

Note on the Proceedings

Tripartite Meeting on Labour Practices in the Footwear, Leather,
Textiles and Clothing Industries

Geneva, 16-20 October 2000

Contents

Introduction	1
Part 1. Consideration of the agenda item.....	5
Report of the discussion.....	7
Introduction	7
Composition of the Working Party.....	7
Presentation of the report and general discussion	8
Presentation of the report	8
General discussion	9
Point-by-point discussion	15
Labour practices and globalization	15
Employment issues	17
Fundamental principles and rights at work	20
Human resources development	31
ILO activities	32
Consideration and adoption of the draft report and the draft conclusions by the Meeting.....	33
Conclusions on labour practices in the footwear, leather, textiles and clothing industries	35
Labour practices and globalization.....	35
Fundamental principles and rights at work	36
Child labour	36
Women workers	37
Migrant workers.....	38
Homeworkers.....	38
Clandestine workshops (“sweatshops”)	38
Debt bondage	39
Overtime	39
Freedom of association and effective recognition of the right of collective bargaining	39
Export processing zones.....	40
Voluntary private initiatives	40
Technological change and vocational training	40
The ILO’s role.....	40
Part 2. Resolutions	43
Consideration and adoption by the Meeting of the draft resolutions.....	45
Text of the resolution adopted by the Meeting	48
Resolution concerning future ILO action in the footwear, leather, textiles and clothing industries.....	48

Part 3. Other proceedings.....	51
Panel discussions	53
Social dialogue in the TCF industries: Positive experiences and bottlenecks	53
Discussion	55
Decent work – Safe work: Strategies to improve safety and health in TCF industries	57
Discussion	58
How to improve the impact of voluntary private initiatives in the TCF industries: From theory to practice	60
Discussion	61
Closing speeches.....	63
Evaluation questionnaire.....	65
List of participants	69

Introduction

The Tripartite Meeting on Labour Practices in the Footwear, Leather, Textiles and Clothing Industries was held at the International Labour Office in Geneva from 16-20 October 2000.

The Office issued in English, French and Spanish a report to serve as the basis for the Meeting's discussions.¹

In accordance with a decision of the Governing Body, Ms. L. Sasso-Mazzufferi, Employer member of the Governing Body, chaired the Meeting. The Meeting elected three Vice-Chairpersons: Mr. M. Fuchs (Czech Republic) from the Government group, Ms. T. Sosnina from the Workers' group, and Mr. J. Flores Merino from the Employers' group.

The Meeting was attended by Government representatives from Bangladesh, Belgium, China, Colombia, Czech Republic, Egypt, Malaysia, Morocco, Portugal, Thailand, Tunisia, Turkey, United States, by 20 employer representatives and by 20 worker representatives. A representative of the Government of Mexico was present at the sittings.

Representatives of the following intergovernmental organizations attended as observers: Arab Labour Organization, International Textiles and Clothing Bureau (ITCB), United Nations Economic Commission for Europe (ECE), and World Trade Organization (WTO).

In addition, representatives from the following international non-governmental organizations attended as observers: European Apparel and Textile Organization, European Observatory for Textiles and Clothing, European Trade Union Federation for Textiles, Clothing and Leather, International Confederation of Free Trade Unions, International Federation Textile and Clothing, International Federation of University Women, International Organization of Employers, International Textile, Garment and Leather Workers' Federation, World Confederation of Labour, World Federation of Trade Unions.

The three groups elected their Officers as follows:

Government group:

Chairperson: Mr. K. Nakchuen (Thailand)

Vice-Chairperson: Mr. J. Zhang (China)

Secretary: Ms. J. Hester (United States)

¹ ILO, Tripartite Meeting on Labour Practices in the Footwear, Leather, Textiles and Clothing Industries, Geneva, 2000: *Labour practices in the footwear, leather, textiles and clothing industries*, 119 pp.

Employers' group:

Chairperson: Mr. T. Makeka

Vice-Chairperson: Mr. R. Alexandriysky

Secretary: Mr. J. Dejardin (International Organization of Employers) (IOE)

Workers' group:

Chairperson: Mr. P. Booth

Vice-Chairpersons: Mr. A. Gundersheim

Ms. B. Jantjies

Ms. A. Gono

Mr. J. Callaert

Secretary: Mr. N. Kearney (International Textile, Garment and Leather Workers' Federation) (ITGLWF)

The Secretary-General of the Meeting was Mr. O. De Vries Reilingh, Director of the Sectoral Activities Department of the International Labour Office. The Deputy Secretary-General was Mr. N. Jennings of the Sectoral Activities Department and the Executive Secretary was Mr. J-P. Sajhau of the same Department. The Clerk of the Meeting was Ms. S. Maybud of the Management Services Unit of the Social Dialogue Sector. The experts were Mr. P. Bailey, Mr. B. Essenberg and Mr. P. Poschen of the Sectoral Activities Department.

The Meeting held six plenary sittings.

In her opening speech, the Chairperson of the Meeting indicated that the topic of labour practices covered most current issues concerning the TCF industries. These issues, however, needed to be considered within the context of globalization. Results from the Meeting could include an assessment of the application of the fundamental principles and rights at work as defined in the ILO Declaration, and the identification of new needs in training and redeployment, which in turn could lead to the promotion of sound labour practices in the TCF industries. The survival of these industries, including the employment they generated, depended on their capacity to respond to market needs and to improve the quality of products. These key requirements constituted the basis for improving labour practices within a framework of constructive social dialogue which secured the commitment of the social partners to adapting and improving these industries.

Ms. K. Hagen, Executive Director (Social Dialogue), welcomed the participants to the ILO. She noted that the topic of the Meeting was suggested at the last Tripartite Meeting on the Globalization of the Footwear, Textiles and Clothing Industries (November 1996). At that time a number of cases relating to abusive labour practices in TCF industries had been highlighted in the media,

especially in relation to the violation of basic human rights at work in sweatshops and to the exploitation of child labour. As the report for this Meeting showed, the dramatic changes in the TCF industries in the past few years reflected not only a significant geographic shift in employment trends but also a considerable growth in the use of subcontracting. The report was persuasive in showing the strong relationship between the growth of subcontracting chains in the TCF industries and the growing amount of this work being done by the informal sector. And it was primarily in the informal sector that one continued to find the phenomenon of substandard labour practices. The importance of the informal sector, the low unionization rate in small and medium-sized enterprises and the increasing pressure exerted by international competition were some of the factors which hampered fruitful social dialogue, and the full respect of legal obligations relating to freedom of association and the right to collective bargaining wherever the work might be.

As the report emphasized, a better and more constructive social dialogue relating to technological change and training practices would improve the efficiency and productivity of enterprises while providing, at the same time, more adequate career opportunities for those workers who wish to progress in the TCF industries. The issues discussed in the report went to the heart of the ILO's mandate – employment, wages, hours of work, respect of basic human rights at work, training and retraining – which the Director-General of the ILO had emphasized under the theme of “decent work”. Decent work meant work where all three parties to employment – government, employers and workers – freely participated in the search for a basic consensus about the conditions of work and labour practices through social dialogue. Decent work encompassed the four strategic objectives of the ILO: the promotion of fundamental principles and rights at work; employment; social protection; and social dialogue.

Ms. Hagen concluded by noting that in relation to this “cycle” of work in the TCF industries, a number of activities had been conducted over the last four years, either directly under the responsibility of the Sectoral Activities Department or in collaboration with other technical departments and the field. All the activities undertaken during the last four years, and in particular national tripartite workshops, had proved to be very useful to the countries where they had been conducted. The ILO intended to do more of these as a part of the coming “cycle” which would integrate the recommendations made at this Meeting.

Part 1

Consideration of the agenda item

Report of the discussion¹

Introduction

1. The Meeting met to consider the item on the agenda in accordance with the provisions of article 7 of the Standing Orders for sectoral meetings; the Officers presided in turn over the discussion.
2. The spokesperson for the Employers' group was Ms. Tucker and the spokesperson for the Workers' group was Mr. Gundersheim. The Meeting held five sittings devoted to the discussion of the agenda item.

Composition of the Working Party

3. At its fifth plenary sitting, in accordance with the provisions of article 13, paragraph 2, of the Standing Orders, the Meeting set up a Working Party to draw up draft conclusions reflecting the views expressed in the course of the Meeting's discussion of the report. The Working Party, presided over by the Government Vice-Chairperson (Mr. Fuchs, Czech Republic) was composed of the following members:

Government members:

Bangladesh:	Mr. Haque
Czech Republic:	Mr. Fuchs
Portugal:	Mr. Fraga de Oliveira
Tunisia:	Mr. Brini
United States:	Ms. Hester

Employer members:

Mr. Alexandriysky
Mr. Anthony
Mr. Memon
Ms. Tucker
Ms. Wong

¹ Adopted unanimously.

Worker members:

Mr. Gundersheim

Ms. Jimenez

Ms. Rhamiri

Mr. Rose

Ms. Shah

Presentation of the report and general discussion

Presentation of the report

4. The report for the Meeting prepared by the International Labour Office was introduced by the Executive Secretary. The first part of the report, which had been prepared with the assistance of the European Observatory for Textiles and Clothing, set out the general development of work practices in the context of globalization. He highlighted the trends in production in the different sectors of the TCF industries and drew attention to the effects of the Asian crisis on the production of clothing, textiles and shoes. The data confirmed the role of Asia as the principal producing region. In 1998 it produced over 50 per cent of the world's clothing by value for the first time and textile production had almost doubled in the decade to 1995. But these broad figures masked the significant changes in the location of production facilities that had occurred as one country's comparative advantage changed in relation to another's in the face of increasing international competition. Asia had benefited most from relocation strategies, with China taking the lion's share. The recent trend for production to be closer to major markets had led to increases in production in, inter alia, Maghreb and Central and Eastern European countries and in Mexico. But the growing need for quality and flexibility was also marginalizing those countries that relied solely on low production costs. Each of these developments had an impact on employment in the TCF industries and on labour practices. Notwithstanding increases in employment in developing countries as a result of relocation, it was still volatile, especially in the clothing sector where subcontracting was a major form of work. Three-quarters of the world's clothing workforce are women (30 per cent in textiles and 45 per cent in shoemaking). What had changed was the ability of women to assume more responsible and more highly skilled jobs in the sector. While this illustrated an evolution in attitudes, paradoxically, some of these opportunities were due to a lack of interest shown by young people in the sector. Increased competition had led to greater use of subcontracting, part-time, temporary and seasonal work, much of which was precarious, notably in the countries of Central and Eastern Europe. Home work provided employers with the greatest degree of flexibility, but it was also open to abuse due to its diminished legal status. Official data showed that remuneration in the TCF industries was significantly below that of other manufacturing sectors and that there were still important differences between men's and women's earnings, particularly in the clothing industry. Notwithstanding

a general reduction in official working hours, there was still recourse to significant amounts of overtime. This, together with increased home work, meant that working time remained long. Turning to the issue of labour practices and fundamental rights, the speaker informed the Meeting that 53 member States had ratified seven of the eight core ILO Conventions and 25 had ratified all eight. There had been significant progress in the area of child labour, especially in the formal sector, since the last Meeting in 1996, thanks to the efforts of many groups. There remained, however, much to be done to deal with child labour in the informal TCF sector. Although freedom of association underpinned fundamental rights at work, there was often still a significant gap between law and practice. Social dialogue was an important feature in some countries, but it was often lacking due to globalization and competitive pressures. The nature of many jobs in TCF enterprises (largely “low-skilled”) and the high proportion of women and migrant workers meant that it was often possible for discriminatory practices to develop and flourish, particularly as far as pay was concerned. The sector had, however, benefited from the global change in attitudes towards harassment at the workplace. Forced labour was not common in the TCF industries, but there were examples of bonded labour and the situation of clandestine workers in sweatshops was sometimes akin to forced labour. Export processing zones were generally modern installations with human resource practices that were better than those at the national level. But there were often problems as far as recognition of the right to organize was concerned. Private voluntary initiatives were playing a greater role throughout the TCF industries, which had been to the forefront in their development, but they were not a substitute for social dialogue and their development needed to be transparent and credible. Increased competition was bringing with it a need for new and improved training techniques and increased opportunities for training and retraining. Wide social dialogue would be important for their successful development and introduction.

General discussion

5. The Worker spokesperson said that discussions on labour practices had to take place in the context of globalization. Intense competition in the TCF industries was driving down wages and working conditions as companies sought new contracts and governments competed for foreign investment. The victims of this “race to the bottom” were the workers who were, in effect, subsidizing the TCF industries through their low wages and poor working conditions. There was considerable under-investment and much poor management of out-of-date factories. Creating social partnerships based on respect for workers, trade unions and fundamental rights would lead to increased viability of these industries. As they became more competitive and profitable, workers would have higher spending power, investment would be stimulated and employment would increase. It was important to note that cooperation was generally confined to the national level while investment was determined globally. Social concerns had to be taken into account at the international level too. The Workers’ group felt strongly that trade and respect for fundamental workers’ rights should be linked and discussed at international meetings. Ignoring workers’ rights would make it harder to resist calls for trade restrictions. They stressed the need to find flexible and fair solutions through social dialogue to problems arising from globalization and felt that this Meeting could make an important contribution to strengthening social dialogue and building partnerships to address the issues before it.

-
6. The Chairperson of the Employers' group praised the report prepared by the Office which, notwithstanding a relative lack of information on Africa, raised important issues. The Employers' group was committed to the fundamental principles of the ILO and to workers' rights. He reaffirmed their commitment to the Declaration. He regretted the comparative absence of information on leather and footwear in the report and noted that while some issues might be common to all subsectors of the TCF industries, there were some that were specific to each element. Globalization was a key issue that required all aspects be examined before any decisions were made on it. The issue of trade linkages had been widely discussed in several international forums, including the Governing Body, and he cautioned against discussing it at this Meeting as it risked occupying all the time to the detriment of other important issues. The Employers' group was concerned about working conditions and wages within the sector but pointed to the considerable economic importance of the TCF industries, particularly in developing countries. The Meeting's deliberations and outcome had to take this into account.
 7. A Worker member from Lesotho raised the issues of collective agreements and working time. Some multinational enterprises (MNEs) in Africa were avoiding negotiating collective agreements with unions in order not to have to improve working conditions and wages. Governments sometimes gave their tacit support. Moreover, high production targets often led to excessive working time but without overtime payments. Thus there were cases where minimum standards and ILO Conventions were neither being complied with by employers nor enforced by governments.
 8. A Worker member from Indonesia pointed out that while TCF workers received the statutory minimum wage, but with no benefits, it was barely enough to meet basic needs. Indonesia had ratified ILO Conventions Nos. 87 and 98. As unions were growing rapidly and there could be many different unions in one enterprise, the impact of these Conventions was significant. The large number of unions in some enterprises made it difficult for workers to speak with one voice and easy for employers to avoid negotiations, leading to worsening working conditions. The growth of the informal sector and individual subcontracts with even less social protection made matters worse. Whole families were involved and children were not going to school but working at home. Working methods had changed from employing one male worker for a complete task to employing several women workers to complete different parts of the same task. This marginalized women workers, depriving them of opportunities to increase their knowledge and income. The implementation of codes of conduct were best monitored by unions as governments were less familiar with the codes.
 9. The representative of the Government of China regretted that the report contained some inaccurate information pertaining to his country and expressed his concern. He indicated that the development of his country's economy, including the TCF industry, was in line with national economic reform and economic globalization. China needed to learn from developed countries so as to improve its TCF technologies and not be dependent on labour-intensive development. Employment in the TCF industry was an issue, and he recounted experiences in solving unemployment problems during structural change in his country. These experiences demonstrated that as long as the government and society had good will, unemployment issues were solved to a certain extent. After providing for their

basic needs, workers were trained or retrained and were subsequently re-employed. His Government had also emphasized monitoring and supervising private and foreign-funded enterprises which had infringed workers' rights, and those found breaching the national labour law were punished accordingly. He indicated that developing countries should not be blamed for their wage levels or working conditions, which were results of historical inequities in the international economic order. In order to improve wages and working conditions in developing countries, developed countries, as well as the ILO, should provide assistance.

10. A Worker member from Ghana outlined a number of problems affecting West Africa. Many TCF workers were made redundant when governments privatized state-owned enterprises. Globalization also forced developing countries to compete against each other and governments responded by making labour laws more flexible to attract foreign direct investment (FDI). As a result, wages, working conditions and core labour standards were sometimes ignored, even by countries which had ratified ILO Conventions Nos. 87 and 98. How could the benefits of globalization be shared if those making high-priced TCF products earned as little as 5 cents an hour? Although Africa had a small share of the TCF industry, the level of abuse there was among the highest; something needed to be done.
11. The Chairperson of the Employers' group reiterated their full support for the core Conventions and the ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work. Social dialogue was the best method of resolving differences that sometimes arise between employers and workers, and their organizations in the interpretation of the Declaration and its implementation or application. Closing down the few factories which did not comply with labour standards did not resolve anything; such sanctions only put people out of work.
12. The representative of the Government of Egypt emphasized the importance of the TCF industries in Africa, which could have been better reflected in the report. These were labour-intensive industries which now needed more highly skilled workers in order to compete on the basis of technology. The principles in the ILO Declaration had to be implemented over time since rapid solutions, such as linking trade with international labour standards, would be superficial. Also, the reasons why they were not respected had to be eliminated in order to ensure benefits from globalization. The ILO should build awareness about the Declaration, IPEC and women workers.
13. A Worker member from Belgium outlined the long tradition of social dialogue in his country, which flourished due to permanent structures and processes at all levels. Collective bargaining took place every two years and focused on purchasing power, performance, occupational safety and health, work and family life, reduction of working time and retirement planning. Industry benefited from having a stable, highly productive workforce. Nevertheless, the flexibility required led to stress. Women workers needed more time with their families while at the same time being trained for jobs traditionally occupied by men. Immigrants also were in need of training, including language skills, better to integrate them into the industry. The social partners organized language courses for migrant workers. Lifelong learning was necessary throughout the TCF industries to impart new skills and improve adaptability to new technologies, and to obtain work outside the industry. The Belgian trade unions supported the Clean Clothes Campaign and put

pressure on Belgian employers to respect laws and ILO Conventions wherever they operated.

- 14.** The Employer spokesperson emphasized that her remarks on codes of conduct reflected the views of her own company, not necessarily those of the group. Since their introduction in 1991, most major brand names in the industry had a code of conduct. Her company had found a code to be both necessary and beneficial; its customers expected it. Despite the challenges, it made work abroad better. Ensuring the respect for ILO Conventions by its suppliers helped promote a level playing field. Similarly, her company supported international and industry initiatives. A programme of internal and external monitoring was an important and visible benchmark. She urged the ILO to examine different voluntary initiatives, especially in this industry to see what could be learnt from them. It was already clear that one size did not fit all. What was good for a large multinational might not be feasible for a small or medium-sized enterprise.
- 15.** The representative of the Government of Bangladesh felt that it would be unfair to draw conclusions without looking at the broader context. Labour practices should be looked at from a development perspective. A recent OECD study had confirmed that fears about a race to the bottom in labour standards were probably exaggerated. The real challenge was to develop a paradigm which would eliminate poverty, with its huge economic and social costs, and promote social dialogue.
- 16.** A Worker member from the Philippines indicated that there was consensus on the fact that multinationals and free trade zones heavily influenced globalization. While the Labour Code in the Philippines ensured that there would be no problems with respect for freedom of association or collective bargaining, an adverse impact of globalization had been the increase in contract labour which had led to downsizing and retrenchments. The need to accept casualization and flexibility had weakened the trade union movement, but there was no alternative; globalization could not be stopped.
- 17.** An Employer member from Mexico agreed there was no alternative to globalization but cautioned against mixing up the mandates of bodies such as the WTO with that of the ILO. Forcing compliance with obligations was unlikely to be effective, especially in small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs). In Mexico, it was difficult to finance SMEs serving niche markets. The task was to find a way of permitting all to enjoy the benefits that globalization could bring, including faster economic development.
- 18.** A Worker member from Colombia highlighted the systematic violence against workers and trade union officials in his country, including disappearances, torture and murder – all of which had been reported to the Committee on Freedom of Association. There was also a proliferation of decrees against the workers, such as the law which ran counter to the collective bargaining rights of workers. The speaker acknowledged the need of enterprises to be viable but not at the cost of workers' rights.
- 19.** An Employer member from Germany indicated his general agreement with the report while noting the difficulty of covering all countries at different levels of development for three very different industries. The textile industry still existed in

Germany, but many jobs had been lost. Globalization could not be opposed, but the social partners could try to influence how it took place. His industry, with the participation of trade unions, had agreed an EU code of conduct that incorporated the core labour standards. In other countries, government guarantees of fundamental rights might be more appropriate. Multinationals could support such codes and ensure that their suppliers complied, an advantage SMEs did not have. In any event, everyone had the obligation to do his best.

20. A Worker member from Bangladesh emphasized that both the Government and the social partners had roles to play in providing stable employment. She referred to the IPEC programme in Bangladesh to remove under-age children from garment factories and provide them with education and training. Unfortunately, only 7,000-10,000 children could be accommodated out of an estimated 100,000 children originally working in the factories. This raised the question about the other 90 per cent who potentially had shifted to even more hazardous occupations. Ultimately, training had to be integrated into formal education and jobs provided at the end. The Government also had to enforce the legislation against child labour in SMEs and in the informal sector.
21. A Worker member from Romania said that large enterprises usually became smaller once they had been privatized. In some cases, trade unions followed the same pattern, but then larger trade union structures were created. Although social dialogue was well established in her country, workers were concerned about maintaining their acquired rights as negotiations became tougher. Whereas larger enterprises respected freedom of association, smaller enterprises were more likely to resist workers organizing and insist on the maximum flexibility allowed under the law. MNEs also pressured workers by threatening to go elsewhere if their demands were too high, as other countries were also competing to supply the European Union (EU) with clothing. Although overtime worked was paid as such, this did not compensate for stress and other health problems, particularly affecting women. Romania had once been a large producer of textiles but it was now a net importer with its mills closed. On the surface, the ban on child labour was complied with, but nevertheless there was a growing unregulated underground economy. Ninety per cent of the workers in the sector were women; they often had low-skilled manual jobs using obsolete technologies, giving rise to health problems. There was little prospect for advancement. The high content of manual work meant that safety and health were key issues. Although vocational training was provided, many new recruits left because of the pace of work and low pay.
22. A Worker member from Morocco said that the Labour Code was not applied and that 90 per cent of TCF workers were women with poor working conditions, no social protection and excessive hours without overtime pay. Convention No. 87 was not ratified and consequently freedom of association was not always respected. Union officers could be dismissed when workers organized, and the militia sometimes brought in when workers went on strike. Alternatively, the workers were locked out. Occupational safety and health were appalling and workers could be injured. The effects of ill-ventilated workplaces could result in occupational diseases. Sexual harassment was endemic, especially in factories where workers were not organized. Women had no redress as there were no legal provisions to protect them. All the foregoing applied to the formal sector. The informal sector was worse, with the additional problem of child labour. Tools were needed to apply

the Labour Code and provide trade unions with the means of amending it to combat more effectively these negative effects. Measures could include: encouraging the ratification of Convention No. 87 and collective bargaining; providing more protection for workers; more education and schools; promoting vocational training; setting up joint committees on OSH and training matters; and organizing the informal sector.

23. The representative of the Government of Morocco noted the importance of the TCF industries for the balanced development of his country, largely because of both large and small and medium-sized enterprises, both in terms of employment (largely female) and export earnings. Much of the informal sector employment was in textiles and there had been positive examples of relocation from urban to rural areas. He quoted from an article by a foreign correspondent who had found the working conditions favourable and sweatshops to be absent and children were not employed in formal sector enterprises. He acknowledged that legislation was not fully applied in the informal sector and the craft industry. However, many enterprises provided more than the legal requirements, including benefits such as transportation, mutual funds, and 13th month bonus. The opportunity for social dialogue had always existed and should be seized to make improvements.
24. An observer (International Federation of University Women) welcomed the disaggregation of data by sex and age in the report which highlighted the plight, particularly with regard to pay and training, of women who made up the majority of export processing zone (EPZ) workers and home workers in the TCF sector. Women were prevented from obtaining higher level jobs because of the entry level skills required to obtain necessary training. Structural adjustment had exacerbated gender inequality through the casualization of work which largely affected women. Women – in the informal sector and entrepreneurs in SMEs – needed an enabling environment to open the door to information technology, access to finance and the right to property in order to start their own businesses. Change had to be tackled in a comprehensive and holistic manner, focusing on family values.
25. The representative of the Government of the Czech Republic referred to the recent anti-globalization protest in Prague and noted that media representatives had made polls among the demonstrators which showed that a substantial part of the demonstrators did not know what globalization was or that it had existed for hundreds of years. The only difference today was its pace and scale. Changes in the country during the last ten years had resulted from privatization and globalization had influenced employment, working conditions and labour practices in the TCF sector. There were many new SMEs. A short-term effect had been significant job losses. But better productivity had led to improved working conditions and wages, especially following foreign investment. There was extensive social dialogue in the TCF sector in the Czech Republic.
26. The representative of the Government of Portugal pointed out that his country ranked fourth among the EU's TCF industries in employment terms. Transformations and restructuring had led to a number of cascading problems beginning with outsourcing and leading to informal and clandestine employment in low-quality jobs. This and micro-enterprises were impossible for the State to control. New strategies based on clear priorities and objectives had to be developed

together with the social partners. Social and labour values had to be affirmed. Labour laws and their application were matters for society as a whole.

27. An observer (International Textile, Garment and Leather Workers' Federation) said that in many countries the TCF industries were in crisis. Jobs were being lost, competition was intense, and companies that respected the law were undercut by those who did not, often with the connivance of governments. The forthcoming expiry of the Multi-Fibre Arrangement (MFA) was causing great uncertainty. The focus of power had shifted from manufacturers to global merchandisers and retailers and production was now very fluid. Industrial relations were generally poor, negotiating skills were limited, and conflicts were frequent and were often accompanied by threats, harassment and worse. Most problems related to the right to organize, collective bargaining, wages and hours of work. A week's work sometimes only bought three days of food; 16-17-hour days, seven days a week were not uncommon. A solution had to be found within the industries or they would be imposed on them. Codes of conduct had been imposed on manufacturers and retailers by consumers. But the suppliers received no compensation; they had to provide high-quality goods to strict deadlines, which led to the excessive hours and poor working conditions that existed. He welcomed the support of the Employers for the ILO Declaration, but wondered about a mechanism to enforce it in States which ignored it. One answer might lie in linking trade and workers' rights. The interdependence of employers and workers was a daily reality. Cooperation was essential and the Meeting should set an example for the entire industry by examining the problems and possible solutions and reaching agreement on a range of measures that would contribute to meeting the challenges.

Point-by-point discussion

Labour practices and globalization

28. The Worker spokesperson questioned all the supposed benefits of a global economy. The academic arguments were well rehearsed but many problems negated the benefits. These needed to be addressed so that benefits could be realized. Rather like industrialization, globalization had caused insecurity and had increased inequalities. The ease with which production centres could be moved often harmed local economies. Inputs were not sourced locally and the product was too expensive for local consumption; local industries withered. Countries were induced to set up EPZs, but since they were outside the purview of national laws and practices the result was a second class "country" within a country. The lack of applicable regulations in EPZs meant there was often no collective bargaining or dispute settling mechanism, a tendency to lower wages not higher, and a reduction in purchasing power. Even though there might be more jobs in one country the overall net benefit might still be negative. Governments had lost the means to implement their own regulations, and offering incentives such as tax concessions could lead to a reduction in national income. Any benefits from globalization tended to accrue to a minority thereby increasing economic inequality, especially where skill levels were below average. Thus there needed to be both international and national efforts to address the many issues that globalization had created.

-
- 29.** The Employer spokesperson agreed that globalization was a mixed bag, and that it was here to stay. She was optimistic about the benefits of globalization in terms of new technology and technology transfer, better communications, improved production processes, higher wages, better terms of employment and increased education and training opportunities for TCF workers. The importance of the sector in developing countries and countries in transition should not be overlooked and it was here that any disadvantages had been felt most. SMEs could not compete internationally, factories had closed, access to credit was difficult and quotas had posed difficulties for many countries. Relocation of manufacturing was based on seeking increases in productivity, not the lowest labour costs. It was also important to differentiate between the footwear and clothing industries, with the former being more difficult to relocate. She felt there was a tendency to blame globalization for problems caused by other factors. Employers sought a level playing field that was underpinned by the terms of the Declaration.
 - 30.** The representative of the Government of Turkey agreed that there were positive and negative effects of globalization. Enterprises performed more strongly but there could be negative effects on labour practices. The rise in the informal sector had put great pressure on the quality of jobs, wage levels and union influence in the formal sector. Provided the social impact was not neglected and labour practices were not sacrificed for short-term gains, globalization should benefit everyone in the long term.
 - 31.** The representative of the Government of the United States agreed that globalization was generally beneficial. The TCF industries provided jobs for those who had difficulty in finding work in higher skilled occupations. The drive to reduce production costs in various countries had adversely affected jobs globally. A positive approach would be to ensure that workers reaped the benefits of globalization. For this to occur there had to be a global commitment to ensuring that the core labour standards were implemented and that laws were applied in every sector, formal and informal.
 - 32.** A Worker member from Germany noted that, as a result of information and communications technology, enterprises were no longer tied to a particular location. They could now produce goods worldwide with the same conditions. New technologies had helped harmonize production standards so that competition no longer depended on better know-how or technology but on differences in working conditions. These could be driven down, which was the most important negative effect of globalization. Technology was developing more rapidly than could be coped with; working conditions could not be restored to previous levels. TCF was now a consumer-driven industry, the original purpose of which was to meet domestic needs and then export any surplus. Nowadays, however, many facilities produced solely for export and neglected domestic markets. This had led to declines in working conditions and the inability of workers to purchase the goods they produced.
 - 33.** The representative of the Government of Bangladesh agreed that the impact of globalization should be examined from a geographical perspective. Two interlinked forces were shaping economies – the promise of a new economy arising from progress in IT and communications, and growing instability and uncertainty. The growth of the “knowledge” part of the economy also affected the TCF industries as

they became more flexible, more dispersed and more diversified. The benefits of new technology were unevenly distributed because of the different degree of access to knowledge technology and resources – the “digital divide”. An ILO study in Bangladesh on the social dimension of globalization had revealed that liberalization and growth had been accompanied by increased inequality and instability. The Meeting’s conclusions should identify areas of action for the ILO in addressing labour practices in the TCF industries and assist in improving the management of industrial relations.

34. The Worker spokesperson concluded that jobs had shifted away from those countries that promoted strong trade unions and effective collective bargaining and enforced high labour standards. This had occurred within regions as well as between them. It was not just a North-South shift. It was no longer legitimate to argue that comparative advantage could be sought through the use of poor work practices. Competition had to be on a different basis, with a level playing field. The Employers’ group seemed to be overly concerned with productivity as a determinant of location for production facilities. He believed this contradicted the practice of setting specific prices for end products and demanding high-quality and delivery standards that had adverse effects on workers, including the reintroduction of sweatshops, the informal sector and the use of migrant labour in some countries. The cost of production was clearly important since competitiveness was based on price and quality, not on the way goods were produced. The burgeoning trade in used clothing was destroying local industries in many parts of the world, particularly in Africa, and was leaving thousands of workers out of jobs. Thus, the trade in used clothing was further impoverishing already poor communities.
35. The Employer spokesperson had not said that productivity was the sole criterion. She recognized that it was not possible to make high-quality merchandise in facilities that were not safe or healthy and where workers’ rights were denied. Employers did not support such places and it was unfair to suggest that they combed the world looking for sources of cheap labour. But it took time for changes to be implemented and many employers were involved in different initiatives to improve working conditions, including ILO programmes. Productivity had to be taken into account, along with price, quality and delivery. She noted that the TCF industries had been important for the economic development of many countries, and in achieving improvements in labour standards. Some employers were examining their supply chain to ensure that the standards they had set were observed throughout. It was, however, for governments to ensure that legislation encompassed both the formal and informal sectors and that it was effectively enforced.

Employment issues

36. The Worker spokesperson noted that workers were often treated as part of the production process – used as and when required. He saw no reason for having EPZs as there were other means of reducing tariffs for inputs to the production process which was their *raison d’être*. Increased recourse to contractors had led to a fall in regular employment with traditional benefits. Multinational companies exerted tremendous influence over their contractors. Their demands for lower prices and short delivery times meant that workers often had to work very long hours for low pay. There was no guarantee that a relocation of production would

keep standards and benefits for the workers concerned. For the most part, the jobs transferred were low-paid and insecure jobs, often in EPZs in the informal sector. The issue was the shift of power away from manufacturers and even from governments. Its consequences needed to be addressed as did the means by which the ILO and others could develop measures to regulate the negative effects of globalization. Good examples of means to improve environmental performance might be relevant for labour issues too.

- 37.** The Employer spokesperson challenged the Workers' group's view that employers would change workforces as fashions changed. No successful employer could remain in business by undertaking short-term expedient action. Employment changes had had mixed effects, including losses and gains and more sophisticated jobs involving multiskilled workers, especially in export-oriented operations. But some domestic workers had gone unnoticed. Some employers had decided not to have their suppliers use home workers because of the difficulty of supervision. Whereas in other parts of the industry, notably at the high end of the shoe market, much skilled work was done at home. Also, home work provided employment to many who would be unable to work in a factory. It was not home work per se that was a problem. Rather it was where accepted labour practices were ignored. The fact that the Home Work Convention, 1996 (No. 177), had only received two ratifications illustrated the problems of implementing standards for home work. Stable employment depended on market conditions; governments should set the appropriate policy framework. When seeking flexibility, employers were not seeking reductions in labour standards or workers' rights. What was required was the means to ensure that SMEs could compete successfully. Although EPZs would be discussed more fully later, it was important to note that they had been set up in response to tariffs, not to diminish workers' rights. There were plenty of EPZs that allowed trade unions and paid higher wages than other domestic jobs in the country concerned. The Employers' group recognized the progress made on environmental issues but cautioned about equating it with less quantifiable labour concerns.
- 38.** The representative of the Government of Egypt referred to the difficulty of organizing home work in her country because of constraints on inspections in homes. Employers needed to be able to contact their workers, who should receive normal benefits. Home work should not be overly constrained but should react to market needs.
- 39.** The representative of the Government of the United States said that home work should be subject to the same labour laws as applied to the formal sector. Under the Fair Labor Standards Act, home work was proscribed in some TCF sectors in the United States. Where it was permitted, it had to be certified, including on an individual basis in certain cases. Whether restricted or unrestricted home work in the United States is subject to provisions covering minimum wage, hours and overtime.
- 40.** A Worker member from India referred to the many, mostly female, homeworkers in her country who received less than half the statutory minimum wage and had no social benefits. Convention No. 177 was both strong and flexible and should be widely ratified in accordance with national conditions, thereby affording a minimum of protection to these workers.

-
41. The Worker spokesperson reiterated the flexibility of Convention No. 177, the purpose of which was not to outlaw home work but to end abuses. The idea that home work existed to provide employment to disabled people and those with special family responsibilities was stretching the concept too far. These issues had been dealt with in factories for years. Trade unions had to play a role in the enforcement of Convention No. 177, particularly with respect to job security, health care, social and other non-wage benefits that were the subject of collective bargaining.
 42. An Employer member from Germany agreed that there was a lack of stability, but the clock could not be turned back. Enterprises had to adapt to rapid change in order to survive. There were opportunities to benefit from increased trade while retaining minimum labour standards in a social free market. Consumers now had considerable power and demanded quality, swift adaptations to change and low prices. But everyone was a consumer with different needs and this should be borne in mind. There was a move away from home work in Germany because of its longer lead times and slower throughput. Nonetheless, there were minimum wage and other standards for home workers which were set through social dialogue. But in some countries the standards were not worth the paper they were printed on, so means to ensure their implementation in sovereign States were required.
 43. The Employer spokesperson called on the ILO to look at two issues: distinguishing between footwear and textile and clothing production; and the relationship between quotas and the relocation of clothing production since many companies, as their business expanded, needed to extend their source base. This presented a challenge as far as compliance was concerned.
 44. A Worker member from Colombia believed that trade unions could develop strategies for increasing productivity that would provide greater stability and autonomy of more highly trained workers. Workers should receive productivity bonuses or a share of the proceeds of increased productivity.
 45. The representative of the Government of Thailand said that globalization generally had a positive effect on jobs, including home work. His Government had set up a unit to support home workers and had set up networks among government officials and NGOs to help them. He recognized, however, that there was still a lack of protection and a need to improve labour regulations to create a balance between economic and social activities. He agreed with the Employers' group that policies and regulations concerning home work should take into account market conditions and the jobs that home work could create.
 46. The representative of the Government of Bangladesh referred to the role of government in setting and implementing standards. He felt that globalization had led to the marginalization of governments in some developing countries as they had withdrawn from economic activities and had little time and fewer means to adjust to changes brought about by globalization. They faced demands for job creation as well as having to ensure people's well-being. There were, however, some responsibilities that could and should be shared.
 47. The Worker spokesperson welcomed the remarks about a social compact from the Employer member from Germany. The global spread of textile and clothing

production in particular had arisen because of the quota system. Without it, many developing countries would not have had access to markets for their products. Since there were similar trends throughout the TCF sector, and the expiry of the MFA could have adverse effects on many countries, it was important to examine them and identify the winners and losers and the reasons behind their situation.

48. The representative of the Government of Portugal said that his Government had not ratified Convention No. 177 and was addressing the issue within the provisions of a 1991 Act from two perspectives to reflect the differences between properly regulated home work, such as the embroidery industry in Madeira, where workers had a guaranteed salary, paid holiday and other benefits, and clandestine unregulated home work that was prevalent in northern Portugal in the clothing industry and especially in the footwear industry. The trade unions had made considerable efforts to inform homeworkers of their rights so that they could benefit from the legal entitlements. In Madeira, a concerted effort was necessary to encourage enterprises to join the regulated home work sector. This meant that the information had to be provided to people at home, so unconventional approaches might be necessary.

Fundamental principles and rights at work

Child labour

49. The Employer spokesperson said there had been significant progress in dealing with child labour in the TCF industries. She urged all concerned to support the IPEC programme, which was providing viable solutions in several countries to the problem of child labour. These programmes could be replicated elsewhere. It was important to realize that most child labour was in the informal sector and there were limits to what employers in the formal sector could do. It was for governments to ensure that schooling was available, together with stronger labour inspectorates. Some employers had paid for schooling when under-age workers had been discovered in their plants.
50. The representative of the Government of Bangladesh said that child labour was no longer an acceptable part of family life. In reality, however, it was not always possible for all children to go to school and they had to contribute to the family's earnings. Efforts to combat child labour should be based on a broad socio-economic approach to address the prime cause of child labour – poverty. The flexible, multifaceted approach contained in the Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182), provided the most appropriate means to eliminate child labour. Bangladesh had displayed the political will to eliminate child labour, enacting machinery to protect children's rights. Considerable progress had already been made in the ready-made garment sector and the Government was examining the possibility of ratifying Convention No. 182 before the end of this year.
51. A Worker member from Colombia called for the universal ratification of the Minimum Age Convention, 1973 (No. 138), and Convention No. 182 and for awareness raising and education campaigns as part of the means to address the political and economic causes of child labour. Trade unions and NGOs should be to the forefront of promoting the rights of children, especially to education, and of eliminating child labour.

-
52. The representative of the Government of Egypt noted that child labour needed a comprehensive plan that went beyond the responsibilities of a single ministry, together with political will, to combat child labour. Both short- and long-term approaches were necessary. The former included removing children from dangerous occupations, helping families get adequate income, medical campaigns, vocational training and the provision of health and social services for legal young workers. In the long-term, the complete eradication of child labour was the goal and policies and programmes for this had to be set up in Egypt. Continued donor assistance was necessary. Egypt had ratified Convention No. 138 and a tripartite committee was examining the possibility of ratifying Convention No. 182.
53. The Worker spokesperson said that all agreed child labour was wrong and had to be eliminated. The issue was how best to move to “zero tolerance” of child labour through a mix of positive measures and sanctions. The overriding objective was the abolition of child labour. This required no new recruitment of child workers, and the removal from the workforce of children under the minimum age. Family income needed to be maintained by employing adult members of the same family, by stipends paid by the employer to the family of the child, or by financial assistance by the government. The obvious answer was to raise adult wages through collective bargaining so that children did not need to go to work. Laws banning child labour should be enforced and employers should implement codes of practice that reached down to the start of the supply chain and included subcontractors and home workers. There were already a number of such agreements whereby employers ensured that work was properly carried out. Employers could also create funds for education and training to augment those provided by impoverished government authorities, and there should be increased cooperation between the ILO and its constituents and with NGOs. The successes of IPEC, particularly in the TCF sectors, should be built upon. Finally, linking trade agreements and labour standards would provide additional encouragement to countries having problems in enforcing bans on child labour.
54. The representative of the Government of Egypt disagreed with the statement of the Worker spokesperson endorsing boycotts of products made by children. Egypt too would like to abolish child labour but a boycott would often be more harmful to the poorest families where the child was the sole breadwinner particularly if the child then undertook even worse activities. Alternatives had to be found which were not worse than the original situation and which involved the ILO. In 1996, Egypt had introduced legislation to provide social protection to women and children.
55. The representative of the Government of Morocco indicated that child labour there was largely confined to the informal and craft sector. Morocco was working with the ILO to limit the presence of children in the labour market but, as a developing country, it was not yet in a position to abolish child labour in the craft industry. He felt that the poverty and mentality of parents, as well as tradition and levels of social development, were the root causes of child labour. Morocco was endeavouring to abide by international instruments in setting the minimum age. For example, dangerous work could not be carried out by persons under 16 and night work was banned between 10 p.m. and 5 a.m. Labour inspectors had to be trained and themselves be convinced of the need to reduce child labour if they were to be able to educate, as well as police regulations. There was also a need for inter-ministry cooperation. Promotional campaigns should be aimed at parents and those

responsible for vocational training. The will to protect children at work should be expressed in legislation that conformed with existing international Conventions. Home work was rather rare in Morocco and mainly craft based. Large enterprises as well as SMEs, where the labour costs were lower than those in Europe, did not need to use homeworkers.

- 56.** A Worker member from Germany disagreed with previous Government representatives. He did not think that poverty was the cause of child labour, rather it was the profit motive of companies which employed children because they were cheaper. Boycotts were therefore a means to help governments deal with the problem. If Conventions and other instruments were insufficient to achieve a change in legislation, outside pressure was required.
- 57.** A Worker member from India said child labour had to be abolished. Competition for employment in the informal sector meant low wages and recourse to child labour. However, if their parents were fully and gainfully employed the children would not have to work. Governments should have employment-generating schemes so that children could go to school. She gave the example of the “bidi” (cigarette) industry where an employer-funded social security scheme was able to offer scholarships to children of the workers.
- 58.** The representative of the Government of China pointed out that there was a historical component to child labour, as well as an economic one. Most industrialized countries still had child labour less than a century ago. Children in developing countries had to work today for the same reasons as those in industrialized countries in earlier times – poverty. They had to help support the family. He agreed with the representatives of the Governments of Bangladesh and Egypt about the economic reasons for child labour and the need for broad efforts to combat it. Linking trade and international labour standards, however, was likely to hinder economic development and hence delay the end of child labour.
- 59.** A Worker member from Morocco listed a number of means for combating child labour. These included: obligatory schooling and monitoring to make sure children attended; measures to combat poverty so that family incomes were adequate; efforts to organize the informal sector where most of the children were employed; and monitoring of enterprises and businesses to eliminate clandestine workshops. Inhuman treatment of workers should result in imprisonment.
- 60.** The representative of the Government of the United States referred to recent work by the US Department of Labor that had found three barriers to the elimination of child labour. They were: a poverty of resources, a poverty of opportunity, and the availability of work for children to do. To overcome the poverty of resources training could be provided to other family members so they could work to replace the child’s income. To overcome the poverty of opportunity educational programmes had to be made attractive. To counteract the availability of work, international standards such as Convention No. 182 should be ratified to make it more difficult to hire children. In addition, new technologies could be introduced to make the employment of children unnecessary and a higher profile should be given to the negative aspects of child labour. Initiatives like Rugmark should be continued and a greater general awareness of child labour promoted through codes of conduct. There should also be more local involvement in education where vested

interest might produce a more desirable outcome. Furthermore, enabling transparency in compliance through cross-notification between ILO member States of activities undertaken would help encourage enforcement.

61. The representative of the Government of Thailand called for more collaboration between government and the social partners, together with NGOs, to combat child labour. Thailand was proceeding on two levels, the first at the national level to raise awareness and to train labour inspection volunteers and the second at the international level where Thailand was working closely with IPEC and UNICEF. Such cooperative efforts had led to an improvement in the child labour situation.
62. The representative of the Government of Portugal said there were several causes of child labour, including the economic situation of the parents, profit-seeking motivations of the employers and tradition. Legislation in Portugal set the minimum working age at 16. With systematic monitoring the incidence of child labour had decreased markedly.

Non-discrimination

63. The Employer spokesperson said that the Employers' group did not condone any discrimination against women. Where did discrimination begin? Was it at the workplace or was it when a young girl did not receive education or have access to training? Governments needed to continue to support education and training programmes that were targeted at women. As to employer action, the ILO's excellent programme – More and Better Jobs for Women – was already used by them. Employers had also set standards for suppliers that banned discrimination and had supported micro-lending. Hiring and promotion should be on the basis of qualification not gender. With respect to migrant workers, all standards should be applied equally.
64. The Worker spokesperson said that there was discrimination in the TCF industries; the question was about the demarcation line. Certain jobs, such as weaving, were reserved for men, whereas sewing was largely undertaken by women. There were few women in responsible management positions. Sexual harassment was prevalent and women of childbearing age were discriminated against. Where laws existed to prevent discrimination there was a need for more education so that women could understand their rights and be able to submit complaints. Every job should be open to all workers and efforts should be undertaken to get more women to join and assume leadership positions in trade unions so that they could better react to their problems. Some countries needed to provide better complaints procedures; part-time workers often had no protection at all. The issue of migrant workers presented problems and needed further study about the extent of migrant labour. To ensure their integration, employers needed to take measures to ensure their equality of treatment and opportunity. The illegal use of migrant workers should be publicized and stopped through better observance of laws and Conventions. Language training should be provided to enable migrants to integrate better into society. The Workers were also opposed to the growing use of contract labour across borders.
65. The representative of the Government of Egypt said that many women in her country had benefited from legislation, gaining senior positions in enterprises and unions. Their success provided encouragement to others and, in itself, militated

against discrimination, as did the fact that the national assembly favoured the promotion of women in Parliament. A national women's council was created to promote the role of women in all areas, especially in decision-making and in parliamentary elections.

- 66.** The representative of the Government of Malaysia indicated that, while his country had no specific law on discrimination, government policy was against any form of discrimination or victimization at work. Complaints were dealt with by the Labour Department, which had recently issued a code of practice on the prevention and eradication of sexual harassment in the workplace. Companies were encouraged to have in-house policies and special policy statements in this respect. There were about 1 million foreign workers in Malaysia, both unskilled and semi-skilled. They enjoyed the same rights as nationals but the problem was illegal workers who could not be protected because they did not come forward to lodge any complaints at the Labour Department.
- 67.** The Employer spokesperson, in response to the Worker spokesperson, emphasized that the Employers knew sexual harassment and discrimination existed, but they did not endorse it. She did agree with the Workers' group that active anti-discrimination measures were needed and that there should be more women in management positions and in trade unions.
- 68.** The representative of the Government of the Czech Republic said that, as a result of his country's preparations for EU membership, the Labour Code was being amended with respect to wages and non-discrimination. To ensure implementation, the labour inspection bodies had to be adequately informed and instructed about how to enforce it and provide advice and counselling to the public, including at the local level. Public-awareness campaigns were also needed to inform women of their rights and how to use them. Although there was a fairly stable relationship between employers and the trade unions in his country the Government was of the opinion that measures related to discrimination were amongst the topics that should be included in collective bargaining. The principle of equal pay for work of equal value had been introduced and it remained for wage rates to be carefully negotiated with this in mind.
- 69.** An Employer member from India said that the national law prohibited any form of discrimination and employers' organizations required all members to ensure there was none. Maternity leave was between three and six months. The Supreme Court had recently issued guidelines on sexual harassment which included the formation of committees to hear complaints. The definition of harassment had been extended to include verbal abuse. It was more difficult to monitor the informal sector, but his impression was that the situation was improving.
- 70.** The representative of the Government of the United States said there needed to be improvement with regard to discrimination against women and migrant workers. Changes in attitudes towards women, ethnic groups and what jobs they should perform had to be made. In some countries, certain types of work are reserved for women or they are deprived of the opportunity to work outside the home or to be trained and educated. However, national laws should be applied equally to everyone, and there should be equal pay and equal recognition for women and migrants in the workplace. In the United States, at the federal level, there are

special programmes to train women for higher positions. Both women and migrants should have available skills training to participate fully in the workplace, and migrants should have access to language skills training. At the federal level, an inter-agency committee that reports to the President monitors the participation of women in the workforce, and programmes in the Small Business Administration promote participation of women in business enterprises.

71. A Worker member from India stated that 92 per cent of the total workforce in her country was in the informal sector, of which 96 per cent were women. Yet despite their overwhelming participation rate in the TCF sector and their contribution of 63 per cent to national income, most women workers did not get maternity leave.
72. The representative of the Government of Portugal said that non-discrimination was enshrined in the Constitution, with specific legislation on discrimination against women and sexual harassment. Maternity protection was being brought into line with EU directives. Tribunals and courts had handed down a number of important decisions but discrimination still existed in the informal and clandestine sectors which were more difficult to monitor and detect. Illegal immigrants presented the same problems in his country as in the United States.
73. The Worker spokesperson was happy to note from the preceding discussion that progress was being made and that discrimination was not accepted by governments and employers. The question was how to end discrimination. How could maternity protection be enhanced to include a continuation of income? Pregnancy testing before hiring should be stopped. Mechanisms were also needed at the company and national level for the submission of complaints and dispute resolution in cases of sexual harassment.

Clandestine work

74. The Worker spokesperson noted that the ILO had been founded in 1919 to combat these problems and was surprised it was still necessary to address the issues 80 years later. Although the ILO had strongly promoted freedom of association and collective bargaining it needed better ways to implement its Conventions and Recommendations. Even if a Convention was ratified it was often a long way from being respected. He had three suggestions. First, with respect to dispute settlement, perhaps the ILO should have the power to impose sanctions against countries not upholding Conventions. Second, social dialogue had to be increased in order to give more respect to trade unions. Mechanisms were necessary to allow for international collective bargaining. Third, since MNEs were larger, they had more power to determine how products were made (including by their suppliers), they should encourage the respect of freedom of association and collective bargaining throughout the supply chain, including homeworkers. He also proposed a framework agreement between labour and international companies as a means to resolve problems on an ongoing basis. Some of these existed and they pointed in the right direction. Consideration might be given to extending the concept of European Works Councils (EWCs) to the rest of the world as a means of promoting social dialogue. Then there was the question of integrating the work of the ILO with other multilateral international and regional organizations and various trade agreements. All of these agencies should be used to see that international principles were respected.

-
75. The Employer spokesperson said that one person's sweatshop might be another person's economic opportunity. In the Employers' view, a sweatshop was an establishment where fundamental rights (as defined by the ILO in the Declaration) were denied. As mentioned before, larger multinationals had taken steps to deal with sweatshops, including through voluntary initiatives, but SMEs were not in a position to look into the supply chain. It was here that governments had to take the responsibility, and the ILO could become more active in supporting this endeavour. In principle, the Employers did not agree to sanctions, preferring positive incentives. They were in favour of increasing social dialogue and although a number of framework agreements existed, they were difficult to sign in an industry where you did not own a factory. With respect to the EWCs, the Employers felt that there had been mixed results and that it would be premature to consider imposing them elsewhere.
76. The representative of the Government of Egypt said that although governments had to keep an eye on sweatshops and clandestine employment, particularly in developing countries, it had to be remembered that labour inspectors had very low wages and that they lacked equipment and transportation. She appealed to all governments to fight against clandestine employment.
77. The Worker spokesperson said sanctions were the last option. The Workers' group also preferred positive measures which would encourage countries to uphold labour laws. One incentive might be to give countries which adhered to labour standards greater access to markets. This had been the case for textile imports into the United States from Cambodia where the quota had been progressively increased. This could be expanded to include other trade agreements with increased benefits if international labour standards were adhered to. The Workers were dismayed to hear that indentured labour and debt bondage still existed and urged that sanctions be imposed to discourage it from moving across borders.

Freedom of association

78. The Worker spokesperson said that much of what his group had said previously also applied to this issue.
79. The Employer spokesperson agreed on behalf of her group. She responded in a similar manner and reiterated the Employers' support for freedom of association and collective bargaining. She emphasized, however, that the right to freedom of association also included the freedom not to associate. If workers chose not to join a union no blame should be put on employers. A passage in the report gave this impression, but she pointed out that relocation decisions were very complex and were not necessarily anti-worker. Governments, as well as employers, had a major duty to safeguard workers' rights.
80. A Worker member from Morocco called on all countries to ratify the Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organise Convention, 1948 (No. 87), and the Right to Organise and Collective Bargaining Convention, 1949 (No. 98), to enforce them through guaranteeing their application in national legislation and give power and resources to labour inspectors to monitor and enforce compliance. Agreements between workers and employers had to be effective, not just pieces of paper. Notwithstanding collective agreements between unions and employers'

organizations, employers who were not members did not apply them. They should be encouraged to join their associations and apply solutions agreed through social dialogue.

- 81.** The representative of the Government of Morocco felt that collective bargaining in the context of social and economic change, productivity, competitiveness and the reclassification of workers, necessitated a reassessment of the role of the social partners. Collective bargaining needed to be promoted, dialogue needed to be facilitated, and sectors where collective agreements could be concluded needed to be identified.
- 82.** A Worker member from Germany felt that freedom of association was the key to each of the preceding points. With respect to joining a trade union, the question was not forcing someone to join but whether workers could join without fear or repression. There was a relationship between human rights and freedom of association. As for sanctions, it was perhaps not so much a question of punishment as one of providing rewards and incentives.
- 83.** A Worker member from Lesotho underlined the question of corruption. Sometimes companies were owned by government ministers, or managers were susceptible to bribery, making labour inspection and the enforcement of freedom of association difficult.
- 84.** The representative of the Government of Egypt said her Government attached great importance to collective bargaining and that governments had a role to play in balancing employers and workers. The ILO should increase the number of training courses offered to governments, employers and workers to allow them to learn more about their duties and make women more aware of their rights. There should also be training for the settlement of industrial disputes.
- 85.** The representative of the Government of the Czech Republic said that, despite guarantees and sanctions to encourage freedom of association and collective bargaining, violations did exist as was indicated in the report. Some multinationals from Europe and the United States had also tried to circumvent the formation of trade unions and collective bargaining in their subsidiaries in his country. The enterprises in question were not members of an employers' organization. New small employers needed support from the ILO and employers' organizations in the procedures of collective bargaining and social dialogue. The EU recently provided funds within the PHARE programme for projects in the Czech Republic to strengthen social dialogue at the enterprise level and to strengthen the capacity of the social partners to participate in the preparation and implementation of EU accession.
- 86.** A Worker member from the Philippines said that, despite the existence of freedom of association and collective bargaining, there were many legal provisions which stood in its way. His own organization, for example, had filed for certification with an employer. However, the law permitted the employer to question this and appeal to the Secretary of Labour and eventually to the Supreme Court. It was over two years before a decision was handed down in the union's favour by which time the company had closed and 120 workers laid off. Legal procedures could be used to deny trade union rights.

-
87. A Worker member from the Dominican Republic said that although freedom of association was legally possible it was very difficult to negotiate a collective agreement because the Labour Code obliges the workers in EPZs to follow the directives of the EPZ authority. These regulations required an absolute majority vote of the workers in order to enter into collective bargaining. Workers who wished to join trade unions were harassed by employers.

Voluntary private initiatives

88. The Worker spokesperson said that Conventions, which had been extensively negotiated in a tripartite framework, had a high level of credibility and an enduring validity that was enhanced by their legal underpinning and the clear supervisory procedures. The issue was how to implement them; the answer was through collective agreements and social dialogue but further measures were necessary. Codes of conduct could play a secondary but valuable role. Some of the early codes, however, were unsatisfactory. They had been imposed unilaterally, they did not contain core labour standards, monitoring was vague, they lacked credibility and they had little impact on workers, many of whom were unaware of their existence. Progress in codes had been made, thanks in part to the efforts of trade unions and others. But more needed to be done so that they were in line with international labour standards. Codes of conduct should be negotiated with trade unions and workers' organizations and reflect the Declaration. There needed to be strong means of ensuring implementation and for the education of all concerned, in all production and supply units. The codes should cover the entire supply chain. Multinationals should then be consistent and not impose price and delivery deadlines which required manufacturers to impose long hours and low wages on their workforce. Strong, independent monitoring throughout the supply chain was necessary, possibly including international monitoring by the ILO or some other body. Codes of conduct were relatively new and it would be necessary at some point in the future to evaluate their impact on working conditions. Eventually, however, international agreements based on the core labour standards would make codes of conduct superfluous.
89. The Employer spokesperson noted that the Office report had recognized that the TCF industries were to the forefront in the development of voluntary private initiatives (VPIs). Credit had to be given to those who had taken the initiative before VPIs became common. She realized that customers had been a driving force in the development of VPIs, especially by MNEs, but cautioned that SMEs were mostly unable to take action to the same extent. Some producers in developing countries felt that VPIs had been imposed on them without consultation, including with their workers. Moreover, they were sometimes expected to adhere to several at once. The ILO should expand its work in this area, possibly being represented in the discussion of VPIs, particularly when they now referred to core labour standards, which should continue to be promoted through the Declaration. Workers should also take part in national efforts to develop VPIs. Their absence made the process incomplete. VPIs would not become obsolete until there was effective labour administration and oversight worldwide.
90. The representative of the Government of Tunisia said the development of labour standards had to take national circumstances into account. Given the disparity in development and income, it was too difficult to establish viable international labour

standards. Standards should be limited to a number of fundamental labour principles, which could be fixed for a particular country or region.

91. The representative of the Government of the United States said that VPIs had been helpful in the elimination of child labour, but there was a need to do more in all Labour Code areas. The US Department of Labor reported that many countries had codes of conduct, but their proliferation led to confusion as to which standards were applicable. More standardized codes of conduct should be developed and adopted because most violations occurred in SMEs and in home work. Also, there was a need for better monitoring.
92. The Worker spokesperson agreed that there had been progress with VPIs, where they were negotiated with trade unions, referred to the ILO core standards, and contained provisions for monitoring and verification. In some cases, however, unions had withdrawn when they believed that the codes were not credible. He agreed that SMEs, that might supply to several large enterprises, could face contradictory instructions and supported better clarity and harmonization. He did not agree, however, that some standards should not be adhered to because of a lack of development. Such a proposal was unacceptable. Trade unions would work towards the final goal of global standards, while in the meantime working with governments and employers to take all the necessary interim steps along the way.

Export processing zones

93. An Employer member from Mauritius felt that the question should have been posed in the opposite sense – how to bring standards in other sectors up to those in EPZs. Her country's industrial transition was due to EPZ companies which had made major contributions to the introduction of good and ethical practices. Regulations developed for EPZs, such as attendance bonuses, had been extended to other sectors. Best practices, no matter where from, that did not jeopardize an enterprise's viability, should be collected and used.
94. The Worker spokesperson said that the positive effects of EPZs were overwhelmed by the negative ones and they should be abolished. The reasons for their establishment – imports, taxation – could be dealt with administratively. Some EPZs coexisted in the same premises as local production. While he recognized the need for EPZs to be close to transport facilities, the concept had been abused. There were too many examples where national laws were not applied. Bangladesh, for example, publicized the fact that unions were not allowed in EPZs. There should be tripartite and employer-worker discussions to see how standards in EPZs matched those generally accepted both nationally and internationally. The isolation of workers in enclaves meant unions did not have access and workers were unaware of their rights, and some EPZs did not provide the same social benefits that obtained in the national economy. Examples of higher wages and better working conditions in EPZs were, unfortunately, exceptions to the rule. A system to eliminate differential treatment of and within EPZs was needed. If this could not be achieved through social dialogue, international efforts to set minimum standards might be necessary.
95. The representative of the Government of Bangladesh highlighted the steps that had been taken to open up the economy, ensure democracy and ratify core labour

standards to protect workers' rights there. The objective of establishing EPZs in the 1980s was to provide productive employment and upgrade skills through the acquisition of technology. Workers in EPZs enjoyed higher wages and better working conditions than those outside. The Government was committed to ensuring adequate wages and work practices in EPZs and had recently implemented several initiatives, including a policy to phase in more labour rights in the form of freedom of association and collective bargaining. A workers' welfare committee that included workers' representatives had been set up to discuss and negotiate with management on various aspects of employment, including working conditions. An international auditing firm had been appointed to monitor employment practices, working conditions and wages in the EPZs and examine compliance with zone regulations. Wages would be reviewed regularly and education opportunities provided for EPZ managers and committee members. The Government welcomed any assistance to strengthen the existing conducive environment in EPZs, and was already engaged with the ILO and UNDP in this regard.

- 96.** An Employer member from Pakistan said that the purpose of EPZs was to make the import of inputs easier. They were not set up for labour reasons. Premium wages compensated the workers for being outside the regular wage/benefit system and trade unions were present. One disadvantage was that they were outside the quota system and had restricted access to finance. Bonded factories now existed so there was no need to have a special zone. This had led to the closure of 80 per cent of the EPZs, with the rest likely to close in a few years.
- 97.** The Government representative of Tunisia said the situation in his country was similar to that in Pakistan. Workers in EPZs were subject to the same working conditions as elsewhere in the country and the Government had not noted any less respect for labour legislation by EPZs, which were regarded as the same as other industrial zones.
- 98.** A Worker member from Bangladesh reiterated that there were no trade unions in EPZs in her country and there were many labour disputes. The ban on unions should be withdrawn and MNEs should respect labour legislation. Trade unions should continue to pressure governments to allow unionization in EPZs and the worker should also seek the right to organize.
- 99.** A Worker member from India said that home workers, who received lower wages than workers in EPZs, should be treated the same as them. Homeworkers got their work through a long chain of subcontractors and were getting very low wages and working long hours. It was the responsibility of contractors to keep records of homeworkers they employed. Homeworkers needed to be covered in codes of conduct.
- 100.** A Worker member from Germany did not see why workers' rights were limited in EPZs, nor why employers could not ensure those rights as in the rest of the country.
- 101.** A Worker member from Colombia said there were many examples of EPZs in Latin America where workers' rights were not respected and trade unions were repressed. Governments should respect the Conventions they had ratified and he regretted the lack of social dialogue to ensure their application.

-
- 102.** The representative of the Government of the United States said her perception of EPZs was not as good as the description given by some other speakers. While, in some cases, wages might be higher, many labour standards were often ignored because labour legislation did not apply in EPZs. This dual approach should be outlawed, and the legislation governing the formal sector should apply also in EPZs. The only incentives for investment should be monetary incentives such as tax exclusions. Foregoing freedom of association and collective bargaining as an inducement to establish EPZs should be ruled out. ILO member States should consider following this rule to avoid one country being pitted against another on the basis of whether or not they applied labour standards.
- 103.** A Worker member from the Dominican Republic said that in Central America and the Caribbean it was a struggle to get governments and employers to accept that EPZs included human beings and opportunities for work should be in acceptable conditions. Unions struggled to get recognition. While some enterprises allowed union representatives, they impeded their functioning. Governments often sided with employers in denying workers' rights.
- 104.** The Worker spokesperson did not understand how some countries that purported to accept all labour rights and standards did not allow unions. They said they were democratic but did not listen to the voices of workers. They said they needed special treatment because of the level of development or to respect cultural traditions. If this were true, there would have been precious little progress since the days when slavery was a primary and traditional form of employment. EPZs were unlikely to disappear rapidly. There had been four trade rounds that had reduced tariffs, but EPZs were still growing. He particularly welcomed the statement of the representative of the Government of the United States.

Human resources development

- 105.** The Employer spokesperson said there was no doubt about the necessity for a well-trained workforce. Responsibility for training should be shared. She referred to several successful national programmes where governments had facilitated extra training initiatives. Some employers who were concerned that the cost of training might not be recouped if workers quickly changed jobs had implemented a contractual obligation to remain for a certain time after the completion of training. Opportunities for multiskilling needed to be provided so that workers could obtain the skills necessary to adapt to new technologies. The ILO could play a role in reinforcing training programmes for SMEs. It could also examine the skill base and future needs in the sector.
- 106.** The Worker spokesperson was in broad agreement with the Employers' group. The cost of training and retraining had been borne by employers; it was a legitimate business cost. It was important to ensure that sufficient resources for training were available, for example by having a common fund. Government assistance might be necessary, as well as outside expertise. Education needs were accelerating with the advent of new technologies, as were skill requirements. Pay levels had to be linked to acquired skills. Job classification systems might have to be renegotiated, in conjunction with workers' organizations. The question of job security in a changed production process also had to be addressed and special provision had to be made

for older workers, those making the transition to the formal sector and those transferring out of the industry.

- 107.** The representative of the Government of Egypt said that together with the ILO her country was studying the creation of a national fund for vocational training to which employers contributed to ensure that new workers were adequately trained. Egypt also envisaged the creation of a national employment agency with a tripartite advisory board presided by employers. It will study the labour market and give guidance on training requirements as well as providing a range of training. The ILO should concentrate on helping SMEs provide training so that they could keep abreast of technical advances.
- 108.** A Worker member from Colombia said that training was the key to avoiding exclusion from the workplace. Trade unions should be involved in training issues at the enterprise level. A comprehensive tripartite policy and programme on vocational training and retraining was required. This view was shared by a Worker member from Morocco, who stressed the need for literacy training.
- 109.** A Worker member from Mexico agreed that tripartite action was essential to ensure the provision of vocational training. Governments might need to provide incentives for training to ensure that new enterprises attracted a skilled workforce. Continuing training should then be carried out at the employers' expense so that workers could meet the skill requirements of new technologies. Trade unions had to ensure that workers were able to undertake training and that pay rates reflected skills.
- 110.** The representative of the Government of Tunisia said that governments and employers should share training costs so that sufficient people obtained new skills that were required as a result of technical progress in the TCF industries.
- 111.** An Employer member from Mexico pointed out that countries and workers benefited from training too. Workers who were more competitive got better jobs. Governments should give special emphasis and assistance to meeting SMEs' training needs.
- 112.** The representative of the Government of the United States said that the Department of Labor promoted lifelong learning and funded a training programme for displaced workers which had been widely and effectively used by TCF workers.
- 113.** The representative of the Government of the Czech Republic agreed that skilled workers were more flexible and employable and this was in the interest of workers themselves, of employers, and of the governments. A highly skilled workforce and accessible lifelong learning for all was one of his Government's priorities in education and employment policies.

ILO activities

- 114.** The Worker spokesperson said that, as a priority, the ILO should: continue to promote the Declaration and the ratification of the core Conventions and ensure their effective implementation; work more closely with other organizations and agencies to ensure greater coordination of economic development; work with MNEs, merchandisers and retailers to encourage and ensure corporate

responsibility at all levels of supply; establish an ongoing tripartite relationship to enhance problem-solving mechanisms; contribute to a coordinated approach to the development of codes of conduct and their independent monitoring; provide assistance to the informal sector; do more for women workers, including increased coordination with initiatives arising from the Beijing Summit; increase cooperation between governments in order to avoid destructive competition; use the resources in the field to assist training, particularly in developing countries; and ensure that IPEC continued its work in the TCF industries.

- 115.** The Employer spokesperson called on the ILO to undertake more research in the TCF sector, especially on EPZs and VPIs; become more involved in the collection and dissemination of best practices; assist in training programmes; promote the Declaration; ensure greater visibility of the ILO and its Conventions, in coordination with the social partners; be represented in forums where VPIs are discussed. She did not agree that the ILO should be the place for the negotiation of framework agreements; this should be done at the national or enterprise level. Countries in transition needed more information on the mechanisms and institutions of tripartism and social dialogue; the Office should investigate trends in trade unions in different countries; and further develop its Internet presence to increase its outreach, including the development of tools in other languages.
- 116.** The representative of the Government of Egypt asked the ILO to provide training in collective bargaining and continue to work against forced and child labour. There should be increased training on women's rights at the national and international levels; more sensitization on occupational health and safety; and the promotion of the Declaration.
- 117.** The representative of the Government of Tunisia supported the foregoing and stressed the need for assistance to developing countries to overcome the problems of adapting to new technologies.

Consideration and adoption of the draft report and the draft conclusions by the Meeting

- 118.** The Working Party on Conclusions submitted its draft conclusions to the Meeting at the latter's sixth sitting.
- 119.** At the same sitting, the Meeting adopted the present report and the draft conclusions.

Geneva, 20 October 2000.

(Signed) Ms. L. Sasso-Mazzufferi,
Chairperson.

Conclusions on labour practices in the footwear, leather, textiles and clothing industries¹

The Tripartite Meeting on Labour Practices in the Footwear, Leather, Textiles and Clothing Industries,

Having met in Geneva from 16 to 20 October 2000;

Adopts this twentieth day of October 2000 the following conclusions:

Labour practices and globalization

1. Owing to their global nature, the footwear, leather, textiles and clothing (TCF) industries are highly influenced by the pressure of international competition. This pressure has an impact on the viability of enterprises and influences labour practices. In this context, therefore, developments in labour practices should adopt an innovative approach by taking into account the social dimensions of globalization and strive for improvements in the competitiveness of enterprises, stable employment and better working conditions.
2. The TCF industries play an important role in the world economy. They generate large flows of trade, are a major creator of employment and substantially contribute to the initial stages of the process of industrialization in many developing countries. Over the last 20 years the TCF industries have undergone major changes. Large distribution groups, which have sometimes taken the place of traditional producers, have emerged; there has been a trend towards national and international contracting and subcontracting; and there have been waves of relocations, notably in the clothing industry, in response to changes in the criteria governing international competitiveness. These factors influence the global landscape in which TCF industries operate and, as a consequence, the development of working practices. In view of the mixed results of globalization, the effective implementation of core labour standards should be taken to ensure that the advantages of globalization are fairly distributed to the benefit of all. Efforts should also be made to assist those developing countries and economies in transition which suffer as a result of the growing international competitiveness in the TCF industries.
3. The TCF industries cover a wide range of activities carried out by: large enterprises in the formal sector; many small and medium-sized enterprises; and the informal sector. To create the conditions to ensure that all these producers can continue their activities in the long term and create stable, more skilled employment, special attention should be given to improving the efficiency of small and medium-sized

¹ Adopted unanimously. The representative of the Government of Egypt expressed reservations on paragraphs 22 and 31; the representative of the Government of Tunisia expressed reservations on paragraph 31.

enterprises and to the organization of the informal sector with a view to its gradual integration into the formal sector.

4. The demand for greater product quality and diversity requires enterprises to be more flexible in their operations. Effective strategies have to be based on social criteria as well as economic and financial ones. Adapting labour practices to the constraints of the markets should take place in a way that benefits all parties – the enterprises, the people working there, and the community at large. To achieve this objective employers and workers’ representatives² should engage in social dialogue in an atmosphere of mutual trust and a spirit of partnership.
5. Given the concerns raised by the dismantling of the quota system and the relative stagnation in global demand, one means of opening new markets to the TCF industries, and thus of ensuring greater employment stability, would be to improve purchasing power in developing countries. This would require the implementation of economic and social policies as well as foreign assistance which would promote development in their national markets. Moreover, the uncontrolled import of second-hand clothing causes substantial harm to the local industry and results in employment losses. The channels of distribution of used clothing should thus be more tightly controlled.

Fundamental principles and rights at work

Child labour

6. Child labour and its exploitation are flagrant human rights violations which thwart the principles of social justice. While significant progress has been made in the past 20 years in child labour legislation worldwide, and more recently in formal sector enterprises, child labour continues to be a problem in the TCF industries in some countries. Child labour deprives children of an education and the right to childhood. Child labour is a source of unfair competition with negative impacts on employment security and the wages of adult workers.
7. All member States should ratify and fully enforce all relevant international Conventions, in particular the ILO Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182), and the Minimum Age Convention, 1973 (No. 138). New awareness campaigns on the issue of child labour should be launched along with drives to promote the universal ratification of these two Conventions. In countries where

² Throughout this text, when the term “workers’ representatives” is used, it refers to Article 3 of the Workers’ Representatives Convention, 1971 (No. 135), which reads as follows:

For the purpose of this Convention, the term “workers’ representatives” means person who are recognized as such under national law or practice, whether they are: (a) trade union representatives, namely, representatives designated or elected by trade unions or by the members of such unions; or (b) elected representatives, namely, representatives who are freely elected by the workers of the undertaking in accordance with the provisions of national laws or regulations or of collective agreements and whose functions do not include activities which are recognized as the exclusive prerogative of trade unions in the country concerned.

child labour occurs, governments should earmark additional funds to improve the education system and tighten supervision of compulsory school attendance by children working in the formal and informal sectors. Further, they should – with the ILO’s support – take action to: enhance labour education programmes; make labour inspection more effective; use social dialogue to combat child labour; and increase awareness among the public at large.

8. Programmes should be set up within TCF enterprises, with the support of the ILO and the social partners, to prevent the recruitment and employment of children and to make sure that the displaced children are given the opportunity to attend school. To encourage children’s school attendance, a range of measures is needed to ensure that family income is maintained. Additionally, these programmes should involve the removal of children from hazardous working conditions and of children below the minimum age as defined in Convention No. 138. These programmes should be conducted in close cooperation with the ILO and its International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC).

Women workers

9. The majority of workers in TCF industries are women. They are the ones who contribute most actively to the stability of these industries in the long term. In order to secure equal opportunity, governments should facilitate equal access to education, literacy programmes and training, including in traditionally male jobs, and TCF industry employers should enhance their human resource development and training policies, particularly with regard to women. A large number of women workers are in the informal sector and social security funds should be formed for these workers. Employers should strive to ensure access to a broader range of career choices for women through training as well as through the provision of equal opportunities and equal pay for work of equal value. They should ensure access by women workers to all levels of training and various other benefits. Candidates for employment or promotion should be chosen on the basis of skills and ability, not gender. Particular emphasis should be given to facilitating women’s opportunities with regard to equal access to skilled jobs.
10. Specific steps should be taken, and suitable mechanisms developed on a tripartite or bipartite basis, to put an end to discriminatory practices, of sexual harassment in particular, which continue to be a problem, despite recent advances in this area. There is a need for special provisions to provide maternity protection and family-friendly policies.
11. Steps should be taken at national and international levels, by governments and social partners, in close cooperation with the ILO, to make the relevant parties more aware of gender issues, provide training on workers’ rights, and promote the ratification and full enforcement of relevant international conventions and the decisions taken at international conferences on the topic (Platform for Action of the Fourth World Conference on Women in Beijing, 1995, and measures approved by UN Special Session Beijing+5). Women workers, including those from the informal sector, need to have a voice in negotiations at all levels.

Migrant workers

12. Migrant workers constitute an important part of the TCF workforce in industrialized countries and those developing countries which have progressed furthest along the road to industrialization. As migrant workers tend to face difficulties because of inappropriate types of education, language difficulties, administrative measures and social integration, they may suffer discriminatory labour practices. It is the responsibility of the social partners, with the support of the competent authorities, to ensure that migrant workers can fully integrate into the activities of TCF enterprises without discrimination and have access to the training necessary for their optimal participation in all production activities. Activities by employers and governments should combat racial and religious discrimination that migrant workers often face. Special language courses should be set up for migrant workers by governments and the social partners to improve access to and completion of training, retraining and education. In accordance with national laws and the provisions of the relevant ILO Conventions, all appropriate measures should be taken to ensure that the special needs of migrant workers are duly taken into consideration.

Homeworkers

13. In some parts of the world, the past several years have seen a growth in home work in the TCF industries as markets demand increasing flexibility on the part of enterprises. In many countries, homeworkers, most of whom are women but may also include child workers, enjoy no recognized legal status and, as a result, they are susceptible to a range of abusive labour practices. They thus deserve special attention as well as legal and social protection. Their working conditions are a source of concern to governments and workers' and employers' organizations.
14. Homeworkers should benefit from the full application of all applicable labour laws. Measures are required to bring the wages and conditions of homeworkers into line with other wage earners in the sector; to regulate the responsibilities of intermediaries; to ensure a system of inspection; and to adopt means to elaborate labour statistics on home work.

Clandestine workshops ("sweatshops")

15. Steps should be taken to strengthen measures to combat clandestine workshops. They represent unfair competition for legally registered enterprises. They subject the workers to intolerable abuses, often practise forced labour, and operate outside the law. The initiatives taken by governments to help to eradicate those illegal production facilities should continue to receive the unconditional support of employers' and workers' organizations and relevant NGOs. Only the law and effective tripartite coordination at the national level, along with public education campaigns, will make it possible to put an end to these activities, which is prejudicial to workers as a whole, and to the public image of the TCF industries. Merchants, retailers and marketers must use their power and responsibility to prevent the use of clandestine work in the production of their products.

Debt bondage

16. Appropriate regulatory and promotional measures to eliminate debt bondage should be taken and their application strengthened in countries in which it continues to be practised. The abolition of bonded labour and indentured servitude is one of the priorities of the ILO as set out in the ILO Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182), together with the Forced Labour Convention, 1930 (No. 29), and the Abolition of Forced Labour Convention, 1957 (No. 105). The employers' and workers' organizations of the TCF industries should cooperate with the governments concerned in these efforts.

Overtime

17. In order to prevent excessively long working hours, the number and schedule of overtime hours worked and payment for overtime should always comply with the provisions of national laws or collective agreements and there should be stricter control of the regulatory measures.

Freedom of association and effective recognition of the right of collective bargaining

18. As recalled in the ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work and its Follow-up, 1998, the member States of the ILO have an obligation to respect, promote and realize, in good faith, the rights set out in the fundamental Conventions. The right of freedom of association and collective bargaining should fully apply to the TCF industries. These industries have to follow national laws in order to promote efficient industrial relations systems and further social dialogue. Governments have an important role to play in this regard, notably by creating an institutional framework necessary for social dialogue.
19. Member States should ratify and enforce the relevant international labour standards, in particular the Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organise Convention, 1948 (No. 87), and the Right to Organise and Collective Bargaining Convention, 1949 (No. 98), and promote the strengthening of social dialogue at the appropriate levels. The ILO, in collaboration with the social partners, should support activities aimed at promoting social dialogue in TCF industries, particularly in countries where the framework for such dialogue is not developed.
20. Collective bargaining can take many different forms and may be based on national, sectoral, enterprise or other forms of agreement. In all countries, workers' representatives should enjoy the freedom to bargain with their employers on salaries and working conditions. The informal sector also needs a voice on these matters.

Export processing zones

21. Setting up a harmonious labour relations system based on the application of the principles of freedom of association and collective bargaining is vital for the economic development of TCF activities in export processing zones and for improving the conditions of workers. The social partners should seek to ensure that the principles embodied in the ILO Declaration are upheld. Governments, in cooperation with the social partners, should ensure that national labour laws and all core ILO Conventions are enforced fully in enterprises in these zones.

Voluntary private initiatives

22. Voluntary private initiatives, including codes of conduct, can complement existing legislation and encourage the promotion of fundamental principles and rights in the workplace. To be effective they should be based on the core Conventions of the ILO and include effective management systems and objective and transparent verification systems to assure their implementation. These codes can be particularly useful in promoting improvements in workplace labour practices, thereby boosting productivity, quality and competitiveness. Effectively applied in consultation with workers' representatives, voluntary codes of conduct can be an important ingredient in promoting social dialogue.
23. Voluntary private initiatives are still relatively new and much more work needs to be done to encourage a more consistent approach between different codes to prevent confusion.

Technological change and vocational training

24. To enhance the effectiveness of training and retraining programmes made necessary by the introduction of new technologies, and to bring the effects of staff reduction to a minimum, cooperation and social dialogue between the social partners should be developed on these issues. Governments should provide quality basic education and, in cooperation with the social partners, institutional training in tune with the changing needs of TCF industries. They should also offer incentives to enterprises to expand initial and continuing training programmes. Special support should be given to small and medium-sized enterprises by their governments.
25. Training and retraining programmes in TCF industries should be designed by all the parties concerned and should prepare workers for change, offer them transferable qualifications, and improve occupational safety and health and working conditions.

The ILO's role

26. The ILO should continue to promote its Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work and its Follow-up, the Tripartite Declaration of Principles concerning Multinational Enterprises and Social Policy, as well as all relevant ILO

Conventions and Recommendations. It should also increase its visibility on an international scale, with its constituents' support.

- 27.** In accordance with the strategic objectives set by the International Labour Conference, the ILO should focus primarily on promoting and strengthening sectoral social dialogue, particularly in TCF industries. ILO activities in the following areas – economic development, the informal sector, the employment impact of technological change, child labour, promotion of small and medium-sized enterprises, training, health and safety, improvement of social protection and women's occupational status, in the overall context of decent work – can bring concrete advantages to TCF industry enterprises and workers. A sectoral approach would reinforce their impact. If appropriate, meetings of experts and regional or subregional meetings to address these issues could be held.
- 28.** The ILO should give priority to concrete means of helping sectoral constituents at national, subregional and regional levels. Priority should also be given to support activities for workers' and employers' organizations and to training programmes, in particular for SMEs. Support should also be given to strengthening labour administrations. Special attention should also be given to the social impact of restructuring and privatization policies in many developing countries, particularly in Africa, and in economies in transition.
- 29.** The ILO should pursue its research programmes on the impact of voluntary codes of conduct in TCF industries, homeworkers, export processing zones and multinational enterprises. It should also develop research projects on the impact of the trade in second-hand clothes on employment and working conditions in TCF industries and undertake a study on the social implications of hours of work.
- 30.** The ILO should build on its capacity to gather and disseminate information and statistics on employment – women's employment, in particular – and on labour practices in TCF industries, including both the formal and informal sectors. Broader use of new communication technologies should make it possible to improve its performance in this area.
- 31.** The ILO has begun to expand its contact and relations with other international institutions which have an impact on economic development. The ILO should seek to enhance these relationships in order to arrive at a more coordinated, rational approach.

Part 2

Resolutions

Consideration and adoption by the Meeting of the draft resolutions

At its fourth plenary sitting, the Meeting set up a Working Party on Resolutions, in accordance with article 13, paragraph 1, of the Standing Orders.

The Working Party, presided over by the Chairperson of the Meeting, consisted of the Officers of the Meeting and three representatives from each of the groups. The members of the Working Party were:

Officers of the Meeting:

Ms. Sasso-Mazzufferi (Chairperson)

Mr. Fuchs (Government Vice-Chairperson)

Mr. Flores Merino (Employer Vice-Chairperson)

Ms. Sosnina (Worker Vice-Chairperson)

Government members:

Malaysia: Mr. Mohd Salleh

Morocco: Mr. Benrouine

Thailand: Mr. Nakchuen

Employer members:

Ms. Linger

Mr. Makeka

Ms. Vannela

Worker members:

Mr. Booth

Ms. Menendez

Ms. Sunarijati

At the Meeting's sixth plenary sitting the Chairperson, in her capacity as Chairperson of the Working Party on Resolutions, and in accordance with article 14, paragraph 8, of the Standing Orders, submitted the recommendations of the Working Party on Resolutions regarding the draft resolutions before the Meeting. As required by the same provision of the Standing Orders, the three Vice-Chairpersons of the Meeting had been consulted on the contents of her oral report.

The Working Party had before it four draft resolutions submitted by the Workers' group.

The Working Party met on Tuesday to consider the receivability of the draft texts. *The draft resolution concerning social dialogue and international collective bargaining in the textile, clothing, shoe and leather industries (WPR/D.1), the draft resolution concerning multi-stakeholder corporate codes of conduct in the footwear, leather, textiles and clothing industries (WPR/D.2), the draft resolution concerning the informal sector of the footwear, leather, textiles and clothing industries (WPR/D.3), and the draft resolution concerning future ILO action in the footwear, leather, textiles and clothing industries (WPR/D.4)* were declared receivable. On the same occasion and according to article 7, paragraph 4, of the Standing Orders, the Officers of the Meeting set the time limit of the Wednesday session at 2030.

The Working Party met on Wednesday to examine the text of these draft resolutions in detail and to amend them where necessary in a manner that would secure general acceptance. *The draft resolution concerning social dialogue and international collective bargaining in the textile, clothing, shoe and leather industries (WPR/D.1)* was discussed at length, but consensus could not be reached on the numerous amendments proposed by the parties. The Workers' group representatives proposed a vote on the amendments, but the Chairperson preferred the reaching of a consensus. Legal advice was sought from and provided by the secretariat on whether: (a) a vote could be taken within the Working Party on the amendments proposed to the draft resolution and whether the resulting text could be submitted to the plenary session on Friday where it could be adopted by delegates in consensus or in a vote; (b) the Working Party had the possibility to send to the plenary, where it could be adopted by delegates in consensus or in a vote, a text containing paragraphs within brackets on which consensus had not been reached and a vote had not been taken within the Working Party. The Legal Adviser confirmed that these options were possible. However, discussion on the resolution was postponed so as to allow for discussion on *the draft resolution concerning future ILO action in the footwear, leather, textiles and clothing industries (WPR/D.4)*. The ensuing exchange took up the remaining time allotted, and the time limit of 2030 was reached without going back to vote on WPR/D.1.¹

Paragraphs 1-3 of *the draft resolution concerning future ILO action in the footwear, leather, textiles and clothing industries (WPR/D.4)* were amended on the basis of proposals made by members of the three groups. Consensus could not be reached on paragraph 4; it was voted upon and was deleted with eight votes in favour of deletion and four votes in favour of its retention. Consensus could not be

¹ At the Meeting's sixth plenary sitting, the spokesperson for the Workers' group voiced his strong objection to the handling of the discussion in the Working Party on the draft *resolution concerning social dialogue and international collective bargaining in the textile, clothing, shoe and leather industries (WPR/D.1)*. He stated that there had been consensus between the Workers' group and the Government group on the amendments proposed to the text, but that questionable handling prevented the resolution from being presented to the plenary. He suggested that the ILO should examine amendments to its procedures to prevent possible manipulation of the work of its tripartite committees. The Employers' spokesperson stated for the record that there had been no manipulation of the proceedings concerning the abovementioned draft resolution and that all deliberations had been conducted in a transparent manner and in accordance with the rules and regulations.

reached on paragraph 5; it was voted upon and was deleted with seven votes in favour of deletion and five in favour of its retention. Having reached the time limit of 2030 which had been set by the Officers of the Meeting, the Working Party on Resolutions could not complete discussion of points (f)-(i) of paragraph 6. It should be noted for the record that the Workers' group's representatives stressed that the request for a vote to accept or delete these points had been made prior to the 2030 deadline. The Chairperson, however, ruled that the request for a vote had been made after the deadline.

Again, as the time limit of 2030 which had been set by the Officers of the Meeting had passed, the Working Party on Resolutions could also not discuss *the draft resolution concerning multi-stakeholder corporate codes of conduct in the footwear, leather, textiles and clothing industries (WPR/D.2)*, and *the draft resolution concerning the informal sector of the footwear, leather, textiles and clothing industries (WPR/D.3)*.

The Working Party recommended the adoption by the Meeting of the amended draft resolution.

Resolution concerning future ILO action in the footwear, leather, textiles and clothing industries

The representatives of the Government of Egypt, Morocco and Tunisia expressed reservations about paragraph 4(d)(v) of the resolution. The Meeting unanimously adopted the resolution.

Text of the resolution adopted by the Meeting

Resolution concerning future ILO action in the footwear, leather, textiles and clothing industries¹

The Tripartite Meeting on Labour Practices in the Footwear, Leather, Textiles and Clothing Industries,

Having met in Geneva from 16 to 20 October 2000,

Considering the importance of the footwear, leather, textiles and clothing industries to employment generation and economic development worldwide;

Adopts this twentieth day of October 2000 the following resolution:

The Tripartite Meeting on Labour Practices in the Footwear, Leather, Textiles and Clothing Industries invites the Governing Body of the International Labour Office:

- (1) to ensure that tripartite meetings on the footwear, leather, textiles and clothing industries take place on a regular basis, with experts' meetings for the sectors combined or separately as required;
- (2) to devote the next tripartite meeting to an examination of the promotion and application of the ILO's Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work in the footwear, leather, textiles and clothing industries, which would include, inter alia, an examination of changes in working conditions and whether this has contributed to changes in investment, productivity, quality and competitiveness;
- (3) to ensure that the footwear, leather, textiles and clothing industries continue to receive adequate attention and resources to develop further the levels of technical cooperation and research;
- (4) to request the Director-General:
 - (a) to continue the promotion throughout the footwear, leather, textiles and clothing industries of the ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work and the ILO Tripartite Declaration of Principles concerning Multinational Enterprises and Social Policy, as well as all relevant ILO Conventions and Recommendations;

¹ Adopted unanimously. The representatives of the Governments of Egypt, Morocco and Tunisia expressed reservations about paragraph 4(d)(v).

-
- (b) to allocate sufficient resources in the ILO's future work programme and budget to provide for technical assistance to governments and workers' and employers' organizations in the footwear, leather, textiles and clothing industries;
 - (c) to include in the work programme, regional and subregional meetings specific to the footwear, leather, textiles and clothing industries;
 - (d) to include in the work programme meetings of experts on issues such as:
 - (i) health and safety;
 - (ii) informalization and other new forms of work practices;
 - (iii) voluntary corporate codes of conduct;
 - (iv) employment practices in export processing zones;
 - (v) the methodology of calculating a minimum living wage;in the footwear, leather, textiles and clothing industries;
 - (e) to arrange for the further collection and dissemination of statistics, specific and relevant to the footwear, leather, textiles and clothing industries.

Part 3

Other proceedings

Panel discussions

Social dialogue in the TCF industries: Positive experiences and bottlenecks

Moderator: Mr. R. Alexandriysky, Vice-Chairperson of the Employers' group

Panellists: Mr. G. Casale, IFP/Dialogue, ILO, Geneva

Mr. A. Krouglik, Vice-President, JSC "ROSLEGPROM", Moscow

Mr. P. Itschert, General Secretary, European Trade Union Federation for Textiles, Clothing and Leather, Brussels

Mr. Casale said the ILO defined social dialogue in broad terms including tripartite relations, bipartite relations as well as new forms of "tripartite-plus" consisting of the traditional social partners together with other interest groups.

Social dialogue had a value of itself as an instrument of democracy and also as a means to promote democracy. However, certain basic conditions had to be fulfilled such as the acceptance of pluralism and freedom of association as well as the acceptance and application of basic rights as embodied in the ILO Declaration. As far as the structure of social dialogue was concerned, he said that it should be based on the autonomy and independence of the parties and a proper system of collective bargaining which allowed for the expression of divergent interests.

A question that was often raised was whether social dialogue developed better in a crisis situation. Whenever there was an important crisis, the parties would get together and hammer out a solution. However, when the crisis was over, the parties tended to forget about social dialogue. He referred to a recent ILO study on the relationship between employment growth and development and good mechanisms for social dialogue in four European countries. These countries had been in crisis but had used social dialogue to find solutions and all had become good economic performers. Social dialogue was more important in post-crisis situations than in pre-crisis ones. The transition economies in Central and Eastern Europe had also recognized the benefits of social dialogue. What was missing was a system of collective bargaining at sectoral level and a proper legal framework.

The ILO was of the opinion that institutions or mechanisms for social dialogue were necessary to enable the parties to work together. But institutions alone were not enough because there also had to be a change in the approach of the parties to tripartite-plus institutions. In many countries mechanisms had been established but there were no results because the attitudes of the parties had not changed.

He said that it was argued that there was no direct relationship between good functioning social dialogue mechanisms and good economic performance. He again referred to the ILO research findings but also to the experience in Central and Eastern Europe where there had been a decline in social dialogue and collective bargaining together with a less favourable economic performance. Social dialogue

was an important contribution, an element among others such as foreign direct investment, labour flexibility and working time, to economic success.

Finally, he said, a major threat to the success of social dialogue was the excessive decentralization of collective bargaining to enterprise or even lower levels at the cost of sectoral, regional or national agreements.

Mr. Krouglik, started his remarks by giving a brief description of the TCF industry in the Russian Federation, which had been in decline in the early 1990s, among other things, because of the privatization of the former state-owned enterprises. With regard to social dialogue in the Russian Federation, he said that there had been major changes in the industrial relations system at various levels. A tripartite commission had been established at the federal level in 1999. He described the relationships between federal-, regional- and branch-level agreements. The 2000-01 agreement in the TCF industry was aimed at developing the industry and protecting employment. This was important in an industry which employed many women and also had a large number of informal sector workers.

The Russian Employers' Federation valued partnerships with the trade unions and was fully committed to the implementation of international labour standards. Government should be the guarantor of law and order and also strengthen the role of the social partners.

Globalization had negative consequences for national TCF industries and local protection was vital. Another problem were the "grey" imports which were on the increase. The light industry could be the motor of the industry and thus contribute to employment stability.

Mr. Itschert said that he was fully aware that models cannot easily be transferred from one country to another but they could serve as examples. The European Union had, from the beginning, placed the harmonious development of a social dialogue at bipartite and tripartite level at the centre of the European social model. This dialogue was progressively developed on a legislative and institutional basis. The EU took the necessary measures to consult systematically with employers and workers on all important proposals having social and employment consequences at the tripartite level. At the bipartite level, the social partners could autonomously negotiate framework agreements that replace the traditional legislative measures.

European social dialogue takes place at various levels: interprofessional, sectoral and enterprise levels with the European works councils. Since the early 1990s, his federation had participated in European social dialogue and for some time the TCF sector was the only sector to have such a dialogue. For his organization the sectoral social dialogue was a priority. The enormous difficulties the European TCF industry was facing could only be solved at the sectoral level. On the employers' side, some organizations had accepted the dialogue while others were still absent. For the modernization of the industry in Europe, the improvement of industrial relations at the sectoral level was a necessity.

From the union viewpoint, the social dialogue had been a positive experience. While the first two years were basically an observation period, attention rapidly

turned to quantitative and qualitative employment and training needs in the TCF sectors (1994-95) in order to match supply and demand at the European level. Other agreements followed including the adoption in 1997 of a code of conduct for the textiles and clothing sector. In adopting this code, the employers have agreed to promote, all over the world, whether in direct or indirect (outsourced) production, the respect of the core labour standards included in the ILO Declaration. In July 2000, a framework agreement was reached for the tanneries sector that not only refers to the core standards but also includes provisions on working time, occupational safety and health and “decent wages”.

Regarding European social dialogue at enterprise level, the speaker pointed out that his organization had co-signed about 30 agreements concerning the establishment of European works councils, not only with European companies but also with European subsidiaries of US companies. European works councils bring together representatives of all European production units of multinational enterprises which meet at least once a year. In some enterprises, the process has gone beyond consultations and framework agreements on human rights at work or on occupational safety and health have been concluded.

Among the problems encountered, particularly in transition countries, Mr. Itschert mentioned (i) the absence of representative employers’ organizations, (ii) the weakness of trade unions at enterprise level due to the anti-union attitude of certain employers, (iii) the delays in concluding collective agreements, (iv) certain small- and medium-scale enterprises and the informal sector in general did not implement the agreements, (v) the need to make the European social dialogue better known.

In conclusion, he said that at the level of the European Union, social development and “solidarity” constituted a model that was different from models found in other parts of the world. The European model was based on dialogue and negotiations between employers and workers rather than on confrontation between the social partners. Notwithstanding the social dialogue, multinationals continued to refuse unions in certain subsidiaries. Social dialogue did not prevent the inclusion of a fourth partner – the NGOs – in the debates with a view to weakening the trade unions. Finally, the fact that there was social dialogue did not mean that the unions would shy away from their traditional means of action.

Discussion

A Worker member agreed that social dialogue was essential for the development of society but that in Asia there was no social dialogue at the regional level because there was no Asian employers’ organization. It was the intention of the unions to continue the struggle for social dialogue at the Asian level. At the national level, except for Japan perhaps, social dialogue was not commonly implemented. He further mentioned the absence of negotiations in EPZs.

An Employer member (Germany) said social dialogue was not just a question of collective bargaining. In his country there was no collective bargaining at the national level. The very heart of social dialogue was the bilateral contact between employers and workers at the sectoral level. At that level, matters could be discussed that not necessarily needed to be included in collective agreements. He

was opposed to EU agreements on issues that affected the sectoral collective bargaining process. In his view, social dialogue was useful if it was not used in times of crisis. There was a need to build trust among the partners which in the end would be more fruitful. The functioning of the economy was based on competition. Taxes and social insurance issues did have an impact as well as factors over which there was no control such as currency fluctuations. There was no argument about the usefulness of social dialogue but it should also not be overestimated.

Several Worker members (Colombia, Lesotho, Morocco, Philippines, South Africa) underlined the importance of social dialogue for economic and social development. They also described the successes and problems of social dialogue in their respective countries.

The representative of the Government of Egypt said that social dialogue was conducted at the highest level in her country. The role of the Government in the collective bargaining process was very important. The Government was restructuring the economy to a market economy resulting in job losses. Therefore, the Government had to intervene and introduce measures to alleviate the consequences.

An Employer member (Nigeria) said that social dialogue was working effectively in his country, mainly through bipartite consultations and negotiations. The Government only intervened in case of disputes through the conciliation and mediation services of the Ministry of Labour. On national issues (minimum wage, amendments of labour laws) the apex bodies of employers and workers, represented in the National Labour Advisory Council, were consulted by the Government.

In replying to the debate, Mr. Casale reiterated that the definition of social dialogue had to be broad and include all types of negotiations: consultation, bargaining, information sharing and other forms between governments, employers' and workers' organizations. The definition should also include bipartite contacts. In countries starting the social dialogue process, it was important to create an institutional framework to make social dialogue a permanent process. Certain basic conditions had, however, to be fulfilled such as the respect in law of basic rights (Declaration); the parties to social dialogue have to be autonomous and independent of each other; collective bargaining should be used constantly by the parties; the legislative framework should be supportive of the autonomy and independence of the parties; and there should be a recognition of the right of workers to consultation and information.

In his reply, Mr. Itschert agreed with an earlier speaker that social dialogue was broader than collective bargaining only. So far there had been no bargaining at the European level. Trade unions believed that because of the free movement of people, the common currency, etc. it was not possible to avoid collective bargaining at the European level and this was the ultimate objective of the trade unions. Social dialogue was only the first step in this direction. He further agreed with Mr. Casale's comprehensive statement. Finally, as far as competition was concerned, he said that Germany was a high-wage country with a well-developed system of social dialogue which, in his view, demonstrated that social dialogue could aid competition.

Mr. Krouglik said that in the transition countries social dialogue was not yet complete, but very often trade unions and employers were united in raising issues with the government. Social dialogue could only take place in a climate of mutual understanding.

Decent work – Safe work: Strategies to improve safety and health in TCF industries

Moderator: Ms. T. Sosnina, Worker Vice-Chairperson of the Meeting

Panellists: Ms. E. Rosskam, Programme on Safety, Health and the Environment, ILO, Geneva

Ms. L. Besson, Executive Director, Employers' Consultative Association of Trinidad and Tobago, Port of Spain

Ms. S. Capuccio, Health and Safety Secretary, International Textile, Garment and Leather Workers' Federation (ITGLWF), Brussels

Ms. Rosskam indicated that workers faced health risks in the TCF industries related to poor lighting, layout of the workspace, fire hazards and noise. Many of these could be corrected through proper planning. Low-cost innovations such as sky lights and windows could be used to maximize natural illumination. Sound-absorbing materials on walls or around the machinery were preferable to earmuffs which were hot and cumbersome. Movement and better seating arrangements could be used to prevent repetitive strain injuries (RSI) and musculo-skeletal disorders (MSD) which are widespread in the industry. Machine maintenance and the guarding of equipment could protect workers.

She referred to ongoing activities such as the "European Strains Campaign" of the European Trade Union Confederation and the fact that October/November 2000 was being devoted to raising awareness about MSD by the European Agency for Occupational Safety and Health.

Homeworkers were another category which needed special attention since they were paid by piece rate and worked outside the factory where there was little control over the factors referred to above. One solution might be to make ergonomic equipment available to such workers.

Harmful chemicals were also common to the TCF industries and were found in solvents, dyes, paints, glues and powders which could have a number of short- and long-term effects. The first solution would be to provide good ventilation and to substitute dangerous substances with less harmful ones. Problems associated with workers lifting and carrying heavy objects could be overcome by training in proper lifting techniques and respecting maximum limits as outlined in the ILO's Maximum Weight Convention, 1967 (No. 127).

Having a health and safety representative present at the workplace was one way of ensuring that working conditions were dealt with collectively by management and the workers and not on an individual basis.

The speaker went on to refer to the ergonomic checkpoints approach which could be used and result in less damage to goods and materials, increased productivity, fewer accidents, better morale and improved company image. These would result in added value – not added cost.

Ms. Besson said that the major concerns facing workers in the TCF industries in Trinidad and Tobago were related to: overcrowding, poor ventilation, means of escape in case of fire, the employment of mainly single parent women with family responsibilities, noise and machine guarding.

Corrective measures could include: registration of all garment cottage-type operations and boutiques to bring them under the jurisdiction of the Factory Inspectorate. The Factory Inspectorate could also form alliances with other government agencies (National Insurance, Central Statistics Office, Ministry of Industry and Commerce, Ministry of Health, Small Business Development Company).

The absence of major accidents should not lead to complacency. Potential hazards existed and still needed to be identified and risks assessed. The lack of enforcement of appropriate legislation led organizations to spend less money on correcting potential OSH problems. Personnel also needed to be trained to identify potential OSH hazards. With increasing globalization, and the emergence of a world market, there was greater need for the adoption of international codes and standards.

Ms. Capuccio felt that the working conditions in the TCF industries had deteriorated in recent years especially since many physical disorders did not appear immediately and showed up only years later.

Under the competitive threat of globalization employers were forced not only to move from one country to another in search of lower wages, but also to seek other savings such as in the cost of proper working conditions and in skimping on preventive measures. The pace of work had also intensified in response to market demand. Subcontracting had become a sort of universal principle in the process of globalization resulting in more informal home work which was unprotected by legislation.

Because of low salaries “workplace inspections” often became a simple mechanism for local corruption. In many countries, the policy to promote industrial development usually failed to include investment in essential social welfare services. Medical reports often overlooked symptoms and thus reported low incidences of occupational diseases. Where child labour existed, the anatomical, physiological and psychological characteristics of children made them more vulnerable to occupational hazards as compared to adult workers. Sexual abuses were not infrequent.

Discussion

In the ensuing discussion many of the participants raised issues they had encountered. For example, a Worker member from Bangladesh felt that even if her country had ratified the Forced Labour Convention, 1930 (No. 29), abolishing

forced labour, long hours and late shifts that finished when no transportation was available, was tantamount to forced labour.

An Employer member from Nigeria commented on the effectiveness of joint safety committees and the role they could play in encouraging reluctant workers to use personal protective equipment, a point which was also echoed by the Government representative of Tunisia who felt equipment was available but not used.

In response to a question from the representative of the Government of Tunisia who stated that governments were willing to use less hazardous chemicals, but could not locate them, Ms. Roskam indicated that the ILO's CIS database¹ could be used to search for alternatives.

An Employer member from the United States indicated how NIKE had come up with a non-toxic water-based substitute to glue shoes together. It was initially more expensive but large volumes and reduced health costs had made it pay off. The company had even run training programmes in its use for its competitors who were still reluctant to introduce it, mainly for cost considerations. But where there was a will there was a way.

An Employer member from Mexico felt that there was general compliance with the laws in respect of OSH matters and requested more objective information.

A Worker member from Ghana agreed that joint safety committees were a good thing in a factory setting, but questioned what could be done for the informal sector and for women and children. When governments did not live up to their responsibilities the burden fell on the employers and workers, perhaps with the assistance of NGOs.

Ms. Roskam emphasized that it was important to remember that when dealing with the informal sector a different approach was required than for an organized factory. Goals should not be too high at the start, but it was important to make a start. There were grass-roots organizations, OSH specialists on the MDTs, SMEs could link up with NGOs and employers' organizations. Through networking, examples of positive case studies could be shared.

The representative of the Government of Egypt pointed out that lack of resources prevented many countries from training inspectors to go out and do a proper job.

Many speakers also referred to the use of the Internet to post problems and seek potential solutions on OSH problems. Large multinationals were in a better position to devise alternatives, but information sharing remained a problem.

¹ International Occupational Safety and Health Information Centre (CIS), www.ilo.org/cis.

How to improve the impact of voluntary private initiatives in the TCF industries: From theory to practice

Moderator: Mr. Zhang Junfeng, Vice-Chairperson of the Government group

Panellists: Mr. M. Urminsky, Voluntary Private Initiatives, ILO, Geneva

Mr. R. Alexandriysky, Chairperson, Association of Garments and Textiles in Bulgaria, Sofia

Mr. N. Kearney, General Secretary, International Textiles, Garment and Leather Workers' Federation (ITGLWF), Brussels

Mr. Urminsky gave an overview of general trends in voluntary private initiatives (VPIs) in the textiles, leather, footwear and clothing industry, of the social component of the Global Compact, and of the ILO's current work on VPIs.

He pointed out that a number of codes of conduct as well as social labelling schemes were being applied in the sector. Some of these, like the Clean Clothes Campaign, were specific to this industry. Others were cross-sectoral, including for example the SA 8000 code or the Ethical Trading Initiative. Like in other sectors, the initiatives in the TCF industries tended to be selective in the choice of issues, often reflecting the concerns of the parties involved. Freedom of association and collective bargaining, for example, were typically raised in schemes where workers' organizations were involved. The issues most commonly addressed were forced labour and child labour. Partnerships were an important means of gaining credibility for the initiatives.

The Global Compact was a new international initiative launched by the Secretary-General of the United Nations at the World Economic Forum in 1999. Its nine universal principles included the fundamental rights enshrined in the ILO Declaration, in addition to basic human rights and environmental requirements. It was addressed to companies which could adopt and implement it, among others, by engaging in projects and alliances with diverse interest groups.

ILO work on VPIs included research on supply chain management, where TCF was one of the groups of sectors under study. Another topic was the effectiveness of social labelling in combating child labour. A searchable database about VPIs would soon become available where all constituents and interested parties would be able to find current, original information on initiatives. The ILO had also been promoting the Global Compact through a series of meetings with employers in developing countries.

Mr. Alexandriysky focused on a different angle of product labelling based on the Bulgarian experience in the sector. Small and medium enterprises in the countries in transition were forced to compete globally under very unfavourable conditions, including a collapsed banking system, all but non-existent national markets and a State failing to uphold fair terms of competition in international trade. If the national firms were to survive, it was imperative to strengthen employers' associations so they could engage the Government in a discussion

about its role. He also hoped that new marketing rules could be introduced through an alliance and that a requirement would be introduced for labelling of products in the Bulgarian language. Only if the enterprises managed to stabilize economically would conditions for workers be expected to improve.

Mr. Kearney began by emphasizing that corporate codes of conduct and social labelling existed because governments and international institutions had failed to guarantee decent work around the globe. These initiatives were not voluntary, but had rather been forced on the sector by public opinion and consumers. While codes of conduct were ultimately codes of labour practices, they were no substitute for legislation and its effective implementation. At best, they could become a temporary bridge towards the universal observance of the principle of decent work. Good codes had to meet five criteria: (i) their content had to be based on the core ILO Conventions and to also include provisions for a “living wage”, reasonable hours of work, safety and health and job security; (ii) an effective management system in place in the firm; (iii) monitoring; (iv) independent verification of compliance; and (v) an assessment of the impact. He pointed out that few unilateral codes met the above criteria. Most were mere public relations exercises.

The proliferation of partial and differing codes was a problem also for the industry faced with repeated paperwork and inspection. Broad, multi-stakeholder codes such as SA 8000 which involved manufacturers and retailers as well as trade unions and NGOs were preferred. SA 8000, for instance, integrated relevant ILO Conventions and compliance became a contractual obligation along the production chain and was subject to independent verification. He regretted that the ILO had largely been sidelined in the development of VPIs, when it should be drawing on its vast expertise to promote uniform application, to develop standards for social auditing and to train inspectors.

He called on all companies to engage in social dialogue and to work with trade unions so that codes had benefits for all. Where codes were being subscribed to, all employees should receive explanation, training and have a personal copy in a language they understood. Procedures needed to be in place for monitoring and for dealing with complaints. Trade unions, for their part, needed to learn about codes and how to use and monitor them.

A big obstacle in the application of codes at the moment was the inconsistent behaviour of multinational manufacturers and retailers in the sector: on the one hand they often imposed a code of conduct with first class social standards; on the other, they were paying rates for the products and setting deadlines for delivery, that made it impossible for the local manufacturer to comply with the code. Those who placed orders needed to understand that compliance came at a price.

Discussion

Mr. Kearney insisted that the cost of compliance with a code had to be borne by the employer as it was in fact tantamount to observing national labour legislation. Buyers were responsible for paying a fair price. He agreed with a question suggesting that wages and working hours were the most controversial issues in codes. Setting a “living wage” was, however, less difficult than was often assumed. He maintained that workers had a very good appreciation of what

constituted a living wage. Code verifiers were also developing this capability. He quoted the experience of four teams of inspectors, which, independently and using different methodologies, arrived at very similar wages for the TCF industry in southern China. This notwithstanding, wages should ideally be set by free collective bargaining. Paying a living wage was perfectly possible. A review of 500 audits by a major European retailer had found that those manufacturing firms that did not pay a living wage were also the ones that were not meeting quality standards, deadlines for deliveries and had low overall productivity.

An Employer member from Croatia observed that most firms in the TCF sector in Croatia were merely processing international orders and were subject to enormous economic pressure. Some companies were forced to relocate to lower wage countries in transition. The alternative strategy of creating a brand of their own was costly and available to only a few firms. She suggested that the workers did understand this situation and that there had been few difficulties between the social partners in her country. Mr. Kearney agreed that Croatia was a positive example of social dialogue.

Several speakers raised the question of the relationship between trade and social standards. Mr. Kearney argued that codes were a stopgap through which markets and consumers were trying to make up for the failure of governments to implement the labour legislation which often existed. Mechanisms that encouraged good practices rather than punished offences were to be preferred. The trade unions were not wedded to the social clause as a way to link trade and workers' rights, but he concluded that one way or another "the ILO needed teeth".

Closing speeches

The Secretary-General provided information on participation in the Meeting and reviewed its outputs. He noted that 19 women delegates were present, representing a figure of almost 36 per cent. When all participants were included, the percentage of female participation was 40 per cent. He was pleased to note that the Meeting had been important for the ILO and its constituents in addressing the problems related to current labour practices in the TCF industries, particularly regarding the fundamental principles and rights at work reaffirmed in the ILO Declaration. He highlighted that the social dialogue which had taken place enabled the Meeting to adopt important conclusions as well as one resolution. These texts were the main outcomes of the Meeting. He mentioned that it was now important that the constituents of the ILO as well as the ILO itself be ready to put the conclusions and the resolution into action. Many of the activities identified in the conclusions and the resolution could not be accomplished by the Office alone but required the continuous contribution of knowledge and experience of the parties concerned.

Ms. B. Jantjies (Vice-Chairperson of the Workers' group) considered that the Meeting provided an important opportunity to discuss the problems encountered by workers in the TCF industries around the world and congratulated the Office on the production of a detailed and interesting report which greatly facilitated the work of the Meeting. On behalf of the Workers' group, particular thanks were given to ACTRAV.

Workers suffered from the blight of inhuman treatment and exploitation. Not only was there a denial, by some groups, of these abusive practices, but also a refusal to discuss the key issues facing industries today, i.e. international collective bargaining, framework agreements, codes of conduct, issues which were submitted in the draft resolutions. Because of these refusals there was a failure to address the agenda of importance to these sectors. As a result, the Meeting had followed another agenda, one totally separate from the real needs of the TCF industries. The Governing Body of the ILO needed urgently to reconsider how these meetings were handled. The wisdom of having working groups chaired by Worker or Employer representatives who, during the course of the Meeting, actively participated in the work of their respective group was questioned. The possibility of issues being addressed comprehensively if sectoral meetings were to take place in the regions was raised. The ILO, as well governments, employers and unions, needed to take action to fulfil the demands made by the representatives of the TCF industry.

Mr. T. Makeka (Chairperson of the Employers' group) expressed his group's appreciation to the Office for having facilitated a fruitful exchange of views on the issues within the TCF industries. The Employers' group believed there was a need for more dialogue at regional and subregional levels and expressed the hope that the ILO would provide the necessary assistance to develop social dialogue at these levels. He added that employers were aware of the problems encountered in the TCF industries and were willing to address them in order to achieve the common goal of providing decent work for all. He thanked the Government representatives

for their active participation and expressed his group's satisfaction at the outcome of the Meeting.

Mr. K. Nakchuen (Chairperson of the Government group) expressed the satisfaction of his group at the quality of the report prepared by the Office. The conclusions and the resolution adopted reflected the issues which needed to be addressed in order to improve working conditions and to promote stable employment in this sector. He believed that with continual tripartite efforts and with the support of the ILO, the benefits of globalization would be fairly distributed to all and social dialogue in the TCF industries would be improved and strengthened.

The Chairperson thanked and congratulated the participants and the Officers of the Meeting both for the results obtained and for the spirit of cooperation that prevailed during the discussions. She also expressed her satisfaction regarding the number of women participating in the Meeting. She stressed that conducting such a meeting exemplified social dialogue in action, and she thanked the secretariat for its excellent preparatory work as well as its assistance during the course of the Meeting. The report had provided a sound basis for discussion. Panel discussions allowed for issues to be covered that were not addressed in plenary sessions. The resolution and the conclusions adopted contained plans of action which merited the full attention of the ILO. Once disseminated through the *Note on the proceedings* within a few months, these texts also required that follow-up action be taken at national and international levels. The Chairperson reminded participants that she would have the privilege of presenting the results of this Meeting to the Governing Body, and was persuaded that positive and constructive decisions were taken concerning the future of the TCF industries during the course of the Meeting. The Chairperson declared the Tripartite Meeting on Labour Practices in the Footwear, Leather, Textiles and Clothing Industries closed.

Evaluation questionnaire

A questionnaire seeking participants' opinions on various aspects of the Meeting was distributed before the end of the Meeting.

1. How do you rate the Meeting as regards the following?

	5 Excellent	4 Good	3 Satis- factory	2 Poor	1 Unsatis- factory	Average score
The choice of agenda item (subject of the Meeting)	11	10	2			4.4
The points for discussion	5	16	3			4.0
The quality of the discussion	2	11	10			3.7
The Meeting's benefits to the sector	5	14	4	1		4.0
The conclusions	3	11	6	1		3.8
The resolution	3	5	6	3	3	3.1
Panel discussion on social dialogue in the TCF industries	3	10	4			3.9
Panel discussion on decent work – safe work	3	8	6	2		3.6
Panel discussion on how to improve the impact of VPIs in the TCF industries	4	6	8			3.8
Opportunity for networking	3	13	4	1		3.9

2. How do you rate the quality of the report in terms of the following?

	5 Excellent	4 Good	3 Satis- factory	2 Poor	1 Unsatis- factory	Average score
Quality of analysis	5	15	4			4.0
Objectivity	5	12	7			3.9
Comprehensiveness of coverage	4	12	6			3.9
Presentation and readability	9	12	3			4.3
Amount and relevance of information	5	16	4			4.0

3. How do you consider the time allotted for discussion?

	Too much	Enough	Too little
Discussion of the report	3	21	–
Panel discussions	6	14	1
Groups	4	18	–
Working Party on Resolutions	4	11	5
Working Party on Conclusions	4	13	3

4. How do you rate the practical and administrative arrangements (secretariat, document services, translation, interpretation)?

	5 Excellent	4 Good	3 Satis- factory	2 Poor	1 Unsatis- factory	Average score
	11	9	3			4.3

5. Respondents to the questionnaire

	Government	Employers	Workers	Observers	Total
	5	6	12	1	24

6. Participants at the Meeting

	Government	Employers	Workers	Technical advisers	Observers	Total
	13	20	20	12	20	85

7. Delegates/technical advisers

	Government	Employers	Workers	Total
Delegates	13	20	20	53
Technical advisers	7	1	5	13

8. Female participation

	Government	Employers	Workers	Total	% women delegates
Delegates	2	6	11	19	35.8
Technical advisers	4	–	3	7	

List of participants
Liste des participants
Lista de participantes

Representative of the Governing Body
of the International Labour Office
Représentant du Conseil d'administration
du Bureau international du Travail
Representante del Consejo de Administración
de la Oficina Internacional del Trabajo

M^{me} Lucia Sasso-Mazzufferi, dirigeante, Affaires internationales, CONFINDUSTRIA, Confédération générale des employeurs d'Italie, Rome

Members representing governments
Membres représentant les gouvernements
Miembros representantes de los gobiernos

BANGLADESH

Mr. Shahidul Haque, Counsellor, Permanent Mission of Bangladesh in Geneva

BELGIUM BELGIQUE BÉLGICA

Mr. Luk Biesemans, Sociaal Bemiddelaar, Ministerie van Tewerk Stelling en Arbeid, Vilvoorde

CHINA CHINE

Mr. Zhang Junfeng, Counsellor, Permanent Mission of China in Geneva

Adviser/Conseiller technique/Consejero técnico

Mr. Liu Xu, First Secretary, Permanent Mission of China in Geneva

COLOMBIA COLOMBIE

Sr. Camilo Reyes Rodríguez, Embajador, Representante Permanente de Colombia, Misión Permanente de Colombia en Ginebra

Advisers/Conseillers techniques/Consejeros técnicos

Sra. Amparo Oviedo Arbelaez, Ministra Consejera, Misión Permanente de Colombia en Ginebra

Sra. Olga Lucía Lozano Ferro, Ministra Consejera, Misión Permanente de Colombia en Ginebra

CZECH REPUBLIC RÉPUBLIQUE TCHÈQUE REPÚBLICA CHECA

Mr. Miroslav Fuchs, Director of Department, Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs, Praha

EGYPT EGYPT EGIPTO

Ms. Nadia El-Gazzar, Labour Counsellor, Permanent Mission of Egypt in Geneva

MALAYSIA MALAISIE MALASIA

Mr. Mohd Abdul Wahab Bin Mohd Salleh, Director of Labour, Labour Department Headquarters, Kuala Lumpur
Adviser/Conseiller technique/Consejera técnica

Ms. Sharifah Fuziah, Counsellor, Labour Affairs, Permanent Mission of Malaysia in Geneva

MOROCCO MAROC MARRUECOS

M. Abderrahim Benrouine, délégué préfectoral de l'emploi, direction du travail, ministère de l'Emploi, de la Formation professionnelle et du Développement social, Rabat

PORTUGAL

M. João Fraga de Oliveira, inspecteur du travail, Inspeção Geral do Trabalho, Porto

Adviser/Conseiller technique/Consejera técnica

M^{me} M. Teresa Paccetti, Assessora Principal, ministère du Travail et de la Solidarité, Lisbonne

THAILAND THAÏLANDE TAILANDIA

Mr. Kamjorn Nakchuen, Minister Counsellor (Labour), Permanent Mission of Thailand in Geneva

TUNISIA TUNISIE TÚNEZ

M. Khémaïs Brini, ingénieur chargé de mission, ministère de l'Industrie, Tunis

Adviser/Conseiller technique/Consejero técnico

M. Mohamed El-Mili, chef de service cuir et chaussure, ministère de l'Industrie, Tunis

TURKEY TURQUIE TURQUÍA

Mr. Özkan Suat Özmen, Expert, Ministry of Labour and Social Security, Ankara

UNITED STATES ETATS-UNIS ESTADOS UNIDOS

Ms. Janie Hester, Acting Director, Commodities Division, Bureau of International Labor Affairs, US Department of Labor, Washington

Adviser/Conseiller technique/Consejero técnico

Mr. Robert Hagen, Labor Attaché, Permanent Mission of the United States in Geneva

Members representing the Employers

Membres représentant les employeurs

Miembros representantes de los empleadores

Mr. Robert Alexandriysky, Chairman, Association of Garments & Textile Exporters in Bulgaria, Sofia

Mr. Kenneth Anthony, Head of Industrial Relations, British Footwear Association/CBI, Wellingborough

Ms. Linda Besson, Executive Director, Employers' Consultative Association of Trinidad & Tobago, Port of Spain

Mr. Namjiltseren Dash-Ulzii, President, Ulziit Center Corporation of Mongolia, Ulan Bator

Mr. Pravin Dave, Head, Employee Relations, Hindustan Lever Ltd., Employers Federation of India, Bangalore
Sr. Jesús Flores Merino, Director, Flores Merino S.C., Mexico
Mr. Nobuo Fujii, Assistant Manager, Personnel Department, Kuraray Co. Ltd., Osaka
Mr. Mebrahtu Haile Tesfazion, Board Member, Employers' Federation of Eritrea, Asmara
Mr. Alexandre Krouglik, Vice-President, JSC "ROSLEGPROM", Moscow
Ms. Hannie V. Linger, Chief Executive Officer, CKC Textile Works Suriname (TWS) N.V., Paramaribo
Mr. Thabo Makeka, Executive Director, Association of Lesotho Employers, Maseru
Mr. Abdul Aziz Memon, Chairman, Kings Textile Industries (Pvt.) Ltd., Karachi
Mr. Jaiyeola Paul Olarewaju, Executive Director, Nigerian Textile Garment & Tailoring Employers' Association, Lagos
Mr. Jieming Qin, Deputy Director of International Department, China Enterprise Confederation (CEC), Beijing
Mr. Dag Sandvik, Lawyer, Federation of Norwegian Manufacturing Industries, Oslo
Mr. Klaus Schmidt, Director-General, GESAMTTEXTIL e.v., Eschborn
Ms. Marija Sutina, General Manager, "EMKA" D.D. Modna Kucá Pregrada, Pregrada
Ms. Amanda Tucker, Senior Manager, Labor Practices, NIKE Inc., Beaverton
Adviser/Conseiller technique/Consejero técnico
Mr. Todd McKean, NIKE Inc., Beaverton
Ms. Sari Vannela, Executive Director, Finnish Shoe and Leather Industries, Helsinki
Ms. Danielle Wong, Director, Mauritius Export Processing Zone Association (MEPZA), Port Louis

Members representing the Workers

Membres représentant les travailleurs

Miembros representantes de los trabajadores

Ms. Khaleda Anwar, Women Affairs Secretary, Bangladesh Textile, Garment & Leather Workers' Federation (BTGLWF), Dhaka
Mr. Gilbert Awinongya, Deputy General Secretary (Operations), Industrial & Commercial Workers' Union (ICU), Accra
Mr. Macaefa Billy, General Secretary, Lesotho Clothing & Allied Workers' Union, Maseru
Mr. Peter Booth, National Organizer, Transport & General Workers' Union (TGWU), London
Ms. Lutgarda Cabebe, Executive Vice-President, Integrated Labor Organization of the Philippines, Quezon City
Adviser/Conseiller technique/Consejero técnico
Mr. Florante G. Reyes, National President, Integrated Labor Organization of the Philippines, Quezon City
M. Jan Callaert, secrétaire national, CCTKB, Gent
Ms. Akiko Gono, Director, International Affairs Bureau, ZENSEN, Tokyo
Adviser/Conseiller technique/Consejero técnico
Mr. Hisanobu Shimada, Director of Textile & Manufacturing Industries Division, ZENSEN, Tokyo
Mr. Arthur Gundersheim, Director, International Trade Department, Union of Needle Trades Industrial and Textile Employees (UNITE), New York
Ms. Carmen Ionescu, International Affairs Department, Textile and Clothing, Democratic Trade Union Confederation of Roumania, Textile and Clothing Sector (CSDR), Bucarest
Ms. Bonita Jantjies, Organizer, Southern African Clothing and Textile Workers' Union, Cape Town

Sra. Mayra Jiménez, Secretaria General, Federación Unitaria de Trabajadores de las Zonas Francas (Futrazona), San Pedro de Macoris

Sra. Noemi Ruíz Menéndez, Secretaria General Nacional, A.M.A. Asociación de Trabajadores de la Moda y Imagen, Buenos Aires

Adviser/Conseiller technique/Consejera técnica

Ms. Laura Carter, Policy Assistant to the General Secretary, ITGLWF, Nelson

Sr. Marco Aurelio Ossa Romero, Secretario General, Sindicato Textil Coltejer Sedeco (CGTD), Itagui Antioquia

Adviser/Conseiller technique/Consejero técnico

Mr. Koen Deketele, Interpreter, CCTKB, Gent

Mr. Zeki Polat, President, Turkish Textile, Knitting and Garment Workers' Union (TEKSIF), Ankara

Adviser/Conseiller technique/Consejero técnico

Mr. Önder Aker, Consultant, Turkish Textile, Knitting and Garment Workers' Union (TEKSIF), Ankara

M^{me} Khadija Rhamiri, Union marocaine du travail, Casablanca

Mr. Wolfgang Rose, Sekretär, IG Metall Vorstand, Rödermark

Ms. Manali Shah, Member, Executive Committee, Self-Employed Women's Association (SEWA), Bhadra Ahmedabad

Ms. Tatiana Sosnina, President, Textile and Light Industry Workers' Union of Russia, Moscow

Ms. Ari Sunarijati, Head, Division of Organization & International Relations, Indonesian Textile, Garment & Leather Workers' Union (SPTSK), Jakarta

Sr. Adolfo Gott Trujillo, Secretario General, Sindicato de Trabajadores de la Industria Textil, de la Confección, Similares y Conexos de la República Mexicana, México

Others

Autres

Otros

Representatives of member States present at the sittings

Représentants d'Etats Membres présents aux séances

Representantes de Estados Miembros presentes en las sesiones

MEXICO MEXIQUE MÉXICO

Sra. Socorro Rovirosa Priego, Ministro, Misión Permanente de México en Ginebra

Representatives of United Nations, specialized agencies and other official international organizations

Représentants des Nations Unies, des institutions spécialisées et d'autres organisations internationales officielles

Representantes de las Naciones Unidas, de los organismos especializados y de otras organizaciones internacionales oficiales

Arab Labour Organization (ALO)

Organisation arabe du travail

Organización Árabe del Trabajo

M. A. Majid Abugrara, directeur adjoint, délégation permanente à Genève

International Textiles and Clothing Bureau (ITCB)

Bureau international des textiles et des vêtements

Oficina Internacional de los Textiles y las Prendas de Vestir

Ms. Dinora Diaz, Economic Officer, Geneva

World Trade Organization (WTO-OMC)

Organization mondiale du Commerce

Organización Mundial del Comercio

Mr. Jean-Pierre Lapalme, Counsellor, Textiles Division, Geneva

Representatives of non-governmental international organizations

Représentants d'organisations internationales non gouvernementales

Representantes de organizaciones internacionales no gubernamentales

European Apparel and Textile Organization (EURATEX)

Organisation européenne du textile, de l'habillement et des grandes entreprises

Mr. William Lakin, Director-General, Brussels

European Observatory for Textiles and Clothing

Observatoire européen du textile et de l'habillement (OETH)

Ms. Michèle Ledic, Director-General, Brussels

European Trade Union Federation for Textiles, Clothing and Leather (ETUF-TCL)

Fédération syndicale européenne du textile, de l'habillement et du cuir

Mr. Patrick Itschert, General Secretary, Brussels

International Confederation of Free Trade Unions (ICFTU)

Confédération internationale des syndicats libres (CISL)

Confederación Internacional de Organizaciones Sindicales Libres

Mr. Dan Cunniah, Director, Geneva Office

Ms. Anna Biondi, Assistant Director, Geneva Office

International Federation Textile and Clothing (IFTC-WCL)

Fédération internationale textile et habillement

Federación Internacional Textil y Vestido

Mr. Bart Bruggeman, CNV– Bedrÿven Bond, Houten

Mr. Dirk Uyttenhove, Secretary, Gent

International Federation of University Women

Fédération internationale des femmes diplômées des universités

Federación Internacional de Mujeres Universitarias

Ms. Conchita Poncini, Troinex/Geneva

Ms. Christiane Privat, Vessy

International Organization of Employers (IOE)

Organisation internationale des employeurs

Organización Internacional de Empleadores

Mr. Jean Dejardin, Adviser, Cointrin/Geneva

International Textile, Garment and Leather Workers' Federation (ITGLWF)

Fédération internationale des travailleurs du textile, de l'habillement et du cuir

Federación Internacional de Trabajadores del Textil, Vestuario y Cuero

Mr. Neil Kearney, General Secretary, Brussels

Ms. Laura Carter, Policy Assistant to the General Secretary, Nelson

Mr. Kadir Burhan, Ankara

Mr. Necdet Inandioglu, Ankara

World Federation of Trade Unions

Fédération syndicale mondiale

Federación Sindical Mundial

M^{me} Aida Avella, représentant permanent à Genève

M. Luis Narváez, conseiller juridique, Genève