

Recruitment and selection – comparative document by Staff Union Committee – January 2006

Collective agreement

Agreement in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
In the Preamble ‘...to establish a comprehensive procedure for recruitment...’	‘ comprehensive ’ has disappeared in the 2 nd paragraph	To be put back.
In the Preamble ‘This procedure is an integral part of a career development approach applying throughout the ILO and will be conducted in accordance with due process, fair procedure and natural justice having regard to relevant international law, including international labour standards and the ILO Declaration on fundamental principles and rights at work.’	‘The purpose of this Agreement is to establish a procedure for recruitment and selection based on principles of fairness and equity, and aiming at ensuring timeliness, efficiency, objectivity and transparency. This procedure is an integral part of a wider human resource strategy that is designed, and periodically reviewed, to promote the policy goals as determined by the Office and the Governing Body.’	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The reference to the ILO Conventions and Human Rights are in the first paragraph of the Recognition and Procedural Agreement. To be maintained. 2. SUC members proposal to insert ‘...and aiming at ensuring timeliness, efficiency, objectivity, consistency and transparency.’ 3. SUC members proposal to insert ‘... a wider human resource strategy and an integral part of a career development approach that is designed, ...’
In the Preamble ‘The Office and the Union, ... , recognize that this Agreement aims to improve on existing structures and processes. All substantive entitlements of staff members shall remain intact, except where this agreement states otherwise.’	In the Preamble ‘The Office and the Union recognize that this Agreement aims to improve on existing procedures and processes simplifying recruitment and selection, increasing transparency and flexibility and minimizing delays, while respecting the rights of officials and promoting their career development. ’	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. SUC members’ proposal to insert again ‘All substantive entitlements of staff members shall remain intact, except where this agreement states otherwise.’ 2. SUC member proposal to delete the word ‘flexibility’. We do not agree to this concept here. The workers of the ILO are not a

Agreement in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
		commodity.
Article 1 ‘Definitions’	Deleted	
Art. 2.1 ‘Guiding principles’ ‘Competition in accordance with this Agreement shall be the normal method of filling vacancies between the grades G1 and P5 (both inclusive).’	Art. 1.1 ‘Guiding principles’ ‘Competition in accordance with this Agreement shall be the normal method of filling vacancies in the General Service, National Officer, and Professional categories.’	The wording is better.
Art. 2.3 ‘ILO staff can apply to all vacancies, subject to the conditions set out in this Agreement’	Deleted	Wording is to be kept if no good reason.
1.4 Having regard to the Office’s need to ensure the highest standards of competence, efficiency and integrity, and promote greater motivation and job satisfaction of its staff, this procedure aims to match <i>abilities and aspirations</i> of staff members with the employment needs of the Office.	1.4 Having regard to the Office’s need to ensure the highest standards of competence, efficiency and integrity, and promote greater motivation and job satisfaction of its staff, this procedure aims to match <i>competencies and career aspirations</i> of staff members with the employment needs of the Office.	Minor change
	Article 2 ‘Recruitment procedures’	
	Art. 2.1 The Parties agree that, within the framework of the principles set down in Article 1 above and in accordance with the procedures set down in the Annex to this Agreement (Circular Series 6 No. XX), vacancies shall be filled as follows:’	SUC members’ proposal to reinstate the competition process basic features into the agreement and leave the details of the procedure for the circular, as it was in the previous agreement.
	Art. 2.1 (b) vacancies in senior management positions as well as other positions of confidence shall be filled without competition at the discretion of the Director-General,	SUC members’ proposal to comprehensively define what are those positions of confidence and to cancel the interim agreement for

Agreement in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
		the P5 for deputy directors.
	Art. 2.1. (c) vacancies in the specific categories as listed in paragraph XX of the annexed Circular may also be filled without competition.	This gives too much flexibility to the administration; please refer to the pertinent paragraph of the draft circular.
	2.2 The Parties agree to use the following tools: (a) enhanced search for candidates through calls for expressions of interest, targeted calls for candidatures and competitions; (b) identification of eligible candidates by HRD against clear criteria and subsequent short listing of candidates in consultation with the technical department; (c) technical panels including “independent” members drawn from a jointly agreed list; (d) focused assessments for external candidates and movements across staff categories; (e) structured interviews, including a written test where appropriate.	This is the type of precisions SUC would like to see in art. 2.1 and we wonder whether HRD has the necessary resources to undertake these additional responsibilities?
Article 3 ‘Opening of a competition’		Modified by the circular
<p>Article 4 ‘Competition process’</p> <p>4.1 The selection process is composed of two phases, the assessment centre and the technical evaluation.</p> <p>4.2 Internal candidates who apply for a competition graded above their existing grade level shall go through the Assessment Centre. Internal candidates who have already been successfully assessed for the grade level they</p>	<p>Article 3 ‘Assessment’</p> <p>3.1 All external candidates who apply for a competition in the GS, NO and P categories and who are short-listed shall go through an assessment process.</p> <p>3.2 All internal and external candidates for management level positions (certain P5, all D1 and D2) shall go through an assessment process.</p>	<p>These changes reflect the content of the negotiation. In 3.2 the word ‘certain’ attached to P5 should be deleted.</p>

Agreement in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
<p>apply to need not undergo a new assessment. 4.3 External candidates short-listed by the responsible Chief in agreement with HRD will be invited to participate in the Assessment Centre.</p>	<p>3.3 All internal candidates applying for a position in a different staff category shall go through an assessment process. 3.4 All external candidates for vacancies in the General Service and the National Officer levels in the field shall go through assessments as adapted for the field and as specified in the annexed Circular (Section II (B) para. 28). 3.5. All internal candidates shall receive a written report on the results of the assessment process. 3.6 The results of the assessment process will be communicated to the technical evaluation panel and will be included in the report to the Director-General. Candidates who do not fully meet the expectations of the assessment process will normally be considered unsuitable for that appointment. 3.7 The assessment process will be reviewed and refined in the light of experience.</p>	<p>SUC representatives did not agree to 3.3 and argued that internal candidates did prove their value over the years and should not need an assessment to go from G to P.</p> <p>3.5 there is a need to limit the amount of time allotted for transmission of results. 3.6 stresses the importance of the technical panel where the administration approved the designation of independent jury members to assist managers.</p> <p>3.7 ‘... jointly with SU to be added’. How can we improve transparency if SU representatives are not part of the evaluation process?</p>
Article 5 ‘ Technical Evaluation ’		Modified by the circular
Article 6 ‘ Information and feedback to candidates ’		Modified by the circular
Article 7 ‘ Career counselling and coaching ’	Article 4 ‘ Career counselling and coaching ’	

Agreement in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
<p>7.1 The Office shall provide career counselling and coaching to ILO staff.</p> <p>7.2 In particular, such career counselling and coaching shall be provided to:</p> <p>a. Officials who did not reach the standards required in the Assessment Centre;</p> <p>b. Officials who have successfully passed the Assessment Centre but have not been selected for a post corresponding to that grade group within two years from the assessment.</p>	<p>4.1 The Office shall provide career counselling and coaching to ILO staff.</p>	<p>Deletion of 7.2 not acceptable.</p>
<p>Article 8 ‘Reopening of the recruitment and selection process’</p>		<p>Modified by the circular</p>
<p>Article 9 ‘Cancellation of a competition’</p>		<p>Modified by the circular</p>
<p>Article 10 ‘Field offices’</p>		<p>Modified by the circular</p>
<p>Article 11 ‘Grievances’</p>		<p>Modified by the circular</p>
<p>Article 12 ‘Transitional measures’</p>		<p>Not necessary</p>
<p>Article 13 ‘Miscellaneous’</p>		<p>Not necessary</p>
	<p>Article 5 ‘Human Resources Consultative Committee’</p> <p>5.1 A Human Resources Consultative Committee shall be established. The membership of the Committee shall include management and Union representatives. The committee shall meet at least twice a year and its role shall be as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - to review information/data on recruitment and selection, - review progress in relation to meeting the human resource policy goals; and 	<p>SUC argued that four times a year should be a minimum and that should HRD not give satisfaction to its recommendations to report to the JNC and not to HRD in order to address the issue to the DG. The creation of that committee should be part of the SR as well. Anything less than for times a year is not relevant.</p>

Agreement in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
	<p>- make recommendations to HRD.</p> <p>5.2 The Parties agree to review the functioning of the HR Consultative Committee after its first year of operation and subsequently as may be required.</p>	
	<p>Article 6 ‘Final clause’</p> <p>6.1 No term of the provisions applying this Agreement shall be suspended, modified, cancelled or otherwise amended except by means of a written agreement signed by the Parties. The Parties may renegotiate any part of this Agreement at any time.</p> <p>6.2 In the event of a difference of opinion in the interpretation or application of this Agreement, the matter shall be submitted to the Review Panel, as per Article 7 of the Recognition and Procedural Agreement as amended on 6 November 2003.</p> <p>6.3 This Agreement shall be implemented by means of the Staff Regulations and the circular appended hereto in accordance with Article 8, paragraph 4 of the Recognition and Procedural Agreement, as amended on 6 November 2003. The Office shall submit to the Governing body any proposed amendments to the Staff Regulations necessary to give effect to this Agreement.</p> <p>6.4 A copy of this Agreement, the related amendments to the Staff Regulations and the</p>	<p>A proposal by a SUC member to amend 6.4 as follows: ‘A copy of this Agreement <i>shall be provided to each existing and future staff member. The Parties shall ensure that all staff members are aware of the existence of this recruitment and selection procedure and shall undertake the preparation of a user friendly instruction manual for all staff on the operation of the procedure.</i> A copy of this Agreement, the related amendments to the Staff Regulations and the circular shall be posted on the Office website.’</p>

Agreement in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
	circular shall be posted on the Office website.	

Annexe 1 of the proposed Agreement

(Replace article 4.1, 4.2, article 10.7 (ADC) and Annex I by the following provisions)

Staff regulations in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
Chapter IV ‘ Recruitment and Appointment ’	Chapter IV ‘ Recruitment, Selection and Appointment ’	
Article 4.1 ‘ Selection by the Director-General ’	Article 4.1 ‘ Considerations governing recruitment and Selection ’	
Art. 4.2 ‘ Filling of vacancies ’ (a) (i) ‘The paramount considerations in the filling of any vacancy shall be the necessity to obtain and retain staff of the highest standards of competence, efficiency and integrity. Due regard shall be paid to the importance of maintaining a staff selected on a wide geographical basis, recognizing also the need to take into account considerations of gender and age. Every official shall be required to possess a fully satisfactory knowledge of one of the working languages of the Organization.’	Art. 4.1.2 ‘The paramount considerations for the recruitment and selection of officials shall be the necessity to obtain and retain staff of the highest standards of competence, efficiency and integrity committed to the values and principles the Organization promotes; to maintain a balanced gender, age and grade staff structure; cultural and linguistic diversity and to ensure career and professional development to staff members. Due regard should also be paid to the necessity to ensure geographical diversity in the professional category.’	This sentence has been moved to the circular ‘ <i>Every official shall be required to possess a fully satisfactory knowledge of one of the working languages of the Organization.</i> ’ It is stronger if it is maintained in the SR. Who is to decide on what is ‘balanced’. We need a better transparency at this stage of the process.
Art. 4.2 (a) (ii) ‘Without prejudice to the foregoing, officials shall be selected without discrimination on the basis of age, race, gender, religion, colour, national extraction, social origin, marital status, pregnancy, family	Art. 4.1.3 ‘Without prejudice to the foregoing, officials shall be selected without discrimination on the basis of age, race, gender, religion, colour, national extraction, social origin, marital status, pregnancy, family	

Staff regulations in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
responsibilities, sexual preference, disability, union membership or political conviction.’	responsibilities, sexual preference, disability, union membership or political conviction.’	
	Article 4.2 ‘ Filling of vacancies ’	
	Art. 4.2.1 ‘Subject to the provisions below, the recruitment and selection of senior managers and other positions of confidence are at the discretion of the Director-General.’	<i>Positions of confidence</i> should to be defined.
	Art. 4.2.2 ‘Vacancies in the professional, national officer and general service categories shall be filled, normally through a competitive process, in accordance with procedures established by the Director-General on the recommendation of the Joint Negotiating Committee.’	
<p>Art. 4.2 (b) ‘Appointment to vacancies of Deputy Director-General, Assistant Director-General and Treasurer and Financial Comptroller shall be made by the Director-General after consultation with the Officers of the Governing Body.</p> <p>Art. 4.2 (c) ‘The Director-General may designate a Principal Deputy Director-General, in which event such designation shall be made after consultation with the Officers of the Governing Body and with the agreement of the Governing Body.’</p> <p>Art. 4.2 (d) ‘Vacancies in the Director and Principal Officer category shall be filled by the Director-General by transfer in the same grade,</p>	<p>Art. 4.2.3 ‘Appointments to vacancies of Deputy Director-General, Assistant Director-General and Treasurer and Financial Comptroller shall be made by the Director-General after consultation with the Officers of the Governing Body. The Director-General may designate a Principal Deputy Director-General, in which event such designation shall be made after consultation with the Officers of the Governing Body and with the agreement of the Governing Body. The position of Chief Internal Auditor shall be filled by the Director-General after consultation with the Governing Body.</p> <p>Art. 4.2.4 ‘Appointments in the Director and</p>	

Staff regulations in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
promotion or appointment. Such promotions or appointments, other than to vacancies in technical cooperation projects, shall be reported to the Governing Body with a short statement of the qualifications of the persons so promoted or appointed. The position of Chief Internal Auditor shall be filled by the Director-General after consultation with the Governing Body.’	Principal Officer category, other than to vacancies in technical cooperation projects, shall be reported to the Governing Body with a short statement of the qualifications of the persons so appointed.’	
Contents of Art. 4.2 (e), (f), (g), (h) and (i), art. 10.7 and Annex I ‘ Recruitment procedure ’ moved to the circular		

Circular Series 6 – Recruitment and selection procedures
(to replace annex I of the Staff Regulations)

Agreement or Staff regulations in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
	Art. 1 ‘In accordance with the Collective Agreement on a Procedure for Recruitment and Selection, all vacancies are to be filled in accordance with the principles of competence, efficiency and transparency.’	
	Art. 2 ‘Vacancies can be filled with or without a competition through appointment, transfer in the same grade or promotion. Vacancies shall be announced to serving staff whenever they represent an opportunity for career development, including mobility, using one of the following search methods:	Should be preferably deleted and should be detailed in the terms dealing with selection with and without competition.

Agreement or Staff regulations in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
	(a) calls for expression of interest; (b) calls for candidatures for an in-grade transfer; (c) internal competition; (d) internal/external competition.	
<p>Annex I – Art. 1 ‘In the filling of any vacancy account shall be taken of linguistic knowledge. Officials in the Professional category whose mother tongue is one of the working languages shall normally be required to have a good working knowledge of a second working language and may be required to acquire a knowledge of a third working language. Officials Professional category whose mother tongue is not one of the working languages of the Office shall be required to possess a fully satisfactory working knowledge of one of the working languages of the Office, as prescribed in article 4.2(a) (filling of vacancies) and may be required to acquire a knowledge of a second working language.’</p>	<p>I. General considerations Art. 3 ‘Officials in the Director and Principal Officer, Professional and National Officer categories whose first language is one of the working languages of the Office shall be required to have a good working knowledge of a second working language or to acquire it and may be required to acquire a knowledge of a third working language.’</p>	<p>See comments page 7. ‘to acquire’ who is to assess? Length of time?</p>
	<p>Art. 4 ‘Officials in the Director and Principal Office, Professional and National Officer categories whose first language is not one of the working languages of the Office shall be required to possess a fully satisfactory working knowledge of one of the working languages of the Office and may be required to acquire a knowledge of a second working language.’</p>	<p>See comments page 7.</p>

Agreement or Staff regulations in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
Annex I – Art. 2 ‘Officials in the Professional category who undertake duties as translator or such other duties as may be designated as similar by the Director-General shall be required to have a thorough knowledge of two working languages as well as the main language into which they translate.’	Art.5 ‘Officials in the Professional category who undertake duties as translator or such other duties as may be designated as similar by the Director-General shall be required to have a thorough knowledge of two working languages as well as the main language into which they translate.’	
	Art. 6 ‘Subject to the requirements of any specific position, officials in the General Service category shall be required to have a fully satisfactory working knowledge of one of the working languages of the Office and may be required to acquire a knowledge of a second and third language.’	New. Coherence with Art. 3.
	Art. 6 ‘Subject to the requirements of any specific position, officials in the General Service category shall be required to have a fully satisfactory working knowledge of one of the working languages of the Office and may be required to acquire a knowledge of a second and third language.’	New. Coherence with Art. 4.
Annex I – Art. 3 ‘Officials in the Director and Principal Officer, Professional and National Officer categories shall be required to possess a degree awarded by a recognized university, or its equivalent in experience.’	Art. 7 ‘Officials in the Director and Principal Officer, Professional and National Officer categories shall be required to possess a degree awarded by a recognized university, or its equivalent in experience.’	
Annex I – Art. 4 ‘In the filling of any vacancy, service in the Office, including service in the	Art. 8 ‘In the filling of any vacancy, service in the Office, including service in the field where	

Agreement or Staff regulations in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
field where relevant, shall be taken into account.’	relevant, shall be taken into account.’	
	Art. 9 ‘Any external candidate and any internal candidate applying for a position in a different category must be assessed as suitable for appointment within the category to which the position pertains. Such assessment shall be carried out in accordance with arrangements adopted by the Director-General on the recommendation of the Joint Negotiating Committee.’	See comments page 3 for art.3.
Art. 4.2 (f) of the SR ‘In accordance with the provisions of the Collective Agreement on a Procedure for Recruitment and Selection, competition shall be the normal method of filling vacancies between grades G1 and P5 inclusive.’	II. Selection with competition Art. 10 ‘Competition shall be the normal method of filling vacancies in the General Service, National Officer and Professional categories in accordance with the following procedures.’	
	<i>A. Filling of vacancies in the Professional Category, and in the General Service category at Headquarters</i> <u>Search methods</u> Art. 11 ‘Interest in positions can be made known to HRD by reference to existing organizational structures irrespective of any actual vacancy, or by reference to a specific vacancy.’	New. How this will be managed and to what extent this information will be taken into account in the selection process?
	Art. 12 ‘The Human Resource Development Department will from time to time, but at least twice a year, seek expressions of interest in	New, in line with the mobility policy, but should also be in line with staffing reviews.

Agreement or Staff regulations in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
	positions scheduled or likely to become vacant in the following year. Such calls for expressions of interest should be posted for at least six weeks.’	
<p>Agreement – Art. 3.1 ‘La demande d’ouverture d’un concours émane du chef responsable. Il (elle) fournit une description des exigences, des responsabilités et des objectifs propres à l’emploi.’</p> <p>Annex I – Art. 7 ‘Proposals to open a competition will be made by the responsible chief for the job concerned, who will identify the relevant job description, indicating the job family and the grade, and prepare a description of the responsibilities and objectives that are specific to the job as well as of other relevant requirements to be fulfilled by candidates. The proposal will be notified to the Director of the Human Resources Development Department.’</p>	Art. 13 ‘Upon confirmation that a position will become vacant, HRD will determine, in consultation with the responsible chief for the vacancy concerned, the job family, the generic job description and the corresponding grade, as well as a description of any responsibilities and objectives specific to the position and any special requirements to be fulfilled by candidates.’	New terms stress the HRD’s involvement.
<p>Agreement – Art. 3.2 ‘Le Département du développement des ressources humaines (ci-après dénommé «HRD») et le chef responsable font alors une recommandation concernant la définition de poste et la nécessité de procéder ou non à une recherche de candidats externes.’</p> <p>Art. 3.3 ‘Le ou les représentants du Syndicat ont le droit de formuler des observations au sujet des propositions dont il est fait mention au paragraphe précédent. Ces observations doivent être présentées dans les 10 jours ouvrables qui</p>	Art. 14 ‘If the position is redefined or the conditions specified in the generic job description of the vacancy are substantially modified, the Human Resource Development Department will inform the designated Staff Union representatives, who will have one week in which to make any comments.’	OK if ‘ <i>substantially</i> ’ is deleted and if <i>10 days</i> is kept as per the previous agreement.

Agreement or Staff regulations in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
suivent la date de la notification de la demande d'ouverture d'un concours, mais cette période peut être prolongée si HRD et le Syndicat en conviennent.'		
<p>Agreement – Art. 3.4 'Les observations du ou des représentants du Syndicat font l'objet d'une discussion entre le(s) représentant(s) du Syndicat, le(s) représentant(s) de HRD et le chef responsable en vue de parvenir à un accord. Cette discussion doit avoir lieu avant la publication de l'avis de vacance de poste.</p> <p>3.5 Chaque fois qu'un accord intervient, l'avis de vacance de poste est publié.</p> <p>3.6 Tout désaccord entre le(s) représentant(s) du Syndicat, le(s) représentant(s) de HRD et le chef responsable est consigné par écrit et communiqué au Directeur général pour décision.'</p> <p>See also paragraphs 7 and 8 of Annex I of the Staff Regulations.</p>	<p>Art. 15 'If the generic job description of the position remains unchanged or is amended after receipt of any comments under paragraph 14 above, the Human Resource Development Department will determine, in agreement with the responsible chief, whether to proceed to a call for candidatures for an in-grade transfer, an internal competition or an internal/external competition.'</p>	<p>Not acceptable as it does not take into account any comments from the SU. The text of the agreement in force is much better.</p> <p>Reminder: at this stage, the objective was for the SU representatives to get the opportunity to make comments on the method for filling the vacancy. Rejected.</p>
<p>Art. 3.7 'La période pendant laquelle une vacance de poste est ouverte est déterminée par HRD, cette période devant être au minimum d'un mois civil. Si une prolongation est nécessaire, HRD en informe le(s) représentant(s) du Syndicat.'</p>	<p>Art. 16 'Any call for candidatures or competition announcement shall be posted for a minimum period of four weeks. This period may be extended if, prior to closure, there are less than 3 candidates. The Human Resource Development Department will inform the designated Staff Union representatives of any such extension.'</p>	<p>Does four weeks equal 20 working days?</p>
<p>Annex I – Art. 8 'All competitions will be open</p>	<p><u>Internal/external candidates</u></p>	<p>Reminder: the objective was for</p>

Agreement or Staff regulations in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
<p>to internal candidates. Officials who are not considered as internal candidates by reason of paragraphs 15 and 16 below, or of other relevant provisions of the Staff Regulations, may apply as external candidates where a competition is open to the latter. The Human Resources Development Department and the responsible chief concerned will decide if it is necessary to open the competition to external candidates.</p> <p>Internal Candidates</p> <p>Art. 15 ‘ Officials serving TC projects, except those detached from another job within the Office, as well as officials appointed under the Rules Governing Conditions of Service of Short-Term Officials, will not normally be eligible to participate as internal candidates. The Human Resources Development Department, in agreement with the Staff Union representatives referred to in paragraph 9 above, may decide, exceptionally, to waive this exclusion, but may establish special requirements.</p>	<p>Art. 17 ‘Officials serving on technical cooperation projects, except those detached from a regular position within the Office, as well as officials on temporary positions referred to under paragraph 35 (e), below or appointed under the Rules Governing Conditions of Service of Short-Term Officials, are not eligible to participate as internal candidates.’</p>	<p>the SU representatives to take the opportunity of the revision to address the issue of the staff working for TC projects.</p> <p>Rejected.</p>
<p>Art. 16 ‘An official may not apply in a competition as an internal candidate before successful completion of his/her probationary period.’</p>	<p>Art. 18 ‘An official shall not qualify as an internal candidate before the successful completion of his/her probationary period. Eligibility as an internal candidate shall be determined on the date of closure of any call for candidature or competition. In the case of a call for expression of interest, eligibility shall be determined on the date when the position becomes vacant.’</p>	<p>‘... shall be determined...’ by whom and how? Is not in line with art. 19.</p>

Agreement or Staff regulations in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
See paragraph 15 of Annex I of the SR.	Art. 19 ‘Officials who are not considered as internal candidates may apply as external candidates where calls for expressions of interest, call for candidatures and competition are open to the latter. The Human Resources Development Department, following consultation with designated Staff Union representatives, may however decide, exceptionally, to permit the participation of certain categories of external candidates in internal calls for expressions of interest, calls for candidatures and competitions, as well as any special conditions for such participation.’	‘...open to the latter...’ to be clarified.
Annex I – Art. 8 ‘The responsible chief will undertake and ensure rigorous technical evaluation of all candidates who have successfully completed the Assessment Centre’s process, and will prepare a report.’	Short listing Art. 20 ‘In all cases, the Human Resource Development Department will establish, in consultation with the responsible chief, a list of all eligible candidates, as well as a shortlist of up to five candidates ranked on the basis of the general considerations in paragraphs 3 to 9 above as well as to the qualifications required in the job description of the vacant position or in the vacancy notice.’	Stresses HRD’s role.
See paragraph 4.2 (g) of the SR ‘In filling any vacancy account shall be taken in the following order, of – (1) applications from former officials whose appointments were terminated in accordance with the provisions of article 11.5 (Termination on reduction of staff);	Art. 21 ‘In establishing the list of eligible candidates, account shall also be taken, in the following order, of (1) applications from former officials whose appointments were terminated in accordance with the provisions of article 11.5 (Termination on reduction of staff);	

Agreement or Staff regulations in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
<p>(2) applications for transfer; (3) applications for a higher grade; (4) if the Director-General and the Staff Union agree, applications from former officials other than those who have been discharged or summarily dismissed; (5) on a reciprocal basis, applications from officials of the United Nations, specialized agencies, or the Registry of the International Court of Justice.’</p>	<p>(2) applications for transfer; (3) applications for a higher grade; (4) if the Director-General and the Staff Union agree, applications from former officials other than those who have been discharged or summarily dismissed or separated under an agreed termination; (5) on a reciprocal basis, applications from officials of the United Nations, specialized agencies, or the Registry of the International Court of Justice.’</p>	
	<p>Art. 22 ‘In the absence of any eligible candidate, and subject to the provisions below governing under-filling, the prospection of candidates can be further broadened or the call for candidatures or competition re-issued with an extended period for the submission of applications.’</p>	New
<p>Agreement – Art.8 - Réouverture du processus de recrutement et de sélection S’il est déclaré que la procédure de recrutement et de sélection n’a pas donné de résultats et si le poste est maintenu avec la même définition d’emploi, HRD et le chef responsable examinent dans quelles conditions il convient de rouvrir la procédure de sélection et de recrutement (Centre d’évaluation et évaluation technique) et en informent le ou les représentants du Syndicat. Art. 9 – Annulation d’un concours Avant de décider d’annuler un processus de</p>	<p>Art. 23 ‘If there is still no eligible candidate, the Human Resource Development Department may declare the competitive process unsuccessful. If a competitive process is declared unsuccessful, the Human Resource Development Department will inform the designated Staff Union representatives as well as internal candidates who have applied for the vacancy.’</p>	

Agreement or Staff regulations in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
sélection et de recrutement qui a déjà commencé, HRD consulte de bonne foi les représentants du Syndicat. En cas de désaccord, l'opinion du Syndicat est jointe à la documentation transmise au Directeur général pour décision sur une éventuelle annulation. Si l'annulation est confirmée, les raisons en sont données par écrit à tous les candidats internes.'		
<p>Agreement – Art. 5 - Evaluation technique</p> <p>5.1 Toutes les personnes dont la candidature a été évaluée de façon positive doivent faire l'objet d'une évaluation technique. Il incombe au chef responsable d'entreprendre et de garantir une évaluation technique rigoureuse des candidats suivant les directives formulées d'un commun accord par le Syndicat et par le Bureau. Les parties conviennent d'élaborer ces directives avant le 31 décembre 2000 et, en tout état de cause, avant la mise en application du présent accord.</p>	<p><u>Technical evaluation</u></p> <p>Art. 24. 'A technical evaluation panel shall be set up for all selection, composed as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the responsible chief (as defined in article 2.3 of the Staff Regulations) or a person designated by him/her; - a member appointed by HRD from a pool of officials (knowledgeable of the various job families and trained in competency based interviewing) set up in agreement with Staff Union; - a representative from the Human Resource Development Department, who shall also act as Secretary to the Panel.' 	<p>The agreement reached mentioned <i>'a member jointly appointed by HRD and Staff Union from a pool of officials (knowledgeable of the various job families and trained in competency based interviewing)'</i></p> <p>New text not acceptable.</p>
	Art. 25. The Human Resource Development Department, in consultation with the responsible chief, may decide to appoint one expert in the field of competency of the vacancy to assist the evaluation panel.'	New
	Art. 26 'The technical evaluation panel will conduct an interview of short-listed candidates	New

Agreement or Staff regulations in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
	and will determine any other type of test and examination it deems appropriate to evaluate the candidates.’	
	Art. 27 ‘The Secretary to the Panel shall, as soon as possible, prepare a draft report in consultation with the members of the panel with the results of the interviews and any required test and/or assessment process and establishing a ranking of recommended candidates.’	New
<p>5.2 Le ou les représentants du Syndicat ont accès à tous les rapports concernant l’évaluation technique. S’ils ont des observations à faire, ils doivent en informer HRD dans les 10 jours ouvrables suivant la date de notification du résultat de l’évaluation technique. Ces observations font l’objet d’une discussion entre le chef, HRD et les représentants du Syndicat.</p> <p>5.3 Un rapport complet sur cette procédure est communiqué au Directeur général, avec copie aux représentants du Syndicat. Le Directeur général prend alors la décision finale concernant le recrutement.’</p>	Art. 28 ‘This report will be made available for comment to designated Staff Union representatives, who will have one week from its receipt in which to make comments on the compliance with the agreed procedure. Any comments may be the subject of discussion between the responsible chief, the Human Resources Development Department and designated Staff Union representatives. The report, together with any comments made by the designated Staff Union representatives, will be transmitted to the Director-General or his/her representative who will then take a decision.’	The reduction from 10 days to a week is not acceptable.
<p>Agreement - Article 10 - Bureaux extérieurs ‘Les Parties peuvent convenir d’ajuster cette procédure pour le personnel recruté localement dans les bureaux extérieurs.’</p>	<p>B. Filling of vacancies in the General Service and National Officer categories in field duty stations</p> <p>Art. 29 ‘Each Region shall establish procedures for the filling of vacancies in the National Officer and General Service categories. The Regional Director will, in consultation with the</p>	Not acceptable as the present rules for recruitment in regions such as Americas and Asia are far more transparent than the one proposed here.

Agreement or Staff regulations in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
	<p>regional SHRO, be responsible for ensuring that these procedures respect the following principles:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Upon confirmation that a position will become vacant, the Office Director concerned will determine, in consultation with the regional SHRO, the job family, the generic job description and the corresponding grade, a description of the responsibilities specific to the position and any special requirements to be fulfilled by candidates as well as the prospection method to be used. • The Office Director concerned will ensure that for vacancies to be filled by competition the announcement will be published in a way which ensures that they are brought to the attention of as large a number of potential candidates as possible. • For vacancies to be filled other than through competition the Office Director concerned will, in consultation with the regional SHRO, establish the list of eligible candidates. • For vacancies for which there is more than one eligible candidate, the Office Director concerned will ensure that the selection procedure includes for short-listed candidates an appropriate written test, to be 	

Agreement or Staff regulations in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
	<p>prepared in consultation with the regional SHRO. Taking into account the results of the written test the Office Director will determine the candidates to be called for interview.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The procedures for conducting the interview will ensure that the interview panel consists of at least two staff members. The panel will prepare a written report for the Office Director concerned. • For the filling of all vacancies the Office Director concerned will prepare a selection report including the outcome of the interviews and evaluations. This report will be submitted to the Regional Director for approval. The Staff Union representatives of the Office concerned will be given a copy of this report for information. • The Regional SHRO will make the selection report available to the designated regional Staff Union representatives, who will have one week from its receipt in which to make comments on the compliance with agreed procedures. Any comments may be discussed with the SHRO. The report, together with any comments made by the Staff Union, will be transmitted to the Regional Director or his/her representative who will then take a decision. 	

Agreement or Staff regulations in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
<p>Agreement – Article 6 - Information et information en retour des candidats</p> <p>6.1 Les candidats reçoivent un rapport écrit sur les résultats de la procédure du Centre d'évaluation.</p> <p>6.2 Les candidats internes peuvent solliciter par écrit un entretien avec le chef responsable afin d'obtenir une information en retour sur l'évaluation technique. L'entretien a lieu si possible dans les 10 jours ouvrables suivant la date de réception de la demande. Les candidats peuvent s'ils le souhaitent se faire accompagner d'un membre du Syndicat, d'un autre fonctionnaire ou d'un ancien fonctionnaire du BIT.</p> <p>6.3 Si un candidat n'est pas satisfait du résultat de l'entretien, il peut demander une information en retour par écrit. Cette information sera fournie si possible dans les 10 jours ouvrables suivant la date de réception de la demande.</p> <p>Article 11 - Doléances</p> <p>Un fonctionnaire ayant demandé une information en retour au chef responsable conformément à l'article 6 peut demander l'avis des conciliateurs ou du médiateur prévus dans la procédure de règlement des différends. Si le fonctionnaire n'est pas satisfait de l'information en retour fournie par écrit, il peut adresser ses doléances au groupe mixte prévu dans la procédure de règlement des différends datée du 13 septembre</p>	<p>Provision for feedback to internal candidates</p> <p>Art. 30 'Internal candidates will be informed by HRD or the regional SHRO of the outcome of any competition in which they have taken part. Internal candidates may request a joint meeting with the HR representative and the responsible chief in order to identify those areas for development which led to the non-selection of the candidate for the post in question.</p> <p>Art. 31 Should an internal candidate feel that the competitive process has not been respected, the established conflict resolution procedures shall apply.'</p>	<p>Article 6 more favourable to the staff, because of the set delays and the reference to the mediator possible action. To be rejected.</p>

Agreement or Staff regulations in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
2000, en faisant valoir que la décision a été fondée sur un vice de procédure ou un traitement inéquitable.’		
<p>Agreement - Article 9 - Annulation d’un concours</p> <p>Avant de décider d’annuler un processus de sélection et de recrutement qui a déjà commencé, HRD consulte de bonne foi les représentants du Syndicat. En cas de désaccord, l’opinion du Syndicat est jointe à la documentation transmise au Directeur général pour décision sur une éventuelle annulation. Si l’annulation est confirmée, les raisons en sont données par écrit à tous les candidats internes.</p>	<p>D. Cancellation of competitive processes</p> <p>Art. 32 ‘Before a decision is taken to cancel any call for candidatures or competition that have already begun, the Human Resource Development Department shall inform the designated Staff Union representatives. In case of disagreement, the views of the Staff Union shall be attached to the proposed cancellation for decision by the Director-General. If the cancellation is confirmed, reasons shall be given in writing to all internal candidates.</p>	No change.
Please refer to 4.2 (e)	<p>III. SELECTION WITHOUT COMPETITION</p> <p>Art. 33 ‘Selection without competition shall be the normal method for the filling of vacancies in senior management positions and other positions of confidence, namely:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) directors and principal officer category; (b) directors of offices in the field; (c) in the Office of the Director-General; (d) principal secretaries to Executive and Regional directors, provided the person considered for appointment is a serving official having completed the probationary period.’ 	More precision is needed on what is a ‘principal officer’.
	<p>34. Selection without competition can also be resorted to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) in filling vacancies in technical junior 	For (a), when the item was discussed, we accepted provided there was a limit to the number of

Agreement or Staff regulations in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
	<p>positions (P1 and P2) in the professional category with candidates under 35 years from countries with no national or an insufficient number of nationals in the staff of the Office;</p> <p>(b) for transfers in the same grade of officials to be placed or due for geographical mobility under the relevant policy;</p> <p>(c) to fill a vacancy in respect of which a competition has been declared unsuccessful, provided that the vacancy is filled in a manner consistent with the general policy objectives concerning the gender, age and geographical composition of the staff;</p> <p>(d) to fill vacancies in positions in respect of which the agreement of the Staff Union is required by virtue of a collective agreement;</p> <p>(e) to positions of up to three years of a purely temporary and specialist nature not leading to a career in the ILO; officials recruited under this provision shall not be eligible for any employment with the Office for a period of 12 months following the end of their appointment, any new recruitment after that period being subject to selection with competition in accordance with the provisions of section II above;</p> <p>(f) in filling vacancies caused by regrading of a job by one grade in the same category or in the case of a job regraded from the General Service to the National Professional Officer</p>	<p>recruitment under this term, female or male, excluding administration, finance and HR positions.</p> <p>For (b), accepted provided that there was a call for interest prior to the transfer.</p> <p>For (c) the objective was to consult the SU prior to any decision in order for its representatives to make comments to the DG if necessary. No change to the job description?</p> <p>For (d) agreed, it refers to the position of the Mediator or the Secretary to the JAAB.</p> <p>For (e) please refer to article 4.2 (e) of the SR.</p> <p>For (f) agreed as it was something missing in the SR.</p>

Agreement or Staff regulations in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
	<p>category or to the Professional category or in the case of a job regraded from the National Professional Officer to the Professional category;</p> <p>(g) in filling vacancies in positions in technical cooperation projects or in other temporary positions not provided for in the Regular Budget, normally not leading to a career in the ILO;</p> <p>(h) for appointments under the Rules Governing the Conditions of Service of Short-Term Officials.</p>	<p>For (g) please refer to article 4.2 (e) of the SR.</p> <p>For (h) those rules should have been revised in the course of the present exercise avoiding precarious employment.</p>
	<p>Art. 35 ‘The Director-General may in cases under paragraph 34 and 35 above seek expressions of interest and have candidates undergo, in addition to any required assessment, an interview or any other tests as s/he may consider appropriate. Transfer, promotion or appointment in cases under paragraphs 34 and 35 above are subject to candidates meeting the relevant general considerations specified in paragraphs 3 to 9 of the present circular, as well as the requirements of the vacancy for which they are considered.’</p>	<p>Nothing is compulsory! Not acceptable.</p>
	<p>Art. 36 ‘The designated Staff Union representatives shall be informed of any proposed promotion, in grade transfer or external appointment made under paragraph 33 (a) to (e) above. Any comment as to procedure</p>	<p>In line with the referred paragraph.</p>

Agreement or Staff regulations in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
	provided by the designated Staff Union representatives within one week from the receipt of the proposal shall be communicated to the Director-General together with the proposed selection.’	
	<p>IV. Under-filling Art. 37 “Under-filling” refers to the process whereby a person is appointed to a position at a lower grade level than the grade of the position. Under-filling may occur when the appointee does not meet one of the qualification requirements of a position, either due to a lack of work experience or technical or language skills, or simply because s/he does not yet meet all of the competencies required to undertake fully and immediately the new role and responsibilities, provided no other candidate meets all the qualification requirements. Under-filling applies both to internal or external candidates for a position.</p>	Could be acceptable with additional information on who is to decide, which body, and at which stage of the process.
	<p>Art. 38 ‘In no case can there be under-filling of a position that is more than one grade above the grade of an internal candidate. Under-filling is not possible across categories, except for appointments in the director and principal officer category.</p> <p>Art. 39 ‘The candidate under-filling a position will retain the lower grade until performance demonstrates that s/he meets all of the requirements of the position and has acquired</p>	In line with the above.

Agreement or Staff regulations in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
	<p>the competencies necessary to be fully operational at the level of responsibilities required. A ‘development period’ of no less than 12 months is required before a promotion proposal can be submitted for review.</p> <p>39. The candidate under-filling a position will retain the lower grade until performance demonstrates that s/he meets all of the requirements of the position and has acquired the competencies necessary to be fully operational at the level of responsibilities required. A ‘development period’ of no less than 12 months is required before a promotion proposal can be submitted for review.</p> <p>Art. 40 In the case of a selection of an internal candidate, the Responsible Chief, in consultation with HRD must communicate to the official concerned the reasons for the under-filling. A clear development period and plan must be established, indicating specific performance and competency objectives to be achieved during that development period, as well as any training requirements.</p> <p>Art. 41 Once the official has worked in the position throughout the development period established at the commencement of the appointment, an ad hoc performance appraisal should be completed and attached to the Promotion Proposal prior to the expiration of the development period. The Performance</p>	

Agreement or Staff regulations in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
	<p>Appraisal Review should refer to the original performance and competency standards within the work-plan, specifically highlighting the achievements against those objectives. A promotion onto the higher level grade shall only be recommended on the basis of fully satisfactory work performance across the full scope of the position, and be submitted to the Reports Board for endorsement. Where at the end of the development period an official has not performed satisfactorily across the full scope of the position, the development period may be extended for a further maximum period of one year so as to enable the official to fully perform at the level of the position. Otherwise, the position shall be declared vacant and the official assigned to duties corresponding to his/her personal grade.</p>	
	<p>Art. 42 'External candidates who do not fully meet the grade requirements for a vacant position may also be offered to under-fill the position. Their progress will normally be examined within the probationary review process administered by the Reports Board. They will be eligible for promotion upon successful completion of the probationary period or at any later date determined upon appointment. The requirements set down under paragraphs 40 and 41 for documenting a development period and submitting a promotion</p>	<p>In line with the above.</p>

Agreement or Staff regulations in force	Proposal made by the Administration	Comments
	proposal will apply. An external candidate who does not perform satisfactorily across the full scope of the position after the end of the development period becomes unsuitable for continued employment with the Office.’	
	Art. 43 ‘Staff members occupying positions on an under-filled basis are not eligible for special allowances (Art. 3.7 of the Staff Regulations refers), since they are not serving in a temporary, acting or replacement capacity.’	In line with the above.
	V. Designated Staff Union representatives Art. 44 ‘The Staff Union shall inform the Human Resource Development Department of the names of up to three representatives designated by the Staff Union Committee for the purposes of the consultations and communication of information provided for in the present circular.’	New.
Please refer to Article 18 of the Annex I of the SR.	VI. Confidentiality Art. 45 ‘All concerned officials shall respect their duty to maintain strict confidentiality in all matters that come to their knowledge in the recruitment and selection process.’	