carpet and rug weaving, three centres in Lahore, Rawalpindi and Karachi have Ready-made Garment Centres, and a Hosiery Knitting Centre in Faisalabad. Normally the seating capacity of a SIC Centre is 20. The Garment Centres for women seat 25, and some male trade centres cater for up to 40 trainees per session.

The Telephone and Telegraph Departments have six pre-employment Telecom Training Centres in the country with about 117 trainees in Punjab (1986). Women train as operators in these.

The Agriculture/Livestock Department conducts training programmes for female field assistants and livestock assistants. In Sindh 23 women enrolled in 1986. The Poultry Research Institute (PRI) in Karachi trains men and women in management, housing, feeding and prevention of diseases in poultry. Women do not enroll regularly in PRI and to date, very few have undergone training. Other training
institutes are in Rawalpindi and Quetta and the Livestock Department's poultry farms in Sindh (34) where poultry training is given at the informal level. After successfully finishing the courses the trainees provide advisory and extension services to women in the rural areas. Female field assistants trained 13,000 women in rural Punjab in 1980. The rural extension programmes in Punjab numbered 63 in 1983 and gave informal training to village women, and the village poultry programme in Baluchistan trained 1,562 women in 1985.

In the health sector there are 44 nursing schools in Pakistan. In Punjab, six public health schools/centres with a combined training capacity of 250 provided training for medical technicians. The Department of Local Government and Rural Development (LGRD) runs 482 industrial-cum-adult education centres. In Sindh, LGRD runs 46 community halls dealing exclusively in traditional skills. The Co-operatives Department also has industrial homes established as co-operatives. Out of the 61,000 co-operatives operating in the country only 1,600 are for women (Seventh Plan). These are for developing saving schemes and also provide some basic traditional vocational skills.

For managerial/commercial training there are 11 commercial/secretarial institutions for women in Quetta, Peshawar and Hyderabad with 525 seats and two centres in Islamabad and Peshawar which provide management skills to women. The National Education and Training Centre (NETC), Islamabad is the national scheme of the Ministry of Women’s Affairs under which training in non-traditional areas is given to enhance the professional skills of women and to create a corps of “trainers of trainers”. Training is given in the areas of: management of day-care centres; leadership, methods and skills for setting up community projects; project formulation, management and community participation; project monitoring and evaluation; utilisation of case study methods for project monitoring and evaluation; and secretarial instruction. By 1987 NETC had trained 96 women as trainers of trainers. Besides these, a number of Women Welfare Centres, District Socio-economics Centres and Pilot Women’s Centres provide book-keeping, typing and shorthand training with other traditional skill development programmes.

2. Programmes in the private sector

a. Non-governmental organisations (NGOs)

With the objective of facilitating income generation for women, NGOs across the country provide traditional skills development programmes, but information about their outreach and enrollment is not readily available. A few of the well-established NGOs and some newly formed ones have moved to less conventional areas of training. Secretarial, shorthand-typing courses are run by the Family Welfare Co-operative Society, Lahore, Behbud Association, and YWCA, among others. Training in community development work is being conducted by the Pakistan Voluntary Health and Nutrition Association (PVHNA) in Karachi and the Family Welfare Co-operative Society in Lahore with the support of the Ministry of Women’s Affairs. These courses are five and six months long respectively with emphasis on practical training.

Almost a decade ago, the Family Planning Association of Pakistan (FPAP) had embarked on a training of trainers scheme for community development workers focusing on poverty and disease eradication. However, most of the FPAP training is geared to its own projects and employees. The Craft Council of Pakistan has been running woodwork and wood carving courses for women in Chiniot. Three groups of trainees have successfully completed the courses and are gainfully
employed. From time to time the Business and Professional Women's Club and Business, Professional and Agriculture Women's Club conduct courses in management training for women.

b. Commercial centres

There is an unspecified number of commercial training institutes offering skills such as electronics, computer related skills, and airline ticketing and tariff/cargo handling. In principle these establishments should be registered with the Technical Board of Education. In practice many are not, hence little information is available regarding the variety and level of training, the enrollment capacity, or the proportion of women who attend. Available information indicates that commercial institutes tend not to be gender-segregated. An earlier case study (Shaheed: 1987) reported that in one ticketing institute approximately 25 percent of the trainees were women. In computer-training, some institutions have no women registered, while women may account for up to 15 percent or more in other courses.

c. In-plant training

In the industrial sector, the vast majority of women are employed as unskilled workers. Even in pharmaceuticals and food, women are mostly employed in various packing sections and learn on-the-job without any formal training. In the garment industry, women employed in production are usually hired on the basis of their prior ability to sew on machines. Further training is rare; they learn on the production lines. A few establishments give 2-3 days of training prior to production.

Exceptionally, in-plant training is provided to women employed in the electronics industry. Each establishment carries out its own training according to its specific needs. A case-study of one establishment in Lahore, Micro Electronics Industry (Shaheed: 1987) reported that in-plant training is an on-going process, with different courses designed for the two major categories of workers: assembly workers, and technicians. At the first level, workers are given a three-month course when hired; however, management feels that effective training at this level depends on assembling experience. Technicians who are required to have a science education background undergo a six-month course. Three months of training allows assembly workers to be upgraded to technicians (even without science education). Ninety percent of those employed in these two categories are women. At any given time MEI's two establishments, in Lahore and Karachi, have 200-250 women under training. Training is also provided when workers are moved from one department to another. Senior staff is also required to attend refresher courses.

C. Policies on training

Policies regarding women's training reflect the shift in development planning towards integrating women into national development processes. These were concretised formally in the Sixth Five-Year Plan (1983-88). Earlier the establishment of the Women's Division was the first step taken to address the issue of women's integration into the development mainstream.

One of the earliest initiatives in the direction of technical training for women was taken by the former Women's Division in 1983 when the Technical Training Centre in Karachi was established. This was conceived as an experimental pilot project funded by the former Women's Division and run by the Labour Department within the policy framework of the National Training Ordinance of 1980. The Ordinance was promulgated to streamline
and standardise vocational training programmes and ensure they meet the demands of the labour market. Formulated in the wake of large-scale migration of skilled workers to the Middle-East the policy was primarily targeted towards males. It sought to expand training opportunities and ensure a continual supply of skilled workers to meet identified requirements.

The Sixth Five-Year Plan (1983-88) provided for the first time a broad policy framework to incorporate women in the planned development process. The Plan's recommendations for women's integration included:

(a) Provision of requisite training for women to enable gainful employment in small-scale industries in rural and urban areas;

(b) Reservation of 10-15 percent seats for the recruitment of women in the government and private sectors;

(c) Encouragement of training and skill development, income generation and savings among women;

(d) Increasing training facilities for women in traditional fields of teaching, nursing and birth attendants.

The Seventh Five-Year Plan (1988-93) upholds the policy parameters of the Sixth Plan and emphasises the need to enhance women's employable skills and increase their labour force participation rate in all sectors of the economy.

It sets out three imperatives for an effective national development policy, viz:

(a) To acknowledge that women have been neglected;

(b) Special efforts are needed to integrate them and to provide equal opportunities in all fields;

(c) To create awareness among policymakers and the public that discrimination against women has social and economic costs.

The steps delineated for women's training in the Plan period include:

(a) Increasing the number and capacity of polytechnic schools and vocational training centres;

(b) Establishing incentive schemes to increase hiring of women by public and private enterprises;

(c) Instituting special credit programmes for women establishing small businesses and including special facilities for poor women without collateral;

(d) Providing more hostels for working women;

(e) Creating separate wings for women in employment exchanges (Offices where potential employers and employees are registered and placement of those seeking employment undertaken).

The Plan's commitment "to create social and cultural acceptance of the multiple roles of women as homemakers as well as economically productive and socially responsible individuals" is a recognition that attitudinal obstacles to women's participation need to be addressed and liases ultimately removed.

The role of the former Women's Division is critical in translating policies into action. It has provided financial, technical and institutional assistance through provincial line departments to help in the implementation of programmes for women. In addition, the Ministry of Women's Affairs initiates, executes and administers federal government projects through a special federal projects wing created in April 1985. According to the
Seventh Plan, there are in all 13,000 schemes across the country. Current plans include:

- Supplementing and consolidating on­
  going programmes in the Departments of
  Social Welfare, Health and Education;
- Facilitating the expansion of women’s
  polytechnics (Department of Education),
  technical training centres (Labour Depart­
  ment), skill development centres for
  women (Social Welfare Department),
  sericulture and monoculture (Forest
  Department), paramedical training
  (Health Department) and creating pilot
  centres in the Integrated Rural Develop­
  ment Programme;
- Providing more child-care centres and
  hostels for working women.

The Ministry also has a representative in the
National Training Board (the executing agen­
cy of the National Training Ordinance 1980)
to ensure that training schemes for women are
given due attention. The three TTCs for
women in Karachi, Lahore and Quetta come
under this scheme. However, it is not repres­
ented on the Provincial Technical Boards
(PTB) that co-ordinate and monitor all training
schemes (male and female) under the NTO.

Representatives of the provincial Planning
and Development Departments (P&D) (which
are responsible for the financial co-ordina­
tion of all provincial development projects)
sit on the PTBs and as each P&D has a
Women’s Cell, they are considered to repre­
sent women’s interests. But the effectiveness
of P&Ds regarding women’s projects is direct­
ly correlated to the nature and competence of
the Women’s Cells. Although these are sup­
posed to monitor and co-ordinate various
women’s projects, their temporary nature
(they were established as Ministry of
Women’s Affairs projects in the provincial
governments with interim funds), lower posi­
tion in the bureaucratic hierarchy and non-in­
stitutionalised status have so far rendered
them weak. The result is that women’s con­
cerns tend to be marginalised.

D. New opportunities for training

The non-traditional training schemes/pro­
grammes detailed above are new options
created for women in the early 1980s and
reflect the changed perspective at the policy-
making level to move away from training in
traditionally acceptable fields of sewing,
embroidery, knitting and teaching.

Of the training programmes that directly feed
into the industrial sector, the Garment Train­
ing Centres of the Small Industries Corpora­
tions/Boards provide women with training in
the use of industrial machines. The demand
for those trained is high; however, not all of
the graduates opt for employment. Some
prefer to work at home. The management of
garment industries employing women ex­
pressed the view that the number of trained
women seeking employment is small and
falls far short of labour requirements (only
25-30 women are trained every year in each
centre while large industrial establishments
hire up to 250-300 women). As a result, in­
dustrial units conduct in-house training for
their employees. Consequently, there is room
for expansion of training in this sector. The
TTCs run by the Labour Department take
special interest in identifying jobs and arrang­
ing interviews for their trainees with prospec­
tive employers. Women trained in civil and
architectural drafting reportedly find place­
ment more easily in both public and private
enterprises. The electronics course which
specifically provides radio and TV-related
technical skills provides employment oppor­
tunities in the radio/TV manufacturing indus­
try although there is often a time lag
between training and employment. However
the numbers trained are not commensurate
with the numbers employed in the few but
large industrial units in the electronics sector. It is also not clear whether the training given is in keeping with the requirements of the electronics industry. However, a major problem is that a number of women who train in these centres do not wish or are not permitted to work in mixed institutions. There are others who are not allowed to work at all, even in an all-female institution. Their only option is home-based work.

The polytechnics run for women by the Education Department provide post-secondary technical education. While the objective is to give training that may lead to employment the institutions are not formally required to help in finding employment. Depending on the inclination of the head of the institute informal efforts to place graduates may be taken. In Lahore, the majority of women trained in the Polytechnic (Shaheed, 1987) came to learn technical skills but not necessarily with employment in mind at the end of the training period. Others who entered employment stated they would discontinue it after marriage. In Karachi, the principal of the polytechnic expressed annoyance when questioned about the employment opportunities of successful trainees. In her opinion technical training should not only guide women into professions but should serve as a safety-net to meet unforeseen economic crises. Moreover, in her view the skills can be utilised for setting up home-based enterprises where women need not move outside their homes or work in mixed (male-female) work environments.

Training programmes of the Social Welfare, Rural Development and Local Government and Agriculture Departments, for food preservation, kitchen gardening, poultry farming, metalwork, etc. are informal, short-term and in situ, and aim at upgrading existing skills and improving the quality of life of the participants. They are not focused on employment.

In the sericulture schemes of the Forest Department in Sindh (Miani Forestry Reserve) and Punjab (Mitta Tiwana) set up in 1981 and 1983-84 respectively, women are trained in the cultivation and care of silk worms. More recently training for reeling of silk yarn and weaving of cloth has been started. Women are provided with eggs to rear worms and cocoons. In 1987 about 40 families were benefitting from the training of women in Punjab and 100 in Sindh.

A new professional approach to community development work and the newest addition to women's technical/vocational training is training as female community development workers (FCDW). Trained FCDWs are placed with NGOs and government departments on request and the Seventh Plan envisages training 6,000 FCDWs - one for each of the 4,200 union councils and one for every unit of 25,000 population in 400 urban localities. These women will be trained in community organisation and development, public health, home economics, human ecology, adult education, industrial arts and agriculture.
Finally, forestry is a new area opening up to women. The Pakistan Forestry Institute has conducted two programmes for women in forestry extension and plans are underway to run regular courses for women in the future.

The expansion in training facilities is envisaged by the Government in areas where initiatives have already been taken indicating that the Government regards these programmes as successful. Under the Education Department 40 new vocational training institutes are being planned in the Seventh Plan period and the number of polytechnics are to be increased from nine to 13. Three TTCs will be established by the Department of Labour raising the total training capacity of the TTCs to 3,160 by the end of the Plan period. Special efforts are also proposed to integrate a large number of women into the health profession at all levels to attain 50 percent women in this field over the next 20 years.

E. Support measures

Professional institutions, colleges and universities in Pakistan have provisions for hostel accommodation, however, hostels for working women and/or day-care centres have not been the norm. Establishment of these in the public sector has been initiated on a relatively large scale by the Ministry of Women’s Affairs. Fifty-one working women’s hostels and 173 day-care centres had been set up as part of the physical planning component of its development projects by 1986. Another 11 hostels and four day-care centres were added in 1987 and the 1987-89 proposals included the establishment of 100 more hostels.

A few hostels and day-care centres are run by women’s NGOs. Some of the NGOs involved in training have accommodation facilities, e.g. the Family Welfare Co-operative Society, Lahore and the PVHNA Training Academy, Karachi and a few of the government training institutes provide facilities for women during training. The Government Polytechnic for Women and the Technical Training Centre in Lahore have hostel facilities. The TTC in Karachi has no accommodation available, neither does the Secretarial Training Centre for Women in Islamabad, nor other technical training centres in other parts of the country. Overall, hostel accommodation within training/vocational institutes is limited. Even staff training institutes of the Government (for refresher courses, skill upgrading) have very few accommodation facilities.

Vocational Guidance Cells exist in the provincial labour departments to provide information on possible professions for men and women and related training requirements.

The Vocational Guidance Cell in the Punjab has produced 50 pamphlets in Urdu giving details about professions ranging from airline ticketing, to dental assistants and school teachers. These are addressed both to men and women and are distributed to secondary school students. Their effectiveness in mobilising/generating interest however has not been assessed. The facility is not publicised and it appears few people use it. According to a senior official of the Labour Department, the woman officer in charge of reaching female students complains of inadequate funds and transportation facilities to be able to spread information.

The impact of the counselling for training and guidance/information remains minimal. An important dimension was indicated by a senior official of the Punjab Labour Department while discussing the effectiveness of vocational guidance. In his opinion the need was for more jobs rather than vocational guidance. In other words the more important issue is that of unemployment. Training women without a demand for their skills may
not lead anywhere, in his view. Women Cells have been established in employment exchanges at the provincial and district levels in line with the policy formulated by the Ministry of Women's Affairs a few years ago, and women managers have been appointed in divisional headquarters. The objective of these cells is to help women seeking employment by linking potential employees with relevant employers. However, as there is no statutory provision for the public or the private sector to channel employment needs through exchanges, these are only occasionally used and their effectiveness is limited.

F. Conclusions

It is clear from the above that women in Pakistani society are disadvantaged, living shorter lives, considered subordinate and largely seen as child-bearers. Vast numbers remain illiterate and immobile and in their highly segregated society they are marginalised and undervalued.

Policy-makers and planners have finally realised that no genuine development is possible without women's active and recognised participation. Strategies and plans have been formulated to reach women and provide opportunities to them. One important focus is on non-conventional training programmes to bring women into what are typically considered "male" technical fields. A number of schemes and programmes have been initiated during the 1980s. While those addressed to rural women aim at introducing new skills, the ones in urban areas are geared towards expanding employment options for women. The orientation and mandate of the particular department running the programme determines the extent to which women's entry into the job market is achieved. For instance, the centres run by the Department of Industries and Department of Labour actively counsel their trainees and facilitate placement, whereas those run by the Ministry of Education have a more ambivalent view of women's work and see the training as basically a skills gaining exercise since the basic mandate of the Department is to educate. The social welfare schemes do not claim to be employment oriented and the Department's scope of work does not include finding jobs for its trainees.

Innovative programmes in the NGO sector are recent initiatives and should be seen as model projects. Commercially run institutes are by and large located in urban areas and are usually established in response to needs identified by those who want training and those who may employ them.

The outreach of these programmes, however, is not very extensive. Women's share in participation generally ranges from 1 to 20 percent of the total number of trainees. Furthermore, with few exceptions, there is no apparent link between employment and training.

Notwithstanding the fact that only a small number of women benefit from the training programmes one should not underrate the significance of these, particularly in overcoming barriers between technology and women, and in demonstrating women's ability to learn as well as cope with often unfamiliar skills. This is all the more important in view of women's segregated and secluded lives where their contact with and exposure to new ideas and technology is restricted.

One of the greatest obstacles to women's training and employment opportunities is the seclusion/segregation norm. It restricts women's mobility, making it difficult for them to attend work or enter training institu-
tions that are at a distance from where they reside and prevents them from being part of mixed institutions. At the level of training this problem is generally tackled through segregated training institutions. But within industrial enterprises such provisions cannot be made mandatory. Women's entry into the work force appears to take place either when there is an economic crisis forcing women into the labour market or as a result of changing attitudes regarding women and their roles in society. Training programmes should be viewed as important initiatives towards bringing about this latter change.
II. Case studies

A. Introduction

The selection of case studies was made primarily on the basis of their being successful, non-conventional and innovative. Success was determined by the enrollment levels, the programme's popularity, in addition to the extent of absorption of women trainees into the labour market.

An attempt was made to include both rural and urban schemes; however, formal schemes (leading to certificate/diploma) in the innovative/non-conventional framework in rural areas are difficult to find. The political situation in rural Sindh ruled out the possibility of studying projects there and financial and time constraints precluded examples from NWFP and Baluchistan. Thus ABAD TTC in northern Punjab was selected, and two centres within the project were investigated.

In the urban areas four successful/innovative schemes from the public, commercial and NGO sectors were selected. This choice was partly to cover a wide spectrum of skill-training institutions and partly because the integration of women into mainstream development requires a concerted multi-pronged effort involving the participation of many partners. For example, the financial and infrastructural resources of the government make it possible to initiate large-scale and bold schemes. The grassroots experience and closer interaction of NGOs with women in their environment enable them to identify actual needs and respond accordingly. And the imperatives of market demands determine the nature of commercially operated training centres. Examples from these three areas combine to give a picture of the skills in demand.

The Technical Training Centre, Karachi, was selected for being one of the first training schemes of the government set up with the objective of opening employment opportunities for women in fields which are considered male domains, i.e. architectural and civil drafting, TV and radio electronics and repair of domestic appliances. Assessed as a successful project by the government, it has led to the establishment of more TTCs in the country and plans are underway to increase the number in the Seventh Plan period.

The Training Academy PVHNA (Karachi) for Women Development Workers represents a new concept in Pakistan's context, of trained community workers. It is also an example of successful co-ordination between the government and an NGO. In this case the Ministry of Women's Affairs is financing the employment of successfully trained women while PVHNA is using its community-based experience and network to select appropriate persons for training and later find them employment.

The National College of Computer Sciences, Lahore was selected for its courses in the high-tech field of computers. While the programme of the NCCS is not directed solely at women, the student body comprises over 15 percent women, the highest number compared to other institutions in Lahore.

The Punjab Small Industries Corporation's Garment Centre, though apparently focusing
on the traditional/conventional skill of stitching, actually provides training for industrial application of the skill. Women are trained not only to cut and design but to handle industrial machines. In addition, financing, costing and marketing skills are given to enable them to set up private enterprises, a significant option for women who are constrained by social norms and customs. The ready-made garment industry is also one of the largest employers of women.

B. Methodology

The case studies are based on empirical research carried out through interviews with trainees, instructors and heads of institutions to assess the efficacy of the schemes, the problems, the support systems, and obstacles to women’s placement in jobs. Those who had completed training and were working were also interviewed as regards their experiences in finding jobs, the shortcomings of their training, and their job expectations. Their employers were interviewed to elicit views on women’s performance and potential for job mobility.

Key officials in policy-making positions in the Directorate of Manpower and Training, Board of Technical Education, Department of Labour, ABAD, the Small Industries Corporation and the Ministry of Women’s Affairs were also interviewed to examine policymakers’ views on women’s training and the adequacy of existing policies, their implementation and monitoring.

C. Technical Training Centre for Women, Karachi

1. The programme

The Technical Training Centre for Women, Karachi was established in 1983, and is run by the Directorate of Manpower and Training of the Labour Department, Government of Sindh. Although the Labour Department has been running technical, vocational and apprenticeship training programmes since independence in 1947, the Karachi TTC is its first scheme for women, made possible through bilateral and ILO assistance. The TTC, Karachi was the pilot project reflecting a national level policy change regarding technical/vocational education for women contained in the National Training Ordinance, 1980.

Until 1983 all formal vocational and technical training programmes for women fell under the provincial Boards of Technical Education of the Education Department. It was hoped with more direct feedback from industry the Labour Department would be better placed to direct training to wage employment. The formal examination and awarding of certificates is still carried out by the Board of Technical Education, but course content is determined by the National Training Bureau, Islamabad. Given the satisfactory performance of the Karachi TTC, the NTB has expanded the scheme to other major cities in the second phase of the National Vocational Training Project (1986). Accordingly a TTC for women has been established in Lahore and in Quetta.

The Karachi TTC aims to facilitate women’s entry into vocational and technical occupations by providing necessary skills training. Although the men’s TTCs do not officially exclude women, social customs prevent women from attending predominantly male institutions. To overcome social constraints separate centres for women were established. However the skills to be taught were often determined as much if not more by social and religious customs as by an assessment of market demands.
The specific objective of the programme under review was to train women as technicians in the field of TV and radio electronics, architectural drafting and the repair of domestic appliances.

2. Programme content

The TTC has three departments offering courses of one year duration in domestic electrical appliances repair, architectural drafting, and radio/TV electronics. The last two are running to full capacity (25), and the drop-out rate is low. However in the case of domestic electrical appliances, enrollment is far below capacity and although there were no dropouts, only six women joined. Although the TTC requirement is a secondary school certificate, 11 trainees were F.A./F.Sc. (Grade 12), one was B.A. and only two trainees were matric, which suggests that on completing secondary school women try to enter mainstream education institutions and when unable to do so due to stringent entrance requirements, they explore other options (Shaheed & Mumtaz, 1987).

All TTC courses emphasise practical learning and only 20 percent of each is theoretical. Students are encouraged to learn their trade through practical exercises. Instructors' educational requirements are either diploma with two years trade experience or a certificate with six years trade experience. The original provision was for all-female staff; however, trained female instructors could not be found for all courses.

3. Support measures

To encourage women's entry in these relatively new fields tuition fees are kept to a nominal Rs.10 per month and tools, equipment and training material are provided by the TTC free of cost. All students are taken on field trips to industries related to their particular skills, giving them first-hand exposure to real working conditions and an opportunity to learn about job openings.

Counselling is informally built into the programme so course participants learn of job opportunities while training, and prospective employers are encouraged to interview the women on the TTC premises. Both measures have been useful. Students interviewed felt that the counselling was particularly important since their instructors were far more likely to have knowledge about job opportunities than they themselves.

4. Programme appraisal

All TTC participants expressed satisfaction with the content and manner of teaching and the interest and expertise of their instructors. However, the general opinion was that their chances of finding employment immediately were slim, and in the case of those enrolled in domestic appliances virtually non-existent. The main problem identified was society's non-acceptance of women in the role of repair mechanics and to a lesser degree, of women in the technical field in general. Graduates pointed to the tendency of male employers to give preference to male applicants. Students of the civil drafting course expressed greatest confidence at being able to find employment. Graduates who were professionally employed as draftpersons were satisfied with their employment and their career opportunities. However they felt the need for higher level training to advance their careers.

Participants of the electronics course expected a time lag between their graduation and employment, while those in the domestic appliances course were resigned to using acquired skills at home. They were sceptical about the plan of previous graduates to start a private repair shop since "people would laugh" if women offered these services.
The management and staff of the institute feel that Pakistan's social organisation is the biggest drawback for females who have opted for technical courses. Trained women are often not allowed to take up jobs after the completion of their course, because of the presence of males in the prospective employing organisations. As one respondent put it, the government can establish separate technical institutes for females but it cannot establish separate female enterprises/work units. Another problem is the extremely limited mobility of women. If the transportation problem is solved, their job prospects would improve. Overall, it was agreed that females perform as well as males. They face no problems in completing the programme and handle the electric and electronic equipment with ease and sensitivity. But they find difficulty in overcoming social and family constraints.

D. National College of Computer Sciences

1. The programme

The National College of Computer Sciences is a newly established private institution which offers computer courses. The institute issues certificates and diplomas to its students after they have completed the various long and short-term courses. NCCS has not sought recognition by the Board of Technical Education. NCCS feels that the Board syllabi are obsolete and impede academic or professional advancement.

The prime objective of the institution is to create awareness regarding state-of-the-art computer knowledge, and to provide proficient personnel to organisations using computers. To meet this objective the NCCS has a three-pronged approach consisting of training, software development and promotion. Given that a large number of organisations have already or intend to computerise their operations, particularly accounts, there is a growing demand for computer trained persons. The management of the institution felt that available computer courses in the existing institutions were not providing up-to-date knowledge. The programme intends to train software programmers, computer operators and systems analysts. The NCCS takes pride in the fact that it provides state-of-the-art computer knowledge, and follows a policy of no discrimination on the basis of colour, race, sex or religion.

2. Course content

Courses are run for a duration of three months to one year. At the moment, the institution has around 360 students, of which about 60 are females. The minimum requirement for admission is F.A./F.Sc., but in some cases those with a matric certificate have been admitted. At the time of the survey, female students were all graduates and one had an M.A. degree.

The institution places priority on practical experience and a separate computer is provided for every student. According to the instructors, theoretical knowledge alone is insufficient, therefore 80 percent of the course content is practical work in keeping with international standards. The management claims that the quality of NCCS graduates matches any foreign-trained computer personnel.

Initially, students are given basic theoretical knowledge about computers, followed by intensive practical experience working with computers. The institution's computer laboratory is a large, well-lit, air-conditioned hall which has over 100 computers. Each student is assigned a computer in rotation which he or she can use as long as needed. The laboratory is open for all students to practice their skills from 8.00 a.m. to 7.00
p.m. During these practice hours, students learn about software programming and computer languages. Highly qualified and experienced teaching faculty has been hired. The faculty members are either B.Sc. or M.Sc. in Computer Sciences with a thorough background of the subject. Currently, there is only one woman laboratory instructor.

Regular tests and practical exams are held every month to check the progress of the students. Those who show unsatisfactory performance are given more time and attention, so they can reach the required level of expertise.

3. Support measures

Not all those desiring training are in a financial position to afford course fees. Consequently the NCCS has provisions to reduce or eliminate fees for needy students.

With respect to female participants, the NCCS had the highest ratio of female students amongst the leading computer institutes in Lahore. The management attributes this to the fact that the general attitude of the institution is encouraging towards females. Many examples of positive discrimination were given to prove this point. In classrooms, the front-row seats are usually occupied by women. All female trainees interviewed agreed that male students behave decently and soberly, when female students were around. A part of the computer laboratory has been reserved for females.

Female students who are doing short courses are encouraged to take up employment in the field of computers. An example is the female laboratory instructor at NCCS who, having done two NCCS courses, was offered the job. She is currently enrolled in more computer courses and intends to do her Master's in Computer Sciences.

NCCS has initiated the formation of an Association of Computer Users (ACU) which facilitates job placement for its graduates by collecting information on prospective employers. Many computerised organisations contact the institution for trained personnel and the students are given constant informal counselling about job opportunities. Organisations interested in hiring women are invited to interview prospective candidates on the premises, which is a convenient and unthreatening service for those seeking employment. This facility is not available to establishments only interested in hiring males.

4. Programme appraisal

Female students attending various courses were interviewed, and all expressed a general level of satisfaction. Two however, felt that since men have greater exposure to computers and technical fields they learn faster than women. Two of the interviewees felt that their expectations had not been met but were unable to identify what more they would have expected. One said she would know better once she was employed. A number of women intended to follow several other courses to improve their job opportunities. All felt that career guidance would be helpful. Opinions relating to future job opportunities were perceived as a function of their own ability to learn, and varied widely from low to very high. None identified teaching methods or content (all rated high) as an impediment. One felt her job opportunities were slim as the market was male-dominated and saturated.

Two ex-students who had found employment on completion of training were interviewed. Both thought they had received a thorough knowledge of computers at NCCS which was being fully utilised in their current jobs. They are optimistic about their careers, but feel the
need for further training in computer languages and at higher academic levels.

The families of the interviewees are supportive and encouraging, and pleased that their daughters are learning something innovative which has practical utility and increasing significance in the workplace. The majority of women were in courses taught by men; one exception felt this was a problem. Only one woman felt that male instructors had a less favourable attitude towards female participants. Others said that male instructors gave females preferential treatment. After interviewing the directors, trainees and employees, it was clear that the women trained had little difficulty finding employment because they were promptly linked up with job opportunities upon completion of their courses.

In the director's opinion a large number of youth with only master's degrees without technical skills are facing severe problems in finding jobs because of the current high rate of unemployment. He felt that technical skills such as capability of handling computers, considerably enhances their chances of getting employment. The management feels that the two biggest problems of NCCS had been financial resources and finding adequately qualified staff, capable of motivating and inspiring students. The institution has had no external financial help.

E. The Training Academy of the Pakistan Voluntary Health and Nutrition Association (PVHNA)

1. The programme

The Pakistan Voluntary Health and Nutrition Association (PVHNA) is a well-established NGO located in Karachi that has been working in community health for many years. PVHNA carries out needs assessment surveys in rural and urban areas to select communities in which to work. Presently PVHNA has 100 urban and 300 rural projects training health workers and birth attendants, home teachers, carpet weavers, sewing experts, adult literacy teachers and livestock (poultry) specialists.

It also offers a programme designed to train female community development workers (FCDW). The training programme for FCDW was established by PVHNA in 1987 at the suggestion and with the financial support of the former Women's Division. The programme's significance is in recognising community development work as a professional discipline and an avenue of employment.

2. Programme objectives

The FCDW programme was initiated in response to the lack of trained middle-level workers in community development projects and programmes targeting women. It was felt that the performance of such projects would be greatly enhanced if there was a pool of trained female community workers available with a professional and scientific approach to community development work. The type of expertise needed was:

- Survey techniques for needs assessments;
- Knowledge in health and population welfare practices;
- Knowledge of basic micro-business creation;
- Knowledge of women's legal rights; and
- Organisational and communication skills.

The specific aim of the FCDW project is to create a cadre of middle-level workers capable of interacting with the community to help its members identify and solve a wide range of problems. The programme caters to the needs of both NGOs and government departments which require in-service train-
ing for their employers or trained personnel for future job openings.

3. Programme Delivery

The FCDW is a five-month full-time course. Each course is open to 50-55 women who have completed twelfth grade education. However of those interviewed three trainees had advanced degrees. Final selection of trainees is carried out through interviews. At the end of the course, on the recommendation of the executive board and the training director, successful candidates are given certificates by the Ministry of Women’s Affairs.

All FCDW policy is determined by the Ministry of Women’s Affairs, but the programme has a Committee of Advisors and its structure allows for feedback and formal inputs from course instructors. Instructors have only an informal involvement in policy matters, marginal influence in staff selection, and no involvement in student selection. The FCDW course uses lectures, group-work and practical field work as methods of training. For two months trainees are attached to PVHNA and other NGOs to observe the methodology employed in real-work situations. For example, they are taken through the steps of a needs assessment survey. The theoretical training is conducted by the academy staff with inputs from resource persons with expertise in subjects not available within the academy. Instructors are required to have an M.A. in relevant subjects with at least three years experience. There are four regular instructors, all women, but men occasionally come as speakers. Relations between men and women appear to be very good as are those between women.

4. Support measures

To encourage women to enter this relatively new field, a number of support measures have been introduced from the start. The course is run free of cost and students are given a monthly government stipend. Trainees are required to pay a registration fee. Since accommodation is frequently a major obstacle for women attending courses outside their home towns, the programme has a hostel for 30 out-station women. This facility is provided free of cost. The most important support measure is the employment guarantee provided to successful trainees. PVHNA is in direct contact with a large number of NGOs and relevant government departments to whom they offer training services and trained personnel. The notices sent out for each course specify that the salaries of the successful trainees will be paid by the Ministry of Women’s Affairs.

5. Programme appraisal

Among participants and graduates there was a high degree of satisfaction regarding the course. Those currently enrolled felt it met their expectations, that the methods and quality of teaching were of a high standard, and that the knowledge gained was both appropriate and interesting. Counselling on job opportunities was especially appreciated. There is a very low drop-out rate (2-3 persons out of 55), one reason being the training provided skills that were useful, not only for future employment, but for their immediate individual lives.

Course graduates working with the National Bank of Pakistan and the NGO Co-ordinating Council (NGOCC) for population welfare expressed a high degree of satisfaction with the PVHNA course. Among the bank employees, whose responsibility involved educating and informing women about the availability of credit schemes and processing their applications, there was a need for further training in management, computers and English language skills to enhance job advancement.
With respect to women's placement and employment in the technical and vocational fields certain problems were identified:

(a) Women's lack of orientation and knowledge regarding technical fields;

(b) Social pressure and attitudes that negatively affect women undertaking such jobs, particularly if the job requires physical mobility or working in close proximity to men.

However, all trainees felt that given equal opportunities in training and employment, women perform as well as men. Important promotional measures would include providing career counselling and exposing younger women to a wide range of possible employment opportunities.

F. The Agency for Barani Areas Development (ABAD)

1. The programme

The Agency for Barani Areas Development (ABAD) was set up in 1978 to co-ordinate and accelerate development programmes in the rain-fed areas of Punjab. Attached to the Planning and Development Department, Government of Punjab, one of its activities has been to establish and run training programmes for rural men and women. Its women's programme started in 1981. Currently ABAD is running a total number of 37 Vocational and Technical Training Centres (VTCs and TTCs) in 14 districts of Punjab, of which 19 are for women.

There is no difference between TTCs and VTCs except the source of financial support. TTCs are financed by the Ministry of Women's Affairs and were established on a trial basis. Under the Director of ABAD, an assistant director is responsible for the women's TTCs. Each TTC is run by a workshop manager whose responsibilities include supervising the courses, reporting to the ABAD research wing, developing materials for courses, and accounting for products made and sold through the TTC itself.

2. Objectives

The TTC programme was established as part of ABAD's general aim of improving the quality of life in Punjab's barani (rain-fed) areas. The programme is intended to provide the semi-literate rural population with access to technical skills and simultaneously with a means of earning or supplementing their livelihoods. For women, the TTCs were also intended to develop self-reliance and to function as an entry point for further social development activities such as adult education, nutrition, first-aid, sanitation, etc. Finally, since traditionally a large number of men from the barani districts have joined the army, and migrated to the Middle East for work, it was felt that women could be trained to meet local needs for technical skills.

The range of skills available to men however is far wider and more immediately identified as income-generating than those for women. For example, men are trained in welding, mechanical repairs, soldering, electrical wiring, plumbing, but for women the choice has been narrowed to:

- Repair, maintenance and use of sewing, stitching and knitting machines and tools (12 months);
- Repair, maintenance and use of electrical, mechanical, oil and gas operated domestic appliances (6 months);
- Design and fabrication of home maintenance materials and miscellaneous rural based utility items (6 months);
- Poultry and livestock raising, paraveterinary training (6 months);
- Polishing, soldering and repair of domestic utensils and other miscellaneous items (6 months).

Centres work at full capacity (796) throughout the year. There have been no drop-outs since the start. Trainees spend five hours daily learning their respective trades and in the remaining time do practical work or learn something else from other trainers.

3. Support measures

Training is provided free of cost, although trainees have to bring materials needed for practicals. Each participant also receives a monthly stipend. An additional incentive is given to those enrolling in the repair and maintenance course, in the form of training in household skills, such as preparing and preserving pickles, jams, chutneys and stringing of chairs and "charpoys" (traditional beds). This measure was introduced to attract more women to the course.

Bus cards are issued entitling trainees to travel at a nominal rate in government buses. However private transporters do not accept these and the support measure has not been very successful. While there is no career counselling, informal career guidance is provided by the teachers and workshop managers. All trainees enjoyed the active support of their families who felt that irrespective of whether course graduates found employment their acquired skills are of practical use to the households.

4. Programme appraisal

Women are enthusiastic despite the fact that they may not find employment after completing the course. There are hardly any jobs available near their homes and self-employment is usually the only option available. One reason for the unavailability of jobs is that socially women are not accepted as electricians, repair persons, etc. Secondly there are fewer electrical, oil, or gas appliances in the villages.

Thus, compared to the cities, the scope for using acquired skills in the rural areas is limited. For poultry farming, the situation is slightly different. Most of the girls who complete this programme work either with their own poultry breeding business or with their families, or provide advisory services to their fellow villagers, usually free of charge.

All TTC instructors for women are women who entered this field because of personal interest. Male employees are limited to support staff. Relationships between TTC staff members are reported to be very good. However, there is no formal system for involving staff members in either policy-making or course design but instructors said they have an informal input.

There are hardly any support measures for female staff, but despite this shortcoming their performance is very good. The assistant director generally favours support measures and regrets not being able to provide them. The instructors were of the view that measures like accommodation and day-care centres especially for students could effectively accelerate the rate of female participation both in terms of quality and quantity. The most important service would be accommodation.

G. Ready-made Garment Training Centre

1. The programme

Financed by the former Women's Division, the Ready-made Garment Training Centre was established in December 1983. The Centre is administered by the Punjab Small Industries Corporation. The trainees are
taught drafting, cutting, stitching, embroidery, marketing knowledge and handling industrial machines.

The programme is successful in terms of graduates applying their skills to generate income through self-employment, or as employees in garment factories.

2. Programme content

The one year training programme has a minimum educational requirement for entrance. In exceptional cases, others are admitted. All applicants must demonstrate their aptitude in needle-work through a practical test. Prospective trainees are interviewed to determine the most eligible for the stipend scheme.

The Centre has a capacity of 25 students but usually hundreds of women apply.

The course is balanced in favour of practical training. Women are given training covering all aspects of garment manufacturing and marketing with the objective of providing the widest possible range of skills related to the trade.

3. Support measures

The most significant support measure is the monthly stipend which covers the cost of transport. In addition the Centre provides participants with student cards that enable them to travel on public transport at concessional rates. This is an important facility as most students come from distant parts of the city. All materials other than cloth are provided free of cost to the trainees.

Before completion of the course, trainees are taken on a tour of nearby garment factories to familiarise them with the factory environment and to introduce them to prospective employers. Apart from helping place women in factories, the Centre assists women in setting up their own businesses by channelling small orders to them and providing guidance and advice.

4. Programme appraisal

The participants feel content with the course. All would like to use their training in earning an income either by stitching on order at home or by working in garment factories. Currently, the major problem identified by the interviewees was the lack of cloth for practicing and working.

Overall the course appears to be in high demand and the diversified course content probably contributes to its success. The fact that the Centre is located close to the Kot Lakhpat Industrial Estate facilitates the placement of its trainees. The project officer personally assesses working conditions before placing students.

The project officer is a key person in the Centre. She keeps contact with the graduates of the Centre, those who have found employment and those who are working at home. This is an important monitoring and feedback process which has helped in the development of the Centre’s courses. The decision to make the marketing component of the course more intensive was based on the feedback from former graduates.

A number of graduates are self-employed as they are not permitted by their families to work in factories. One of them has set up her own production unit making ready-made garments for factories according to their orders and specifications. Currently she has leased out the unit for a period of six months while she is planning her own outlet to maximise profits.
At the institutional level the Centre has a major financial problem. It was conceived as a production-cum-training centre which would become self-sustaining after the Ministry of Women’s Affairs stopped funding it, but it has not succeeded. Initially orders were taken for the production of uniforms for children and peasants and from garment factories. However, the production targets could not be met as the work was done by trainees who could not maintain requisite standards of finishing.

A separate unit of production is now being proposed as a commercial enterprise which would generate profits to run the Training Centre. Successful trainees from the Centre would also be absorbed into the production unit.
III. Findings

The above schemes should be viewed against an environment which impedes women’s access to general mainstream education and training on the one hand and employment on the other. In Pakistan, wage employment is heavily male-dominated and until recently technical fields were considered suitable for men only. Policies promoting female employment are new and women’s skill diversification recent. In this context it is indeed remarkable that the schemes investigated, geared to women’s employment in trades traditionally not considered suitable for them, have been operating successfully.

Low drop-out rates along with capacity enrollment in all the schemes reflect the general popularity and demand. However, the success of any programme, institution or scheme is best assessed by participants’ evaluations. The trainees from these programmes gave favourable assessments of their programmes. Only 14 percent found the programmes too easy and 2 percent too difficult. The rest felt their expectations were met.

In comparing the five schemes, several points emerged. First, where the market demand is adequate, training programmes for women need relatively few support measures. For instance, the computer training institute is being run commercially, is co-educational and has no problem encouraging women to join. Computer skills are viewed as an entry point to office-based professional careers. On the other hand encouraging women to work in the middle tier of development projects has required a larger number of supportive measures to overcome social constraints on women’s mobility and their working in open unprotected places. Where social resistance is strong such as to women electricians even existing support measures have proved inadequate in promoting women’s entry into the formal labour market. In these cases opportunities for self-employment need to be explored.

The same parameters cannot be used to assess rural and urban skills training programmes. In general, rural areas provide few non-agricultural wage employment opportunities for men and even fewer for women. Consequently skill training must be assessed in terms of improving the quality and expertise of women in their daily functions and income substitution activities, as well as in increasing the scope for self employment.

Most of the course participants are new entrants in the labour force. None of those interviewed had previously held a job although almost all the graduates expressed the need for further training for career mobility.

In four of the five schemes a significant factor of success has been the provision of all-female institutions. In the Pakistan context non-existent or minimal contact with members of the opposite sex is reassuring for both trainees and their families. In deference to cultural norms even the co-educational NCCS has reserved a section of the computer laboratory exclusively for female participants.

The manner in which the institutions are run and the programmes conducted is a significant factor in the success of the programmes. For instance, although there was no
formal career counselling institutionalised in any of the programmes studied, with the exception of the Garment Training Centre, informal provisions for career counselling exist and 64 percent of the trainees claim they have taken advantage of them. Trainers and the heads of institutions seem to have a fairly strong involvement with the trainees and in keeping them informed about the job market. The institutional structure of these schemes also permits instructor feedback and course modification. The fact that course graduates compared favourably with male colleagues proves the effectiveness of these schemes. No fees, reduced fees and stipends are additional key factors when assessing the success of these programmes.

With respect to employment, the most important support measure carried out by these institutions was the identification of prospective employers and encouraging firms to interview course graduates on the training premises. Those who do not take up jobs immediately often wait voluntarily for what they consider "suitable" employment, i.e. government jobs or congenial work environment.

On the negative side the domestic electrical appliances repair course does not appear to lead to employment in either the urban or rural areas. Given the existing socio-cultural situation, the fact of women working in electrician shops or workshops is not possible and the likelihood of women being called to repair appliances even within the neighbourhood (except perhaps by immediate neighbours) is equally remote. While the skill replaces expenditure it does not generate job opportunities. The only other possibility for applying the skill for income generation would be to start all-women workshops catering to women's needs in the immediate neighbourhoods. But this entails capital, organisational and managerial skills not offered in the TTCs.
IV. Conclusions and recommendations

A. Conclusions

(a) At the official level, initiatives addressed to women’s training and employment have been taken within the perspective of the overall national development policy, in particular the Sixth Five Year Plan (1983-88), which makes explicit provisions for women.

(b) Non-conventional training programmes have evoked a positive response from women. However, training has not necessarily meant greater employment in the formal sector.

(c) While a large number of women who train do not seek employment, a substantial female workforce exists in the garment, electronics and pharmaceutical industries. It appears that training opportunities are utilised by one category of women and employment is sought by another. One should investigate whether those entering the job market have equal access to training as those attending existing training programmes.

(d) Measures like the creation of women’s sections in employment exchanges, counselling and guidance services and the reservation of a certain number of jobs for women in public and private sector establishments may be in demand but have not proven to be successful. Major obstacles are due to the fact that government does not have the power to enforce their implementation. Thus the private sector, the largest employer of women in manufacturing, does not feel obliged to use official employment exchanges. Similarly, the private sector retains the right to hire and fire workers according to its perception of who is suitable for a specific job. It cannot be expected that job quotas for women recommended by the government will be maintained if women’s employment is not perceived as beneficial.

(e) The private sector’s independence in hiring practices is evident from the fact that certain industries hire substantial numbers of women not in response to government policy but because of business and commercial imperatives. Women may be employed regardless of whether they have formal training. In-plant training is arranged according to need.

(f) There seems to be a lack of awareness among women about the range of options and opportunities regarding training and employment.

(g) The outreach of guidance and counselling services is limited and awareness regarding such facilities is also lacking.

B. Recommendations

Recommendations fall into two categories:

1. Training institutions

(a) Vocational guidance needs to be formally incorporated into training courses. This is most effective when training institutions can provide a direct link between prospective employers and course participants. Direct contact with employment exchanges can facilitate this.
(b) Training institutions should build in feedback mechanisms from:

- Course participants,
- Instructors, and perhaps most importantly,
- Employed graduates, so that course strengths and weaknesses can be identified and the programme adjusted accordingly.

(c) Staff development programmes for men and women are to be recommended as a measure to ensure up-to-date skills of instructors and to motivate and sustain teachers' interests in the students and the specific technical field.

(d) Any training programme that hopes to attract out-station women for its course needs to have hostel accommodation.

(e) Where the aim of the programme is to encourage women to enter a field for which the pull of the job market is not strong enough to overcome other constraints, the training has to be provided at no or minimal cost to participants.

(f) Given existing cultural patterns the formal job market in some sectors is not able to provide work environments acceptable to women and their families. In such cases an important means of generating an income is through self-employment. All existing institutions should add a small-scale business management course that allows women access to marketing, accounting and other business skills and also to information regarding existing sources of credit.

(g) Women's socialisation leaves them unprepared to work and cope with the male-dominated environment of most job opportunities. To overcome this handicap, site visits, formal counselling and industrial attachment could be included in the training.

2. Policy matters

(a) Monitoring of labour market trends and feedback to training institutions for guidance requires more effective implementation by the National Training Ordinance. The Labour Department undertakes research, but what is required is that this information in the form of projections be relayed to training institutions through the Boards of Technical Education.

(b) From the perspective of women's training and employment the absence of an official women's representation on the Provincial Technical Boards is a serious administrative shortcoming. To implement and monitor schemes formulated at the federal level, the Ministry of Women's Affairs should have an official position in the PTBs.

(c) An immediate step for facilitating women's employment is to strengthen the role of the women's employment exchanges. Communicating employment needs to employment exchanges should be required for all government departments and private establishments. Exchanges would then be better equipped to respond to job requests and could also relay information on job opportunities to training institutes.

(d) To improve the efficiency of training more support should be given to women's Vocational Guidance Cells to allow them to create awareness among and to motivate more women regarding new areas of skill development. Mobile teams, audio-visual materials and the mass media could be used.

(e) In keeping with the policy for men, government vocational institutes for women should also be moved from the Education Department to the Labour Department which is more informed about the labour market and its needs.
(f) In many instances social barriers restrict women's entry into the formal sector and non-traditional occupations, therefore assistance should be provided to help women engage in self-employment.

(g) Special efforts through official media channels are necessary to create and raise public awareness about women's contribution to national development and participation in the labour force.
REFERENCES


Cabinet Secretariat: Government of Pakistan, Women's Division, Islamabad not dated.


To appraise and Review the Progress Made During the Decade of Women in Pakistan, Report on a One Day Workshop, January, 1984 (GOP), Lahore, 1986.


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source No.</th>
<th>Name of Institute</th>
<th>No. of Inst.</th>
<th>Courses</th>
<th>Enrol./Seats</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Course Duration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SOCIAL WELFARE DEPARTMENTS:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Govt. Vocational Institutes for girls (GVIs) (Across Pakistan)</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>Handicrafts, Household Skills, Shorthand and typing</td>
<td>11,000</td>
<td>1988</td>
<td>1 Year Certificate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2 Years Diploma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>District Industrial Homes (Punjab)</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Dressmaking, Embroidery, Knitting, Block Printing, Woodwork, Crochet, Flower Making</td>
<td>n.a.</td>
<td>1986</td>
<td>One week to nine months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>District Industrial Homes (Punjab)</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Teacher training courses</td>
<td>n.a.</td>
<td>1986</td>
<td>One week to nine months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>District Economic Centres (Sindh)</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>Traditional Skills + Typing, Bookkeeping + Shorthand in 9 centres</td>
<td>n.a.</td>
<td>1986</td>
<td>Informal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Pilot Women's Centres (All Pakistan)</td>
<td>1,491</td>
<td>Local crafts, Teachers Training, Agriculture Health, Cooperatives</td>
<td>n.a.</td>
<td>1986</td>
<td>Informal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Instructors Training Institute (Karachi)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Training in all skills for the GVIs and Socio-Economic Centres</td>
<td>n.a.</td>
<td>1986</td>
<td>n.a.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMALL SCALE INDUSTRIES CORPORATIONS AND BOARDS:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Readymade Garment Training Centres, Lahore, Rawalpindi, (Karachi)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Use of industrial machinery Drafting, Designing, Cutting, Sewing, Pressing, Packaging, Costing</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>1986</td>
<td>One Year Certificate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Hosiery Knitting Centre, Faisalabad</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Use of industrial machinery</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>1986</td>
<td>6 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LABOUR DEPARTMENT:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Technical Training Centres for Women (TTCs) (Karachi, Lahore, Quetta)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Civil drafting/Radio/TV mechanics Repair of Domestic Appliances/Receptionist/Typist/Telex Operator Computer Operator, Executive Secretary/Dress Designer/Office Secretary</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>1988-1989</td>
<td>6 months - 2 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HEALTH DEPARTMENTS:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>LHVs, Paramedics, Medical Technicians/Training Institutions (FATA, Muzaffargarh, Lahore, Peshawar, Sindh)</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>Preventive/Curative Medicine, Birth attendants, female paramedics</td>
<td>650</td>
<td>1983</td>
<td>6 months - 1.5 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Public Health School/Centres (Punjab)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>X-ray technicians, dispensers, operation theater assistant, Lab technicians</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>1985</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Nursing Schools (Pakistan)</td>
<td>44</td>
<td></td>
<td>840</td>
<td>1983</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>LHW Training Schools</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td>600</td>
<td>1983</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WOMEN'S DIVISION (SELF-ADMINISTERED):</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>National Education and Training Centre (Islamabad)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Management skills, Project design monitoring and evaluation</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>1987</td>
<td>1 day workshop 8 week course</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>National Training Institute (Peshawar)</td>
<td>1.a</td>
<td>Teacher Training for day care Centre staff, Industrial teachers</td>
<td>n.a.</td>
<td>1986</td>
<td>6 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1.b</td>
<td>Social Workers, Local Councilors</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Informal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DIRECTORATES OF TECHNICAL EDUCATION:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Govt. Vocational Teachers Training Institute (Hyderabad, Lahore, Peshawar)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Handicrafts, Household skills, Shorthand + Typing, Cooking, Fruit and vegetable preservation</td>
<td>200-275</td>
<td>1985</td>
<td>8 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Commercial Secretarial Inst for women (Hyderabad, Quetta, Lahore, Peshawar)</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>Shorthand/Typing, Bookkeeping, Secretarial procedures</td>
<td>325</td>
<td>1983-1986</td>
<td>Informal 6 months - 1 year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Women Welfare Centres (Sindh)</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>Commercial/Secretarial Training</td>
<td>n.a.</td>
<td>1986</td>
<td>Informal</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

31
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S.No.</th>
<th>Name of Institute</th>
<th>No. of Inst.</th>
<th>Courses</th>
<th>Enrol./ Seats</th>
<th>Info. Year</th>
<th>Course Duration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Secretarial Training Centres for Women (Islamabad, Lahore, Karachi, Peshawar)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Typing Course, Secretarial Course</td>
<td>400</td>
<td>1986</td>
<td>4-6 months + 1 year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>ABBAD TTCs (Punjab Barani Areas Rural)</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>Poultry, Repair + Maintenance of Domestic Appliances, Light Woodwork, Interior Decoration, Metal Work</td>
<td>192</td>
<td>1986</td>
<td>6 months - 1 year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Livestock Department (Punjab)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Looking after livestock, Animal husbandry + poultry, Machinery (Sindh)</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>1986</td>
<td>6 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Women's Extension Programme (Punjab)</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>Poultry farming, village basis agriculture, women poultry, Livestock management and child health care</td>
<td>1,592</td>
<td>1985</td>
<td>Informal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Village Poultry Programme (Baluchistan)</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>Poultry management, disease, feed</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1985</td>
<td>n.a.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Poultry Institution Poultry Forms (Karachi, Rawalpindi, Quetta, Sindh)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Poultry Training, Housing, feeding Management, disease prevention (Quetta)</td>
<td>100 Families (Sindh)</td>
<td>1983</td>
<td>Lady Field Assistant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Agriculture Training Institutes (In service Sargodha, Rahim Yar Khan)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Kitchen Gardening, Fruit &amp; Vegetable Preservation, Preparation of Jam, Ketchup</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>1984</td>
<td>6 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Sericulture Training Programme (Sindh, Punjab)</td>
<td>6+4</td>
<td>Sericulture rearing of coloans 1988 in Punjab added rearing and weaving (Sindh)</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>1989</td>
<td>6 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Telephone operators, Basic/advanced courses (Lahore, Multan, Faisalabad, Gujranwala, Peshawar, Sukkur)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td>117</td>
<td>1986</td>
<td>Approx. in Punjab</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**SOURCE:** Compiled from:-
1. National Vocational Training Project/ PD-1, Phase II, Volume-I.
2. Vocational Training in Pakistan - Documentation of the Pakistan National Workshop on Vocational Training.
3. Diversification of Women's Training and Employment in Pakistan.
7. Women in Pakistan.