



## **Fifth item on the agenda: Human resources training and development: Vocational guidance and vocational training**

### **Report of the Committee on Human Resources Training and Development**

1. The Committee on Human Resources Training and Development met for its first sitting on 31 May 2000. Initially, it consisted of 308 members (99 Government members, 142 Employer members, 67 Worker members). It also included 18 Government deputy members, 61 Employer deputy members and 69 Worker deputy members. In addition, four non-governmental international organizations were represented.
2. The Committee elected its Officers as follows:  
*Chairperson:* Dr. L. Mishra (Government member, India).  
*Vice-Chairpersons:* Mr. C. Renique (Employer member, Netherlands) and Mr. E. Patel (Worker member, South Africa).  
*Reporter:* Mr. J. Chetwin (Government member, New Zealand).
3. At its 9th sitting the Committee appointed a Drafting Group to draw up a draft resolution and draft conclusions based on views expressed during the plenary discussions, for consideration by the Committee. The Drafting Group was composed as follows: a Government member from Japan, Portugal, Saudi Arabia, Ethiopia, Canada and Brazil; Mr. Renique (Employer member, the Netherlands), Mr. Dumont (Employer member, France), Mr. Ampiah (Employer member, Ghana), Ms. Leeming (Employer member, New Zealand), Mr. Soto Priante (Employer member, Mexico); Mr. Patel (Worker member, South Africa), Mr. Attigbe (Worker member, Benin), Mr. Cole (Worker member, United States), Ms. Valkonen (Worker member, Finland), Ms. Middleton (Worker member, New Zealand); and *ex officio* Mr. Mishra in the Chair and Mr. Chetwin as Reporter.
4. The Committee held 15 sittings.

### **Introduction**

5. The Committee had before it Report V, entitled *Training for employment: Social inclusion, productivity, and youth employment*, prepared by the Office on the fifth item on the agenda of the Conference: Human resources training and development: Vocational guidance and vocational training.

- 
6. The representative of the Secretary-General emphasized the importance of human resources training and development to empower people. Globalization has the potential to promote growth in the economy and in employment. But at the same time, in some countries, it had had adverse effects on employment and job quality. Human resources training and development are key instruments for maximizing the benefits of globalization while minimizing its adverse effects.
  7. Human resources training and development must be an integral part of a comprehensive employment strategy. The five main components of a comprehensive employment strategy are: (1) macroeconomic stabilization; (2) stabilizing financial and capital markets; (3) providing effective social protection for displaced workers; (4) good corporate governance, which combines higher economic performance with good social and environmental practices; and (5) a regulatory environment which promotes job creation, largely through business development support services to small and medium-sized enterprises.
  8. The Chairperson then invited the deputy representative of the Secretary-General to introduce the report. The deputy representative stressed that globalization, economic restructuring and the shift to a knowledge and skills-based society have generated a paradox: skills are needed more than ever, yet these same forces may be driving policy-makers and enterprises to reduce their investment in people or focus on the short term. Individuals, enterprises and society as a whole increasingly require team working, leadership, management and technical skills. Social dialogue and partnership must be central to the governance, development and funding of human resources training and development.
  9. The world has greatly changed: planned economies have given way to the rule of the market, information technology is becoming widespread, work is organized differently, and secure wage employment is increasingly being replaced by non-standard types of work. These changes have affected the structure and functioning of labour markets and the types of skills demanded. Human resources training and development now has a dual, i.e. proactive and mitigating function. The proactive function involves helping individuals and enterprises to be more productive and competitive. The mitigating function attempts to redress social inequalities by helping people, by means of training, to improve their chances of getting a job, to become more productive on the job, and improve their living standards. In view of these fundamental changes, the Human Resources Development Convention, 1975 (No. 142), remains valid, while the Human Resources Development Recommendation, 1975 (No. 150), has been overtaken by changes in the world of work and society at large.
  10. In his opening statement, the Chairperson thanked the Committee for his appointment. He noted the increased awareness of globalization and its positive and negative effects on economies, employment and people's lives. However, insufficient attention has been devoted to the social consequences of globalization, particularly the growth of inequality and poverty affecting millions of people worldwide. He suggested a number of issues for discussion including: the paradox of globalization and other forces which increased the need for education and training, while at the same time, these same factors had resulted in a squeeze of investment in human resources training and development; the waste of human resources due to child labour; the need to boost institutions for social dialogue; the mismatch between skills supplied and demanded; the need to align formal and workplace training; the importance of overcoming discrimination and improving access to training for people with special needs; responding to the needs of the informal sector; and the role of multinational enterprises in human resources training and development.

- 
11. The Chairperson stressed that the Committee should identify the appropriate role of the ILO in each area identified for discussion and determine how responsibility for human resources training and development should be shared between the social partners and other stakeholders. Although the Committee faced a tight work schedule, the Chairperson was confident that a consensus could be reached in a spirit of trust, goodwill and understanding.

## General discussion

12. On behalf of his group, the Employer Vice-Chairperson addressed the present context, the needs of enterprises, the new paradigm for education and training, and the roles of the social partners.
13. The report of the Office provided a good starting point. However, the Employers' group do not agree with the rather pessimistic view on globalization. They do not deny that in some countries, enterprises and the economy at large have more difficulty to respond to the new challenges, but the many drives for change, such as mentioned in the report of the Office, have been responded to by enterprises, resulting in economic growth. The myth of "jobless growth" has been challenged by the recent performance of economies in regions like the United States and Europe. The Employers' group also questioned the training paradox, as mentioned in the report of the Office and referred to by the Chairperson. According to this paradox, increased mobility will induce less investment in training. The Employers' group welcomed the increasing mobility of workers, inside and between enterprises, and even across sectors. This reduces mismatches and facilitates restructuring. They absolutely do not choose the option, as suggested in the report, to invest less in training and to try to solve the lack of knowledge and skills only through recruiting strategies. Serious mismatches and shortages on the labour market make this impossible. More importantly, knowledge has become an integral part of the process, the core added value, and often even the product itself. Therefore, on the contrary, as underpinned by figures from many countries, the private sector has even increased investment in training. The Employers' group indicated that increased investment at the same time increases the interest in the quality and the return of training. They called upon governments to improve also investment in basic education and initial training, the monitoring of outcomes and quality assessment.
14. The new paradigm for education and training focuses on preparing people for change. People need to take responsibility for their employability and career choices. In this environment, generic skills such as teamwork, problem solving, communication, and work ethic are highly valued, and primary education is becoming even more important in developing such basic, transferable skills. To help prepare people well, education and training institutions must rethink the relationship between student and school; and they must re-evaluate the role of teachers and the methods of assessing performance. Vocational education schools must forge new forms of cooperation with companies to create more flexible forms of dual learning, which combine classroom and workplace environments. New pathways into work must be established to help young people in the transition from school to work.
15. Information and communications technology (ICT) is a powerful tool for implementing this new paradigm but working methods and organization of vocational education and training (VET) must change also. For instance, institutions should promote group work, problem solving, and guest teaching. The Employers' group agreed on the need to look for methods to evaluate and certify experienced-based learning. The new paradigm has implications for vocational guidance as well. Guidance, on a continuous basis, should be

---

thought of as developing career competence in individuals, to enable people to identify options that are appropriate for their talents and motivation.

- 16.** The Employers' group quoted the Cologne Charter of the G8 which calls for renewed commitment of all partners to lifelong learning: "by governments, investing to enhance education and training at all levels, by the private sector, training existing and future employees, by individuals, developing their own abilities and careers." Companies and VET institutions must also form partnerships for more effective training. Governments should focus on facilitating the process, but leaving the responsibility for planning and organization with companies and workers – a bottom-up approach.
- 17.** Lastly, the Employers' group highlighted the particular circumstances of developing countries. They suggested that the international community should assist the developing countries in improving their initial education. These can benefit from the use of new methods and concepts of education and training, including the use of ICT and workplace-based learning assessment. They reiterated the importance of smoothening the transition from school to work by means of active labour market policies, promotion of youth entrepreneurship, and providing adequate safety nets for those facing difficulties finding work.
- 18.** On behalf of his group, the Worker Vice-Chairperson stressed that education and training are important means to economic and social development, but are also ends in themselves as they contribute to an informed citizenry. Training should be viewed as a central pillar of the concept of "decent work". Training can improve the quality and organization of work and contribute to economic growth and job creation. Training is important for workers because it is a means to increase incomes, promote job security, secure greater social equity through reducing inequalities and eliminating poverty, and improve social inclusion. However, despite the clear benefits on many levels, not all public policies promote training. Structural adjustment, in particular, is inducing many governments to reduce expenditure on training.
- 19.** Training is a necessary, but not sufficient, condition for economic development – witness the high levels of unemployment among the highly educated in some countries. Unless the macroeconomic framework is appropriate, unless the range of policy tools all in combination maintain and expand aggregate demand at the same time that supply-side reforms improve productivity and efficiency, training and education will not resolve the crisis of employment. This calls for the right fiscal policies and for an effective collective-bargaining system. In addition, active labour market measures such as career development services, embracing career education and counselling, and employment counselling, are required.
- 20.** Education and training should be universal, irrespective of sex, race or social origin. There should be a strong public funding commitment to ensure access to all. Education has become universally accepted as a fundamental right, which is denied to children when they are put to work at a young age. Education and training should also cover the development of an ability, referred to in Convention No. 142, to influence the working and social environment.
- 21.** The Workers' group noted that many commentators have argued that the modern economy requires greater flexibility. Some have taken that to mean a reduction in worker protection, in the quest for competitiveness and flexibility. Training and skill enhancement however, give us a very different way to address this requirement. Skill increases create greater agility and flexibility for workers confronted with rapidly changing work processes, and fast changes in consumer tastes and needs. It provides therefore an opportunity to meet the

---

need for flexibility through increased skills, not through decreased labour standards. The Workers' group noted that many developing countries had a large and expanding "informal sector", which was not a sector in the traditional sense as much as a description of a range of largely survival activities, characterized by low earnings, low productivity, and absence of standards. The role of training was not to "prepare" people for the informal sector or to grow the informal sector, but to serve as an instrument to transform the informal sector, to lift activities out of a survival mode and integrate them into mainstream economic and social life. Trade unions should be centrally involved in these programmes.

- 22.** The Workers' group stressed that training must be targeted to the needs of many groups, including: women, rural workers, the disabled, retrenched workers, potential victims of economic restructuring, low-paid workers, workers left out of training and education in the past, migrant workers, refugees, people with special needs, and the long-term unemployed. They also supported extensive training and support for young workers. Skills programmes should include pre-employment, unemployment, and in-employment training. An effective human resources development and training system should undertake skills audits of the workforce; systematically certify prior and on-the-job learning; provide modular-based training which is accessible also to full-time workers and is portable; provide life skills as the foundation of training, covering communication, informatics and problem-solving; and develop career-path policies and continuous learning. The position of women is a good example of the need to change both training and reward systems. The shift from the production to the service sector also means a shift from higher wages to lower incomes. Yet at the same time, this demands an increase in important social skills such as communication, teamwork, problem-solving, which are all regarded as typically female skills. They are required, but not appropriately recognized or rewarded. The challenge is to create a culture in the workplace where learning is valued, supported and rewarded.
- 23.** The Workers' group argued that the challenges facing developing countries are substantial. Societies with huge and growing levels of adult illiteracy and massive debt crises are unable to design, fund or implement modern training policies, the prerequisites for development and economic growth. In the age of the knowledge society, 884 million adults are illiterate, while UNESCO estimated that in the least developed countries, 144 million adults were illiterate in 1985, a figure expected to rise by 30 per cent by 2005. The international community should undertake bold and substantial debt relief, and help mobilize resources for developing basic literacy and numeracy, and the development of communication and information infrastructure. Multinational corporations should be encouraged to agree to fair technology transfer agreements and develop high-level local skills in developing countries. These measures provide a ladder for moving up the value-chain, and with education and training, constitute measures to leapfrog societies from underdevelopment to the knowledge society.
- 24.** The Workers' group proposed that the ILO benchmark the best practice of VET spending at 4 per cent of payroll, to encourage governments and enterprises to increase current efforts. The ILO should recommend a training levy on industries and services to ensure adequate funding, and draw up guidelines for developing facilities that increase employees' access to training, e.g. childcare facilities for working mothers. The cost of human resources development and training should be viewed as a necessary investment by enterprises and society in human capital, with a high return in the form of increased productivity.
- 25.** The Workers' group proposed the concept of a national training framework and policy, embracing national, industrial and enterprise-level contributions. Partnership is essential, but governments must continue to have major responsibility for education and training. They were encouraged by the Employers' group's expression of support for the need to

---

invest in people, and emphasized that partnership implies that workers through their trade unions should be involved in decision-making. Training should be a part of the bargaining process, and of a power-sharing arrangement between all three social partners.

- 26.** Following the comments of the two Vice-Chairpersons, the Committee continued the general discussion of Report V. Many members of the Committee commended the report for clearly showing the contribution of education and training to human prosperity and the need to strengthen educational and vocational training systems in the context of globalization and changing work organization. However, one Government member felt the report did not fully represent the situation facing developing countries. Another felt that the phrase “human resource development and training” could incorrectly convey the impression that training is separate from human resource development and not fundamental to it; and suggested that the phrase “human resource development”, or “people development” should be sufficient. She also recommended adoption of the term “professional and vocational education and training” in place of “vocational education and training (VET)” and continuous education and training (CET) used in the document, to bring the terminology into line with UNESCO and thus contribute towards more effective collaboration between ILO and UNESCO.
- 27.** Several governments echoed the comments of the Workers’ and Employers’ groups in stressing the need for a clear vision of the role of human resources development and training. Training systems should empower people by enabling them to learn, to acquire knowledge, to learn how to act, and to learn for life. Human resources development and training should aim to make everyone employable – able to secure and retain decent work as employees, entrepreneurs or workers in community-based activities. In this respect, it is important to distinguish between narrowly defined skills linked to the needs of the employer and broad-based competencies generally demanded in the labour market.
- 28.** Although training programmes should be responsive to the demand for skills in the labour market and global trends in such fields as information and communication technology (ICT), helping people to develop fully as individuals should be central to any system. People work to feel productive, provide for their families and contribute to society – these constant factors should guide the discussion. One Government member stated, though, that the system in his country was totally demand driven.
- 29.** The social aspects of education and training should be given special attention. Human resources development and training have great potential to prevent or decrease social exclusion. Priority should be given to access for all, but most particularly to those in greatest need. Programmes should target the underprivileged and those with the least access to education and training. Several Government members stressed the importance of developing culturally appropriate programmes targeting women, people with disabilities, and minorities and indigenous peoples suffering discrimination. In this respect in particular, local communities and local government have a very important contribution to make. Distance learning was also mentioned as a tool for improving access and flexibility while maintaining quality.
- 30.** Quality should be stressed over quantity. Policies and programmes should be carefully designed and monitored to ensure they are meeting real needs and are available to, and appropriate for, the intended target groups.
- 31.** The need for a holistic approach was emphasized. Education and training should be viewed as part of a larger policy of economic and social development. However, global forces (trade, finance, etc.) may limit governments’ control over their economies.

- 
32. Numerous Government members described the importance of tripartite participation in formulating policies and programmes. Participation of workers and employers ensured that the training and education programmes were relevant and kept pace with changes in the labour market. Governments can facilitate the involvement of the social partners and must provide an appropriate legal and institutional environment.
  33. The importance of lifelong learning was repeatedly stressed. The ICT revolution is dramatically increasing the rate of obsolescence of particular skills, and globalization is contributing to worker displacement. Therefore workers need to update their skills throughout their careers. But lifelong learning also means paying more attention to the very early years of education, including available and affordable quality pre-schools, and keeping young people in formal education longer. Government members mentioned actions taken such as setting specific targets for various age groups and increasing the length of compulsory education, to ensure that all people had the opportunity to enhance their skills. In general, education and training at all levels should be closely integrated, to allow people to acquire skills whenever the need arose.
  34. Several Government members mentioned the need to equip workers with multiple skills, to improve employability and decrease mismatch. An “education boom” of too many highly skilled workers in some countries was also leading to mismatch, raising awareness of the need to improve the responsiveness of human resources development and training systems to market demand.
  35. Information and communications technology is the source of many new jobs in countries of all levels of development, and is changing the organization of work for many people. It is also a source of potential growing disparities within and between countries. Many Government members described how these changes have influenced their human resources development and training policies and programmes. For instance, some governments have set ambitious targets for universal access to the Internet and increased computer literacy, and have invested heavily in providing computers to schools and libraries.
  36. The need for basic skills was repeatedly underlined. These include literacy, numeracy, and broader problem-solving and teamwork skills. Broader basic skills and specialized skills programmes should complement rather than compete with each other. Training should include broader skills and needs such as human relations, communication, and workplace safety and health.
  37. Several Government members mentioned particular difficulties they face. These include the rapid transformation to a market economy and changes in the form of ownership, migration to urban areas, unemployment, underemployment, low productivity, and insufficient financial resources. Nonetheless, human capital is their most valuable asset, and they are firmly committed to finding creative ways to improve their investment in people, particularly in cooperation with other countries and international institutions such as the newly established UNEVOC centre in Bonn. The ILO has a particularly important role to play in providing assistance and as a forum for exchanging best practices. Developed countries could also contribute much in helping developing countries adapt to the changing work environment. One Government member also proposed establishing a website to facilitate sharing of experiences in greater depth.
  38. Numerous Government members drew attention to the essential role of certification of skills, including prior knowledge. Certification is important in part due to the growth of private sector training and education in some countries. And portability of skills enables workers to move to where work is available.

- 
39. One Government member mentioned that access to labour markets abroad is important for training programmes and that this should be taken into account. However, another Government member cautioned that free movement of workers was not a general remedy for the lack of skills within a particular labour market.
40. Several governments offered general guidelines for defining the appropriate roles of the social partners. It may be logical to assign employers more responsibility for providing training to their employees, while governments should assume more responsibility for training new entrants to the labour market or those changing their careers. Alternatively, employers could focus more on supplying training for the specific skills they demand while governments assume more responsibility for providing broader skills and emphasizing the social dimensions of human resource development and training. The governments' role would include providing safety nets, perhaps even providing training through the social security system, as one Government member described. In either case, greater worker mobility requires workers to take more initiatives as well. And special attention should be paid to creating the appropriate incentives for all of the participants. Employers must see the value in investing in their workers, and workers must be motivated to seek out and participate in education and training. The goal should be to create a learning society. Some Government members called on employers to participate more in funding training.
41. Several Government members shared important changes occurring in their human resources development and training systems. A dual system, combining formal training with work-based experience, plays an important role in the transition from school to work, and appears to be particularly useful in helping youth to integrate better into the workforce. More broadly, some governments aim to break down the barrier between education and training to overcome biases. The high degree of specialization of schools in some countries is becoming outdated. Funding of vocational training has been boosted in many countries, in response to growing need. And most countries were reviewing their policies, programmes and administration of VET systems in search of approaches.
42. Several Government members mentioned actions taken by the European Union in the area of human resources development and training. European Union Member States have been encouraged to facilitate increased investment in people, and targets have been set for education and training systems. Special attention has also been given to youth, the unemployed, and other target groups. The availability of more flexible work hours should be promoted. Each European Union Member State had been called upon previously at the Lisbon Summit in 2000 to set tangible targets to meet, to develop appropriate policies and to adopt employment plans. This is to be followed by a multilateral examination of progress in each member State and would lead to a more inclusive society through improved initial training for youth, the acquisition of relevant skills, the building on existing skills, enhancing competencies through continuous training and the spread of good human resources policies and practices.
43. Several Government members drew attention to the fact that the Human Resources Development Recommendation, 1975 (No. 150), was out of date. Particular problems cited included an incongruity with conditions in the real world and too much specificity, which inevitably lead to it becoming outdated. Some Committee members endorsed the idea of adopting a new Recommendation, but one Committee member thought it advisable to postpone adoption of a new instrument until the general revision of the International Labour Standards had been completed.
44. The Worker Vice-Chairperson pointed out some useful insights emanating from the governments' contributions to the general discussion. He also suggested some extensions

---

to the points made by various Government members that may be useful for the conclusion of the general discussion, including: (1) the need for socially inclusive policies; (2) benchmarking of funding for skills; (3) viewing training not simply as a cost, but as an economically and socially valuable investment in people; (4) greater involvement of the social partners in governance of training; (5) involving local communities; and (6) the impact of some specific aspects of globalization, such as speculative capital movement, on employment. Some of the above points could be extended to the involvement of the trade unions in vocational education and training, and included the need for capacity building of trade unions to enhance their role in training. Lastly, the Workers' group supported a broad definition of employability and emphasized the need to address the problem of funding.

45. The Employer Vice-Chairperson expressed satisfaction over the general stand of the Government members on continuous education and training. They drew attention to a Government member's reference to the Cologne Charter, and suggested that it be considered for inclusion as one of the elements of the conclusions. The Employers' group was satisfied with the reference of the Government members to the role of the social partners in vocational education and training. However, social partners should also be consulted on education policy. This could reflect, for example, the experiences in enterprises with new working methods and new forms of organization and arising from this new demands on working methods and organization of education. Information technology has immense potential and should be exploited for education and training. Lastly, they supported the statement made by the Government representatives of the Syrian Arab Republic and Malawi that developing countries face difficulty in providing continuous education and training and therefore need the support of the international community in this respect.

## Points for discussion

46. The Employer Vice-Chairperson, referring to the first issue for discussion, stated that the broad definition of employability contained in the report was well expressed. However, enhancing employability also required commitment of the three social partners along the lines of the Cologne Charter.
47. Education and training for employability involved a paradigm shift. Employability required a broad based initial education system, from pre-school to university, to ensure that people were equipped with basic and portable skills, and could adapt to a changing work environment. Besides traditional apprenticeship, new methods of combining work and study were required. Such combinations were already in evidence in higher education in some countries.
48. Employers wished to participate in national discussions not only on vocational education, but also in discussions on educational policy at all levels. They wished to have their views considered on issues such as setting the framework for qualifications, and planning and delivery of vocational training.
49. The Employers' group opposed the proposals made by the Workers' group for benchmarking the level of investment in vocational training. They also opposed the notion of imposition of a national levy on enterprises. The Employers' group considered that imposed national levy systems contradict the need for enterprises to develop themselves training plans and to optimise their training investments and contradict the concept of employability, which asks for specific responses and not national arrangements to the different needs of workers. They suggested that the Committee, instead, should focus on ways to motivate investments based on common interests of employers and workers. If

---

additional incentives were needed, governments could provide tax incentives, funding support for training, and support for recognition of prior learning. So far as involvement of social partners was concerned, there could be sectoral or regional agreements as part of the collective bargaining process.

- 50.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson elaborated the centrality of the concept of employability. He agreed with the Employers' group that a broad definition of employability was essential. According to the Workers' group employability embraced a range of policies such as education, active labour market measures, and macroeconomic policies directed at full employment. In addition, there were numerous components to the education element of the range of policies. These required the right to education and training. Furthermore, promotion of full employment could not be realized merely by enhancing skills; human beings needed to "learn to learn" and instructors needed to be proficient in adapting to the changing circumstances. He emphasized that basic education should include information on health and safety, trade union education, information and communication technology skills education on industrial relations.
- 51.** There should be competency standards based on agreements between employers, governments and workers so that the individual could have a benchmark, a certified standard, by which he or she could by some objective process, measure himself or herself. Moreover, since it was not easy to anticipate the skill requirements for the future, lifelong learning should be the vehicle for adapting to the changing work environment.
- 52.** The Workers' group were of the view that responsibility for promoting employability should be shared between workers, employers and governments. While individuals were responsible for their education and training, the enterprises had a continual responsibility to upgrade human skills in the same way as they updated themselves, for instance, on marketing strategies or technology. The state, on the other hand, had the prime responsibility for basic education and for promoting an effective and efficient system of vocational education and training.
- 53.** There was a high degree of consensus regarding the aims of education and training but perceptions differed on mode of funding for training. The concept of employability stripped of the funding issue was not useful since the burden would fall on those least capable of bearing the burden. In this context, the least able to finance access to appropriate training were women and special groups such as refugees, migrant workers, and people with disabilities. Each member of the society should become employable; however, such members should not be expected to finance their own inclusion in the society.
- 54.** Referring to the opposition of the Employers' group to benchmarking funding, the Workers' group clarified that they were not contemplating a binding international obligation, but were proposing a benchmark of what constituted the best practice and should serve to act as a reference point to focus efforts to increase investment in training. The enterprises did have their own specific requirements but investing in developing skills of their workers deserved priority attention and is a requirement which applies to all enterprises.
- 55.** The Workers' group was pleased to note the reference of the Employers' group to instruments currently in use in some countries, such as collective bargaining agreements, tax incentives, and training credits. They stressed that the proposals of the Workers' group relating to funding were also based on current practices in some of the countries where payroll levies was already in existence.

- 
- 56.** One Government member suggested expanding the concept of employability further to include entrepreneurship in light of the growing role of the informal sector in many countries. According to her, employability depended on knowledge, skills and attitudes possessed by individuals and how they matched with the market demands. Individuals should think in terms of what education and training could do for their employability. She emphasized that social partners should take an active role in defining, developing and maintaining the concepts of employability and entrepreneurship at a range of levels, and in integrating this concept into modern management systems.
  - 57.** A number of Government members suggested consideration of different elements in defining the concept of employability. One stated that there were two aspects to the concept: energy which gave humans the physical ability to work, and skills which gave a person the ability to be creative, innovative, and entrepreneurial. The first aspect dealt holistically with human development, including the issues of health, nutrition, environment and gender balance. The second aspect required the efforts of all social partners to provide vocational, technical and entrepreneurial training. Since the ability of a worker to become employed depended on incomes generated by enterprises, meeting the skills requirements of the enterprises was one of the priorities.
  - 58.** Another Government member pointed out that there were four distinct elements to the concept of employability: empowering young people to find jobs; enabling unemployed people to adapt to change; increasing occupational and inter-firm mobility for workers with jobs; and increasing productivity of workers in general.
  - 59.** Several Government members emphasized that training was not a cost but an investment from which individuals, enterprises, and society benefit. This approach raised the need for stakeholders to re-examine planning and delivery of education and training at the national levels. Governments should develop effective incentives for promoting investment in education and training.
  - 60.** A number of Government members stressed the need to actively engage the social partners in the entire process of education and training. For instance, enterprises could provide valuable information on the appropriateness of curricula. Similarly, local governments and stakeholders at the local levels should play an important role, especially on a sectoral basis.
  - 61.** Some Government members stressed that more attention should be paid to young people. This should include enhancing the quality of the school system and recognizing that there were different styles of learning. Youth should also be provided with the needed support when entering the workforce, including a more user-friendly labour market information system to help them make better-informed career choices. This also implied comprehensive educational and vocational guidance policies.
  - 62.** One Government member stated that special efforts are required for enhancing employability of youths from underprivileged sections of society. She explained that some young people had very limited opportunity of becoming employable since they came from isolated locations, dysfunctional families, or had no financial support. In such cases, attempts should first be made to integrate them better into society before attempting to enhance their employability.
  - 63.** The importance of lifelong learning was reinforced during the discussion. One Government member cited the example of “job rotation” as a model for facilitating lifelong learning and for creating job opportunities.

- 
64. Particular problems facing governments included collapse of some industries and, in some cases, persistently high unemployment. Many developing countries had been focusing on providing people with specific technical skills, but the focus was gradually being shifted to the acquisition of multiple skills.
  65. One Government member noted the growing interdependence among individuals, societies, and countries. He expressed concern that the prosperity arising as a result of globalization is not trickling down to poorer countries. This, according to him, represented an inherent imbalance in sharing the benefits of global prosperity.
  66. The Worker Vice-Chairperson observed that the focus should be on the portability of skills that would be more inclusive and ensure long-term sustainability of acquired skills. According to him, employability based on “disposability” should not be encouraged. The social partners should concentrate on formulating a credible policy for employability. The Workers’ group agreed that workers should be provided with multiple skills. Their concern was that the burden of financing should not increase for the individuals.
  67. The Worker Vice-Chairperson stressed that the ILO should address broader issues, such as increased inequality in global economy, that have repercussions for skill shortages and inadequacies.
  68. The Employer Vice-Chairperson highlighted the points emanating from the discussion. While guidance on initial education was important, the issue of long-term employability should also be paid due attention. Training standards should be defined broadly to ensure occupational mobility and this should be done in collaboration with social partners. To prevent school drop-out, dual pathways with involvement of enterprises could be considered. In considering instruments for financing, training should be flexible enough to accommodate school drop-outs, and such training should be recognized by employers. In considering any national levy for financing human resources training and development, the best instruments available for the purpose should be assessed. The Employers’ group emphasized that levies did not necessarily lead to increased training which was relevant to workers’ and employers’ needs.
  69. The Employer Vice-Chairperson, referring to point (2), opened the discussion by noting that the issue of access presented challenges in itself. The underlying forces of globalization and technological progress have increased the visibility of the weak points in existing basic education systems. The ILO should specify criteria for setting standards of initial education that ensure minimum quality of the initial training system. The Employers’ group also mentioned that preventing youth from dropping out was very important. Schools should be more adaptable to pupils with special needs.
  70. While the responsibility for ensuring access to basic education rested mostly with governments, enterprises could provide additional support to the initial education system, in particular by providing tools for development of skills in information and communications technology. The need to find an adequate solution to the funding gap was highlighted.
  71. The Worker Vice-Chairperson also noted the challenges surrounding access to basic education, especially for those already in work. Developing countries are struggling to overcome particularly low numeracy and literacy rates. Free and universally available public education is a fundamental right which should be carefully protected in the course of structural adjustment and market liberalization. Clear standards for initial training need to be articulated, and a time period should be set within which universal provision of initial training should be achieved.

- 
72. Governments should have a strong and continued responsibility for providing initial training. However, the social partners all had a role to play in addressing disadvantaged groups' special needs, such as language skills for migrant workers and non-discrimination in access to training. The Workers' group also felt that opportunities for using ICT could be fostered by greater partnership between schools and enterprises, and governments had a role to play in introducing ICT into the initial training system.
  73. One Government member agreed that information technology could potentially overcome the problem of limited access to education. Many governments were providing computers in schools to facilitate ICT learning and Internet access.
  74. More fundamentally, a consensus was needed on what constitutes high quality education. Setting school attainment standards and assessment procedures should be a priority in improving literacy and numeracy.
  75. Measures proposed to ensure equal access included: training for adults on a wide basis; informing enterprises and trade unions about the existing benefits and the functioning of the system for training programmes; establishing and monitoring standards; and targeting policies for the disadvantaged.
  76. Particular problems identified by governments included widespread illiteracy, language barriers in multilingual societies and the urgent need for bilateral and multilateral financial support. Particular solutions mentioned included providing skills through public works projects.
  77. One Government member stressed that although public funds should be concentrated on helping the most vulnerable groups, enterprises also had a social responsibility in this regard. Another Government member mentioned that in his country employers played an important role even at the primary education level, and that the business environment provided an important element for improving access to education and training. Other entities, such as non-governmental organizations, were also making important contributions.
  78. The Employer Vice-Chairperson said that sound basic education and initial training programmes formed the basis for lifelong learning. Government has the responsibility for programmes for the vulnerable groups. Where appropriate, social partners can be involved in the implementation.
  79. The Worker Vice-Chairperson noted that the challenge of improving basic education remained the principal obstacle facing workers in the field of human resource development. The Committee should conclude that it is necessary to increase the will of national governments and the social partners to close the gaps in access to basic education. The Workers' group drew attention to the digital divide between younger and older workers, and emphasized that older workers should have access to ICT training. Lastly, the Workers' group urged the Committee to ensure that structural adjustment programmes do not cut spending on education.
  80. The Chairperson added that the report reveals a gloomy picture of enrolment in primary education in 1997: 56 per cent in primary education in sub-Saharan Africa and South Asia; 65 per cent in Latin America; 71 per cent in East Asia; and 96 per cent or more in industrialized countries. The 1990 goal of the Jontien Conference of education for all by the year 2000 had to be pushed back to 2015 by the Copenhagen Social Summit of 1995. Over 800 million adults worldwide remained illiterate.

- 
- 81.** The Chairperson was encouraged by various Committee members' expressions of the political will to realize the universal right to basic education. The Committee should explore ways of harnessing this political will to provide the necessary funding for education.
  - 82.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson, addressing item 3 of the points for discussion, supported the various types of incentives for continued training which had been mentioned. The key to any system of training was flexibility and a bottom-up approach – employers and workers should be responsible for planning and carrying out suitable training programmes.
  - 83.** The funding problem needed to be clearly identified before meaningful solutions could be developed. The core problem was access of vulnerable groups to the labour market, including the less educated and illiterate, people with disabilities, or women who had been outside the labour market. When national arrangements were necessary, responsibility should naturally be shared among the social partners.
  - 84.** Companies and workers in employment did not really face a funding problem. Businesses had an incentive to invest in workers because profitability would be affected; and workers have an incentive to invest in themselves to enhance their career prospects. Since the motivation for investing clearly existed for this sector, the discussion on funding should focus on the vulnerable groups. Efforts should be made to help motivated workers to grab the opportunities offered by companies; but this was a problem of information rather than funding.
  - 85.** The Employers' group felt that the report underestimated the investment in training by SMEs. Formal training investment was measured well, but the kind of informal training that goes on in smaller enterprises was overlooked. In this respect, it would be useful to develop a method for assessing and validating informal ways of learning. The report also stated that the participation rates for women and ethnic minorities in training were low; but this trend was shifting, and in some cases participation rates were higher for these groups.
  - 86.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson noted the consensus regarding the need to focus on target groups, including women, rural workers, the disabled, potential and actual victims of restructuring, the low paid, untrained workers, migrants, refugees, the long-term unemployed and victims of past political policies. The conclusions of the Committee should capture this consensus.
  - 87.** The Workers' group proposed acceptance of the idea of a national qualifications framework with multiple entry and exit points, which was flexible and established through tripartite negotiations. The framework should include support measures such as the provision of childcare facilities and paid time off for training, to facilitate access to training and foster the notion of training as an extension of work itself. Although there should be training for both formal and informal sector workers, the objective of training for informal sector workers should be to provide a ladder to increase productivity to transform the informal sector. The Workers' group believed that the discussion should focus on people working in enterprises, as they comprise the bulk of the workforce.
  - 88.** The Workers' group described the "training dilemma" facing firms: the risk of poaching created a disincentive to invest. The resulting market failure led to suboptimal levels of investment, despite the broad consensus on the benefits to individuals, firms and society. Investment in training was shifted primarily to the worker even though there should be an equitable sharing of responsibility. Management practices that encouraged job insecurity produced a high turnover of staff and low worker motivation, resulting in further under-investment in education and training. Additionally, subcontracting, outsourcing, and

---

casual work were not conducive to promoting education and training because they reduced the commitment between employers and workers. The Workers' group proposed that company balance sheets reflect human resources development investments. Businesses also should proactively develop career paths for individual workers and provide opportunities from within the firm. Although at first glance it might appear easier to recruit from the outside, providing existing employees with opportunities fostered a strong and committed workforce – an important point that should form part of the conclusions of the Committee.

- 89.** Lastly, the Workers' group felt that discussion point (3) of the report overemphasized the importance of competitiveness and recalled the Declaration of Philadelphia's proclamation that "labour is not a commodity". The conclusions of the Committee should stress a more balanced approach, as competitiveness is not the same as employability.
- 90.** Some Government members stressed the importance of overall job creation – without adequate levels of employment the value of continued training declined. Continuous training must also be part of an integrated and coherent education and training system. Several Government members concurred with the Employers' group that motivation was the key for firms and workers with jobs, and one emphasized that companies and workers need tailored solutions to their needs. All agreed that close cooperation between the social partners was vital to ensuring equitable access for young people and adults.
- 91.** Some Government members spoke of the right to education and training, and described how it was guaranteed in their respective countries. Provisions mentioned to help secure this right included: free primary and secondary education for all; providing training to all unemployed workers; and providing training to workers who have lost their jobs due to structural adjustment programmes. One Government member described how in her country a statutory right to study leave existed, and financial assistance in the form of loans helped workers to realize this right.
- 92.** Many governments were undertaking reforms of their education and training systems, including recognition of non-formal learning. Changes were needed primarily because training activities were not always directed at those individuals who would most benefit. Workers often were not aware of the training opportunities available to them or were denied access because of entrance requirements such as literacy. Various governments were working on overcoming obstacles that demotivate workers. One Government member described the work going on in his country, with help from other governments and the ILO, to understand better the particular needs of the informal sector, and to provide workers in the informal sector with more flexible training venues and times, as well as concentrating on the basic skills they needed most. Another mentioned financial support for the self-employed to participate in training.
- 93.** Government members drew attention to the low investment rates in small and medium-sized enterprises. This was partly due to lack of awareness of the potential high returns, but also to the ease of replacing the predominantly low-skilled workers in these firms.
- 94.** Some Government members recounted the valuable contribution of a payroll tax in providing broader access to training, particularly for smaller enterprises. One described the major role that national, regional organizations played in disbursing these funds. However, another government explained that in his country payroll taxes had not succeeded in assisting those most disadvantaged in the labour market or lessened the extent of skills mismatch. Other governments added their opposition to payroll taxes as a solution to the problem of funding, and felt strongly that governments should facilitate, and not mandate,

---

investment. One suggested that funding responsibilities be allocated on the basis of benefits accrued.

- 95.** A Government member also observed that discounted minimum wages for youth appeared to have a positive influence in promoting their employment, as such lower minimum wages reflected lower skills and abilities.
- 96.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson welcomed the views of the Government members who stressed the importance of raising awareness and motivation among workers and employers. The Employers' group endorsed the statements of the Government members who emphasized creating incentives for investment in training.
- 97.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson noted that the experiences shared by various Government members reaffirmed the need for close coordination among the social partners in the design and implementation of training policies and programmes. The main task of governments should be to address the social aspects of continuous training, including equity, while employers and workers should concentrate on workplace learning. They agreed that the workplace was becoming more important for learning.
- 98.** Concerning the question of time off from work to participate in training, the Employers' group stressed that the working time paradigm was changing. Training should occur both during work and during leisure time, and strict rules about time off from work for training were unrealistic. As to the question of poaching workers from firms that invested in training by firms that did not, the Employers' group considered that this was a market reality, which however will not keep enterprises who want to increase their competitiveness from continuing and increasing their investment in training.
- 99.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson stressed the many areas in which general agreement among Committee members could be reached, such as the need for: a national framework for training policy and an employment growth strategy; permanent structures for training; and tripartite involvement.
- 100.** The Workers' group presented an alternative view to that presented by a Government member concerning the effectiveness of that country's training levy programme. He noted that the programme had not operated for long enough to accurately assess its long-term benefits and that the levy substituted for a billion dollar training programme. When the levy was removed, long-term unemployment increased again. As concerned lower minimum wage rates for youth, the Workers' group referred to the evidence in OECD countries that such lower rates did not appear to have a positive impact on youth employment.
- 101.** The right to training embodied in national legislation was a valuable tool that should be promoted. The Committee should emphasize that policies and programmes aimed at the informal sector should raise working conditions and living standards and formalize the sector. Finally, the Workers' group stressed that markets are a human construct and as such are open to the inclusion of moral values, especially the concept of good governance of training systems.
- 102.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson, referring to point (4) for discussion, suggested that governments should place high priority on investing in physical and educational ICT infrastructure, including the training of teachers in ICT. The introduction of ICT courses needed substantial investment and one of the ways to tackle the issue of funding was to encourage partnerships between schools and firms. This collaboration was already visible

---

in many cases. Trade liberalization could help lower the costs of introducing ICT in educational settings.

- 103.** He said that ICT could promote informal learning. Distance learning could be particularly useful for developing countries and for promoting education and training in remote areas. The Employers' group also noted that during the Summit in Lisbon in April 1999, the EU Member States committed themselves to the goal of connecting every school to the Internet.
- 104.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson mentioned that there were two dimensions: the use of ICT in the world of training; and provision of training in the use of ICT. ICT offered enormous opportunities for workers, citizens, and society, and for greater economic growth. However, an appropriate social framework was needed, otherwise inequalities would only increase from a growing digital divide – between rural and urban areas and the rich and poor nations.
- 105.** The Workers' group thought ICT could be used to promote distance learning; but distance learning could foster isolation and seclusion unless it was used in conjunction with traditional methods of learning. ICT had the potential for upgrading the skills of workers, especially of those in organizations where training facilities were limited. However, it also created job insecurity. The negative effects should be minimized by social interventions for ICT to have a positive impact. More attention should also be paid to adopting appropriate legal instruments to cover the contingencies arising out of use of ICT.
- 106.** Several Government members stated that ICT provided enormous opportunities, particularly in countries with large populations of young people who required training to be able to adapt to new situations. ICT had the potential to create winners and losers. Exploiting ICT fully required a high level of education and hence those who were less educated, particularly women, were at a greater risk of being excluded. Society should ensure that all people benefited from ICT through broad access to proper equipment, training of teachers and appropriate curricula.
- 107.** One Government member felt that ICT belonged to the upper end of the education and training continuum. Many developing countries needed to focus more on the initial stages of education involving eradication of illiteracy and innumeracy before they could reap full benefit from ICT in the education system.
- 108.** For many other countries, ICT in primary and secondary schools was a key element for enhancing access. It was important, however, that education systems become less rigid so as to be able to fully incorporate the ICT. Parents should also be encouraged to become involved. Some Government members also emphasized that ICT had special potential for promoting distance learning – it opened possibilities for more flexible learning and enabled students to learn at their own pace.
- 109.** Nonetheless, ICT must be part of a comprehensive learning system. Broader skills of various kinds needed to be fostered to enable people to benefit fully from ICT. People needed participatory skills for network communications and societies needed to foster skills for designing, implementing and maintaining networks.
- 110.** A Government member pointed out the impact of ICT on corporate organizations. The relatively flat organizational structure of many companies had led to the loss of middle level jobs and transferred management skills to frontline workers. Another stressed that the rise of the information and technology society implied training not only individuals but

---

also society. Social and behavioural skills should be taught to all citizens, especially the underprivileged, disabled and women, to take advantage of ICT.

- 111.** One of the Government members noted that ICT was generally available only in urban areas, where the general population had access to the required infrastructure and equipment. Rural areas were often excluded due to lack of electricity, widespread poverty, and limited industrial investment. However, even in urban areas a significant proportion of the urban poor worked in the informal sector and hence did not have access to new technologies.
- 112.** ICT involved high costs for infrastructure and for the hardware and the software which became obsolete rapidly. Governments could not afford to bear the entire financial burden alone, particularly in developing countries, and therefore the employers should also contribute. A number of Government members emphasized the need to collaborate with employers to secure greater investment in education and training. In some cases, employers did not encourage training which reflected an inadequate appreciation of the importance of training. One of the solutions offered to help contain the high cost of ICT was importing hardware and software duty-free for educational institutions.
- 113.** A few Government members mentioned the lack of international transfer of state-of-the-art technologies. Market liberalization alone was not likely to increase ICT diffusion, particularly if there were also geographic, cultural, and bureaucratic barriers. The international community should recognize that a number of countries and regions still did not have significant access to ICT. Some members described collaborative efforts between several governments. They also expressed the hope that the ILO would facilitate further collaboration. Exchange of information on best practices were welcomed, and it was suggested that the ILO should provide support to developing countries by arranging training seminars at various levels.
- 114.** One Government member considered it necessary to establish national funds for the purpose of providing training in ICT. Contributions, initially, could be voluntary and made obligatory once national legislation for establishment of a training fund had been enacted. Another stated that securing funding through dialogue with the social partners was important, but it should not be made compulsory.
- 115.** One Government member remarked that Recommendation No.150 needed to be updated, partly as a result of the spread of ICT. Given the important role of human resources development and training policies, it would be useful for governments to have updated policy guidelines. It was emphasized that the new labour standard should require dialogue among the social partners on development of ICT policies and training.
- 116.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson supported some of the comments made during the discussion, notably the need to consider the wider dimensions of personal competence, such as social skills, and not confining the requirement of competence to ICT alone. Attention should be paid to preventing a digital divide. The international community, through agencies such as the ILO and the IMF, should provide more support to developing countries in acquiring and diffusing ICT, and preparing their education systems for more effective use of ICT.
- 117.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson noted that developing countries could not necessarily afford to provide local ICT centres. Multinational corporations that use ICT should play a bigger role in diffusing ICT within developing countries. The funding dilemma surrounding access to ICT education and training institutions should be addressed in the conclusions.

- 
- 118.** The Workers' group reiterated that ICT diffusion was leading to a flatter managerial structure within the enterprises and demanded new skills and competencies of workers. The reward structure and competency standards needed to capture the changing skill requirements.
  - 119.** The Workers' group wished the conclusions to contain a concrete proposal for an international instrument which placed training in the decent work paradigm of the ILO and emphasized continuous interactions between the social partners. The Worker Vice-Chairperson stressed that in addition to standard-setting, the ILO had a role to play in providing assistance to the social partners through technical cooperation.
  - 120.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson, addressing point (5) concerning the issue of recognition of skills and competencies, emphasized that it was in the interest of both workers and employers to have appropriate instruments for evaluation and recognition of competencies acquired through work experiences. Tripartite national structures of qualifications should be established to either manage the validation process or monitor validating organizations. A national structure of qualifications would facilitate lifelong learning and help human resource managers and employment agencies to match skills demand with supply. Such a system should be flexible and regularly updated, widely accessible to workers, and integrated into the larger national system of qualifications. Evaluation instruments should also support further development of flexible forms of dual education.
  - 121.** The Employers' group stated that a new qualifications structure should indicate the informal but active role smaller firms play in providing training and enhancing entrepreneurial skills. It was pointed out that some European countries had undertaken initiatives to develop work-based skills evaluations.
  - 122.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson considered that a national qualifications framework should establish appropriate standards and a fair and non-discriminatory assessment system, and offer credible certification. Standards should have technical and occupational elements and reflect the specific skills required in high-performance enterprises such as communication and problem-solving skills, which are required but not always recognized nor rewarded. Also, flatter managerial structures have led to a shift in responsibilities from management to the workforce which should also be appropriately recognized and rewarded. Certificates should be recognized in the labour market so that skills become portable and are fairly rewarded. The academic component of standards should be made more explicit. The system of assessment should recognize currently possessed skills and should be linked explicitly to the standards. New forms of testing were needed for more comprehensive evaluation of the skills possessed by individuals, such as language and communication skills. Better testing methods would also enable individuals to identify their skills gaps and needs in relation to the market demand.
  - 123.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson stated that information was needed on the best practices in that area and the ILO had a role to play in providing an accessible database of national qualification systems.
  - 124.** Many Government members emphasized the importance of recognizing skills and competencies in the labour market and society, and a few referred to such recognition as a right. Government members shared their experiences concerning prior learning assessment and recognition – both successes and difficulties. Problems mentioned included: unproductive competition between testing and certifying institutions; corruption; lack of transparency; lack of credibility in assuring that certificates reflected the actual skills and knowledge obtained by the certificate holders; neglect of certification for white-collar

---

workers; and multiple layers of bureaucracy which impeded or discouraged workers from moving to jobs.

- 125.** National qualifications frameworks were needed to harmonize standards and ensure that certificates were widely recognized. Such frameworks must encourage the smooth functioning of the labour market and ensure fair treatment for all. One Government member also suggested the following measures: removing residency requirements; publicizing and enhancing competence-based occupational licensing, certification and registration practices; and promoting cooperation between regulatory boards. Another described the one-stop approach developed in his country to reduce bureaucratic delays. All agreed that national qualifications frameworks must be part of an integrated approach to education and training, and to employability in general.
- 126.** Skills and competencies acquired from formal and informal education, on-the-job learning, and other civic or voluntary activities should all be included for recognition and certification. One Government member described a national system for documentation and recognition of non-formal learning that would facilitate access to higher education on the basis of experience and competencies. Another mentioned that universities in her country are developing alternative access routes for mature students. Recognition of existing skills and prior learning of the workforce would encourage further learning, particularly when it opens access to higher education. This in turn would speed transition to a knowledge-based economy. More immediately, recognition and certification would increase transparency in the labour market and enhance matching of supply and demand, benefiting both workers and employers. A Government member also drew attention to the fact that testing would enable people to clearly identify their training needs.
- 127.** One of the main contributions of recognition and certification was portability of learning across institutions, workplaces, provinces and countries. Portability would particularly benefit: people who do not have post-secondary education credentials but have work experience; those with some post-secondary credentials but who would benefit from enhanced credentials; or workers who have foreign credentials.
- 128.** Several Government members stressed that portability presupposed a credible certification process – testing should be relevant, unbiased, fair, and free from corruption. One Government member pointed out that credibility in turn entailed periodic testing of skills and competencies, and periodic testing required governments to pay for testing centres to administer examinations. This infrastructure could be quite costly.
- 129.** In order for skills and competencies to be portable, testing and certification standards must be harmonized. The Government members agreed that a national approach was best to ensure uniformity of standards. One Government member noted the existence of variations in training requirements between sectors and described how in her country the recognition and certification system is allowed to adapt to the labour market demands of particular sectors, but Standing Committees monitored the system on a sectoral and occupational basis. Another Government member felt that the formal and informal sectors might require different strategies.
- 130.** International portability required harmonization of standards regionally and internationally. Harmonization was particularly important between countries with substantial migration flows. International cooperation could also bring down the costs of certification by sharing information on best practices and eliminating the need for re-certification.
- 131.** Many Government members stressed the need for continued participation of all social partners in developing and defining a national qualifications framework. The active

---

participation of the social partners must be fostered, e.g. by providing financial assistance to employers' and workers' organizations to strengthen their capacity for participation. A Government member testified to the value of cooperation with other community and special interest groups. Two Government members also mentioned inter-ministerial cooperation, involving the ministries of education and employment in one country, and ministries of migration and human resources in another.

- 132.** A few Government members encouraged increased bilateral assistance to developing countries to help them establish effective certification systems. One Government member expressed her country's appreciation for bilateral aid but stressed that, although the international community has a vital role to play, ultimately national systems had to be self-sustaining.
- 133.** Numerous Government members suggested that the ILO: develop a methodology for documenting skills; conduct further research in the area of prior learning; develop benchmarks; and play a leading role in providing accessible and reliable quantitative and qualitative data. The ILO also should continue to work closely with other international organizations in the area of prior learning recognition.
- 134.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson was very encouraged that so many countries already had provisions for the recognition of prior learning and that others were moving in this direction. The Employers' group noted that some Government members had described the problems caused by the absence of a national system, and endorsed the notion of a national framework for qualifications and the one-stop window described by one Committee member. The social partners should be closely involved in the national systems, and the international dimension of certification should be kept in mind. They concurred that the ILO should initiate research on recognition and certification practices.
- 135.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson was very pleased to note the wide consensus among the Committee members that experience in society and at work should be validated. There also was a high degree of consensus regarding the process and the content of national qualifications frameworks, and the need for linkages with the collective bargaining process. Although the Committee members all appreciated the importance of tripartite involvement, specificity was still lacking. The conclusions should reflect these areas of consensus and spell out in detail the concept of a national qualifications framework and tripartite participation, including a checklist of key issues regarding good practice. The conclusions should also note that recognition of prior learning could break down barriers to higher education.
- 136.** The Workers' group agreed that recognition and certification systems should be national to ensure harmonization and transparency; and they should form part of an integrated lifelong learning policy. They recalled the importance of partnerships between countries, particularly between developing and developed countries. They agreed with the Employers' group that the ILO should act as a clearing house for research and establish a database of good practices. Lastly, they supported the notion of international commitments on standards, which should be reached by including employers and workers in the dialogue.
- 137.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson reiterated the importance of involving the social partners at various levels in promoting education and training. He stressed that the question before the Committee was not whether the social partners should have a role in promoting education but what precisely the role should be.

- 
138. Partnership could occur between government and the social partners, between government and enterprises, and between social partners themselves. Although partnership in the context of the ILO traditionally meant tripartite partnerships, there were many other forms of partnership, formal and informal, that needed to be recognized.
  139. The Employers' group recounted the possible functions that the social partners could carry out. While the government had the responsibility for initial education at all levels, the social partners had an important role to play in vocational education and training. It was stressed that involvement of the social partners in national education and training policies was highly desirable.
  140. ILO should collect examples of good practices on establishment and maintenance of national frameworks for qualifications. ILO and UNESCO should collaborate more closely. ILO should also cooperate with the OECD on relevant research which could prove useful for the ILO member countries. The real challenge, according to the Employers' group, was to assist developing countries in strengthening their education systems and to encourage and support the social partners in investing more in training.
  141. The Worker Vice-Chairperson also stressed the important role of the social partners in promoting education and training, especially by enriching its planning and implementation process by providing insights from the workers. According to him, social partnership should extend to areas such as developing a national qualifications framework, standard setting, negotiating financial incentives, promoting literacy and numeracy, and working with educational institutions at all levels. In addition, collective bargaining could contribute positively towards developing a consensus on training.
  142. Increased involvement of the social partners did not imply a reduced role for the government. Government had an important coordinating and integrating function. Governments should establish permanent structures for promoting social partnerships to facilitate integration of training as an important component of national policies, and to strengthen capacities of social partners. Workers' organizations needed to be supported through public grants to contribute more effectively to national training efforts, and to network with educational institutions to promote a training culture. Better coordination amongst various governmental agencies was also needed to ensure that all available resources were optimally utilized for promoting training.
  143. Developing countries needed assistance to meet the challenge of literacy and numeracy because the demands of structural adjustments and debt servicing were compelling some of these countries to reduce investment in education and training. ILO should also provide assistance in meeting the demands on education and training emanating from regional cooperation, and establish a world-class database and benchmarks. Greater collaboration between ILO and UNESCO was also needed.
  144. The Workers' group pointed out a number of elements in Recommendation No. 150 that were still valid, despite the changes in terminology, indicating that more vigorous implementation was needed. They hoped that the Committee would agree to a set of guidelines which enhanced the efficacy of the provisions of Recommendation No. 150.
  145. The Government members agreed that the social partners should be actively involved in achieving better links between education, training, continuous education, and employability. Workers and employers had important contributions to make, based on their experiences and valuable insights; and they should shoulder part of the responsibility since they benefited directly in many respects. Governments should create an enabling

---

environment to foster clearly defined roles which are reinforced by the appropriate institutions.

- 146.** Some Government members stressed that the term “social partners” should be defined more broadly to include other organizations, such as professional or trade associations, small and medium enterprises, multinational enterprises and non-governmental organizations. Partnerships should also extend to coordination among various ministries of government, to ensure that policies such as structural adjustment do not undermine investment in people. Local and sectoral organizations, and organizations of particular communities, such as immigrants and indigenous peoples, should also become active social partners. Some Government members described how a bottom-up or sectoral approach had been a key element in fostering partnerships at the grass-roots level, involving, for example, local chambers of commerce. With grass-roots involvement, governments were better able to tailor programmes to the needs of the participants, and hence improve matching between skills supplied and demanded, particularly for youth.
- 147.** Closer partnerships should be forged at the regional and international levels. Establishing an effective human resources development and training system was a step-by-step process for all countries. Although no two countries faced the exact same circumstances and problems, all countries had much to learn from sharing methodologies, innovations and lessons learned. Government members from both developing and developed countries stressed the importance of increasing funding for technical cooperation to contribute expertise and help defray the costs of developing education and training systems in an active partnership framework. One Government member described how developing countries had much to learn from each other, and how some had taken steps in that direction; but the cost of travelling for the purpose of sharing experiences prevented them from taking full advantage of the opportunity to learn from their neighbours and developed countries. Intergovernmental and bilateral assistance should be coordinated to avoid duplication of efforts.
- 148.** Several Government members recommended strengthening the capacities of the social partners to meet the challenges of their increased responsibility for human resources development and training. For example, one Government member mentioned the need to improve communication between employer and worker representatives and their respective constituents concerning information on education and training policies and programmes. Another stated that in his country the social partners sometimes lagged behind in fulfilling their commitments. Some countries had implemented paid study leave to participate in capacity-building programmes run by employers’ and workers’ organizations.
- 149.** One Government member suggested that efforts be made to increase the capacities of training institutions; another suggested that the social partners should assume a more active role working with educational and training institutions at all levels – from primary schools to universities. Another mentioned that training institutions in his country had become more customer-service oriented and were responsible for promoting their services to potential clients.
- 150.** In addition to increasing capacities, governments must provide a framework in which training programmes and policies could flourish. Various Government members shared details about frameworks and institutions established in their countries to define the roles of the various social partners. Key features emphasized included flexibility in coping with the changing economic and social environment; a comprehensive approach with employability as the main objective; basing a system on good labour market information and research; and making full use of all existing resources. One Government member mentioned that legislation had been adopted to establish the framework. Another suggested

---

that the informal sector might need legislation to address its special needs. In any case, the framework should provide clearly defined roles and obligations.

- 151.** Governments must ensure that there is equal access to training, that qualification requirements are standardized, and that skills acquired on-the-job are recognized and portable. Additionally, governments must address the special needs of economically or socially disadvantaged groups, e.g. rural workers, women, people with disabilities, victims of war, youth and displaced workers. Governments could also attempt to anticipate the skills needs of the economy, although there was a risk of the information becoming quickly outdated, and ensure that all working people have access to information on such forecasts and on the availability of education and training. In all areas where governments retain the primary responsibility, they must closely involve the social partners as broadly defined.
- 152.** Employers should contribute to all facets of the system, but should be responsible primarily for training their employees and for working closely with governments in areas such as apprenticeships. One Government member suggested that employers also fund training for individuals who have needed to meet the future demand. Another Government member described how the private sector in his country provided a number of training centres in urban areas, allowing the Government to concentrate more on providing training free of charge in rural areas. However, the private sector training was of variable quality, indicating that employers could also benefit from capacity building.
- 153.** Unions could play an important role in providing training. One member of the Workers' group described alliances in his country for promoting training, which included both union members and non-union workers. There were also union training centres that upgraded the skills of the workforce and provided retraining to displaced workers.
- 154.** Individuals should increase their efforts to adapt to the changing environment by managing their own programmes of lifelong learning and contributing to the cost of training. In addition, they should assist union representatives in monitoring national training systems and contributing to the strategic review process.
- 155.** Some Government members described slightly different divisions of responsibility. For instance, one Government member explained how in his country workers' and employers' organizations had become co-managers of their training systems, with additional inputs from recipients of training services; meanwhile, the government had moved away from direct management of training and instead acted as the coordinator of the education and training system.
- 156.** Government members generally agreed that costs should be borne primarily by the main beneficiaries, with the governments concentrating their resources on those most in need. One Government member explained that a bottom-up approach had lent validity to how financing was allocated; another described how government contributions to the training fund, in its capacity as an employer, had set a positive example for other employers.
- 157.** Government members felt that the ILO had an important contribution to make at the international level. It could help define roles, provide specific guidance and disseminate information on best practices. The ILO already had done much to facilitate social dialogue and strengthen capacities through technical cooperation programmes such as the Asia and Pacific Skills Development Programme (APSDEP) and the Inter-American Vocational Training Research and Documentation Centre (CINTERFOR). These efforts should be expanded, and more generally, the ILO should coordinate the activities of the international community in the area of human resources development and training.

- 
- 158.** Various Government members expressed their views on the need to review the Human Resources Development Recommendation, 1975 (No. 150), in the light of changes in the world of work. One Government member pointed out that some statements in the Recommendation were no longer true and therefore it should be replaced. The challenge facing the Committee was how to define a role for vocational education and training in the context of full employment and the long-term aims of social inclusion, citizenship, and the needs of enterprises.
- 159.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson remarked on the many good examples provided of consultations in the field of human resources training and development. In addition to national-level examples, the extensive use of regional structures, local networks and sectoral-level boards for management of training systems were particularly noteworthy. Clear consensus existed on the importance of shared responsibility for training activities, which included not only governments and employers, but also individuals seeking to upgrade their qualifications. There also appeared to be general consensus within the Committee that education and training efforts needed to establish strong links with informal sector activities.
- 160.** The Employers' group also stressed the crucial nature of proactive research for forecasting labour market demand, but cautioned that labour market changes were so frequent that such forecasts ran the risk of being outdated by the time of publication. This rapid pace of change also had implications for the establishment of national frameworks for skills qualifications; occupational profiles could become rapidly outdated. The Employers' group also noted that the vast array of cooperative initiatives demonstrated the enormous opportunities available for countries to build upon provided a good enabling environment existed.
- 161.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson noted that while the need for social partnership appeared to be agreed to by all, the Workers' group felt the need for greater elaboration of what partnership meant. This, no doubt, implied sharing of responsibility between public and private entities in the governance of training systems, including trade union involvement with industry and the educational system, and individual worker responsibility for training, education and career planning.
- 162.** The Workers' group highlighted some of the important points raised by Government members, including the need for a broad objective in achieving full employment and capacity building of the social partners. Quantitative and qualitative targets should be set for training, particularly to raise literacy levels, provide special assistance to informal sector workers, and improve access to training of vulnerable groups. The Workers' group also noted the use of payroll levies to finance training and the need to adapt systems of industrial relations to the growing regionalization of markets. Other areas of consensus included the need to mainstream informal sector workers through active training policies and the significance of research and forecasting to direct training policies and programmes.
- 163.** The Workers' group stressed that a comprehensive approach was needed. For example, the relationship between other labour market policies and those concerned specifically with training should be examined and integrated. Supply-side policies such as investment in human resources needed to be complemented by demand-side policies such as increasing the demand for labour. The question of access to training remained a fundamental facet of this comprehensive approach, again raising issue of funding. Paid leave for time used in training was an issue to be considered carefully. A comprehensive approach required policy-makers to have access to the best practices of other countries. These aspects needed to be carefully examined in the Committee's conclusions.

- 
- 164.** The Committee Chairperson noted the remarkable consensus developing within the Committee. There was general agreement that human resource development was a key component of overall development objectives; that the pace of change in the training and education domain was extremely fast; that partnership was an essential aspect but included partnership of a wide range of actors; that multiple target groups for training required a great diversity of strategies; and that basic education was a springboard to further training and education. A drafting subcommittee was appointed to prepare the Committee's draft conclusions for discussion at the next sitting.
- 165.** Two international non-governmental organizations addressed the Meeting – the World Federation of United Nations Associations and the International Federation of University Women.

### **Discussion of draft conclusions on technical discussion of human resources training and development**

- 166.** The Chairperson made some introductory remarks regarding the current situation of the work of the Committee. The Committee Drafting Group had met on 6 June and produced a set of draft conclusions. One hundred and sixty-three amendments to the text had been received on 7 June but some omissions to the text had been noted. Consultations were held on that day and a number of paragraphs were reformulated and a second set of draft conclusions was produced. Following the Chairperson's introductory remarks, the Coordinator of the Committee Secretariat noted that discussion would therefore be based on C.R.H./D.165, entitled *Second draft conclusions*, with the corrections to the text in bold type for easy reference. Due to logistical difficulties, the revised text could not be distributed to Government members in advance of the current sitting. The Committee would thus consider amendments to paragraphs 1-8 and 14-18, since these amendments were distributed and there were no changes to the original text. Any additional amendments to the corrected paragraphs received by 7 p.m. on 8 June would be considered. The Chairperson expressed appreciation of the Drafting Committee's work and requested Committee members to be mindful of the tight time schedule in view of the large number of amendments received.

#### Paragraph 1

- 167.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment. He suggested that it was necessary to locate the education and training issues in the context of the social challenges faced by the world. The issues mentioned in the amendment expressed many of the important issues raised during the general discussion, including placing the conclusions of the work of the Committee firmly within the ILO's decent work paradigm.
- 168.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson offered a subamendment in which the term "economic growth" was inserted after the word "promote" and the second sentence relating to decent work was deleted. The Government member of Ethiopia proposed that the words "attain sustained" be inserted before "economic growth". The Worker Vice-Chairperson agreed with the first part of the amendment but requested that the order of the concepts be reversed so that "full employment" would be inserted before "economic growth". He argued in favour of retaining the second sentence in its original form, an option opposed by the Employers' group.
- 169.** The Government member of France remarked that inclusion of the second sentence regarding decent work should be retained because it accurately reflected the context of the

---

discussion. The Government members of Portugal, Brazil and Ethiopia also expressed their support for retention of the reference.

- 170.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson suggested that the second sentence referring to decent work be placed in a footnote. The Workers' group rejected retention of the reference, to which the Employer Vice-Chairperson agreed.
- 171.** The amendment submitted by the Workers' group was adopted as subamended and reads as follows:

A critical challenge that faces human society at the start of the twenty-first century is to attain full employment and sustained economic growth in the global economy, and social inclusivity. The ILO's framework of *Decent work* addresses both the quality and quantity of employment, and provides a basis for new education and training policies and strategies.

- 172.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment to add the words "to economic development" after the word "contribute" in the second sentence of paragraph 1. The amendment, supported by the Worker Vice-Chairperson, was adopted.
- 173.** The Government member of India introduced an amendment, seconded by the Government member of Japan, proposing deletion of the words "and good jobs" in the third sentence of paragraph 1. The phrase "decent work" captured the sense of "good jobs" and therefore was superfluous. The Employers' group and the Workers' group did not support the proposed amendment. It was withdrawn.
- 174.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment to replace the words "victims of inequities in employment" by the word "unemployed" in the fourth sentence of paragraph 1. The word "unemployed" sufficiently covered the notion of inequities in employment. The Worker Vice-Chairperson did not support the amendment because the two were distinct issues that should be appropriately reflected. The Worker Vice-Chairperson offered a subamendment with the phrase "unemployed or victims of inequities in employment" replacing the formulation proposed by the Employers' group. The Government members of Portugal, Sweden, and Canada supported the subamendment.
- 175.** Responding to the reluctance of the Employers' group to support the subamendment, the Workers' group suggested an alternative phrasing, "Education and skill formation could lead to less unemployment and more equity in employment". The amendment, as subamended, was adopted, reading "Education and skills formation could lead to less unemployment and more equity in employment".
- 176.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment concerning the inclusion of the phrase "gender equality and non-discrimination" in the sixth sentence of paragraph 1. The Employer Vice-Chairperson supported the amendment. The amendment was adopted.
- 177.** The Government member of Portugal introduced an amendment to the sixth sentence of paragraph 1 to replace the phrase "competitive through better use of human potential" with "competitive through the existence of more skilled human potential". The Government member of France seconded the proposed amendment and was supported by the Workers' and Employers' groups. The amendment was adopted.

## Paragraph 2

- 178.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment to substitute paragraph 2 by an alternative text. While the positive aspects of globalization had been stressed in the text,

---

the negative impacts of globalization were not appropriately developed. The Employer Vice-Chairperson stated that the original text was satisfactory with minor modification and a totally new paragraph was unnecessary.

- 179.** The Government member of Ethiopia supported the amendment as moved by the Workers' group and noted that, should it be accepted, the amendment proposed by him concerning paragraph 2 would be withdrawn. The Government members of India, Sweden, United Kingdom and United States also supported the amendment proposed by the Workers' group. Following consultation between the Chairperson and the Employer Vice-Chairperson the amendment was adopted without changes. The Chairperson noted that, with the adoption of the amendment, all other proposed amendments to paragraph 2 would not be considered.

### Paragraph 3

- 180.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson proposed an amendment to the first sentence of paragraph 3 deleting the words "are a necessary and integral element" and substituting "should go hand-in-hand with". The proposed amendment would reflect the notion that training policy should stand as a policy on its own and should not be considered as being part of other policies.
- 181.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson expressed his preference for the original text because education and training policies were an element of economic and employment policies. Despite this preference for the original text, the proposed amendment was supported by the Workers' group and was adopted.
- 182.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment replacing the word "seize" by "utilize" in the third sentence of the text as the replacement text carried much wider meaning. The proposed amendment was supported by the Employer Vice-Chairperson and adopted.

### Paragraph 4

- 183.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson proposed an amendment in which paragraph 4 would follow paragraph 7. Paragraphs 3, 5, 6 and 7 dealt with the issues of education and training while paragraph 4 dealt specifically with issues related to the informal sector. This made sense in terms of the logical sequencing of paragraphs. The Worker Vice-Chairperson supported the proposed amendment, provided other amendments to paragraph 4 did not change its essential content. The amendment was adopted.
- 184.** The Government member of India proposed an amendment to delete the second sentence of paragraph 4. The sentence did not properly reflect the increasingly wide variety of activities undertaken within the informal sector. The Government member of Japan seconded the proposed amendment.
- 185.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson opposed the amendment, stating that the sentence concerned included enterprises that operated in the informal sector, with many of these engaged in survival activities. The Worker Vice-Chairperson also opposed the amendment noting that the second sentence served the function of clarifying the nature of the informal sector and hence added value to the paragraph.
- 186.** The Government member of the United States proposed a subamendment which included "self-employment or" after the words "most of which are" in the last part of the sentence. In view of the fact that not all self-employed people work in the informal sector, the

---

Worker Vice-Chairperson opposed the subamendment. Considering the lack of support, the amendment was withdrawn.

- 187.** The Government member of Japan proposed an amendment to the third sentence that replaced the part: “The role of training is not to prepare people for the informal sector or to increase the informal sector, but rather to improve the performance of enterprises and ...” by the words: “While acknowledging the socio-economic role the sector plays in respective countries, education and training should be one instrument, in addition to e.g. fiscal policies, provision of credit, extension of social protection and labour laws to enhance the performance of enterprises and ...”. Education and training were not the only instruments available to deal with the challenges of the informal sector. The Government member of India seconded the proposed amendment.
- 188.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson introduced a subamendment that deleted the words: “in addition to” and replaced them by “and should go hand-in-hand”. The Worker Vice-Chairperson proposed a subamendment replacing the words: “While acknowledging the socio-economic role the sector plays in respective countries, education and training should be one instrument and should go hand-in-hand with other instruments, e.g. ...” by the words: “The role of training is not to prepare people for the informal sector or to expand the informal sector, but rather it should go hand-in-hand with other instruments such as ...”. The Employer Vice-Chairperson supported the proposed subamendment.
- 189.** The Government member of Japan expressed his dissatisfaction with the proposed amendment as sub-subamended by the Worker Vice-Chairperson because it lacked acknowledgement of the socio-economic roles the informal sector played. The Government member of India offered a subamendment which added the words “not only” after “the role of training is” on the grounds that the first part of the sentence implied some ambiguities and potential misunderstandings. The Worker Vice-Chairperson and the Government member of Portugal opposed the subamendment as offered by the Government member of India.
- 190.** The Government member of Portugal supported the proposed amendment as sub-subamended by the Worker Vice-Chairperson on the basis that it included the use of other instruments to deal with the problems of informal sector. The Government member of the United Kingdom also supported the subamendment moved by the Worker Vice-Chairperson. However, she noted that, in agreement with the Government member of India, the first part of the sentence was not very clear and proposed a rephrasing to include the words “the only means” after the words “The role of training is not ...”, a proposal opposed by the Workers’ group.
- 191.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson offered an additional subamendment, which was to replace the words “but rather it should go hand-in-hand with other instruments” by the words “but rather it should go in conjunction with other measures”, terminology proposed by the Government member of Portugal in an amendment to be subsequently considered.
- 192.** The Government member of Ethiopia supported the proposed amendment as submitted by the Government member of Japan, noting that there was a need to acknowledge the role played by the informal sector. The Government member of Mali suggested that there may be a semantic problem in the sentence and that it should be split into two parts. The proposed subamendment would read as follows: “The role of training is not to prepare people ... informal sector. Education and training should go in conjunction with other measures ...”. The Employer Vice-Chairperson opposed the proposed subamendment because the separation of the two sentences might be misinterpreted.

- 
- 193.** The Government member of Saudi Arabia expressed his concern that the amendment as sub-subamended by the Worker Vice-Chairperson could be misinterpreted to imply that training should be directed at the informal sector while the main aim of training policies with regard to the informal sector should be to move workers out of the informal sector and incorporate them into the formal sector.
- 194.** In view of the fact that the confusion may arise out of the first part of the sentence, the Employer Vice-Chairperson proposed another subamendment that deleted the words “prepare people for the informal sector or to”. The Worker Vice-Chairperson opposed such a subamendment, noting that training could be one of the instruments that could address the challenges posed by the informal sector and that the first part of the sentence “training is not to prepare people for the informal sector” partially captured this concept. The Employer Vice-Chairperson reiterated that the part of the phrase “training is not to prepare people for the informal sector” could be confusing and did not clarify the aim of training policies with respect to the informal sector. The Government member of Japan supported this viewpoint.
- 195.** In view of the potential confusion and misinterpretation that could arise out of the first part of the sentence, the Worker Vice-Chairperson offered another subamendment, which inserted the words “and to keep them in the informal sector;” after the words “prepare people for the informal sector”. The Employer Vice-Chairperson and the Government member of Japan supported the rephrasing of the proposed amendment as subamended by the Worker and the Employers’ groups. The amendment, as subamended and adopted, reads as follows:

The role of training is not to prepare people for the informal sector and to keep them in the informal sector; or to expand the informal sector; but rather it should go in conjunction with other measures such as fiscal policies, provision of credit, extension of social protection and labour laws to improve the performance of enterprises and the employability of workers in order to transform what are often marginal, survival activities into decent work fully integrated into mainstream life.

- 196.** In view of the adoption of the amendment submitted by the Government member of Japan as sub-subamended, the subsequent amendments to that sentence were not considered.
- 197.** The Government member of Japan introduced an amendment to replace the phrase “informal workers” by “the said workers” in paragraph 4 because this would better reflect the meaning of the sentence in terms of which workers were referred to. The Government member of Canada seconded the proposed amendment. The Worker Vice-Chairperson submitted a subamendment deleting only the word “informal” without a replacement phrase because this would broaden the scope concerning which workers were referred to. The Employer Vice-Chairperson submitted a subamendment replacing the words “informal workers” with “workers in the informal sector and in general”. The Worker Vice-Chairperson thereupon withdrew his subamendment and supported the proposal of the Government member of Japan. The amendment as moved by the Government member of Japan was adopted.

## Paragraph 5

- 198.** The Government member of Italy introduced an amendment to delete either paragraph 5 or paragraph 7 of the proposed conclusions. There appeared to be an inconsistency between the two paragraphs, in that paragraph 5 noted that human resources training and development by themselves were insufficient to ensure sustainable economic and social development while paragraph 7 stated that that they were major instruments to improve

---

such development. The Government member of Canada seconded the proposed amendment. The proposed amendment was also supported by the Government member of the Seychelles but opposed by the Government members of France and New Zealand. The Worker Vice-Chairperson and the Employer Vice-Chairperson preferred to retain the original text because the two paragraphs provided a good balance between what human resources and development can and cannot achieve in terms of social and economic development. The amendment was not adopted.

- 199.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment to add the phrase “or resolve the aggregate employment challenge” at the end of the first sentence of paragraph 5. The proposed amendment, supported by the Employer Vice-Chairperson, was adopted.
- 200.** The Government member of India introduced an amendment to delete the third sentence of paragraph 5 beginning with the words: “Policies that expand aggregate demand” because the original wording confused the distinction between demand-side and supply-side policies or measures. The Government member of Japan seconded the proposed amendment. The Employer Vice-Chairperson and the Worker Vice-Chairperson opposed the amendment. The Government member of New Zealand also opposed the amendment. The proposed amendment was not adopted.
- 201.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment to paragraph 5 adding the word “skill” before “supply-side” in the third sentence. The Worker Vice-Chairperson proposed a subamendment that would broaden the range of such policies referred to. The subamendment, following the words “supply-side policies,” would read: “e.g. industrial and enterprise, science and technology, and education and training”. Following support by the Government member of New Zealand and the Employers’ group, the amendment as subamended by the Workers’ group was adopted.
- 202.** An amendment submitted by the Government members of Australia, Canada, Denmark, Finland, Norway, United Kingdom and United States was introduced by the Government member of the United Kingdom. The intention of the proposed amendment, amending the fourth sentence of paragraph 5, was to clarify the meaning of the original text. The Employer Vice-Chairperson supported the proposed amendment.
- 203.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson offered a subamendment, substituting the word “are” for “can be” so that that the subamendment would read: “Appropriate fiscal policies, social security and collective bargaining are among the means to distribute these economic gains on a fair and equitable basis, and constitute basic incentives to invest in training”. The Employer Vice-Chairperson and the Government members submitting the amendment supported the subamendment. The amendment as subamended was adopted.
- 204.** An amendment submitted by the Government members of Australia, Canada, Denmark, Finland, Norway, United Kingdom and United States was introduced by the Government member of Australia. The proposed amendment would delete the fifth sentence of paragraph 5 that was felt to be imprecise. Since the subject matter was indeed important the Government member was amenable to retaining a sentence regarding the need for ILO research so that the sentence would read: “Pursuing these integrated policies requires a consideration of a new financial and social architecture for the global economy, a subject for ILO research”. Following discussion concerning various possible wordings, the Employers’ and Workers’ groups supported the amendment as rephrased. The amendment was adopted.

- 
- 205.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson, as requested by the Chairperson, introduced paragraph 5 as reformulated and agreed upon by the working party. The reformulated paragraph should read as follows:

It is the task of basic education to ensure to each individual the full development of the human personality and citizenship; and to lay down the foundation for employability. Initial training develops further his or her employability by providing general core work skills, and the underpinning knowledge, and industry-based and professional competencies which are portable and facilitate the transition into the world of work. Lifelong learning ensures that the individual's skills and competencies are maintained and improved as work, technology and skill requirements change; ensures the personal and career development of workers; results in increases in aggregate productivity and income; and improves social equity. Both in developed countries as well as in developing countries there are many workers without the basic skills for literacy and numeracy. National and international strategies have to be developed to eliminate illiteracy, based on concrete targets, benchmarks and quality assessment.

The reformulated paragraph was adopted by consensus.

#### Paragraph 6

- 206.** The Government member of France introduced an amendment to replace paragraph 6 with an alternative text. The intention of the proposed amendment was to explain the role of basic education that could be misconstrued in the original text as concerning primarily the concept of employability. Basic education had much broader aims than simply employability. The Government member of Canada seconded the proposed amendment.
- 207.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson did not agree with the deletion of paragraph 6 in its entirety as the original text included the notions of personal development and employability as part of the aims of basic education. The Worker Vice-Chairperson requested that the Committee follow the original text and consider the amendment proposed by the Workers' group that would adequately take care of the concerns of the Government member of France.
- 208.** The Government member of Italy supported the proposed amendment. The Government member of Bahrain suggested that the idea in the original text that basic education provided the foundation for employability should be retained but that the two central ideas contained in the proposed amendment, namely education as cultural guidance and as a means of helping people adapt to change, should also be included. The Government member of Bahrain offered a subamendment reading: "it is the task of basic education to provide cultural guidance, allow individuals to adapt to changes and establish the foundations of an individual's employability".
- 209.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson requested the Committee to review the proposed amendment and suggested that it could be subamended to include the phrase "... and a full development of the human personality", a formulation taken from the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. Employability was an important element but the text could be enriched by utilizing accepted international language. The Chairperson stated that a number of good points had been made during the discussion and proposed that a small working group be set up composed of France, Bahrain and the representatives of the Workers' and Employers' groups to draft a new text reflecting all amendments to paragraph 6. The Committee members accepted this proposal.

---

## Paragraph 7

- 210.** The Government member of France introduced an amendment to replace paragraph 7 with an alternative text. The alternative text added the notion of lifelong learning to the first sentence as the paragraph concerned mainly the concept of education and not training. The rest of the text was similar to the original and included references to specific needs but deleted references to the concept of targeting. The Government member of the United Kingdom seconded the amendment.
- 211.** The Employers' and the Workers' groups did not support the proposed amendment. In view of the lack of support, the Government member of France withdrew the proposed amendment.
- 212.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson moved an amendment to add the word "quality" at the start of the first sentence. The Employer Vice-Chairperson moved a subamendment to add the word "high" before the word "quality".
- 213.** The Government member of Canada wanted the notion of evaluation also introduced along with the notion of high-quality education. The Workers' group remarked that this aspect would fit better when dealing with the issues related to a national qualifications framework. The Government member of Bahrain observed that there could be many descriptors for describing training. For example, apart from high-quality training, one could also speak of relevant training or effective training. The Government member of Indonesia noted that in the context of economic development, the relevance of training was an important issue. The Employer Vice-Chairperson remarked that it would be difficult to conceive high-quality training that was not relevant.
- 214.** The Workers' group supported the subamendment proposed by the Employers' group to add the word "high" before the word "quality". The amendment was adopted as subamended.
- 215.** The Government member of the United Kingdom introduced an amendment submitted jointly by the Government members of Australia, Canada, Denmark, United Kingdom and United States. The proposed amendment concerned the second sentence of paragraph 7 and inserted, following the words "In order to be effective they must ...", the words "cover everyone, including disadvantaged groups. Therefore they must be carefully targeted at persons ...". The Government member explained that the proposed amendment emphasized lifelong learning and the fact that it should be accessible to all, including the disadvantaged.
- 216.** The Employers' group supported the proposed amendment and observed that it was in line with suggestions made earlier by the Government member of France on lifelong learning. The Workers' group also supported the amendment.
- 217.** The Government member of Sweden remarked on his concern that women were grouped together with rural workers, people with disabilities, migrant workers, the long-term unemployed, etc. He felt that all measures should be adapted to the needs of men and women. There being no other comments, the amendment was adopted.
- 218.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment to replace the words "persons with special needs, including women;" by the words "women and persons with special needs, including" in the second sentence of the paragraph 7. The Worker Vice-Chairperson noted that women should not be identified in the same category as some other groups with more specific needs.

- 
- 219.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson opposed the amendment and stated that the original text was sufficient. He further stated that women should not be singled out as a special category with respect to the provision of general education.
- 220.** The Government members of Italy, Sweden, Norway, Brazil, United Kingdom, Islamic Republic of Iran, Malaysia, Lesotho, Saudi Arabia, Namibia and United Arab Emirates supported the proposed amendment while the Government members of France, Canada and Japan opposed the proposed amendment.
- 221.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson noted that the reason for singling out women as a separate group from those with more special needs was that no society had achieved gender equity. Some countries had achieved considerable progress while many remained very far from achieving gender equity. The Employer Vice-Chairperson requested for a vote by show of hands.
- 222.** The Government member of France noted that the source of the problem might be the listing of the groups with special needs and that the list should be deleted. The Worker Vice-Chairperson argued against the deletion of the list. He further noted that the previous amendment submitted by the Workers' group in paragraph 1 was adopted and the subsequent texts should demonstrate the spirit of the introductory paragraph, which was that all societies should strive to achieve gender equality, given the current lack of gender equity at the global level.
- 223.** Put to a vote by show of hands, the amendment was adopted by 37,004 votes in favour and 4,446 against with 32,219 abstentions.
- 224.** The Government member of the United Kingdom introduced an amendment submitted by the Government members of Australia, Canada, Denmark, United Kingdom and United States. The amendment inserted the words "older workers" between the words "people with disabilities" and "the long-term unemployed" in the second sentence. The Government member of the United Kingdom stated that, although it was recognized that the list was not definitive, the issue of older workers was becoming a pressing issue in many countries and therefore needed to be highlighted.
- 225.** The Employers' and the Workers' groups supported the amendment. The amendment was adopted.

## Paragraph 8

- 226.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment to insert the words "and a duty" after the word "right" in the first sentence of paragraph 8. He stated that while the importance of lifelong learning and access to training was being highlighted, it was also important to refer to the duties of individuals in the matter of training.
- 227.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson sought a clarification from the Chairperson as to whether he could ask for a definition of the term "child labour" for clarifying its use in the document. The Chairperson requested the Deputy Representative of the Secretary-General to provide a definition of child labour according to ILO guidelines.
- 228.** The Government member of the United Kingdom stated that individuals had a responsibility to take advantage of training and supported the proposed amendment.
- 229.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson requested a clarification of the word "duty" in the context of training. He explained that although documents prepared by international organizations,

---

including the ILO, referred to different rights, these rights were not qualified by responsibilities in those documents.

- 230.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson offered a subamendment to the proposed amendment. He suggested that the first sentence could read as follows: “Education and training are a right for all and a responsibility for individuals.” The Worker Vice-Chairperson offered a subamendment that would address the concerns of the Employers’ group. The amendment proposed by him was that the first and second sentences should remain unchanged and after that a new sentence should be added as follows: “It is the responsibility of all persons to make use of the opportunities offered.”
- 231.** The proposed amendment as subamended was agreed to by the Employers’ group and was supported by the Government member of Japan. The proposed amendment was adopted as subamended by the Workers’ group.
- 232.** The deputy representative of the Secretary-General clarified the definition of child labour as contained in ILO instruments. The Worker Vice-Chairperson expressed his concern that the draft conclusions gave the impression of legitimizing child labour in the first sentence. He requested that the secretariat seek alternative language concerning the issue of child labour for inclusion in the paragraph.
- 233.** The Government member of the United States introduced an amendment submitted jointly by the Government members of Canada, Australia, United Kingdom and United States. The proposed amendment sought to amend the words “Free universal” to read “Free universal, quality public primary and secondary education” in the third sentence. The Government member of the United States said that, although universal education was referred to in the document, it was important to expressly indicate that quality primary and secondary education should be made accessible to all.
- 234.** The Employers’ and the Workers’ groups supported the proposed amendment. The amendment was adopted.
- 235.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson submitted an amendment that added the words “availability of adult and second chance education” after the words “initial training” in the sixth sentence. The Worker Vice-Chairperson stated that the intention of the proposed amendment was to emphasize the importance of adult and second-chance learning. The Employer Vice-Chairperson supported the proposed amendment. The amendment was adopted.
- 236.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment to add the words “and trainers” after the words “qualified teachers” in the seventh sentence. The Employers’ group supported the proposed amendment as did the Government member of Norway. The amendment was adopted.
- 237.** The Government member of Norway introduced an amendment, submitted jointly by the Government members of Denmark, Finland and Norway, to replace the words “and helping all children reach high academic standards” in the seventh sentence. by “for children and adults”, as the provision of quality education should be sought regardless of the academic standard achieved. The Worker Vice-Chairperson offered a subamendment, adding the phrase “reach high standards in academic and vocational competencies” at the end of the proposed amendment. The amendment, as subamended, was adopted.

---

**238.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment adding “and the provision of adequate facilities” to the eighth sentence because this was also one of the critical elements of any successful educational system. The amendment was adopted.

**239.** The Government member of Finland introduced an amendment submitted jointly by the Government members of Finland, Norway and Denmark in which elements concerning the importance of vocational and labour market information, employment services and facilitating the school to work and further training replaced the ninth sentence. Following supporting statements by the Employer Vice-Chairperson and Worker Vice-Chairperson, the amendment was adopted and reads as follows:

In addition to education and training, career guidance and job placement services (career development services) embracing career education, career counselling, employment counselling and educational, vocational and labour market information, all have a crucial role to play in human resources development. The fostering of a career development culture throughout education and training systems as well as employment services is a means to promote continuous learning. The development of this culture among youth and adults will be of particular importance for ensuring their employability and facilitating their transition from education and training to work or further training.

**240.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment including the concept of retraining to those of training and education to the ninth sentence. The amendment was adopted.

#### Paragraph 14

**241.** The Government member of India introduced an amendment that adjusted the language of the third sentence for the purposes of clarification. A subamendment was offered by the Employer Vice-Chairperson with the term “interpersonal skills” replaced with “personal skills”, with the new text reading: “All this increases the demand for new skills and competencies, including personal skills and ICT competencies.” The amendment was adopted as subamended.

#### Paragraph 15

**242.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment replacing the third and fourth sentences with more detailed information concerning the support and development of ICT skills through the provision of ICT equipment and possible government incentives to promote such activity. The Employer Vice-Chairperson supported the spirit in which the proposed amendment was submitted but suggested keeping the third and fourth sentences and replacing the fifth sentence with a new one. Following joint consultations between the Workers’ and Employers’ groups, an alternative text was devised and agreed upon as follows, to replace the fifth sentence: “Enterprises may provide ICT facilities or support schemes for workers for the use of ICT at home or in general, and to schools or other training providers, in order to promote the diffusion of ICT skills and access in society. Appropriate government incentives could facilitate this development.” The amendment, as jointly subamended, was adopted.

**243.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment in the third sentence substituting, in the interests of clarity, the word “pedagogical” with the word “teaching”. The Employer Vice-Chairperson supported the amendment and indicated support for other amendments on the same point. The amendment was adopted.

---

Paragraph 16

- 244.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment to replace in the second sentence the words “with huge ... illiteracy” by “with low education enrolment, high school drop-outs, growing levels of adult illiteracy”.
- 245.** The Workers’ group had no argument with identifying the causes of adult illiteracy but this should be done with great care. Not all of the points mentioned in the Employers’ group’s amendment could be classified as causes – for example, low levels of school enrolment and high levels of school drop-outs could be attributed to the lack of resources in many developing countries. The Government member of Ethiopia concurred with the viewpoint of the Workers’ group.
- 246.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson noted that in developed countries there is also high adult illiteracy and that in the amendment these cases were reflected. The Employers’ group withdrew the amendment on the grounds that the paragraph focused on the difficulties of developing countries and hoped that there would be an opportunity later on to include references to industrialized countries.
- 247.** The Government member of Japan submitted an amendment replacing the words “in the least developed economies, undertake bold and substantial debt relief” in the ninth sentence by “in the developing countries”. It was not, in his view, the task of the ILO to intervene in the issue of debt relief. The Government member of India seconded the proposed amendment.
- 248.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson wished to substitute the term “developing countries” for “least developed countries” and could not agree with the point regarding debt relief itself. Debt crisis should be seen as a constraint faced by developing countries in their struggle to promote human resources development and training. The Government member of Ethiopia concurred with the viewpoint of the Workers’ group.
- 249.** The Government member of Japan withdrew the amendment.
- 250.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment noting that it recognized that both cases of debt relief and debt cancellation exist in the world.
- 251.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson remarked that he was not aware of any cases of total debt cancellation and that therefore the present formulation gave enough room for alternative scenarios.
- 252.** The Workers’ group introduced a subamendment which would read: “ ... debt relief and, where appropriate, debt cancellation, ...”. The Employer Vice-Chairperson supported the proposal.
- 253.** The Government member of Japan introduced an amendment to indicate that the ILO should take the lead and develop good coordination between international agencies. There was a need to strengthen existing programmes by making better use of scarce resources. The Government members of India and Canada seconded the amendment.
- 254.** As far as the Employers’ group was concerned, the present formulation in the text was sufficient since it clearly recommended that the ILO take a lead in this field. For this reason, the Employers’ group could not support the amendment. The Worker Vice-Chairperson agreed with the argument and did not support the amendment.

- 
- 255.** The Government member of Poland suggested correcting sentence eleven by adding “on” before “fair”. The Government member of Japan withdrew the proposed amendment.
- 256.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment in order to stress the important role that developing countries have in developing their own economies.
- 257.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson supported the proposed amendment. The amendment was adopted.
- 258.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment to the fourteenth sentence because measures proposed were necessary conditions for economic and social development, but other elements should also be taken into consideration. Following support by the Employers’ group, the amendment was adopted.
- 259.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment to emphasize that developing countries could do a great deal to help themselves.
- 260.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson supported the proposed amendment. The Government member of Ethiopia also supported the proposed amendment but suggested that after “... developing countries themselves” the words “make efforts” should be inserted. The amendment as subamended was adopted.

#### Paragraph 17

- 261.** The Government member of the United Kingdom introduced an amendment proposing that, since the paragraph referred to partnerships between government, the social partners and other actors in the field of vocational education, there should be specific references to the vocational qualifications framework.
- 262.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson agreed that in many countries similar vocational education frameworks to those prevailing in the United Kingdom existed. However, there were countries where an expansion of the vocational education framework was proposed to cover also university degrees. It was therefore preferable to retain the existing text with a possible subamendment to read: “... national (vocational) qualifications framework”.
- 263.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson commented that during the Committee’s meetings very interesting examples had been discussed and that one of the recurring themes was the need to integrate the different strands of the education system.
- 264.** The Government member of the United Kingdom subamended the amendment, inserting the word “vocational” between the words “qualification” and “system” in the thirteenth sentence. She explained that the distribution of responsibilities in providing education and training would be clarified. It was the vocational qualifications system that should be tripartite and not the national qualifications system since provision of general national education systems rested with the governments. The Employer Vice-Chairperson supported the subamendment.
- 265.** The Workers’ group proposed a subamendment. The sentence would now read: “The national qualifications system should always be tripartite, offer ...”. The Employer Vice-Chairperson supported the amendment.
- 266.** The Government member of India opposed the amendment by the Worker Vice-Chairperson and stated that some higher-level training programmes were sometimes

---

only provided by employers and could not be conducted on a tripartite basis. The Government member of the United Arab Emirates supported this viewpoint.

- 267.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson withdrew the sub-subamendment. The amendment as subamended by the Government members of Canada, United States, United Kingdom, and Australia was adopted.
- 268.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment adding “and professional” after “industry-based” to the second sentence as this gave broader basis for different kinds of competencies required in the labour market. The Worker Vice-Chairperson supported the proposed amendment. The amendment was adopted.
- 269.** The Government member of Norway introduced an amendment, stressing that the recognition of all forms of prior learning for all persons in the labour force, including the unemployed, should be assessed, recognized and certified. The Employer Vice-Chairperson supported the amendment.
- 270.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson stressed that for all categories of competencies, people had the right to be assessed, recognized and certified. The building up of a system or a machinery to enable the exercising of this right came afterwards. In this regard, the conclusions should have a strong normative statement.
- 271.** The Government members of Norway, Denmark and Finland offered a subamendment by replacing the words “worker has the right to” by the words “person should have the opportunity” and inserting the words “and non-formal” after the word “formal”. The Employers’ and the Workers’ groups supported this. The amendment was adopted as subamended.
- 272.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson proposed to delete the words in brackets appearing in the third sentence and replace the words by “and remunerated in accordance with the provisions of collective bargaining agreements”. The amendment could be seen as promoting collective bargaining agreements, something that the ILO encouraged.
- 273.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson did not support the amendment. He pointed out that the current trend was not to link remuneration with qualifications but to link it to competencies that were required in the job. The Government member of the United Kingdom supported the view of the Employers’ group. She said that any implication that collective bargaining was the only instrument in this respect would be a misrepresentation. The Government member of New Zealand supported this viewpoint.
- 274.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson said that it was also his contention that competencies should be linked to rewards and that collective bargaining agreements could facilitate that process. However, in view of the opinions expressed by various members, the amendment was withdrawn.
- 275.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment illustrating that the Employers’ group was interested in linking competencies to rewards. The Workers’ group objected to the amendment on the grounds that it was highly prescriptive. The Employers’ group withdrew the amendment.
- 276.** The Government member of Norway introduced an amendment saying that, apart from enterprises, sectors and industries, skills were required to be recognized even by the educational institutions.

- 
- 277.** The proposed amendment was subamended by the Employers' group by adding the words "whether public or private" after the words "educational institutions". The Workers' group supported the proposal. The amendment was adopted as subamended.
- 278.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment to the ninth sentence replacing the words "with a stronger female component" with the words "with a predominant number of women workers". The Employer Vice-Chairperson did not support the amendment.
- 279.** The Government members of New Zealand, Canada, and United States supported the proposed amendment. The Employers' group offered a subamendment replacing the amendment phrase with "with an overall stronger female component". The Workers' group supported the subamendment. The amendment was adopted as subamended.
- 280.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment concerning the globalization of the world economy and the tendency for this to lead to greater informal employment with a disproportionate impact on women in terms of the precariousness of their employment. The Employers' group opposed the amendment which was withdrawn.
- 281.** The Government member of the United States introduced an amendment, submitted jointly by the Government members of Australia, Canada, United Kingdom and United States, to add to the end of the fifteenth sentence a statement concerning research into recognition of prior learning "and the compatibility of national systems". The Employer Vice-Chairperson did not support the amendment. The Worker Vice-Chairperson offered a subamendment, replacing the word "compatibility" with "comparability" as an effort to highlight that the intention of the original amendment was not for the purpose of integrating national systems but to investigate similarities and differences across systems. The Government member of India opposed the amendment. The Government member of New Zealand supported the amendment. The 11th sitting of the Committee was adjourned without reaching a decision concerning adoption of the proposed amendment.
- 282.** The Chairperson confirmed that paragraphs 1-8 and 14-16, as amended, were adopted by consensus, except paragraph 7 which was adopted after a vote.
- 283.** The Government member of Portugal expressed the view that in the experience of the European Union it was very difficult to expect a high level of compatibility of national qualifications systems.
- 284.** In view of the misunderstandings that had arisen regarding the original amendment, the Government member of the United States proposed a subamendment as follows:
- The ILO should develop a database on best practices in developing a national qualifications framework, conduct a general study on the compatibility of different national qualifications frameworks based on this database, and undertake research into recognition of prior learning.
- 285.** The Employers' group supported the subamendment. The Workers' group also supported the amendment as subamended. The amendment as subamended was adopted.

#### Paragraph 18

- 286.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment deleting the text bracketed at the end of paragraph 18. The Employer Vice-Chairperson explained that what was referred to in paragraph 18 was the issue of governance and implementation of training

---

programmes at the enterprise level. As far as the Employers' group was concerned it was not appropriate to discuss governance within this paragraph.

- 287.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson remarked that all partners have responsibility for training which meant, in the view of the Workers' group, that governance arrangements should also be included.
- 288.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson noted that the tripartite mandate could not be applied to training at the enterprise level. The Worker Vice-Chairperson stated that the real test of the Employers' group's commitment to tripartism was in the sphere where they had the most influence – the enterprise level. He asked the governments to prevail on the Committee that collective bargaining is a good method for governance and implementation.
- 289.** The Government member of France offered a subamendment, as follows, in an effort to reach a consensus: "At the sector and enterprise levels, collective bargaining can provide the appropriate conditions for the organization and implementation of training."
- 290.** The Government member of Ethiopia suggested an attempt to bridge the gap between different members of the Committee by utilizing the formulation "... through shared and participative management ..." instead of the term "governance".
- 291.** The Government member of Australia supported the Employers' group's proposed amendment because different enterprises had different systems for governing and implementing training. In Australia, vocational education in enterprises is very much governed by agreements based on market choices of the partners. While there was no objection to tripartite agreements at the aggregate level, Australia supported the Employers' group's proposed amendment.
- 292.** The Government member of New Zealand stated that training is part of broader employment relations and, where these relations are expressed in a collective form, it is appropriate for training to be covered. If the words "can provide" are used then the text becomes a statement of fact and on that basis he would support either the suggestion of the Government members of France or Ethiopia.
- 293.** The Government member of Luxembourg did not support the amendment proposed by the Employers' group. In the European Union the situation described in the formulation in brackets is recognized.
- 294.** The Government member of Poland noted that for the Employers' group the controversial word was "governance". If one examined the text of the proposed subamendments, which spelled out what is meant by "governance", then the discussion on the proposed amendment could be disposed of.
- 295.** The Government member of France suggested consideration of the following modified formulation for the replacement of the text in brackets: "at sector and enterprise level collective bargaining can allow appropriate conditions to be set for the organization and implementation of training".
- 296.** The Workers' group offered a subamendment to the above formulation so that the sentence read as follows: "particularly at the sector and enterprise levels, collective bargaining can set appropriate conditions for the organization and implementation of training". The amendment was adopted as subamended.

---

**297.** The Workers' group submitted an amendment to insert a new sentence at the end. The proposed amendment was subamended by the Workers' group as follows:

Such collective bargaining can provide an opportunity to develop a framework for the development and implementation of training at the enterprise and/or sector levels. Enterprise and sector training should encompass issues such as:

- skills required by enterprises and the economy;
- training necessary for workers;
- skills audits;
- development of career paths for workers;
- personal training and development plans for workers;
- facilities needed to allow the maximum benefits from training;
- assessment of skills gained in the workplace;
- recognition and reward schemes, including remuneration structuring.

**298.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson stated that the subamendment sought a comprehensive grasp of the issues on the role of social partners in training at all levels.

**299.** The Employers' group did not support the amendment on the grounds that it overlapped with what had already been stated in paragraph 18. The Government member of Poland agreed with the Employers' group that there was an overlap in so far as the first sentence was concerned. He felt that the second sentence of the proposed amendment could be retained. The Government members of Canada and Finland supported the amendment.

**300.** The Government member of France agreed with the Workers' group that it would be useful to indicate examples of subjects to be discussed. In referring to the proposed subamendment, she suggested that the first sentence be dropped; the item "skills audit" should be deleted from the list; and that the item "assessment of skills gained in the workplace" be amended to read as "assessment of basic skills and skills gained in the workplace or during individual or associative activities".

**301.** The Government members of Luxembourg, Portugal and United Kingdom supported the subamendment proposed by France. The Government member of Luxembourg stated that the item "facilities needed to allow the maximum benefits from training" in the proposed amendment appeared to be loosely worded and needed to be modified. He expressed doubts concerning the term "individual and associative activities" that were used in paragraph 18 of the conclusions.

**302.** The Government member of Ethiopia suggested that the items listed could be made into a shorter list by grouping them together appropriately. The Government member of the United States supported the proposed subamendment. He observed that it would not be useful to devote time in fine-tuning the list. The Government member of the United Kingdom agreed with this viewpoint but noted that such an exercise was unnecessary since the list was only an indicative list.

---

**303.** After consultations, the Employers' and Workers' groups agreed to the subamendment proposed by the Government member of France. The amendment, as subamended, was adopted to read as follows:

Such collective bargaining could encompass items such as:

- skills required by enterprises and the economy;
- training necessary for workers;
- assessment of basic skills and other skills gained either in the workplace or during individual or associative activities;
- development of career paths for workers;
- personal training and development plans for workers;
- recognition and reward schemes, including remuneration structuring.

#### Paragraph 12

**304.** An amendment was submitted by the Employers' group to delete the words "[currently]" in the first sentence. The Employer Vice-Chairperson introduced the amendment by stating that he did not believe in the potential existence of a universal model of investing in training, whether in the past, present or future. The amendment was adopted.

**305.** An amendment was submitted by the Employers' group replacing the words "of increasing resources for training" by the words "to foster investment in training". The Employer Vice-Chairperson remarked that paragraph 12 considered models for promoting investment in training and hence the word "foster" was more appropriate. The phrase "increase investment in training" was documented a number of times elsewhere in the conclusions and therefore the reference was repetitive.

**306.** The Government member of Portugal stated that the paragraph should relate to the concept of stimulating investment in training and hence, the use of a stronger term such as "increasing" was preferred. The Government member of Luxembourg supported the Government member of Portugal.

**307.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson commented that in some countries, particularly the developing countries, there was a need to find ways of increasing resources for investment in training. The Workers' group offered a subamendment, which was to replace the words "of increasing resources for training" by the words "to foster investment in training and increase resources for training". The amendment as subamended by the Worker Vice-Chairperson was adopted.

**308.** The Employers' group submitted an amendment deleting the fifth through the eighth sentences in brackets. The Employer Vice-Chairperson commented that there was a need for individuals and enterprises to be seen as being more self-reliant and that the interactive relationships between government, individuals and enterprises should consider and determine the appropriate means of financing training. Considering the special needs of smaller enterprises and developing countries, the introduction of a levy system would either force some firms out of business or would push them into the informal sector.

**309.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson defended the original, bracketed text and put forward an argument for a reclaimable national levy system. He first noted that a national levy system

---

did not preclude the tripartite element. He stated that there was a training dilemma in society and that, in some cases, individual companies did not have sufficient incentives to invest resulting in an under-investment in training overall. He argued that a compulsory national system would make all companies contribute to funding and the ability to reclaim levies would provide incentives to companies to invest more in training.

- 310.** The Government member of Mali generally opposed the amendment and suggested a subamendment deleting the seventh sentence in the original bracketed text. He expressed his opposition to the implementation of a reimbursement mechanism.
- 311.** In the view of the Government member of France, the bracketed text was prematurely embarking on the drafting of a new Recommendation. She suggested requesting the ILO to conduct comparative studies, the conclusions of which could be included in a new Recommendation. The Government member of France proposed a subamendment deleting the fifth through eighth sentences and adding at the end of the fourth sentence the following words: “taking account of the essential role of enterprises in such investments”. This subamendment was supported by the Employers’ group.
- 312.** The Government member of Portugal agreed that it was premature to go into detail at this stage and supported the subamendment proposed by the Government member of France.
- 313.** In the viewpoint of the Government member of Namibia the text related to the levy system, as elaborated by the Workers’ group, was very clear and therefore the bracketed text should remain.
- 314.** Although he supported the sentiment of the subamendment of the Government member of France, the Government member of Luxembourg suggested that the wording of the subamendment was too diluted and proposed a subamendment as follows: “Enterprises have an essential role to play concerning the increase in investment in training. For this, a number of mechanisms should be used, to be defined according to circumstances, together with an increase in investment in training.”
- 315.** The Government member of New Zealand noted that in the discussions the issue of tripartite partnership and collective bargaining had been discussed often. A levy might be the most effective method of financing training but it was up to the partners to decide. The Government member of New Zealand therefore supported the subamendment proposed by the Government member of France.
- 316.** The Government member of the United Kingdom stated that it is the responsibility of the ILO to conduct comparative studies so that everyone could learn from each other. Furthermore, it would be premature to select a particular method for financing training at this stage. The Government member of the United Kingdom noted the related amendment proposed by the Government members of Australia, Canada, Denmark, United Kingdom and United States.
- 317.** The Government member of the United Arab Emirates stated that the issue at hand was very important because investing in training is investing in human resource development. Mechanisms are required to finance training, and partnerships can facilitate this process. Government had a regulatory role to play but it is not, in the view of the Government member of the United Arab Emirates, enough to have only voluntary efforts. For this reason, the original text should be retained.
- 318.** The Government member of Malaysia noted that the success of the levy scheme in Malaysia led him to support retention of the original text.

- 
- 319.** In the viewpoint of the Government member of Poland, there was a general consensus around the need for more investment in training and for everyone to contribute. Nevertheless, he supported the view of the Government member of the United Kingdom that it was not appropriate to single out one method. The Government member of Canada was also of this opinion.
- 320.** The Government member of Australia commented on the experience of Australia and noted that the existence of a training levy fundamentally changed the process of decision-making regarding training. The existence of a levy distorted the decision-making process in Australia.
- 321.** The Employers' group supported the views of the Government members of Mali, France, Portugal and other countries, who had spoken about the need for the social partners to agree on instituting a levy. It was the social partners' prerogative to decide on the appropriate method. The Employers' group was in favour of the freedom of social dialogue and was prepared to consider supporting either the amendment proposed by the Government members of France or United Kingdom.
- 322.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson commented that the Government member of Mali had made a point at variance with the interpretation provided by the Employers' group. The Government member of Mali, in the view of the Workers' group, had spoken in favour of a modest levy without reclamation. The Workers' group did not agree with the notion that a levy system distorted the decision-making process regarding training. In the discussion some Government members had spoken positively of a levy but this was not central to the debate at this juncture.
- 323.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson proposed a sub-subamendment keeping the fifth and sixth sentence. He then asked for a vote on the subamendment proposed by the Government member of France.
- 324.** The Government member of Poland suggested a sub-subamendment moving the tenth sentence at the end of the sixth sentence as follows:

Enterprises have a critical role to play in investment in training. A number of mechanisms used in combination to further investment in training is required. These may include levy systems, training funds, public grants, various incentives for training and learning ... international best practice of investing in training.

- 325.** The Chairperson suggested establishment of a small working group to formulate a compromise text. Following some discussions and consultations, a working group composed of the Government members of France, Mali, United Kingdom, and the Employer and Worker Vice-Chairpersons was formed and met to work out an alternative text.
- 326.** An alternative text was agreed upon and was adopted by the Committee as follows:

Enterprises have a critical role to play in investment in training. A number of mechanisms used in combination to further investment in training is required. These may include levy systems on enterprises accompanied by public grants, establishment of training funds, various incentives for training and learning, e.g. tax rebates, training credits, training awards, individual training accounts, collective and individual training rights, sabbatical leave, higher wages for skills gained (and utilized) and collective agreements and emulation of national and international best practice of investing in training. Where levies are the chosen mechanism for funding training, the governance of fund distribution should be

---

tripartite or where these are agreed by social partners, such governance should be bipartite.

- 327.** The Chairperson thereafter announced that with the adoption of the alternative text, all other amendments to the text in brackets under discussion would fall.
- 328.** An amendment was moved by the Government members of Australia, Canada, Denmark, United Kingdom and United States seeking to amend the ninth sentence to read: “Decisions regarding government policies on education and training should be based on genuine social dialogue, including discussion of the best ways and means for the social partners to increase their investments in training.”
- 329.** The Employers’ and the Workers’ groups did not support the amendment. On suggestion from the Chairperson to reconsider the matter, the Government member of the United Kingdom withdrew the amendment.
- 330.** The Chairperson invited views on the retention or otherwise of the words “and utilized” which were in brackets in paragraph 12. During the discussion, the Worker Vice-Chairperson suggested deletion of the words “higher wages for skills gained and utilized”. The proposal was adopted by consensus.
- 331.** Noting the special importance of training investments in small and medium-sized enterprises, the Employer Vice-Chairperson proposed an amendment to add a sentence at the end of the tenth sentence of paragraph 12 as follows: “The chosen mechanism should take into account the special needs of SMEs.” The Worker Vice-Chairperson supported the amendment. The amendment was adopted by consensus.
- 332.** The Employers’ group submitted an amendment to delete the final sentence of paragraph 12: “[Facilities to increase access to training should be provided such as childcare, paid education leave and career breaks.]”. The Employer Vice-Chairperson noted that the issue of facilities provision was better placed in the context of collective bargaining (paragraph 18) and not in the context of funding.
- 333.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson opposed the amendment, and strongly put forward an argument that one of the overall messages that came out of the general discussion was that lack of facilities was one of the key factors that restricted access to training for a large number of people.
- 334.** The Government member of Portugal offered a subamendment to add the words “development of support services for the families and individuals” after the words “sabbatical leave,” in the previous sentence. She argued that this placement was valid since provision of facilities such as childcare, paid education leave and career breaks could be considered as examples of policies to increase investment and accessibility in training. The Government member of France supported the subamendment.
- 335.** The Government members of New Zealand and Nigeria opposed the amendment and stated that the existing bracketed sentence should be included in the concluding remarks, while the Government member of the United Arab Emirates supported the amendment.
- 336.** In expressing his opinion on the amendment as subamended by the Government member of Portugal, the Worker Vice-Chairperson strongly argued in favour of adoption since provision of facilities was understood as playing a key role in ensuring accessibility. The importance of the facility provisions should be clearly stated.

- 
- 337.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson proposed a sub-subamendment to the amendment as subamended by the Government member of Portugal. In view of the Workers' group's insistence that the conclusions need to address the issue of access to training, as well as the role of facilities, the amendment as sub-subamended by the Employer Vice-Chairperson was to insert the words "and to guarantee access" between the words "to further investment in training" and "is required" in the fifth sentence of the paragraph.
- 338.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson suggested a sub-sub-subamendment to the amendment as sub-subamended by the Employers' group to replace the final sentence of paragraph 12 by the words "Measures such as the provision of childcare facilities are needed to facilitate access to training." The amendment as sub-sub-subamended by the Workers' group was adopted by consensus.

#### Paragraph 9

- 339.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment to delete the word "flexibly" in the third sentence of paragraph 9. While the Workers' group supported the idea of moving in and out of the labour market, they felt that using the term "flexibility" was superfluous and made the sentence somewhat contentious.
- 340.** The Employers' group suggested retaining the word "flexibly" and adding the concept "mobility on" before the "labour market". The Workers' group and the Government member of Poland opposed the subamendment. The Government member of France offered a subamendment inserting after "laid off," "and move into the labour market ...". The amendment as subamended by the Government member of France was adopted.
- 341.** The Government member of Papua New Guinea introduced an amendment to the fourth sentence of paragraph 9 adding the words "and training" after "education". The Government member of Australia seconded the amendment. The Employers' and Workers' groups supported the amendment. The amendment was adopted.
- 342.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment to delete the words "... as employees, entrepreneurs, or workers including those undertaking community-based activities" in the fifth sentence as there was no value in its retention. The Employer Vice-Chairperson supported the amendment. The amendment was adopted.
- 343.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment adding a sentence at the end of the fifth sentence of paragraph 9 as follows: "Employability also covers the ability to understand and individually or collectively, to influence working conditions and the social environment." The Workers' group was of the opinion that there had been a convergence of thinking in the general discussion that the concept of employability should be broadly defined and that therefore including the notion that employability also involved the ability to influence working conditions and the social environment was recommended, as outlined in Convention No. 142.
- 344.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson did not support the amendment because the ideas included in it were not part of employability. The Government members of Ethiopia, Japan, Sweden and Poland supported this viewpoint.
- 345.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson recalled that Convention No. 142 had not been criticized during the general discussion and therefore was implicitly supported by the Committee.
- 346.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson repeated that he agreed that the issues were very important but should not be included within the concept of employability. The Chairperson

---

proposed a vote by show of hands and the amendment was rejected by 4,410 votes in favour, 4,704 against, with 210 abstentions.

- 347.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment to replace the bracketed words in the sixth sentence of paragraph 9 with the following: “Entrepreneurship can contribute to creating opportunities for employment and hence to employability”. The Employers’ group supported the amendment. The amendment was adopted.
- 348.** The Government member of Canada introduced an amendment submitted by the Government members of Australia, Canada, Denmark, United Kingdom and United States to remove in the seventh sentence the square brackets around the words “the opportunity for job security, through continuing employability”.
- 349.** The Employers’ group supported the amendment as did the Government members of New Zealand, Portugal and India.
- 350.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson offered a subamendment. He suggested that out of all the words in the two brackets only “sustainable employment” should be kept.
- 351.** The Employers’ group supported the proposal of the Workers’ group. The amendment as subamended was adopted.
- 352.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment to delete the eighth sentence of paragraph 9. The Employer Vice-Chairperson noted that employability was a broad concept and it was not appropriate to emphasize only one aspect of it, hence the proposal for deletion of the sentence. The Workers’ group was of the view that since occupational safety and health was one of the important concerns for the ILO as well as for workers’ organizations, it would be useful to maintain the text as it was in the document. The Government members of Canada and New Zealand also supported retaining the original text.
- 353.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson clarified that employability, apart from the concept of securing jobs also included the concept of retaining jobs, and it was in that context that occupational safety and health became important. He also pointed out that some of the other elements that promoted employability also featured in the text. He reiterated his plea for retention of the existing text. The Employers’ group withdrew the amendment.
- 354.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson suggested returning to the bracketed part of the third sentence of paragraph 9 and proposed to delete the brackets. The Worker Vice-Chairperson stated that there were two views on this subject – that skills, knowledge and attitudes would enhance a worker’s employability or that skills, knowledge and abilities would enhance employability. The Workers’ group would agree with the use of the word “abilities” but not “attitudes”.
- 355.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson stated that the Employers’ group would agree to the inclusion of both “attitudes” and “abilities” because, in their view, reference to attitudes was now in common use in the educational context and attitudes were very important for employment in terms of, for example, accuracy, care for clients, attitudes to safety and health, etc. Therefore, he proposed retaining the word “attitudes”.
- 356.** In the view of the Workers’ group “attitudes” was not appropriate and there was no universal application of the concepts of skills, knowledge and attitudes. Instead, skills, knowledge and abilities was more commonly used. The question of “attitudes” raised issues of “appropriate attitudes”. Furthermore it was difficult to measure attitudes and even

---

more difficult to certify attitudes. There were questions that could be raised about who determined whether an attitude is a good one or not. In his view, there are employers who would regard trade union membership as an example of a negative attitude for employment. For these reasons, “abilities” would be a more acceptable word.

- 357.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson recognized that the measurement of attitudes was problematic but certain attitudes were nevertheless very important for employment. In addition, a positive attitude to learning was very important as well as for recruitment. The Employers’ group insisted on retaining the word “attitudes”.
- 358.** The Government member of New Zealand proposed “skills, knowledge and other attributes” as an alternative formulation. The Government member of India considered that indeed “attitudes” were rather subjective and therefore “aptitude” might be a better formulation, since it related more specifically to the job context.
- 359.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson expressed satisfaction that the Employers’ group had recognized the problem of measuring attitudes. However, he thought that the examples used by the Employers’ group were not in fact examples of attitudes. For example, he felt that accuracy was an ability, whereas knowledge of safety and health related to knowledge. Despite strongly preferring the use of the term “ability”, the Workers’ group was prepared to accept the proposal of India as a compromise.
- 360.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson said that the inclusion of “attitudes” and “abilities” would be perfect but wished to correct the Worker Vice-Chairperson regarding safety and health. He said that the attitudes which would improve safety and health at the work place were key.
- 361.** In the view of the Government member of France, “attitude” was an ambiguous term since employers might expect employees to have appropriate attitudes towards work but others might expect moral values too which was dangerous.
- 362.** Following consultations with the Workers’ group, the Employer Vice-Chairperson announced that a compromise decision had been reached in which the words “attitudes and abilities” appearing in square brackets in the third sentence of paragraph 9 should be replaced by the word “competencies”. The Workers’ group supported the subamendment. The amendment as subamended was adopted.

#### Paragraph 10

- 363.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment to insert the words “guaranteeing universal access” to the first sentence of paragraph 10 as an effort to strengthen the text. The Employers’ group supported the amendment. The amendment was adopted.
- 364.** The Government member of Ethiopia introduced an amendment to insert the following after the first sentence of paragraph 10: “The dire socio-economic situations of African countries particularly of the least developed countries is a cause for serious concern.” The Government member of Ethiopia said that the conditions prevailing in the African countries needed to be especially highlighted and that was the reason for moving the amendment. The Government member of Nigeria seconded the amendment.
- 365.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson opposed the amendment, stating that such a sentence should be placed in paragraph 16, which dealt with developing countries in particular. Considering paragraph 16 had already been adopted, the Worker Vice-Chairperson offered a subamendment, which was to insert a new sentence: “This is especially true for the least

---

developed countries most of which are in Africa, given their dire socio-economic situation.” after the fourth sentence of paragraph 10. The amendment as subamended by the Workers’ group was adopted.

- 366.** The Workers’ group submitted an amendment to insert at the end of the second sentence after the word “combated” the words “both by anti-discrimination regulations as by common action of social partners”. The Worker Vice-Chairperson introduced the amendment by stating that the sentence should be made more concrete by providing some of the practical measures. The amendment was adopted.
- 367.** The Employers’ group submitted an amendment to delete the word “often” before “may” in the fifth sentence. The Employer Vice-Chairperson introduced the amendment by stating that “may” more appropriately reflected the current situation in the world.
- 368.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson offered a subamendment to the amendment, to replace the words “often may” by the words “in many cases”. The Employer Vice-Chairperson offered a subamendment to the amendment to replace the words “often may” by the words “in certain cases”, and stated the Employers’ group’s position clearly was that the wording should be either as offered in the amendment or as offered in his subamendment. The Government member of Ethiopia proposed “in a number of cases”. The Worker Vice-Chairperson agreed.
- 369.** The amendment as subamended by the Government member of Ethiopia was accepted by consensus.
- 370.** The Employers’ group submitted an amendment to delete in the fifth sentence of paragraph 10 the second bracketed words “[especially in developing countries]”. In light of the new sentence added to the paragraph relating to the specific needs of the developing countries, he suggested a further subamendment to delete the first bracketed words “[especially in developing countries]”. The amendment as subamended by the Worker Vice-Chairperson was adopted by consensus.
- 371.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment to delete the sixth sentence “[Market ... training.]” in paragraph 10. In introducing the amendment, the Employer Vice-Chairperson stated that the sentence was an inappropriate characterization of the current world situation and trends. By citing an example of the ICT sector in the Silicon Valley, he argued that individual mobility across enterprises was not a factor resulting in under-investment in education and training. He expressed his strong opposition to the inclusion of the sentence concerned in the conclusions.
- 372.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson opposed the amendment and stated that the general view that emerged from the general discussion was that, in developing countries in particular, the situation of global economic crisis had led to a decrease in investment in education and training due to resource constraints.
- 373.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson noted that given that the Workers’ group’s argument was concerned with developing countries in particular, he suggested a subamendment to place the sentence concerned after the sentence: “However ... training.” The Government member of Ethiopia offered a subamendment to the amendment as subamended by the Employer Vice-Chairperson to replace the first word “This” by the words “Furthermore, this” in the newly adopted sentence. The amendment as sub-subamended by the Government member of Ethiopia was adopted.

---

## Paragraph 13

- 374.** The Employers' group moved an amendment to replace the seventh sentence of paragraph 13 by the sentence: "Countries should also provide incentives for the private sector and individuals to encourage computer literacy and new communication skills to develop." The Employer Vice-Chairperson said that ICT skills deserved high priority and this was why the amendment was introduced.
- 375.** The Workers' group offered a subamendment to replace the words "Countries should" with the words "Government may". The Government member of Ethiopia suggested that the sentence could start with the words "Governments are encouraged to ..." in place of "Governments may ..." as suggested by the Workers' group. The Government members of France and New Zealand supported the subamendment as moved by the Workers' group.
- 376.** The Employers' group supported the subamendment proposed by the Workers' group. The amended sentence read as follows: "Governments may also provide incentives for the private sector and individuals to encourage computer literacy and new communication skills to develop." The amendment as subamended was adopted.
- 377.** The Employers' group introduced an amendment to delete the twelfth sentence of paragraph 13 that was within the square brackets. The Workers' group offered a subamendment in which only the words "e.g. paid education leave" were deleted and wished to retain the other parts of the sentence. The Employers' group agreed with the subamendment as proposed by the Workers' group. The amendment as subamended by the Workers' group was adopted.

## Paragraph 19

- 378.** The Workers' group proposed an amendment to replace the word "maintain" in the first sentence of paragraph 19 with the word "strengthen". The Worker Vice-Chairperson introduced the amendment by stating his impression of the consensus that emerged from the general discussion was that there was a need for strengthening the social dialogue on training. The amendment was adopted by consensus.
- 379.** The Government member of Japan submitted an amendment to replace the word "must" in the third sentence by the word "should". The Government member of India seconded the amendment. In his introduction to the amendment, the Government member of Japan noted that the word "must" was a little too strong. The amendment was adopted by consensus.
- 380.** The Employers' group submitted an amendment to replace the word "framework" by the word "dialogue" in the fourth sentence. The Employer Vice-Chairperson introduced the amendment by noting that a "framework" could not resolve the effort to coordinate education and training policy and that it was the dialogue between social partners that could result in coordination.
- 381.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson opposed the amendment and commented that the word "framework" was meant to capture the need for a nationally coordinated education and training policy. The Worker Vice-Chairperson proposed a subamendment which was to insert "for dialogue and partnership" after the words "This framework".
- 382.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson proposed another subamendment to insert the words "The dialogue in" at the beginning of the sentence before the words "This framework ...". The amendment as subamended by the Employer Vice-Chairperson was supported by the Government member of France.

- 
- 383.** The Government member of New Zealand offered a subamendment which was to delete the word “framework” between the words “This” and “should”. The amendment as sub-subamended by the Government member of New Zealand was adopted by consensus.
- 384.** The Government members of Australia, Canada, Denmark, United Kingdom and United States submitted an amendment to insert the words “and consultative” before the word “national” and to replace the word “boards” after the words “national and sector training” in the fifth sentence by the word “partnerships”. In the introduction to the amendment, the Government member of the United Kingdom stated that the main concern lay with the words “training boards” which was far too specific a term since different countries have different terminology for organizations undertaking similar initiatives.
- 385.** The Workers’ group offered a subamendment that was to replace the word “partnerships” by the word “structures” and to delete the word “consultative” between the words “tripartite,” and “national”.
- 386.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson proposed a subamendment to the amendment as subamended by the Worker Vice-Chairperson, which was to replace the word “structures” after the words “sector training” by the word “arrangements”.
- 387.** The amendment as sub-subamended by the Employer Vice-Chairperson was adopted.
- 388.** The Chairperson concluded the 13th sitting of the Committee by noting that the paragraphs 17, 18, 12, 9, 10, 13 and 19 had been adopted, as amended by consensus, except for paragraph 9 after a vote by a show of hands.

#### Paragraph 11

- 389.** Introducing an amendment the Worker Vice-Chairperson announced that a subamended text had been agreed upon with the Employers’ group for consideration by the Committee. The text read as follows:

The cost of education and training should be seen as an investment. Increasing this investment can be fostered by recognizing that investing in education and training can be a shared responsibility of both the public and private sector. Government must always assume the primary responsibility for investing in basic education and initial training as well as invest in other forms of education and training. Government must also assume the greatest responsibility for investments directed at groups where combating social exclusion or discrimination is an important objective. Governments must also assume responsibility to invest in training as an employer. With respect to the private sector, the responsibilities of both enterprises and individuals should be recognized and, where appropriate, encouraged. These responsibilities are especially appropriate with respect to workplace-based and continuous education, which can raise workers’ employability and the competitiveness of enterprises. The organization and implementation of private sector responsibilities in this area can best be accomplished through partnerships between the government and enterprises or between government and the social partners or between the social partners. Ensuring increased investment for SMEs is especially suitable to a partnership approach. With respect to individuals, the government must also assume responsibility in order that access not be denied on financial grounds and to the detriment of the broader interest of society.

The Employer Vice-Chairperson expressed his full agreement with the submitted text.

- 
- 390.** The Government member of the United Kingdom stated that she had no major problems with the text of the subamendment but suggested adding the words “and individuals” after “groups” in the fourth sentence and removing the last sentence.
- 391.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson proposed to leave the text as submitted to avoid having to include important elements of the last sentence in the text of the fourth sentence, for example, the question of denial of access on financial grounds. He thought that this would make the fourth sentence rather convoluted.
- 392.** The Government member of Ethiopia supported the amendment as subamended by the Workers’ group but questioned the reasoning behind the concept of “... invest in other forms of education and training”.
- 393.** The Government member of New Zealand agreed with the position of the Government member of the United Kingdom and added that the subamendment assumed that individuals do not have any responsibility. He proposed to add the issue of the denial of access on financial grounds to the fourth sentence.
- 394.** The Government member of Luxembourg expressed some doubts regarding the proposal from the Government member of Ethiopia and mentioned that in Luxembourg and in the European Union there is a shifting of responsibility towards the social partners so that the government and the social partners really do share responsibilities.
- 395.** The Government member of Sweden supported the position of the Government member of Luxembourg.
- 396.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson said that in the third sentence the notion of primary responsibility was used to indicate that the government did not have the sole responsibility. The third sentence also indicated, in his view, that with regard to other forms of education and training it was explicit that the government is not expected to have primary responsibility for every type of education and training. The fourth sentence stated that the government should have the greatest responsibility because the sentence refers to social outcomes. Furthermore, he pointed out that, in the Workers’ group’s view, the last sentence does not claim that the individual has no responsibility but that the government has a responsibility to ensure that individuals are not excluded because of financial difficulties, which was to the detriment of society. He proposed the following sub-subamendments:
- (a) in the sentence beginning “These responsibilities ...” to add the words “investment in” before “workplace-based”;
  - (b) to shift the last sentence to follow the sentence which ends “... an important objective” and to replace the word “share” for “assume”.

The Employer Vice-Chairperson agreed with these proposals.

- 397.** The Government member of Ethiopia thanked the Workers’ group for the suggestions and proposed reformulating the third sentence so that after “... initial training” the sentence would read “... and investment in other forms of education and training needs to be given appropriate consideration”.
- 398.** The Government members of United Kingdom and Sweden agreed to the sub-subamendments of the Workers’ group.

- 
- 399.** The Government member of Luxembourg agreed with the Workers' group sub-subamendments but also supported the proposal by the Government member of Ethiopia. He had difficulties with the notion that governments must always assume the greatest responsibility.
- 400.** The Government member of Ethiopia submitted a subamendment to the amendment to insert the word "While" at the beginning of the third sentence and to replace the words "as well as invest in other forms of education and training" by the words ", investment in other forms of education and training must be given appropriate consideration".
- 401.** The Government members of Luxembourg and France strongly opposed the usage of the words "the greatest" after the words "Government must also assume" in the fourth sentence and suggested a subamendment to replace the words "the greatest" by the words "a shared". The Government member of Luxembourg added that his Government cannot accept that the text expressly confirms the view that governments would have to assume the "greatest responsibility" concerning training of groups at risk. As stated by the Worker Vice-Chairperson, these are social problems and therefore all actors in society should assume their share of responsibility in the implementation of training and education of groups at risk or the excluded. This implied a shared responsibility and notably a direct responsibility of the social partners. For this reason, this philosophy was adopted by the Heads of States and Governments of the European Union at the Summits of Luxembourg (1997) and Lisbon (2000). The Government member of Luxembourg accepted with reservations the replacement of the term "greatest" by the term "major", with the sole purpose of reaching a compromise. His agreement did not in any way alter the basic position of the Government of Luxembourg.
- 402.** With regard to the third sentence, the Worker Vice-Chairperson noted the word "consideration" was too weak and unspecific and proposed a subamendment to replace the words "as well as" by the words ", and it should also". The subamendment was adopted by consensus.
- 403.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson explained that in a number of countries social exclusion is a problem, which governments have a responsibility to solve. The proposed reformulation recognizes this. It does not say that only the government should make investments or that the government has sole responsibility; only that the government should have the greatest responsibility in this area. Its wording should not be interpreted to imply that the private sector has no role to play in combating social exclusion or discrimination.
- 404.** The Government members of Luxembourg, France and Sweden remained unsatisfied with the usage of the words "the greatest", and asked specifically for the report to reflect their opinions and the clarification for the continued usage of the words provided by the Worker Vice-Chairperson. The amendment was adopted by consensus.

#### Paragraph 21

- 405.** The Government members of Canada, United Kingdom, Australia, Denmark and United States submitted an amendment to replace the words "by means of ..." by the words "by various ways which may include technical cooperation and assistance to trade union and employer organizations, learnerships, exchanging experiences and best practices between countries". In her introduction of the amendment, the Government member of Canada remarked that the words "public grants" were too restrictive and prescriptive and that they precluded other policies that the governments may prefer to use. The Government members of Australia and France expressed their support for the remarks made by the Government member of Canada.

- 
- 406.** The Worker and Employer Vice-Chairpersons opposed the amendment. Before proceeding any further with the amendment, the Employer Vice-Chairperson suggested consideration of another amendment on the grounds that they were linked and that if it were to be adopted, it may resolve the concerns raised in support of the amendment under current consideration.
- 407.** The Employers' group submitted an amendment to replace the words "on trade union matters" in the fifth sentence by the words "the work and the organization of social partners". The Employers' group proposed a subamendment to insert the words ", on trade union education, business administration and the social contribution by" before the words "and the work and the organization of social partners".
- 408.** The Workers' group supported the amendment as subamended by the Employers' group. The amendment as subamended by the Employers' group was adopted by consensus.
- 409.** The Government members of Australia, Netherlands, and France stated that adoption of this amendment still did not fully address the concerns raised by the amendment submitted by the Government members of Canada, United Kingdom, Australia, Denmark and United States.
- 410.** In an attempt to take into account the concerns raised by the Government members of Canada, United Kingdom, Australia, Denmark and United States, the Employers' group submitted a subamendment to keep the original sentence in the conclusions and to insert the words "such as" after the words "by means". The amendment as subamended by the Employers' group was supported by the Workers' group.
- 411.** The Government members of Canada, United Kingdom, Australia, Denmark and United States supported the amendment as subamended by the Employers' group on the grounds that the insertion of the words "such as" to the original sentence sufficiently demonstrated that the measures subsequently listed in the sentence were simply examples and not a prescriptive list.
- 412.** The amendment as subamended by the Employers' group was adopted.

## Paragraph 22

- 413.** The Worker Vice-Chairperson introduced an amendment to paragraph 22. He suggested that as a matter of procedure, the sixth sentence between the square brackets should be considered first. Based on an agreement between the Workers' and the Employers' groups, he submitted a subamendment to insert the words "present conclusions, adopted by the International Labour Conference, at its 88th Session, 2000, the conclusions of the Cologne Charter, 1999, the statements on this subject jointly made by international employer and trade union organizations, and the" between the words "should be based on the" and "following:"; to insert the words "and address the economic challenges" after the words "(2) enhance employability of the world's workers"; and to delete the fifth sentence.
- 414.** The Employer Vice-Chairperson proposed a subamendment to the amendment as subamended by the Workers' group to insert the words "should include" after the words "trade union organizations, and". The Workers' group supported the amendment as sub-sub-subamended by the Employers' group.
- 415.** The Government member of France requested the consideration of an amendment in the sixth sentence to change point (7) to point (1), renumber the subsequent points (point (1) would now become (2), (2) becomes (3), etc.), and replace the words "advance the decent

---

work concept through defining the role of education and training” in former point (1) by the words “promote the concept of lifelong education and training to ensure a place for everyone in a rapidly and profoundly changing world, and decent work for all”. She emphasized that the concept of lifelong learning should be included in the terms of reference.

- 416.** The proposal to include the concept of lifelong learning in the sixth sentence was supported by the Government members of Finland, Luxembourg, United Kingdom and Canada.
- 417.** The Workers’ and Employers’ groups supported the placement of point (7) to point (1) and the subsequent renumbering of the following points. In order to include the concept of lifelong learning, they proposed a subamendment to the amendment as sub-sub-subamended by the Employers’ group to insert the words “promote lifelong learning,” before the words “enhance employability of the world’s workers” on the grounds that the issue of lifelong learning related more closely to the issue of employability.
- 418.** The amendment as sub-sub-subamended by the Workers’ group was adopted by consensus.
- 419.** Some amendments fell as a result of adopting the new text for paragraph 22. Some other amendments, including those submitted by the Government members of Ethiopia and Japan and the Workers’ group, were not taken up due to lack of time.
- 420.** The Chairperson announced that paragraphs 11, 21 and 22, as amended, were adopted by consensus. Paragraph 20 had been removed.
- 421.** The Chairperson closed the session.

## **Consideration and adoption of the report**

### ***Consideration of the report***

- 422.** The Committee considered its draft report at its 15th sitting.
- 423.** Corrections to specific paragraphs were submitted by various members for incorporation in the report.

### ***Adoption of the report***

- 424.** At its 15th sitting the Committee unanimously adopted its report as amended.

Geneva, 13 June 2000.

(Signed) L. Mishra,  
Chairperson.

J. Chetwin,  
Reporter.

---

## **Resolution concerning human resources training and development**

The General Conference of the International Labour Organization, meeting in its 88th Session, 2000,

Having undertaken a general discussion on the basis of Report V, "Training for employment: Social inclusion, productivity and youth employment";

Adopts the following conclusions and invites the Governing Body to request the Director-General to give due consideration to them for the future work of the Office and to take them into account when preparing the programme and budget for the 2002-03 biennium.

---

## Conclusions concerning human resources training and development

1. A critical challenge that faces human society at the start of the twenty-first century is to attain full employment and sustained economic growth in the global economy and social inclusivity. The ILO's framework of decent work addresses both the quality and quantity of employment and provides a basis for new education and training policies and strategies. Human resources development, education and training contribute significantly to promoting the interests of individuals, enterprises, economy and society. By making individuals employable and informed citizens, human resources development and training contribute to economic development and to achieving full employment and promoting social inclusion. They also help individuals to gain access to decent work and good jobs, and escape poverty and marginalization. Education and skills formation could lead to less unemployment and to more equity in employment. The economy and society at large, like individuals and enterprises, benefit from human resources development and training. The economy becomes more productive, innovative and competitive through the existence of more skilled human potential. Human resources development and training also underpin the fundamental values of society – equity, justice, gender equality, non-discrimination, social responsibility, and participation.
2. Technological changes, changes in financial markets, the emergence of global markets for products and services, international competition, dramatic increases in foreign direct investment, new business strategies, new management practices, new forms of business organization and of the organization of work are among the more significant developments that are transforming the world of work. Many of these developments are also components of globalization which is the name given to the various processes producing the dramatically increased integration of economic activity in the world today. These developments offer both opportunities and challenges for enterprises, workers and countries. For enterprises increased competition has meant more winners and losers. For countries globalization has increased both national development and disadvantages as globalization has exacerbated differences in the relative advantages of countries. For some workers these developments have resulted in career opportunities or successful self-employment, improved living standards and prosperity but for other workers they have resulted in job insecurity or unemployment, declining living standards and poverty. Many of these developments are dramatically increasing the importance of the application of human knowledge and skills to economic activity. Human resources development, education and training are necessary and essential elements required to take both full advantage of the opportunities and to rise to the challenges of these developments for enterprises, workers and countries. There is a growing recognition that globalization has a social dimension that requires a social response. Education and training are components to both the economic and social response to globalization.
3. Education and training cannot alone address this challenge, but should go hand-in-hand with economic, employment and other policies to establish, in an equitable manner, the new knowledge and skills-based society in the global economy. Education and training have distinct but converging outcomes as society is changing. They have both a dual rationale: develop skills and knowledge that will help countries, enterprises and individuals utilize the new opportunities *and* enhance the employability, productivity and income-earning capacity of many population groups that have been adversely affected by globalization and changes in society at large. Education and training are necessary for economic and employment growth and social development. They also contribute to personal growth and provide the foundation of an informed citizenry. Education and training are a means to empower people, improve the quality and organization of work,

---

enhance citizens' productivity, raise workers' incomes, improve enterprise competitiveness, promote job security and social equity and inclusion. Education and training are therefore a central pillar of decent work. Education and training help individuals become more employable in rapidly changing internal and external labour markets.

4. Human resources training and development are fundamental, but are by themselves insufficient to ensure sustainable economic and social development, or resolve the aggregate employment challenge. They should be coherent and form an integrated part of comprehensive economic, labour market and social policies and programmes that promote economic and employment growth. Policies that expand aggregate demand in the economy such as macroeconomic and other measures must be combined with supply-side policies, e.g. science and technology, education and training, and industrial and enterprise policies. Appropriate fiscal policies, social security and collective bargaining are among the means to distribute these economic gains on a fair and equitable basis, and constitute basic incentives to invest in training. Pursuing these integrated policies requires consideration of a new financial and social architecture for the global economy, a subject for ILO research.
5. It is the task of basic education to ensure to each individual the full development of the human personality and citizenship; and to lay the foundation for employability. Initial training develops further his or her employability by providing general core work skills, and the underpinning knowledge, and industry-based and professional competencies which are portable and facilitate the transition into the world of work. Lifelong learning ensures that the individual's skills and competencies are maintained and improved as work, technology and skill requirements change; ensures the personal and career development of workers; results in increases in aggregate productivity and income; and improves social equity. Both in developed countries as well as in developing countries there are many workers without the basic skills for literacy and numeracy. National and international strategies have to be developed to eliminate illiteracy, based on concrete targets, benchmarks and quality assessment.
6. Education and training of high quality are major instruments to improve overall socio-economic conditions and to prevent and combat social exclusion and discrimination, particularly in employment. In order to be effective they must cover everyone, including disadvantaged groups. Therefore, they must be carefully targeted at women and persons with special needs, including rural workers; people with disabilities; older workers; the long-term unemployed, including low-skilled workers; young people; migrant workers; and workers laid off as a result of economic reform programmes, or industrial and enterprise restructuring. In addressing the needs of these groups, particularly of young people, access to a combination of formal, off-the-job, and workplace learning should be systematically offered and developed as it provides for effective learning outcomes and increases the chance of entering the labour market.
7. Training can be one of the instruments that, together with other measures, address the challenge of the informal sector. The informal sector is not a sector in the traditional sense of economic classification but a name given to the economic activity of persons in a variety of situations, most of which are survival activities. Informal sector work is unprotected work that is, for the most part, characterized by low earnings and low productivity. The role of training is not to prepare people for the informal sector and keep them in the informal sector; or to expand the informal sector; but rather it should go in conjunction with other instruments, such as fiscal policies, provision of credit, and extension of social protection and labour laws, to improve the performance of enterprises and the employability of workers in order to transform what are often marginal, survival activities into decent work fully integrated into mainstream economic life. Prior learning

---

and skills gained in the sector should be validated, as they will help the said workers gain access to the formal labour market. The social partners should be fully involved in developing these programmes.

8. Education and training are a right for all. Governments, in cooperation with the social partners, should ensure that this right is universally accessible. It is the responsibility of all persons to make use of the opportunities offered. Free universal, quality public primary and secondary education must be made available to all children, and they should not be denied sustained access to education through child labour. Education cannot be separated from training. Basic and secondary education is the foundation on which an effective vocational education and training system should be built. Good quality basic education and initial training, availability of adult and second chance education, together with a learning culture, ensure high levels of participation in continuous education and training. Qualified teachers and trainers are the fundamental key to providing quality education for helping children and adults reach high standards in academic and vocational competencies. Their recruitment, remuneration, education, training and retraining, assignment and provision of adequate facilities are critical elements of any successful educational system.

In addition to education and training, career guidance and job placement services (career development services) embracing career education, career counselling, employment counselling and educational, vocational and labour market information, all have a crucial role to play in human resources development. The fostering of a career development culture throughout education, training systems as well as employment services is a means to promote continuous learning. The development of this culture among youth and adults will be of particular importance for ensuring their employability and facilitating their transition from education and training to work or further training.

9. Employability is defined broadly. It is a key outcome of education and training of high quality, as well as a range of other policies. It encompasses the skills, knowledge and competencies that enhance a worker's ability to secure and retain a job, progress at work and cope with change, secure another job if she/he so wishes or has been laid off, and enter more easily into the labour market at different periods of the life cycle. Individuals are most employable when they have broad-based education and training, basic and portable high-level skills, including teamwork, problem solving, information and communications technology (ICT) and communication and language skills, learning to learn skills, and competencies to protect themselves and their colleagues against occupational hazards and diseases. This combination of skills enables them to adapt to changes in the world of work. Employability also covers multiple skills that are essential to secure and retain decent work. Entrepreneurship can contribute to creating opportunities for employment and hence to employability. Employability is, however, not a function only of training – it requires a range of other instruments which results in the existence of jobs, the enhancement of quality jobs, and sustainable employment. Workers' employability can only be sustained in an economic environment that promotes job growth and rewards individual and collective investments in human resources training and development.
10. There is tripartite and international consensus about guaranteeing universal access of all to, and increasing and optimizing overall investment in, basic education, initial training and continuous training. Discrimination which limits access to training should be combated both by anti-discrimination regulations as well as by common action of social partners. These principles have been endorsed already in the Tripartite Declaration of Principles concerning Multinational Enterprises and Social Policy adopted by the Governing Body, 1977. The Committee endorsed the core commitments made in the Cologne Charter of the Group of Eight leading industrialized nations (G8) in 1999 calling for renewed commitment of all partners to lifelong learning: "... by governments, investing to enhance

---

education and training at all levels; by the private sector, training existing and future employees; by individuals, developing their own abilities and careers". However, structural adjustment programmes, restrictive fiscal policies, low wages, debt repayment obligations, decline of development assistance flows, competitive price pressures on enterprises and lack of resources of large sections of the population in a number of cases induce governments, enterprises and individuals to under-invest in education and training. Furthermore, market uncertainties, poaching of skills by other enterprises and the growth of insecure forms of work and consequential high turnover of staff may reduce enterprises' incentives to invest in training. This is especially true for the least developed countries, most of which are in Africa, given their dire socio-economic situation. The culture of developing, on a continuous basis, individual and collective skills for enhanced productivity and employability in a rapidly changing environment has to be improved further.

- 11.** The cost of education and training should be seen as an investment. Increasing this investment can be fostered by recognizing that investing in education and training can be a shared responsibility of both the public and private sector. Government must always assume the primary responsibility for investing in basic education and initial training, and it should also invest in other forms of training. Government must also share the greatest responsibility for investments directed at groups where combating social exclusion or discrimination is an important objective. With respect to the responsibility of individuals, the government must also share responsibility in order that access not be denied on financial grounds and to the detriment of the broader interest of society. Government, as an employer, must also assume responsibility to invest in training. With respect to the private sector, the responsibilities of both enterprises and individuals should be recognized and, where appropriate, encouraged. These responsibilities are especially appropriate with respect to investment in workplace-based and continuous education, which can raise workers' employability and the competitiveness of enterprises. The organization and implementation of private sector responsibilities in this area can best be accomplished through partnerships between the government and enterprises, between government and the social partners or between the social partners. Ensuring increased investment for SMEs is especially suitable to a partnership approach.
  
- 12.** There is no universal model of investing in training. Governments should create a general economic environment and incentives conducive to encourage individuals and enterprises to invest individually or jointly in education and training. This investment and the responsibility for it should generally be determined by the objectives of training, e.g. individual, enterprise or societal objectives. Countries can use different ways and means to foster investment in training and increase resources for training. Enterprises have a critical role to play in investment in training. A number of mechanisms used in combination to further investment in training and to guarantee access are required. These may include levy systems on enterprises accompanied by public grants, establishment of training funds, various incentives for training and learning, e.g. tax rebates, training credits, training awards, individual training accounts, collective and individual training rights, sabbatical leave, collective training agreements and emulation of national and international best practices of investing in training. The chosen mechanisms should take into account the special needs of the SMEs. Where levies are the chosen mechanism for funding training, the governance of funding distribution should be tripartite, or where these are agreed by the social partners, such governance should be bipartite. Decisions regarding government policies on education and training should be based on genuine tripartite dialogue and give the tripartite partners the opportunity to develop the best ways and means to increase investments in training. Measures such as the provision of childcare facilities are needed to facilitate access to training.

---

One means of encouraging countries and companies to increase current efforts to invest in training and to provide a measurable and comparative basis towards which we can all endeavour is to develop benchmarks. The ILO should develop a database on current expenditures on vocational and continuing training, and suggest a series of benchmarks on investment in training, possibly differentiated for different regions of the world, size of companies or sector of industry, as a mirror and point of orientation for countries, sectors, and companies.

13. Flatter hierarchical structures, and devolved decision-making, initiative and control, also widen the need for higher-level skills and training, and result in increased responsibility for workers. ICT is accelerating these management trends and changes in the world of work in general.

ICT has the potential to improve enormously people's access to quality education and training, including in the workplace. There is however a danger that these technologies may create a "digital divide" and worsen existing inequalities in education and training between urban and rural areas, between rich and poor, between those who possess and those who lack literacy and numeracy skills and between developed and developing countries. Countries should expand their investment in the infrastructure needed for use of ICT, in education and training hardware and software, and in the training of teachers and trainers. Such investments should be undertaken by both the public and private sectors, and make use of collaborative local, national and international networks. Governments may also provide incentives for the private sector and individuals to encourage computer literacy and to develop new communication skills. New modes and methods need to be deployed for training and learning when using ICT.

Distance-learning methods can be used to make training available at convenient times, at accessible places or at reduced costs. Distance learning should not replace all other learning or teaching methods but can be a valuable part of the total teaching tools available. Distance learning should, as far as possible, be combined with traditional training methods in order to avoid a sense of isolation of the learner. The social framework for training needs to be adapted to these new forms of training.

14. The many driving forces, as mentioned in paragraph 2, have a significant impact on organization and working methods of companies. Also, new sectors are emerging, many of them based on the use of ICT products and services, including the Internet. All this increases demand for new skills and competencies, including personal skills and ICT competencies. Education and training need to respond to these new demands, both those related to ICT and those related to changing work organization.
15. Electronic networking provides opportunities for learners to assist each other more actively, for learners to be more active in the training and education process, and for formal and non-conventional teaching methods to be utilized. In order to apply ICT in training, trainers must master these technologies and be systematically trained. Teaching methods need to be updated to accommodate the teaching of new developments in ICT, new types of organization of schools should be devised to take full advantage of ICT; and the individual needs to learn self-learning methods. New training is needed to provide trainers and individuals with these skills. Enterprises may provide ICT facilities or support schemes for workers for the use of ICT at home or in general, and to schools or other training providers, in order to promote the diffusion of ICT skills and access in society. Appropriate government incentives could facilitate this development.
16. For many developing countries, the challenges are much more basic. Societies with huge and growing levels of adult illiteracy, and massive debt crises, will not be able to design,

---

fund or implement the modern education and training policies which are prerequisites for development and economic growth. In the age of the knowledge society, 884 million adults are illiterate, unable to operate effectively even with the intellectual tools of the “old economy”. UNESCO estimates that, in the least developed countries, while 144 million adults were illiterate in 1985, by 2005 this will rise to 188 million – in other words, the number of illiterate adults will grow by 30 per cent in the least developed countries. Additionally, structural adjustment programmes have in specific instances operated to reduce public investment in education, thus further weakening the longer term capacity for economic growth and development.

Much of the developing world lack access to the physical infrastructure through which much of the new knowledge is pulsing. The lack of electricity and telephones, the cost of computers and Internet access, all contribute to deprive citizens, enterprises and workers in developing countries from benefiting from the ICT revolution, and create the conditions for a “digital divide” to grow between countries. Developing countries should make greater efforts to invest in ICT and to develop ICT-appropriate methods of teaching rather than simply adding computers to existing teaching methods.

The international community should, as part of creating the conditions for skills formation in the least developed economies, undertake bold and substantial debt relief, or, where appropriate, debt cancellation; help mobilize resources for programmes to secure basic literacy and numeracy and the development of communication and information infrastructure; and assist with training in the new information and communication technologies. This is a direct challenge to the ILO and international development agencies.

Multinational corporations should be encouraged to agree fair technology transfer agreements, to develop local high-level skills in developing countries, and to help create the infrastructure for the new knowledge economy. The contributions to development that multinational companies can make through training as elaborated in the Tripartite Declaration of Principles concerning Multinational Enterprises and Social Policy should be recalled.

These measures, taken together, contribute to developing the economies and societies of the poorest parts of the world. They provide a ladder through which developing countries can move up the value chain in production, making goods and providing services which add significant economic value, and which receive significant economic return in the global economy. Education and training is one of the packages of measures to leapfrog from underdevelopment to the information society.

In developing an education and training base in developing countries, the existence of new technology can open up new possibilities and possibly save costs on more traditional methods. This is a major challenge for the developing countries to invest in ICT and develop appropriate policies.

Closer collaboration is needed between the ILO, UNESCO and other international organizations; regional organizations, such as the EU and MERCOSUR; and donor countries that place high priority on human resources development and training. It should also work more closely with international financial institutions such as the International Monetary Fund, the World Bank, and regional development banks, to ensure that structural adjustment programmes do not inhibit investments in education and training. Greater national and international efforts also should be made to eradicate illiteracy worldwide. All of these measures and support can only be effective if the developing countries make efforts to set up policies and programmes to promote economic growth and develop their human talent.

- 
- 17.** The development of a national qualifications framework is in the interest of enterprises and workers as it facilitates lifelong learning, helps enterprises and employment agencies match skill demand with supply, and guides individuals in their choice of training and career. The framework should consist of a number of elements: appropriate, transferable, broad and industry-based and professional competency standards, established by the social partners, that reflect the skills required in the economy and public institutions, and vocational and academic qualifications; and a credible, fair and transparent system of assessment of skills learned and competencies gained, irrespective of how and where they have been learned, e.g. through formal and non-formal education and training, work experience and on-the-job learning.

Every person should have the opportunity to have his or her experiences and skills gained through work, through society or through formal and non-formal training assessed, recognized and certified. Programmes to compensate for skill deficits by individuals through increased access to education and training should be made available as part of recognition of prior learning programmes. Assessment should identify skill gaps, be transparent, and provide a guide to the learner and training provider. The framework should also include a credible system of certification of skills that are portable and recognized across enterprises, sectors, industries and educational institutions, whether public or private.

The assessment methodology should be fair, linked to standards, and be non-discriminatory. Potential hidden discrimination should be actively guarded against. For example, the shift to the service sector, with an overall stronger female component, often relies on greater communication and problem-solving skills, which are not always explicitly recognized. Similarly, testing systems conducted in an individual's second language sometimes distort results of technical and other skills possessed. New forms of work organization often shift the skills requirements within an enterprise. For example, flatter managerial structures are predicated on shifting certain responsibilities from management to the workforce. These should result in explicit recognition of the new competencies required by the workforce under these circumstances; and reward systems have to take these into account.

The vocational qualifications system should be tripartite, offer access to workers and anybody wanting to learn, should cover public and private training providers and be updated on a continuous basis. It should ensure multiple entry and exit points in the education and training system during a worker's career. The ILO should develop a database on best practices in developing a national qualifications framework, conduct a general study on the comparability of different national qualifications frameworks based on this database, and undertake research into recognition of prior learning.

- 18.** Trade unions and employer associations may also contribute to training by managing their own training institutions and providing education for their members. Particularly at the sector and enterprise levels, collective bargaining can set appropriate conditions for the organization and implementation of training. Such collective bargaining could encompass issues such as:

- skills required by the enterprise and the economy;
- training necessary for workers;
- assessment of basic skills and skills gained either in the workplace or during individual or associative activities;
- development of career paths for workers;

- 
- personal training and development plans for workers;
  - facilities needed to allow the maximum benefits from training;
  - recognition and reward schemes, including remuneration structuring.
- 19.** The social partners should strengthen social dialogue on training, share responsibility in formulating education and training policies, and engage in partnerships with each other or with governments for investing in, planning and implementing training. In training, networks of cooperation also include regional and local government, various ministries, sector and professional bodies, training institutions and providers, non-governmental organizations, etc. Government should establish a framework for effective social dialogue and partnerships in training and employment. This should result in a coordinated education and training policy at national level, and long-term strategies, which are formulated in consultation with the social partners and are integrated with economic and employment policies. It should also include tripartite, national and sector training arrangements, and provide for a transparent and comprehensive training and labour market information system. Enterprises are primarily responsible for training their employees and apprentices, but also share responsibility in initial vocational training of young people to meet their future needs.
- 20.** The scope and effectiveness of social dialogue and partnerships in training is currently limited by the capacity and resources of actors. It varies between countries, sectors and large and small enterprises. Recent regional economic integration also brings a new dimension to social dialogue on training and the need for capacity building. There is a pressing need to raise this capacity by various means such as technical cooperation, public grants to trade union and employer organizations, and exchanging experience and best practices between countries. Education and training in industrial relations and on trade union education, business administration and the social contribution by the work and the organization of the social partners, should also be an integral part of capacity building and a part of initial and vocational training. Being a tripartite organization, the ILO should lead international cooperation to build up capacities for social dialogue and partnership building in training. Additional efforts should be made for the benefit of developing countries.
- 21.** Terms of reference for a review of the Human Resources Development Recommendation, 1975, (No. 150), should be based on the present conclusions, adopted by the International Labour Conference at its 88th Session, 2000, the conclusions of the Cologne Charter 1999, and the statements on this subject jointly made by international employer and trade union organizations; and should include the following:
- (1) address training and education needs in the modern world of work in both developing and developed countries, and promote social equity in the global economy;
  - (2) advance the decent work concept through defining the role of education and training;
  - (3) promote lifelong learning, enhance employability of the world's workers, and address the economic challenges;
  - (4) recognize the various responsibilities for investment and funding of education and training;
  - (5) promote national, regional and international qualifications frameworks which include provisions for prior learning;
  - (6) improve access and equity of opportunity for all workers to education and training;

- 
- (7) build the capacity of the social partners for partnerships in education and training;
  - (8) address the need for increased technical and financial assistance for the less advantaged countries and societies.

Recommendation No. 150 should be revised in order to reflect the new approach to training. Although some aspects of the Recommendation are still valid, others have lost their relevance. There is a need for a more dynamic instrument that is more applicable and used by member States and the social partners in formulating and implementing human resources development policies, integrated with other economic and social policies, particularly employment policies. A new recommendation should be complemented by a practical guide and database that can be renewed on a continuous basis by the Office as part of its normal work.





---

## CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
<i>Fifth item on the agenda: Human resources training and development: Vocational guidance and vocational training</i>	
Report of the Committee on Human Resources Training and Development .....	1
Resolution concerning human resources training and development .....	58
Conclusions concerning human resources training and development .....	59