

# Note on the Proceedings

Tripartite Meeting on Human Resources Development,  
Employment and Globalization in the Hotel,  
Catering and Tourism Sector

Geneva, 2-6 April 2001

---

## **Contents**

Introduction.....	1
Part 1. Consideration of the agenda item .....	5
Report of the discussion.....	7
Introduction.....	7
Composition of the Working Party .....	7
Presentation of the report and general discussion.....	8
Presentation of the report.....	8
General discussion.....	9
Point-by-point discussion .....	11
Globalization .....	11
Employment creation and working conditions .....	16
Social dialogue .....	25
Consideration and adoption of the draft report and the draft conclusions by the Meeting .....	28
Conclusions on human resources development, employment and globalization in the hotel, catering and tourism sector .....	29
General.....	29
Globalization.....	29
Employment creation and working conditions .....	30
Human resource development (HRD) .....	31
Social dialogue.....	32
Role of the ILO.....	33
Part 2. Resolutions .....	35
Consideration and adoption by the Meeting of the draft resolutions .....	37
Resolution concerning measures to promote employment in the hotel, catering and tourism sector during the low season, including vacation programmes for senior citizens.....	38
Resolution concerning occupational health and safety in the hotel, catering and tourism sector .....	38
Resolution concerning improving occupational equality for men and women in the hotel, catering and tourism sector .....	38
Texts of the resolutions adopted by the Meeting .....	39
Resolution concerning measures to promote employment in the hotel, catering and tourism sector during the low season, including vacation programmes for senior citizens.....	39
Resolution concerning occupational health and safety in the hotel, catering and tourism sector.....	39
Resolution concerning improving occupational equality for men and women in the hotel, catering and tourism sector .....	40

---

Part 3. Other proceedings.....	43
Panel discussions.....	45
Social dialogue in the hotel, catering and tourism sector .....	45
Discussion .....	49
Socially sustainable tourism development.....	50
Discussion .....	53
Gender questions in the hotel, catering and tourism sector .....	53
Discussion .....	56
Closing speeches .....	57
Evaluation questionnaire.....	59
List of participants.....	63

---

## Introduction

The Tripartite Meeting on Human Resources Development, Employment and Globalization in the Hotel, Catering and Tourism Sector was held at the ILO in Geneva from 2 to 6 April 2001.

The Office had prepared a report<sup>1</sup> issued in English, French and Spanish to serve as a basis for the Meeting's deliberations. It addressed the following topics: general developments in the hotel, catering and tourism sector; the driving forces of globalization impacting upon travel, hospitality and tourism; company consolidation strategies; the impact of technology on SMEs; employment and working conditions; human resource development including forms of work organization and training; and social dialogue.

The Governing Body had designated Mr. Dietrich Willers, Government member of the Governing Body to represent it and to chair the Meeting. The three Vice-Chairpersons elected by the Meeting were: Ms. Dembscher (Austria) from the Government group; Mr. Ramsamy from the Employers' group; and Mr. Latorre from the Workers' group.

The Meeting was attended by Government representatives from: Argentina, Austria, Brazil, Canada, China, Dominican Republic, Egypt, France, Greece, Hungary, India, Italy, Kenya, Mexico, Morocco, Philippines, Poland, Portugal, South Africa, Spain and Switzerland, as well as 25 Employer and Worker representatives. A representative of the Government of the United States was also present at the sittings.

Observers from the European Commission and the World Tourism Organization attended the Meeting and representatives from the following international non-governmental organizations also attended as observers: the General Confederation of Trade Unions; Hotels, Restaurants and Cafés in Europe; the International Confederation of Free Trade Unions; the International Federation of University Women; the International Hotel and Restaurant Association; the International Organization of Employers; the International Union of Food, Agricultural, Hotel, Restaurant, Catering, Tobacco and Allied Workers' Associations; Union Network International; the World Confederation of Labour; the World Federation of Agriculture and Food Workers; and Zonta International.

The three groups elected their Officers as follows:

*Government group:*

<i>Chairperson:</i>	Mr. Zhang (China)
<i>Vice-Chairperson:</i>	Mr. Sio (Kenya)
<i>Secretary:</i>	Mr. Nadon (Canada)

<sup>1</sup> ILO, Tripartite Meeting on Human Resources Development, Employment and Globalization in the Hotel, Catering and Tourism Sector, Geneva, 2001: *Human resources development, employment and globalization in the hotel, catering and tourism sector*, 133 pp.

---

*Employers' group:*

*Chairperson:* Mr. Ghezzi

*Vice-Chairpersons:* Mr. Feliho  
Mr. Rajnita  
Ms. Sajjad

*Secretary:* Mr. Dejardin

*Workers' group:*

*Chairperson:* Mr. Schroeter

*Vice-Chairpersons:* Mr. El-Sharkawi  
Ms. Krylova  
Mr. Pepen Castillo  
Mr. Sawada

*Secretary:* Mr. Dalban Moreynas

The Secretary-General of the Meeting was Mr. O. de Vries Reilingh, Director of the Sectoral Activities Department. The Deputy Secretary-General was Ms. C. Doumbia-Henry of the same department. The Executive Secretary was Mr. D. Belau. The Clerk of the Meeting was Ms. S. Maybud of the Management Services Unit of the Social Dialogue Sector. The experts were: Mr. D. Appave, Ms. C. Foucault-Mohammed, Mr. J. Sendanyoye, Mr. M. Soumah and Ms. S. Tomoda.

The Meeting held six sessions.

The Chairperson opened the Meeting by observing that there was hardly any other economic sector where working conditions were so atypical in terms of working hours and seasonal work. Wages were commonly dependent on the size of tips received. So it was only fitting that the ILO accorded some attention to this particular branch of the economy by convening such a meeting. According to the Office report, workers in the hotel and tourism sector accounted for 3 per cent of the active global population and produced about the same share of the world's GDP. If suppliers were included in the figure it would be 8 per cent and as high as 10 per cent of GNP in some countries. The Governing Body of the ILO decided to examine the possibilities of creating jobs in this sector on the basis of a report provided by the Office. In fact, the previous ILO Tripartite Meeting on Hotel and Tourism which was held in 1997 had been devoted to the theme of new technology and the report of the Meeting had been in such high demand that it had been sold out. This time the Meeting would deal with broader themes, concerning the effects of globalization and increased competition.

The documentation available on unemployment and productivity was insufficient to assist us to understand clearly how small enterprises were being affected by the process of consolidation of enterprises through restructuring. Cross-border tourism was growing at the rate of over 7 per cent in 2000. International tourist trends could change quickly. Developing countries were, however, increasing their market share. Even if the general image of the sector was positive, fundamental questions needed to be addressed such as job and income security, work pressures, vocational training and continuous training. There was a need to make the sector more attractive to the workforce. Women were still doing

---

the harder jobs and constituted over half of the total number of employees in the sector, and often they were relegated to the lesser skilled tasks.

The problems posed for workers in the hotel and tourism sector lay at the heart of the ILO's mandate. More precisely, the last session of the Governing Body of the ILO had placed an important item on its agenda for discussion by the Working Party on the Social Dimension of Globalization, entitled "Poverty reduction and decent work in a globalizing world". The discussion in that session concluded that globalization entailed negative effects on both rich and poor countries. At the same time, the industry constituted an important buffer against poverty. The tourist industry was an eloquent example, subject as it was to the pressures of competition while also benefiting from the migration of labour. The typical low-wage earner in some industrialized countries is the unskilled female foreign worker. Young people, too, could find work in companies that are prone to failure. However, there were different kinds of work, and decent work meant earning more than the minimum wage. This problem also concerned giant companies, because it was important to focus on best practices and labour-saving technologies.

The ILO was well equipped to be a forum for a discussion on the problems being faced in the sector. Not only could it offer its tripartite institutions, but its programme of sectoral meetings was designed to focus on specific sectors. In this particular Meeting, discussions within a tripartite structure could be expected to lead to views on ways to overcome the difficulties faced by the sector.

Ms. Sally Paxton, Executive Director, Social Dialogue Sector of the ILO, in her opening statement set the context of this Meeting within the work of the Organization on the promotion of social dialogue. She recalled the importance of the hotel, catering and tourism sector as a source of employment with a share of 3 per cent of the world's labour force and also as a strong contributor to many economies, frequently 3-4 per cent of GDP. She highlighted the role of numerous small and medium-sized enterprises in the sector and the high percentage of young and migrant workers. Drawing attention to the issues before the Meeting, she referred to the impact of globalization on the liberalization of air transport and trade in services, on mergers and acquisitions and on information and communication technologies as well as to the corresponding impact on employment and working conditions. She stressed that solutions will lie in innovative human resource development strategies, in strategies which enhance the competitive capacity of enterprises and in intensified social dialogue.

Ms. Paxton then referred to the decent work agenda of the ILO which had been endorsed by the Governing Body and the International Labour Conference. This agenda was an aspiration of people, of society, of the international community, of women and men everywhere. It included requirements for access to employment in conditions of freedom and the recognition of basic rights at work. Suggesting a framework for the work of the Meeting, she urged participants to set out a strategy for implementing decent work in the hotels, catering, and tourism sector, identifying the relevant major decent work issues, defining a set of time-bound objectives, and developing policies and programmes to meet them. Participants were also urged to consider the implementation of the ILO Declaration on Principles and Rights at Work and its Follow-up as well as of the Working Conditions (Hotels and Restaurants) Convention, 1991 (No. 172). She concluded by expressing the hope that the Meeting would be a vehicle for social dialogue at the international level and that its conclusions would result in action by the ILO's constituents and the ILO itself in the hotel, catering and tourism sector.

---

Part 1

## **Consideration of the agenda item**



---

# Report of the discussion <sup>1</sup>

## Introduction

1. The Meeting met to examine the item on the agenda. In accordance with the provisions of article 7 of the *Standing Orders for sectoral meetings*, the Officers presided in turn over the discussion.
2. The spokesperson for the Employers' group was Mr. Feutr  and the spokesperson for the Workers' group was Mr. Schroeter. The Meeting held five sittings devoted to the discussion of the agenda item.

## Composition of the Working Party

3. At its fifth plenary sitting, in accordance with the provisions of article 13, paragraph 2, of the *Standing Orders*, the Meeting set up a Working Party to draw up draft conclusions reflecting the views expressed in the course of the Meeting's discussion of the report. The Working Party, presided over by the Government Vice-Chairperson, was composed of the following members:

*Government members:*

Austria:	Ms. Dembsher
Egypt:	Mr. Talha
Greece:	Mr. Tatsos
India:	Mr. Bhanu
Portugal:	Ms. Soares

*Employer members:*

Mr. Amphon  
Mr. Cordesius  
Mr. Feutr   
Mr. Jones  
Mr. Rossi

<sup>1</sup> Adopted unanimously.

---

*Worker members:*

Mr. Bostic

Mr. Dedieu

Mr. Epistithiou

Mr. Pepen

Mr. Schroeter

## **Presentation of the report and general discussion**

### **Presentation of the report**

4. Introducing the report prepared by the International Labour Office, the Executive Secretary noted that it was the result of extensive research and information from different institutions including employers' and workers' organizations, such international organizations as the World Tourism Organization (WTO), UNCTAD, OECD and the European Commission, academic bodies, research institutes, hotel schools and professional associations as well as reports from consultants and publicly available sources. Information in the report was unavoidably centred on industrialized countries, and it had been difficult to present data from different countries consistently because of differing underlying statistical methods. Although it would take some time before comparable primary data would be available for a relevant number of countries, the situation was expected to improve following the adoption by the Statistical Commission of the United Nations in 2000 of a uniform methodology for tourism satellite accounts developed by the WTO and the OECD with the involvement of EUROSTAT. The Tourism Satellite Accounts framework had been developed with ILO cooperation as mandated by the last Tripartite Meeting in 1997, and as a result of that cooperation, debate had started on how to measure employment and other labour-related variables in the tourism sector. In March 2001, the ILO had presented to the Statistical Commission of the United Nations a first design of a labour accounting system in tourism. While the report quotes figures from various sources, it was important to highlight dissimilarities in definitions of the sector: the ILO's differed from those of other organizations in excluding transport but including services to non-tourists provided by hotels and restaurants.
5. The second section of the report dealt with the most important driving factors of globalization in the hotel, catering and tourism sector. For developing countries, the Internet provided increased access to the international tourism markets, although its use was still constrained by the difficulties of individual entrepreneurs and consumers in adopting the necessary technology and the weakness of telecommunications infrastructures in large parts of the world. Another key driver of globalization, especially in northern America and Europe is the continuing process of merger- and acquisition-related consolidation, growing franchising and management contracting. Large enterprises continued to increase their market shares at the expense of independent hotels and restaurants. Difficulties faced by workers, such as unstable employment relations, often reflecting corresponding difficulties by employers, were highlighted in the section on employment and working conditions. The report included examples of how the adverse effects of temporary contracts, part-time and seasonal work had been alleviated through, for example, evening out of the seasonal variations by the creation of additional activities in lean seasons, or by resort to older workers for part-time employment in peak seasons.

---

## General discussion

6. The Workers' spokesperson commenting on the Office report, stated that it painted a good picture of developments in the sector. It indicated the opportunities for action and was therefore a good basis for the Meeting's discussion. It covered adequately the effects of globalization on employment, conditions of work and social dialogue.
7. The Employers' spokesperson found that the report was interesting, with a lot of information and statistics, but it was out of balance. There was a lack of confidence in the statistics on which it was based. Therefore, it could not be a good basis for the discussion. He believed that, contrary to what came through the report, the sector did offer good career opportunities, that it was not too different from other sectors as concerns hours of work, stress and other conditions of work. The report did not cover adequately the efforts of the sector as concerns training, as it did not cover issues such as HIV/AIDS, the cost of labour in small and medium-sized enterprises, and the positive effects of globalization.
8. The representative of the Government of Austria commended the report even if the supporting statistics were not totally coherent. The sector was very important in Austria representing 6 per cent of GDP. The priority for Austria was to have high quality in order to be able to compete. The large majority of enterprises in the sector were small, employing four persons or less. Recognizing the importance of the sector, Austria had created a Secretariat of State for Tourism within the Ministry of Labour. There were many types of training institutions concerned with tourism but the sector still required more skilled workers in spite of the existence of unemployment in the country.
9. The representatives of the Governments of Greece and Turkey drew attention to the prevalence of informal business which existed in the sector. They felt that there was a link between the level of skills of workers and the fact that so many were in the informal sector. The representative of the Government of Turkey pointed out that, in his country, the HCT sector was at a peak, requiring, therefore, skilled personnel. Consequently, it was a matter of maintaining a balance between the personnel supply and the industry's demand. The HCT sector was more important than was specified in the statistics, as it could welcome informal work. He also referred to the increasing number of Turkish citizens going abroad.
10. The representative of the Government of India stated that tourism would continue to grow. Destinations were going to be more diverse and tourists were becoming more quality conscious. With liberalization of trade, competition was more open and it was important to provide quality services. Therefore human resource development (HRD) strategies were becoming crucial in attaining the required quality. Training institutions and curricula should respond to these needs. He suggested that exchanges between countries should be encouraged, including in management technology, training in general and language skills. HRD and capacity-building programmes should be supported by international financial institutions. He highlighted current developments in cross-border movement of natural persons and the role that India could play in the cross-border supply of IT-based tourism services. India also had a potential for exporting expertise in the HCT sector. He mentioned that India had a strong human resource development infrastructure which made it possible to be both a provider of information technology and hotel and catering personnel. He added that tourism was the third foreign exchange earner for India with direct employment exceeding 8 million and total employment around 18 million. The Government of India was therefore attaching great importance to HRD as well as to the protection of workers' rights and the improvement of working conditions in this sector.
11. The representative of the Government of China stressed the tremendous growth of the sector in his country during the last 20 years. Tourism represented 5 per cent of GDP and more than 5 million jobs. Measures had been taken to increase investment in training, there

---

were qualifying examinations for managers and guides, more than 800 colleges and other training institutions had been established throughout the country and multidimensional training had been introduced. Future efforts would intensify the training of managers, increasing the number of trainees, and integrate the development of the western part of China through efforts in tourism. His Government would continue its efforts to improve management programmes and collective bargaining. He believed this Meeting would allow exchange of experience on all these issues since the successful experience of other countries could be useful in the HCT sector of his country.

- 12.** The representative of the Government of Brazil made a statement to correct some of the information contained in the Office report about Brazil. He quoted recent surveys carried out on employment in the tourism sector putting total employment at more than 4.4 million jobs, nearly twice as many as quoted by the Office report.
- 13.** A representative of the Government of Egypt declared that tourism was a most important source of income for his country. She cited the different types of tourism: historic Pharaonic/Coptic traditions, sea-based tourism, including diving, and conference tourism. A major source of employment, tourism was short of qualified personnel – an observation not only applicable to Egypt. Training facilities had been set up and modern technology was being used. She believed that improvements could come from constructive exchanges with all parties involved on the relevant issues, including the role of women in the sector. She mentioned that one way of dealing with the effects of globalization would be to have training courses for persons entering the industry paid for from a social fund for development, to which the employers contributed financially.
- 14.** The representative of the World Federation of Agriculture and Food Workers (WFAFW) held the view that the Office report was only interesting for rich countries and gave virtually no information concerning the hotel and tourism industry in poor countries. Air transport, human resources development and social dialogue were discussed solely with reference to the developed countries. The speaker expressed the opinion that such a report should be universal in coverage. To all appearances, the representatives of the poor countries were just sitting on the benches to hear the views of the rich countries. No opinions of the poor countries had been collected. Furthermore, it had to be remembered that the rich countries received money in hard currency, therefore placing an obstacle to the progress of workers in developing countries. Tips were administered by employers, so workers did not receive what was legally theirs.
- 15.** A Worker representative of the International Union of Food, Agricultural, Hotel, Restaurant, Catering, Tobacco and Allied Workers' Associations (IUF) expressed the view that the timing of the Meeting was appropriate in terms of the need for the social partners to confront their views on future activities for the industry. Already in 1989, it had been underlined that, in the absence of skills, the market mechanism alone could not adequately respond to the need for skilled workers. In order to work in any kind of fast-food enterprise, a worker needed to be available to work at all hours, at peak time, to possess skills in human relations, accept low wages and enjoy limited career prospects. The trade unions recognized that some of these difficulties were inherent to the very nature of the industry. Therefore recognition and compensation should be given to the workers in the sector by ensuring minimum standards as provided for in the ILO Working Conditions (Hotels and Restaurants) Convention, 1991 (No. 172). It was therefore essential that the Meeting examined what progress had been made in the ratification of that Convention. Similarly, the Meeting should reach an agreement on the action to be taken to redress conditions in the industry. In the light of the high turnover of young workers in the sector, policies needed to be formulated to underscore the value and quality of jobs in the sector as well as best practices. Focus needed to be placed on job stability, wages, training and career development. The question of sustainable tourism also needed to be considered in

---

the light of the United Nations policies on environment and linkages between tourists and the host population. It was convenient to underline the importance of the application of ILO Conventions Nos. 87 and 98 concerning freedom of association and the right to collective bargaining, which formed the basis for dialogue between trade unions and employers, and to insist on the need for a sincere social agreement based on mutual recognition and respect.

## Point-by-point discussion

### Globalization

16. The Workers' spokesperson observed that it was necessary to move a step further in discussing globalization in terms of sustainable tourism. The industry had to find ways to arrest excessive disregard for the environment. At the same time it had to recognize that the process of globalization and its network of economic structures served to strengthen the transnational companies which in turn were pushing out the small enterprises. Those companies needed to recognize the rights of the host population and of workers. Furthermore, it was a question of respect for social policy: companies were not to use globalization to justify or invoke cuts in costs in other countries with regard to labour or training. The speaker stressed that companies had a responsibility to invest in training to ensure that its workers' potential was fully utilized.
17. Similarly, the process of globalization was no excuse to exploit child labour. On the contrary, alternatives such as schooling and training had to be found for working children. In this regard, the Code of Practice of the World Tourism Organization represented a first step. Measures needed to be adopted to ensure that tourism was practised within a framework of ethical principles such as a code of conduct which would be monitored and implemented. Such a code would involve all actors with the trade unions as representatives of the workers. The local population should be empowered to take part in tourism. The Chinese, for example, should be involved in tourism in large numbers, but that meant purchasing power and leisure, and at the present juncture many workers had to have two jobs in order to ensure the survival of their families.
18. The Workers' spokesperson added that both developed and developing countries needed to define their own policies on tourism. For the time being, transnational corporations were not applying sustainable development policies, but a common attitude and approach was necessary to develop and implement such policies. He referred to the loss of jobs which resulted from new forms of access to tourism such as the Internet. The pros and cons needed to be weighed but at the same time the clock could not be turned back. Measures should also be adopted to set in place the necessary infrastructure to guard against distortion of competition and to afford everyone a chance to win markets. The responsibility for infrastructure lay with the State which should mobilize all the parties involved to this end.
19. The Employers' spokesperson did not consider the idea of linking the globalization process to sustainable development as a new one. In his view, there had been awareness of such a link for a long time, but tourism had been growing with the progress of globalization. The question remained as to whether or not two types of globalization were at work: one for developed countries and another for lesser developed countries. The speaker wondered whether globalization did not have a different value depending on whether the process occurred in the developed world or in the developing world. A lot had been said about the role of multinational enterprises, but it should not be forgotten that governments also had a major responsibility in terms of developing infrastructure and the transport network.

---

Partnerships could be developed between the private and public sectors and the speaker hoped that a dialogue could take place on such topics during the Meeting.

- 20.** The Employers' spokesperson also held the view that it was necessary to have rules and regulations in certain fields, for example health and safety. Too many rules and regulations, however, merely served to impede competition. It was necessary to arrive at positive results in the industry as well as ensure reasonable returns on investments, both human and financial. Undoubtedly, a fair share needed to be allocated to human resources, but rigid regulations with regard to social taxation could hardly help matters. Nevertheless, it was important to consider whether globalization did mean something different for different parts of the world in terms of sustainable tourism.
- 21.** The representative of the Government of Portugal recognized the importance of the industry, especially in Portugal. Not only was the number of foreign tourists on the upswing as well as receipts, but outgoing tourists as well. She referred to the work of the European Commission which bore testimony to the important role which further skills training had played in speeding up the modernization of the European tourist industry. Such modernization in turn promoted growth and increased employment. The focus of the industry in Portugal had largely been on sustainability and creativity, improvement of skills and human resources. A six-year training programme had been launched with a threefold objective: to modernize the organization of work; increase skills; and develop infrastructure. A National Institute for Training, where the different professional training courses of different qualification levels are being developed, is enhancing its training capacity through the establishment of new hotel schools. A technical support programme for small and medium-sized enterprises and continuing training has also been created. The speaker expressed the view that since the challenges of globalization were many, local, national and international structures needed to be reinforced in terms of culture, environmental awareness, education, transport and agriculture. Similarly, the image of the tourist industry needed to be enhanced, a system of certification of competence developed and partnerships established with public and private institutions.
- 22.** A Worker member (Russian Federation) regretted the report had no mention of countries in transition. Economic reform in the Russian Federation and globalization had led to the arrival of multinational enterprises, increased investment inflows, introduction of new technology and an increase in employment. However, investments tended to be concentrated in large urban centres, such as Moscow and St. Petersburg, and regions were increasingly marginalized. In addition, globalization did not always improve the workers' lot. She noted the example of McDonald's which had initially brought good working conditions, but whose most important consideration had lately become the profit factor. Although a collective agreement was under negotiation, the company was doing everything it could to counteract its workers' efforts at organizing into a trade union or to be influenced by trade unions. McDonald's workers had made representations to both the authorities and international trade unions to pressure the company to desist from this practice. She was of the view that multinational corporations should behave more responsibly in their host countries, including recognizing the fact that local small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) also needed to exist and develop; greater competition from multinationals risked closing SMEs and lead to great unemployment.
- 23.** The representative to the Government of China agreed that globalization had greatly affected tourism in many ways, creating and promoting increased employment. He noted, however, that, as highlighted by the Office report, for various reasons most benefits accrued to Europe and the Americas with developing countries deriving the least. He hoped the different parties would address the problems and take action to solve the problems. There was a need for comprehensive involvement, with governments at the central, regional and community levels, establishing appropriate laws and regulations to

---

encourage the sector's development based on flexible measures, and increased inputs, e.g. infrastructure investment by both governments and companies. Assistance from international organizations and developed countries on marketing information, human resource development, funding, etc., were also most important, as was assistance from international organizations.

- 24.** A Worker member (Egypt) stated that globalization had created an unprecedented situation over the preceding two decades, with multinational enterprises adopting a hostile attitude to social protection, social security and equality of opportunity. There had been an increase in violation of international labour standards, and a growing tendency to transfer operations from countries with good labour legislation to those without one. Tourism was vital to many economies and an attractive target for multinationals' investment. He noted a trend, however, for transnational enterprises to employ only a small number of permanent workers supplemented by greater numbers of part-time and temporary workers. This resulted in increased job insecurity and indifference to training, encouraged disregard for adequate working conditions and caused a decline in wages. Traditionally, tourism was vital to Egypt and the country had adopted training programmes for the sector, which it would like to reinforce. Obstacles to improved human resource development included inefficient training institutions for employees of small and medium-sized tourism enterprises and multinational enterprises' lack of interest to invest in training. There was a need for the social partners to work with the WTO and other partners on programmes conducive to investments in human resources. Globalization also called for greater trade union solidarity to ensure it was accompanied by greater respect for workers' rights and the environment.
- 25.** The representative of the Government of Kenya noted that globalization was a historical process resulting from human innovation and technological progress, and referred to the increasing integration of economies around the world. The challenge was to ensure that globalization benefited all and harmed none. Tourism was emerging as the single most important industry in the new millennium, a leader in the use of the world's natural resources, employment generation, as well as in waste generation and environmental pollution. Human resource implications of globalization for the industry needed to be critically examined on a global level, to ensure that policy-makers, trainers, administrators, regulators and practitioners understand and are prepared to face the responsibilities imposed by the new world order. The fundamental strategy was for the industry to "globalize" itself in terms of human resources development, employment and flow of technology, knowledge and information by integrating education and training for the sector worldwide. It would include networking amongst training institutions and international development agencies to enable international exchange of students and trainers. It would require deliberate investment in human resources development through increased spending on education and training, modularization and standardization of curricula, establishment of a "global" institutional framework to facilitate exchanges, liberalization of rules on issuance of student passes, liberalization of regulations for work permits and sharing of research information and data. Assistance to developing countries should include training to work with the technologies and systems ushered in by globalization, and support from industrialized countries to poorer countries to surmount the closely interrelated problems of poverty and disease. International institutions, such as the IMF and the World Bank, should be prevailed upon to assist developing countries to enhance their capacities in tourism as one of the avenues to poverty reduction.
- 26.** The representative of the Government of Austria considered the theme of sustainability and the protection of the natural environment as particularly important. However, tourism could also be developed within the agriculture sector. In Austria, a national tourist strategy, Concept 2000, had been developed as a federal draft and was intended to provide guidance. Austria was aware that with the onset of globalization the tourist industry was no

---

longer confined to the domestic market. International availability of the media meant that customers could better measure what was on offer, such as adventure or communication with other tourists through events and festivals. The current trend might well last for many years until there was a new one. On-line technology should be put to use since e-commerce was more important to the tourist industry than to any other. She added that Austria was in the process of setting up an electronic interface for bookings and reservation platforms. Its ultimate aim was to make it possible to make bookings from anywhere in the world. At the same time tourism interest groups were being constituted in the different regions in an attempt to make joint offers and launch awareness-raising campaigns. Public and private sector partnerships were involved in this effort. Austria is participating in the Tourist Satellite Accounts.

- 27.** A Worker member (Barbados) expressed the view that bigger countries were taking advantage of smaller countries. In Barbados, for example, where agriculture had been an important economic activity, hotels were importing agricultural products at cheaper prices than those in the domestic market. Not only was the agricultural sector under severe pressure, but the land itself was being purchased at high prices by foreign investors and transformed into golf courses which posed a threat to the natural environment. A resolution was needed to deal with the problems of the smaller countries.
- 28.** A representative of the Government of Egypt recognized that, in the global village created by technological development, tourism in her country was a major source of income. Owing to increased competition, the Government of Egypt had encouraged entrepreneurs to invest further and had privatized hotels by selling them to investors but with the guarantee that workers' acquired rights would be preserved. Holiday villages had been developed along the Mediterranean and the Red Sea coasts to encourage visitors; others had been enlarged and services improved. Internet and electronic services had been introduced into tourist enterprises to take advantage of globalization and liberalization of foreign currency exchange rates. Private banks had also been allowed to act more freely. She strongly suggested that countries needed to give high priority to training at all levels in order to keep pace with changes. In this respect, entrepreneurs and business people had a role to play. A national training fund could be set up. The ILO could play an important role in providing training, both in the areas of health and safety and collective bargaining to ensure that workers' rights were observed and protected. Although legislation might be in place, labour inspection would ensure compliance with the law. The speaker added that, although globalization had increased competition, the State needed to protect what it had already built. For example, television could be used to appeal to the masses. The development of the tourist industry was particularly important in the mass economy. It was also important for the host population not to exploit tourists who needed good memories of their sojourn in order to convey a good image of the country.
- 29.** A Worker member (Brazil) expressed the opinion that, while the globalization process could not be reversed, globalization itself was changing labour relations. The tourist industry in Brazil was aspiring to be more competitive in order to increase profits for governments and employers, but the workers must also be remembered since they could not work in isolation if they were to be providers of high-quality service. For this purpose, good infrastructure was needed as well as training to ensure properly qualified staff. The workers must feel that their services were of benefit to the community as a whole. The speaker urged the ILO to promote exchanges of information among all countries in order to enhance competition and take advantage of the process of globalization.
- 30.** The representative of the Government of the Philippines declared that, in order to reap the benefits of globalization, her country was active on four fronts: optimizing economic growth by inciting local government units and communities to maintain tourist sites in their localities; enhancing social cohesion, cultural preservation, partnership among the

---

stakeholders, and gender-sensitive policies; promoting ecotourism not only to protect indigenous resources but to provide employment opportunities for local communities; and developing diversity in terms of destinations, attractions and markets. The speaker asked that it be noted that child sex tourism did not feature among the said attractions despite the fact that the Office report had made reference to the Philippines in that regard. She drew attention to four areas where the Philippines had embarked on human resources development and employment promotion: the Comprehensive Employment Strategy Programme (CESP) which aimed at mobilizing the various sectors of society in a concerted effort to provide quality jobs for all; the Public Employment Service Offices (PESOs) which had set up jointly with the Department of Interior and Local Government an employment information databank; the Tulay 2000 Programme which provided training and employment programmes designed to assist in integrating persons with disabilities into the mainstream; and the Department of Labor and Employment which was promoting self-employment as a viable option for the unemployed and the underemployed as well as one-stop information and referral centres.

- 31.** A Worker member (Zambia) informed the Meeting that tourism in Zambia had largely been controlled by the Government in the past, which had decided to privatize the sector. That step had resulted in significant job losses. Currently, the Government was providing multinational companies (MNCs) with incentives such as tax holidays. However, the Zambian investment centre was also advertising cheap labour in order to attract MNCs who were anxious to make profits. The industry needed to focus on the improvement of quality as well as the transfer of technology to enhance productivity among workers. While technology transfer was necessary, a fairer balance needed to be found between the positions held by foreigners and those held by Zambians in terms of job status. Workers needed to be sensitized to the need to develop international networks. It was important to attract investors but the improvement of infrastructure was vital to the tourist economy. Certain investors merely renovated a few structures but a more thorough overhaul was needed. In terms of training, it was necessary to upgrade management staff to international standards and to introduce modern communication equipment.
- 32.** The representative of the Government of the Dominican Republic drew attention to the major contribution of the tourist industry to the country's economy, equivalent to 30 per cent of foreign currency earnings as documented by the Tourism Satellite Accounts. Furthermore, the agriculture sector had never been so thriving as it was since tourism had picked up momentum. The workers now earned better wages whereas they had formerly been dependent only on sugar and coffee production. Although the Office report was focused, the speaker would have welcomed an evaluation of the structure of the tourist market where there were problems of competition between each segment. For instance, flexibility was being practised among tour operators but at a very high cost: the cost of accommodation in major hotel complexes had dropped as low as \$19 per person per night, all inclusive. Therefore, income derived per tourist was dropping with a negative impact on wages. He noted that the Office report provided an innovative analysis of the possibilities which the Internet offered to tourists to overcome dependency on tour operators. In Europe, 60 per cent of all bookings were made through tour operators who controlled the whole value-added chain. In the United States, however, 60 per cent of trips were booked through travel agents. So the United States would rank first in this system of computing and France, where tour operators were more powerful, would rank third. It was important to discuss in detail the set-up of the job market.
- 33.** The representative of the Government of Italy was of the opinion that globalization forced countries to adopt new strategies. It was necessary to adopt the appropriate strategies, especially at a communication level, in order to face the great international demand, which explained the considerable importance that the new information technologies (Internet) had acquired in this field. The situation was particularly difficult for small-sized enterprises

---

(usually family enterprises), which needed to adopt measures to bridge the gap between the great international demand and their limited supply. The problems faced by these enterprises were, particularly, their relative isolation and lack of access to the established networks. Globalization imposed on them two requirements: firstly, to leave behind the traditional system, since the lack of means prevented them from visualizing effectively the international market and fulfil its demand; secondly, to launch into the market tourist products which were unique and non-reproducible, taking into consideration the specialization of each tourist system (e.g. gastronomic, cultural or thermal). These two requirements were channelled through several processes, in order to fulfil the competition while attaining the reinforcement of the small-sized enterprises. These processes included horizontal groupings (very frequent in Italy in the promotion field), vertical integration and links with the basic industry. On the other hand, regarding the measures to be adopted in the developing countries, there should be a transfer of skills from the developed countries, whose tourist demand is wider and more settled, to the developing countries, in order to help them improve their situation.

## **Employment creation and working conditions**

- 34.** The Employers' spokesperson stated that not all the issues raised in this section were relevant and some of them were not easy to fully comprehend. In addition, some of them could be read in different ways. In his view, the main barrier to employment, especially in SMEs, was the importance of social costs. In most countries, these were between 30 and 50 per cent of the direct wages. Lower social costs would be an incentive to job creation. Turning to the issue of subcontracting, he felt that the employers present at this Meeting could not adequately represent subcontractors and could not negotiate on their behalf. Their relationship with subcontractors was a business relationship and he felt that comments on this issue would not be appropriate. As for seasonal, casual and on-call employment and corresponding conditions of work, he stated that the concept of seasonal demand for services in the tourism sector could not be changed. The industry needed to call on casual staff when required such as to replace absent workers. He did not fully understand the term "on-call". However, if it referred to part-time work, he felt that this provided useful income to persons who only wanted a few hours work and not a full-time fixed job. Commenting on the low level of ratification of Convention No. 172, he reiterated the Employers' position that this instrument was not a good document and was not so relevant to the industry. He felt that the Governments should comment further on this as it was their responsibility to consider the ratification of ILO instruments.
- 35.** The Employer members from New Zealand, Trinidad and Tobago and Pakistan addressed the issue of enhancement of employment for women in the sector. There was equal opportunity for women in the tourism industry in New Zealand. However, each country should deal with this issue according to its own legislation. Equal opportunity should be encouraged but practice could vary from country to country. In Trinidad and Tobago, there was increasingly equal opportunity for women but it was necessary to impose equal treatment for all workers. In many instances pay was not equal for equal work. In Pakistan, the majority of senior positions in the industry are occupied by men while the greater number of women had low-level, middle-management and secretarial jobs.
- 36.** The Workers' spokesperson found that all the questions were relevant and that it was in the common interest to discuss them. He felt that although SMEs, because of their size, could react quickly to changes in the nature of demand, the degree and speed of change posed a problem as it became difficult to make long-term plans. He also felt that companies operating under a franchise did not always respect the requirements of the brands they represent, particularly when it came to conditions of work. Franchise management companies should pay more attention to the terms of employment of workers. He also felt that SMEs should be encouraged to open themselves to workers' participation in the

---

business. However, too many of them were in the informal sector. In this context, the Workers supported the Job Creation in Small and Medium-Sized Enterprises Recommendation, 1998 (No. 189). He suggested that, in order to give more flexibility to employers, part-time jobs in different small enterprises could be grouped into full-time jobs. He felt the SMEs should be able to compete on the same terms if they all complied with the same relevant social and labour legislation.

- 37.** The Workers' spokesperson, referring to the question of subcontracting or outsourcing, stated that the terms of such contracts should comply with the Working Conditions (Hotels and Restaurants) Convention, 1991 (No. 172), and that they should be negotiated with the relevant unions. Subcontracting should not permit employers to escape sectoral regulations or legislation. Any measures for a sector should apply to all, including subcontractors. As for seasonal, casual and on-call work, the Workers agreed that the nature of the industry could not be changed, but they felt that ways should be considered to make employment more permanent even for casual and seasonal workers. Labour deployment plans could be adopted for seasonal employees to encourage year-round employment. Seasonal work should not eliminate full-time jobs and seasonal workers should have the same conditions of work as other workers. The Workers suggested that studies should be made at national level of the situation of seasonal migrant workers. Based on these studies, seasonal work should be regulated, with the promotion of more sustained employment patterns being promoted, and training, as well as other protection, provided to seasonal workers, as afforded to other workers.
- 38.** The Workers' spokesperson then discussed the employment of women. Women should be able to reconcile family responsibilities and work according to the special patterns of the sector. Sometimes it was impossible for a woman to take a particular job because of the absence of appropriate public transport. The breaking of the day's work into several periods forced the woman worker to be absent from home for too long. There should be facilities, including training, for women to enter or re-enter the sector at an appropriate level after having raised a family. The Workers considered that attention should be given to preserving the dignity of women in the sector. He cited the requirement to wear revealing clothes which could encourage customers and colleagues to engage in sexual harassment. This should be severely repressed. The rights to maternity leave should be fully respected. He also believed that women should be able to stay home on pay to look after their sick children. As for the status of Convention No. 172, he reminded the Meeting that the member States of the ILO had voted for the adoption of the Convention and he would have liked to know of the obstacles to ratification.
- 39.** The representative of the Government of the Dominican Republic stated that vertical integration was gradually pushing out small and medium-sized enterprises from the sector with negative consequences for employment. However, these difficulties could be overcome and small and medium-sized enterprises could ensure long-term viability through such strategies as joint brand marketing, computerized reservation networks, and standardization of services, which were under consideration in his country. Vertical integration was similarly undermining subcontracting possibilities in so far as independent operators were being absorbed by bigger companies. Seasonal employment, which also existed in the Dominican Republic, resulted from the impossibility of reliably forecasting demand, with its unpredictable plateaus and troughs. He agreed with the representative of the Government of Trinidad and Tobago as well as the Employers on the need to accelerate women's access to equal employment opportunities and equal pay for equal work in the sector. His country was not only one of the 11 which had ratified the Working Conditions (Hotels and Restaurants) Convention, 1991 (No. 172), but was also one of 25 countries to have ratified the eight fundamental labour Conventions. Nevertheless, contradictions sometimes arose between international commitments and provisions of both joint ventures

---

and franchising. He hoped the ILO would examine such contradictions and help overcome the problem through the provision of better guidance to member States.

40. A Worker member (Côte d'Ivoire) indicated that sectoral education and training was needed to make headway in universities in Africa. Non-governmental organizations were supporting African human resource development through provision of assistance to train Africans in developed countries, but further scholarships would be welcomed. Promotion of small and medium-sized enterprises should include extension of interest-free loans; technical cooperation between developed and developing countries would also be appreciated, including enhanced contacts between labour officials. Because fixed-term contracts predominated and workers' acquired rights were increasingly not respected. Trade unions were fighting to ensure that, after two years' continuous employment, workers should be granted permanent contracts. Unfortunately, as the example of the Côte d'Ivoire illustrated, since 1990, globalization had made such a goal more difficult to achieve, even though staff turnover was much lower than in developed countries. The development of strong trade unions would provide employers with reliable interlocutors and ensure respect for minimum labour standards. With regard to women, who comprised half the country's population, a number of factors perpetuated their situation: males tended to get preference in education and there was as a result few women in decision-making. It was also difficult to obtain justice on the issue of sexual harassment. Women workers invariably got the blame no matter that the problem arose from the customer or the employer.
41. Another Worker member (Barbados) disagreed with the Employers' continuous reference to high labour costs depressing investment in the sector since it was labour that invariably made profits possible. The sector did indeed resort to seasonal labour in his country, but seasonal workers were entitled to both know whether they would be employed the next season and to sick leave just as any other employee. Training should be integrated in human resource development programmes to provide workers with portable skills. The practice whereby some employers required women workers to wear skimpy clothes as a means of attracting customers contributed to sexual harassment and should be prohibited.
42. The Employers' spokesperson concurred with the Workers that small and medium-sized enterprises were key to diversifying services to customers in the sector. He had misgivings, however, concerning "patchwork" arrangements. Apart from considerations of regional specificities, hotel and restaurant owners were often individualistic people and preferred not to share their workers. In addition, such arrangements were often impossible since companies frequently needed to serve clients at the same time. Franchising, which went under different names and might include management contracts, was a useful tool in the industry and could be an excellent way for small and medium-sized enterprises to develop their businesses. He agreed with the Government representative of the Dominican Republic that the Internet also enabled them to compete with bigger companies, although it had to be utilized properly to extract the full benefits. A particular feature of small and medium-sized enterprises is that it required workers to be multi-skilled although workers disliked the obligation to be polyvalent. The industry was faced with a shortage of skilled labour, and there was a need to facilitate workers' reintegration through appropriate training. Governments, not only employers, should contribute towards this goal.
43. Employers' concerns with high labour costs did not refer to salaries and wages, but rather to overall labour costs. In discussing outsourcing, it was important to be clear as to what it meant. It was much better that a restaurant in a hotel was run by a catering company rather than by the hotel itself. The same applied with regard to maintenance or electrical work; employers considered outsourcing better than the hiring of full-time electricians or cleaners. The issue of migrant workers in the sector could not be discussed without reliable statistics, which were lacking. Flexible work arrangements were crucial if companies were

---

to satisfy customer needs, while the problems related to the international mobility of workers were due to restrictions imposed by governments, such as visa quotas for nationals of given countries. The issue needed to be examined further. He considered the problem of sexual harassment to be exaggerated. It was excessive to believe that all customers were on the prowl and that employers would require workers to wear clothes which invited harassment. He believed that on the real substantive issues, such as hours of work, there had been improvements over the previous 15 years to accommodate women's need to balance work with family responsibilities.

44. The Workers' spokesperson considered the employers' and workers' positions not far removed. Restaurant owners did indeed take a dim view of sharing workers. The workers only concern was that there would be no problem if they had decent incomes, but the "patchwork" approach was still viable if companies' need for workers at the same time could be resolved. Trade unions were concerned that the broad range of core services, such as cleaning, that used to be provided internally were increasingly outsourced to save money. The trend to outsource, despite its employment consequences, had acquired basic philosophical reality as a means of cost-cutting among the industry's multinational enterprises. The problem of sexual harassment and the role played in this by dress requirements was serious and not to be taken as light-heartedly as the Employers seemed to take it. Women, especially young women, were often required to wear certain types of clothes to obtain specific job positions, and there was ample evidence many women did not like this.
45. A Worker member (France) observed that certain issues referred to so far were not exclusive to the hotel and tourist industry. In the service industry, the weight of the wage bills on the turnover was more important than in other industries. Work relations were different. These relationships had been clear in the past, but now an entire plethora of possible combinations had led to complex triangular situations involving contract labour and other intermediate structures. The real difficulty in this multifaceted situation was how to guarantee equal work for equal pay. Legal conditions and franchises varied from place to place. So it was difficult to arrive at simple comparisons of working conditions. Furthermore, equal skills did not necessarily mean equal salaries. It was not surprising, therefore, that potential newcomers to the sector could not acquire a clear understanding of the sector or of the career prospects it offered. This explained why young workers were turning to other sectors. He added that certain features of the sector also applied to other sectors, e.g. night work and weekend work, but the recruitment problem was not of the same nature. Workers enjoyed compensation for such conditions of work in other sectors. So the difficult conditions referred to did not wholly explain the unattractiveness of the sector. Young people had learnt that they had a choice and they chose conditions adapted to their personal lives. The experience of France had shown that the sector became more attractive if the working hours were cut to a 35-hour week. Even workers and employers in fast-food outlets and catering in canteens had agreed to a 35-hour week. So the sector had understood that it needed to keep its workers and ensure a certain critical mass. No one could deny workers social protection when sufficient resources were available, so there was no need to cut expenditure of social protection. The question was how to make the sector more attractive in order to recruit new workers and to keep them.
46. The representative of the Government of the Philippines declared that with respect to contract labour and the emergence of new forms of work, the Government had clarified the permissible and prohibited work arrangements so as to ensure that minimum working and employment standards were applied. The Philippine Plan for Gender-Responsive Development was intended to enhance women's employment in the hotel, tourism and catering sector by introducing six measures: strengthening women's participation; shifting to ecotourism and family-oriented activities; cancelling the accreditation certificates/business permits of tourism establishments found to be engaging in sex tourism

---

or other related activities; promoting women's access to jobs in the sector, ensuring equal opportunities for women and men; and strengthening linkages between the public and private sectors in order to address gender/women issues in the tourism industry. With respect to ratification of the Working Conditions (Hotels and Restaurants) Convention, 1991 (No. 172), certain specific issues needed to be clarified, in particular definitions of "similar" establishments (see Article 1), "workers concerned" (see Article 2) and "sale and purchase of employment".

- 47.** A representative of the Government of Egypt expressed the opinion that all matters pertaining to the sector should be resolved via social dialogue and collective bargaining. SMEs, for example, offered many services but only employed low-skilled workers. The same legislation should apply to contract workers as to other workers. Seasonal and casual jobs afforded survival possibilities to students, wives, disabled persons, and while such jobs were acceptable in the short term, they did not afford a guarantee of income. Therefore labour inspection was of the utmost importance in this sector to guarantee social protection for this vulnerable and marginalized category of workers whose rights should be recognized. Women workers needed to have a say in decision-making, and their conditions of work should not be determined through individual bargaining but through collective bargaining. In addition, women and women's psychology were needed in this sector to help it develop. The poor ratification record of the ILO Working Conditions (Hotels and Restaurants) Convention, 1991 (No. 172) could be due to its provisions being more in line with conditions in developed countries. When new measures are placed on the agenda of the International Labour Conference, more countries would be able to ratify the new Conventions after a broader dialogue with the social partners.
- 48.** The representative of the Government of Brazil held the view that the skilling of workers was important in the tourism sector. The Office report referred to a subsidized training programme in the United Kingdom which was essential to the viability of SMEs which did not enjoy the same conditions as the big chains. Brazil was running a similar programme with public funding. Such subsidized programmes were useful for governments to enable workers to improve their skills. Vacation programmes were another way to provide training for workers.
- 49.** The representative of the Government of Spain placed emphasis on the need for health and safety measures for workers. The sector was already more complex as a result of subcontracting and temporary work arrangements. Workers were at higher risk in terms of muscular problems, workload, handling of dangerous substances, inadequate ventilation and exposure to insecticides. The sector should adopt measures to ensure that the best health and safety conditions prevailed. The Department of Labour and Social Security had developed guidelines for developing accident prevention policies.
- 50.** The Worker spokesperson referred to the added expenditures invoked by the Employers' group as an impediment to the prosperity of the sector. However, government measures such as taxes, social security and pensions merely meant social transfers. He understood that the question being discussed was how could secure and sustainable work be created in the sector for more people to find it attractive. Any worker would find that the sector offered exciting opportunities assuming that working conditions were reasonable. The speaker proposed that the Employers' group could adopt the same stand in spite of other differences of opinion. For instance, according to the Office report, child labour constituted 10 to 15 per cent of the sector, detracting from the social prestige of the sector. Not only were working children preventing adults from finding jobs in the sector but the 1989 tripartite meeting had produced clear guidelines about what conditions should prevail in the sector. He added, however, that since 1989 different structural developments had taken place which had led to an unattractive image of the sector. New recruits did not see long-term employment prospects in the sector. In addition, not only should cost-free training be

---

provided to new workers, but experienced workers should be similarly trained, respected, and should participate in decision-making structures. The entire workforce should be involved in the economic success of the sector.

- 51.** The Worker spokesperson further stated that the social aspects of jobs in the sector needed to be taken into account: dealing with people, providing personally oriented services, handling conflict. The sector must react by providing appropriate training and equal opportunities for women and men. Trade unions and employers could together enhance the image of the sector. It was in the interest of MNCs to ensure that the training and skills they provided could be transferred to other areas, since training was part and parcel of better productivity and motivated workers. Social security wages should be adapted to the cost of living. Regional conditions also had to be taken into account in terms of personal development within the company. Unless the foregoing factors were applied as general policy, the sector would fail to develop its potential. Tips did not constitute wages: a true wage must be paid. The ILO Human Resources Development Convention, 1975 (No. 142), needed to be ratified and the Collective Bargaining Convention, 1981 (No. 154), should be negotiated to ensure vocational training prospects. It was important that all workers enjoyed the same training opportunities. It would be useful in the course of the meeting if examples of national training models could be provided. Prospects for creating jobs also needed to be examined, since there were major differences between MNCs and SMEs in terms of recognition of skills. The meeting should also give rise to exchanges on the different social conditions prevailing. He urged the ILO to conduct comparative studies on the development of the industry on an ongoing basis. He stressed that MNCs had a particular responsibility in developing countries, and that the ILO should collect best practices with regard to training. Information needed to be collected on what other countries were doing in terms of training and workers' access to jobs in the sector. The Worker spokesperson hoped that the group's suggestions would be taken into consideration.
- 52.** The Employer spokesperson recognized that there was a shortage of labour in many parts of the sector. However, he did not agree with the Workers' analysis of the reasons. He believed rather that the speed of the development of the sector, the resulting expansion of labour needs meant that there was difficulty in recruiting and training fast enough. Training programmes ought to be adapted to needs and to the new requirements of the industry. They needed to correspond to actual industry practices so that trainees did not get the impression that the training was obsolete. The success of tourism was a recognition of the contribution of all, and first of all of its workers. There was urgency in stopping the negative image which was wrongly given to the sector. Customers had a good opinion of the sector and this image could be cultivated if workers and employers worked together. He added that countries wanted to develop tourism because they needed the income and tourism had a positive impact on economies. The industry needed to resolve its image problems and its social partners needed to achieve more together.
- 53.** Turning to the question of working hours, the Employer spokesperson did not agree that cutting working hours would help recruitment. In France, some workers who worked 35 hours in one enterprise went to another to work more hours. The industry should rather consider giving jobs a better image with possibly many alternatives such as longer holidays so as to allow more time with the family. He referred to the efforts of other sectors to attract recruits through advertising campaigns. He suggested the establishment of a working party on this issue. He then dealt with the mobility of labour, stressing the difficulty for skilled people to move from one country to another. He believed that it should be possible to organize labour flows to suit the needs of industry. Consequential problems such as with housing, language, and human relations could be dealt with. As for training, it was necessary to introduce the concept of lifelong training so as to keep key skills up to date, to customer requirements and to make the best of evolving technology.

---

Training could be modular since only short periods of training were sometimes needed to upgrade the training of an individual to a higher level. The value of irrelevant theoretical training delivered by trainers who were out of touch with the industry was questioned. Short training coupled with on-the-job coaching was to be preferred. Above all, however, it was important to improve the image of the sector in order to be able to attract the right type of recruits.

- 54.** The Government representative of the Philippines declared that her country had institutionalized the Dual Training System, with enterprises and training institutions sharing the responsibility for the provision of skills and work ethics. Government agencies involved in technical education and skills development had been merged into the Technical Education and Skills Development Authority (TESDA). She suggested that the private sector should participate in skill development schemes, as well as trade skills certification and standardization.
- 55.** A Worker member from Cyprus informed the meeting of the training system in his country with special reference to the role of the Industrial Training Authority (ITA). He began with an overview of the evolution of that training system leading to the establishment of the ITA. He then described the objectives of the ITA and its role and activities which included all kinds of industrial training, from enterprise-based initial training to postgraduate diplomas. He also described all the different types of programmes proposed by the ITA. The establishment of the ITA and the implementation of its training strategy had enabled Cyprus to engage on a path which would improve its position in an extremely competitive world environment.
- 56.** The representative of the Government of Portugal reported that her country was developing an education and training strategy aimed at both young people and adults. For young people, it is desirable to stimulate the training demand through the following channels: a campaign to achieve an increase in value of the social image associated with the jobs in the industry, using information technologies (Internet); the diversification of the training supply, whether at a higher or secondary level, through different means, particularly the learning system with double certification (academic and professional). The system of qualifications' acknowledgement is being reinforced so that it covers the main professional profiles until 2002. In addition, a government-supported internship programme to allow young people to join and remain with enterprises was under development. A tripartite agreement to promote workers' continuing education guaranteed that at least 10 per cent of each company's workers benefited from government-supported vocational training programmes of at least 20 hours up to 2003 and up to 35 hours by 2006. Measures targeting small and medium-sized enterprises in the sector included government financial and technical support for entrepreneurial training for managers and other workers where experts have identified needs and prepared global training plans for specific companies. Training and other support measures had also been useful in upgrading the sector's image, encouraging equal opportunity for women, improving conditions of work and life, and reconciling family and work responsibilities.
- 57.** A Worker member (Ghana) noted globalization's transformation of the world economy including the stifling of developed countries' manufacturing by competition from industrialized countries. Given the fast-paced development of tourism, it was in the mutual interest of the tripartite partners to ensure human resource development for the sector in order to provide jobs for young people, and ensure availability of the skills to support employers' investments. The tripartite cooperation on human resources development for the sector in Ghana, in which government provided the site and both the employers and trade unions provided resource persons and trainers in a collaborative effort to enhance the quality of services in the sector on the basis of an agreed training model, was an example worth emulating.

- 
- 58.** The representative of the Government of Canada explained the sectoral partnerships initiatives implemented by his Government starting nine years previously as the key approach to dealing with the skills challenge in the industry. Effective partnerships involving business, labour and other stakeholders provided a shared understanding of labour market issues and challenges; facilitated sectoral capacity building; and influenced the learning system to respond in a timely manner to the needs of the world of work. On the basis of one such partnership created in 1993 in the hotel, catering and tourism sector, the Canadian Tourism Human Resource Council had successfully promoted and assisted in the development of sector-wide skills standards, training and learning tools, career awareness information and occupational recognition. The Council's Youth Internship programme facilitated young Canadians' transition from school to work. The "bottom-line" lesson from Canada's experience in the sector and some 70 other industries and/or occupations was that with genuine sector support and commitment the approach was highly effective.
  - 59.** The Employer spokesperson commended the efforts in some countries, such as Portugal, aimed at stimulating general interest in the sector and the upgrading of its image, but considered much more might accrue if efforts were deployed at a global level.
  - 60.** A Worker member (Dominican Republic) appealed to governments to contribute by ratifying the ILO's Working Conditions (Hotels and Restaurants) Convention, 1991 (No. 172). His country's success in human resource development for the sector and general improvements in working conditions was in no small measure due to the Dominican Republic's ratification of the instrument. Government legislation to give practical effect to the Convention and the establishment of a fund jointly administered by the social partners, which among other things awarded university fellowships to workers to upgrade their professional skills, had provided an impetus to improved interaction between them.
  - 61.** The representative of the Government of Austria considered the sector's primary concern to be the capacity to attract and retain staff, particularly those over 30 years of age who did not find the industry attractive. Austria had a good dual-system vocational training that included apprenticeships, aimed at facilitating full employment, encouraged transparency and cooperation between the social partners, and thus enhanced industrial relations.
  - 62.** The representative of the Government of India raised four issues. Firstly, workers could be attracted and retained in the sector if they were paid well. However, value needed to be added to the tourist product through training and motivation of workers. The tourist should not carry the value added cost, but information technology and cross-border inputs should be used to bring down costs. Secondly, qualifications must be uniform and standardized with emphasis on quality training, lifelong and on-the-job training. The worker must grow with the sector. Thirdly, the social partners and the ILO had crucial roles in ensuring that knowledge with regard to skills training was properly disseminated. For instance, the Government of India involved the private sector in the management of hotel management institutes and a national council of hotel management and catering technology. The private sector representatives sit on the board of governors. Uniform guidelines have been formulated in the teaching curriculum. When no adequate resources were available for human resources development, the Government needed to play a proactive role. For instance, India was in the process of setting up mobile training courses for the food crafts industry. The ILO could assist in developing such efforts and in promoting human resources development in developing countries. Fourthly, vocational training needed to be addressed within the hotel and tourism sector. The hotel industry utilized on-the-job training to a great extent and, while national legislation contained many acts pertinent to job security. Proactive approaches and clear definitions of the role and the goals of the HRD sector were necessary on the part of all stakeholders if the industry were to thrive.

- 
- 63.** The representative of the Government of Italy also emphasized the need for lifelong training for workers in the industry. The social partners must agree on ways to make skills and competencies globally recognized within a context of social dialogue at the global level.
- 64.** A representative of the Government of Egypt observed an anomaly in labour demand and supply. Hotel schools were producing large numbers of graduates with recognized diplomas and certificates, yet the shortage of personnel continued to be a problem. Obviously, there was a lack of coordination in matching training with needs. Training should be provided so that workers could enter the sector at management level. Such training, in addition to foreign language instruction, should also include computer literacy and should begin at the primary-school level. In Egypt, computer literacy was a first requirement for entry to the labour market. Employees could be kept in the sector if their need for lifelong training could be met, but employers should assume a part of the training costs.
- 65.** The same speaker drew attention to the importance of on-the-job training in Egypt. However, attracting workers to the sector meant paying them decent wages and showing respect for workers' rights in other areas such as social security, sickness, maternity and holidays. Similarly, workers posted to remote places must enjoy proper living conditions. The role of labour inspection could not be sufficiently stressed if workers' rights and employer responsibility were to be ensured. Admittedly, the problem of adequate funding to ensure labour inspection remained an obstacle in some countries, but the ILO's role was to mobilize its tripartite constituents and ensure that all were informed of their rights and obligations. The ILO Working Conditions (Hotels and Restaurants) Convention, 1991 (No. 172), needed to be ratified and applied. Similarly, it was important to maintain effective social dialogue at all stages in order to identify problems and find solutions.
- 66.** A Worker member (Australia) responded to the Employers' earlier reference to shortage of staff in the sector. Tables 1, 2, and 3 in Appendix 2 of the Office report showed clearly that workers in the hotel and tourism industry were not paid as well as those in other sectors. Although the sector was a glamorous and thriving one, workers were underpaid. Young persons were less attracted to the sector where they knew they would earn 20 per cent less than a bank teller or an office clerk, whose jobs were physically easier than that of a waiter, a room attendant or most other jobs in a hotel. In addition, such workers worked more social hours compared with workers in the hotel and tourism sector. A worker organized his or her life around the factors of wages, conditions of work and social working hours. Casual work in the sector accounted for 60 per cent of the workforce, but casual work did not mean a career. He added that workers in the sector were not treated with respect. Very little training was provided to them and no career paths were developed. Competition was welcome if it served the industry but it should not occur at the expense of workers. The sector's services should be sold at a correct price. Training for workers from developing countries was also important and the bigger chains should be acknowledged for the excellent training they were providing. However, the ILO should ensure a process which would allow international exchanges of ideas related to skills development. For instance, staff could be exchanged between countries. However, on occasion this is abused. For example, 15 workers had come from a developing country to Australia to work in the sector during the last Olympic Games, but they had been paid the same wages they were earning at home. This was not fair. The international implications of training should be taken into account when developing training strategies. In particular, such training should be structured and monitored.
- 67.** The representative of the Government of Greece noted that training meant money and time, with the result that employers tended to employ unskilled workers instead of hotel school graduates. Such a practice naturally had an impact on the quality of services

---

provided, therefore ways should be found to convince employers of the need to employ trained people. The criteria for certification also needed to be determined. It was essential that the problem of retaining employment be solved.

## **Social dialogue**

- 68.** The Employer spokesperson stated that even if social dialogue had improved in many countries, it was necessary to make further efforts to promote and implement the ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work and its Follow-up. Organizations of employers and workers should be free from undue political influence so as to engage freely in social dialogue. The latter needs to take place firstly at the level of the enterprise and then at national level. He felt that the social dialogue at regional and international level was less relevant because of differences between the situation in different countries. Disparities between countries are such that collective bargaining at the international level cannot be productive. Turning to sustainable tourism and employment, the Employer spokesperson expressed his support for more and better training. The sector had to find mechanisms to create jobs, to find personnel wherever they were, to train them and to bring them to jobs. Governments should live up to their responsibilities to provide or promote the provision of the necessary infrastructure including roads, airports and other transport, tourism-related facilities and services in the vicinity of hotels, as well as ensure security in tourist areas. He added that governments should be aware of the effects of mergers and acquisitions in the sector which resulted in the formation of large tour operators. Dependence on such large operators placed pressure on enterprises and therefore resulted in tight margins with corresponding effects on wages and salaries in the sector.
- 69.** The Worker spokesperson urged for the development of social dialogue through a series of basic principles. The social partners should accept that there are different orientations, be more open to the positions of the other side recognizing that social dialogue is a process involving time. Trade unions have a role to play since they are the recognized representatives of workers. The collective bargaining process on dialogue can only take place in a context of democracy and freedom. The unions involved should be therefore free unions which are the democratic representatives of workers. He then identified a number of issues which are detrimental to social dialogue and collective bargaining in the sector: child labour and the absence of freedom of association. He therefore supported the implementation of ILO Conventions Nos. 87, 98 and 135. The consultation of workers should be compulsory in major development decisions by enterprises since workers need to be involved to achieve high productivity. This was required at all levels including in transnational corporations where decisions could affect workers in several countries. He therefore argued in favour of the improvement of supranational social dialogue. He also urged for the ratification of the Collective Bargaining Convention, 1981 (No. 154), and the application of the Collective Bargaining Recommendation, 1981 (No. 163). In this regard, a compilation of good practices could be made by the Office to assist discussions between governments and the social partners.
- 70.** The Worker spokesperson strongly advocated that development programmes must be designed bearing in mind the interests of workers. He referred to past meetings which partly dealt with sustainable tourism and employment: e.g. the May 1997 ILO sectoral meeting and the United Nations conference on ecological tourism. He urged the application of relevant ILO Conventions, including Convention No. 182. The ILO, WTO and NGOs should cooperate to fight sex tourism and the exploitation of children. There cannot be sustainable development when consequences were negative for people. With tourism being so important for the economies of countries, there was a need to shift resources so that the objectives set by this Meeting are attained. Discussing these issues every five years was not enough. There should be structures for more frequent consultations with small groups to assess the developments in the sector and to analyse

---

best practices. Discussions at regional and supranational level could lead to common decisions in the common interest of employers and workers.

- 71.** The representative of the Government of the Philippines recalled some of the efforts made in her country's HCT sector on promoting tripartism, collective bargaining and consultations between stakeholders. One of the major achievements of social dialogue was the drafting of the policy framework anchored on the promotion of the tourism sector towards international competitiveness, sustainable growth and generation of quality employment. She referred to the legislative agenda which included the adoption of an Act for the designation of tourism development areas and another law to provide incentives for tourism projects. She added that the ILO could, together with the tripartite partners, contribute towards sustainable tourism through social dialogue to promote mutual understanding among nations.
- 72.** The representative of the Government of China reported that social dialogue in his country aimed at achieving two goals: economic development and protection of workers' benefits. A 1995 labour law had the protection of such benefits as its primary aim, and many regulations and policies focused on this objective especially in small and medium-sized enterprises. Government promoted democratic management, negotiation and collective bargaining and most enterprises engaged with representatives of workers to discuss the way in which enterprise growth, benefits and protection could be promoted.
- 73.** A Worker member (Fiji) noted that social dialogue had to be a democratic process, involving mutually respectful partners, aimed at development and nation building for employment creation, better wages and living standards. Social partners needed to recognize the critical role of democracy in social dialogue processes. Political instability was very devastating to the hotel, catering and tourism sector, as the case of Fiji amply demonstrated. Only with the existence of independent trade unions, rather than those hand-picked by the interim administration from other workers' organizations as workers' representatives to the process, and the respect of law and order, including respect for human and workers' rights, was it possible to have real social dialogue.
- 74.** The representative of the Government of Portugal underlined the important role of the social partners, including those from the sector, in the work of her country's Economic and Social Council. Within the Council's framework, two tripartite agreements had recently been signed by representatives of the sector's social partners, the first on conditions of work and occupational safety and health, and the second on employment policy, the labour market, education and training. Specific issues dealt with in the second agreement include quality and development of training, workers' qualifications and enterprise competitiveness. It also dealt with the expansion of the partners' role in the National Institute for Tourist Training, so that it could finally adopt a tripartite management model, as is the case in other industries. On the other hand, the social partners, within the established Social Consultation Committee, participated actively in the preparation and formulation of any labour legislation. Lastly, all the analysed industries are covered in the collective Conventions. During the last few years, the priority subjects of negotiation were the update of wages and working hours.
- 75.** A Worker member (Croatia) reported that since the establishment of a new non-dictatorial government, a multi-sectoral social dialogue bringing together the tripartite partners in an economic and social council to discuss her country's many economic problems had started. Among the issues discussed by representatives of the tripartite partners were those related to self-employment, working hours, labour law reform, restructuring, privatization, etc. An agreement, identifying each party's obligations in the social field, would soon be signed. The partners were satisfied with the level and content of the social dialogue process, which utilized both formal and informal channels and mechanisms.

- 
76. The representative of the Government of Italy highlighted the problem of child labour, which also existed in the tourism sector, in both developed and developing countries. The information in the Office report on this subject gave cause for alarm and a warning to the international community to continue to take measures to eliminate the practice of child labour in the tourism sector. Sex tourism involving minors was another major phenomenon that needed to be vigorously combated at both the national and international levels. The Government of Italy had ratified the Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182), and adopted very rigorous measures to combat prostitution and sex tourism involving children of both genders. A 1998 law stipulates severe penalties for tourism that sexually exploits minors in any form. Anyone who organizes this kind of tourism or advertises it faces imprisonment and companies found in breach of the law risk losing their operating licences. Tour operators to foreign destinations are required to highlight these provisions of Italian law in their catalogues, underlining the fact that they apply even when the crimes are committed abroad.
77. A Worker member (Russian Federation) considered constant social dialogue the basis of stable and prosperous enterprises, themselves a precondition for adequate levels of employment and decent working conditions. The Russian Federation had established a permanent commission within which problems in various sectors were examined and agreement sought. Agreement had indeed been reached in a number of areas, but the problem was linked to practical implementation. Government and employers did not always respect obligations they had agreed to on payments and working conditions. She expressed concern that a recently proposed labour code would in fact worsen working conditions even further, and trade unions had mobilized to ensure that there were improved provisions when the code was adopted in May 2001. She supported the Worker spokesperson's view that collective bargaining should first and foremost be at the level of the enterprise because that was the place where problems specific to a given workplace would be dealt with. However, trade unions in her country were having problems engaging with some employers, especially those of small and medium-sized enterprises who refused to negotiate or respect obligations. In some cases such employers refused to recognize the legitimate representatives of their workers, preferring instead to designate their own negotiating partners. The ILO needed to look at the possibility of establishing some sort of a permanent committee or other organ to examine problems in the sector as they arose, rather than carry out a review at a sectoral meeting that only met every five years or so.
78. The representative of the Government of South Africa recalled her country's apartheid past in which trade unions were historically marginalized and explained that, being a young democracy, her country had the task of ensuring an atmosphere conducive to social dialogue. The Government had moved quickly to introduce the necessary package of legislation to eradicate apartheid and promote social dialogue. It included individual Acts covering basic conditions of employment, labour relations, employment equity, skills development (and a corresponding Act covering a skills development levy) and a national qualifications framework. The legislation provided for a high level of communication among the partners and effective participation of workers' and employers' representatives in decision-making related to their implementation. Appropriate monetary incentives and penalties were also provided to encourage employers to commit to the objectives of both the Employment Equity Act and the Skills Development Act.
79. The Employer spokesperson underlined the need to use the accepted ILO terminology and refer to "workers' representatives" rather than "trade unions" in relation to discussions on social dialogue. Employers perceived social dialogue as applicable to civil society as a whole rather than being confined purely to structures involving trade unions. It was obvious that it had to extend to all players, especially as in many countries the overwhelming majority of workers did not belong to trade unions, but had also to be represented in social dialogue processes. While employers deplored tours focused on

---

sexual exploitation, they also regretted the way in which the subject had been put forward, as the issue was one of a general social character transcending the hotels, catering and tourism sector, for which hotel owners or managers could not be held responsible. On the question of child labour, a nuanced approach was necessary, distinguishing, for example, situations related to apprenticeships, which in some countries were assimilated to a type of employment relationship. Everyone would certainly oppose the exploitation of young children, but it was necessary to look at the issues carefully and distinguish between different situations that should not really be considered to represent child labour. He emphasized governmental responsibility that recognized tourism as worthy of support.

- 80.** The Worker spokesperson emphasized that what the Workers had referred to with regard to the exploitation of child labour related to the worst forms of child labour as identified within the framework of the ILO's Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182). He was not referring to young people being trained to increase their possibility of obtaining a job which required training. It was not the Workers' intention to suggest that hotels promoted sex tourism, but rather that there were forms of tourism that could involve such practices. These did not generate sustainable development of tourism or of the economies of the countries in which it took place.

### **Consideration and adoption of the draft report and the draft conclusions by the Meeting**

- 81.** The Working Party on Conclusions submitted its draft conclusions to the Meeting at the latter's sixth sitting.
- 82.** At the same sitting, the Meeting adopted the present report and the draft conclusions.

Geneva, 6 April 2001.

*(Signed)* Mr. D. Willers,  
Chairperson.

---

# Conclusions on human resources development, employment and globalization in the hotel, catering and tourism sector<sup>1</sup>

The Tripartite Meeting on Human Resources Development, Employment and Globalization in the Hotel, Catering and Tourism Sector,

Having met in Geneva from 2 to 6 April 2001,

Adopts this sixth day of April 2001 the following conclusions:

## General

1. The hotel, catering and tourism (HCT) sector plays a major role in the economies of many countries and its importance continues to grow. It has a high potential for generating employment, is a major source of revenue in many countries, and small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) – which comprise the majority of enterprises – employ most of the workers in the sector. Similarly, the strategies and procedures of multinational enterprises, which play an important part in the HCT sector, are of great importance. While the sector offers career opportunities, it has a high turnover of employees, particularly among young workers. Policies need to be adopted and best practices promoted to upgrade the image of the sector towards the potential workforce and enhance the value and quality of jobs so as to retain trained workers in the sector, encourage employment creation and improve employment conditions.

## Globalization

2. Globalization has a different impact on developed and developing countries. Present data on tourism receipts and arrivals suggest that most of the benefits in the sector accrue to developed countries. For some developing countries, globalization has led to privatization and deregulation which have resulted in changes in employment structures. In other developing countries, however, globalization has ushered in increased investment flows, multinational enterprises, new technologies and has created and increased employment. To ensure that the benefits of sectoral globalization are as widely distributed as possible, cooperation is necessary between developed and developing countries, and care should be duly taken of issues relating to culture, tradition and the environment. Developing countries and transition economies should be assisted in such areas as Internet marketing, human resource development strategies, exchange of experiences, and necessary funding to make the national tourism economy, in particular small tourism-dependent economies, competitive and sustainable. While member States have to define – with the involvement of all stakeholders – their own policies on tourism at the appropriate national levels, globalization implies that a common international approach was necessary to develop and implement them.

<sup>1</sup> Adopted unanimously.

- 
3. Given that globalization is affecting and transforming labour relations in various ways, there is a need for a legal framework that balances business needs to expand and prosper, and workers' rights, especially those covered by the Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organise Convention, 1948 (No. 87), and the Right to Organise and Collective Bargaining Convention, 1949 (No. 98). Respect for ethical principles, some of which are contained in the Global Code of Ethics for Tourism of the World Tourism Organization and the ILO Tripartite Declaration of Principles concerning Multinational Enterprises and Social Policy, was important to address the potential negative consequences of globalization. Respect for such principles should be encouraged and they should be monitored and implemented with the participation of all stakeholders.

## **Employment creation and working conditions**

4. In order for the HCT sector to be efficient and competitive and to provide productive and sustainable employment under adequate social conditions and wages, a conducive environment to growth and development should be created. In this regard, the Job Creation in Small and Medium-Sized Enterprises Recommendation, 1998 (No. 189), should be taken into account. SMEs should be supported to develop sound human resources strategies. Taking into account their sometimes relative isolation and lack of networks, horizontal groupings and vertical integration, as well as linkages with basic industry, should be promoted. The possible negative consequences for employment of such integration has to be addressed through such strategies as joint brand marketing, computerized reservation networks and standardization of services. Franchising could offer opportunities for SMEs to develop their business. When such contractual arrangements are put in place, they should respect workers' rights and provide fair working conditions in accordance with national legislation. SME development is an area in which financial support, technical cooperation and business acumen from developed to developing and transition countries would be beneficial towards their sustainability.<sup>2</sup>
5. Subcontracting in hotel, restaurant and tourism enterprises to specialized providers is increasing. Subcontracting should, however, not be an obstacle to labour relations. When services are subcontracted or outsourced that result in staff being subject to a new employment contract with a new enterprise, the working conditions prevalent in the original enterprise should not, to the extent possible, be deteriorated by the new employer.
6. Part-time employment and temporary or casual employment or work are a feature of the HCT sector and could be linked to the nature of the industry. While part-time and temporary forms of employment and work may be desired, efforts should be made to provide full-time employment for other workers. Part-time and temporary employment or work should be subject to the equivalent legal and contractual conditions as full-time employment. Employment should, whenever possible, be made more continuous through labour deployment plans or forward planning of working time including seasonal employment. Tourism development policies should seek to take into account and address extreme seasonal variations and its implications for both business and workers. Concerning migrant labour, there was a need to collect reliable data to evaluate its impact in the sector in order to determine if any measures should be taken to assist in the integration of migrant workers, and to combat any discrimination.

<sup>2</sup> The Employers' group expressed reservations about this paragraph, noting that it was difficult in the present situation to attain the "standardization of services".

- 
7. Women make a significant contribution to the HCT sector as they represent the majority of its labour force. More women would be attracted to and retained in the sector if their employment and working conditions, training and career development prospects could be improved. This could take the form of adjustment of daily working hours, facilitating transport to and from home at odd hours, and granting maternity benefits. Women should be offered particular training to facilitate their reinsertion in employment after a period of absence related to their special family responsibilities. Training for women should be enhanced with a view to prepare them for management positions, and also to enhance their capacities at all levels. Women's dignity and personal integrity should be protected. In particular, all forms of discrimination and sexual harassment in the workplace should be eliminated.

## **Human resource development (HRD)**

8. The HCT sector is experiencing a shortage of skilled labour. Innovative and comprehensive human resource development strategies are crucial in order to attract and retain qualified workers in the sector and to maximize the returns on investments made in training. It is also necessary to address the problem of the international mobility of workers in the sector, in particular issues relating to visas and national quota restrictions. Furthermore, an appropriate strategy should be developed and implemented by governments in consultation with the social partners at all levels in order to ensure that international mobility of workers respects local working conditions. Where appropriate, HRD strategies should be globalized through networking of training institutions, facilitating students' international exchange of experience, sharing of information, strengthening cross-border training on information and communication technologies, curricula development, exchanges between countries on management technology and language skills. It requires the establishment or strengthening of appropriate training institutions and capacity building that will take into account national qualification frameworks that recognize lifelong skills and previous working experience. The resolution concerning human resources training and development, adopted by the International Labour Conference at its 88th Session, June 2000, provides guidance on new approaches to training and implementation of human resources development strategies and should be taken into account.
9. Training should be integrated in HRD programmes to provide workers with portable skills and measures should be taken to increase investment in training, if possible, so that workers' potential is maximized. Initial and continuous vocational training, modular training as well as higher training are necessary for those entering as well as those in the industry and also to upgrade the skills of management staff, including managers of SMEs. A system of certification of competencies and qualifications should be developed or promoted. The harmonization of diplomas and degrees in the HCT sector and their mutual recognition among countries should also be encouraged. Various mechanisms for financing of training have to be explored, including public and private partnerships. International agencies, including international financial institutions, have a role to play in supporting a globalized human resource development policy and in providing financial support for training.
10. The tripartite partners in the HCT sector have a role in training. They should be consulted in the development of training policies, in curricula development, and in the allocation of training subsidies, particularly for SMEs. Effective partnerships involving government, employers' and workers' organizations and other stakeholders could provide a shared understanding of labour market issues and challenges. Experiences and best practices in this area should be made available to other countries.

---

## Social dialogue

11. Democracy provides the enabling environment for the development of social dialogue structures and for strong and independent employers' and workers' organizations. The development of social dialogue practices is an open-ended process. Priority should be given to the implementation worldwide of the principles and rights confirmed in the ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work and its Follow-up, 1998. ILO Conventions Nos. 135 and 154 are also pertinent instruments.
12. Social dialogue should be promoted at appropriate levels including at the workplace and enterprise level. Structures and institutions for consultation and discussion in the HCT sector should provide for cooperation at appropriate stages, especially in cases where workers are affected by restructuring of companies. Social dialogue at international level is in an incipient stage of development while regional social dialogue has made advances in a limited number of regions.<sup>3</sup>
13. Globalization requires that issues related to sustainable development be taken into account in social dialogue. Sustainable tourism means that the environmental, social and economic dimensions of tourism development and the linkages between tourists and the host population be integrated. The prerequisites for sustainable tourism development are: increased vocational training, employment and working conditions, the development of infrastructure, and supporting services in tourism-receiving destinations, including safety measures.
14. Governments, employers' and workers' organizations have distinct roles in promoting socially sustainable tourism. The tripartite partners should jointly develop programmes in the framework of the United Nations Year of Eco-Tourism 2002. Governments have a responsibility to develop adequate and appropriate infrastructure and transport points. Partnerships could however be developed with the private sector in this regard. Multinational enterprises also have a role to play in supporting socially sustainable tourism by providing sustainable employment in host communities, investing in staff training and enhancing working conditions. Sustainability also requires partnerships with SMEs to enable them to remain competitive in the tourism market. Employers in the sector have a responsibility to upgrade workers' skills to meet the evolving needs of the sector and to respond to the increasing expectations for quality and service.
15. Tourism development cannot be sustainable if child labour is connected to tourism services. The worst forms of child exploitation, in particular child sex tourism, are a hindrance to sustainable tourism development. Alternatives to working must be found for children, such as schooling and training. Partnerships with international agencies including the World Tourism Organization, with employers' and workers' organizations and with non-governmental organizations, should be developed and pursued to eliminate all forms of child labour in the HCT sector. The Minimum Age Convention, 1973 (No. 138), and the Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182), should be ratified and implemented by all ILO member States.

<sup>3</sup> The Employers' group noted that, while supporting tripartite dialogue as practised in ILO forums, they had difficulties with a wider definition of social dialogue at the international level in the HCT sector.

---

## Role of the ILO

- 16.** The ILO should act as an observatory of trends in the sector and collect and analyse information, statistics and data on relevant developments concerning human resources policies and practices, migrant labour in the sector, prepare targeted reports on a regular basis, collect and disseminate good practices and benchmarking methodologies for the sector. It should put in place a system for training and skill development among countries, particularly for the benefit of developing countries. Building on its experience on occupational safety and health, the ILO should focus, in cooperation with UNAIDS, on providing assistance to its member States to develop training programmes in this area including the prevention of HIV/AIDS and the social integration of workers affected. The ILO should continue to develop a labour accounting system as a supplement to tourism satellite accounts.
- 17.** The ILO should, in consultation with the tripartite constituents, address emerging issues and trends in the HCT sector, such as strategies to enhance the image of the sector, and questions concerning international mobility and human resource development.

---

Part 2

**Resolutions**

---

## Consideration and adoption by the Meeting of the draft resolutions

At its fourth plenary sitting, the Meeting set up a Working Party on Resolutions, in accordance with article 13, paragraph 1, of the Standing Orders.

The Working Party, presided over by the Chairperson of the Meeting, consisted of the Officers of the Meeting and three representatives from each of the groups. The members of the Working Party were:

*Officers of the Meeting:*

Mr. D. Willers (Chairperson)  
Ms. I. Dembsher (Government Vice-Chairperson)  
Mr. M. Ramsamy (Employer Vice-Chairperson)  
Mr. N. Latorre (Worker Vice-Chairperson)

*Government members:*

Brazil: Mr. G. Dayrell  
France: Ms. N. Aguettant  
Kenya: Ms. A. Tabu

*Employer members:*

Mr. A.-P. Feutr   
Ms. M. Geddes  
Mr. O. Ghezzi

*Worker members:*

Mr. C. Mbolela  
Mr. T. Naivaluwaqa  
Mr. J. Stamos

At the Meeting's sixth plenary sitting the Chairperson, in his capacity as Chairperson of the Working Party on Resolutions, and in accordance with article 14, paragraph 8, of the Standing Orders, submitted the recommendations of the Working Party on Resolutions regarding the three draft resolutions before the Meeting. As required by the same provision of the Standing Orders, the three Vice-Chairpersons of the Meeting had been consulted on the contents of his oral report.

The Working Party had before it three draft resolutions submitted by the Workers' group, which were declared receivable. The Working Party amended the text of the resolutions on the basis of proposals made by its members within the time limit set by the Officers of the Meeting. The Working Party recommended the adoption by the Meeting of the three amended draft resolutions.

---

**Resolution concerning measures to promote employment in the hotel, catering and tourism sector during the low season, including vacation programmes for senior citizens**

The Meeting unanimously adopted the resolution.

**Resolution concerning occupational health and safety in the hotel, catering and tourism sector**

The Meeting unanimously adopted the resolution.

**Resolution concerning improving occupational equality for men and women in the hotel, catering and tourism sector**

The Meeting unanimously adopted the resolution.

---

## **Texts of the resolutions adopted by the Meeting**

### **Resolution concerning measures to promote employment in the hotel, catering and tourism sector during the low season, including vacation programmes for senior citizens <sup>1</sup>**

The Tripartite Meeting on Human Resources Development, Employment and Globalization in the Hotel, Catering and Tourism Sector,

Having met in Geneva from 2 to 6 April 2001,

Considering the importance of promoting employment in the hotel, catering and tourism sector during the low season, and

Considering the studies undertaken in different countries, in particular by the Governments of Spain and Brazil, on the economic impact of vacation programmes for senior citizens;

Adopts this sixth day of April 2001 the following resolution:

The Tripartite Meeting on Human Resources Development, Employment and Globalization in the Hotel, Catering and Tourism Sector invites the Governing Body of the International Labour Office:

to request the Director-General, in close cooperation with governments and pertinent employers' and workers' organizations, to conduct a comparative study on measures to promote employment in the hotel, catering and tourism sector during the low season, including vacation programmes for senior citizens, in particular as regards their economic and employment impact on the hotel, catering and tourism sector, and to assess, in collaboration with the World Tourism Organization, the impact of such programmes on the different types of tourism.

### **Resolution concerning occupational health and safety in the hotel, catering and tourism sector <sup>2</sup>**

The Tripartite Meeting on Human Resources Development, Employment and Globalization in the Hotel, Catering and Tourism Sector,

Having met in Geneva from 2 to 6 April 2001,

<sup>1</sup> Adopted unanimously.

<sup>2</sup> Adopted unanimously.

---

Considering the specific occupational health and safety hazards to which workers in hotels, catering and tourism facilities are exposed,

Recalling that the ILO Occupational Safety and Health Convention, 1981 (No. 155) contains provisions for governments and for enterprises aimed at preventing occupational accidents and illnesses,

Underscoring the special role of governments and of food service companies in matters pertaining to food safety, as well as the common interest of governments, employers and workers in seeking to eliminate all food-poisoning risks;

Adopts this sixth day of April 2001 the following resolution:

The Tripartite Meeting on Human Resources Development, Employment and Globalization in the Hotel, Catering and Tourism Sector invites the Governing Body of the ILO to:

- (1) call upon member States to ratify the Occupational Safety and Health Convention, 1981 (No. 155), and to develop education and awareness programmes on safety and health issues in the hotel, catering and tourism sector;
- (2) call upon member States and employers' and workers' organizations to cooperate with independent surveys and initiatives, at the international, national or local levels, aimed at improving food safety;
- (3) request the Director-General to assemble, collect and produce health data on workers in the hotel, catering and tourism sector, for the purpose of identifying what are the risks particularly associated with the HCT sector, which may include second-hand smoke, alcohol consumption and drug use, as well as assessing the prevalence of HIV/AIDS among workers, in particular the high-risk population of young workers; and to assemble, collect and produce information on nationwide or local measures implemented in certain countries or by certain employers in order to deal with the foregoing specific hazards.

## **Resolution concerning improving occupational equality for men and women in the hotel, catering and tourism sector<sup>3</sup>**

The Tripartite Meeting on Human Resources Development, Employment and Globalization in the Hotel, Catering and Tourism Sector,

Having met in Geneva from 2 to 6 April 2001,

Considering the high proportion of women employed in the sector,

Recalling that the Tripartite Declaration of Principles concerning Multinational Enterprises and Social Policy and the ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles and

<sup>3</sup> Adopted unanimously.

---

Rights at Work and its Follow-up include a commitment to eliminate gender discrimination in employment and occupation,

Underscoring the challenges facing men and women workers employed in the hotel, catering and tourism sector and the difficulties of reconciling occupational activities with family life;

Adopts this sixth day of April 2001 the following resolution:

The Tripartite Meeting on Human Resources Development, Employment and Globalization in the Hotel, Catering and Tourism Sector invites the Governing Body of the International Labour Organization to:

- (1) appeal to member States to:
  - (a) use all means at their disposal to persuade firms to organize work in such a manner as to encourage equal employment opportunities for both men and women, including with respect to the nature of the work, pay levels and opportunities for training and advancement;
  - (b) respond, wherever possible, to the needs of parents at work by making available childcare facilities and personnel appropriate to the sector's special requirements, as well as to recognize their parenting obligations;
  - (c) take all necessary measures to prevent and eliminate sexual harassment and all others forms of discrimination at the workplace;
  - (d) encourage the implementation of training programmes and approaches equally accessible to men and women in particular those aimed at the acquisition of skills related to new technologies; and
  - (e) encourage management to provide women with the same career opportunities as men;
- (2) encourage member States to promote the ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work and its Follow-up and relevant Conventions on equality and non-discrimination.

---

Part 3

**Other proceedings**

---

## Panel discussions

### Social dialogue in the hotel, catering and tourism sector

*Moderator:* Mr. Zhang, Chairperson, Government group

*Panellists:* Ms. Deborah Anderson, Hotel Employees and Restaurant Employees International Union (HERE), United States

Mr. Enrique Strega, Argentine Federation of Hotel and Food Service Professionals (FEHGRA), Buenos Aires

Mr. Carlos Alberto Lopes, Directorate-General for Employment and Social Affairs, European Commission, Brussels

Ms. Patricia O'Donovan, ILO, Geneva

Ms. Anderson's presentation focused on relations between the local sectoral trade union and employers in the casinos of the city of Las Vegas, United States. The success of the local trade union, which at present had a little over 50,000 affiliated members, was the result of a twofold strategy aimed on the one hand at developing and maintaining a partnership with the sector's employers, and on the other hand at continuing and broadening the fight against those casino owners who stood in the way of harmonious industrial relations in Las Vegas.

Following a strike in 1984 the local trade union had suffered heavily, losing the members employed by six casinos. That, however, had served as a catalyst for the remaining 18,000 members who had seized the opportunity to elect new local representatives. Assistance subsequently given by senior international trade union officials had enabled the local union to reorganize as of 1987. The sense of partnership was strengthened through expansion at the national level, taking into consideration the diverse nature of affiliated members.

According to Ms. Anderson, the first challenge had been to engage in appropriate information activities to prevent the further loss of accreditations with the casinos. The collective labour agreement signed in 1989 by Mr. John Wilhelm, president of HERE, and the director of Golden Nugget (Mirage Resorts) could be considered a real platform for consultation. The agreement not only enshrined the main objectives of the local union but also included possibilities for wage increases and measures to improve the health of workers and their families at no extra cost. The substance of the agreement, however, lay in its new partnership model, according to which changes in workers' living conditions were tied to growth in the enterprise for which they worked.

This agreement served as a model for negotiations held with all casinos wishing to consolidate the image and future of gambling, notably the group known as the "Big Six", which included Circus Circus, Caesar's Palace, the Las Vegas and Flamingo Hiltons, the Tropicana and Bally's. Tough battles had had to be fought before the concept of free accreditation and the principle of neutrality, both contained in the Las Vegas Strip contracts, had been recognized and accepted as models by HERE. In 1991, all casinos but one (the Frontier) had renegotiated their trade union agreements.

That attitude had triggered the longest strike in the history of the United States, which had lasted six years, four months and ten days. During that time there had been displays of

---

exceptional solidarity; for example, the director of Circus Circus himself decided to supply the strikers with meals for a period of almost six years. Today, good cooperation between the local trade union and the casino industry had become a reality to the point where there now existed a true culture of cooperation and partnership.

One of the most outstanding results of the new partnership had been the establishment of the Culinary Training Center in 1993. Designed to meet the need for qualified staff in the industry, the Center had already trained more than 15,000 workers, 65 per cent of whom were now employed in 26 hotels working together with the local trade union. The courses given by the Center were free of charge.

In concluding, Ms. Anderson stressed that the current partnership benefited all: not only had trade union membership grown, but workers' standards of living had improved markedly (more so than in other sectors in the United States) as regarded salaries, pensions and social security cover.

Mr. Strega stated that he would keep his comments brief, more detailed information being contained in his article *Turismo, ocio y trabajo: Reflexiones desde un pais emergente* written with Jorge Busquets (English and Spanish language versions only), which was available to participants at the back of the meeting room. His experience as a workers' adviser, civil servant and employers' adviser had shown that after a series of military dictatorships, Argentina had now become a model of democracy in Latin America.

The constant efforts to strengthen democracy went hand in hand with structural reforms implemented to enable the country to cope with the demands of globalization. In the 1990s the trade and the financial systems had been liberalized fully, the majority of state enterprises had been privatized and state structures had been reformed to contain the rampant inflation Argentina had known in the past. There had also been technological developments, particularly in the field of telecommunications. Inflation had been reigned in a little more than six years after the introduction of a law which established the full convertibility and parity of the Argentinean peso and US dollar. All of the above reforms had had repercussions on not only trade but also labour and trade union relations.

Social dialogue had enabled the social partners to accomplish those reforms and to resolve the conflicts resulting therefrom. Social dialogue covered not only questions related to industrial relations and the trade unions but also to economic and political reforms. It was true that in Argentina the representatives of the workers' and employers' organizations were empowered to take part in the political, social and economic dialogue and therefore not limited to discussing only problems relating strictly to social issues and the trade unions. This gave an idea of the power and influence of the social partners. The organizations concerned consequently had to have solid experience and qualified staff at their disposal.

The trade union structure comprised three levels: the local unions, the federations and the confederation that represented all trade union organizations in any dialogue and negotiations held with the Government and employers at the central level on questions relating to industrial relations, the national economy or social issues.

A perfect example of the dialogue and consultation mechanisms established in Argentina was the collective agreement between employers and sectoral unions concerning notably flexible working conditions and salaries. This and similar agreements had enabled companies to adjust to the demands of open competition, especially in view of the reforms instituted in response to globalization.

---

In conclusion, Mr. Strega emphasized the specificity of each country in the area of social dialogue. In his opinion, however, social dialogue was an excellent means of achieving common goals and rising to the challenges of the twenty-first century.

Mr. Lopes' presentation consisted of two parts: social dialogue in the European Commission in general; and social dialogue at the European level in the hotel and catering sector.

At the European Commission and in the entire body of European Union institutions, social dialogue was considered essential in the development of the European social model. As one of the components of democracy, social dialogue made it possible for both parties involved in the creation of wealth (i.e. workers and employers) to express their respective interests. In this respect, the two essential concepts of consultation and negotiation were gaining ground.

Consultation, one of the aspects of good governance, enabled the social partners to send the necessary signals to public decision-makers at a very early stage. At the European level, the social partners were integrated into a comprehensive network of consultative structures, which allowed them to make their voices heard in European Community initiatives on employment, vocational training, the free flow of manpower, equal opportunities for men and women and economic and monetary policy. An additional aspect of social dialogue, which was also showing progress, was the ability to directly influence employment and the social dimension, and to participate in the development thereof.

As to negotiations, the European Commission had to date set up 26 sectoral committees on social dialogue, whose aim was to strive for greater involvement of the professional associations in independent dialogue. Social dialogue had also been stimulated greatly by other developments within the institutions of the European Union. The provisions introduced in the social protocol of the Maastricht Treaty, reflected in Articles 138 and 139 of the Amsterdam Treaty, enabled the social partners to opt variously for a legislative or treaty-based approach to drawing up social provisions. On the basis of these provisions the social partners were effectively consulted and could choose to enter negotiations on subjects submitted to them.

These provisions also had the effect of stimulating social dialogue. For example, they resulted in the initiation and successful conclusion of the first European-wide negotiations by the social partners. To date, three inter-professional framework agreements had been concluded on parental leave, part-time work and fixed-term contracts. Strong independent dialogue between the social partners had moved beyond the inter-professional arena and into other sectors of activity. For instance, four agreements on working hours had been signed in 1997 in the agriculture, maritime transport, railway and civil aviation sectors.

In the hotel and catering sector, the social dialogue initiated in 1983 had already resulted in a number of initiatives, including the:

- joint declaration on principles and guidelines for maintaining and developing tourism jobs in rural areas (10 March 1995);
- joint declaration on flexibility of labour and organization of working time, part-time work and the creation of jobs (9 June 1995);
- agreement on social dialogue at the European level (28 September 1998).

It should also be remembered that the social partners, Hotels, Restaurants and Cafés in Europe (HOTREC) and SETA-UITA, had set up a committee for social dialogue in the hotel and restaurant sector. On 3 May 1999 the committee had approved the joint

---

declaration for the promotion of employment in the European hotel and restaurant sector. Also at the European level, mention should likewise be made of FERCO (European Federation of Contract Catering Organizations) which had been active in social dialogue, negotiations and initiatives undertaken with SETA-UITA (joint declarations, seminars). For the period 2000-01, the social partners had been promoting the following activities:

- a debate on qualifications and their accreditation (with the participation of CEDEFOP and the Directorate-General for Education and Culture);
- an analysis of medium-term developments in the hotel sector; and
- an analysis of national experiences in training and promotion of employment in the hotel sector.

In conclusion, Mr. Lopes said that he believed that the willingness of the social partners to take part in the construction of a European social model and the potential of the HCT sector would assure their future success. The social partners could therefore be sure of the support of the European Commission.

In introducing her presentation, Ms. O'Donovan referred to the speech given by Ms. Sally Paxton, Executive Director for Social Dialogue at the ILO, at the opening of the Tripartite Meeting, in which she had described social dialogue as one of the four strategic objectives of the ILO, thus giving Governments, Employers and Workers attending the Tripartite Meeting the opportunity to discuss social dialogue at the international level. Ms. Paxton's speech had also highlighted the need for the ILO to strengthen social dialogue since it was a mechanism that permitted the Organization's constituent members to put forward the problems and challenges arising from the economic and social climate of the day, while stimulating development by committing the social partners together to find new or alternative solutions.

Ms. O'Donovan went on to emphasize that social dialogue was a very dynamic concept when used as a problem-solving tool, a means for management change and a mechanism for promoting quality employment, competitive enterprises and sustainable tourism. Social dialogue was also the best means for ensuring that the above three interrelated elements were integrated harmoniously.

Referring to Chapter 5 of the report under discussion by the Tripartite Meeting, Ms. O'Donovan pointed out that social dialogue had resulted in significant advances, even if employers and workers believed that much remained to be done. For example, institutional capacities were insufficient and attempts at solving problems often did not include tripartite consultations. That should encourage all the social partners to see the hotel, catering and tourism industry participate effectively in economic growth and increased employment. The report was very clear about the difficulties encountered in strengthening social dialogue; these varied with the systems under which labour unions were organized, the diversity of enterprises in the sector concerned and the effects of globalization. It further had to be noted that the vast majority of enterprises in question were micro-enterprises employing around ten or fewer staff. Owing to these and other factors the sector faced more challenges than other areas of activity, even without taking into account its considerable vulnerability to macroeconomic changes. The sector's diversity was an established fact: for example, subsectors such as marketing and sales services had benefited enormously from the new information and communication technologies that had boosted growth in international tourism. At the same time there had been an increase in the most sordid form of sex tourism, notably that involving children, which was one of the worst forms of child labour as set out in Convention No. 182, adopted by the International Labour Conference in 1999. The report also confirmed that

---

innovative developments in human resources and training had improved employment quality and productivity in some activities of the sector, whereas in other areas temporary work, precarious working conditions and low revenues were on the increase.

The above was evidence of the urgent need to step up initiatives to strengthen social dialogue in the sector. If effective social dialogue was not established at the national and international level, it would be difficult to solve the problems related to human resources development, employment and globalization. Such dialogue had to strive to set up good practices on the basis of, among other things, the positive results achieved elsewhere. It was safe to assume that social dialogue focusing on the issues of training and development, work and the family, child labour, the fundamental rights at work, subcontracting and franchising would contribute substantially to the long-term success of the sector. This could also improve the sector's image, since it was commonly associated with poor working conditions, job insecurity and limited career options.

In conclusion, Ms. O'Donovan stated that in order to solve the urgent problems facing the sector, sectoral social dialogue had to form part of a shared global vision accepted by all. It was the responsibility of the tripartite members, gathered at the present Meeting, to accomplish that. The ILO for its part had to give the necessary encouragement and support through the appropriate structures and by providing advice and technical expertise.

## Discussion

Addressing all speakers, a Worker member from Australia asked what role the public authorities had played in the area of social dialogue. The Worker member from the United States replied that no public intervention had occurred in Las Vegas, whereas in San Francisco the public authorities did become involved on occasion, even going so far as to amend contracts in the process of being performed – a unique situation in the United States.

An Employer member from Argentina said that the Ministry of Labour intervened to resolve disputes but only in case of minor problems. He added that relations between the Government and the sectoral trade unions were good, unlike in the case of other sectors of activity. According to the European Union representative, the member States had well-defined social models for areas such as social security, protection of the most disadvantaged members of society, the prison population and the fight against discrimination. It was up to each country to choose its own model.

The ILO expert on social dialogue pointed out that, notwithstanding any activities carried out by the public authorities, it was the social partners who had to be the main players. Any initiative taken by the ILO would be futile if there was no rapprochement between the social partners and the authorities. The ILO would always work to bring together the parties concerned and to provide them with technical assistance.

In view of the above responses and the difficulties experienced by the sector, one participant proposed that a permanent working group be set up to focus on ILO activities concerning governments and their role in social dialogue.

A Government representative from South Africa found the Argentinean model to be of interest and recommended it for consideration by all member States. Thanks to social dialogue, employers in South Africa had become involved in discussions on vocational training, which, in addition, was the subject of a specific law. A Worker member from Spain wanted to know more about employers' attitudes to workers in Argentina, with reference to the difficulties relating to competition that had been encountered in Las Vegas. Mr. Strega replied that employers complied with the legislation and numerous

---

business organizations abided by the fact that social dialogue was controlled by the Government. Ms. Anderson said that competition had a stimulating effect and that Las Vegas no longer suffered from strikes or, thanks to the creation of a training centre, a shortage of skilled labour. In reply to the concerns voiced earlier in the discussion, the European Union representative stated that the social partners were free to act within the constraints of the prevailing legislation. The social partners took all the necessary steps at the national and not the European level. However, in 26 sectors of activity there was social dialogue at the European level. A Worker member of the French trade union, CFDT, indicated that sectoral social dialogue in the European Union was a recent phenomenon and stressed that some resistance to dialogue at this level persisted in the hotel industry.

## **Socially sustainable tourism development**

*Moderator:* Mr. Norberto Latorre, Worker Vice-Chairperson of the Meeting

*Panellists:* Mr. Marimootoo Ramsamy, AHRIM, Mauritius (Employers' delegate)  
Mr. Fernando Medina, FECOHT-CC.OO., Madrid (Workers' delegate)  
Ambassador Federico Alberto Cuello Camilo, Dominican Republic  
Mr. Philippe Egger, ILO, Geneva

Ambassador Cuello Camilo threw some light on the need for socially sustainable tourism development from the perspective of a developing country. The tourism sector in developing countries would be truly sustainable only if revenues were distributed equitably, if tourist expenditure in the country increased at a higher rate than the number of tourists and if incomes were allocated for sustainable use of natural resources required to support the tourism sector and to increase the capacity of host communities to receive a growing number of visitors. To ensure this, he stressed the importance of social dialogue not only between workers and management but also within local communities where service providers should take part in an integrated process of conceiving industrial strategies as well as developing and managing resources including the environment. He explained the nature of uneven distribution of revenues between sending and receiving countries in the forms of internal, external and invisible "leakages". A host country having to import heavily in order to run the industry suffered from "internal leakages", while a country suffered "external leakages" when large foreign airlines and travel agencies controlled in-bound and outbound operations. In general, 60 per cent of tourism revenues went to airlines, travel agencies, etc., while only 40 per cent was for the host country. In addition, "invisible leakages" in the forms of tax evasion, foreign exchange imbalances and resource depletion posed a serious challenge to sustainable tourism development in developing countries. Moreover, there were anti-competitive practices such as vertical integration of tourism-related operations by large companies resulting in discrimination by tour operators against local hotels, discriminatory access to networks such as GDS (global distribution system) and CRS (computerized reservation systems) or the arbitrary fixing of flight schedules and destinations by large tour operators located in industrialized countries. International organizations should assist developing countries to better deal with anti-competitive practices and protect them from exploitation by promoting, for example, codes of conduct, and assist them to find more direct access to the market. Coherent international tourism policies would promote fair competition in the industry and better pricing methods would absorb the costs of resource depletion in compliance with environmental standards. He also proposed developing countries to form strategic alliances through the use of the Internet to bypass or reduce the role of intermediaries, and stressed the need to strengthen multilateral commitments to achieve sustainable tourism development.

---

Mr. Ramsamy emphasized that we were moving into a new age of travel and tourism, and commended the tourism industry for its forward and backward inter-sectoral linkages creating employment. The industry had to become increasingly competitive as it dealt with a perishable commodity. In his country, the rapid growth of the sector was due to constant strategical reviews reinventing the tourism development pattern and promoting a business culture to strive for quality and excellence. Referring to the United Nations Earth Summit of 1992 in Rio, he defined “sustainable tourism” as “a development process that meets the needs of the present generation, without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs”. Sustainable development allowed for economic growth, set high standards at all levels, preserved socio-cultural heritage, safeguarded the interests of the local population, discouraged pollution and brought out the values of the society. It required the right policy framework, sound development strategies, integrated planning, good business practices, effective legislation to control and monitor the development, and a long-term vision based on full community participation with equitable distribution of benefits, job creation and poverty alleviation. Sustainable tourism development, in addition, meant the conservation of both natural and socio-cultural environments and the mutual understanding of different cultures through harmonious interactions among visitors and host communities. On the other hand, socio-economic and political instability, excessive bureaucracy, as well as poor human resources leading to institutional weakness and unethical practices posed threats to sustainable tourism development, eventually resulting in environmental degradation and social disintegration. Referring to more recent concepts such as “nature tourism” and “ecotourism”, the speaker proposed to analyse certain phenomena influencing the market such as the ageing of the population and the demand of experienced customers who were longing for higher valued leisure activities to balance increasing pressure they were suffering in their work. He outlined the role that each of the tripartite constituents should play in this respect. The government was expected to play a key role in providing the right policy framework, infrastructure, training, and tourist safety and security codes, as well as in facilitating investment. The private sector, on the other hand, was expected to make competitive investment decisions, create jobs and provide training, particularly on information technology. He stressed the need for both “high-tech” and “hi-touch” training, as the human touch was still the essential element in the tourism industry. The private sector also needed to be mindful of good business ethics and practices and environmental protection. Employees had to have a realistic approach to productivity requirements and participate in the development of tourism strategies in the community. Sustainable tourism under the present market forces warranted innovation, creativity, quality and excellence, instead of mere expansion. Tourism in the era of globalization required a global vision, and this was where international organizations such as ILO and WTO could play an important role. The speaker concluded his presentation by stressing that tourism was a noble mission as it fostered better human understanding.

Mr. Medina spoke from the viewpoint of the tourism workers in Spain, a leading tourism country in the world where tourism revenues accounted for 11 per cent of GDP and foreign tourist arrivals alone were over 48 million in 2000, 70 per cent of which by aeroplane. The sector had recorded 3 per cent annual growth during the last few years, but he questioned how the employment opportunities would continue growing in the sector which already employed 1.5 million workers. Out of about 300,000 wage earners in hotels and restaurants, only 61 per cent held continuous contracts, however. Owing to the highly seasonal nature of the work in most parts of the country, only 7 per cent of the salaries were above the national average, although much employment was offered continuously in places like the Canary and the Balearic Islands. Reducing the seasonal variations was therefore an important objective of the trade unions. However, as long as the tour operators were promoting beach holidays, workers had to face seasonal work. No more than five tour operators dictated the market and were able to put the industry under pressure by threatening to shift operations to other countries. He doubted their social responsibility. Spain’s past tourism model “sun and beach” had indeed helped his country to develop

---

economically, but it also had led to serious water shortages in tourist centres. Likewise, it had relied on cheap labour, and enough attention had not been paid to human resources development despite increasing global competition. A few years ago employers and workers had agreed to change the tourism model and had jointly adopted a policy to enhance the quality of services and jobs. With a view to promoting alternative tourism models, a special ecotourism tax of three euros per day per visitor was introduced, which met with considerable opposition, and a Local Agenda 21 was agreed upon reflecting goals such as employment, fair competition and social cohesion. Trade unions welcomed the ecotourism development fund to mitigate environmental destruction. The fund was also used for training workers. A tripartite consultative committee was established under the Local Agenda 21 and a manual was produced to better control the construction along the coastline to the benefit of the environment, particularly on small islands such as Majorca which received one-third of all visitors to Spain. He felt that more consideration should be given to workers' concerns in any tourism policy development in the future.

Mr. Egger gave a presentation on climate change and how it would affect tourism development. The evidence gathered by the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC), an advisory body composed of scientists from around the world established in 1988 by the World Meteorological Organization (WMO) and the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP), showed that the world temperature was rising due to human-made greenhouse gases (GHG) released from the burning of fossil fuels. The IPCC report showed the 1990s as having been the warmest decade of the twentieth century and projected the world temperature to rise further, depending on world economic and population growth and emission levels of GHG. All scientists agreed that climatic change was indeed taking place and that 90 per cent of the change was a consequence of human energy consumption. A rise in the average sea level between 9 cm and 88 cm by 2100 was predicted, which would flood or submerge many low-lying areas and whole island countries. The frequency of natural disasters such as floods and droughts would also increase due to changing global rain patterns, seriously affecting tropical regions, forests and agricultural lands and their fish stocks, wildlife and crops. Water resources would be more unevenly distributed than today, and tropical diseases would also spread beyond present boundaries due to a rise in humidity and temperature, while the incidence of skin cancer would increase as a result of a thinning ozone layer. All these changes would directly affect traditional tourist destinations both in the northern and the southern hemispheres in both summer and winter. Agriculture, industries and services heavily dependent on fossil fuels would face major challenges and would have to consider shifting slowly to non-fossil fuel energy sources. Faced with this growing concern, the Rio Conference on sustainable development held in 1992 had agreed to limit GHG emissions in industrialized countries to the level of that of 1990 by the year 2000, but this was not binding. In 1997 the parties had further agreed in Kyoto to reduce emission levels to 92-95 per cent of the 1990 levels by 2008-12. The World Conference on Climate Change held in The Hague in November 2000 failed to reach agreement on the implementation of the Kyoto Protocol. While these conferences addressed mainly the GHG emissions in industrialized countries, it was estimated that emission levels of developing countries, notably China and India, would exceed the levels of industrialized countries by 2015. Another world conference on sustainable development was planned for 2002 in South Africa, and it would be an excellent opportunity for the tourism industry to better assess the likely consequences of climate change relevant to it and what contribution it could make towards sustainable social development. The employers' and workers' advisory committee in the OECD had been calling for more research to be undertaken on how climate change affected industry and employment, in terms of both direct and indirect consequences. Employers were particularly keen on promoting research on energy-saving measures in industry, while workers were interested in employment implications of climate change. He concluded his presentation by strongly recommending that the tourism industry seriously consider the dimensions of climate change to its sustainable development.

---

## Discussion

During the subsequent discussion, a representative of the ILO International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) stated that her programme was combating child labour and child prostitution in the tourism sector particularly since the adoption of the ILO Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182). ILO tripartite constituents were called upon to consider how they could contribute. IPEC was providing training and decent employment opportunities to young people who had been rescued from child labour.

The Government representative from South Africa referred to the Rio +10 Conference to be held in 2002 in her country and said that the Government was in the process of preparing a national strategy for sustainable development including tourism development.

Referring to the growth recorded in tourism in the Canary Islands, a Workers' representative questioned how sustainable tourism could be developed when the industry was dominated by powerful capitalism responding to demanding clients. He referred to the criticism of tour operators and their power to determine the tourism development model.

Commenting on Mr. Ramsamy's presentation, the Government representative from China stated that sustainable tourism development required consideration of a broad range of social issues. China offered a cultural heritage of thousands of years. The challenge of his country was how to preserve traditional culture and environment. Sustainable tourism should promote an understanding of the destination culture and contribute to protect it. He stressed the need to watch out for sexual exploitation in tourism. Harmonious labour relations would surely also contribute to the sustainable development of the industry.

## Gender questions in the hotel, catering and tourism sector

*Moderator:* Mr. Marimootoo Ramsamy, AHRIM, Mauritius (Employers' delegate)

*Panellists:* Ms. Vesna Dejanovic, SSUTH, Croatia (Workers' delegate)

Ms. Minu Hemmati, United Nations Environment and Development Forum, United Kingdom

Ms. Cristina Patricia Oddone, Cordoba Tourism Agency, Argentina (Employers' delegate)

Ms. Shauna Olney, ILO, Geneva

Ms. Dejanovic pointed to the importance of gender questions in the HCT sector for Workers' representatives as the sector was dominated by women in atypical employment. Seasonal, temporary, part-time and night work by women and mobile youth were the characteristic features in the sector. Despite the fact that the share of women workers increased to 46 per cent of the workforce in tourism and 90 per cent in catering and accommodation, the number of unemployed women in the sector was greater than that of men. She thought this was due to low levels of education and women's low social status in poorer countries. Women occupied low-paid and low-skilled jobs in the sector as indicated by their average wages which were 20 per cent lower than those of men in the same job categories, and enjoyed little opportunity for training and promotion. Women in atypical employment were also vulnerable to economic recession, restructuring and new technology. They performed physically demanding tasks, often in split shifts, and were exposed to high and low temperatures, smoke, drugs and sexual harassment. She gave a positive example from Finland where the Service Union United had helped to promote the

---

Smoke Act to improve the working environment for women, particularly pregnant women, in restaurants and nightclubs. The Act entitled women to special maternity benefits if they had to work in smoky areas during pregnancy. It also obliged the employer to register all employees affected by smoke and measure the environment on a regular basis, providing the results to the authorities. Since more women were joining the workforce, their special needs had to be taken into account by employers and trade unions, and they had to be properly represented in decision-making. Non-regular workers should enjoy more job security and be entitled on a pro-rata basis to the conditions applicable to regular workers. In addition to equal pay, skill training and promotions women should enjoy protection of their dignity and not be forced to wear indecent work clothes. The speaker urged countries to ratify the Working Conditions (Hotels and Restaurants) Convention, 1991 (No. 172). The social partners should cooperate to provide women with equal career opportunities by setting up childcare facilities and providing training programmes. Public services should be better organized to enable workers to better manage their family life. Women working in the sector had been caught unprepared by globalization and the new economic environment. Whilst they had not had a chance to develop a strategy to face the new economic order, their capacity for hard work and perseverance had made them progress in the sector.

Ms. Hemmati saw important links between the present ILO Meeting and the International Year of Eco-Tourism and the Rio +10 Conference in 2002. Tourism had demonstrated its potential for creating jobs and benefiting local communities in destination areas as well as providing entry points for women's employment. However, all stakeholders in tourism communities should collaborate to safeguard the natural environment and cultural heritage and increase social and economic justice. According to a study prepared by her Office, women's share in the tourism workforce ranged between 2 per cent and 80 per cent, the average being 46 per cent as opposed to 34-40 per cent in the whole economy. On the average, the hours worked by women had increased to a level of 89 per cent of the hours worked by men. One should be mindful, however, of the fact that they continued to shoulder a large share of domestic duties raising their average total working hours to 70-90 hours per week. Women earned an average of 79 per cent of men's earnings as they worked in low-paid positions and non-regular employment, and due to sheer discrimination. The gender gap in earnings was greater in developing countries. As in other sectors, there was gender segregation in employment in both the horizontal ("glass wall") and vertical ("glass ceiling") direction: certain occupations were typically either female or male, and managerial positions were dominated by men, a situation which was being perpetuated by traditionalism and gender stereotyping. The HCT sector might, however, due to its dynamic nature, call for initiatives to advance women from which other industries would benefit. All stakeholders would have to work together to combat gender discrimination at work while being mindful of women's domestic responsibilities. There were many examples of women's groups which had been successful in community-based tourism. They had provided women with better skills, financial independence and self-esteem resulting in more equitable relationships in the families and in the community. However, they still had less access to market information. Women in developing countries were disadvantaged in gaining entry into the formal sector due to their low education and training. Tourism had tended to be controlled by powerful vested interests without due concern for the local communities. However, the new trend was to enhance participation by all sections of the host communities and building partnerships among all stakeholders of Local Agenda 21 (LA21). Local tourism boards had an important role to play in promoting those partnerships as required by the LA21 process. The speaker also mentioned sexist stereotypes reflected in certain work clothes and mannerisms, which was in violation of various international human rights Conventions, and called for immediate elimination of related marketing strategies by the industry.

---

Ms. Oddone said that there was hardly any gender discrimination in Argentina as there was equal access not only to primary and secondary education but also to universities. The principle of non-discrimination was guaranteed by the Constitution and the Labour Standard, while the equality of working conditions and job security for women after maternity leave were protected in the collective agreement. The tourism sector was “women intensive” as 43.6 per cent of workers were female, while the proportion reached more than 50 per cent if travel agencies were included, as opposed to 40 per cent in the total national workforce and 28 per cent in manufacturing industries. Women felt attracted by a high rate of computerization in the HCT sector. Many women were also entering the labour market as many men had lost jobs during the recession which left an unemployment rate of almost 18 per cent particularly affecting young people. However, men earned an average of 26 per cent more than women in the HCT sector as opposed to 40 per cent in other sectors. Of the workforce in the hotel and catering sector, 6.4 per cent had not completed primary education, 58.5 per cent had at least primary education or some secondary education, 32.5 per cent had finished the secondary level, while 2.6 per cent had tertiary or university-level education. Whilst the proportions of the two middle groups were not much different from those in the total population, the proportions of those with tertiary or university education was much lower than the national average of 15.6 per cent. The number of women playing important roles in multinational companies had, however, increased impressively in recent years, and many were taking up executive positions, which had mostly been occupied by men in the past. Women were also making a strong advance in public relations work in the tourism sector. Among the executives in the companies affiliated to her association, women had increased their share to 40 per cent. She therefore felt that women should not feel discriminated against and that men and women had to work together by complementing one another.

Ms. Olney spoke about the ILO’s gender mainstreaming policy and the means of promoting gender equality, particularly through collective bargaining. The approach aimed at gender equality in two steps: the first was to assess the respective implications for women and men of any planned action, including legislation, policies and programmes; and the second was to design and implement a strategy to ensure that women’s as well as men’s concerns and experiences were an integral dimension in such actions so that women and men would benefit equally and inequality would not be perpetuated. The ILO had recognized that gender concerns were cutting across all policy and operational activities and that they were at the very core of the concept of “decent work” and essential to realize human potential. The ILO’s commitment to gender equality had to be internalized throughout the Office and be reflected in all its technical work, operational activities and support services. However, “mainstreaming” should not be confined to the ILO. Its adoption by the tripartite constituents was much encouraged. After mentioning some ILO instruments for promoting gender equality, such as the Equal Remuneration Convention, 1951 (No. 100), and the Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention, 1958 (No. 111), the ILO Declaration of Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work, the speaker opened a gender perspective on freedom of association and collective bargaining in the hotel, catering and tourism sector. Very few women were covered by collective agreements in this sector as they were in atypical employment and not members of trade unions. In spite of the known obstacles to collective bargaining in the sector, she underscored collective bargaining as being an important means of promoting gender equality and making the best use of human resources. Collective bargaining was essential in addressing gender issues for a number of reasons, including inadequacy of legislative coverage and law enforcement. It would also show the employers’ commitment to equality, which would help to attract and retain women workers in particular, while for trade unions it would be a means of attracting women to membership. The sector had a reputation for being badly paid, and there was a much wider wage gap between men and women here than in other sectors, but she questioned if it was due to women being less skilled or the system undervaluing the efforts of women. In either case, collective

---

bargaining could play an important role in addressing the issues. Women were also generally thought to prefer flexible hours because of their family responsibilities, but flexibility meant many different things to different people and it was important through collective bargaining to promote flexibility that would be of benefit not only to the employer but the workers as well. Other matters that collective bargaining could address included workplace violence and sexual harassment (including sexually enticing uniforms), late hours and problems of safe transport, combining work and family responsibilities, childcare and a lack of career prospects.

## **Discussion**

During the discussion, delegates called for efforts to better define occupational diseases in the HCT sector and to distinguish them from general diseases which could also be acquired in household work. At any rate, work in hotels and restaurants and household work reciprocally aggravated the risks. An Employers' representative stated that this requirement to define occupational diseases in the HCT sector in the perspective of gender equality should not be imposed on countries without regard to their levels of economic development.

---

## Closing speeches

The Secretary-General provided information on participation in the Meeting. He noted that the discussion of the background report in the plenary and in the working parties had clearly shown the importance of the issues concerning human resources development, employment and globalization in the hotel, catering and tourism sector. The three panel discussions had provided an opportunity to exchange information and experiences on social dialogue, socially sustainable tourism and gender questions in the sector. He highlighted the importance for the ILO's constituents, as well as for the ILO itself, to translate the conclusions and resolutions into action at the national and international levels. He called upon the participants to contribute to this objective.

Mr. J. Zhang (representative of the Government of China; Chairperson of the Government group) stressed the importance of the hotel, catering and tourism sector for the economic development and employment in many countries and hence the review by the Meeting of human resources development issues. He expected that the progress made on certain issues would have an impact on the development of the sector. He thanked the ILO on behalf of the Government group for the Meeting and the background report and the Employers' and Workers' group for their constructive attitude.

Mr. K. Schroeter (Chairperson of the Workers' group) also thanked the ILO for the organization of the Meeting and the preparation of the background report which he considered provided an accurate description of the situation in the sector. He expected the sector to benefit from the outcome of the Meeting. Stressing the merits of direct dialogue as it was practised throughout the Meeting, he saw its results as a milestone paving the way for more ratifications of the Working Conditions (Hotels and Restaurants) Convention, 1991 (No. 172).

Mr. O.A. Ghezzi (Chairperson of the Employers' group) thanked the Chairperson and Vice-Chairpersons, the secretariat and the participants for their contributions to a successful Meeting. Emphasizing the interrelations between tourism and areas such as health, culture and employment, he highlighted the prominent role of the people working in hotels, restaurants and in tourism making the sector work and grow. He saw a strong continuity between this Meeting's discussions on human resources and the previous meeting which dealt with new technologies. However, it was the human beings who were the more important factor.

The Chairperson affirmed that possibly nowhere were human qualities in such high demand as in the hotel, catering and tourism sector. The human skills and talent prevalent in the sector had also helped to overcome the differences of interest between the groups present at the Meeting, and to get to the results achieved. After thanking the secretariat for preparing and supporting the Meeting, as well as the Vice-Chairpersons and the spokespersons of the groups, the participants and everybody involved in the Meeting for their contribution, he declared the Tripartite Meeting on Human Resources Development, Employment and Globalization in the Hotel, Catering and Tourism Sector closed.

---

## Evaluation questionnaire

A questionnaire seeking participants' opinions on various aspects of the Meeting was distributed before the end of the Meeting.

**1. How do you rate the Meeting as regards the following?**

	5 Excellent	4 Good	3 Satis- factory	2 Poor	1 Unsatis- factory	Average score
The choice of agenda item (subject of the Meeting)	13	12				4.52
The points for discussion	11	10	3			4.33
The quality of the discussion	5	11	8			3.87
The Meeting's benefits to the sector	5	12	7			3.91
The conclusions	7	8	8			3.95
The resolutions	7	7	9			4.21
Panel discussion on social dialogue	5	12	3	1		4.00
Panel discussion on sustainable tourism development	4	14	2			4.10
Panel discussion on gender questions	5	11	1	1		4.11
Opportunity for networking	7	7	4		1	4.00

**2. How do you rate the quality of the report in terms of the following?**

	5 Excellent	4 Good	3 Satis- factory	2 Poor	1 Unsatis- factory	Average score
Quality of analysis	8	11	7			4.03
Objectivity	3	13	9			3.76
Comprehensiveness of coverage	7	12	5			4.08
Presentation and readability	7	14	4			4.12
Amount and relevance of information	7	11	5	1		4.00

**3. How do you consider the time allotted for discussion?**

	Too much	Enough	Too little
Discussion of the report		16	9
Panel discussions		16	6
Groups	1	15	5
Working Party on Resolutions	2	11	8
Working Party on Conclusions	3	9	8

**4. How do you rate the practical and administrative arrangements (secretariat, document services, translation, interpretation)?**

5 Excellent	4 Good	3 Satis- factory	2 Poor	1 Unsatis- factory	Average score
12	8	3			4.39

**5. Respondents to the questionnaire**

Government	Employers	Workers	Observers	Total	(Response rate 21%)
4	11	6	4	25	

**6. Participants at the Meeting**

Government	Employers	Workers	Technical advisers	Observers	Total
21	25	25	22	24	117

**7. Delegates/technical advisers**

	Government	Employers	Workers	Total
Delegates	21	25	25	71
Technical advisers	10	1	11	22

	Government	Employers	Workers	Total	% women
Delegates	8	6	8	22	31
Technical advisers	5	0	3	8	

---

**List of participants**  
**Liste des participants**  
**Lista de participantes**



---

Representative of the Governing Body  
of the International Labour Office  
Représentant du Conseil d'administration  
du Bureau international du Travail  
Representante del Consejo de Administración  
de la Oficina Internacional del Trabajo

Mr. Dietrich Willers, Unterabteilung Internationale Sozialpolitik, Bundesministerium für Arbeit und Sozialordnung, Bonn

Members representing governments  
Membres représentant les gouvernements  
Miembros representantes de los gobiernos

**ARGENTINA ARGENTINE**

Sr. Eduardo Varela, Misión Permanente de Argentina en Ginebra

**AUSTRIA AUTRICHE**

Ms. Iris Dembscher, Deputy Director, International Labour and Social Policy, Federal Ministry of Economic Affairs and Labour, Vienna

**BRAZIL BRÉSIL BRASIL**

Sr. Gilson Dayrell, Asesor del Ministro, Ministério del Trabajo y Empleo, Brasilia

**CANADA CANADÁ**

Mr. Luc Nadon, Director, Sectoral and Occupational Studies Division, Human Resources Partnerships, Human Resources Development, Ottawa

**CHINA CHINE**

Mr. Zhang Junfeng, Counsellor, Permanent Mission of China in Geneva

*Adviser/Conseiller technique/Consejero técnico*

Mr. Xu Jingsheng, Division Director, Industry Management Department, National Tourism Adm., Beijing

**DOMINICAN REPUBLIC RÉPUBLIQUE DOMINICAINE REPÚBLICA DOMINICANA**

S.E. Sr. Federico Alberto Cuello Camilo, Embajador, Representante Permanente, Misión Permanente de la República Dominicana en Ginebra

---

## **EGYPT EGYPT EGIPTO**

Mr. Mahmoud Talha, Head of the Department for the Supervision of Hotels and Touristic Villages, Egyptian Ministry of Tourism, Cairo

*Adviser/Conseiller technique/Consejera técnica*

M<sup>me</sup> Nadia El Gazzar, Conseillère des affaires du travail, Mission permanente d’Egypte à Genève

## **FRANCE FRANCIA**

M<sup>me</sup> Nathalie Aguetant, Chargée de mission à la mission des interventions sectorielles, Délégation générale à l’emploi et à la formation professionnelle, ministère de l’Emploi et de la Solidarité, Paris

*Adviser/Conseiller technique/Consejero técnico*

M. Bernard Maurin, Conseiller technique gouvernemental, ministère de l’Emploi et de la Solidarité, Paris

## **GREECE GRÈCE GRECIA**

Mr. Nicolas Tatsos, Chairman, Schools of Tourism Education, Athens

## **HUNGARY HONGRIE HUNGRÍA**

Ms. Anita Tanczer, Junior Expert, Ministry of Economic Affairs, Budapest

## **INDIA INDE**

Mr. Maddu Kuri G.V.K. Bhanu, Director, Department of Tourism, Ministry of Tourism and Culture, New Delhi

## **ITALY ITALIE ITALIA**

M. Luigi Trento, Direzione Generale dei Rapporti di Lavoro, Div. II, Affari Internazionali, Ministero del Lavoro e della Previdenza Sociale, Roma

## **JAPAN JAPON JAPÓN**

*Adviser/Conseiller technique/Consejero técnico*

Mr. Masaya Ojika, Counsellor, Permanent Mission of Japan in Geneva

## **KENYA**

Ms. Alice Akinyi Tabu, Deputy Labour Commissioner, Ministry of Labour and Human Resource Development, Nairobi

*Advisers/Conseillers techniques/Consejeros técnicos*

Mr. Mwakai Sio, Principal, Kenya Utalii College, Nairobi

Ms. Tabu Irina, First Secretary, Permanent Mission of Kenya in Geneva

## **MEXICO MEXIQUE MÉXICO**

Sr. Tomás Díaz Díaz, Misión Permanente de México en Ginebra

---

**MOROCCO MAROC MARRUECOS**

M<sup>me</sup> Zakia El Midaoui, Conseiller, Mission permanente du Maroc à Genève

**PHILIPPINES FILIPINAS**

Ms. Regina Irene P. Sarmiento, Labour Attaché, Permanent Mission of the Philippines in Geneva

**POLAND POLOGNE POLONIA**

Mr. Slawomir Skrzydlewski, Expert, Department of Tourism, Ministry of Economy, Warsaw

**PORTUGAL**

Sra. Maria Candida Soares, Directora Geral, Ministério do Trabalho e Solidariedade, Lisboa

*Adviser/Conseiller technique/Consejera técnica*

Sra. Maria Teresa Paccetti, Assessora Principal, Ministério do Trabalho e Solidariedade, Lisboa

**SOUTH AFRICA AFRIQUE DU SUD SUDÁFRICA**

Ms. Lindiwe Sangweni-Siddo, Chief Director Tourism, Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism, Pretoria

*Adviser/Conseiller technique/Consejera técnica*

Ms. Lindiwe Lusenga, Labour Attaché, Permanent Mission of South Africa in Geneva

**SPAIN ESPAGNE ESPAÑA**

Sr. Rodrigo García-Conde, Consejero Laboral y de Asuntos Sociales, Misión Permanente de España en Ginebra

*Adviser/Conseiller technique/Consejera técnica*

Sra. Raquel Calveras Augé, Inspectora Superior de Trabajo y Seguridad Social, Barcelona

**SWITZERLAND SUISSE SUIZA**

M. Daniel Veuve, Chef du Service juridique, Secrétariat d'Etat à l'Economie, Seco-Direction du travail, Berne

*Adviser/Conseiller technique/Consejero técnico*

M. Bertrand Clerc, Secrétariat d'Etat à l'Economie, Seco-Direction du travail, Berne

**Members representing the Employers**

**Membres représentant les employeurs**

**Miembros representantes de los empleadores**

M. Ayi Kanligan Ajavon, Président, Conseil national du patronat du Togo, Association des hôteliers et restaurateurs du Togo (ASHORESTO), Lomé

Mr. Michael Antoniou, Head, Industrial Relations and Labour Legislation Department, Cyprus Employers & Industrialists Federation (OEB), Nicosia

---

Ms. Patricia Butcher, Executive Director, Trinidad & Tobago Hospitality and Tourism Institute (TTHTI), Chaguaramas

Mr. Marinus L.W. Cordesius, Head, Policy Department, Koninklijke Horeca Nederland, An Woerden

Mr. Wilford Dambuleni, Executive Director, Employers' Consultative Association of Malawi, Blantyre

Sr. Ramón de Isequilla, Presidente, Liga de Fomento y Turismo de Punta del Este, Punta del Este

M. Albin Feliho, Directeur général, Groupe Vickinfel (Hôtellerie-restauration-tourisme), Cotonou

M. Alain-Philippe Feutré, Syndicat français de l'hôtellerie, Paris

Sr. Felipe Gaspart, Secretario General, Agrupación Hotelera de las Zonas Turísticas de España (ZONTUR), Palma de Mallorca

Ms. Maryann Geddes, Manager, Human Resources and Quality, Skyline Enterprises Limited, Queenstown

Sr. Oscar Alberto Ghezzi, Presidente, Federación Empresaria Hotelera Gastronómica de la República Argentina (FEHGRA), Buenos Aires

*Adviser/Conseiller technique/Consejero técnico*

Sr. Enrique Strega, Federación Empresaria Hotelera Gastronómica de la República Argentina (FEHGRA), Buenos Aires

Mr. Don Jones, Executive Director, Planning & Development, Jupiters Limited, Broadbeach, Queensland

Mr. Alfred Mallia-Milanes, Director-General, Malta Employers' Association (MEA), Valletta

Sra. Cristina Patricia Oddone, Federación Empresaria Hotelera Gastronómica de la República Argentina (FEHGRA), Buenos Aires

Ms. Katia Knipschildt Ostergaard, Personnel Manager, Head of Department, Social Affairs, Association of the Hotel, Restaurant & Tourism Industry (HORESTA), Frederiksberg C

Sr. Luis Pimentel Espino, Miembro Director, Consejo Nacional de la Empresa Privada (CONEP), Panamá

Mr. Mihai Rajnita, Secretary-General & CEO, Romanian Hotel Industry Federation (FIHR), Bucharest

M. M. Sen Ramsamy, Directeur, Association des hôteliers et restaurateurs (AHRIM), Port-Louis

Sr. Ricardo Rimoldi, Federación Empresaria Hotelera Gastronómica de la República Argentina (FEHGRA), Buenos Aires

Mr. Gaudenzio Rossi, Managing Director and Chairman, Hotels Association of Zambia, Zambian Federation of Employers, Garden Group of Hotels, Lusaka

Mr. Amphon Saay-Op-Oua, Director of Human Resources, Erawan Hotel Public Company Limited, Grand Hyatt Erawan, Bangkok

Ms. Shahida Sajjad, c/o Mr. Mustafa Sharif, Employers' Federation of Pakistan, Karachi

Sr. D. Valentín Ugalde, Secretario General, Federación Española de Hoteles, Madrid

Ms. Rose L. Wright, Director, Human Resources, ISSA Resort Collection, c/o Couples Negril, Negril Westmore Land

Mr. Dan Yarden, Chief Economist, Israel Hotel Association, Tel-Aviv

### Members representing the Workers

### Membres représentant les travailleurs

### Miembros representantes de los trabajadores

Ms. Deborah Anderson, Assistant Director of International Affairs, Hotel Employees & Restaurant Employees International Union (HERE), Boston

Mr. Jeff Carr, Deputy National Secretary, Australian Liquor, Hospitality & Miscellaneous Workers' Union, Torrensville Plaza, South Australia

- 
- Sra. Agustina Crespo Soto, Comisión Ejecutiva, Federación Regional de Asturias, Federación Estatal de Comercio, Hostelería y Turismo de Comisiones Obreras (FECOHT-CC.OO), Oviedo  
*Adviser/Conseiller technique/Consejero técnico*
- Sr. Fernando Medina, Comisión Ejecutiva, Federación Estatal de Comercio, Hostelería y Turismo de Comisiones Obreras (FECOHT-CC.OO), Madrid
- Ms. Ethrill Crichlow, Vice-President, Barbados Workers' Union (BWU), St.-Michael  
*Adviser/Conseiller technique/Consejero técnico*
- Mr. Phillip Bostic, Barbados Workers' Union (BWU), St.-Michael
- M. Thierry Dedieu, Secrétaire national, Fédération des services (CFDT), Pantin
- Ms. Vesna Dejanovic, President, Samostalni Sindikat Ugostitejstva i Turizma (SSUTH), Zagreb
- Mr. Mohamed El-Sharkawi, President, National Trade Union for Hotels & Tourism Workers (GTUHTW), Cairo  
*Advisers/Conseillers techniques/Consejeros técnicos*
- Mr. Ezzat Shawky Saadan, National Treasurer, National Trade Union for Hotels & Tourism Workers (GTUHTW), Cairo
- Mr. Yasser Alshinwi, Department of International Relations, National Trade Union for Hotels & Tourism Workers (GTUHTW), Cairo
- Mr. Nicos Epistithiou, General Secretary, Cyprus Hotel Employees' Federation (OEXEV-SEK), Nicosia
- M<sup>me</sup> Marie Alloulo Fiankan, Trésorière, Confédération des syndicats libres de Côte d'Ivoire (CIAGAH-CI), Abidjan
- M<sup>me</sup> Maria Antonia Franceschini, Secretaria Nazionale, FILCAMS-CGIL, Roma
- Mr. Napoleon D.K. Kpoh, General Secretary, ICU (TUC), Accra
- Ms. Tatiana Krylova, President, Commerce and Catering Workers' Union of Russia (CCCCWU), Moscow  
*Adviser/Conseiller technique/Consejero técnico*
- Mr. Kirill Buketov, Representative for Eastern Europe/Central Asia, Commerce and Catering Workers' Union of Russia (CCCCWU), Moscow
- Sr. Norberto Latorre, Secretaría de Finanzas, Unión Trabajadores Hoteleros Gastronómicos (UTHGRA), Buenos Aires  
*Adviser/Conseiller technique/Consejera técnica*
- Sra. Patricia Mantovano, Jefa Departamento Turismo, Unión Trabajadores Hoteleros Gastronómicos (UTHGRA), Buenos Aires
- Sr. Héctor Martínez Mora, Secretaría General, Agrupación Sindical Unica de Trabajadores y Empleados de la Industria Gastronómica, Hoteles, Moteles, Bares, Centros Nocturnos, Recreativos y Conexos (ASUTIG), México  
*Adviser/Conseiller technique/Consejera técnica*
- Sra. Rojas Guillermina López, Agrupación Sindical Unica de Trabajadores y Empleados de la Industria Gastronómica, Hoteles, Moteles, Bares, Centros Nocturnos, Recreativos y Conexos (ASUTIG), México
- Mr. Crispin Mbolela, President, Hotel Catering & Allied Workers' Union (HCAWUZ), Savoy Hotel, Buteko Avenue, Ndola
- Mr. Bijan Motae, Hotel and Restaurant Workers' Union (HRF), Stockholm
- Mr. Timoci Naivaluwaqa, General Secretary, National Union of Hotel & Catering Employees (NUHCE), Nadi Airport
- Ms. Eleanor P. Ogarte, President, National Union of Workers in Hotel, Restaurant and Allied Industries (NUWHRAIN), Manila
- Sr. José Justo Pepen Castillo, Secretario General, Federación Nacional de Trabajadores Hoteleros, Bares y Restaurantes (FENATRAHORETS), Higüey

---

Sr. Manuel Romero Peña, Presidente, Sindicato Nacional de Trabajadores Hoteleros, Turísticos, Alimentación, Similares, Conexos y Afines (SINTRA-HOSIVEN), Caracas

*Adviser/Conseiller technique/Consejero técnico*

Sr. Rubén Camacho Mora, Sindicato Nacional de Trabajadores Hoteleros, Turísticos, Alimentación, Similares, Conexos y Afines (SINTRA-HOSIVEN), Caracas

Mr. Hiroshi Sawada, President, Japan Federation of Leisure, Service Industries Workers' Unions, Tokyo

*Adviser/Conseiller technique/Consejera técnica*

Ms. Chizuko Kataoka, Executive Director of Women's Division, Japan Federation of Leisure, Service Industries Workers Unions, Tokyo

Mr. Klaus Schroeter, National Officer, National Secretary for the Hotel & Restaurant Branch, Gewerkschaft Nahrung-Genuss-Gaststätten (NGG), Hamburg

Mr. James Stamos, Hotel Employees & Restaurant Employees International Union (HERE), Canadian Regional Office, Montreal

Sr. Moacyr Roberto Tesch Auersvald, Director Presidente, Confederação Nacional dos Trabalhadores Em Turismo e Hospitalidade (CONTRATUH), Brasília

*Advisers/Conseillers techniques/Consejeros técnicos*

Sr. Rogério Cardoso Gomes, Confederação Nacional dos Trabalhadores Em Turismo e Hospitalidade (CONTRATUH), Brasília

Sr. Natal Léo, Coordenador, Confederação Nacional dos Trabalhadores Em Turismo e Hospitalidades (CONTRATUH), Brasília

Mr. George Wigley, Antigua Trades Labour Union, St. John's, West Indies

### **Others Autres Otros**

Representatives of member States present at the sittings

Représentants d'Etats Membres présents aux séances

Representantes de Estados Miembros presentes en las sesiones

### **UNITED STATES ETATS-UNIS ESTADOS UNIDOS**

Mr. Robert S. Hagen, Labor Attaché, United States Permanent Mission in Geneva

Representatives of the United Nations, specialized agencies  
and other official international organizations

Représentants des Nations Unies, des institutions spécialisées et d'autres  
organisations internationales officielles

Representantes de las Naciones Unidas, de los organismos especializados  
y de otras organizaciones internacionales oficiales

### **European Commission (EC)**

**Commission européenne**

**Comisión Europea**

M. Carlos Alberto Lopes, Administrateur, DG emploi et affaires sociales, Bruxelles

---

**World Tourism Organization (WTO)**

**Organisation mondiale du tourisme (OMT)**

**Organización Mundial del Turismo (OMT)**

Ms. Rosamond Deming, International Coordinator, Human Resource Development Programme, Madrid

Representatives of non-governmental international organizations

Représentants d'organisations internationales non gouvernementales

Representantes de organizaciones internacionales no gubernamentales

**General Confederation of Trade Unions (GCTU)**

**Confédération générale des syndicats**

Ms. Valentine Mitrofanova, Chairperson, All General Confederation of Trade Unions (VKP), Moscow

**Hotels, Restaurants and Cafés in Europe (HOTREC)**

Ms. Marguerite Sequaris, Secretary General, Brussels

Mr. Eric Dresin, Assistant, Brussels

**International Confederation of Free Trade Unions (ICFTU)**

**Confédération internationale des syndicats libres (CISL)**

**Confederación Internacional de Organizaciones Sindicales Libres (CIOSL)**

Mr. Dan Cunniah, Director, Geneva

Ms. Anna Biondi, Assistant Director, Geneva

**International Federation of University Women (IFUW)**

**Fédération internationale des femmes diplômées des universités**

**Federación Internacional de Mujeres Universitarias**

Ms. Eva Hansen, Bellevue

**International Hotel and Restaurant Association (IH&RA)**

**Association internationale de l'hôtellerie et de la restauration**

Mr. Anthony Pollard, Chairman, IH&RA National Association, Chief Executives' Council, Paris

---

**International Organization of Employers (IOE)**

**Organisation internationale des employeurs (OIE)**

**Organización Internacional de Empleadores (OIE)**

Mr. Jean Dejardin, Adviser, Cointrin/Geneva

**International Union of Food, Agricultural, Hotel, Restaurant, Catering, Tobacco  
and Allied Workers' Associations (IUF)**

**Union internationale des travailleurs de l'alimentation, de l'agriculture, de l'hôtellerie-  
restauration, du tabac et des branches connexes**

**Unión Internacional de Trabajadores de la Alimentación, Agrícolas, Hoteles,  
Restaurantes, Tabaco y Afines**

Mr. Patrick Dalban Moreynas, Coordinator for the HRCT Sector, Petit-Lancy

Ms. Jacqueline Baroncini, Petit-Lancy

Ms. Galina Yurova, Educational Officer, Moscow

Ms. Kerstin Howald, Tourism Sector Secretary, European Federation of Food, Agriculture and Tourism, Brussels

Mr. Nikolas Elomaa, Service Union United Finland, Helsinki

Ms. Jennifer Taylor, Education & Research Department, ICU, International Union of Food and Agriculture,  
Accra

M. Christian Juyaux, ETLC-UITA, Lyon

**Union Network International (UNI)**

Mr. Bob Ramsay, Department Head, Nyon

**World Confederation of Labour**

**Confédération mondiale du travail (CMT)**

**Confederación Mundial del Trabajo**

M<sup>me</sup> Béatrice Fauchère, Représentante permanente, Genève

**World Federation of Agriculture and Food Workers (WFAFW)**

**Fédération mondiale des travailleurs de l'agriculture et de l'alimentation**

**Federación Mundial de Trabajadores de la Agricultura y la Alimentación**

Sr. José Gómez Cerdá, Secretario General, Bruselas

Sr. Humphrey Mongen, Secretario General Adjunto, Curaçao

Sra. Antonia Pérez Martínez, Secretaria General Adjunta, Madrid

---

**Zonta International – International Service Organization of Executives  
in Business and the Professions**

Ms. Marie-Claire Seguret, Member UN Committee, Geneva