



INTERNATIONAL
INSTITUTE FOR
LABOUR STUDIES



International
Labour
Office

**Workshop on: “Participatory Governance:
A New Regulatory Framework?”
9-10 December 2005
IILS, Geneva**

**Elimane Kane Room, M3-South
(Room XII) - ILO Building**

I. Purpose

The workshop examined emerging innovations in participatory governance at the international, national and local levels. It drew inspiration from research that has been carried out in the Institute for the past few years and combined it with empirical and theoretical contributions from researchers around the world.

The underlying aim of this Workshop was to move the debates on participatory policy processes “beyond the hype” and towards a more critical, and possibly productive, approach. Most speakers were researchers with an empirical bend. The speakers produced written papers to be edited and collected in a collective book to be published by the Institute in the summer of 2006.

II. Structure of the Workshop

Panel 1: Different Conceptions of Governance and Public Participation

The concept of governance is not new. It has been around for quite some time in both political and academic discourse. Yet, it is not clear it is used in the same way by different academic disciplines (e.g., economics, political science, sociology, law). Also, it is not clear how innovative the concept really is. For example, participatory-policy making structures in which the state shares the public space with interest groups have existed for ages, especially in “corporatist” European countries. Participants in the opening panel were invited to discuss the various conceptualisations and approaches to governance, with a particular emphasis on participatory policy-making. Also, they were asked to provide their own view of why innovations in participatory governance have emerged, how they compare with past experiences, and what they imply for democratic theory and practice. Among the themes that were discussed in this panel were the following: a) history and evolution of the notion of participatory governance; b) the rationale for the establishment of participatory policy processes; c) policy areas to which participatory governance processes can be usefully applied; d) evidence of equity and efficiency effects or lack thereof; and d) the possible link between the ILO and participatory governance.

Chair: Jean-Pierre Laviee (IILS, Geneva, CH)

Speakers:

1. Philippe C. Schmitter (European University Institute, Florence, Italy)
Applying the 'Fuzzy' And 'Capacious' Notion of Governance
2. Balakrishnan Rajagopal (Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Boston, US)
The Problem with Participation: Governance, Civil Society and the Circle of Democracy

Discussant: Yannis Papadopoulos (University of Lausanne, CH)

Panel 2. Inclusive and Deliberative? Lessons from Different Modes of Participatory Governance

This panel was in many ways a continuation of the previous, with a focus on discussing how inclusive, participatory, and deliberative the new policy making fora really are, based on available empirical research.

Speakers:

1. Lucio Baccaro and Konstantinos Papadakis (IILS, Geneva, CH)
The Downside of Deliberative Public Administration
2. Bruno Jobert (Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique, Grenoble, France)
Beware of Forums!
3. Anne-Mette Kjær (Aarhus Universitet, Denmark)
Central Government Intervention as Obstacle to Local Participatory Governance: The Case of Uganda

Chair and Discussant: Steven Friedman (Rhodes University, Grahamstown, South Africa)

Panels 3. International Organizations and Participatory Governance: The Experiences of the World Bank, the EU, and the ILO

The emphasis here was on international organizations and the logic behind the promotion by international institutions of participatory governance ideas at the national or subnational level. The focus was on the Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSP) of the World Bank, the experience of the European Union's Economic and Social Committee (EESC) as well as the experience of the ILO as the only international organization with institutionalised participation of social actors.

Speakers:

1. Luca Barbone (Poverty Reduction Group, World Bank, Washington D.C.)
Strengthening Governance through Engaged Societies: Lessons from the Implementation of Poverty Reduction Strategies

2. Dirk Jarré (EESC, European Economic and Social Committee, Brussels)
European Participatory Governance and the Role of the European Economic and Social Committee (EESC)
3. Stephen Pursey (ILO, Office of the Director General, Geneva)
Governance of the Labour Market: Why Participation Is Indispensable
4. Konstantinos Papadakis (IILS, Geneva, CH)
Socially Sustainable Development and Public Participation: Is Procedure Enough?

Chair and Discussant: Balakrishnan Rajagopal (Massachusetts Institute of Technology, US)

Panel 4. Participatory Experiences in the South

This panel illustrated some of the more theoretical material discussed in the previous panels. It addressed the extent to which participatory approaches to policy making keep their promises in national and local contexts, with a focus on developing countries. The presentations were based on empirical research conducted in India (Kerala), Brazil, and South Africa.

Speakers:

1. Rebecca Abers (University of Brasília, Brazil)
Mobilizing the State: Participatory Governance, Cooptation and Democracy in Brazilian Water Policy
2. Patrick Heller (Brown University, Providence, Rhode Island, USA)
Building Local Democracy: Lessons from the Kerala, India
3. Steve Friedman (Rhodes University, Grahamstown, South Africa)
On Whose Terms? Participatory Governance and Citizen Action in Post-Apartheid South Africa

Chair and Discussant: Philippe C. Schmitter (European University Institute, Florence, Italy)

Panel 5. The Evolution of Tripartism

The purpose of this panel was to analyse the experiments where social dialogue structures have been opened up to the participation of other civil society structures and seek to understand whether institutional participation of these new actors has brought qualitative, or purely symbolic, changes. The focus was on the two most institutionalised tripartite-plus experiments at the national level, i.e., South Africa and Ireland.

Speakers:

1. Shakela Buhlungu (University of Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa)
Social Movements and Social Dialogue: Assessing the South African Model
2. Rory O'Donnell (National Economic and Social Council, Dublin, Ireland)
Ireland's Inclusive Social Partnership: Testing Models of Participation and Associative Governance

Chair and Discussant: Lucio Baccaro (IILS, Geneva, CH)

Panel 6. Participatory Governance and the Law

The panel examined the connection between participatory governance and the production of legal norms at the national, regional or international levels. Speakers were invited to do so by examining, from a national or international public law perspective, the legal dimension of governance and public participation, as opposed to that of more traditional forms of regulation (e.g., legislative, executive, judiciary; collective bargaining agreements etc.).

Speakers:

1. Jean-Claude Javillier (IILS, Geneva, CH)
Governance: A Contribution from the Perspective of Labour Law
2. Brian Langille (University of Toronto, Toronto, Canada)
The Non-Instrumental Limits of Participatory Governance
3. Edith Brown Weiss (Inspection Panel, World Bank, Washington D.C., US)
Accountability and Compliance: Listening to Affected Communities

Chair and Discussant: Cleo Doumbia-Henry (ILO, Geneva, CH)

Panel 7: Concluding Remarks

Speakers:

1. Gerry Rodgers (IILS, Geneva, CH)
2. Rebecca Abers (University of Brasília, Brazil)
3. Lucio Baccaro (IILS, Geneva, CH)
4. Rory O'Donnell (National Economic and Social Council, Dublin, Ireland)
5. Patrick Heller (Brown University, Providence, Rhode Island, USA)

Chair: Gerry Rodgers (IILS, Geneva, CH)

III. LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

1. Rebecca Abers, University of Brasilia, Brazil
2. Lucio Baccaro, IILS, ILO
3. Luca Barbone, Poverty Reduction Group, World Bank, Washington, USA
4. Edith Brown Weiss, Inspection Panel, World Bank, Washington, USA
5. Sakhela Buhlungu, University of Massachusetts, USA
6. Cleopatra Doumbia-Henry, International Labour Standards Department, ILO
7. Steven Friedman, Director, Centre for Policy Studies, Johannesburg, South Africa
8. Patrick Heller, Watson Institute, Brown University, USA

9. Dirk Jarré, European Economic and Social Committee, University of Linz, Austria
10. Jean-Claude Javillier, ILS, ILO
11. Bruno Jobert, CNRS, Grenoble, France
12. Anne Mette Kjær, Institut for Statskundskab, Denmark
13. Brian Langille, University of Toronto, Canada
14. Jean-Pierre Laviec, ILS, ILO
15. Rory O'Donnell, National Economic and Social Council, Dublin, Ireland
16. Konstantinos Papadakis, ILS, ILO
17. Yannis Papadopoulos, University of Lausanne, Switzerland
18. Steven Pursey, Office of the Director General, ILO
19. Balakrishnan Rajagopal, MIT, USA
20. Gerry Rodgers, Director, ILS, ILO
21. Philippe Schmitter, European University Institute, Italy