



**BealesGelber Consult
Inclusive Social Development**

EVALUATION

**UNITED NATIONS DIVISION OF INCLUSIVE SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT (DISA)
INTERNATIONAL LABOUR ORGANISATION (ILO)**

Achieving SDGs and Ending Poverty through Universal Social Protection

**Funded by
2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development Sub-Fund
United Nations Peace and Development Trust Fund**

August 2021

With special thanks to the staff members of UNDESA and ILO who shared their thoughts and opinions with honesty and frankness and to project participants in Cambodia and Pakistan who took the time to answer our questions.

George Gelber and Sylvia Beales

CONTENTS

GLOSSARY	2
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	3
1. INTRODUCTION	8
1.1. ILO/UNDESA partnership	8
1.2 Partner responsibilities	9
1.3 Budget allocations and changes	10
1.4 National and global relevance of the project	10
2. BACKGROUND	11
2.1 Social security institutions	11
2.1.1 Cambodia	11
2.1.2 Pakistan	11
2.2 Political context for the project	12
2.3 Role of ILO	13
2.4 COVID-19	14
2.4.1 How did the project respond to Covid-19?	15
3. METHODOLOGY	17
4. ACHIEVING SDGS AND ENDING POVERTY THROUGH UNIVERSAL SOCIAL PROTECTION - THE PROJECT	18
4.1 Capacity building through training	19
4.2 Direct Support	21
4.2.1 Cambodia	21
4.2.1 Pakistan	22
4.3 Advocacy, campaigning and awareness raising	22
4.4 Global component	23
5. FINDINGS	24
5.1 Did the project strengthen capacity for good governance of social protection in the project countries and globally?	24
5.1.1 Compliance	25
5.1.2 Data management	25
5.1.3 Coordination	26
5.2 Accountability and compliance with legal provisions	26
5.3 Did the project strengthen universal social protection in the project countries and globally?	27
5.4 Achievements of the overall project objectives/outcomes	28
5.4.1 Sustainability	28
5.5 Effectiveness of knowledge sharing & communication strategy in raising the profile of the project	29
5.6 Monitoring and evaluation and adaptive management	30
6. IMPACT	31
7. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	32
APPENDIX 1 – Interviews	35
APPENDIX 2 – Documents consulted	36
APPENDIX 3 – Answers to overview questions	39

GLOSSARY

EFP	Employers Federation of Pakistan
ESSI	Employees' Social Security Institution
GS	General Secretariat (of the National Social Protection Council, Cambodia)
ICT	Information and Communications Technology
ILO	International Labour Organisation
ITC	International Training Centre
ITC/ILO	ILO International Training Centre (Turin, Italy)
NSPC	National Social Protection Council – Pakistan
NSSF	National Social Security Fund – Cambodia
PASSD	Poverty Alleviation and Social Safety Division (Pakistan)
PWF	Pakistani Workers Federation
SDG	Sustainable Development Goal
UNDESA	United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs
USD	United States dollar

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The project, Achieving the SDGs and ending poverty through universal social protection, was implemented in Pakistan and Cambodia, between January 2019 and June 2021. This period includes a six month extension granted to take account of delays caused by the need to modify project activities in response to restrictions on face-to-face meetings and international travel due to the Covid-19 pandemic.

The project's objectives were to strengthen the capacity of the government in Cambodia and Pakistan to formulate, implement, monitor and evaluate national social security schemes in line with national development priorities, SDG commitments and international ILO standards and to respond 'to the growing need for awareness-raising at the global level as well as for the sharing of knowledge and ... bridging the gap in developing comprehensive overview of the best practices, tools and communication mechanisms for the good governance in the social protection systems and floors; and assisting countries to achieve the SDGs and eradicate poverty.'¹

Project partnership

The project is a unique partnership between the ILO and UNDESA which came about because the source of the funding for the project, the Peace and Development Trust Fund of the United Nations, financed by the Peoples Republic of China, can grant funding only to entities within the UN Secretariat. The ILO, headquartered in Geneva, is not within the UN Secretariat. Funding through the DESA for other UN member agencies is approved on an exceptional, case by case basis. The DESA is not an operational agency and the ILO, which is, have different management and institutional procedures.

Responsibilities within the project and their budget allocations were divided between UNDESA and ILO. In-country activities and their costs were entirely the responsibility of ILO together with three learning modules on coordination, ICT and data management and compliance. UNDESA's responsibility was to commission and publish the research papers on social protection, manage the ToRs and fees of international consultants, arrange and approve international travel and oversee the organisation and financing of the final international conference in Beijing. Joint oversight of the project was achieved through regular management meetings and shared reporting via Geneva and New York to the Manager of the Peace and Development Trust Fund.

A request was made for six month no-cost extension in December 2019 on the grounds that the project had made very little progress in Pakistan. This request was approved in June 2020. No mention of Covid-19 was made at the time. Mentions of adjustments made necessary by Covid-19 started to appear in project management correspondence later in the year.

¹ Project Document

Covid - 19

Covid 19 has had a dramatic impact on the activities and timing of the project. Most of the training in-country and through the ITC/ILO was moved online. The study tours to China and the final international conference in Beijing were cancelled. Replacing this final conference, two online workshops were held on 25th and 28th June, the first focusing on the technical aspects of Coordination, ICT and Data management and Compliance, and the second on global policy issues, with the participation of China. The consequence of the changes introduced in response to Covid-19 was that even before the project ended on 30th June 2021, the ILO had exhausted its share of the budget while a large proportion of UNDESA's share remained unspent. The conditions of the Peace and Development Fund require that any unspent funds at the end of the project be returned to the fund by December 2021.

Overview of the project

The principal national stakeholders in the project were the social security institutions of Cambodia and Pakistan together with the more recently created executive agencies which have responsibility and oversight of all social protection programmes, including some charitable programmes. These are the Poverty Alleviation and Social Safety Division in Pakistan, created in 2020, and the National Council for Social Protection with its General Secretariat in Cambodia, created in 2015. Both these bodies have ambitions to extend social protection beyond the formal sector.

In both countries a huge majority of workers are in the informal sector, 72% in Pakistan and 90% in Cambodia, and are excluded from any form of social security and may or may not have access to one or more of the many schemes of social assistance, some of which are run by non-governmental organisations. At the same time the formal social security institutions, which have evolved in a piecemeal fashion, acquiring new responsibilities often without the means to discharge them, struggle to work effectively.

The project sought to improve the efficiency and consistency of existing schemes in both countries and thereby extend the coverage of social security institutions, especially with regard to coordination, data collection and processing and compliance. The majority of the activities in both countries were training of managers and staff of social security institutions on social protection and data management; brokering connections between the institutions; the formation of national social security coordination forums; advocacy to increase social security coverage; and key investments in data collection and data processing. Manuals were developed in Pakistan to improve the registration of employees in social security institutions, and the project supported coordination and tripartite dialogue, advocacy and awareness raising on social protection in both countries.

Project outcomes included the development of practical guidance, three learning modules on the governance of social security – on coordination, ICT and data management and compliance – which will be available for the ILO's work with social security institutions around the world. Two are already in use by the ILO International Training Centre in Turin (ITC/ILO).

Chinese experience is seen as particularly relevant. Both countries are important participants in China's One Belt and One Road initiative and have much to learn from the deliberate and steady expansion of social protection in China. Study tours to China and the final international conference in Beijing were important elements of the original project proposal.

Among project achievements are –

- 14 managers and staff from Cambodia and over 32 from Pakistan (12 financed by the project and 22 by two other ILO projects) completed online ITC/ILO trainings. A further 230 took part in courses in-country (165 in Cambodia; 230 in Pakistan) and some are now acting as trainers of trainers. 250 employers were trained as a result of series of awareness raising sessions in Sindh.²
- In Pakistan all social security institutions covering the formal sector with issues of age, disability and informality are feeding their data to a central database which will be the basis for the national report on SDG 1.3 in 2022.
- A pilot project in extending social security to domestic workers in Punjab, a first attempt in Pakistan at extending social security to workers in the informal sector.
- The project finalised the design of the pensions scheme in Cambodia, to be rolled out in 2022.
- Awareness raising on social protection, as opposed to social security, and the building of confidence to progress from existing systems to more universal measures. For more detail on results see appendix.

The wider, global component of social protection was addressed by awareness raising and specifically by the research papers on the evolution of social protection in China, Argentina, Kenya and the small island states of Mauritius and Fiji. The research papers were to have been presented in the final workshop in China but were presented in a virtual workshop in May 2021 instead. They are available on the UNDESA website and the intention is to share and use them proactively.

Project delivery and impact assessment

The project has satisfactorily delivered its planned activities in the modified form imposed by Covid-19 restrictions. Just two are delayed, because of an upsurge of Covid-19 in Phnom Penh and one, the learning module on compliance, because it is undergoing final revision by legal experts. National stakeholders and partners in Cambodia and Pakistan have expressed their satisfaction with the training provided by the project and the ways in which it has practically contributed to improving the efficiency of social security institutions in both countries. These practical contributions include the SDG3.1 database, the Simplify manuals and handbooks and advocacy campaigns in Pakistan, and the development of the business case for the NSSF ICT system in Cambodia and the establishment of national social security coordination forums in both countries.

² Information gathered from Progress Report April-June 2021 and email communication with Pakistan project coordinator.

The five research papers on the evolution of social protection in China, Argentina, Kenya and the small island states of Mauritius and Fiji together with an overview paper, Global Research on Governance and Social Protection, constitute a valuable resource which should be used both to develop learning materials on social protection and raise awareness on the impact of social protection for sustainable development. The training modules have been very well received. The first module, on coordination, will be used to develop a new course on governance; the second, on ICT and data management is now required reading in the ITC/ILO course on leadership in social protection; and the third on compliance will underpin existing and future ITC/ILO courses. The lessons learned from this project will feed into the Framework for Action on social protection proposed at the June 2021 Intentional Labour Conference.

Nevertheless the full impact of the project will only become evident in years to come when the processes set in train by the project come to fruition, when social security managers and staff apply the knowledge and skills they have acquired in the training sessions organised by the project and, importantly, when political leaders take hard decisions about the resourcing of social protection.

Sustainability lies in the political commitment of the governments of both countries to modernise their social security systems and to begin the task of extending social protection to the millions of workers and households who have no protection at all. The seriousness with which the managers and staff of the social security and social protection agencies have engaged with the project is a good indication that the training and other investments of the project will not be wasted. The active presence of the ILO in both countries, the continuation of its Flagship project and its commitment to supporting universal social protection through its in-country and global work are key factors going forward. UN agencies and donors in Pakistan and Cambodia are supporting social protection.³ The potential to engage China in follow up is important; all stakeholders in Cambodia and Pakistan as well as the ILO and DESA regret that it was not possible for the study tours to take place and to hold the final conference in China. South-South learning on social protection, of which the Chinese experience is an significant, is an essential element in helping countries progress towards universal social protection, in line with ILO standards and the SDGs.

Conclusions and Recommendations

The scale of the challenges that lie ahead should not be underestimated. The immediate question is how the achievements of the project can be consolidated. It has provided tools and training, brought about progress in national coordination and generated knowledge and commitments and future progress is now the hands of national stakeholders.

The speed with which the processes started by the project will move forward will also depend to some extent on the assistance that is available to the institutions responsible for them and the resources on which such assistance depends. In both countries concerns have been voiced about the need for follow up, not so much in the form of a second full scale project, but more

³ See Pakistan One United Nations Programme III (OP III) 2018-2022

the ability principally of the ILO to provide continuing advice, encouragement and technical assistance and to participate in and facilitate meetings. This is especially the case in Cambodia.

Follow up with and through China has been singled out as important. There have been substantial savings in UNDESA's share of the budget because the study tours to China and the final international conference in Beijing were cancelled. While it is understood that these savings are to return to the Trust Fund, thought should be given to a future initiative, possibly with a new application to the Fund, which will consolidate the achievements of the project, ensuring significant input from China on a par with its participation in the original project. Efforts should also be made to ensure good use of the knowledge products – the research papers and the modules – to support the ILO's Plan of Action on universal social protection systems called for by the International Labour Conference.

We have noted that the different institutional procedures of the two agencies created bottlenecks, particularly in reporting and budget adjustments, but that these were overcome and that relations between the agencies remain excellent. Learning from this constitutes the basis for even more effective cooperation between UN agencies. The UNDESA/ILO partnership worked well, with good will on both sides, playing to the strengths of each agency, and could be a model for collaboration between UN agencies in the future. It has enabled the Peace and Development Trust Fund to provide important support to sustainable development and the achievement of the SDGs.

We therefore recommend that

- careful thought be given to renewing this partnership, possibly through a Phase 2, to consolidate and build on the progress made, making full use of the learning tools developed and, importantly, ensuring the full engagement of the People's Republic of China.
- that this be linked to the Plan of Action on universal social protection called for by the International Labour Conference.
- that the research papers be edited and purposed for teaching.
- that progress be made in the streamlining of bureaucratic procedures between agencies.

1. INTRODUCTION

‘Social Protection is the most practical tool to make a difference to countries and their people.’ Wenyan Yang Chief Social Development branch UNDESA

The 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development Sub-Fund of the UN Peace and Development Trust Fund financed the project through a partnership between the ILO and UNDESA. The project took place between 1st December 2018 and 30th June 2021. The project had originally been scheduled to last two years but, owing to slow progress in Pakistan, a no-cost extension of six months was added, extending the project to the middle of 2021. Responsibilities within the project and the corresponding budget allocations were divided between UNDESA and the ILO.

The primary aim of the project is described in the project document (2018) ‘...to strengthen the capacity of the government in Cambodia and Pakistan to formulate, implement, monitor and evaluate national social security schemes.’ Training and capacity building in Cambodia and Pakistan on better governance and coordination, improved data management, and better compliance with social security laws are at the heart of the project, with the ILO in each country playing a catalytic role in bringing key actors on social protection together and raising awareness of and interest in social protection. Work in country was supported by lesson learning and training tools. In the words of the project document, the project was to have ‘an important role in bridging the gap in developing comprehensive overview of the best practices, tools and communication mechanisms for the good governance in the social protection systems and floors; and assisting countries to achieve the SDGs and eradicate poverty.’

Key objectives described by the ILO were to:

- Demonstrate the importance of coordination of national systems, specifically between the stakeholders concerned with employment and social policies at national and federal levels
- Show how good governance comes about by coordination rather than the scattering of efforts
- Showcase south-south support with China, not only with finance but knowledge and technical input
- Illustrate the role of the ILO to be the broker of information and expertise on social protection between countries (as well as within them through the national programme)

1.1. ILO/UNDESA partnership

The idea for the project ‘Achieving SDGs and ending poverty through universal social protection’ (hereinafter ‘the project’) arose from discussions between senior officials in the ILO and UNDESA in New York. The proposal was subsequently agreed between ILO Geneva and the China Mission, and was submitted to the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development Sub-Fund of the UN Peace and Development Trust Fund, which is financed by the People’s Republic of China. Support from this fund is limited to entities within the United Nations Secretariat, with support to UN agencies (such as the ILO) possible only through a specific partnership set up on a case by case basis. In order to access funding from the Sub-Fund, therefore, a partnership

was formed with DESA (UN Department for Economic and Social Affairs). This partnership divided responsibilities within the project and its budget between the two partner institutions.

Both Pakistan and Cambodia, as near neighbours of China, are participants in the One Belt and One Road initiative of China. Most importantly, however, the “Chinese experience in extending social security to all, including through improved coordination between central and provincial levels, one stop shops for social protection that bring services close to the people, improved management information systems, and using inspection systems to increase compliance, is very relevant for both Cambodia and Pakistan.”⁴ China has demonstrated successful social protection expansion in the areas of health protection, old age pensions and social assistance. This experience is very interesting to countries in ASEAN and more widely.

In the design of the project China was singled out as one of the most striking and successful experiences of the extension of social protection, especially in the areas of health protection, old age pensions and social assistance. The relevance of the China experience for both Cambodia and Pakistan was built into the project with the expectation that on-site lesson learning would happen in China through consultants, study tours and a final global workshop in Beijing. The paper on the evolution of social protection was written by Chinese academics, led by Professor Hong MI (Team Leader, *Center for Non-traditional Security and Peaceful Development Studies*).

While the plans for detailed involvement of China had to be modified in response to Covid-19, (consultancies, the on-site study tours and the global workshop in China could not take place), China still played an important role in the final virtual conferences of the project. The two online workshops which were substituted for the final conference in China drew in over 150 participants from the region and further afield, and the experience of China was shared through this process.

1.2 Partner responsibilities

The ILO had responsibility for the in-country work in Cambodia and Pakistan, drawing on its long experience in both countries and international leadership on social protection issues. The ILO supported the capacity building of social protection institutions in both countries through national training and by enabling 24 social security officials and policy makers⁵ to attend on ILO/ITC online courses run by its E-Campus training centre in Turin. In Pakistan the ILO also supported information campaigns and media work on social protection in both countries and put in place a pilot for informal domestic workers in the Punjab. The purpose of this pilot project was to explore how domestic workers could enjoy comparable benefits to workers in the formal economy, in the wake of a study in Punjab supported done by the project. There are plans to support domestic worker pilots in different provinces in the light of this experience.

⁴ Ibid.

⁵ 14 managers and staff from Cambodia and over 32 from Pakistan (10 financed by the project and 22 by two other ILO projects) completed ITC/ILO courses

The project's global component, which is the responsibility of UNDESA, is aimed at lesson learning from low- and middle-income countries for universalising social protection. Five background research papers and three learning modules - on coordination, information communication technology and data management, and compliance - have been produced. One of these (information technology and data management) is now required reading on ITC/ILO course on leadership in social security.

1.3 Budget allocations and changes

The total approved budget of the project was USD 1,249,467 shared between ILO (USD 746,014) and UNDESA (USD 503,453), with an additional 3% support costs (USD 26,218) allocated to UNDESA. Responsibilities within the budget were divided as follows: most, but not all, international consultants' fees and international travel were the responsibility of UNDESA, together with most of the budgets of the research papers (73%) and the international conference to be held in Beijing (83%). The budget had to be revised when the project was restructured in response to restrictions on international travel imposed in response to Covid-19. At the end of April 2021, with two months of project activities yet to take place, the ILO had exhausted all of its approved budget while UNDESA was left with unspent funds of USD 340,577, 68% of its original approved budget.⁶

1.4 National and global relevance of the project

The project derives from and is consistent with the global consensus that social protection plays a key role in achieving sustainable development, as it promotes good governance, social justice, reduces poverty and vulnerability across the life course, and reduces income inequality by raising household incomes of the poorest. Social protection is the third target of Goal 1 of the SDGs - 'Implement nationally appropriate social protection systems and measures for all, including floors, and by 2030 achieve substantial coverage of the poor and the vulnerable.'

Social protection is a human right, enshrined in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948), the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (1966), and in other major United Nations human rights instruments. Social protection floors, a key component of SDG 1, target 3, the recommendation for which was made in 2012 for ILO member states, are 'nationally defined sets of basic social security guarantees that should ensure, as a minimum that, over the life cycle, all in need have access to essential health care and to basic income security which together secure effective access to goods and [services defined as necessary at the national level.](#)' ILO members reaffirmed their commitment to social protection at the International Labour Conference in June 2021.

⁶ Budget figures taken from Proposed Budget Breakdown, submitted 30 April 2021. Progress Report April - June 2021 show ILO with expenditure to date of US \$687,993.88 (actuals only, awaiting final financial statement – utilisation rate - 92.2% tbc with financial statement after closing all POs) and UNDESA with expenditure of US \$207,724.43 (utilisation rate - 84.07% of released funds)

2. BACKGROUND

Cambodia and Pakistan share common characteristics. In both countries the great majority of the working population is in the informal sector and is not covered by social protection. In Pakistan 75.6 per cent of agricultural workers and 68.1 per cent of urban workers are informal,⁷ and in Cambodia workers in the informal economy represent 90 per cent of the labour force.⁸ While a significant number of these workers and their families receive some social assistance on the grounds of extreme poverty, the only workers enrolled at least partially in the social security system are civil servants and formal economy workers in the private sector. In both countries social protection expenditure represents about 1.3% of GDP.^{9 10} Pakistan is a large country with an area of 881,913 square kilometres and a population of 225 million. It was estimated in 2008 that 3.33% of the population of Pakistan had access to at least one social protection programmes.¹¹ Cambodia is, smaller with an area of 181,585 square kilometres and a population of almost 17 million.

2.1 Social security institutions

2.1.1 Cambodia

In Cambodia the institution directly responsible for social security is the National Social Security Fund (NSSF), set up in 2007. The NSSF started as a department of the Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training to become 10 years later an institution with more than 1,000 staff serving almost two million workers around the country through various provincial branches. The umbrella body for social protection is the National Social Protection Council (NSPC), set up in 2017, constituted by ministers or their representatives from 12 different ministries and chaired by the Minister of Economy and Finance. The General Secretariat of the NSPC, set up in 2018, acts as its executive arm. The NSPC has oversight of all social protection activities including emergency relief and cash support for persons with disabilities. The NSPC has ambitions to develop programmes of support for older persons, school feeding, primary and secondary education scholarships for children from poor and vulnerable families and pregnancy and child protection.¹²

2.1.2 Pakistan

In Pakistan responsibility for social security is devolved to its four provinces and the federal territory of Islamabad, with each province having its own social security institution, e.g. Punjab Employees Social Security Agency - PESSI etc. At the national level, with the creation of Ehsaas, the government is seeking to coordinate the country's many social protection and social

⁷ ILO website, citing figures from 2017/18 labour force survey.

<https://www.ilo.org/islamabad/areasofwork/informal-economy/lang--en/index.htm> . Accessed 18 07 2021

⁸ UNDESA Project Document. Page 9.

⁹ Project Document pp. 8 & 10

¹⁰ In Pakistan the percentage of GDP spent on social protection rises if government expenditure on military and civil service pensions is included and falls if it is excluded. See ILO Mapping Social Protection Systems in Pakistan.

https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---asia/---ro-bangkok/---ilo-islamabad/documents/publication/wcms_737630.pdf

¹¹ Project Document. Page 10.

¹² National Social Protection Council website. <https://nspc.gov.kh/social-assistance-cambodia>. Accessed 20 07 2021

assistance programmes and projects. Ehsaas is an initiative rather than an institution. It has 268 policy areas, a vision for social protection and brings together a wide range of agencies. Its four pillars are - Countering elite capture and strengthening good governance; Safety nets; Human capital; and Creating jobs and livelihood opportunities. The government body responsible for Ehsaas is the Poverty Alleviation and Social Safety Division (PASSD), now popularly known as the Ehsaas Ministry. Ehsaas target groups are the extreme poor, orphans, widows, the homeless, persons with disabilities, the jobless, poor farmers, labourers, the sick who risk medical impoverishment, the undernourished; students from low-income backgrounds and poor women and older citizens. Ehsaas aims to deliver benefits through 'one window' offices and bank branches, which will have access to the national database. Beneficiaries will identify themselves with a fingerprint. Policy on social protection in Ehsaas is led by the 14-member Labour Welfare and Social Protection Experts Group on which the ILO, World Bank and Asian Development Bank have representatives.

2.2 Political context for the project

Political will is essential for progress on social protection. The governments of both countries have shown interest in extending social protection to the majority of their citizens. In December 2017 Pakistan was already completing its first National Mapping Study on Social Protection Programmes in line with the Social Protection Floor concept and held a subsequent National Dialogue on adopting universal social protection system. The findings of the Mapping Study and the Consultation would become the foundation to take forward work for promoting social protection floors in Pakistan during the project. In Cambodia the two NSSF social protection schemes of employment injury and healthcare, both contributory schemes, have been functioning since 2017-18. The project advanced work on Cambodia's contributory pension scheme, building on an earlier project, Policy, design and actuarial assessments of the national pension,¹³ which concluded in December 2018. It was originally planned that the pensions scheme would be launched in July 2020 but, due to Covid-19, it was decided to postpone the launch to 2021. With Covid-19 continuing to cause problems, however, it was decided in June 2021 to postpone the launch to early 2022.

Both countries have also demonstrated political commitment by putting in place multiyear programmes for social protection extension and conducting important needs assessments¹⁴ to anchor programme rollout. This interest was sharpened by the Covid-19 pandemic during which they, like governments worldwide, implemented unprecedented measures to control the spread of the virus and to mitigate the impact of these measures, principally lockdowns, on millions of their citizens. The crisis also highlighted the fragmentary nature of their existing

¹³ See ILO website. <https://www.ilo.org/DevelopmentCooperationDashboard/#b4ehqif>

¹⁴ In Pakistan in December 2017, the first National Mapping Study on Social Protection Programmes in line with Social Protection Floor concept was completed and a National Dialogue on adopting universal social protection system was organized. The findings of this Mapping Study and Consultation would become foundation to take forward work for promoting social protection floors in Pakistan. ILO. Mapping Social Protection Systems in Pakistan. https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---asia/---ro-bangkok/---ilo-islamabad/documents/publication/wcms_737630.pdf

systems as well as the value of having ILO as a long term partner actively engaged in capacity building for strengthened social protection system building.

Both Cambodia and Pakistan are members of the ILO and are signatories to the 2030 Agenda. They have both signalled their intention to extend social protection coverage in line with SDG 1 target 3 and make significant progress on the SDG targets specifically listed in the project document.

The project will contribute directly to six SDG targets, namely ---

- SDG 1.3 (Implement nationally appropriate social protection systems and measures for all, including floors, and by 2030 achieve substantial coverage of the poor and the vulnerable), SDG 3.8 (Achieve universal health coverage, including financial risk protection, access to quality essential health-care services and access to safe, effective, quality and affordable essential medicines and vaccines for all).
- SDG 5.4 (gender equality).
- SDG 8.5 (decent work for all and sustainable economic growth).
- SDG 10.4 (reducing inequalities, all specifically highlight social protection).
- SDG 16.6 (Develop effective, accountable and transparent institutions at all levels).

It also contributes to the objectives of the Third Decade for the Eradication of Poverty i.e. “Accelerating global actions for a world without poverty”.

2.3 Role of ILO

The ILO is operational in both countries, with six current projects in Pakistan¹⁵ and eight in Cambodia, and already had significant experience and knowledge of working with social security institutions in each country on various aspects of social protection. Both countries are part of the ILO Flagship programme on social protection¹⁶ (see box). In both countries the absence of a national framework for social protection and lack of coordination between different federal and provincial social protection programmes had been identified as key obstacles to extending social protection coverage.

A Flagship programme to support social protection for all

The ILO’s Global Flagship Programme will contribute to the achievement of Sustainable Development Goal 1.3 to “implement nationally appropriate social protection systems and measures for all, including floors”. The Programme aims to:

- Support governments, workers’ and employers’ confederations, and civil society organizations in 21 countries, in collaboration with other UN agencies, to define and implement tailor-made and functional social protection floors.
- Contribute to the Global Campaign for Social Protection Floors by developing and sharing knowledge, thus promoting the ILO’s values and standards.

¹⁵ ILO in Pakistan website. <https://www.ilo.org/islamabad/whatwedo/projects/lang--en/index.htm>. Accessed 27 07 2021

¹⁶ <https://www.social-protection.org/gimi/gess/Flagship.action>

In Pakistan, under the UN Development framework, the ILO leads social protection work. In July 2018 the newly elected government quickly started work on the Ehsaas initiative which was officially launched on 27 March 2019. Ehsaas, (the Urdu word for compassion), is seeking to bring some coordination to the patchwork of existing official and charity social assistance and social protection measures under its umbrella. Its slogan is 'social protection for all' – focused on jobs, shelter and decreasing vulnerabilities of the masses. At the outset of the project there were some 50 institutions in Pakistan managing different forms of social assistance and social protection, and four social security programmes for workers, all working in isolation. There was duplication of data, the quality of social protection governance was not good and workers in the informal economy were not included.

The ILO national project coordinator, Rabia Razzaque, joined the project in 2020 after working closely with Ehsaas. This experience enabled her to bring a range of agencies together on social protection with the Minister in Charge, Dr Sania Nishtar, Special Assistant to the Prime Minister. Through this alignment the UN as a whole was able to give inputs into the national programme under Ehsaas, and was able to bring in expertise to help Ehsaas set priorities.

Cambodia is already more than half way through its 2016-2025 National Social Protection Policy Framework, coordinated by the National Social Protection Council. By 2019, in Cambodia, the NSSF had grown organically in response to different demands starting with insurance and was responsible for a range of different schemes, which led to duplication and overlap. The increase in the responsibilities of the NSSF is putting a strain on NSSF's ability to effectively manage its new benefit types and branches. For this reason, it was clear a systematic and strategic approach to its entire business was needed to ensure effectiveness, efficiency, and good service to contributors and beneficiaries - in other words, modernisation.

In both countries, therefore, there was overlap, duplication, inefficiency and gaps in coverage which reduced the impact of the social protection schemes that were in place. However, these problems were recognised and there was commitment to deal with them. This has enabled to ILO both to support ongoing capacity building and to play a catalytic role in bringing different stakeholders together; in the case of Pakistan to create the National Social Coordination Security Forum, which is now very advanced, doing very well and, bringing the different partners together and supporting synergy between them; in the case of Cambodia rationalising and professionalising the NSSF, consolidating the sections dealing with different schemes (thus eliminating duplication and overlap), and making it more client focused.

2.4 COVID-19

COVID-19 affected the project in a number of ways, the major consequence being cancellations of study tours to China and the final international conference which was to be held in Beijing. At the national level, however, the pandemic highlighted the need for social protection. Both Pakistan and Cambodia introduced cash transfer programmes to mitigate the impact of lockdowns. Covid-19, however, also acted as a stimulus to social protection, as it threatened to throw millions of already poor households into complete destitution.

Given the poor coverage of existing social assistance programmes and in the absence of any form of systematic social protection for the most vulnerable and marginalised people, Covid-19 cast a harsh light on inequality and poverty. Dr Sania Nishtar calculated that over 162 million Pakistanis were put at risk of destitution by the pandemic.¹⁷

In Pakistan, the first payments under Ehsaas were made in April 2020, by which time over 30 million applications had been made to the fund.¹⁸ 15 million families (approximately 109 million people) judged to be at risk of extreme poverty received emergency cash grants through Ehsaas.¹⁹ Since July 2020, the Royal Government of Cambodia has introduced seven stimulus measures to mitigate the socio-economic impacts of the COVID-19 pandemic. They include cash transfers to about 700,000 of the poorest and most vulnerable households, who were hit the hardest by the pandemic.²⁰

Covid 19 gave urgency and extra political relevance to the project but the restrictions put in place to prevent the spread of the virus required the project organisers and national partners to make very significant adjustments to the planned work programme. The cancellation of international travel and restrictions on face-to-face meetings meant that it was not possible to conduct the in person trainings and workshops that had been envisaged, to go ahead with the study tour to China, or to end the project with the round table meeting in Beijing with the participation of experts from the region and further afield. Budget adjustments were drawn up at the end of 2020 to enable a shift to virtual training and to make in-person capacity building compliant with covid restrictions. Most training courses and workshops took place online.

These changes meant that by 2021 ILO's share of the budget was spent more or less in full and that some call had to be made on its regular budget. In contrast, a large proportion of UNDESA's share of the budget, allocated to international consultants and travel, together with the China study tour and final round table, remained unspent.

2.4.1 How did the project respond to Covid-19?

The evaluators explored the impacts of Covid-19 on project activities in the spirit of lesson learning. Informants were unanimous that while nothing can replace face to face meetings, and the reliance in internet connections can bring many challenges, there were cost benefits and a beneficial focus on national experience. The modifications gave extra importance to the development of the training manuals used nationally, such as SIMPLIFY, and the virtual meetings which brought together smaller groups of participants on a regular basis.

¹⁷ Dr Sania Nishtar. Introductory note to Mazdoor Ka Ehsaas

¹⁸ Dunya News website. 09 April 2020 <https://dunyanews.tv/en/Pakistan/540378-Payments-under-Ehsaas-Emergency-Cash-program-begin>. Accessed 12 07 2021

¹⁹ World Bank. Social Protection and Jobs Responses to COVID-19: A Real-Time Review of Country Measures. Living Paper, Version 15 (14 May 2021) <https://documents1.worldbank.org/curated/en/281531621024684216/pdf/Social-Protection-and-Jobs-Responses-to-COVID-19-A-Real-Time-Review-of-Country-Measures-May-14-2021.pdf> Accessed 19 07 2021

²⁰ UNDP website. 3 June 2021. Cambodia COVID-19 And Social Protection - Responses And Lessons Learned. <https://www.asia-pacific.undp.org/content/rbap/en/home/presscenter/pressreleases/2021/cambodia-covid-19-and-social-protection---responses-and-lessons-.html> Accessed 11 July 2021

In Pakistan, WhatsApp groups have been set up with those who have been trained which are used to exchange news and policy ideas. In Cambodia training sessions were moved online because of Covid-19, with some rescheduled to take place in the months of the project extension. The ITC/ILO training also was held online in June 2021. Because of travel restrictions within Cambodia as well as internationally, some resources were reallocated to support for NSSF. This included the business case exercise, devised to enable the NSSF to weigh the costs and benefits of different decisions on the investments that had to be made to modernise its systems of collection and processing of data (ICT).

Response to national training - PAKISTAN

“There were total of two trainings organized, one training which was on the orientation pack, SIMPLIFY, it was the training of some of the key focal persons of PESSI. After finalization of the orientation pack, Training of Trainers was organized on zoom which in turn was a very unique idea in my opinion. All 20-Directorates Deputy Directors of PESSI participated in the training of trainers training. This training was very useful in making the trainees equipped of the knowledge and skills of becoming trainers for their further staff.

These two trainings were very useful in terms of both orientation on the simplified version of social security as well as the efforts that these trainings made to urge the trainees to become master trainers initiating a sustainable, trickle down way of training social security staff and employers and workers.

I definitely have been able to pass on the material of the training to the staff underneath me. Also the directors, deputy directors, and inspectors of social security directorates were able to attend the training of trainers. Now as a result of this training they are equipped with the skillset and knowledge to train the social security staff, employers and employees further. PESSI will ensure that those master trainers make the best out of their training and disseminate the contents of the Simplify orientation pack and convey the message to further stakeholders.”

Response to evaluator questionnaire

Even though participants in training sessions regretted that it was not possible to meet in person and missed the informal conversations that normally take place at meal times and in breaks during workshop day and can contribute to team building, those who were interviewed or responded to online questionnaires were very positive in their assessments of the training provided. The ITC/ILO worked quickly with ISSA to move the residential courses online and adapt the training with dedicated online tutors, course work, peer to peer marking of final presentations, and quizzes. Courses are now six weeks online with two big meet ups (beginning and end) with two live sessions a week with an assigned tutor. Participants from Cambodia stated that after each training participants shared their learning with senior officers and staff and apply it. Training received on social protection ‘has helped colleagues understand

that social protection includes both social assistance and social security. Colleagues had thought that social security was social protection.’²¹

Both ILO staff and local stakeholders said that the omissions that were felt most keenly were the cancellation of the study visits to China and the final conference which was to have taken place in Beijing. Even though the webinars on 25th and 28th June were both well attended and well received, they inevitably could not have the same impact for participants. These cancellations also meant that participants did not have the benefit of learning *in situ* about the Chinese experience of social protection – ably laid out in the paper ‘Coordination and implementation of social protection systems in China’ – from which both social protection institutions in Cambodia and Pakistan have much to learn.

3. METHODOLOGY

Both UNDESA and ILO made all documentation in their possession available to the evaluators. Further documentation was made available by some interviewees. Key documentation studied includes four progress reports for the periods January-March 2020, April-September 2020, October 2020-March 2021 and April-30 June 2021, the in-country and ITC/ILO training materials, background documentation about the Fund and email traffic, sustainability notes made available from Pakistan and the material prepared by Development Pathways. The evaluators attended the online meetings on 25th and 28th June.

The evaluators therefore have had access to all, or almost all, the materials and reports produced in the 30 month duration of the project. The most significant of these documents are listed in Appendix 2.

The evaluators interviewed 15 ILO and UNDESA staff based in New York, Geneva, Turin, Cambodia and Pakistan together with national stakeholders from both countries and one of the senior researchers of Development Pathways. Interviewees and dates are listed in Appendix 1. Interviewees were more than generous with their time and helpful with requests for information and verification of details. Notes are available on request of all the interviews. All but one of those approached responded for interview.

The evaluators relied on the project’s progress reports and on interviewees for factual information on achievements. When judgments were made about the success and difficulties encountered, these were confirmed or otherwise with interviewees. Interviews with course participants did not elicit any critical comments about their courses.

The evaluators supplemented the above with detailed searches of ILO documentation on the Pakistan and Cambodia and relevant global material to do with the SDGs and the Social Protection Floor.

²¹ ILO interview

4. ACHIEVING SDGS AND ENDING POVERTY THROUGH UNIVERSAL SOCIAL PROTECTION THE PROJECT IN DETAIL

In the words of the Project Document, “The main objective of the project is to strengthen the capacity of the government in Cambodia and Pakistan to formulate, implement, monitor and evaluate national social security schemes, and contribute to the global knowledge base to promote experience-sharing and learning.”²²

The project has three components: the first two are sets of ILO-led national activities in Cambodia and Pakistan focused on capacity building and support to their social security institutions for rationalisation and modernisation. The third, global component, funded from the UNDESA budget, is the development and provision of materials for wider, global learning and teaching; and the organisation of a concluding conference. The preparation of three modules for wider learning was a joint activity of ILO and Development Pathways, funded principally from the ILO’s share of the approved budget.

Nine activities were planned for each country. All nine activities in Pakistan are described as ‘completed’ in the final Progress Report (April – June 2021). Activity A2.4, a study tour to China and one other country for eight persons was replaced by a study on the extension of health coverage to retirees and families of trans-provincial workers and a virtual consultation held to reach consensus on the most viable option for ensuring extension of social security benefits to the two groups.²³

Seven of the nine activities in Cambodia are described as ‘fully delivered’, with two delayed due to a surge in Covid-19 cases restrictions on meetings in Phnom Penh in 2021. Activity A1.9, the study visit to China and Cambodia, was replaced by a Visioning Retreat on Social Security involving tripartite stakeholders and civil society organisations. The aim was to improve communication and foster a collaborative relationship between the General Secretariat of the NSPC and NSSF and to reach agreement on a common vision of Social Security jointly developed by GS-NSPC, NSSF, and representatives of employer and worker associations.

There has been widespread satisfaction with this retreat, with a senior official in Cambodia describing it “very important. It brought together the Gen Secretary of the NSSF with senior officers of the national council. Members of the Board now have a more mature understanding of the roles different people and Ministries play, and got answers to lots of questions. We would like to hold more retreats to bring in more people.”

The five research papers on social protection have been written and delivered and can be found on the UNDESA website. The papers are an important contribution to the literature on

²² Project Document. Page 3

²³ ILO website. Stakeholder consensus on extending health care benefits to retired workers and families of trans-provincial workers. https://www.ilo.org/islamabad/info/public/pr/WCMS_814293/lang--en/index.htm%20.

social protection extension and could, indeed should, be made available more widely in due course. The final conference in Beijing was cancelled and replaced by two international webinars on 25th and 28th June. Two of the three modules have been completed: the first, on coordination, will be the basis of a new course on governance, the second on data is now required reading within the ITC/ILO course on Leadership in Social Protection, and the third, on Compliance, is being reviewed by legal experts and will be published in September.

4.1 Capacity building through training

Planned training included courses conducted by ITC/ILO in Turin, visits to China and in-country workshops and training sessions. After the onset of Covid, most training activities were redesigned to take place online while training involving international travel on the part of participants or consultants was cancelled and replaced by online webinars and workshops.

Participants in the different forms of training were from existing social security institutions. Emphasis was placed on coordination, data collection and management and compliance of existing social protection programmes for employers and workers in the formal sector. The themes of different trainings and workshops included:

- Communication and facilitation techniques – Cambodia (two trainings for NSSF staff)
- Database training – Pakistan and Cambodia
- Data collection, compilation and reporting on SDG 1.3 – Pakistan and Cambodia
- Management and governance of social protection – Cambodia
- Pension policy – Cambodia
- Monitoring and evaluation of social protection policy – Cambodia
- Support for the process of modernisation – Cambodia
- ITC/ILO courses on governance – Cambodia and Pakistan.
- Enforcement and compliance – Pakistan
- Social Protection – Cambodia (for the National Trade Union Council)
- Administrative solutions for coverage extension – Cambodia (NSSF staff)

Reports from Cambodia were careful to note the numbers of female participants in the courses – always a significant minority. ITC/ILO reported that Pakistan sent a large group in 2020, a good mix of junior and senior people, men and women.

Training on compliance in Pakistan used the Simplify tools developed by the project, including an orientation pack, a manual (trainer’s facilitation guide), a handbook (in English and Urdu) and a pocket book. The project trained social security directors and assistant directors in the provinces in the application of SIMPLIFY. 20 were trained in Punjab, 25 in KP (Khyber Pakhtunkhwa); 38 in Sindh; and 17 in Baluchistan. Trainings of master trainers on SIMPLIFY have been completed.

SIMPLIFY

THE SOCIAL SECURITY



A Self-Orientation & Assessment Tool

For Effective Compliance & Enforcement
of Social Security Laws in Pakistan

The orientation pack is developed as part of the Project,
'Achieving SDGs and ending Poverty through Universal Social Protection'
supported by the UN Peace and Development Fund

Over 30 officials from government, employers' and workers' organisations in Pakistan took part in the ITC/ILO course on governance. They were interested in public finance and Social protection, in impact assessment, and were policy oriented. In Cambodia 10 NSSF and GS-NSPC management staff completed the ILO-ITC Course on Leadership for Social Protection. Another four NSSF officers completed the ITC-ILO online course on Administrative Solution for Coverage extension. Their focus was on issues of contribution and collection, and extension of coverage and in 2021 some have been redirected to the leadership course. A representative of ITC/ILO commented on the quality and commitment of trainees from both countries, all of whom passed the threshold mark to gain a Certificate of Achievement, 10 points higher than the lower grade of Certificate of Attendance.

In Pakistan the project organised three regional trainings on SDG 1.3 (with over 140 participants), in Islamabad, Muzaffarabad and Quetta, which helped to leverage provincial and territorial governments, such as Azad Jammu and Kashmir, to integrate the principles of ILO Resolution R202 (Social Protection Floors) in the development of their social protection policies.

Other training sessions were awareness raising and education on social protection rights and obligations, targeting workers' and employers' organizations and their members in Pakistan, and on training in the use of the Toolkit on Government Innovation for Social Inclusion of Vulnerable Groups organized by UNDESA, also in Pakistan.

Training on universal social protection – the provision of different forms of basic social protection irrespective of the employment status of beneficiary – took place in both Cambodia and Pakistan, focussing largely on familiarisation with the concepts. In Cambodia there is no culture of social protection in the government and prior to 2018 there was not even a Khmer word for social protection. Key ministries tend to regard social protection as social assistance – charity - rather than a right. The ILO-led review of the national social protection framework revealed that of the 30 interviews conducted with government departments and institutions, 22 have focused on social assistance and perhaps 2 on social protection. As donors tend to follow the lead of the government they too are steered towards social assistance, with the exception of the EU which has expressed a strong desire to work on social protection.

Universal social protection is more advanced in Pakistan. The project took part in the launch on 1st May 2021 of the Mazdoor Ka Ehsaas report which has the ambition of ensuring that every worker in Pakistan should be guaranteed social protection and a minimum standard of living. The report is, in fact, a compilation of detailed recommendations on social protection drafted by the Labour Welfare and Social Protection Expert Group of which the ILO (alongside two other external stakeholders, the World Bank and the Asian Development Bank) is a member. However there is as yet no unemployment benefit in Pakistan, described as a major gap in coverage by the ILO, nor social pension.

4.2 Direct Support

The project also provided direct support for different project components. Key examples follow:

4.2.1 Cambodia

- the project supported the government in the finalization of the design of its pension scheme, including technical workshops to discuss among others the Chinese experience (Activity A.1.1).
- facilitated the establishment of the new NSSF tripartite board as part of the NSSF modernization.
- provided technical assistance to the process of modernization of NSSF (administrative review, development of a new management information system).
- finalised and presented the business case on ICT investment to the NSSF management.

- there has been progress in overcoming lack of trust – one of the issues identified in the project document – accomplished by investment in monitoring and evaluation and in gathering and reporting accurate data. Trust, for example, is built when people see results: the time taken to process payments has been cut from 14 to 7 days.

4.2.1 Pakistan

- assisting the country to develop a coordination mechanism for social security schemes at the national level and in one province (KPK) (Activity A.2.1).
- a national consultant was contracted to design and implement a central database for reporting on SDG3 target 1, across all federal and provincial programmes. This will be used to provide the national report on SDG 1.3 in 2022. Additional questions were included in the National Labour Force Survey on age, disability and informal workers with a clear link to social protection. Its sample size has increased by 4 times at the district level. Data from 50 social protection agencies at the provincial and federal levels, covering 80% of social protection programmes and schemes, have been included in the database. Work on the database included the writing of user manuals, a dashboard and training in the uses of the database. More than 200 representatives of social protection agencies have now been trained on the use of the database. Its online interface was launched on 17th June and its first draft report has been completed.
- the development of a resource book on social security, called SIMPLIFY, consisting of an orientation pack, a trainer's guide, a participants' handbook in English and Urdu, and a pocket size book for the use of social security officials in the field.
- the project supported the pilot project of PESSI (Punjab) to extend social security to domestic workers. The Punjab Domestic Workers Act of January 2019 entitles domestic workers to sickness benefits and medical care during sickness, medical care of dependents, injury benefits, disablement pension and survivor's pension. This pilot project seeks to realise the ambitions of this act.
- facilitation of the establishment of a new tripartite Coordination Forum for Social Security.
- a national consultant researched and wrote a study on Compliance and Enforcement of Social Security Laws and Development of Standard Enforcement Guidebook for Enhanced Compliance.

4.3 Advocacy, campaigning and awareness raising

The project document states that in Cambodia key problems are the lack of culture of social security amongst the general public, and lack of public trust; together with lack of capacity to efficiently deliver services to increasing number of beneficiaries and Ineffective coordination between the different institutions involved.²⁴ Trust is built when people see results: the time taken to process payments has been cut from 14 to 7 days. However, there is still a lot of work to do to counter lack of understanding of social protection and the culture of mistrust with the general public. The focus has been on the government staff and social partners, to enable them to understand the workings of social protection, which in turn helps them to explain the

²⁴ Project Document. page 9/10

system and its benefits to the public/beneficiaries, to improve efficiency and put in place the pension roll out for 2022.

In Pakistan it has been possible, including with budget modifications due to Covid -19, to invest in advocacy and media to support partner agencies – Employees’ Social Security Institutions – in developing campaigns to increase coverage. Print, poster and TV campaigns to increase coverage of social security to employees in the formal sector were run in 2020/2021 resulting in an increase of 215,664 workers being registered. The 1,938,838 workers now registered across all four provinces still represent only 36.53% of the total eligible workforce. Separately the Employees Old Age Benefits Institute (EOBI) reported that 3,012 new enterprises registered with the institute across Pakistan. During January-March 2021 when the coverage campaign was in full swing EOBI registered an additional 139,937 workers. Overall more than 550,000 workers were registered during the project period.

The project commissioned a report on the multiplier effect of social expenditures in Pakistan from researchers at the research centre on Macroeconomics of Inequalities at the Department of Economics University of São Paulo Brazil, which shows a positive relationship between social expenditures and GDP. This clearly academic advocacy product stands alongside the business case for social security developed by the Employers’ Federation of Pakistan which argues that resources contributed companies to social security funds – in effect choosing to comply with current legislation on social security and employers’ contributions – has a positive impact on employee welfare and productivity.

4.4 Global component

The global component consisted of research five reports on social protection written by Development Pathways, on China, Argentina, Kenya and the small island states of Mauritius and Fiji, together with an overview of global research on the governance of social protection and three modules written and designed for training purposes - on coordination; information and communication technologies and data management; and compliance. The modules themselves are intended to be used more widely and will form the basis for the development of simpler learning materials. The research papers and the modules are collectively described as ‘knowledge products’. The learning modules, for which the ILO was responsible, were the product of intensive collaboration involving DESA, ISSA, the ILO and Development Pathways, while the research papers, under the leadership of Development Pathways, similarly benefitted from meetings, exchanges of comments and reference documents with ILO experts from across the organisation but especially from the Social Protection (SOCPRO) department.

The reports on social protection and the global overview are on the UNDESA website but Development Pathways were not told they would be published in their present form and believe that they require further editing – something that has not happened because this would have required further funding.

The three learning modules, developed jointly by ILO, ISSA and Development Pathways, are learning and guidance booklets which contain best practice and case studies. The topics are

Coordination; Information and communication technologies and data management; and Compliance and enforcement of legal frameworks. All three modules have been completed, with the first two in their final published form and the third scheduled for publication in September. They were presented at a virtual workshop on the 25th of June. These ‘knowledge products’ were used in internal and external webinars. Module 2 was assigned as mandatory reading material for Week 4 of the ITC/ILO course of E-Learning on Leadership for Social Protection.

The ILO has commented that the third module on Compliance is currently under review by colleagues working on legal matters who want to revise the text before publication. The ILO has confirmed that Module 3 will be finalised and uploaded in early September. This additional work will be funded from the regular ILO budget and will not therefore constitute a call on the spending framework of the project.

5. FINDINGS

5.1 Did the project strengthen capacity for good governance of social protection in the project countries and globally?

In both reports and interviews the evaluators observed genuine enthusiasm for the project and commitment on the part of staff of government social security institutions. This was also evident in the concluding webinar. The project has generated commitment and enthusiasm which could not have resulted from training and webinars alone. The focus on bringing different institutions together to form National Forums is strategic and has been highly appreciated. In Cambodia it was noted that a major contribution of this project is coordination, beginning early on with trainings with the NSSF and the General Secretariat (GS). An important point of these trainings was to manage expectations, by means of discussion regarding the roles of the different institutions and how they could be coordinated.

The ‘learning by doing’ and ‘learning by training’ have been mutually supportive. The evaluators learned that participants in formal ITC/ILO training, some of whom were in relatively senior positions in their organisations, have started to cascade their learning to colleagues.

Learning from the global component of the project is ongoing. The existing knowledge products constitute a rich source of future learning materials.

Working with national staff and locally recruited consultants, the project has–

- trained and motivated staff of social security institutions in Cambodia and Pakistan to modernise their operations and extend coverage
- provided tools and training for improved data collection
- made a positive impact in social security in both countries by bringing together those working on separate schemes and encouraging national forum building
- facilitated the formation and functioning of tripartite forums
- has finalised the design and functionality for the pension scheme in Cambodia to be launched in 2022

- has furthered understanding of social protection in Cambodia and kickstarted the modernisation of the social security system by training staff members and demonstrating what a modern social security system should look like. As a consequence Cambodian social security institutions have accepted the need for modernisation and are now fully committed to it
- has produced advocacy materials and facilitated and accompanied advocacy campaigns in Pakistan. The project has supported advocacy for universal social protection in Pakistan through national conferences and specific research on the multiplier effects of social protection and on the institutions that are charged with delivering social protection, including legal, socio-economic and political factors
- established new digital infrastructure
- been instrumental in the launch of a pilot social security project for domestic workers in Pakistan
- established a fully developed data portal in Pakistan, which includes all social security institutions covering the formal sector and now has 57 federal and provincial institutions feeding data into it, with issues of age, disability and informality included. All The data portal is about to release its first report and is preparing for a national report on SDG 1.3 in 2022)
- has produced research and learning materials which will be used in many countries

The three project themes, seen as critical to good governance, were coordination, data management and compliance. All three areas were comprehensively addressed in both countries.

5.1.1 Compliance

The extension of coverage in both countries is an indicator of compliance, principally on the part of employers. 550,000 more employees were registered for social security in Pakistan in the lifetime of the project. In Cambodia the number of registered employees rose from 1.2 million to 2.1 million but this is not comparable with Pakistan because it was a response to the social security law officially promulgated on 18th October 2019 whereas the increase in Pakistan took place under existing legislation.

5.1.2 Data management

- Pakistan: the project put in place a central database/dashboard on social protection to report on SDG1.3.1. Training has been provided, agencies are already inputting data and the consultant is providing ongoing support
- Cambodia: a major component of the project in Cambodia was the development of a business case for investment in ICT by the NSSF. The purpose of the business case was to enable NSSF management to decide between three options for investment in ICT. These were business as usual, in-house development and development by an external vendor
- In Cambodia the project ran one training course specifically on data collection and compilation and on reporting on SDG1.3 Several other courses in Cambodia focused on general administrative issues as part of the modernisation programme of the NSSF

5.1.3 Coordination

Tripartite forums were set up and started to function successfully in both countries. In Pakistan the National Social Security Coordination Forum brings together all social security agencies in the provinces, the old age benefits institution, provincial departments of labour and social partners. In Cambodia a new NSSF tripartite board was set up as part of the NSSF modernization programme. The board held their first meeting on 31st August 2020. More broadly, PASSD in Pakistan and the NSPC in Cambodia are seeking to coordinate both social security and social assistance programmes. The tripartite forums are seen as a major accomplishment of the project and a vehicle for monitoring progress and advocacy on social protection.

5.2 Did the project strengthen capacity for the accountability and compliance with legal provisions including contributions from employers within the social protection systems in the project countries and globally?

In general, the project has focused on modernising, strengthening and extending current social security institutions nationally while working on educational and awareness raising materials on social protection through the modules and training nationally and globally. The training module on ICT and data management is now required reading in the ILC courses and the module on coordination will be used to develop a new course on governance. The module on compliance is undergoing final review by legal experts and will be published in September.

The research papers show other countries journeys towards universal social protection, highlighting important issues, and can serve in future as the basis for simpler learning materials.

The expansion of social security coverage was achieved by different routes in Cambodia and Pakistan. In Cambodia a training package on Social Protection and training of trainers for a focal person from the National Trade Union Council has been developed by local consultants. In Cambodia, as of May 2021, the number of NSSF registered members of both the Occupational Risk and Health Care schemes had increased to 2.18 million compared to 2.14 million in 2020 from a starting point of 1.2 million in 2018, but this was due in part to the introduction of a new social security law in October 2019.

The expansion of coverage in Pakistan – 550,000 employees – was an achievement of the full scale information and education campaign designed in cooperation with a number of ILO projects. At the start of the project only a small number of enterprises and their workers in the formal economy were registered with provincial Employees' Social Security Institutions (ESSIs) – about 1.8 million workers, 34% of the country's 5.27 million eligible workers. The 550,000 therefore increased the proportion of registered workers to 45% of the eligible workforce. Existing laws in Pakistan provide loopholes which employers take advantage of to avoid paying contributions. The two major loopholes are that employers are obliged to register only permanent employees who tend to be in a small minority (5-10% of the workforce) in any workplace and only employees earning less than a threshold wage of 22,000 rupees a month (this threshold varies between provinces). As one project document points out, this has a

particular impact on female employees: “in case of female workers, the number is almost invisible due to very few number of female workers on permanent contract and employers neglected attitude towards female social security memberships.”²⁵

The participation of the Employers’ Federation of Pakistan in the advocacy campaign was significant. It produced its own advocacy materials and participated and produced a business case on social security linking it to increased employee satisfaction and productivity. More than 250 employers have been trained as a result of the series of awareness raising sessions in Sindh. Other industry associations have replicated similar dialogues for their members benefitting from the information that was shared with them through presentations and videos.

More than 150,000 unions were reached through information and advocacy materials material (posters and videos) disseminated through the Pakistan Workers’ Federation (PWF) to its members and alliances across the country. PWF is a federation of a number of unions and have country wide presence. It remains a focal point to facilitate further coordination.

5.3 Did the project strengthen universal social protection in the project countries and globally?

There is clear recognition in both Cambodia and Pakistan that a majority of the population are not covered by formal social security schemes. Both countries had schemes/institutions in place to start on the task of coordinating fragmented social security and social assistance schemes – Ehsaas in Pakistan and the National Social Protection Council in Cambodia. In Pakistan the ILO is a member of the Labour Welfare and Social Experts Group which acts as the steering committee for Mazdoor Ka Ehsaas (Compassion for Workers), a tripartite body, which has formulated recommendations on social protection to the government.

In Pakistan one of the achievements of the project is its work on data. It has led to the inclusion of additional questions in the National labour Force Survey on age, disability and informal workers with a clear link to social protection. Its sample size has increased by four times at the district level. The data portal is now fully developed with 57 federal and provincial institutions feeding into it. This paves the way for a more coordinated approach to social protection. Its SDG 1.3 data portal will allow a report for the first time in 2022 and will be able to pave the way for universal coverage by highlighting gaps to be filled.

The launch of the social security project for domestic workers in Lahore is the first time that any form of social security has been extended to informal sector workers. PESSI (Punjab Employees Social Security Institution) has plans to extend the project (now in its pilot phase with 270 domestic workers registered) to 10,000 workers within two years. The commitment of the ILO to support extension of this pilot 415 k \$ to take to the whole of the province and then extend to another one is significant.

²⁵ Tahir Manzoor. Study on Compliance & Enforcement of Social Security Laws and Development of Standard Enforcement Guidebook for Enhanced Compliance. Page 14

5.4 What have been the achievements of the overall project objectives/outcomes?

It is important to reiterate that the governments of both Cambodia and Pakistan, prior to and independently of the project, have shown commitment to improving and extending social security and to moving forward on social protection.

Cambodia

The long term vision of the Royal Government of Cambodia is “... the construction of a social protection system based on inclusiveness, effectiveness and financial sustainability as a tool to reduce and prevent poverty, vulnerability and inequality and which will contribute to the development and protection of human resources and stimulate economic growth.”

(from the Prime Minister’s Preamble to the National Social Protection Policy Framework 2016-2015)

Pakistan

Presently a large number of workers remain outside the ambit of social protection. ... Extension of labour welfare measure for the informal sector in a country as large as Pakistan is a huge task. Formalizing informal workers through the registration and protection of their rights is unquestionably one the fundamental challenges the country is facing at the moment. The need for addressing this issue has become more pronounced considering the recent outbreak of COVID-19 and potential risks of income and job disruption for the vulnerable informal workers in Pakistan.

(from the Introductory Note to Recommendations to Implement on Mazdoor Ka Ehsaas. Dr Sania Nishtar)

In this context the project has been built on strong national commitment, levered significant financial and human resources to further this process, been a catalyst in bringing key stakeholders together, provided relevant training appreciated by participants, and has prepared the ground for future progress.

5.4.1 Sustainability

Sustainability is a key goal of the project, to be achieved by “... [ensuring] national ownership through the involvement of professionals from relevant government institutions and social partners as well through the fostering of a national dialogue process.”²⁶

In Pakistan the ILO has confidence that work will continue in key areas as a result of national commitment and the willingness of the ILO itself to provide some continuing support. These include:

²⁶ Project Document. Page 26

- In Punjab work on the domestic workers programme will continue with support from the ILO to widen its scope within the province, and possibly extension to a second province
- The Labour Expert Group of Mazdoor Ka Ehsaas, of which the ILO is a member, will continue to its work of boosting the capacity of national institutions
- The data portal is now fully developed, is collecting more and higher quality data, will be able to chart progress towards universal coverage and report on SDG3.1
- Social security institutions have taken ownership of campaigning on social protection through the SIMPLIFY materials
- All social security institutions have now participated in training provided by the project. This has not happened before
- There is scope for more projects which will enable social security institutions to widen, from just health at present, the range of services they provide to the informal sector
- The National Social Security Coordination Forum will continue to function. It is not at risk of collapse

In Cambodia the project explicitly supports the national social protection policy. Its inputs have already increased efficiency and public trust in the benefit system and put in place the pension to be launched in 2022. The NSSF will continue with the task of building its IT systems and will only require specific technical assistance, which could be provided by an ILO specialist or external consultant, perhaps for one or two months a year. Training has opened the eyes of both the General Secretariat of the NSPC and the NSSF to the ‘mountain of skills’ required to run an efficient social security system. Their commitment to moving forward has been demonstrated by the modernisation initiative, but both institutions will need continuing technical support to guide them on their ongoing journey. Without this technical support, the task would be like ‘trying to scale a mountain without a guide. They might get there in the end but the journey would be longer and more arduous.’ ILO projects are continuing in the country but they are not focused on capacity building, which is still a gap to be filled in relation to fiscal space, the overarching policy framework and extending social security coverage. In Cambodia, therefore, there is a risk that in the absence of follow up support the momentum achieved by the project may slow down or halt progress.

In sum, while the evaluators have not heard any interviewee express doubts about stakeholders’ commitment to continuing to extend coverage and improve the performance of social protection institutions, some concern has been voiced about a possible deceleration of forward momentum in the absence of some continuing future support from ILO.

5.5 Has the knowledge sharing, and communication strategy been effective in raising the profile of the project within the country and among the cooperating partners?

The participation and commitment of stakeholder institutions and their staff in both Cambodia and Pakistan is at least in part a product of the energy with which the project has been pursued by the ILO. The ILO has been fortunate in the quality of the local staff recruited to lead the project in both countries. Ehsaas in Pakistan and the NSPC in Cambodia have both provided a favourable context for the project. Covid-19 too has acted as a wake-up call for social

protection and the need to reform, regularise and coordinate programmes. The major stakeholders in both countries have expressed their satisfaction with the project.

5.6 Monitoring and evaluation and adaptive management

The project reported periodically on activities and indicators of impact, such as numbers of employees newly registered for social security. Where appropriate, trainees were given before-and-after tests to assess how much they had learned from their training. Full reports were submitted to the Fund Manager who responded with questions for clarification on budget and substance and only approved final reports and budget requests when queries were answered.

The biggest challenge in terms of ‘adaptive management’ faced by the project was adapting scheduled project activities to restrictions to international travel and face-to-face meetings and seminars. Each country has adapted well to the Covid restrictions by ensuring learning and exchange happened online through seminars and smaller country retreats, with ‘out of country’ inputs via zoom. The ILO specifically acknowledged the adaptability of the SDG Fund manager of UNDESA to allow these changes of budget allocation.

It was clear in late 2020 that neither the study tours nor the final conference in Beijing could go ahead as planned due to Covid-19. At a management meeting in January 2021 It was decided to reallocate funds for the two exchange visits between practitioners from Cambodia and Pakistan to in-country training and to reallocate some of the unspent DESA tranche towards two final virtual workshops – one technical and one policy focused with high level involvement of China – at the end of June 2021. It was suggested that China might welcome the opportunity and potentially fund a major international conference on their own at a later date. Unspent funds would therefore return to the Fund. It was decided not to request a new project from the sub-fund at this time but to review possibilities at a later stage in the light of a discussion with China, with the Ministry of Human Resources and Ministry of Social Security. A future project could include a China-led roundtable to include countries in the One Belt One Road Initiative in Africa and Asia, focus on a south-south plan for social protection, and to make the extension of social protection a major pillar of the peace and development strategy of the People’s Republic of China.

In terms of overall management of the project with its shared and differentiated responsibilities, it was noted that, even though relations between the two partner entities were excellent, there were at times bottlenecks and delays due to different procedures for signing off reports, facilitating payments and approving adjustments in expenditures and terms of reference. Interviewees have said that the process of approval for budget and activity changes due to Covid-19, originating in ILO Cambodia and Pakistan offices and being transmitted through ILO Geneva and UNDESA New York was slow and time consuming.

Nevertheless given that it was a new type of partnership between two agencies, both of which were responsible to an external fund with its own strict guidelines on reporting and the use of funds,²⁷ it was a good experience overall.

As one respondent put it: *'The project has been a very productive partnership between ILO and UNDESA as it played to each organisations strengths. It has been a best practice example of interagency work, getting over turf issues, despite some cumbersome bureaucratic procedures.'*

6. IMPACT

The full impact of the project will only become evident in years to come when the processes set in train by the project come to fruition, when social security managers and staff apply the knowledge and skills they have acquired in the training sessions organised by the project, and when political leaders take hard decisions about the means of resourcing of social protection. This will create the conditions for robust social protection systems to be put in place to make social protection a reality for all citizens. Nevertheless it is possible to make a preliminary judgment.

One factor working in favour of the project is the political commitment of the governments of both countries to modernise their social security systems and to begin the task of extending social protection to the millions of workers and households who have no protection at all. The second factor is the active presence of the ILO in both countries and the commitment of the UN agencies in Pakistan²⁸ and Cambodia²⁹ to social protection. The seriousness with which the managers and staff of the social security and social protection agencies have engaged with the project is also a good indication that the training and other investments of the project will not be wasted.

However, the scale of the challenges that lie ahead should not be underestimated. The speed with which the processes started by the project will move forward will also depend to some extent on the assistance that is available to the institutions responsible for them and the resources on which such assistance depends.

Draft plans for the project's 'exit strategy' in Pakistan presume a sufficient level of ongoing support from the ILO and national organisations such as PASSD and the Pakistan Bureau of Statistics (PBS) to maintain the forward momentum achieved by the project. The exit strategy calls for continuing engagement with and provision of technical assistance to employers' and workers' organisations and social security institutions, some continuing training, support to the National Social Security Coordination Forum and advocacy and engagement with UN and other development partners. While some of these activities may sound like little more than

²⁷ <https://www.un.org/en/unpdf/assets/pdf/Guidelines%20for%202030%20Agenda%20Sub-Fund.pdf>

²⁸ See Pakistan One United Nations Programme III (OP III) 2018-2022. https://unsdg.un.org/sites/default/files/cf-documents/5dc3a25b-9c23-421e-b4b6-97f3fb8d4299_UNDAF_OPIII_online_page_view.pdf

²⁹ See Cambodia Joint SDG Fund <https://www.jointsdgfund.org/programme/social-protection-floors-cambodia>

mentoring, the likelihood is that more will be required to ensure good progress and, in any case, the accumulation of tasks constitutes a serious programme of work.

Similar concerns have been voiced in Cambodia, though in less detail than the exit strategy in Pakistan. The project opened the eyes of both the General Secretariat of the NSPCS and NSSF to the ‘mountain of skills’ required to run an efficient social security system. This was demonstrated by the modernisation initiative. The willingness and commitment are there but both institutions will need technical support to guide them on their ongoing journey. Without this technical support, the task would be like “trying to scale a mountain without a guide”. The climbers might get there in the end but the journey would be longer and more arduous – and the end result might not be as good as it would be without the necessary technical assistance.

The decision reached by the NSSF in response to the options set out by the modernisation business case illustrates the difficult choices that have to be made when resources are a key issue. The business case presented to the NSSF made a clear recommendation that the contract for the modernisation of its information technology system should be outsourced because, in spite of its greater initial cost, it would generate a significantly higher income stream and outsourcing to a vendor would allow the system to be deployed in a shorter time and therefore allow the NSSF to achieve its objectives more quickly. Despite this, the NSSF opted for the less costly in-house development.

This evaluation began with the observation that both Pakistan and Cambodia spend approximately 1.3% of GDP on social protection. Both countries have put in place new institutional structures which have mission statements setting out clear ambitions to improve the effectiveness and coverage of social protection. Both countries receive significant development assistance (2019: Pakistan - USD 2.171 billion, 0.796% GNI; Cambodia USD 984,070,007, 3.85% GNI)³⁰ but ultimately the sustainability of social protection expenditure will depend on internally generated resources that match the ambitions of these new institutional structures.

7. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The project has satisfactorily delivered its planned activities in the modified form imposed by Covid-19 restrictions. National stakeholders and partners in Cambodia and Pakistan have expressed their satisfaction with the training provided by the project and the ways in which it has practically contributed to improving the efficiency of social security institutions in both countries. These practical contributions include the SDG3.1 database, the Simplify manuals and handbooks and advocacy campaigns in Pakistan, the development of the business case for the NSSF ICT system in Cambodia and the establishment of national coordination forums in both countries.

³⁰ World Bank. Net development assistance and official aid received (current US \$). <https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/DT.ODA.ALLD.CD>

The project produced five research papers on the evolution of social protection in China, Argentina, Kenya and the small island states of Mauritius and Fiji together with an overview paper, *Global Research on Governance and Social Protection*. There are also three learning modules, one of which, *ICT and Data Management*, is already in use in the ITC/ILO course on *Leadership in Social Protection*. A second paper, *Coordination*, will form the basis of a new course to be developed by ISSA on *Governance of Social Protection*. The research papers, long, detailed and rather academic, will be of interest to students and specialists in social protection. They should be widely available and easily accessible on the internet. They constitute a valuable resource which can be used to develop learning materials on social protection. As with the training delivered by the project, we have yet to see the full use that can be made of both the research papers and the modules.

The ambitions of the project implicit in its title, *Achieving the SDGs and ending poverty through Universal Social Protection*, are huge because, as Dr Sania Nishtar has said, the historic wrongs of past decades cannot be undone in one day. The main efforts of the project concentrated on improving the efficiency and extending the coverage of the social security institutions in both countries but at the same time it kept in mind the millions of workers and households who have no reliable access to social protection of any sort. Covid-19 clearly acted as a wake-up call for governments faced with the possibility that millions of their citizens could be plunged into absolute destitution.

The question that remains is how the achievements of the project can be consolidated, given that it has provided tools and training. Future progress is in the hands of national stakeholders. In both countries concerns have been voiced about the need for follow up, not so much in the form of a second full scale project, but more about the ability, principally of the ILO, to provide continuing advice, encouragement and technical assistance and to participate in and facilitate meetings.

Attention has inevitably been directed at the savings in UNDESA's share of the original budget and exhaustion of the ILO's share. Our understanding is that, according to the conditions under which the grant was made by the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development Sub-Fund of the UN Peace and Development Trust Fund, any surplus at the end of the project has to be returned to the Trust Fund. However, if there were a way in which this surplus could be used over, say, the next couple of years to enable this sort of continuing support to partners and stakeholders in Cambodia and Pakistan, it could create greater confidence about its future solidity and impact. Follow up through China has been singled out as important as is the significance of the 2021 agreement of the International Labour Conference to mandate the ILO and its members to urgently implement measures to realise universal social protection.

We have noted that the different institutional procedures of the two agencies created bottlenecks, particularly in reporting and budget adjustments, but that these were overcome and that relations between the agencies remain excellent. Learning from this constitutes the basis for even more effective cooperation between UN agencies. The UNDESA/ILO partnership worked well, with good will on both sides, playing to the strengths of each agency, and could

be a model for collaboration between UN agencies in the future. It has enabled the Peace and Development Trust Fund to provide important support to sustainable development and the achievement of the SDGs.

Future work, potentially with a new application to the Fund, to ensure the consolidation of the project based on lessons learned is desirable, with the input of China as originally envisaged. This should also ensure good use of the knowledge products (both the learning modules and the research materials written by Development Pathways) in-country and to support the ILO's Plan of Action on the universal social protection systems called for by the International Labour Conference.

We therefore recommend that –

- a renewed partnership - or 2nd phase - be developed to build on and consolidate the progress made, with the engagement of the Peoples Republic of China and making full use of the learning tools developed and lessons learned in the project.
- that this be linked to the Plan of Action on universal social protection called for by the International Labour Conference.
- that the research papers be edited and purposed for teaching.
- that progress be made in the streamlining of institutional procedures between agencies.

APPENDIX 1

INTERVIEWS

Name	Affiliation	Position	Date of interview
Oleg Serezhin	DISA - DESA	Chief, Capacity Development & Partnership Cooperation	20 05 21; 17 06 21
Robert Venne	DISA - DESA	Social Affairs Officer	20 05 21; 25 06 21
Broddi Sigurdason	DISA - DESA	Evaluation Manager	17 06 21
Annamaria Scuderi	DESA - CDPMO	SDG Fund Manager	07 07 21
Jean-Louis Lambeau	ILO Geneva	Social Protection Specialist	25 05 21; 21 06 21
Valérie Schmitt	ILO Geneva	Deputy Director, Social Protection	09 07 21
Karuna Pal	ILO Geneva	Head, Programming, Partnerships and Knowledge-sharing	01 07 21
Sokgech Heng,	ILO Cambodia	National Project Coordinator	01 07 21
Jie Yu Koh (Finn)	ILO Cambodia	Programme Manager - Phnom Penh	06 07 .7.21
Nuno Cunha	Social Protection DWT-Bangkok	Senior Social Protection Technical Specialist	requested did not take place
Rabia Razzaque	ILO Pakistan	National Project Coordinator	23 06 21; 24 06 21; 02 07 21
Saad Gilani	ILO Pakistan	Senior Programme Officer	07 07 21
Ingrid Christensen	ILO Pakistan	Country Director	02 07 21
Costanza de Toma	ITC ILO Turin	Programme Officer	16 07 21
Raul Ruggia-Frick	ISSA	Director, Social Security Development Branch	15 07 21
Shea McClanahan	Development Pathways	Senior Social Policy Specialist	15 07 21
Wenyan Yang	UNDESA	Chief, Social Perspective on Development	9.7.21
Group discussion Cambodia with interpreter	NSSF	Organised by Sokgech Heng	16.7.21

APPENDIX 2

DOCUMENTS CONSULTED

(Documents without a web link were provided by project managers)

A Brief Profile of Domestic Workers in Pakistan

Advocacy Campaign to create awareness about Social Security Coverage for Domestic Workers - A pilot initiative of Punjab Employees Social Security Institution – Terms of Reference (PAKISTAN)

Building an Inclusive Social Protection System in Pakistan. Final Draft. Shirin Gul and Firuza Pastakia - (May 9, 2021)

A Business case on social security - Compliance has returns: Testimonies by employers – Employers Federation of Pakistan (PowerPoint presentation)

Business Case for Employers’ Investment in Social Security in Sindh – Employers’ Federation of Pakistan

Business Case for NSSF ICT System YX (Yong Xiang) Yeo (April 2021) - CAMBODIA

Cambodia National Social Security Fund (NSSF) - Modernization Plan. Business Process Review Workshop. Phnom Penh, July 15-19, 2019 --- Final Report. Michael Kidd, Consultant, ILO

Central Database/Dashboard on Social Protection (SDG 1.3.1) – User Manual (PAKISTAN)

Coordination Forum of Social Security Agencies – Terms of Reference (PAKISTAN)

Development of Central Database/Dashboard on Social Protection (SDG 1.3.1) – Final Consolidated Report. Mata ur Rahman - January 28, 2020 (PAKISTAN)

Extending Social Security Coverage to Domestic Workers in the Province of Punjab – Implementation Framework. Final. February 24, 2021 (PAKISTAN)

Extending Social Security Coverage to Domestic Workers in the Province of Punjab – Workshop Proceedings. February 22, 2021 (PAKISTAN)

Governance of social protection systems: a learning journey --- Module 1 - Coordination

Governance of social protection systems: a learning journey --- Module 2 - Information and Communication Technologies & Data Management

Governance of social protection systems: a learning journey --- Module 3 – Compliance and Enforcement of Legal Frameworks (Draft)

ILO ---- Policy, design and actuarial assessments of the national pension (Project January 1, 2017 - December 31, 2018)

<https://www.ilo.org/DevelopmentCooperationDashboard/#b4ehqif>

ILO ---- Social protection: coverage, affordability, financing options. Valerie Schmitt, ILO

<https://www.ilo.org/DevelopmentCooperationDashboard/#b4ehqif>

ILO --- Achieving the SDGs and ending poverty through universal social protection - a brief on project outcomes in Pakistan (June 2021)

https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---asia/---ro-bangkok/---ilo-islamabad/documents/publication/wcms_808025.pdf

ILO ---- A social protection profile of Pakistan Building an inclusive social protection system

https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---asia/---ro-bangkok/---ilo-islamabad/documents/publication/wcms_802498.pdf

ILO ---- ILO website. Interview with Saad Gilani. 29 January 2019
https://www.social-protection.org/gimi/gess/ShowResource.action;jsessionid=OtHclLcReBHH6Pz5tcHuzwtSpkO73mu_bgcgXohQMjzVCiJDkvHR!1750948109?id=55502&lang=AR

ILO ----ILO International Labour Conference - 109th Session, 2021 Resolution concerning the second recurrent discussion on social protection (social security) (19 June 2021)
https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_norm/---relconf/documents/meetingdocument/wcms_806099.pdf

ILO ---- Launch of the Mazdoor Ka Ehsaas report- A social protection programme for workers in the informal economy (2021) PAKISTAN
https://www.ilo.org/islamabad/info/public/pr/WCMS_790152/lang--en/index.htm

ILO ---- Mapping Social Protection Systems in Pakistan The status of current systems in line with the UN Social Protection Floor concept (2019)
https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---asia/---ro-bangkok/---ilo-islamabad/documents/publication/wcms_737630.pdf

ILO ---- Global Flagship Programme - Social Protection
<https://www.social-protection.org/gimi/gess/Flagship.action>

ILO ---- Terms of Reference for National Consultant to Identify Options & Mechanism for Extending Social Security to ‘retired workers’ and ‘to families of trans-provincial workers’ (PAKISTAN)

ILO ---- World Social Protection Report 2017-2019
https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---dgreports/---dcomm/---publ/documents/publication/wcms_604882.pdf

ILO/UNDESA ---- Minutes of partnership meeting, Geneva, 15 January 2021

ILO/UNDESA ---- Progress Report April-June 2021

ILO/UNDESA ---- Progress Report April-September 2020

ILO/UNDESA ---- Progress Report January-March 2020

ILO/UNDESA ---- Progress Report October 2020-March 2021

ILO/UNDESA ---- Project Document

ITC/ILO E-Campus – E-learning course on leadership for social protection (June 2021)
ITC/ILO E-Campus – E-learning on good governance (May-June 2021)
<https://ecampus.itcilo.org>

Multipliers of Social Protection study, Pakistan – written by Laura Carvalho, Marina Sanches & Dante Cardoso, Department of Economics, University of Sao Paulo, Brazil. April 5, 2021.

National Social Protection Council – Cambodia
<https://nspc.gov.kh/national-social-protection-council>

OECD/Development Pathways --- Social Protection System Review of Cambodia (2017)
https://www.oecd.org/countries/cambodia/SPSR_Cambodia_ebook.pdf

Poverty Alleviation and Social Safety Division - Government of Pakistan
<https://www.pass.gov.pk/home>

Recommendations to implement on Mazdoor Ka Ehsaas ---- Poverty Alleviation and Social Safety Division & Ministry of Overseas Pakistanis and Human Resource Development – Labour Welfare and Social Protection Expert Group (LWSPEG) PAKISTAN

<https://www.pass.gov.pk/Document/Downloads/MKEF.pdf>

Royal Government of Cambodia ---- Sub-Decree on Social Security Scheme on Pension for Persons Defined by The Provisions of the Labour Law (March 2021)

Royal Government of Cambodia ---- National Social Policy Protection Framework 2016-2025 (2017)

<https://www.adb.org/sites/default/files/linked-documents/cam-53308-001-tar-ld-02.pdf>

SIMPLIFY The Social Security (A Self Orientation and Assessment Tool; Pocket Book; Participants Handbook; Trainer’s Facilitation Guide) PAKISTAN

Study on Compliance & Enforcement of Social Security Laws and Development of Standard Enforcement Guidebook for Enhanced Compliance – Findings/Final Report. (Tahir Manzoor, December 2020) PAKISTAN

UNDESA/ILO ---- Budget documents (various)

UNDESA/ILO ---- Global Research on the Governance of Social Protection – Argentina Case Study

UNDESA/ILO ---- Global Research on the Governance of Social Protection – China Case Study

UNDESA/ILO ---- Global Research on the Governance of Social Protection – Kenya Case Study

UNDESA/ILO ---- Global Research on the Governance of Social Protection – Case studies on Mauritius and Fiji

UNDESA/ILO ---- Global Research on the Governance of Social Protection – Global Overview

United Nations ---- Transforming Our World: the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development

United Nations ---- Guidelines 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development Sub-Fund

<https://www.un.org/en/unpdf/assets/pdf/Guidelines%20for%202030%20Agenda%20Sub-Fund.pdf>

United Nations Sustainable Development Framework for Pakistan - One United Nations Programme III (OP III) 2018-2022 (2018)

<https://pakistan.un.org/sites/default/files/2020-05/UNDAF-OPIII-v9.pdf#:~:text=Pakistan's%20UNSD%20FOP%20III%202018,path%20towards%20achieving%20the%20SDGs.>

World Bank ---- Social Protection and Jobs Responses to COVID-19: A Real-Time Review of Country Measures (May 14,2021)

<https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/handle/10986/33635>

APPENDIX 3

Answers to Overview Questions

1. Did the project strengthen capacity for good governance of social protection in the project countries and globally? This question will highlight a minimum of three focus areas elicited by the project to strengthen governance for social protection, namely coordination, data management and compliance.

Yes. Working with national staff, locally recruited consultants, and global experts, the project has

- trained and motivated staff of social security institutions in Cambodia and Pakistan to modernise their operations and extend coverage and provided tools and training for improved data collection
- made a positive impact in social security in both countries by bringing together those working on separate schemes and encouraging national forum building;
- facilitated the formation and functioning of tripartite forums;
- Enabled in country and international (via ITC/ILO) training on the 3 topics of coordination data management and compliance
- For global use has produced detailed research documents and learning materials/modules on the three topics which will be used in many countries.

2. Did the project strengthen universal social protection in the project countries and globally? This question will highlight the main impact areas of the project in that direction, including advocacy and extension of coverage.

Specifically in Cambodia the project has –

- Supported the final design and mode of functionality for the pension scheme to be launched in 2022.
- Furthered understanding of the importance of public trust in social protection.
- Kickstarted the modernisation of the social security system by training and demonstrating what a modern social security system should look like.
- Facilitated buy-in and ownership regarding modernisation on the part of the Cambodian institutions which are engaged in the outcomes – business case.
- Built capacity in key institutions through training and ongoing reflection.
- Seen the number of registered workers increase by 900,000 (from 1.2 to 2.1 million) in the lifetime of the project.

In Pakistan the project has –

- Produced advocacy materials with employers' and workers' organisations and conducted advocacy campaigns to encourage companies to convince both of the importance of social security.
- national conferences and specific research on the multiplier effects of social protection and on the institutional drivers of social protection, including legal, socio-economic and political factors.

- established new digital infrastructure.
- Been instrumental in the launch of a pilot social security project for domestic workers.
- Seen the number of registered workers increase by 550,000 in the lifetime of the project.
- Established a fully developed data portal in Pakistan, which includes all social security institutions covering the formal sector and now has 57 federal and provincial institutions feeding data into it, with issues of age, disability and informality included. The data portal is about to release its first report and is preparing for a national report on SDG 1.3 in 2022.

Globally, the project has –

- Produced high quality research and learning materials on social protection
- Stimulated interest in social protection from other countries through sharing the results of the work in Cambodia and Pakistan and the webinars during and at the end of the project.

3. Did the project strengthen capacity for the accountability and compliance with legal provisions including contributions from employers within the social protection systems in the project countries and globally?

Yes

- Tripartite forums were set up and started to function successfully in both countries.
- In Pakistan the project worked closely with the Employers' Federation of Pakistan which produced its own advocacy materials to persuade employers of the importance of social security.
- In Pakistan the national social security coordination forum brings together all social security agencies in the provinces, the old age benefits institution, provincial departments of labour and social partners.
- In Cambodia a new NSSF tripartite board was set up as part of the NSSF modernisation programme. The board held its first meeting on 31st August 2020.
- More broadly, PASSD in Pakistan and the NSPC in Cambodia are seeking to coordinate both social security and social assistance programmes.
- Globally these results were shared at the end of project workshops as good practice. For training purposes the module on compliance is finalised and will be available mid-2021 for use on ITC courses

4. Is the project coherent with the Government's objectives, National Development Frameworks, beneficiaries' needs, and does it support the outcomes outlined in the SDGs?

Both countries have demonstrated political commitment by putting in place multiyear programmes for social protection extension and conducting important needs assessments to anchor programme rollout.

Cambodia

The long term vision of the Royal Government of Cambodia is “... the construction of a social protection system based on inclusiveness, effectiveness and financial sustainability as a tool to reduce and prevent poverty, vulnerability and inequality and which will contribute to the development and protection of human resources and stimulate economic growth.”

(from **the Prime Minister’s Preamble to the National Social Protection Policy Framework 2016-2015**)

Pakistan

Presently a large number of workers remain outside the ambit of social protection. ... Extension of labour welfare measure for the informal sector in a country as large as Pakistan is a huge task. Formalizing informal workers through the registration and protection of their rights is unquestionably one the fundamental challenges the country is facing at the moment. The need for addressing this issue has become more pronounced considering the recent outbreak of COVID-19 and potential risks of income and job disruption for the vulnerable informal workers in Pakistan.

(from **the Introductory Note to Recommendations to Implement on Mazdoor Ka Ehsaas. Dr Sania Nishtar**)

This interest was sharpened by the Covid-19 pandemic during which they, like governments worldwide, implemented unprecedented measures to control the spread of the virus and to mitigate the impact of these measures, principally lockdowns, on millions of their citizens. The crisis also highlighted the fragmentary nature of their existing systems as well as the value of having ILO as a long term partner actively engaged in capacity building for strengthened social protection system building.

Both Cambodia and Pakistan are members of the ILO and are signatories to the 2030 Agenda. They have both signalled their intention to extend social protection coverage in line with SDG 1 target 3 and make significant progress on the SDG targets specifically listed in the project document. The 109th session of the International Labour Conference of June 2021 agreed a framework for action for realising universal social protection, ‘to progressively and as soon as possible build and maintain universal, comprehensive, sustainable and adequate social protection systems placed under the overall and primary responsibility of the State, pursuant to the vision and principles expressed in ILO up-to-date social security standards, including the Social Security (Minimum Standards) Convention, 1952 (No. 102), and the Social Protection Floors Recommendation, 2012 (No. 202), as well as other relevant standards, such as the Transition from the Informal to the Formal Economy Recommendation, 2015 (No. 204).’³¹

³¹ https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_norm/---relconf/documents/meetingdocument/wcms_804457.pdf page 5

Relationship to the SDGs

The project will contribute directly to six SDG targets, namely

- SDG 1.3 (Implement nationally appropriate social protection systems and measures for all, including floors, and by 2030 achieve substantial coverage of the poor and the vulnerable),
- SDG 3.8 (Achieve universal health coverage, including financial risk protection, access to quality essential health-care services and access to safe, effective, quality and affordable essential medicines and vaccines for all),
- SDG 5.4 (gender equality),
- SDG 8.5 (decent work for all and sustainable economic growth),
- SDG 10.4 (reducing inequalities, all specifically highlight social protection),
- SDG 16.6 (Develop effective, accountable and transparent institutions at all levels).

It also contributes to the objectives of the Third Decade for the Eradication of Poverty i.e. “Accelerating global actions for a world without poverty”.

5. What links have been established so far with other activities of the UN or other cooperating partners operating in the Country in the areas of social protection?

In both countries the ILO is the lead agency in convening national partners and UN agencies (under the One UN framework) on issues of social protection. The focus on SDGs and social protection in-country has helped pull all UN agencies together and has laid the background for close work, even joint projects. The SDG focus of this project supports that process. In Pakistan, the ILO is chairing the outcome group, which includes WFP (food), UNHCR (refugees), UNFPA (health), WHO (health insurance) UN Women, UNDP, UNICEF. The strength of UN system, when it works, is its ability to focus on specific constituencies and then work together. The project is consistent with and encourages that process. ILO in this sense is acting as a broker in bringing partners together to share knowledge and to strategise. Its strength has been to avoid overlap and to build on what is there (one example is UNICEF’s work on child labour in provinces can be linked to the ILO’s work on ‘hazardous work’. In Cambodia, where there is donor crowding, the strength of the ILO is to support and broker understanding of the whole spectrum of social protection, to encompass social security and social assistance.

6. Was the project realistic (in terms of expected outputs, outcome and impact) given the time and resources available, including performance and its M&E system, knowledge sharing and communication strategy?

The main objective of the project is to -

1. *Strengthen the capacity of the government in Cambodia and Pakistan to formulate, implement, monitor and evaluate national social security schemes.* Given the favourable political environment and the established presence of the ILO in both countries and their inclusion in the ILO’s ongoing ILO’s ‘Global Flagship Programme on

Building Social Protection Floors for All' project, both outputs and outcomes have met or surpassed expectations.

The full impact of the project will only become evident in years to come when the processes set in train by the project come to fruition, when social security managers and staff apply the knowledge and skills they have acquired in the training sessions organised by the project and when political leaders take hard decisions about the means of resourcing of social protection. This will create the conditions for robust social protection systems to be put in place to make social protection a reality for all citizens.

2. The global objective of the project, that of the *growing need for awareness-raising at the global level as well as for the sharing of knowledge and the development of practical guidance for the governance of social security systems*, has been addressed through the development of the research papers and modules. The full benefit of the research papers will only be felt when they are systematically shared and used for training. The modules have an immediate use as they are and will be used in the ITC training – in the case of the coordination module, it will be the basis of a new governance course, filling a gap. The module on ITC and Data Management is already required reading for participants in the Leadership on Social Protection course. The third module on compliance is scheduled for publication in September.
3. The project will be an important contribution to the formation of a comprehensive set of best practices, tools and communication mechanisms for good governance in social protection that countries need to build their own systems and to achieve the SDGs. This requires information about the project and its key outcomes to be made widely available throughout social protection networks. As the high level week in China could not happen – and partial information could be shared through the on line workshops – and the 5 papers are only available currently through the DESA website - more detail on this aspect of the work is needed.

Overall the monitoring framework of the project is aligned to the budget and work plan, is more activity-based than results-based, which has the effect of making it less flexible to changes and therefore less adaptive. A point to note is that there is no indicator on gender and disability. Some outcome indicators seem to have been over ambitious given its short timeframe, as e.g. it is difficult to highlight direct linkages between the number of countries in the South requesting technical support based on Governance, based on the delivery of the three main knowledge products which are final outputs, and the time it takes (as noted in point one) to shift from piecemeal approaches to universal ones.